立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1347/14-15 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB2/PL/SE

Panel on Security

Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday, 3 March 2015, at 2:30 pm in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members : Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP (Chairman)

present Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon Claudia MO

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming

Hon YIU Si-wing

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

Hon KWOK Wai-keung

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Member : Ho attending

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP

Members absent

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP Hon Kenneth LEUNG Hon Dennis KWOK

Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Public Officers attending

: <u>Item III</u>

Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP Under Secretary for Security

Mr Vic YAU Cheuk-hang Principal Assistant Secretary for Security A

Mr Edwin LAM Man-wing Assistant Commissioner of Police (Support)

Ms Monica AU YEUNG Mun-yee Superintendent (Licensing) Hong Kong Police Force

Item IV

Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP Under Secretary for Security

Ms Amy WONG
Principal Assistant Secretary for Security C

Mr WK LEUNG, IDSM, IMSM Assistant Director of Immigration (Management & Support)

Mr Tom YIP Chi-kwai District Planning Officer / Kowloon Planning Department Mr David CHAK Wing-pong Project Director 2 (Acting) Architectural Services Department

Item V

Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP Under Secretary for Security

Mr Alex CHAN Yuen-tak Principal Assistant Secretary for Security B

Mr LI Kin-yat, FSMSM Deputy Director of Fire Services

Mr Joseph LEUNG Wai-hung Deputy Chief Fire Officer (Headquarters) Fire Services Department

Item VI

Mr John LEE Ka-chiu, PDSM, PMSM, JP Under Secretary for Security

Mr Billy WOO Tak-ying Principal Assistant Secretary for Security D

Mr David CHIU Wai-kai, IDSM Assistant Director (Personal Documentation) Immigration Department

Mr LOK Wai-man
Principal Immigration Officer
(Information Systems) Development
Immigration Department

Miss Caroline FAN Mei-hing Chief Systems Manager (Technology Services) Immigration Department

Clerk in attendance

: Miss Betty MA

Chief Council Secretary (2) 1

Staff in : Mr KAU Kin-wah

attendance Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 3

Mr Raymond LAM

Senior Council Secretary (2) 7

Ms Mina CHAN

Council Secretary (2) 1

Miss Lulu YEUNG Clerical Assistant (2) 1

Action

I. Information paper issued since the last meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(2)885/14-15(01))

Members noted that a letter dated 12 February 2015 from Dr CHIANG Lai-wan regarding the granting of medical parole to persons in custody who were gravely ill had been issued since the last meeting. Members agreed that the Administration be requested to provide a response to the issues raised in the letter.

II. Date of next meeting and items for discussion

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)914/14-15(01) and (02))

Meeting in April 2015

- 2. <u>Members</u> agreed that the following items would be discussed at the next regular meeting on 10 April 2015 at 10:45 am -
 - (a) Latest situation of the operation of control points;
 - (b) Replacement of the Infrastructure Platform for the Police Operational Nominal Index Computer System and the Criminal Intelligence Computer System; and
 - (c) Amendments to the First Schedule to the Dangerous Drugs Ordinance.

Visit to Fire Services Department ("FSD") on 23 March 2015

3. <u>The Chairman</u> reminded members that a visit would be made to FSD in the afternoon of 23 March 2015 to better understand its work and provision of post-dispatch advice.

III. Relaxation of the upper age limit for Category B Security Personnel Permit

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)914/14-15(03) and (04))

- 4. <u>Under Secretary for Security</u> ("US for S") briefed Members on the proposal of the Security and Guarding Services Industry Authority ("SGSIA") to amend the criteria for issuing a security personnel permit to relax the age limit of Category B security personnel ("the proposal").
- 5. <u>Members</u> noted a background brief entitled "Security personnel permits" which was prepared by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat.

Views on the proposed relaxation of upper age limit

- 6. Mr WONG Yuk-man said that he had no objection in principle to the proposal. However, it was pitiable that a person aged over 65 had to continue working in order to make a living, especially given the long working hours of security personnel. He considered that the Administration should introduce a universal retirement protection scheme, abolish the means test requirement for the Old Age Living Allowance and enact laws on standard working hours.
- 7. <u>US for S</u> responded that the Administration had noted from its earlier discussion with the trade and labour groups that many security personnel aged 65 or above were in good health and hoped to continue contributing to the community through their work.
- 8. Mr WONG Kwok-kin expressed support for the proposal and declared that he was a member of SGSIA. He said that the Hong Kong General Union of Security and Property Management Industry Personnel under the Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions ("HKFTU") had called for the relaxation of age limit for security personnel for many years. He considered that with the increased life expectancy in Hong Kong, security personnel should be capable of working beyond the age of 65. The

proposal would also help to address the manpower shortage problem in the industry. While expressing support for the introduction of a retirement protection scheme, he said that the subsidy provided under such a scheme might not be adequate for supporting the living costs of a retired person.

Fees for the proposed medical check

- 9. <u>Mr WONG Yuk-man</u> considered that the fees for the requisite medical check under the proposal should not be borne by employees.
- 10. <u>Mr LEUNG Che-cheung</u> expressed concern about whether the expenses of the proposed medical check should be borne by the Administration.
- 11. <u>US for S</u> responded that the biennial medical check requirement for Category B security personnel would basically be the same as the existing arrangements for Category A security personnel, who had to pay for the medical check themselves. He understood that it would cost around \$200 which should not impose undue financial burden on applicants or permit holders.

Applicability of the Mandatory Provident Fund ("MPF") Scheme to Category B security personnel aged 65 or above

- 12. <u>Mr LEUNG Che-cheung</u> asked whether Category B security personnel aged 65 or above were not covered by the MPF Scheme. <u>The Chairman</u> expressed support for the proposal. He considered that the Administration should examine the issue of lack of MPF coverage for security personnel aged 65 or above.
- 13. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung considered that if security personnel aged 65 or above were not covered by the MPF Scheme, employers might tend to replace younger security personnel with those aged 65 or above.
- 14. <u>US for S</u> responded that the MPF arrangements for security personnel aged 65 or above would follow the existing MPF law which applied to all trades. The Administration would convey members' views regarding MPF coverage to SGSIA for consideration. <u>Miss Alice MAK</u> suggested that the issue of MPF coverage for security personnel aged 65 or above be referred to the Tripartite Committee of the relevant sector for follow-up.

Other issues

- 15. Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed support for the proposal and said that the potential labour force of seniors had not been fully released. He considered that an eight-hour shift should be introduced to complement the proposed relaxation of age limit. He expressed concern that as there was only one security personnel on duty at any time in single block buildings, consideration should be given to establishing a mechanism for such security personnel to get help when they suddenly fell sick or sustained injuries while on duty. US for S responded that the Administration would convey the above views to SGSIA and the trade for consideration when reviewing their guidelines and training programmes.
- 16. <u>Mr LEUNG Che-cheung</u> expressed support for the proposal. He asked whether the premium of employees' compensation insurance would be higher for employees aged over 65. <u>US for S</u> responded that the premium of insurance was affected by a number of factors such as location of the premises and varied from case to case. As employees' compensation insurance was paid by employers, the level of insurance premium should not have any impact on employees.
- 17. Referring to the situation where a Category B security personnel failed to renew his permit when he reached the age of 65, Mr YIU Si-wing asked whether the employer or the employee would be liable. He also asked whether such cases had been found with Category A security personnel. US for S responded that all security personnel were required by law to have a valid permit. In case where a security personnel was found working without a valid permit, both the employer and employee would be liable. Inspections were carried out by the Police to ensure compliance with the relevant law. As regards the proposed medical check requirement, the Police would issue reminders to permit holders before their medical certificates were due.
- 18. <u>Miss Alice MAK</u> expressed support for the Administration's proposal. She said that the proposal had met the requests of HKFTU and would help to address the manpower shortage of the industry concerned. She asked whether the Administration had communicated with the relevant sector and labour unions on the implementation details and when the Administration's proposal would be implemented. <u>US for S</u> responded that the Administration and the SGSIA had been liaising closely with the trade. Members of SGSIA included a representative of the Secretary for Security. The proposed relaxation of upper age limit

and the imposition of a medical check requirement on Category B security personnel applicants would require amendments to the criteria to be specified by SGSIA. The revised criteria had to be approved by a resolution of LegCo before published in the Gazette. It was hoped that the revised criteria would be implemented by the end of 2015.

19. <u>Miss Alice MAK</u> asked whether a former Category B security personnel aged 65-70 whose employment had already been discontinued because of the existing upper age limit would be eligible for applying for the permit after the relaxation of upper age limit. <u>US for S</u> responded in the affirmative, adding that according to the criteria for issuing a security personnel permit, the applicant must fulfill the requirement of proficiency in security work. The requirement could be fulfilled by having not less than three years of cumulative experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past five years, or not less than one year of cumulative experience in performing security work lawfully in Hong Kong over the past two years immediately before submitting his application.

IV. Construction of staff quarters for Immigration Department at Heng Lam Street, Kowloon

(LC Paper No. CB(2)914/14-15(05))

- 20. <u>The Chairman</u> drew Members' attention to Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure concerning personal pecuniary interest to be disclosed.
- 21. <u>US for S</u> briefed Members on the Administration's proposal regarding construction of staff quarters for the Immigration Department ("ImmD") at Heng Lam Street in Kowloon.

Plot ratio for the proposed staff quarters

22. Mr WONG Yuk-man expressed support in principle for the Administration's proposal. Noting that the proposed staff quarters would be a 15-storey building, he queried why the Administration had not applied a higher plot ratio so that more staff quarters could be constructed on the site concerned. Referring to paragraph 9 of the Administration's paper, he said that the Administration should provide information on the cost-effectiveness of the proposed solar photovoltaic system and the rainwater recycling system.

23. <u>US for S</u> responded that the Administration had already applied to the Town Planning Board to relax the building height restriction on the Outline Zoning Plan so as to increase the plot ratio of the proposed building. Having taken into account the visual, environmental, traffic, air ventilation and other technical considerations, the Town Planning Board accepted the application. The plot ratio had been increased from 1.6 to 3.45. <u>The Chairman</u> said that the Administration should include such information on plot ratio in its paper for the Public Works Subcommittee and the Finance Committee ("FC").

Provision of more staff quarters for ImmD

- 24. Noting that the proposed project would provide 112 staff quarters for ImmD, Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed concern whether it would shorten the waiting time for staff quarters of ImmD. He asked whether the Administration had any further plans to construct more ImmD staff quarters and whether there was a target for the number of ImmD staff quarters in the longer term.
- 25. <u>US for S</u> responded that it was the established government policy to provide, subject to the availability of resources, departmental quarters for married staff of disciplined services to maintain staff morale. Government departments had been asked to examine, in the development plan of sites under their use, the possibility of the inclusion of staff quarters in such development. He said that there was a plan for another project at Kwun Tong which would provide more than 200 staff quarters for ImmD.
- 26. <u>Mr YIU Si-wing</u> asked whether the Administration would allocate more resources for the construction of more staff quarters for ImmD. He also asked whether consideration would be given to constructing staff quarters outside urban areas, such as in the New Territories.
- 27. <u>US for S</u> responded that the Administration hoped to identify more sites for the construction of staff quarters in accordance with the established mechanism. As there were difficulties in identifying suitable sites, all government departments had been requested to maximise the use of existing sites under their use. He said that the construction of staff quarters was not confined to sites in urban areas but also in the New Territories.

28. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung considered that public rental housing should be allocated to ImmD staff. US for S said that eligible staff, including retiring officers, of ImmD could apply for public rental housing, which was under the purview of the Hong Kong Housing Authority and open to all eligible Hong Kong residents. The provision of staff quarters was a form of benefit for disciplined services staff.

Criteria for allocation of staff quarters to ImmD staff

- 29. <u>Mr YIU Si-wing</u> sought information on the criteria for allocation of staff quarters to ImmD staff. <u>Assistant Director of Immigration</u> (<u>Management and Support</u>) responded that a points system was adopted in the allocation of staff quarters to rank and file grade staff of ImmD. Points were awarded according to the length of service, number of family members and salary point of the staff concerned.
- 30. <u>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung</u> asked whether ImmD staff were no longer entitled to staff quarters after they had left service. <u>US for S</u> responded that ImmD staff who had left service should surrender his staff quarter within two months.
- 31. <u>The Chairman</u> concluded that members had no objection in principle to the Administration's submission of its proposal to the Public Works Subcommittee.
- V. Creation of a Deputy Chief Fire Officer post for implementing quality assurance and training accreditation mechanisms in the Fire Services Department

(LC Paper No. CB(2)914/14-15(06))

32. <u>US for S</u> briefed Members on the Administration's proposal to create a permanent Deputy Chief Fire Officer ("DCFO") post in the Headquarters Command ("HQ Command") for implementing quality assurance and training accreditation mechanisms.

Quality assurance and training accreditation mechanisms to be implemented by FSD

33. <u>Mr YIU Si-wing</u> asked how the quality assurance and training accreditation mechanisms to be implemented by FSD compared with those of other countries.

34. <u>US for S</u> said that the firefighting skills and techniques of firefighters in Hong Kong had attained international standards. <u>Deputy Director of Fire Services</u> ("DDFS") said that firefighters were facing greater challenges with more complicated and difficult rescue operations, due to the increasingly complex structures of new infrastructure and buildings, the completion of a number of large-scale cross-boundary and inter-district infrastructures as well as mass transit systems in recent years. There was a need for equipping firefighters with advanced techniques for firefighting and rescue to maintain a high quality of service. He stressed that the quality assurance and training accreditation mechanisms to be implemented would be tailored to the circumstances of Hong Kong.

Workload of the proposed DCFO

- 35. <u>The Deputy Chairman</u> expressed support for the Administration's proposal. Referring to paragraph 13 of the Administration's paper, he expressed concern about the workload of the DCFO post holder.
- 36. <u>DDFS</u> responded that after creation of the proposed post, the management of training resources under the purview of the Fire Services Ambulance Command Training School, which was currently managed by the Ambulance Command, the Fire Services Training School and the Recruitment, Training and Examination Group would be consolidated under the oversight of the post holder. His work in the area of ambulance service would be assisted by a Senior Assistant Chief Ambulance Officer.

Fire and Ambulance Services Academy ("FASA")

- 37. The Deputy Chairman sought information on the projected completion date of the new FASA and the number of trainees who could undergo training at one time.
- 38. <u>DDFS</u> responded that FASA was expected to be completed by the end of 2015 and commence operation in early 2016. In order to meet the fast-changing social development and service requirement, FSD saw the need to incorporate its firefighting experience into its training courses to enhance the firefighting and rescue techniques of fire and ambulance personnel.

Other issues

- 39. <u>Dr Priscilla LEUNG</u> expressed concern about the gas explosion incident at Shek Kip Mei Estate on 22 November 2014 in which a fireman had died and several firemen were injured. She asked whether FSD would review its training for firemen. <u>DDFS</u> responded that FSD had set up a dedicated investigation team to examine the cause for the explosion and whether there was room for improvement in the existing operational guidelines for handling gas leakage incidents.
- 40. <u>Dr Priscilla LEUNG</u> asked whether the spouse of the fireman who died on duty would be required to surrender the staff quarter concerned. She also asked whether public rental housing could be allocated to the spouse of the deceased fireman. <u>DDFS</u> responded that the spouse of a fireman who died on duty would be allowed to live in the staff quarter until the original retirement date of the deceased fireman, or she might apply for public rental housing as a special quota would be available for the spouse of a fireman who died on duty.
- 41. <u>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung</u> said that the remuneration and benefits of firemen and ambulancemen should be improved.
- 42. <u>The Chairman</u> concluded that members had no objection in principle to the Administration's submission of its proposal to the Establishment Subcommittee.

VI. The next generation Smart Identity Card System (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)534/14-15(03) to (04), CB(2)654/14-15(03) and CB(2)914/14-15(07))

43. The Chairman said that the subject had been discussed at length at the meeting on 6 January 2015. Members had also taken a vote at the meeting on 3 February 2015 regarding the Panel's support for the Administration's submission of its proposal to FC. He said that the subject was arranged for further discussion at this meeting in response to the request of some members at the last meeting on 3 February 2015, at which further questions were raised by some members on the subject.

- 44. <u>US for S</u> briefed Members on the Administration's supplementary paper on the next generation Smart Identity Card System ("SMARTICS-2") and the Administration's response to further questions raised by members on SMARTICS-2 at the meeting on 3 February 2015.
- 45. <u>Members</u> noted the updated annex, which was tabled at the meeting, to the Administration's response to further questions raised by members on SMARTICS-2 at the meeting on 3 February 2015.

(*Post-meeting note*: The updated annex tabled at the meeting was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)963/14-15(01) on 4 March 2015.)

Protection of information stored inside a new smart identity ("ID") card

- 46. Mr WONG Yuk-man expressed concern about whether there would be adequate protection of information stored inside a new smart ID card. He said that if the existing contact interface of the smart ID card was to be maintained, the adoption of Radio Frequency Identification ("RFID") technology would become meaningless. The Administration should also provide information on the failure rate of the existing "contact type" smart ID card. Regarding the consultancy report on SMARTICS-2, he said that the Administration should at least disclose the parts of the report which would not have adverse impact on system security and the tendering exercise. He expressed concern that as the Registration of Persons Ordinance (Cap. 177) ("ROPO") had no extraterritorial effect, a person might access information stored inside a new smart ID card outside Hong Kong with a card reader available on the market. considered that many of the new functions to be incorporated into the new smart ID card were unnecessary.
- 47. <u>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen</u> considered that the statutory requirement for all persons to carry their proof of identity should be reviewed. He expressed concern that as provisions in ROPO were not applicable outside Hong Kong, it could not prevent unauthorised access outside Hong Kong to information stored inside a new smart ID card.
- 48. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> said that as RFID involved new technology, there might be room for improvement in its security. He expressed concern that with the employment of RFID technology in new smart ID cards, someone might gain remote access to information stored inside the smart ID cards of participants of a public assembly.

- 49. <u>US for S</u> responded that such a situation would not occur. To read information stored inside a smart ID card, an authorised optical card reader for reading the card face would be needed. The new smart ID card would have to be placed within 2 cm from the authorised optical card reader for turning on the wireless data transmission function, which would involve multi-dimensional security features as detailed in paragraphs 4 to 15 of the Administration's supplementary paper. The proposed new smart ID card would be designed strictly in accordance with internationally adopted standards. Such authentication technology was employed in many advanced countries, including Germany. He said that besides ROPO, most local legislation, apart from that related to sexual offences, had no extraterritorial effect. The main issue was the protection of information stored inside a new smart ID card.
- 50. Mr Christopher CHUNG expressed support for the Administration's proposal. He said that the Octopus Card had been in use for many years and there had not been any complaint about unauthorised access to information or value stored inside such a card. He asked whether the proposed wireless technology to be adopted was a type of Near Field Communication ("NFC") technology. US for S responded that the proposed wireless technology to be adopted was the most advanced.
- 51. Ms Claudia MO considered that an Octopus Card and a smart ID card was not comparable in that the former did not contain information about the cardholder's date of birth and there was no requirement in law for a person to carry his Octopus Card. She queried why there was a need to discuss the subject again within a short period. The Chairman said that the subject was scheduled for discussion again in response to the request of some members at the meeting on 3 February 2015.
- 52. <u>US for S</u> said that it was in the interests of Hong Kong to deploy the proposed SMARTICS-2, which would enable effective as well as efficient immigration control and clearance while maintaining a high level of protection regarding privacy and security. He reiterated that the authentication technology of the proposed system was the same as those being used in Germany and Belgium.
- 53. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> queried whether there was a pressing need for replacement of the existing smart ID cards. <u>US for S</u> responded that although the Administration had secured extension of the existing system maintenance agreements to the end of 2018, the first batch of smart ID cards issued in 2003 would have been in use for about 15 years by that

time. He pointed out that the first ID card replacement exercise was launched in 1983, followed by another card replacement exercise four years later in 1987 before the last card replacement exercise was launched 16 years later in 2003. He said that since its first issuance in 2003, there had been over 64 000 cases of malfunction of the chips in existing smart ID cards till end 2014. Breakdowns of the image storage system had increased from five cases per year in the past to 32 cases per year in 2013. With the ageing of existing smart ID cards, the possibility of massive card failure would increase. He reiterated that the Administration had sought the views of academics and experts in RFID, none of whom had queried the security of the authentication technology to be employed for SMARTICS-2, which was currently used in Germany and Belgium.

- 54. Assistant Director of Immigration (Personal Documentation) ("AD of Imm(PD)") said that the contract for supply of existing smart ID cards had expired and the stock of the existing type of smart ID cards could only meet the demand for the period up to 2018. In the event of a massive failure of existing smart ID cards, there might be insufficient smart ID cards for replacement.
- 55. Mr Alan LEONG and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung asked whether there were safeguards against unlawful access by law enforcement officers to information stored inside a new smart ID card.
- 56. <u>US for S</u> responded that the Immigration Department was not authorised under the law to allow any other party to use its smart ID card readers. Even if a person could obtain a card reader from the market, the card reader had to possess a designated certificate and the necessary decryption keys before access could be made to information stored inside a new smart ID card. He added that it was an offence under section 12 of ROPO and regulation 12 of the Registration of Persons Regulations (Cap. 177A) for a person to gain access to information stored inside a smart ID card without lawful authority.
- 57. The Chairman asked whether it was possible for a person to read information stored in a new smart ID card from a distance with a device employing RFID technology.
- 58. <u>AD of Imm(PD)</u> responded that, similar to the case of existing smart ID cards, the proposed new smart ID cards would have to be placed onto an authorised optical card reader for initiating the authentication process. Without first placing a smart ID card onto the authorised optical card reader, the authentication process could not commence. <u>Principal</u>

<u>Immigration Officer (Information Systems)</u>, <u>Development</u> added that a smart ID card had to be first placed onto an optical card reader authorised with certificate and equipped with the specific algorithm to generate a random encrypted key from a "key text string" captured optically from the card face. The question of information stored in a new smart ID card being read from a distance with RFID technology would not arise.

Possible non-ROPO functions of the new smart ID card

- 59. The Deputy Chairman noted that the Office of the Government Chief Information Officer ("OGCIO") was conducting a separate technical study to review other possible uses of smart ID cards. He sought information on the possible new uses of smart ID cards.
- 60. <u>Ms Claudia MO</u> expressed concern whether the storage of information other than that provided in ROPO would require consent of the cardholder concerned.
- 61. <u>US for S</u> responded that, besides information required and regulated by ROPO, the use of smart ID card for value-added services was voluntary and would require consent of the cardholder. OGCIO's study was focused on the inclusion of value-added services similar to the current library card and access to electronic health records in a smart ID card. He added that the Administration had sought the views of academics and experts in RFID and none of them had raised concerns about the security of the authentication technology to be employed for SMARTICS-2.

Requirement of carrying and producing identity card

- 62. <u>Dr Fernando CHEUNG</u> said that the issue of whether ID cards should be issued to residents had been discussed many times in the United States of America. The United Kingdom had also abolished requirements for its residents to produce ID cards when requested by law enforcement officers because of concerns about protection of human rights.
- 63. Mr YIU Si-wing expressed support for the Administration's proposal and said that there was no reason to employ outdated technology in the smart ID card replacement exercise. He expressed concern that if the requirement for producing identity card upon demand by authorised law enforcement officers was to be abolished, the crime rate might increase and the problem of illegal employment might become serious.

He asked whether the Administration had studied the impact of abolishing the requirement for producing identity card upon demand by authorised law enforcement officers on the crime rate.

- 64. <u>US for S</u> responded that crimes detected through stop and question by law enforcement officers included those related to possession of drugs, weapons or false document, illegal employment and contravention of conditions of stay. There was a need to maintain the law on carrying and producing identity cards upon demand by authorised law enforcement officers.
- 65. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung asked whether the requirement in law for producing an identity card upon demand by authorised law enforcement officers was only for the purpose of verification of a person's identity. US for S responded that there was local legislation empowering law enforcement officers to require a person to produce proof of his identity for inspection.
- 66. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 28 April 2015