

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)62/15-16
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/3/12

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on
Tuesday, 19 May 2015, at 9:30 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present :** Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP (Chairman)
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
- Members attending :** Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Member absent : Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item III**

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Agenda item IV

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Agenda item V

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP
Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Miss Winnie WONG Ming-wai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)3
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Henry CHAN Chi-yan, JP
Principal Government Engineer/Railway
Development
Highways Department

Attendance by invitation : Agenda item III

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Aidan ROONEY
General Manager – SCL Civil–EWL
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Jason WONG
Project Manager – SCL Civil–EWL
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager – Projects and
Property Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item IV

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr James CHOW
General Manager – KTE
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Mark CUZNER
General Manager – WIL/SIL
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager – Projects and
Property Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item V

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Simon TANG
General Manager – XRL
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Alvin LUK
General Manager – XRL E&M
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Maggie SO
Deputy General Manager – Projects and
Property Communications
MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)6

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (4)6

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (4)6

Action

- I. Information papers issued since last meeting**
- (LC Paper No. CB(4)610/14-15(01) - Letter from Hon Claudia MO on the stray dog incident on the East Rail Line on 20 August 2014
- LC Paper No. CB(4)895/14-15(01) - Submission on inadequate barrier-free facilities in MTR stations)

Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last meeting.

II. Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 3 July 2015

(LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(02) - List of follow-up actions)

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next meeting to be held on Friday, 3 July 2015 –

(a) Progress update on the Hong Kong section ("HKS") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL"); and

(b) Progress update on enhancement of MTR station facilities.

III. Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link

(LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(03) - Administration's paper on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link

LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(04) - Paper on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

3. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Transport and Housing ("USTH") and General Manager – SCL Civil–EWL of the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link. The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Action

IV. Progress update of the construction of the West Island Line, South Island Line (East) and Kwun Tong Line Extension

(LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(05) - Administration's paper on the progress update of the construction of the West Island Line, South Island Line (East) and Kwun Tong Line Extension

LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(06) - Paper on the progress update of the construction of the West Island Line, South Island Line (East) and Kwun Tong Line Extension prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(4)842/14-15(01) - Letter from Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki on water seepage in MTR HKU Station of the West Island Line

LC Paper No. CB(4)1020/14-15(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki on water seepage in MTR HKU Station of the West Island Line)

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, USTH, General Manager – WIL/SIL of MTRCL and General Manager – KTE of MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the West Island Line, South Island Line (East) and Kwun Tong Line Extension. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

V. Progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

(LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(07) - Administration's paper on the progress and financial situation of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong

Kong Express Rail Link

LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(08) - Paper on the progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, USTH and General Manager – XRL of MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of HKS of XRL. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

VI. Any other business

6. Members noted that the Subcommittee would conduct a visit to MTR Admiralty Station that evening to observe the conditions of the train compartments and platform during peak hours.

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:07 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
19 October 2015

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Tuesday, 19 May 2015, at 9:30 am
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000120 – 000139	Chairman	Information papers issued since the last regular meeting on 6 March 2015.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 3 July 2015</i>			
000140 – 000157	Chairman	<p>The Chairman informed members that the Administration agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting on 3 July 2015:</p> <p>(a) Progress update on the Hong Kong section ("HKS") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL"); and</p> <p>(b) Progress update on enhancement of MTR station facilities.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item III – Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link</i>			
000158 – 000742	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL").	
000743 – 001554	Chairman MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1052/14-15(01)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the progress update of the construction of SCL.	
001555 – 002040	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr Gary FAN enquired whether the Administration or MTRCL would be responsible for the significantly increased cost incurred by SCL project delay. He expressed support to the view that the Administration would be responsible for the additional cost for SCL arising from archaeological works and discoveries at To Kwa Wan Station as heritage conservation should be borne by the community as a whole. Nevertheless, Mr FAN pointed out that owing to MTRCL's mismanagement, a number of construction works of the project, apart from To Kwa Wan Station with archaeological finds unearthed, were also experiencing delays. As such, he considered that the Corporation should be responsible for the cost incurred thereof.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that SCL project was funded by the Administration under the concession</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>approach. The Highways Department ("HyD") would oversee the construction of SCL whereas MTRCL, being the entrusted project manager, would have to take care of the construction works.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that there were often unforeseeable situations in construction works. For instance, the progress of the tunnel construction from Diamond Hill to Ma Chai Hang was behind schedule due to unforeseen geological conditions. It would however spare no effort to implement recovery measures to catch up with the progress.</p>	
002041 – 002458	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing considered that in view of unforeseeable situations in the course of works, such as archaeological discoveries at To Kwa Wan Station and discovery of a large metal object on the seabed in the vicinity of the old Wan Chai Ferry Pier, it was inevitable for SCL to experience delays. Notwithstanding this, he urged the Administration and MTRCL to implement possible measures so that SCL could be commissioned as soon as practicable.</p> <p>The Administration explained that there would be about 11-month delay for the Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section and about 6-month delay for the Hung Hom to Admiralty Section of SCL. The original target commissioning date for the Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section was December 2018. Due to archaeological discoveries at To Kwa Wan Station, MTRCL estimated that there would be a minimum delay of about 11 months and the expected completion date of this Section would be in 2019. Given the late site handover in Wan Chai Development Phase II ("WDII") to SCL, the commissioning date of the Hung Hom to Admiralty Section would be deferred from December 2020 to 2021.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the late site handover in WDII to SCL caused delay of the completion of the North-South Corridor. Nevertheless, the Corporation would strive to develop recovery measures to mitigate the delay as far as possible.</p>	
002459 – 002951	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	<p>Concerning the delay of SCL project as a result of difficult ground conditions (e.g. those in Ma Chai Hang), Ms Claudia MO questioned whether it was caused by poor underground investigation work during the site investigation process. As regards the media reports that the increased cost for SCL might escalate to as high as \$41.6 billion, Ms MO enquired about the proposed amount of additional funding the Administration planned to seek from the Legislative Council ("LegCo") in order to proceed with the works.</p> <p>In response, the Administration clarified that SCL facing cost overrun of more than \$40 billion as reported by the media</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>was inaccurate. It further explained that the approved project estimate for the entire SCL project in 2011 and 2012 amounted to \$79.8 billion. In respect of archaeological works and discoveries at To Kwa Wan Station, the additional cost of the project would be at least \$4.1 billion in total. As the revised cost for the entire project was under review, it was premature for the Administration to provide details of the additional funding to be sought from LegCo at the present moment.</p>	
002952 – 003400	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam Administration	<p>Given that SCL was facing delay and cost overrun, Mr CHAN Kam-lam suggested that the Administration and MTRCL should be open and forthcoming about dissemination of relevant information to the community. Also, he expressed concern about the progress of the investigation on the large metal object found on the seabed in the vicinity of the old Wan Chai Ferry Pier, such as the detailed planning and actions to be taken by the Administration.</p> <p>The Administration responded that the Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CEDD") was conducting an investigation of the discovery of the aforesaid large metal object. According to the preliminary surveying and assessment, the object might be part of the wreck of a ship that sank in Victoria Harbour in the past. As the metal object might have an impact on SCL progress, the Administration and relevant departments would closely monitor the progress of investigation and provide further details to the public in due course.</p>	
003401 – 003808	Chairman Administration	<p>The Chairman expressed worry that SCL might experience further delay as a result of the discovery of the large metal object on the seabed in the vicinity of the old Wan Chai Ferry Pier. As such, he asked the Administration to provide details of the actions to be taken on the metal object and announce relevant timetable. In view of the possible cost overrun incurred by the above, the Chairman urged the Administration to formulate better measures to control the project cost.</p> <p>The Administration advised that there were a number of unforeseeable situations in the course of implementing SCL. In regard to the discovery of the aforesaid large metal object, CEDD and other relevant departments were conducting an investigation, such as assessing the historical, heritage and archaeological values of the object, and would give further details to the public in due course. The Administration added that it would strike a balance between SCL progress and heritage conservation.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003809 – 004253	Chairman Mr Tony TSE Administration MTRCL	<p>In view of delay and cost overrun in other railway projects under construction, Mr Tony TSE was worried that the Administration might be unable to monitor the role and duties performed by MTRCL in implementing SCL. Given that SCL was a major underground infrastructure project of a considerable scale, Mr TSE enquired about the proposed contingency period allowed for some unexpected delay in construction works. Noting that the completion rate of the overall works for SCL was 31%, he asked MTRCL to provide details on the basis for calculating such percentage.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that it monitored SCL progress by various means, such as regular meetings with MTRCL and monthly reports submitted by the Corporation. In addition, HyD had employed an external consultant to assist in the monitoring and verification work.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the estimated completion of SCL had provided for a contingency. The contingency period of each works activity of SCL varied depending on a number of factors (e.g. nature of works). For critical activities, they would not have any contingency period. The Corporation further explained that the overall percentage of completion of SCL project was the sum of all weighted percentage completion of all major works contracts.</p>	
004254 – 004558	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration	<p>Mr Gary FAN expressed worry that SCL project might experience further delay arising from the discovery of the large metal object on the seabed in the vicinity of the old Wan Chai Ferry Pier. Concerning the delay of the five railway projects under construction, he urged the Administration to conduct a comprehensive review so that future railway projects could be better planned and managed to avoid various infrastructure projects to be implemented simultaneously.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that there were various challenges and difficulties encountered in the course of constructing the five railway projects, such as archaeological discovery at SCL site area and industry-wide shortage of labour. The Administration would draw on the experience gained when planning for future railway projects.</p>	
004559 – 004900	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	<p>Given that the Administration would seek additional funding from LegCo for SCL project, Ms Claudia MO expressed concern about the proposed amount to be sought and the planned timetable for the funding application.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that the additional cost to SCL project arising from archaeological works and discoveries at To Kwa Wan Station would be at least \$4.1</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		billion in total. At the current stage, it was too early for the Administration to provide details of the additional funding to be sought from LegCo because the revised cost for the entire project was still under review.	
004901 – 005233	Chairman Administration	<p>Noting that CEDD was conducting an investigation of the discovery of the metal object on the seabed in the vicinity of the old Wan Chai Ferry Pier, the Chairman enquired about the role being played by the Transport and Housing Bureau in such an investigation, in particular the monitoring mechanism. The Chairman raised concern that SCL project might experience further delay as a result of the discovery of the metal object and urged the Administration to provide details of the actions to be taken on the metal object and announce the relevant timetable as early as practicable.</p> <p>The Administration explained that CEDD and other relevant departments were conducting an investigation of the aforesaid metal object. Given that the discovery of the metal object might have impact on part of the reclamation works under WDII as well as SCL progress, the Administration and relevant departments would maintain close monitoring of the progress of the aforesaid investigation and offer further details to the public in due course.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item IV – Progress update of the construction of the West Island Line, South Island Line (East) and Kwun Tong Line Extension</i>			
005234 – 005816	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the West Island Line ("WIL"), South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)") and Kwun Tong Line Extension ("KTE").	
005817 – 011324	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1052/14-15(02), (03) and (04)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the progress update of the construction of WIL, SIL(E) and KTE.	
011325 – 011755	Chairman Mr CHAN Kam-lam MTRCL	As regards the adverse impact of the "Occupy Movement" on the traffic conditions near the work site of Harcourt Road Garden between September and mid-December 2014, Mr CHAN Kam-lam enquired whether MTRCL would consider pursuing occupiers' legal responsibility during the "Occupy Movement". Also, Mr CHAN expressed worry that the scrutiny of the proposals on the method for selecting the Chief Executive in 2017 by LegCo in the coming month might trigger another round of "Occupy Movement". As such, he asked whether MTRCL would formulate any measures to mitigate the possible impact on the construction of SIL(E) project.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>In response, MTRCL explained that the underpinning works for the existing Island Line at Admiralty Station were the most critical to the progress of SIL(E) project. Notwithstanding this, the closure of roads surrounding the work site of Harcourt Road Garden in late 2014 had adversely affected construction traffic of the site and the contractors concerned would file claims with the Corporation. To avoid recurrence of similar problems, MTRCL had collaborated with the Transport Department earlier to introduce possible measures (e.g. traffic diversion) to minimize the possible impact of any further "occupy" activities on the project progress.</p>	
011756 – 012206	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>With regard to water seepage recently found at some locations of the three stations of WIL, Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern that it might pose safety problems to the structural integrity of the stations. In view of challenges encountered in implementing SIL(E), such as the slow progress of excavation for the underpinning works below the Island Line at Admiralty Station, Mr WONG was worried that the project might experience further delay, which would disappoint the public, in particular residents of the Southern District.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the water seepage found at WIL was mainly caused by underground water penetrating through construction joints of concrete lining. The problem would neither affect the structural integrity of the stations nor the railway operation. With a view to minimizing the impact on passengers, the Corporation would expedite the remedial works at locations with seepage. Besides, MTRCL maintained that the target commissioning date of SIL(E) was still the end of 2016. In order to achieve this target, the Corporation would spare no effort to improve the efficiency of every aspect of the expansion works at Admiralty Station and expedite the remaining works.</p>	
012207 – 012626	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG MTRCL	<p>Given that the persistent delay of the works at Whampoa Station of KTE project had caused much inconvenience to the residents nearby, Dr Priscilla LEUNG suggested introducing fare concessions to those affected residents upon commissioning of KTE. To alleviate the traffic problems caused by the works of KTE and SCL projects, she urged the Administration to temporarily provide water taxi services or waterborne transport services connecting Hung Hom to other districts.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that it had been offering a wide range of fare concessions and promotional schemes each year. When reviewing the fare promotions in the future, the Corporation would take into account Dr LEUNG's</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		suggestion as well as the views expressed by the community.	
012627 – 013054	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Owing to various difficulties and challenges encountered in the course of construction, Mr Gary FAN expressed worry that SIL(E) might experience further delay. If so, he enquired about any revised programme to complete ("PTC") of the project. Noting that water seepage was recently found at some locations of the three stations of WIL, Mr FAN questioned whether it was related to quality of works or use of construction materials.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the underpinning works for the existing Island Line at Admiralty Station were the most critical to the progress of SIL(E) project. Based on the current assessment, there were still risks of not achieving the target commissioning of end 2016.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the challenges remained at the site of Admiralty Station while the current target opening of SIL(E) was maintained. The Corporation would strive to overcome those challenges, like securing adequate labour resources for the concreting works of the project.</p>	
013055 – 013521	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>In view of the fact that the existing Admiralty Station would be expanded to form an integrated station for the MTR Island Line, Tsuen Wan Line as well as the future SIL(E) and SCL, the Chairman expressed worry that the additional patronage to be brought by the new railway lines might aggravate the problem of crowdedness at Admiralty Station. With a view to alleviating crowdedness of the existing Island Line and WIL, the Chairman suggested expediting the implementation of the North Island Line proposed by the Administration in the Railway Development Strategy 2014 ("RDS-2014").</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the extension works of Admiralty Station were being carried out under Harcourt Garden, east of Admiralty Station, with three additional levels being constructed below the existing station. After expansion, passengers would be able to interchange with other MTR lines conveniently at Admiralty Station. With regard to the increasing patronage upon commissioning of SIL(E) and SCL, the Corporation would closely monitor the situation and formulate crowd control measures as appropriate.</p> <p>The Administration advised that at the present stage, the proposed North Island Line set out in RDS-2014 was not among the first batch for implementation. This would be kept under review.</p>	
013522 – 013953	Chairman Dr Helena	Dr Helena WONG was dissatisfied that the construction works of KTE had caused much inconvenience to the	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	<p>WONG Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>residents in the vicinity of Whampoa Station. As such, she expressed grave concern over the progress of KTE project, including the actual commissioning date, the excavation works of the platform tunnel at Whampoa Station as well as the road reinstatement works nearby, in particular at Tak On Street.</p> <p>In response, the Administration said that it was aware of the views expressed by the residents in the vicinity of Whampoa Station. To minimize the impact of the construction works of KTE on nearby traffic and residents, the Administration would closely monitor the situation and MTRCL would strive to expedite the construction progress.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the construction of the platform tunnel at Whampoa Station remained the most challenging and critical part in the completion of KTE project. As the excavation works of the platform tunnel at the station were still ongoing and in view of the uncertainties arising from the complex geological conditions, there were also risks of not achieving the target of commissioning in mid-2016. According to the latest estimate, the excavation works and the structural works of Whampoa Station were expected to be completed in around early August 2015 and the third quarter of 2015 respectively. Also, road reinstatement works in the vicinity of the station would commence in the third quarter of 2015.</p>	
<p>013954 – 014413</p>	<p>Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL</p>	<p>Concerning the adverse impact of the construction works of KTE on nearby traffic and residents, Ms Claudia MO expressed worry that the situation would be aggravated when the section of Shung King Street traffic lane would be temporarily closed in mid-2015 for a few months for the drainage and utilities diversion works. She therefore urged the Administration to monitor the traffic condition closely to minimize the possible impact on residents.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that temporary traffic deck was installed along the roads affected by KTE project at street level to maintain traffic flow so that excavation and other construction works could be carried out underneath the deck for the sake of minimizing inconvenience caused to the public. The Corporation planned to start reinstating the road surface to their original condition by the end of 2015. Besides, MTRCL had received complaints from residents against the contractor which carried out 24-hour construction works inside the platform tunnel between the East and West concourses of Whampoa Station. In response, the contractor voluntarily shortened 24-hour working period to between 7:00 am and 11:00 pm afterwards. As the working hours were shorter than planned and coupled with the highly</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>complex ground condition encountered, the progress of excavation work at Whampoa Station was slower than expected. As a result, the entire KTE project might be further delayed.</p>	
014414 – 014843	<p>Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL</p>	<p>With regard to the underpinning works beneath the Island Line at Admiralty Station of SIL(E), Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok raised concern about how MTRCL maintained the safety of the railway tunnel structure and ensured that there was no impact on the train services of Island Line. Noting that water seepage was recently found at some locations of the three stations of WIL, Ir Dr LO asked MTRCL to provide further information on the causes of the problem and the remedial measures taken.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that the underpinning works beneath the existing Island Line at Admiralty Station of SIL(E) were carefully designed and planned with a number of redundancy measures in place to mitigate the risks. Monitoring instruments had been installed within the works area and the Island Line tunnels to enable continuous and real time monitoring to identify any movement that might occur during the excavation works and allow corrective actions to be taken. With 83% of the excavation for the underpinning works completed as at the end of March 2015, the monitoring instruments so far only identified very small amount of expected movements. Also, MTRCL explained that the water seepage found at WIL was mainly caused by underground water permeating through construction joints of concrete lining and similar situations also occurred previously at some underground structures of other projects. The Corporation had carried out remedial measures, such as sealing up the linings, so that the nuisance to passengers was contained and the situation under control.</p>	
014844 – 015249	<p>Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung</p>	<p>Owing to the construction complexities of the railway projects under implementation and continued challenges encountered, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed worry that the projects might experience further delay. For instance, given the slow progress of the underpinning works for the existing Island Line tunnel at Admiralty Station of SIL(E) project, there were still risks of not achieving the target commissioning at the end of 2016 according to the latest assessment. Furthermore, the delay was aggravated because of so many railway projects being implemented concurrently. As such, Mr LEUNG suggested seeking advice and inputs from experts and professionals.</p>	
015250 – 015700	<p>Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung</p>	<p>Mr KWOK Wai-keung expressed concern about the effectiveness of the delay mitigation and recovery measures in catching up with the works schedule of SIL(E) project.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	MTRCL	<p>Given the difficulties and challenges encountered in the underpinning works beneath the tunnels of Island Line, Mr KWOK was worried that the target commissioning date of SIL(E) might not be achievable. He therefore urged MTRCL to be open and forthcoming about dissemination of relevant information to the public. In respect of the delay of SIL(E) project, he also expressed worry that some of the structural works of the tunnel and track laying works, which were completed at an earlier stage, might be left idle for a period of time and so this might create maintenance problems.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that as at the end of March 2015, about 83% of the excavation for the underpinning works beneath the tunnels of Island Line was completed. The progress of excavation had significantly improved. To achieve the target commissioning by the end of 2016, the Corporation would spare no effort to expedite the remaining works and closely monitor relevant testing, including system testing and train testing on the running track.</p>	
015701 – 015945	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG Administration	<p>To alleviate the traffic problems as a result of the construction works of KTE and SCL projects, Dr Priscilla LEUNG suggested introducing ferry services or water taxi services connecting the Hung Hom area to other districts.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that the major outlying island ferry routes were basically the only means of external transport for residents of outlying islands and as such, special helping measures were formulated for these outlying island ferry routes. This was not the case for the Hung Hom area. Nevertheless, if any ferry operator was interested to provide ferry services for the area, they could approach the Transport Department.</p>	
015946 – 020201	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Noting that there were still risks for SIL(E) of not achieving the target commissioning at the end of 2016, Mr Gary FAN enquired when the Administration would be able to confirm the commissioning date. Also, he expressed concern about the underlying causes of the water seepage found at WIL as similar situations did not occur upon commissioning of other railway lines.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that it would closely monitor the progress of the construction of SIL(E). With more certainty on the opening date of the project, the Administration and MTRCL would update the community on the relevant details as far as possible.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the water seepage found at WIL was mainly caused by underground water permeating through</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>construction joints of concrete lining. The situation was not unusual at underground structures.</p>	
020202 – 020421	<p>Chairman Dr Helena WONG MTRCL</p>	<p>Noting that the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") previously passed a motion urging the Administration and MTRCL to increase the number of entrances at both Ho Man Tin Station and Whampoa Station for the convenience of local residents [LC Paper No. CB(4)954/14-15(06)], Dr Helena WONG asked MTRCL to update members on the latest development.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that the Corporation had taken into account the views of the community when planning and designing the entrances of both Ho Man Tin Station and Whampoa Station. As regards Ho Man Tin Station, there would be several entrances in the station to provide vital connection with the estates in the vicinity, such as Ho Man Tin Estate and Oi Man Estate. Besides, there would be a total of four entrances in Whampoa Station, with two at Hung Hom Road and the other two at Whampoa Garden shopping mall respectively. The latter were integrated entrances which could provide a more direct and convenient access to and from the shopping malls, residential blocks and Whampoa Station.</p>	
020422 – 020644	<p>Chairman MTRCL</p>	<p>Given that the affected contractor would lodge a claim with MTRCL in relation to the "Occupy Movement", the Chairman enquired whether the claimed damages would be borne by MTRCL or the occupiers. As regards the water seepage found at WIL, the Chairman expressed worry that it might be caused by substandard materials or workmanship or design problems, and would adversely affect the structural integrity of the stations in the long run.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL advised that the contractor affected by the "Occupy Movement" would have to provide sufficient justifications and substantiation of the claim, and the Corporation would then conduct a thorough assessment. After completing the assessment, MTRCL would decide whether to cover the claimed damages by the contingencies of SIL(E) project or pursuing occupiers' legal responsibility during the "Occupy Movement". As regards WIL, the water seepage was mainly caused by underground water permeating through construction joints of concrete lining. MTRCL carried out remedial measures by sealing up the linings in affected stations. The situation had been improved and neither the structural integrity of the stations nor the railway operation would be adversely affected.</p>	
020645 – 020900	<p>Chairman Mr KWOK</p>	<p>With regard to the water seepage found at some locations of the three stations of WIL, Mr KWOK Wai-keung urged</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	Wai-keung MTRCL	<p>MTRCL to formulate effective remedial measures to completely solve the problem.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that water seepage was not uncommon at some underground structures. After the water seepage at WIL was known, MTRCL had implemented remedial measures by sealing up the linings in affected stations. The Corporation would closely monitor the situation and conduct regular check to tackle the water seepage.</p>	
020901 – 021420	<i>Break</i>		
<i>Agenda Item V – Progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i>			
021421 – 021858	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the progress update of the construction of HKS of XRL.	
021859 – 023042	Chairman MTRCL	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1052/14-15(05)], MTRCL gave a briefing on the progress update of the construction of HKS of XRL.	
023043 – 023516	Chairman Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration	<p>Concerning the provision of the facilities for arrangements for co-location of boundary control facilities ("the co-location arrangements") at the West Kowloon Terminus ("WKT"), Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired about the relevant progress, say, whether the co-location arrangements could be implemented upon commissioning of HKS of XRL. In view of the persistent delay of works, in particular the progress of critical contracts, Mr WONG asked what actions the Administration had taken to mitigate the problem of project delay.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that it had set up an inter-disciplinary task force studying the implementation of the co-location arrangements and discussing them with the Mainland counterparts. The discussions mainly focused on the legal framework and design of the co-location arrangements. Once specific agreements had been reached with the Mainland authorities, the Administration would report them to LegCo in a timely manner. Besides, the Administration had urged MTRCL to strengthen measures to recover the delay of HKS of XRL project and would closely monitor the project progress.</p>	
023517 – 023935	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	As regards the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL, Ms Claudia MO did not support the proposal that the Mainland should authorize the Hong Kong law enforcement agencies to enforce the Mainland's immigration and clearance procedures and the related Mainland laws at the terminus as it	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>would undermine the "One Country, Two Systems" principle. Instead, Ms MO considered that passengers of HKS of XRL could complete immigration checks en route.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that the prime consideration of implementing the co-location arrangements at a designated area within the territory of Hong Kong was to enable Mainland officers to smoothly carry out their inspection duties under the Mainland laws (including those relating to customs, immigration and quarantine matters) within the constitutional framework. With a view to arranging a proper legal framework for the co-location arrangements, the Administration was actively studying the relevant issues with the Mainland counterparts. Also, the Administration would take account of the views and suggestions raised by the community on the implementation of the co-location arrangements.</p>	
023936 – 024412	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration	<p>Mr Gary FAN expressed concern that the intended purpose of HKS of XRL as an express railway might not be realized if the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL could not be implemented eventually. In regard to the proposal that the Mainland should authorize the Hong Kong law enforcement agencies to enforce the Mainland's immigration and clearance procedures and the related Mainland laws at WKT, Mr FAN expressed worry that it would jeopardize the "One Country, Two Systems" principle. Owing to the continuous delay and cost overrun of HKS of XRL, he suggested that the Administration should conduct a feasibility study on the economic benefits brought by the project. If HKS of XRL failed to generate substantial economic benefits, which should be greater than the cost to complete ("CTC") of the project, he opined that the Administration should halt the entire project to avoid further loss of public money.</p> <p>The Administration explained that it would spare no effort to implement the co-location arrangements at WKT in order to realize the intended purpose and benefits of HKS of XRL. Besides, after completing the assessment of MTRCL's CTC of HKS of XRL project of \$71.52 billion, the Administration requested MTRCL to provide further information. The Corporation was therefore reviewing again its CTC. As such, it was premature for the Administration to offer comments on the amount of cost overrun at the present stage.</p>	
024413 – 024903	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration MTRCL	<p>Given the continuous delay and cost overrun of HKS of XRL project, Dr KWOK Ka-ki requested the Administration to make an apology to the public. He also questioned whether the Administration or MTRCL should bear the additional cost incurred by project delay. Furthermore, Dr KWOK was</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>dissatisfied that the implementation timetable for the co-location arrangements for HKS of XRL had not yet been finalized. In order to resolve the problems faced by the project, he suggested that HyD should seek independent experts' advice.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that the primary objective was to contain cost and to complete the works of HKS of XRL project as early as possible. It would also be of utmost importance for the Administration to implement the co-location arrangements at WKT to truly unleash the potential of a timesaving express railway.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that HKS of XRL project, being a major underground infrastructure project of a considerable scale, encountered a number of difficulties and challenges in the course of construction, such as complex geological conditions. The Corporation had made strenuous efforts to minimize the risks of project delay. For instance, past experience was drawn to make the initial time estimate as well as experts' views and opinions were gathered for underground investigation work.</p>	
024904 – 025335	Chairman Dr Helena WONG Administration	<p>To resolve the legal and constitutional challenges encountered by the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL and to take forward the project, Dr Helena WONG opined that the Administration should actively and carefully study the views and suggestions from the community. She considered that the Mainland could authorize the Hong Kong law enforcement agencies (e.g. the Security Bureau) to enforce the Mainland's immigration and clearance procedures and the related Mainland laws at WKT. Besides, Dr WONG expressed concern that noise and air pollution in the vicinity of WKT and the West Kowloon Cultural District would be aggravated upon commissioning of HKS of XRL. As such, she urged the Administration to formulate possible measures, such as retrofitting of noise barriers on affected roads, to minimize the possible impact on residents nearby. With regard to pedestrian connectivity of HKS of XRL, Dr WONG asked whether travelators, escalators and lifts would be installed to connect WKT with Kowloon Station to provide barrier-free public access.</p> <p>The Administration explained that it would spare no effort to complete HKS of XRL project as early as possible. Concerning the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT, the Administration welcomed any views and suggestions from the Subcommittee and members of the public.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
025336 – 025754	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Administration MTRCL	<p>In respect of continuous delay of HKS of XRL project, Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok opined that the best and most responsible way to solve the problem was to implement mitigation measures to catch up with the progress through the concerted efforts of the Administration, MTRCL and its contractors. With regard to the additional cost incurred by project delay, Ir Dr LO was worried that MTRCL might have disputes with its contractors over the processing of the claims.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that it would work hard to contain cost of HKS of XRL project. It was however premature for the Administration to give comments on MTRCL's CTC of the project (i.e. \$71.52 billion) at the current stage as the amount was still under review.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that HKS of XRL project had experienced persistent delay due to a number of challenges encountered in the course of works, such as complex geological conditions. MTRCL would spare no effort to resolve the disputes with its contractors over the increased cost incurred by project delay. Also, the Corporation would make use of its established procedures to assess the contractors' claims to ensure strict compliance with the contract terms.</p>	
025755 – 030159	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG opined that the concept of implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL would be in compliance with the Basic Law. Under Article 95 of the Basic Law, the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region ("HKSAR") might, through consultations and in accordance with law, maintain juridical relations with the judicial organs of other parts of the country, and they might render assistance to each other. Dr LEUNG also considered that the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT would be aligned with the international practices. With a view to resolving the legal and constitutional challenges faced by the co-location arrangements, she suggested making reference to some successful practices arranged between Britain and France as well as between Canada and the United States on cross-border trains.</p>	
030200 – 030724	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN MTRCL	<p>In order to resolve the challenges encountered in the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL, Mr Michael TIEN suggested making reference to Article 18 of the Basic Law in relation to the application of national laws in HKSAR. He considered that it was proper to enforce the Mainland's immigration and clearance procedures and the related Mainland laws at WKT. Due to short journey time, he considered the proposal of asking passengers of HKS of XRL to complete immigration checks en route not feasible. Besides, noting that the progress of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the critical contracts remained behind PTC, Mr TIEN expressed worry that the project cost would surge if the Administration and MTRCL tried to speed up the works progress by all means. As such, he suggested conducting a review of the commissioning programme and striking a balance between commitment to achieve the target commissioning date and cost control of the project.</p> <p>In response, MTRCL explained that HKS of XRL project, in particular the key civil works contracts, encountered a number of difficulties and challenges in the course of construction. For instance, regarding the cross-boundary tunnel section, heavy clay content in the alluvial subsoil conditions adversely affected the performance of the slurry circulation system of the tunnel boring machines operation. As a result, the works progress of the cross-boundary tunnel section was substantially slowed down.</p>	
030725 – 031130	Chairman Administration	<p>Given the loopholes in the existing monitoring mechanism and continuous cost overrun of HKS of XRL project, the Chairman suggested that the Administration should place a cap to the amount of the final entrustment cost. Also, he raised concern about the progress of the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT as it might affect the completion date of the entire project.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that as MTRCL was reviewing CTC of HKS of XRL project, it was premature to provide comments on the amount of cost overrun at the present stage. The Administration supplemented that the existing Entrustment Agreement did not include any means to cap the final entrustment cost of the project. Besides, the Administration was actively studying the implementation of the co-location arrangements and discussing them with the Mainland counterparts. The discussions mainly focused on the legal and constitutional framework as well as the design of the co-location arrangements. The Administration expected that the design of the co-location arrangements would be finalized within 2015.</p>	
031131 – 031614	Chairman Mr LEE Cheuk-yan Administration	<p>Mr LEE Cheuk-yan was dissatisfied with the slow progress in the study of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL by the Administration. Given that the co-location arrangements might not be implemented upon commissioning of HKS of XRL, Mr LEE asked if the Administration would introduce possible interim measures as proposed by the former Secretary for Transport and Housing. In view of the continuous project delay, he questioned whether the Administration or MTRCL would bear the increased cost incurred.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration explained that the inter-disciplinary task force led by the Secretary for Justice was actively studying the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL and would spare no effort to resolve the concerned legal and constitutional challenges.</p>	
031615 – 032026	<p>Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration</p>	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai opined that when considering the proposals for the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL, the Administration should uphold the principles of "One country, Two systems" and a high degree of autonomy. Noting that the original target completion date of HKS of XRL project was 4 August 2015, Mr WU asked when the entrustment cost of \$65 billion would be used up. In respect of the possible cost overrun, he questioned when the Administration would seek additional funding from LegCo for the project; and whether the Administration, MTRCL or its contractors should be responsible for the increased cost incurred.</p> <p>In response, the Administration explained that as announced by MTRCL in 2014, the target commissioning date and CTC of HKS of XRL project was revised. Regarding the cost overrun and the parties' responsibility for bearing the relevant costs, the Administration would assess MTRCL's obligations in due course and would reserve all the rights to pursue the matter with the Corporation.</p>	
032027 – 032404	<p>Chairman Mr Christopher CHUNG Administration</p>	<p>Mr Christopher CHUNG said that implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL was of utmost importance to the realization of the intended purpose of HKS of XRL as it could truly unleash the potential of a timesaving express railway. Under the concept of the co-location arrangements, passengers could complete immigration clearance for both Hong Kong and the Mainland in one go without having to disembark for immigration checks en route. Citing the immigration control in Shenzhen Bay as an example, Mr CHUNG called for members' support to the implementation of the co-location arrangements.</p>	
032405 – 032633	<p>Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG</p>	<p>Concerning the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT of HKS of XRL, Dr Priscilla LEUNG considered that neither completing immigration checks en route nor authorizing the Hong Kong law enforcement agencies to enforce the Mainland's immigration and clearance procedures at WKT was appropriate. For the sake of revolving the challenges faced by the co-location arrangements, she called for concerted efforts from all sectors in the community to collaborate with the Mainland counterparts in a sincere manner.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
032634 – 032837	Chairman Mr Gary FAN	Mr Gary FAN expressed worry that HKS of XRL project might experience further cost overrun and the implementation of the co-location arrangements might jeopardize the "One Country, Two Systems" principle. He therefore suggested that the Administration should carefully consider whether to halt the entire project to avoid further loss of public money.	
032838 – 033041	Chairman Mr Michael TIEN	In respect of continuous cost overrun of HKS of XRL project, Mr Michael TIEN expressed worry that the entrustment cost would be used up very soon and the project might have to be stopped. He considered that MTRCL should strike a balance between commitment to achieve the target commissioning date and cost control of the project. For instance, MTRCL might consider slowing down the project in order to substantially cut the amount of cost overrun.	
033042 – 033239	Chairman Dr Helena WONG MTRCL	To respond to Dr Helena WONG's abovementioned enquiry, MTRCL explained that WKT was carefully designed to minimize any possible impact on the environment, e.g. a substantial amount of vegetation used to create green open space. It would be unnecessary to retrofit noise barriers on Lin Cheung Road as the vehicle transport there would go underground. After careful assessment and examination, MTRCL considered that the provision of a direct subway linking WKT and Kowloon Station was technically not feasible.	
033240 – 033534	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration	<p>Mr WU Chi-wai questioned if the Administration would bear the additional cost incurred by delay of HKS of XRL project; and whether the amount to be claimed against MTRCL would be capped at the amount of the project management cost under the Entrustment Agreement. Given that the implementation of the co-location arrangements at WKT was very important to the realization of the intended purpose of HKS of XRL to be a timesaving express railway, he urged the Administration to spare no effort to resolve the relevant issues and update the public on the progress as soon as practicable.</p> <p>In response, the Administration advised that it would assess MTRCL's obligations regarding project implementation, works delay and project cost overrun after the review of CTC of HKS of XRL project was completed. With regard to the implementation of the co-location arrangements, the Administration would strive to resolve the legal and constitutional challenges.</p>	
033535 – 033656	Chairman Administration	As regards the implementation of co-location arrangements, the Chairman urged the Administration to submit the details to the Subcommittee for discussion and consideration as early as possible. Concerning cost overrun of HKS of XRL	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>project, the Chairman reiterated that the Administration should place a cap to the amount of the final entrustment cost in consultation with MTRCL.</p> <p>The Administration said that the Chairman's views and suggestion were noted.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item VI – Any other business</i>			
033657 – 033734	Chairman	The Chairman reminded members that the Subcommittee would conduct a visit to MTR Admiralty Station that evening to observe the conditions of the train compartments and platform during peak hours.	

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
19 October 2015