

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)898/14-15
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development

**Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation
of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting
held on Monday, 12 January 2015, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Member attending : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Members absent : Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Public Officers attending : Items II and III

Home Affairs Bureau

Mrs Betty FUNG CHING Suk-ye, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen, JP
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Ms Sabrina LAW Chung
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West
Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Duncan PESCOD, GBS, JP
Chief Operating Officer

Dr CHAN Man-wai
Executive Director, Project Delivery

Mr Y C NG
Head, Technical Services

Mr Patrick LAM
Senior Traffic and Transport Engineer

Item II

Transport Department

Mr LEUNG Tat-fai
Chief Engineer/Priority Railway

Mr CHAN Wai-tak
Senior Engineer/Kowloon District West

Item III

Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr Norman HEUNG Yuk-sai, JP
Project Manager (Kowloon)

Mr Ringo MOK Wing-cheong
Chief Engineer/Kowloon 5

Clerk in attendance : Ms Amy YU
Chief Council Secretary (2)6

Staff in attendance : Ms Jasmine TAM
Senior Council Secretary (2)8

Miss Meisy KWOK
Legislative Assistant (2)6

Action

I. Work plan of the Joint Subcommittee
(LC Paper No. CB(2)561/14-15(01))

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

2. Ms Cyd HO suggested that in addition to the subjects for discussion as set out in the proposed work plan of the Joint Subcommittee, the Joint Subcommittee should also follow up on the progress of work of the Administration/the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") in nurturing arts talents/arts-related personnel and communication/engagement with relevant stakeholders, such as the relevant District Council, in preparation for the progressive commissioning of the arts and cultural facilities in the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"). She suggested that a meeting be scheduled for June 2015 to discuss the relevant issues. The Chairman suggested to receive views from the arts and cultural sectors on such issues at the meeting.

Clerk

3. Members raised no further view on the proposed work plan. The Chairman advised that the Clerk would liaise with the Administration on the arrangements for future meetings and members would be informed of the relevant details in due course.

II Integration and connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District with its neighbouring districts
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)561/14-15(02)-(03))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, WKCD briefed members on the implementation progress of the transport infrastructure projects linking the WKCD with its neighbouring districts, details of which were set out in WKCD's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)561/14-15(02)) and powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation materials provided by WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)608/14-15(01) on 12 January 2015.)

5. Dr Helena WONG declared that she resided at one of the topside property developments at Kowloon Station.

Action

Admin/
WKCDA

6. The Administration/WKCDA were requested to provide the following information -

- (a) all the existing and planned pedestrian connections through which visitors from the Hong Kong Island taking Western Harbour Crossing ("WHC") bus routes could get to the western entrance of WKCD and M+ respectively from the WHC bus lay-bys;
- (b) whether WKCDA would consider operating marine transport service to/from WKCD in the event of unavailability of service providers;
- (c) in relation to WKCDA's estimation that only 8% of the visitors to WKCD would drive to WKCD, when and how such estimation was arrived at; and whether the estimation had covered solely the visitors intending to use the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD or whether it had also covered those who sought only to park their cars in WKCD;
- (d) the number of parking spaces planned to be provided in WKCD and those currently/planned to be provided at the adjoining developments;
- (e) of the 1 800 public car parking spaces to be provided in WKCD for shared use by the arts and cultural facilities and the office/retail developments, a breakdown of the number of car parking spaces to be made available for hire on an hourly, daytime/evening, daily, and monthly basis; and
- (f) the technical difficulties involved in providing underground pedestrian connections to link Kowloon Station with WKCD and the West Kowloon Terminus respectively and whether such difficulties could be overcome.

III. Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District integrated basement

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)561/14-15(04)-(05))

7. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration briefed members on the implementation progress of the WKCD integrated basement, the timeline for the relevant funding applications, as well as the alternative funding arrangement for the first stage of design and advance works of the

Action

integrated basement, details of which were set out in the Administration/WKCDA's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)561/14-15(04)) and powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation materials provided by the Administration/WKCDA was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)608/14-15(02) on 12 January 2015.)

8. Dr Priscilla LEUNG declared that she owned residential properties in West Kowloon.

9. Mr Abraham SHEK declared that he was a non-executive director of the MTR Corporation Limited.

Admin/
WKCDA

10. The Administration/WKCDA were requested to advise in writing -

- (a) the feasibility of adding an extra one or two levels to the integrated basement for the development of an underground city with retail and dining facilities, the additional costs involved, as well as the estimated rental income to be generated from such facilities;
- (b) the facilities covered in the Administration's funding submission for the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment in 2008 and the target completion dates of these facilities stated therein;
- (c) whether and how the development programmes of the WKCD facilities had been affected by the delay of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link project, including the extent of delay, if any; and
- (d) how the rough cost estimate of the integrated basement and the related public infrastructure works produced in 2013 (i.e. around \$23 billion) was derived, including whether any geological study had been conducted for the relevant parts of the WKCD site where the basement would be built.

Admin

11. The Administration was also requested to provide information on the estimated costs of the related public infrastructure works as well as the portions of the integrated basement for the hotel, office and residential sites in WKCD when it updated the Joint Subcommittee on the financial situation of the WKCD project in May 2015.

IV. Any other business

12. Members noted that the next meeting would be held on Monday, 23 March 2015 at 10:30 am.

13. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:41 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
18 February 2015

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project
held on Monday, 12 January 2015, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 2A of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item I - Work plan of the Joint Subcommittee</i>			
000453 - 000913	Chairman Ms Cyd HO	Consideration of the proposed work plan of the Joint Subcommittee.	
<i>Agenda Item II - Integration and connectivity of the West Kowloon Cultural District with its neighbouring districts</i>			
000914 - 003505	Chairman Admin	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCDA") on the implementation progress of the transport infrastructure projects linking the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") with its neighbouring districts [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)561/14-15(02) and CB(2)608/14-15(01)].	
003506 - 003921	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG raised the following views and suggestions –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the Administration and WKCDA should attach importance to enhancing pedestrian access to WKCD from the inner parts of West Kowloon. The pedestrian walkways to be provided should be tree-lined and separated from bike lanes; (b) consideration should be given to making available appropriate spaces at the pedestrian facilities connecting WKCD and its surrounding areas for local artists to display their artworks; (c) the Administration should respond to local residents' request for conducting greening works at footbridges connecting to WKCD; (d) given that the car parking facilities at the adjoining developments of WKCD were not planned to cater for the car parking requirements generated by WKCD and the current provision of such facilities was already inadequate to meet the demand of nearby residents, office workers and visitors, the Administration and WKCDA should seek to ensure adequate provision of car parking spaces in WKCD; and (e) to cater for the traffic generated by the planned developments in the West Kowloon area including WKCD, consideration should be given to constructing a new link road to connect the Western Harbour Crossing ("WHC") directly to Route 3. 	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
003922 - 004927	Dr Helena WONG WKCD Chairman Mr Frankie YICK	<p>Declaration of interest by Dr Helena WONG</p> <p>Dr Helena WONG cautioned that as vehicles would mainly enter WKCD through the underground access at Lin Cheung Road, inadequate provision of parking spaces in the WKCD car park at the basement level and/or inefficient operation of the car park management facilities therein would likely result in queue(s) of vehicles awaiting parking spaces at the Lin Cheung Road Access, thereby giving rise to congestion problems on Lin Cheung Road and the adjacent roads.</p> <p>Dr WONG stressed that in planning the provision of car parking spaces in WKCD, WKCD should seek to address not only the car parking demand arising from the various facilities in WKCD but also such demand arising from the inadequate provision of car parking spaces at the adjoining developments of WKCD (e.g. topside developments of Kowloon Station). She sought information on the number of car parking spaces to be provided in WKCD which would be open for public use.</p> <p>Mr Frankie YICK shared Dr Helena WONG's concern about the inadequate provision of car parking spaces at the topside developments of Kowloon Station.</p> <p>WKCD advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the provision of car parking spaces in WKCD had been planned in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. Given that the peak period for utilization of the car parking spaces for the arts and cultural facilities (usually at night) and that for the office developments in WKCD (usually during day time) were different, a portion of the car parking spaces to be provided in WKCD had been planned for shared use by the arts and cultural facilities and the office developments in WKCD to create synergy; and (b) subject to the design of the various facilities/developments in WKCD, around 2 200 to 2 800 car parking spaces were planned to be provided in WKCD. Excluding the car parking spaces allocated for the residential developments in WKCD, a total of around 1 800 car parking spaces were planned for other facilities in WKCD and would be open for public use. <p>Referring to p.22 of the powerpoint presentation material [LC Paper No. CB(2)608/14-15(01)] which seemingly showed that there were more than a hundred bus routes serving the West Kowloon area, Mr Frankie YICK questioned the need for providing such a large number of bus routes and cautioned that too many</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>buses on the roads might further add to the traffic pressure on the road network of the West Kowloon area.</p> <p>WKCDA clarified that as the same bus route might have been included in more than one bus stop groups shown in p.22 of the powerpoint presentation material, the sum of the number of the bus routes indicated therein did not represent the total number of bus routes serving the West Kowloon area.</p> <p>Mr Frankie YICK further expressed the following views –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in considering the employment of new car park management technology to enhance the operating efficiency of the car park in WKCD, WKCDA should give due regard to various implementation issues that might arise (e.g. whether all visitors would be required to use RFID cards to access/leave the car park); (b) given that WKCD was a popular leisure spot for families, WKCDA should provide both bikes for adults and those for children (e.g. tricycles) in WKCD; and (c) while he did not object to the provision of ferry/water taxi service to connect WKCD with the other parts of Hong Kong, WKCDA should carefully assess the service demand and the financial viability of providing such service. 	
004928 - 005352	Ms Cyd HO WKCDA Chairman	<p>Ms Cyd HO raised the following view and enquiry –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) as it might be difficult to secure adequate demand to support the operation of ferry service between WKCD and other parts of Hong Kong, consideration should be given to using water taxis, which had relatively lower passenger capacity than ferries, to provide marine transport service to connect WKCD with Tsim Sha Tsui ("TST") and Hong Kong Island; and (b) apart from pedestrian decks, footbridges and subways, at-grade pedestrian connections should be provided to link WKCD with the neighbouring districts. <p>The Administration/WKCDA were requested to provide information on all the existing and planned pedestrian connections through which visitors from the Hong Kong Island taking WHC bus routes could get to the western entrance of WKCD and M+ respectively from the WHC bus lay-bys.</p>	Admin/ WKCDA

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
005353 - 005843	Ms Emily LAU WKCDA Chairman	<p>Ms Emily LAU expressed support for the provision of marine transport service between WKCD and other parts of Hong Kong, which, if implemented effectively, would help alleviate the traffic pressure on the road network of West Kowloon area. She stressed that to encourage visitors to use the marine transport service, the landing facilities should be easily accessible and well connected with other facilities in WKCD. She further sought information on the routes of the marine transport service to be provided.</p> <p>Ms LAU expressed support for the provision of environmentally friendly transport service in WKCD and enquired about WKCDA's latest plan for the implementation of such service, including whether such service would also cover areas outside WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA advised that the existing landing steps in WKCD were fairly close to the Artist Square Development Area but the exact location of the landing facilities to be provided in WKCD would be subject to further study. Issues relating to marine access locations, options and their feasibility as well as the mode of operation and possible routes of marine transport service would be examined in the context of the Traffic Operation Plan ("TOP") consultancy study being conducted by WKCDA. The study would also review and assess the E-bus proposals suggested by the Development Plan consultant and look at relevant issues including possible E-bus routes and service frequency. WKCDA would revert to the Joint Subcommittee on the interim findings of the study on public transport planning and operation as well as car park, loading and unloading management in the second half of 2015.</p>	WKCDA
005844 - 010300	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen WKCDA Chairman	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered that to make WKCD a popular destination among members of the public, it was important to ensure that visitors would have a pleasant experience in accessing WKCD. He agreed with the approach adopted by the Administration and WKCDA to segregate the pedestrian and vehicular traffic accessing WKCD, so as to provide for a more pedestrian-friendly environment in and around WKCD.</p> <p>Noting that around 1 800 public car parking spaces would be provided in WKCD, Mr CHAN raised the following enquiries –</p> <p>(a) in planning the provision of public car parking spaces in WKCD, whether WKCDA had made reference to information on the split between use of private cars and use of public transport by audiences attending shows at other arts and cultural venues in Hong Kong (e.g. AsiaWorld-Expo); and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>(b) given the large number of public car parking spaces in WKCD, whether WKCDA would still encourage members of the public to use public transport to get to WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA advised that according to its earlier study and estimation generated from transport models for WKCD, about 8% of the visitors to WKCD would drive to WKCD, whereas over 90% of them would use public transport. The planned provision of car parking spaces in WKCD was determined largely on the basis of the relevant statistics generated from such models.</p> <p>The Administration and WKCDA were urged to formulate effective crowd dispersal and traffic management plans for the staging of mega events in WKCD and report to the Joint Subcommittee on such plans in due course.</p>	<p>Admin/ WKCDA</p>
<p>010301 - 010747</p>	<p>Deputy Chairman Admin</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman considered that the WKCD project should seek not only to promote the development of the waterfront areas in West Kowloon but also to foster the development of the neighbouring old districts (e.g. Yau Ma Tei and Jordan) and the integration of these districts with WKCD to create synergy. He enquired whether WKCDA had made reference to the experience of the Abandoibarra Project in Bilbao of Spain in promoting the development and integration of new and old districts, details of which were set out in the reports of the former Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development formed in the Third Legislative Council ("the former Subcommittee") on its duty visit to Bilbao in 2005.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman further said that according to p.15 of the powerpoint presentation material [LC Paper No. CB(2)608/14-15(01)] showing the proposed pedestrian links from neighbouring districts to WKCD, it appeared that the connectivity plan of WKCD was designed in such a way that priority was given to vehicles rather than pedestrians. He sought clarification whether at-grade pedestrian connections would be provided to link WKCD with the neighbouring old districts.</p> <p>The Administration advised that two pedestrian links connecting WKCD with Jordan and TST respectively were proposed in a traffic study on the pedestrian links for the West Kowloon Development Area completed by the Transport Department ("TD") in 2013. These two links were within the study area of the pilot study on underground space development to be conducted for four selected urban districts, including TST West, which was announced in the Chief Executive's 2014 Policy Address.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
010748 - 010954	Dr Priscilla LEUNG Chairman	<p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG reiterated that the Administration and WKCDA should step up efforts to enhance the pedestrian accessibility of WKCD and provide a green environment at the pedestrian connections to WKCD.</p> <p>Dr LEUNG further expressed the view that as compared with ferry, water taxi was a more preferred mode of marine transport which would enhance the tourism appeal of WKCD. She added that if ferry service was considered as a possible marine transport means for WKCD, the Administration should consider formulating special assistance policies and measures for such service as appropriate.</p>	
010955 - 011217	Dr Helena WONG Chairman	<p>Dr Helena WONG requested WKCDA to revert to the Joint Subcommittee on whether it would consider operating marine transport service to/from WKCD in the event of unavailability of service providers.</p> <p>Expressing doubt over the reliability of WKCDA's estimation that only 8% of the visitors to WKCD would drive to WKCD, Dr WONG requested WKCDA to provide the following supplementary information in writing –</p> <p>(a) when and how such estimation was arrived at;</p> <p>(b) whether the estimation had covered solely the visitors intending to use the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD or whether it had also covered those who sought only to park their cars in WKCD; and</p> <p>(c) of the 1 800 public car parking spaces to be provided in WKCD for shared use by the arts and cultural facilities and the office/retail developments, a breakdown of the number of car parking spaces to be made available for hire on an hourly, daytime/evening, daily, and monthly basis.</p>	<p>WKCDA</p> <p>WKCDA</p>
011218 - 011356	Mr Frankie YICK WKCDA Chairman	<p>Mr Frankie YICK enquired whether trams would be considered as a possible environmentally friendly transport mode to be adopted for providing shuttle service in WKCD.</p> <p>In response to Dr Helena WONG's earlier enquiry about the number of car parking spaces currently available at the West Kowloon Terminus ("WKT"), WKCDA advised that around 1 000 car parking spaces were provided at WKT and its topside developments.</p>	
011357 - 011839	Deputy Chairman Admin Chairman	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired whether the Administration/WKCDA had taken into consideration the need to promote mutual development of WKCD and the neighbouring old districts in drawing up the connectivity plan of WKCD and whether reference had</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>been made to the experience of the Abandoibarra Project in Bilbao of Spain.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the Consultation Panel of WKCDA had discussed the Bilbao experience in detail. To promote the integration of WKCD with the neighbouring districts and communities, WKCDA had organized/supported various pre-opening arts and cultural programmes/activities (e.g. Mobile M+) which were held in the neighbouring districts. WKCDA would continue to explore collaboration with relevant organizations/local artists in organizing more arts and cultural as well as community activities in these districts.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman stressed that in planning the pedestrian and vehicular infrastructures for WKCD, TD should give due regard to the need to foster mutual development and integration of WKCD and the neighbouring old districts.</p> <p>The Chairman said that WKCDA should seek to provide marine transport service not only as a transport means to enhance the accessibility of WKCD from other parts of Hong Kong but also as a support service for tourists visiting WKCD. He suggested that consideration might be given to offering performance-plus-ferry service packages, which would encourage visitors to use ferry service as well as enable WKCDA to better gauge the demand for such service.</p>	
011840 - 012109	Mr Frankie YICK WKCDA Dr Priscilla LEUNG Admin	<p>In reply to Mr Frankie YICK's enquiry, WKCDA advised that both bicycles and tricycles were currently being provided in WKCD.</p> <p>Declaration of interest by Dr Priscilla LEUNG</p> <p>Dr Priscilla LEUNG reiterated that WKCDA should consider providing water taxi service, and not ferry service, in WKCD. She further stressed that tourism elements should be incorporated in the planning of provision of marine access to WKCD.</p> <p>The Administration advised that issues relating to possible provision of marine transport service between WKCD and other parts of Hong Kong, including the mode of marine transport to be used, would be examined in the TOP study being conducted by WKCDA. WKCDA supplemented that it had initiated discussion with the Hong Kong Tourism Board, among others, on relevant issues and would revert to the Joint Subcommittee on the outcome in due course.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
012110 - 012228	Dr Helena WONG Chairman	<p>Dr Helena WONG requested the Administration/WKCDA to advise in writing -</p> <p>(a) the number of car parking spaces planned to be provided in WKCD and those currently/planned to be provided at the adjoining developments; and</p> <p>(b) the technical difficulties involved in providing underground pedestrian connections to link Kowloon Station with WKCD and WKT respectively and whether such difficulties could be overcome.</p>	Admin/ WKCD
<i>Agenda Item III - Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District integrated basement</i>			
012229 - 013523	Chairman Admin WKCD	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the Administration and WKCD on the implementation progress of the WKCD integrated basement, the timeline for the relevant funding applications, as well as the alternative funding arrangement for the first stage of design and advance works of the integrated basement [LC Paper Nos. CB(2)561/14-15(04) and CB(2)608/14-15(02)].	
013524 - 014359	Dr Helena WONG Admin Ms Emily LAU	<p>Dr Helena WONG said that given the high cost estimate of the integrated basement, the Administration and WKCD should consider expanding the functions of the basement to enhance the cost-effectiveness of the project. Citing the extensive networks of underground retail and dining facilities in Osaka, Japan as an example, she enquired whether consideration would be given to providing also retail, dining and entertainment ("RDE") facilities in the integrated basement so as to generate income to offset part of the cost of the basement.</p> <p>Dr Helena WONG also sought clarification on whether the \$23 billion cost estimate of the integrated basement had covered the cost of the portions of the basement for the hotel, office and residential ("HOR") sites in WKCD; and if so, whether the prospective developers of the HOR sites would be required to share such cost.</p> <p>Ms Emily LAU said that she was gravely concerned about the spiraling cost of the WKCD project. She also shared Dr Helena WONG's concerns about the high cost estimate yet limited functions of the integrated basement, as well as the cost-sharing arrangement between the Government and private developers for the development of the portions of the integrated basement for the HOR sites in WKCD. She further expressed dissatisfaction with the latest plan of the Administration and WKCD to, as a makeshift measure, charge the costs of the first stage of design and advance works of the integrated basement to WKCD's endowment fund and then later seek to obtain approval from the Legislative Council</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>("LegCo") for such costs which would be transferred back to WKCD afterwards. In her view, the Administration had failed to pay due respect to the work of LegCo in scrutinizing and approving financial proposals for public works projects.</p> <p>The Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) the integrated basement was a key facility in Foster + Partners' conceptual plan ("F+P CP"). It served to free up space for arts and cultural use and also as an essential feature to meet the statutory minimum requirement for the provision of 23 hectares of public open space in WKCD. While the rough cost estimate of the integrated basement and the related public infrastructure works produced in 2013 was around \$23 billion, the Administration would, based on the phased implementation arrangement, seek funding from LegCo in phases for the implementation of such works and the funding to be sought over the next two to three years was estimated to be about \$10 billion;</p> <p>(b) given the integrated design as envisaged in F+P CP, the HOR sites in WKCD also consisted of RDE facilities and other WKCD facilities. Under the current planning, the prospective developers of the HOR sites in WKCD, if required, would develop the portions of the basement concerned, and they would be reimbursed by the Government the costs of the underground road, associated public infrastructure, and enabling works for the WKCD facilities involved. Despite the fact that the Government would fully fund the capital costs of the integrated basement as general enabling works to facilitate the development of the whole WKCD, the cost of developing the portions of the basement for the HOR sites incurred by the Government would be duly reflected in the land premium for such sites; and</p> <p>(c) as the planned space in the integrated basement had already been designated for accommodating vehicular access, ancillary car parking and loading/unloading facilities, any proposal to provide additional facilities in the basement would require further excavation works to develop more underground space, which would incur substantial additional costs.</p>	
014400 - 015017	Deputy Chairman Admin WKCD	The Deputy Chairman said that while the Civic Party had all along disagreed with the provision of an one-off upfront endowment fund for the WKCD project and the Specialist Advisor appointed by the former Subcommittee had advised that \$21.6 billion might not be sufficient for completing the entire project, he	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>considered it necessary for the Administration and WKCDA to ensure the success of the WKCD project so as to enhance the status of Hong Kong in the international arts and cultural arena.</p> <p>Noting WKCDA's plan to develop the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD in batches, he enquired how the Administration and WKCDA would enlist the support of LegCo and the public for taking forward the development of the various batches of facilities and whether they had formulated any contingency plans in the event that the relevant funding applications were not supported by LegCo and the public.</p> <p>The Administration responded that members had been advised that according to WKCDA's assessment, the portion of the endowment fund for the design and construction of WKCD facilities would be sufficient to cover the costs of the Batch 1 and Batch 2 facilities including Xiqu Centre, M+, the Park, Lyric Theatre, Centre for Contemporary Performance and Medium Theatre II. WKCDA had been focusing on the development of the Artist Square Development Area in Zones 3A and 3B as well as the Park, with a view to completing these facilities as soon as possible for early public enjoyment. WKCDA would continue its efforts on enhancing the public's understanding of the work of WKCDA in taking forward the WKCD development.</p> <p>WKCDA supplemented that in tandem with the hardware development, it was pressing ahead with a host of audience building, capacity building and stakeholder and public engagement initiatives to promote the development of cultural software to complement the WKCD project. As the timely completion of the integrated basement was part and parcel of the development of the facilities to be built on the topside, any delay in obtaining the funding approval of LegCo for the implementation of the integrated basement would have significant time and cost implications on the development of the whole WKCD.</p>	
015018 - 015429	Mr IP Kwok-him Admin	<p>Mr IP Kwok-him raised the following views and enquiry –</p> <p>(a) WKCDA should seek to expedite delivery of the WKCD facilities for early enjoyment by the public, as well as to ensure prudent use of the endowment fund and stringent control of the costs of the WKCD project;</p> <p>(b) given that the integrated basement as envisaged in F+P CP was an integral part of the design of WKCD which was adopted after years of consultation, the integrated basement should be implemented as planned. He disagreed with the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>proposal to provide additional RDE facilities in the integrated basement, which would entail major change to the design of WKCD and result in further delay of the WKCD project; and</p> <p>(c) given the delay of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") project, whether the various works for the WKCD facilities could be implemented and completed as scheduled.</p> <p>The Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) WKCDA would strive to ensure that the construction of Xiqu Centre, the Park and the facilities in Zones 3A and 3B at the western end of WKCD (e.g. M+, Lyric Theatre and Artist Square Development Area), which were generally not/less affected by the XRL works in WKCD, would be completed on schedule. As part of the site area in Zones 2A, 2B and 2C (i.e. the site area between Xiqu Centre and Lyric Theatre) was being occupied by the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") for the XRL works, the Government and WKCDA were liaising closely with MTRCL on the timing for the handover of the relevant works area by MTRCL to the Government/WKCDA; and</p> <p>(b) WKCDA had all along strived for rigorous cost containment. In the light of the fact that the delay in obtaining LegCo's approval of the funding application for the first stage of design and advance works of the integrated basement would have serious knock-on effects on the construction costs and development programmes of the topside developments, WKCDA had agreed, as a one-off and exceptional arrangement, to charge the costs of the first stage of design and advance works of the integrated basement to its endowment fund first so as to mitigate the adverse impact on cost and venue opening.</p>	
015430 - 015830	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman said that the escalating cost of the WKCD project had turned it into a white elephant. He enquired whether the Administration was confident that the final cost of the whole main integrated basement and the related public infrastructure works would be in the region of \$23 billion as estimated.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the \$23 billion cost estimate of the main integrated basement and the related public infrastructure works was derived in 2013 on the assumption that the construction of the whole integrated basement would start in 2014 for completion in one go by 2020. Given that the integrated basement would now be implemented in phases, the Administration would be in a better position to provide</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>the Joint Subcommittee with more updated estimates for the whole integrated basement project when the detailed design and the construction programmes for the different portions of the integrated basement were firmed up.</p> <p>The Administration was requested to provide information on the estimated costs of the related public infrastructure works as well as the portions of the integrated basement for the HOR sites in WKCD when it updated the Joint Subcommittee on the financial situation of the WKCD project in May 2015.</p>	Admin
015831 - 020210	Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman said that he envisaged that under the worst-case scenario, only Xiqu Centre, M+, Lyric Theatre and the Park would be implemented in WKCD. Pointing out that the different zones of the integrated basements were intended to be interconnected according to F+P's design, he enquired whether it would be a waste to construct Zones 3A and 3B of the integrated basement if the other zones of the integrated basement and/or the relevant topside venues would not be implemented.</p> <p>The Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) subject to LegCo's funding approval for the implementation of the relevant parts of the integrated basement and timely release of the relevant works area in WKCD by MTRCL, the Batch 1 and Batch 2 facilities (i.e. Xiqu Centre, the Park, M+ in Zone 3A, Lyric Theatre in Zone 3B, and Centre for Contemporary Performance and Medium Theatre II in Zone 2A) would be implemented by WKCDA with its endowment fund as planned, whereas the implementation programme and funding for the Batch 3 facilities (i.e. Great Theatre, Musical Theatre and Music Centre in Zone 2C and Medium Theatre I in Zone 2A) were to be confirmed; and</p> <p>(b) even if the other zones of the integrated basement and the relevant topside venues were not implemented, those portions of the integrated basement which had already been constructed (e.g. Zone 3A and Zone 3B) could be put to use and would not be wasted.</p> <p>Extension of meeting for 15 minutes.</p>	
020211 - 020539	Dr Helena WONG WKCDA Chairman	<p>Dr Helena WONG requested the Administration/WKCDA to advise in writing on the feasibility of adding an extra one or two levels to the integrated basement for the development of an underground city with retail and dining facilities, the additional costs involved, as well as the estimated rental income to be generated from such facilities.</p>	Admin/ WKCDA

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>WKCDA advised that -</p> <p>(a) the integrated basement was a key feature in the F+P CP, which had received public support during the public consultation conducted by WKCDA and was adopted as the basis for developing the WKCD Development Plan. The integrated basement was premised on the concept of segregation of people and traffic in WKCD, rather than putting both underground; and</p> <p>(b) the integrated basement was designed to accommodate not only vehicular access and carparks, but also loading/unloading and other facilities to support the topside developments.</p>	
020540 - 020847	Mr IP Kwok-him Admin	<p>In response to Mr IP Kwok-him's enquiry on the costs incurred by the Government in developing the portions of the integrated basement for the HOR sites, the Administration reiterated that such costs would be duly reflected in the land premium for such sites.</p> <p>On the concern expressed by Mr IP Kwok-him about whether M+ could be completed on schedule under the current financial situation of WKCDA, the Administration responded that the schematic design for M+ had been completed and the foundation works for M+, which commenced in August 2014, was scheduled for completion in the third quarter of 2015. Furthermore, funding provision had already been made for the construction of M+. Upon the completion of the foundation works for M+ and the advance works of the relevant portion of the integrated basement, the main contract for the construction of M+ could be tendered out. Based on the current progress, it was expected that M+ could be completed in 2018 as scheduled.</p>	
020848 - 021156	Mr Abraham SHEK	<p>Declaration of interest by Mr Abraham SHEK.</p> <p>Mr Abraham SHEK requested the Administration and WKCDA to advise in writing –</p> <p>(a) the facilities covered in the Administration's funding submission for the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment in 2008 and the target completion dates of these facilities stated therein;</p> <p>(b) whether and how the development programmes of the WKCD facilities had been affected by the delay of the XRL project, including the extent of delay, if any; and</p> <p>(c) how the rough cost estimate of the integrated basement and the related public infrastructure</p>	Admin/ WKCDA

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>works produced in 2013 (i.e. around \$23 billion) was derived, including whether any geological study had been conducted for the relevant parts of the WKCD site where the basement would be built.</p> <p>Mr SHEK added that given the huge sums of public funding involved in the integrated basement project, the Administration should explain clearly the need for and merits of the project.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item IV - Any other business</i>			
021157 - 021213	Chairman	Date of next meeting	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
18 February 2015