

# **立法會**

## ***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. CB(2)1819/14-15  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/12

### **Panel on Home Affairs and Panel on Development**

### **Joint Subcommittee to Monitor the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

### **Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday, 19 May 2015, at 3:00 pm in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP  
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Member attending** : Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP

**Members absent** : Hon Steven HO Chun-yin  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

**Public Officers attending** : Items I, II and III

Home Affairs Bureau

Mrs Betty FUNG CHING Suk-yee, JP  
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen, JP  
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

Ms Angela LEE Chung-yan  
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs(3)

Ms Sabrina LAW Chung  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West  
Kowloon Cultural District)

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Michael LYNCH  
Chief Executive Officer

Mr Jeremy STOWE  
Head, Construction Project Management

Item I

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Louis YU Kwok-lit  
Executive Director, Performing Arts

Item II

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Dr Lars NITTVE  
Executive Director, M+

Item III

Civil Engineering and Development Department

Ms Alice PANG  
Deputy Project Manager (Kowloon)

Mr Ringo MOK Wing-cheong  
Chief Engineer/Kowloon 5

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Amy YU  
Chief Council Secretary (2)6

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Jasmine TAM  
Senior Council Secretary (2)8  
  
Miss Meisy KWOK  
Legislative Assistant (2)6

---

Action

**I. Update on the development of Xiqu Centre**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1463/14-15(01)-(02))

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") briefed members on the progress of the Xiqu Centre project, details of which were set out in its paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1463/14-15(01)) and powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation materials provided by the WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1531/14-15(01) on 20 May 2015.)*

Admin/  
WKCD

3. The Administration and WKCD were requested to follow up members' concern that the design of the pedestrian passageways leading to the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"), whether newly constructed or existing ones, should match the artistic and cultural ambience of WKCD.

**II Update on the development of M+**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1463/14-15(03)-(04))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, WKCD briefed members on the progress of the M+ project, details of which were set out in its paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1463/14-15(03)) and powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation materials provided by WKCD was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1531/14-15(02) on 20 May 2015.)*

5. Ir Dr LO Wai-kyong declared that he was a member of the Board of WKCD.

Admin/  
WKCD

6. The Administration/WKCD were requested to advise in writing –

- (a) the functions, mode of operation, and composition of the Collections Trust to be set up; and

Action

- (b) the relationship among and the respective responsibilities of the Collections Trust, M+ Limited and the WKCDA Board, particularly in regard to the selection and approval of acquisitions by M+.

Admin/  
WKCDA

7. In response to Miss CHAN Yuen-han's concern that conflict of interests might arise in the selection and approval of acquisitions under the proposed governance model for M+, the Administration/WKCDA agreed to provide for members' reference information about the procedures on avoidance of conflict of interests for Chairman/members of the authorities involved in advising on/approving acquisitions by M+.

### **III Implementation of the integrated basement and infrastructure works for the West Kowloon Cultural District**

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1463/14-15(05)-(06))

8. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Administration briefed members on the proposed funding applications for (a) the first and second stages of design, site investigation and construction works of the WKCD integrated basement under 763CL(part); and (b) the first construction package of the infrastructure works for WKCD under 754CL(part), details of which were set out in its paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)1463/14-15(05)) and powerpoint presentation materials tabled at the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the powerpoint presentation materials provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1531/14-15(03) on 20 May 2015.)*

9. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok declared that he was a member of the Board of WKCDA.

10. At the request of Dr Helena WONG, the Administration agreed to provide for members' reference information on the preliminary costing prepared in 2010 for the integrated basement as envisaged in the Conceptual Plan prepared by Foster + Partners, which was subsequently selected as the preferred option for developing into a Development Plan for WKCD.

*(Post-meeting note: The information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1697/14-15(01) on 11 June 2015.)*

11. The Administration was also requested to incorporate the following information in its funding application for the first and second stages of design, site investigation and construction works of the WKCD integrated

Action

basement to be submitted to the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") and the Finance Committee –

- (a) whether it would be a waste to construct Zones 3A and 3B of the integrated basement if the other portions of the basement, such as Zones 2A and 2C, would eventually not be implemented; and
- (b) the cost-sharing arrangement between the Government and private developers for the development of the portions of the integrated basement for the hotel, office and residential sites in WKCD.

*(Post-meeting note: The requested information was set out in paragraphs 14(b) and 25 of LC Paper No. PWSC(2015-16)30.)*

12. Members did not raise objection to the Administration's submission of the proposed funding applications to PWSC for consideration.

**IV. Any other business**

13. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:58 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
29 June 2015

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor  
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project  
held on Tuesday, 19 May 2015, at 3:00 pm  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)/Discussion</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
000839 - 000947	Chairman	Opening Remarks	
<i>Agenda Item I - Update on the development of Xiqu Centre</i>			
000948 - 001831	Admin WKCD	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD") on the progress of the Xiqu Centre project (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1463/14-15(01) and CB(2)1531/14-15(01)).	
001832 - 002221	Ms Claudia MO Chairman WKCD	<p>Ms Claudia MO enquired whether WKCD would reconsider changing the English name "Xiqu Centre" to, for instance, "Hei Kuk Centre" which could project a stronger sense of local identity for the venue, or "Chinese Opera Centre" which was more easily understandable to foreigners.</p> <p>WKCD advised that "Xiqu Centre" had been used as the working title of the venue since the establishment of WKCD in 2008. The issue of the English name of the venue had been discussed over the past two years, and WKCD was of the view that "Xiqu Centre" was an appropriate English name for the venue which would feature not only Cantonese opera but also other types of Chinese opera.</p>	
002222 - 002805	Mr IP Kwok-him WKCD	<p>Mr IP Kwok-him enquired about the following –</p> <p>(a) in view of the good response to the Rising Stars of Cantonese Opera 2015, whether WKCD would organize more such activities to nurture young talents and promote Xiqu among the younger generation; and</p> <p>(b) the purpose of organizing the Tea House Theatre Taster, the profile of the audience of the programme and how they were selected.</p> <p>WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) the Rising Stars of Cantonese Opera 2015 was one of the pre-opening programmes organized by WKCD to nurture young talents. WKCD would organize more such activities in collaboration with the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts ("HKAPA") and the Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong ("CAAHK"), its partners in young artist training projects, in the run-up to Xiqu Centre's completion targeted in 2017; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>(b) the Tea House Theatre Taster was a prototype programme organized by WKCDA to test out ideas on the design, operation and programming for the unique venue of Tea House Theatre in Xiqu Centre. The programme was held on three days in May 2015 at a replica space created at HKAPA with refreshment served and live theatre performances presented. About half of the audience were from the Xiqu and tourism sectors, while the other half were people who had not watched Chinese opera before. All participants attended the event by invitation and about half were below the age of 50. The feedback collected from the audience showed that the future Tea House Theatre would appeal particularly to first-time audiences of Chinese opera, both locals and tourists.</p>	
002806 - 003303	Ms Emily LAU WKCDA Admin	<p>Ms Emily LAU enquired about the following –</p> <p>(a) the programmes organized by WKCDA to nurture young artists and build audience for the future Xiqu Centre; and</p> <p>(b) whether adequate channels and training opportunities were available for interested young people to widen their exposure to Cantonese opera.</p> <p>WKCDA and the Administration responded that –</p> <p>(a) as part of its ongoing effort to provide support and training opportunities to young artists, WKCDA had organized two programmes this year, namely the Rising Stars of Cantonese Opera 2015 and the Tea House Theatre Taster, to provide a platform for young artists to showcase their performance;</p> <p>(b) WKCDA had been working over the past years on building new audiences of different generations and different types for the future Xiqu Centre through various pre-opening programmes such as the West Kowloon Bamboo Theatre and the Tea House Theatre Taster. WKCDA would conduct more audience building programmes after the opening of Xiqu Centre; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration had introduced various initiatives in recent years to cultivate young talents in Cantonese opera. In addition to the four-year Chinese opera degree programme recently launched by HKAPA, CAAHK had also been selected as the Venue Partner of the Yau Ma Tei Theatre ("YMTT") for a second three-year term to groom up-and-coming Cantonese opera performers. Furthermore, a New Cantonese Opera Play Scriptwriting Competition was recently organized by the Cantonese Opera Development Fund to nurture budding playwrights in Cantonese opera.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
003304 - 003840	Dr Helena WONG WKCD	<p>Dr Helena WONG enquired about the following –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the impact of the delay in the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") project on the completion time of the construction works of Xiqu Centre; and</li> <li>(b) whether the design of the existing pedestrian subway across Canton Road, which would be one of the main pedestrian passageways leading to Xiqu Centre, could be improved to echo with the cultural ambience of Xiqu Centre.</li> </ul> <p>WKCD assured members that the delay in the XRL project would not have significant adverse impact on the progress of the construction works of the Xiqu Centre, which was scheduled for completion in 2017.</p>	
003841 - 004605	Deputy Chairman WKCD	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired about the following –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) whether the two senior management positions of Artistic Director ("AD") and General Manager ("GM") to be recruited in 2015-2016 would be responsible directly to the WKCD Board; and</li> <li>(b) from the perspective of artistic accountability, whether AD would have full autonomy in respect of the selection of operas and programming of performances to be staged at Xiqu Centre.</li> </ul> <p>WKCD responded that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) AD and GM would be directly responsible to the Executive Director, Performing Arts ("ED, PA") of WKCD. To support the management structure of Xiqu Centre, it was also planned that an advisory committee would be set up to advise the WKCD management on matters relating to the management and operation of Xiqu Centre; and</li> <li>(b) ED, PA was responsible for overseeing the overall operation of as well as the co-ordination and interface among the various performing arts venues in the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD"); while AD would take full charge of the artistic direction of the entire Xiqu Centre and be responsible for the artistic output and overall image of the venue, including the programming of Xiqu performances.</li> </ul>	
004606 - 005031	Mr IP Kwok-him Admin WKCD	<p>In response to Mr IP Kwok-him's enquiry about the respective positioning of the Xiqu Centre and YMTT in promoting the development of Chinese opera, the Administration and WKCD advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) YMTT, with a seating capacity of 300, served mainly as a training venue for young artists of Cantonese opera. CAAHK, the current venue partner at YMTT,</li> </ul>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>had the mission of nurturing up-and-coming young Cantonese opera performers; and around 150 Cantonese opera performances would be held at YMTT each year to provide training and performance opportunities for young artists; and</p> <p>(b) one of the key objectives of Xiqu Centre, which would be equipped with a 1 100-seat Main Theatre, was to provide world-class facilities for the staging of large-scale performances of different Xiqu genres. On the nurturing of talents, Xiqu Centre would focus on the training of emerging talents of Cantonese opera and provide a venue for emerging talents to showcase their artistic performance.</p>	
005032 - 005256	Dr Helena WONG Admin WKCD	<p>In response to Dr Helena WONG's earlier enquiry about the management of the existing pedestrian subway across Canton Road and the feasibility of enhancing the design of the subway, the Administration advised that the existing pedestrian subway across Canton Road was under the management of the Transport Department ("TD") and it would follow up with TD on Dr WONG's suggestion.</p> <p>Dr Helena WONG further asked about the role of AD in the promotion of Xiqu education in Xiqu Centre, which included 2 000 square metres of public education facilities.</p> <p>WKCD advised that AD would be responsible for applying the artistic direction to all areas of the development of the venue, including the artistic strategies and programming for the education facilities in Xiqu Centre, audience building and training of young talents.</p>	
005257 - 005722	Ms Emily LAU WKCD	<p>Ms Emily LAU enquired whether there would be resident companies in Xiqu Centre and whether rehearsal spaces for local troupes would be provided in the venue.</p> <p>WKCD advised that in the light of the views of the Xiqu sector, it had decided to directly operate Xiqu Centre, instead of engaging a single troupe to take on a residency role at Xiqu Centre. Taking into account the needs of local troupes, WKCD would provide rehearsal and production spaces in the venue to facilitate new productions and rehearsals by up-and-coming artistic talents.</p>	
005723 - 010257	Mr Tony TSE Admin Chairman	<p>Mr Tony TSE pointed out that when the Joint Subcommittee discussed the connectivity of WKCD with its neighbouring districts about two years ago, members had emphasized that the design of the pedestrian facilities connecting WKCD with its surrounding areas should be coherent and match with the artistic and cultural ambience of WKCD. He was concerned whether members' view in this regard had been followed up by the relevant government departments and WKCD.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>The Administration clarified that for new pedestrian facilities connecting WKCD with its neighbouring areas such as the footbridge linking the Artist Square with the Elements shopping mall, special elements would be incorporated into their design to match with the cultural ambience of WKCD. The pedestrian subway across Canton Road mentioned by Dr Helena WONG was, however, an existing pedestrian link. That said, the Administration would liaise with TD on the suggested enhancement of its design.</p> <p>The Chairman shared members' view that the design of the pedestrian passageways leading to WKCD, whether newly constructed or existing ones, should match the artistic and cultural ambience of WKCD. He requested the Administration/WKCDA to follow up the matter.</p>	<b>Admin/ WKCD</b>
<i>Agenda Item II - Update on the development of M+</i>			
010258 - 012415	Admin WKCD	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by WKCD on the progress of the M+ project (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1463/14-15(03) and CB(2)1531/14-15(02)).	
012416 - 012926	Ms Claudia MO WKCD	<p>Ms Claudia MO raised the following enquiries –</p> <p>(a) given that multiple layers of authority were involved in the proposed governance structure of M+ as shown in WKCD's powerpoint presentation materials (LC Paper No. CB(2)1531/14-15(02)), whether WKCD would assure the public that the proposed M+ Limited to be set up would not slip into bureaucracy and become an "independent kingdom"; and</p> <p>(b) whether and how the Executive Director of M+ ("ED, M+") would guarantee that there would be no political censorship in the selection of works to be acquired by and displayed at M+.</p> <p>WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) the proposed governance structure of M+ sought to ensure greater transparency and reduce bureaucracy in its operation through setting out clearly the decision-making responsibilities and the accountability of the parties involved in the future management and governance of M+; and</p> <p>(b) the M+ team fully appreciated that artistic freedom and freedom of expression were central to the success of any cultural institution, and would make independent judgements if these freedoms were under threat. So far, the M+ team had not felt any pressure in exercising artistic freedom in their work.</p>	
012927 - 013510	Mr IP Kwok-him WKCD	Noting that the proposed M+ Limited would be established under the Companies Ordinance (Cap. 622) as	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>a separate legal entity, Mr IP Kwok-him requested WKCD A to explain in more detail the relationship between and the respective responsibilities of the WKCD A Board and M+ Limited, particularly in respect of the control over the assets and finances of M+ Limited.</p> <p>Mr IP further raised the following enquiry and view in relation to acquisitions by M+ –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the amount of funding that had been earmarked for purchase of works by M+; and</li> <li>(b) the artistic freedom and curatorial independence of M+ should be safeguarded in such a way that M+ should not be prevented from acquiring, or be requested to acquire, specific artworks or works produced by any specific artist.</li> </ul> <p>WKCD A advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the proposed M+ Limited would be set up as a subsidiary company wholly-owned by WKCD A. It would be non profit-making and would function more like a trust. While decisions on museological and curatorial matters would be made by the Board of M+ Limited ("the M+ Board"), members of which would be appointed by the WKCD A Board, WKCD A would basically retain control over all aspects of M+ Limited including the overall monitoring and control over the finances of M+ Limited. Funding allocation to M+ Limited would be managed centrally by WKCD A, and the business and corporate plans of M+ Limited would be submitted to the WKCD A Board for approval after being endorsed by the M+ Board; and</li> <li>(b) the upfront endowment granted to WKCD A had included a sum of over \$1 billion for acquisitions by M+ and about one-third of it had been spent so far. Separately, M+ had received various artworks as well as cash donations from donors, the total value of which was about \$1.35 billion. To underline its commitment to transparency, WKCD A had published the up-to-date M+ Acquisition Policy and the complete list of the M+ Collection on its website for public information.</li> </ul>	
013511 - 014119	Dr Helena WONG WKCD A	<p>Dr Helena WONG raised the following views and enquiry –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) M+ should uphold its positioning as a museum of visual culture for Hong Kong people and ensure that Hong Kong art should always be the core of and well represented in the M+ Collection;</li> <li>(b) given that works from Hong Kong and works from other regions of China respectively accounted for</li> </ul>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>32% and 42% of the total number of accumulated works acquired by M+ to date as shown in WKCDA's powerpoint presentation materials (LC Paper No. CB(2)1531/14-15(02)), whether M+ had plans to increase the number of works from Hong Kong to be acquired and whether a target had been set for the proportion of works from Hong Kong in the M+ Collection upon the opening of M+; and</p> <p>(c) as there had been complaints about the visual and environmental nuisance caused by the glittery façade of the International Commercial Centre ("ICC") located in the vicinity of WKCD, WKCDA should avoid using reflective materials (e.g. glass and steel) for the façade of the M+ building to minimize possible adverse impacts on nearby residents and road users.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that –</p> <p>(a) the figures provided in the powerpoint presentation materials only served to provide a snapshot of the geographical distribution of the works acquired by M+ so far, and the higher number of works from other regions of China was mainly attributed to the approximately 1 500 works of Chinese contemporary art donated by/acquired from Dr Uli Sigg earlier. Unlike other local museums which focused mainly on telling the story of Hong Kong, M+'s vision was to build a world-class collection representative of the 20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> century visual culture from a Hong Kong perspective with a global vision. While an appropriate balance should be struck between the representation of Hong Kong art and non-Hong Kong art in the M+ Collection, it might not be suitable to measure the level of representation or importance of Hong Kong art in the M+ Collection in terms of the number of such works acquired; and</p> <p>(b) as opposed to the façade of ICC which was made of sheer glass, the glass windows of the M+ building would be installed behind units of precast concrete elements. The façade of the M+ building would, therefore, look very different from that of ICC.</p>	
014120 - 014336	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	<p>Declaration of interest by Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok expressed the following views –</p> <p>(a) M+'s vision and strategy for building its collection had been clearly laid down in the M+ Acquisition Policy. Given the increasing importance and standing of Chinese contemporary art in the international market, it was reasonable for M+ to include works from other regions of China in its collection; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		(b) while he welcomed the inclusion of more quality works from Hong Kong in the M+ Collection which would help showcase the talents of Hong Kong artists to the international arts community, he considered it not necessary to set a rigid target for the number of works from Hong Kong to be acquired by M+.	
014337 - 014723	Ms Emily LAU WKCD	<p>Ms Emily LAU expressed appreciation of the architectural design of M+, which would make M+ an iconic landmark in Hong Kong. She further sought the view of ED, M+ on how M+, upon completion of the museum building and with the ongoing enrichment of its collection, would rank among other major museums around the world.</p> <p>ED, M+ advised that in his view, the design of the M+ building was phenomenal and probably the best among the various museums for contemporary art and design that had been built. With the ambitions to be the first museum of its kind in Asia and to rank among the top five museums for visual culture in the world, M+ was making good progress and would continue to develop on different fronts including building the museum building and its collection and raising awareness through inventive pre-opening programmes.</p>	
014724 - 015157	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin WKCD	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han expressed concern that conflict of interests might arise in the selection and approval of acquisitions under the proposed governance model for M+. She considered it necessary for the Administration/WKCD to advise in writing (a) the functions, mode of operation, and composition of the Collections Trust to be set up; and (b) the relationship among and the respective responsibilities of the Collections Trust, M+ Limited and the WKCD Board, particularly in regard to the selection and approval of acquisitions by M+.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the Home Affairs Bureau had been monitoring the formulation of the governance structure of M+ through representation on the Board and the Museum Committee of WKCD. WKCD had been working on the establishment of the Collections Trust and preparation of the relevant legal documents, which sought to set out the powers and responsibilities of the Trust and its relationship with the M+ Board and the WKCD Board. While the Collections Trust would own the collections of M+, the management of the collections would rest with M+. The Administration/WKCD would give due regard to the need to put in place appropriate checks and balance in considering the respective compositions of and appointments to the WKCD Board, the M+ Board, and the Collections Trust.</p>	<b>Admin/ WKCD</b>
015158 - 020023	Deputy Chairman WKCD	The Deputy Chairman raised the following enquiries –	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>(a) whether ED, M+ could undertake that an artistic accountability system would be implemented in M+ under which the director of M+ could make decisions on acquisitions and curatorial matters independently and would be accountable for such decisions; and</p> <p>(b) how M+ would capitalize on the geographical location of Hong Kong as a gateway to China and Hong Kong's unique position as a meeting point of Eastern and Western cultures to achieve the goal of becoming an innovative and forward-looking museum institution, thereby raising Hong Kong's standing on the international cultural and artistic scene.</p> <p>ED, M+ responded that –</p> <p>(a) he agreed that artistic accountability was critical to the success of any cultural institution as it would help build the long-term trust of the public in the institution's programming and artistic decisions;</p> <p>(b) while all proposed acquisitions by M+ would be approved by different tiers of authority according to the value of the works, such proposals would always come from and be thoroughly discussed by the curatorial team which had professional expertise in museum matters; and</p> <p>(c) with the proposed governance model for M+ under which curatorial and museological decisions rested with a specialized museum board, M+ would have in place a governance and accountability system that was generally in line with international best practices.</p>	
020024 - 020452	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan WKCD	<p>Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired about the uses of the floor spaces in the vertical tower of the M+ building. She further suggested that to tie in with the Government's policy in promoting energy saving and emission reduction in buildings, WKCD should liaise with the Environment Bureau on the relevant requirements for new buildings and incorporate appropriate green features into the design of the M+ building accordingly.</p> <p>WKCD advised that –</p> <p>(a) the vertical tower of the M+ building would house an array of public, back-of-house and retail, dining and entertainment ("RDE") facilities, including a café, a learning centre, a curatorial centre to be used as the office of the curatorial team and related staff, a Members' area for members and patrons of the museum, other arts and cultural facilities, as well as RDE facilities on the top three floors; and</p> <p>(b) sustainability was one of the key principles upon which the WKCD project was premised. WKCD</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>had been in discussion with relevant government bureaux and departments on ways to maximize the environmental benefits of individual buildings/facilities in WKCD. The M+ building aimed to achieve a Gold rating under the Building Environmental Assessment Method Plus assessment scheme and the electrical and mechanical installations in the building would adhere to the relevant rating standards.</p>	
020453 - 020914	Chairman Admin	<p>The Chairman queried the necessity for implementing the governance of M+ through the establishment of M+ Limited, which deviated from the existing governance framework for public museums managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") under which the Chief Curator of each museum was responsible for the overall management of the museum including its collections.</p> <p>The Administration explained that given the large volume and high value of the collections of M+, it was crucial for the stakeholders and partners of M+ to be clear that they were working directly with M+ as an institution. The proposal to set up M+ Limited sought to create a clearer identity for M+ as an institution and remove the legal ambiguity in the eyes of people dealing with M+, as well as to maximize public perception of the artistic freedom and curatorial independence of M+. While the Government had decided in 2010 not to corporatize public museums and that public museums would continue to be managed by LCSD, the post of Chief Curator had been retitled as Museum Director with a view to strengthening the identity of individual public museums.</p>	
020915 - 021200	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han reiterated her concern about how the Administration/WKCDA would guard against conflict of interests in considering appointments to the WKCDA Board, the M+ Board and the Collections Trust.</p> <p>The Administration responded that while appointments to the M+ Board had yet to be made by the WKCDA Board, the intended composition of the M+ Board should bring together diverse expertise and experience to support the different areas of M+, and future members who were not directly from the industry should have a strong interest in museums and/or collecting. Procedures on avoidance of conflict of interests for Chairman/members of the authorities involved in advising on/approving acquisitions were set out in the M+ Acquisition Policy, which had been reviewed recently and the updated version had been uploaded onto WKCDA's website. The Administration/WKCDA would provide information on such procedures for members' reference.</p>	<b>Admin/ WKCD</b>
021201 - 021420	Deputy Chairman WKCD	In response to the Deputy Chairman's earlier enquiry about how M+ would establish itself as an innovative and	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>forward-looking museum of its kind, WKCDA advised that while M+ was unique in the way that it would be telling the story of Hong Kong art as well as the art in other regions of China and Asia as a part of the global history and it would be the first museum in Asia to systematically collect works in design, architecture and moving image, it would at the same time be an international museum and would seek to explore partnership and collaboration opportunities with other major museums around the world.</p>	
021421 - 021707	Dr Helena WONG WKCDA	<p>Dr Helena WONG raised the following view and enquiry –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) since M+'s acquisitions were paid out of public money, WKCDA should make available details on the works acquired by M+, including the purchase price of each work, for public inspection; and</li> <li>(b) how M+ would determine the creative/aesthetic merit, quality and value of an acquisition.</li> </ul> <p>WKCDA advised that –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) while it would make public M+'s annual expenditure on acquisitions and the categories and geographical distribution of the works acquired, it would not disclose the transaction price of individual acquisitions in order to avoid undermining M+'s bargaining power in future acquisitions; and</li> <li>(b) all proposed acquisitions would be carefully reviewed and discussed by the Interim Acquisition Committee comprising members with relevant professional expertise. Each acquisition would be determined and approved strictly in accordance with the criteria and procedures as set out in the M+ Acquisition Policy.</li> </ul>	
021708 - 022128	Chairman WKCDA Admin	<p>The Chairman expressed concern about the co-ordination between M+ and LCSD museums in collection of artworks. In his view, M+ should develop and adopt objective standards for assessing the collection value of individual artworks. He urged WKCDA to strengthen communication with LCSD on each other's scope of collections to avoid duplication in acquiring artworks.</p> <p>The Administration responded that each LCSD museum would acquire works in accordance with its own positioning and collection strategy. Notwithstanding the different positioning of LCSD museums and M+, they might need to acquire or display in their exhibitions works comprising similar elements/components with different curatorial perspectives. WKCDA had all along maintained close dialogues with LCSD museums on collection and acquisition matters and would continue to do so in future.</p>	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
<i>Agenda Item III - Implementation of the integrated basement and infrastructure works for the West Kowloon Cultural District</i>			
022129 - 023632	Admin WKCD	Briefing and powerpoint presentation by the Administration on the proposed funding applications for (a) the first and second stages of design, site investigation and construction works of the WKCD integrated basement under 763CL(part); and (b) the first construction package of the infrastructure works for WKCD under 754CL(part) (LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1463/14-15(05) and CB(2)1531/14-15(03)).	
023633 - 024704	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin Dr Helena WONG	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that while she appreciated that the construction of the various WKCD facilities could only commence after the completion of the relevant parts of the integrated basement, she was gravely concerned about the high cost estimate of the integrated basement, which had increased from over \$10 billion as previously advised by the Chief Secretary for Administration cum WKCD Board Chairman to around \$23 billion, and the serious cost overrun of the whole WKCD project. Noting that the integrated basement would be implemented in phases, Miss CHAN and Dr Helena WONG enquired whether the Administration could undertake that the final cost of the whole integrated basement would be in the region of \$23 billion as estimated. Miss CHAN added that she neither supported nor opposed the proposed funding applications.</p> <p>The Administration advised that –</p> <p>(a) the rough cost estimate of around \$23 billion in money-of the-day prices for the integrated basement and the associated public infrastructure works was derived in mid-2013 on the assumption that the construction of the whole integrated basement would be completed in one go by 2020. Based on the phased implementation arrangement, the estimated total amount of funding sought for implementing Zones 3A, 3B and 2B of the integrated basement and the associated public infrastructure works would be about \$10 billion. However, the cost estimates for the remaining portions of the integrated basement (i.e. Zones 2A and 2C), which were to be implemented at a later stage, were not available yet. Hence, the Administration was not in a position to give an undertaking that the final cost of the whole integrated basement would not exceed \$23 billion; and</p> <p>(b) the funding sought under the current funding application for the first and second stages of design, site investigation and construction works of the integrated basement covered mainly the costs of the relevant works for Zones 3A and 3B of the integrated basement, the completion of which was essential for the implementation of the topside facilities including</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>M+, the Lyric Theatre Complex and the Artist Square Development Area. It also covered the costs of carrying out design and site investigation for Zones 2A, 2B and 2C of the integrated basement, which would facilitate the Administration in drawing up more realistic cost estimates for the remaining works of the integrated basement to be implemented.</p> <p>While noting that the basement design was not envisaged when the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion was granted to WKCD in 2008, Dr Helena WONG considered that the Administration/WKCD should have had regard to the amount of the endowment fund granted to WKCD in selecting the Conceptual Plan ("CP") for the WKCD development. To facilitate Members' consideration of the funding proposal for the integrated basement, she considered it necessary for the Administration to explain the decision-making process for the selection of the CP prepared by Foster + Partners ("F+P") as the preferred option for the WKCD development, particularly whether any assessment had been conducted on the financial implications for implementing the integrated basement as envisaged in F+P's CP.</p> <p>The Administration responded that -</p> <p>(a) the upfront endowment of \$21.6 billion was sought in 2008 to implement the WKCD development covering the arts and cultural facilities, RDE facilities, public open space and certain transport facilities within WKCD. The basement design was not envisaged back then, and was only proposed in the CP options for WKCD prepared for public consultation in 2010; and</p> <p>(b) the integrated basement as proposed in F+P's CP, with all vehicular traffic and the related facilities to be put underground, was an essential feature to meet the statutory minimum requirement of providing 23 hectares of public open space in WKCD. While preliminary costing for the integrated basement should have been prepared in 2010 and the relevant information could be provided for members' reference, the rough cost estimate drawn up back then would likely be very different from the current estimate given the significant increase in construction cost in recent years.</p> <p>In response to Dr Helena WONG's further enquiry about the adequacy of the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment fund for the implementation of all WKCD facilities, the Administration advised that as informed in the previous Joint Subcommittee meetings, the portion of the endowment fund for the design and construction of the WKCD facilities, which was around \$15.8 billion, would be sufficient to cover the design and construction costs of</p>	Admin

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		the Batch 1 and Batch 2 facilities; while the funding for and the implementation programme of the Batch 3 facilities would be reviewed in due course.	
024705 - 025002	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	<p>Declaration of interest by Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok expressed the following views –</p> <p>(a) the integrated basement was an essential feature of the design of WKCD to free up at-grade space for arts and cultural use and create a pedestrian-friendly district for public enjoyment by putting all the traffic, parking and loading/unloading facilities underground; and</p> <p>(b) as the development and commissioning of the various WKCD venues hinged on the timely implementation and completion of the integrated basement and other public infrastructure works for WKCD, he hoped that the proposed funding applications would be endorsed by the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") and approved by the Finance Committee ("FC") as soon as possible so that the relevant works could commence as scheduled.</p>	
025003 - 025420	Mr IP Kwok-him	<p>Mr IP Kwok-him expressed the following views –</p> <p>(a) recognizing that it had all along been planned that the Administration would undertake the communal and government facilities and related engineering works for supporting the whole WKCD with funding to be sought from the Legislative Council ("LegCo") separately, and that the integrated basement was an integral part of the Development Plan for WKCD which was formulated after extensive consultations during the public engagement exercise, he supported the current proposals of the Administration to seek funding to implement the integrated basement and other public infrastructure works for WKCD as planned to facilitate early development of the topside facilities in WKCD for public enjoyment; and</p> <p>(b) given that the Administration had assured LegCo Members in 2008 that the \$21.6 billion upfront endowment should be sufficient for financing the costs of all the arts and cultural facilities and other associated facilities in WKCD, it should not seek to obtain additional funding from LegCo to supplement the original endowment fund in a bid to address the problem of cost overrun of the project.</p>	
025421 - 025903	Deputy Chairman Chairman	The Deputy Chairman said that as the implementation of Zones 3A and 3B of the integrated basement was part and parcel of the development of the topside arts and cultural facilities such as M+, he generally supported the proposed funding application for the first and second stages of design, site investigation and construction works of the	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>integrated basement. He further said that to facilitate Members' consideration of the proposed funding application, the Administration should incorporate the following information in its paper to be submitted to PWSC and FC –</p> <p>(a) whether it would be a waste to construct Zones 3A and 3B of the integrated basement if the other portions of the basement, such as Zones 2A and 2C, would eventually not be implemented; and</p> <p>(b) the cost-sharing arrangement between the Government and private developers for the development of the portions of the integrated basement for the hotel, office and residential sites in WKCD.</p> <p>Members did not raise objection to the Administration's submission of the proposed funding applications to PWSC for consideration.</p>	<b>Admin</b>
<i>Agenda Item IV - Any other business</i>			
025904 - 025913	Chairman	Closing remarks	