

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

Ref : CB2/PL/WS

LC Paper No. CB(2)1048/14-15  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

**Panel on Welfare Services**

**Minutes of special meeting**  
**held on Tuesday, 20 January 2015, at 10:00 am**  
**in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che (Chairman)  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
- Members absent** : Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
- Public Officers attending** : Item I  
Miss Annie TAM, JP  
Permanent Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr Donald CHEN, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Labour and Welfare (Welfare) 2  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr Steve TSE  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare (Special  
Duties)  
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr LAM Ka-tai, JP  
Deputy Director of Social Welfare (Services)  
Social Welfare Department

Miss Cecilla LI  
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)  
Social Welfare Department

Dr Ernest CHUI  
Principal Investigator  
Consultant Team

**Attendance by invitation** : Item I

Mr WONG Cheuk-kin, Member of Yuen Long District Council

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong  
Kong

---

Ms CHEUNG Fan-lan  
Deputy Spokesperson of Welfare Services

Hong Kong Rehabilitation Power

Mr Stanley NG  
Executive Director

長者社區照顧服務關注組

Mr NG Ming-wai  
Representative

The Forthright Caucus

Miss LAM Ling

Labour Party

Mr LO Ho-yuen  
Representative

Miss Alice Ishigami LEE Fung-king

爭取資助院舍聯席

Mr LEE Chi-yung  
Convenor

Hong Kong Social Security Society

Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam

Ms HUI Ching-yee

Ms CHEUNG Lai-mui

Ms CHEUNG Lai-man

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service, Task Group on  
Manpower Shortage

---

Ms Elaine LAM Yee-li  
Member

智障人士老齡化關注組

Ms WONG Ming-fung

葵涌邨長者權益關注組

Ms LO Lai-ping  
Member

Mr WONG Yun-tat, Member of Kwai Tsing District Council

Neighbourhood and Worker's Service Centre

Mr CHOW Kam-pui  
Organizer

Mr WONG Wai-yin, Member of Yuen Long District Council

全港長者及護老者權益聯席

Mr KWONG Wing-tai

將軍澳長者民生關注會

Ms MAK Yuen-lin

Chosen Parents' Network

Ms AU Yim-fong  
Chairperson

Carer Alliance for the Dementia

Ms CHEUNG Yuet-kam  
Chairperson

Victoria City Social Service Centre

Mr Mark LI  
Chairman

Liberal Party Youth Committee

Mr Harris YEUNG

照顧者關注組

Miss CHU Moon-chun  
Member

葵涌邨居民權益關注組

Mr CHEUNG Kai-bing  
Secretary

Elderly Welfare Concern Group

Mr LAI Ming-lai  
Member

工友權益聯社

Ms CHEUNG Man-wai  
Member

Grassroots Development Centre

Mr NG Kin-wing  
Member

St. Francis Church (Caring Committee – Senior Group)

Ms WONG Bik-yam  
Member

St. Francis Church (Caring Committee)

Mr WONG Keung-sang  
Member

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service, Specialized  
Committee on Elderly Service

---

Mr YEUNG Chiap-to  
Vice-Chairman

Caritas – Hong Kong

Mr LEUNG Tsan-kuen  
Social Work Supervisor

Hong Kong Young Women's Christian Association

Ms LI Kit-ching  
Supervisor

Evangelical Lutheran Church Social Service – Hong Kong

Mr Schwinger WONG Chi-kit  
Service Director

S.K.H. Holy Carpenter Church Community Centre

Mr SHUM Wai-chuen  
Service Director

Hong Kong Association of Gerontology

Ms CHEUNG Yuk-har  
Consultant

Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited

Ms LUK Loi-tai  
Service Director

長者政策監察聯席 – 聯席之友

Ms FUNG Miu-ha  
Member

香港基督教服務處長者評議會

Mr PANG Fai-hang  
Member

The Salvation Army,  
Yau Ma Tei Multi-service Centre for Senior Citizens

Ms CHU Pui-shan  
Team Leader

St James' Settlement

Ms LUI Kwok-ying  
Clinical Practice Leader

天水圍長者權益關注組

Ms LEUNG Choi-kam

關注家居照顧服務大聯盟

Ms CHIM Miu-cheung

Hong Kong Family Welfare Society

Miss WONG Kit-yu  
Senior Manager (Elderly Service)

Civic Party

Miss Vicky CHIU Pui-sze  
District Developer

**Clerk in attendance** : Mr Colin CHUI  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Catherina YU  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Kay CHU  
Council Secretary (2) 4

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

---

Action

**I. Elderly Services Programme Plan**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)381/14-15(08) to (09), CB(2)402/14-15(01), CB(2)628/14-15(01) to (02), CB(2)674/14-15(01) to (09) and CB(2)705/14-15(01) to (11)]

At the invitation of the Chairman, Permanent Secretary for Labour and Welfare ("PS(LW)") briefed members on the progress of the preparation of the Elderly Services Programme Plan ("the Programme Plan") by the Elderly Commission ("EC").

Action

2. The Chairman invited deputations/individuals to present their views. A total of 46 deputations/individuals expressed their views which were summarized in the **Appendix**.

3. In response to the views of the deputations/individuals, Dr Ernest CHUI said that the Consultant Team would conduct the study in respect of the formulation of the Programme Plan by soliciting stakeholders' views on elderly services in three stages, namely Scoping, Formulation and Consensus Building, and analyze the collected views from an academic perspective. That said, a proper balance has to be struck in considering an appropriate scope of the Programme Plan. As for the release of the report of the Scoping Stage, similar to other studies, the Consultant Team would defer it to EC on the exact arrangements first. The Consultant Team would consider providing more communication channels in the public engagement exercises in the latter two stages to further encourage public participation. PS(LW) added that the Administration kept an open mind on the arrangement for the public engagement exercises in the Formulation and Consensus Building Stages. She also thanked stakeholders for their views and suggestions, and advised that the Consultant Team would consolidate and submit the public views to the Working Group on the Elderly Services Programme Plan ("WGESPP") under EC for consideration.

*(The Chairman extended the meeting time to end at 1:15pm.)*

Discussion

*Methodology for formulating the Programme Plan*

4. The Deputy Chairman said that elderly services should cover a wider spectrum of issues. Hence, it was not desirable to restrict the scope of the study by the Administration's proposed framework, which would subsequently render the Programme Plan unable to meet the needs and expectation of elderly persons. PS(LW) responded that the purpose of the Programme Plan was to provide a holistic plan for the provision of elderly services. EC would carefully consider the views and proposals submitted by stakeholders to the Consultation Team.

5. Mr POON Siu-ping said that elderly services covered a wide spectrum of issues, such as health protection scheme and retirement protection which were sometimes controversial. He wondered how EC could help the public forge



Action

consensus in the Programme Plan in the Consensus Building Stage. Dr Ernest CHUI responded that public participation was of paramount importance and would be encouraged during the course of the formulation with an aim to reach a general consensus in the community on the Programme Plan. In the Scoping Stage, stakeholders' views on elderly services would be solicited to assist WGESPP in defining the scope of the Programme Plan and identifying the key issues that needed to be addressed. Then, WGESPP would consult stakeholders on the directions and possible alternatives for handling these issues, and draw up the preliminary recommendations of the Programme Plan in the Formulation Stage. In the Consensus Building Stage, WGESPP would engage stakeholders with a view to finalizing, prioritizing and building up a consensus on the recommendations.

*Suggestions on the enhancement of elderly services*

6. Mr TANG Ka-piu noted the view of some stakeholders that the principle of "ageing in place as core" was only a slogan given that the Administration did not have a sustainable policy on or allocate sufficient resources for the provision of community care services ("CCS") for elderly persons. He called on WGESPP to realistically forecast the demand for elderly services in the next five to 10 years, and make recommendations on how to enhance elderly services to cater for the growing demand in this regard for Administration's consideration. He also urged the Administration to take immediate measures to enhance CCS. PS(LW) responded that the Programme Plan would not only take stock of the existing and planned elderly services, but also cover the longer-term projection on the demand for and supply of subsidized elderly services. Meanwhile, the Administration would continue to take measures to enhance elderly services.

7. Mr Frederick FUNG said that although members had time and again expressed grave concerns about the inadequacy of residential care services ("RCS"), the Administration had yet to fully address the problem. He urged the Administration to critically consider formulating a policy on the provision of RCS for elderly persons in government premises and public rental housing, and incorporating the aforesaid suggestion into the Programme Plan. PS(LW) assured members that EC would take account of the demand for and planning of RCS when it drew up the Programme Plan. Dr Ernest CHUI added that with all stakeholders' views consolidated, the Consultant Team would set out different options for EC's consideration.

Action

8. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that although there was a long waiting list for subsidized residential care homes for the elderly ("RCHEs"), quite a number of places in private RCHEs were left vacant. This indicated that privatization could not alleviate the shortage of RCS for elderly persons. He urged the Administration to consider, under the context of the Programme Plan, allocating more resources to enhance elderly services directly and providing long-term care services according to care needs of recipients instead of their age and disability types.

9. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung was of the view that the Administration had no sincerity to improve retirement protection for elderly persons as there was no holistic plan in this regard in the 2015 Policy Address. He said that the most desirable mode of elderly services was to provide elderly persons with flexibility and discretion to opt for different types of elderly services that best suited their personal and care needs.

Admin

10. The Chairman requested the Administration to prepare an interim report on the Programme Plan and brief the Panel on the report in November or December 2015.

Motion

11. The Chairman and the Deputy Chairman jointly moved the following motion -

"本委員會促請安老事務委員會擴闊「安老服務計劃方案」(下稱「計劃方案」)的範疇，並督促「計劃方案」顧問團隊將研究範圍擴闊至"社會福利服務、醫療、房屋及退休生活的需要"。"

(Translation)

"That, this Panel urges the Elderly Commission to extend the scope of the Elderly Services Programme Plan ("the Programme Plan") and press the consultant team of the Programme Plan to extend its scope of study to cover "social welfare services, medical services, housing and needs after retirement"."

12. The Chairman put the motion to vote. All members present voted for the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

Action

**II. Any other business**

13. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:14 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
16 March 2015

## Panel on Welfare Services

Special meeting on Tuesday, 20 January 2015 at 10:00 am

## Elderly Services Programme Plan

## Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Deputation/individual	Views
<i>Session One</i>		
1.	Mr WONG Cheuk-kin, Member of Yuen Long District Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should review the ratio between subsidized residential care places and bought places to ensure not only prudent use of public money, but also the availability of more options of residential care services ("RCS") for elderly persons. It should also consider leasing a few rural sites with low rental to operators for running high quality residential care homes for the elderly ("RCHEs").</li> </ul>
2.	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should make a pledge on the waiting time for elderly services, standardize the assessment mechanism across the board, extend the coverage of the RCS voucher to community care services ("CCS"), enhance the Integrated Home Care Services ("IHCS"), strengthen the training for healthcare workers, modify the public services to become more elderly-friendly, and evaluate the adverse effect of the Lump Sum Grant Subvention System ("LSGSS") on the manpower shortage in the welfare sector.</li> </ul>
3.	Hong Kong Rehabilitation Power	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(01)</li> </ul>
4.	長者社區照顧服務關注 組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(01)</li> </ul>
5.	The Forthright Caucus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(02)</li> </ul>
6.	Labour Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(02)</li> </ul>
7.	Miss Alice Ishigami LEE Fung-king	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should increase the number of places for Day Respite Service for Elders and Residential Respite Service for Elders, waive the means test requirement for the Pilot Scheme on Living Allowance for Carer of the Elderly Persons from Low Income Families ("the Carer Allowance"), provide tax relief for carers who lived with elderly persons being taken care of, and strengthen the training for private practitioners to enhance their knowledge of dementia.</li> </ul>
8.	爭取資助院舍聯席	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(03)</li> </ul>

No.	Deputation/individual	Views
9.	Hong Kong Social Security Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(03)</li> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(04)</li> </ul>
10.	Ms HUI Ching-ye	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(05)</li> </ul>
11.	Ms CHEUNG Lai-mui	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should make a pledge on the waiting time for RCS applications, and make reference to a comprehensive population census in formulating a long-term and holistic policy on rehabilitation services, particularly the provision of RCS, with an aim to address the ageing problems of persons with disabilities.</li> </ul>
12.	Ms CHEUNG Lai-man	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(06)</li> </ul>
13.	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service, Task Group on Manpower Shortage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)628/14-15(01)</li> </ul>
14.	智障人士老齡化關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(07)</li> </ul>
15.	葵涌邨長者權益關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should enhance long-term care ("LTC") services and elderly services, such as setting up more community canteens, to help elderly persons live a healthy and pleasant life in their twilight years.</li> </ul>
16.	Mr WONG Yun-tat, Member of Kwai Tsing District Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should allocate more resources to strengthen IHCS, make a pledge on the waiting time for IHCS applications, set up community canteens in community centres, and consider setting up the proposed Social Centre for the Elderly at the first phase of Kwai Chung Estate instead of the nearby new public rental housing ("PRH") estates.</li> </ul>
17.	Neighbourhood and Worker's Service Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should attach more importance and respond to the results of the consultancy study on the Elderly Services Programme Plan ("the Programme Plan"), otherwise it was a waste of time and efforts of the Consultant Team.</li> <li>The Administration should not tighten the eligibility criteria on age for applying welfare services as elderly persons might feel pressured to extend their retirement age.</li> </ul>
18.	Mr WONG Wai-yin, Member of Yuen Long District Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should prepare and release a white paper on rehabilitation policy, and set up a Commission on Rehabilitation Services.</li> </ul>
19.	全港長者及護老者權益聯席	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(04)</li> </ul>
20.	將軍澳長者民生關注會	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(05)</li> </ul>

No.	Deputation/individual	Views
21.	Chosen Parents' Network	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(08)</li> </ul>
22.	Carer Alliance for the Dementia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should provide persons with dementia with LTC services according to their levels of disability, and provide the frontline staff of residential care homes for persons with disabilities with the specialized training to enhance their knowledge of dementia.</li> </ul>
23.	Victoria City Social Service Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(09)</li> </ul>
24.	Liberal Party Youth Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should formulate a policy on the provision of RCS for elderly persons in PRH. It should also address the problem of manpower shortage in the welfare sector by strengthening the vocational training in the long run. In the interim, it should explore the feasibility of alleviating the aforesaid problem by the importation of foreign workers.</li> </ul>
<b>Session Two</b>		
25.	照顧者關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should provide a timetable for the implementation of universal retirement protection, waive the means test requirement for the Carer Allowance, and earmark \$5 billion in the 2015-2016 Budget to set up an Elderly Living Fund.</li> </ul>
26.	葵涌邨居民權益關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should allocate more resources to enhance elderly services, and implement non-means-tested universal retirement protection to help frail elderly persons.</li> </ul>
27.	Elderly Welfare Concern Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should critically assess the demand for elderly services before formulating policies in this regard to achieve the objective of "ageing in place".</li> </ul>
28.	工友權益聯社	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(10)</li> </ul>
29.	Grassroots Development Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should formulate a holistic and long-term strategy on elderly services which covered housing, healthcare and rehabilitation services, social security, as well as retirement protection.</li> </ul>
30.	St. Francis Church (Caring Committee – Senior Group)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(06)</li> </ul>
31.	St. Francis Church (Caring Committee)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)674/14-15(07)</li> </ul>
32.	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service, Specialized Committee on Elderly Service	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Programme Plan was expected to lay down clear objectives and review mechanism for elderly services, examine issues relating to LTC financing, implement the principle of shared responsibility of the ageing population, and promote</li> </ul>

No.	Deputation/individual	Views
		cross-sector co-operation to enhance the provision and quality of elderly services.
33.	Caritas - Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should set up a dedicated office on LTC services, review and update the Standardized Care Need Assessment Mechanism for Elderly Services ("SCNAMES") to more accurately assess the care needs of elderly persons with dementia, strengthen the support for carers of elderly persons, allocate more resources to enhance elderly services, review remuneration for healthcare workers in the welfare and medical sectors, and prepare a manpower plan for the welfare sector.</li> </ul>
34.	Hong Kong Young Women's Christian Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should allocate resources to, in collaboration with stakeholders, set up a case management system with code of practice. It should also share the clinical assessment data collected by SCNAMES with the medical and welfare sectors for better planning of their service development.</li> </ul>
35.	Evangelical Lutheran Church Social Service – Hong Kong	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should set up a day care centre for persons with dementia in each district. It should also refer to the recommendations made by the Hong Kong Council of Social Service in 2012 to enhance services for persons with dementia, such as drawing up guidelines for accommodation design and providing professional training for healthcare workers, etc.</li> </ul>
36.	S.K.H. Holy Carpenter Church Community Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should provide more support for elderly centres to strengthen their services in health education and self-care management, and enhance hospice care services in the community.</li> </ul>
37.	Hong Kong Association of Gerontology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should review the implementation of the Programme Plan regularly in consultation with stakeholders.</li> <li>The Programme Plan was expected to address the problem of manpower shortage in the welfare sector, refine the licensing systems of healthcare workers and RCHEs, draw up a benchmark for CCS and RCS, and formulate a short, medium and long-term development plan for elderly services.</li> </ul>
38.	Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should standardize the licensing and monitoring mechanisms for Care and Attention Homes for the Elderly and Nursing Homes, set out and regularly review the manpower requirements of different elderly services, and provide serving operators of the Enhanced Home and Community Care Services ("EHCCS") with recurrent funding through LSGSS.</li> </ul>
39.	長者政策監察聯席 - 聯席之友	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should set up a case management system to address the needs of frail elderly persons and give support to carers of elderly persons.</li> </ul>

No.	Deputation/individual	Views
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In addition to the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance, the Administration should provide elderly persons with LTC allowance, the amount of which should be determined by the level of impairment as assessed by SCNAMES.</li> </ul>
40.	香港基督教服務處長者評議會	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should enhance the transparency of information related to elderly services, such as making public the waiting time for CCS and its planning for the provision of CCS and RCS, and strengthen the support for carers of elderly persons.</li> </ul>
41.	The Salvation Army, Yau Ma Tei Multi-service Centre for Senior Citizens	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should formulate a policy on supporting carers of elderly persons, and introduce a carer allowance with an aim to relieve the financial burden and release the labour force of the aforesaid carers.</li> </ul>
42.	St James' Settlement	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should study issues on LTC financing during the formulation of the Programme Plan, explore the feasibility of implementing LTC insurance in Hong Kong, and extend the coverage of the CCS voucher to respite service.</li> </ul>
43.	天水圍長者權益關注組	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should make a pledge on the waiting time for CCS, and provide an implementation timetable for the Programme Plan.</li> </ul>
44.	關注家居照顧服務大聯盟	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)402/14-15(01)</li> </ul>
45.	Hong Kong Family Welfare Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administration should review the demand for and supply of as well as the manpower and resources for IHCS, set up case management system for elderly services, and provide serving operators of EHCCS with recurrent funding through LSGSS.</li> </ul>
46.	Civic Party	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>LC Paper No. CB(2)705/14-15(11)</li> </ul>