

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1894/14-15  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/4/12

**Panel on Welfare Services**

**Subcommittee on Retirement Protection**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Saturday, 6 June 2015, at 9:00 am**  
**in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH

**Members absent** : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP

**Public Officers attending** : Item I

The Administration

Mr Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Miss Stella CHANG Lai-chu  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
(Welfare) 4

**Attendance** : Item I  
**by invitation**

Session One

The Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour Unions

Miss TAM Kam-lin  
Director of Social Affairs Committee

Alliance for Universal Pension

Mr Nick CHAN  
Organizer

Momentum 107

Mr Raymond HO Man-kit  
Convenor

T.K.O. Concern Network of Universal Pension

Mr LAI Wai-tong  
Member

Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions

Mr NG Koon-kwan  
Organizing Secretary

Liberal Party

Mr Michael LEE

Hong Kong Disneyland Cast Members' Union

Mr YU Hok-man  
Executive Member

The Lion Rock Institute

Mr Laurence PAK  
Director of Operations

中產關注退休保障陣線

Ms YIM Pik-fan  
Convenor

League of Social Democrats

Mr WONG Ho-ming  
Vice-Chairman (Internal Affairs)

Neo Democrats

Mr LAI Ming-chak  
Community Officer

天主教香港教區 教區勞工牧民中心(九龍)  
單幢大廈保安關注組

Mr CHAN Chau-shing  
Member

天主教香港教區 教區勞工牧民中心(九龍)  
保安護衛關注組

Ms CHOI Wai-fun  
Member

Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral  
Centre for Workers (Kowloon)

Mr SIN Chi-man  
Assistant Program Officer

Elderly Council of Tsuen Kwai Tsing District

Mr LAM Chi-chung  
Executive Member

Hong Kong Domestic Workers General Union

Ms CHUNG Bik-mui  
Representative

The Grassrooteer

Ms LEE Choi-kwan  
Chairlady

Caretakers Concern Group

Ms CHU Moon-chun  
Member

Kwai Fong Estate Elderly Rights Concern Group

Mr CHUNG Hau-ping  
Member

Kwai Chung Estate Residents' Rights Concern Group

Mr CHEUNG Kai-bing  
Secretary

Individual

Mr LAI Ming-lai

Labour Rights Commune

Ms Florence CHEUNG  
Member

利華樓互助委員會

Mr TSANG Lui-keung  
Chairman

Industrial Relations Institute

Ms LAU Yau-chun  
Organizer

Women Workers' Cooperative

Ms LAU Yee-wan  
Member

社區及院舍照顧員總工會

Miss Rida CHEUNG

Social Development for Hong Kong's Future

Ms LAI Yuen-mei  
Member

Individual

Mr Julian KAN Chi-chung

Individual

Ms LEE Wai-ming

The Association for the Advancement of Feminism

Miss WU Sui-shan  
Project Coordinator

Civic Party

Mr Anthony BUX Sheik  
District Developer

Individual

Mr FU Ka-ho

爭取基層生活保障聯盟

Mr YUEN Wai-tak  
Member

New People's Party

Mr KAM Man-fung  
Central Committee Member

Session Two

Secured retired no worrie group

Mr Paul LAM Sze-yuen  
Representative

青年支持全民退保委員會

Mr CHEUNG Kin-pong  
Representative

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms Mariana CHAN  
Chief Officer, Policy Research and Advocacy

Women Concern Group for Rights

Miss Wendy HUANG Wenjie  
Representative

Grassroots Women Concern Group on Retirement Protection

Ms CHI Kwai-yip  
Representative

Grassroots Women Concern Group on Social Security

Ms Lily SZE Choi-lee  
Representative

Children's Rights Association

Mr David WONG Hung-to  
Representative

Children's Concern Group on the Development of Retirement Protection

Miss LEE Suet-lin  
Representative

Elderly Right League (H.K.)

Mr CHENG Kei  
Representative

Grassroot Worker Concern Group

Ms FOK Mei-zone  
Representative

Society for Community Organization

Mr NG Wai-tung  
Community Organizer

Hong Kong Federation of Women's Centres

Mr LEUNG Shek-lun  
Advocacy Officer

Elderly Social Concern Alliance

Ms BUN Muk-nga  
Representative

Individual

Miss TAI Yuet-ching

Individual

Mr HONG Fu-yeuk

「全民退保 點解唔得」關注組

Mr AU YEUNG Kwun-tung  
Spokesperson

Neighbourhood and Workers Service Centre

Mr CHOW Kam-pui  
Organizer

Government Mod 1 Staff General Union

Mr Paul CHUI  
Vice Chairman

Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's  
Livelihood

---

Mr HO Kai-ming  
Officer

Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre  
for Workers (N.T.)

---

Mr Augustine YU Siu-po  
Acting Centre Supervisor

North District Employment Concern Group

Mr KU Kwok-wo  
Member

New Territories Evangelical Ambassador

Mr Simon TAM  
Member

North District Grass Roots Workers Group

Miss Tansy WONG Ka-yee  
Member

North District Outsource Cleaning Workers Concern Group

Mr LAM Yun-kei  
Member



Concern North District Workers Alliance

Mr CHEUNG Ho-hin  
Member

Individual

Miss CHOW Wing-chi

HK Buildings Management and Security Workers General Union

---

Mr CHAU Wai-tak  
Executive Member

新界東工人退休保障關注組

Ms TSE Yin-fei  
Member

Grassroots Development Centre

Mr NG Kin-wing  
Member

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong

---

Mr CHOI Tin-yam  
Deputy Spokesperson of Welfare Affairs

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Betty MA  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 1

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Rita LAI  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 1

Ms Kiwi NG  
Legislative Assistant (2) 1

Miss Lulu YEUNG  
Clerical Assistant (2) 1

---

*(The Deputy Chairman took the chair during the temporary absence of the Chairman.)*

**I. Future development of retirement protection in Hong Kong : universal retirement protection proposal versus non-universal retirement protection proposal**

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received oral representations from 64 deputations/individuals attending the meeting. Members also noted that two organisations had provided the Subcommittee with written submissions only. The majority of the deputations is in support of universal retirement protection scheme and their views are summarised below -

- (a) in the light of the challenges of an ageing population and the fact that there was a considerable number of the elderly living in poverty and strong community call for retirement protection, the Administration should implement a non-means-tested retirement protection scheme with tripartite contributions from the Government, employers and employees without further delay so as to ensure that the elderly could lead a dignified and financially-secured life in their twilight years. Retirement protection was a fundamental right of individual elderly people in recognition of their past contribution, including female homemakers, to the society and should not be considered from the perspective of poverty alleviation;
- (b) should universal retirement protection scheme not be implemented, the ageing population would also impose a heavy burden on public finance under the existing social security system which was considered having the following deficiencies -
  - (i) the labelling effect of the requirement to make declaration on non-provision of financial support by family members of the elderly applicants under the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") Scheme had deterred many vulnerable elders from seeking appropriate financial assistance;

- (ii) the Mandatory Provident Fund ("MPF") system was ineffective in providing adequate retirement protection in view of the limited amount of accrued benefits accumulated owing to the low contribution from low income, the arrangement of allowing severance payments and long service payments to be offset with MPF accrued benefits derived from employers' contributions, the low investment return, as well as high management and administration fees. In addition, there was concern that the current generation of elders, homemakers and unemployed persons were not covered by the employment-based MPF system which had been implemented only in late 2000; and
- (c) the Commission on Poverty ("CoP") should conscientiously conduct the public consultation on retirement protection to be launched in the fourth quarter of 2015 ("the public consultation"). It should include the six retirement protection options listed in the Research Report on Future Development of Retirement Protection in Hong Kong released by the consultancy team led by Prof Nelson CHOW as well as the consultancy team's recommendation on the setting up of the "demo-grant", and to seek views from members of the public on the financial arrangements for a retirement protection scheme to be implemented in Hong Kong.

3. Some deputations, on the other hand, were in support of a non-universal retirement protection scheme, having regard to the read-across implications of a universal retirement protection scheme on the public finance and the younger generation over time. Concern was also raised about the sustainability of a universal retirement protection scheme. It was stressed that the Government should make best use of the finite public resources which should be targeted at the elderly in need.

4. Most members were of the view that a universal retirement protection scheme should be implemented as soon as practicable in the light of an unambiguous and strong call from the community over several decades. These members expressed grave concern about the timeframe of the impending public consultation on retirement protection and cast doubt as to whether a policy on retirement protection could be duly worked out for implementation within the current-term Government.

5. In response to the views of deputations and members, the Secretary for Labour and Welfare made the following points -

- (a) the Administration was very concerned about the subject of retirement protection in the light of the challenges of an ageing population and was open-minded on the way forward for retirement protection in Hong Kong. In fact, a considerable number of elderly received retirement protection under the existing social security system funded by public coffers, including about 220 000 elderly received an Old Age Allowance of \$1,235 per month, more than 420 000 eligible elderly received a monthly Old Age Living Allowance of \$2,390, and 150 000 singleton elderly CSSA recipients received some \$5,500 per month. To further demonstrate the Government's determination and commitment in improving protection for needy citizens after retirement, \$50 billion was earmarked to provide for future needs;
- (b) CoP noted that under the existing social security system, some elderly persons were still not adequately cared for and were in need of further assistance. Therefore, CoP had commissioned Professor Nelson CHOW and his consultancy team to undertake a study on future development of retirement protection in Hong Kong so as to identify the way forward. Following the release of the Research Report on Future Development of Retirement Protection in Hong Kong ("the Research Report") compiled by the consultancy team in August 2014, CoP agreed to conduct a public consultation on retirement protection in Hong Kong in the fourth quarter of this year;
- (c) given that the Census and Statistics Department was updating the population and labour projection, CoP members agreed to make use of the latest projection figures and the projection method adopted in the Research Report to update the projection of the relevant proposals in the Research Report as well as to explore the feasibility of extending the projection period; and

- (d) the public consultation was expected to be launched in the fourth quarter of 2015. The preliminary thinking was that one single universal retirement protection proposal as well as a concrete proposal on the means-tested non-universal retirement protection option providing targeted assistance for the elderly in need should be covered in the consultation document to facilitate public discussion. The Government would commission two independent consultancy teams to assist in arranging different consultation events, consolidating and analysing the views collected, as well as conducting surveys. Based on the outcomes of the public consultation, the Administration would take forward the issue of retirement protection.

## **II. Any other business**

6. The Chairman said that the next meeting of the Subcommittee would tentatively be held around mid-July 2015. Proponents of various retirement protection proposals listed in the Research Report and relevant professionals would be invited to exchange views with Subcommittee members on the financing arrangements of retirement protection options.
7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:36 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
10 July 2015

**Proceedings of meeting of the Subcommittee on Retirement Protection  
held on Saturday, 6 June 2015, at 9:00 am  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
<i>Agenda item I - Future development of retirement protection in Hong Kong : universal retirement protection proposal versus non-universal retirement protection proposal</i>			
<i>Session One</i>			
000000 - 001117	Deputy Chairman	<i>(The Deputy Chairman took the chair during the temporary absence of the Chairman.)</i>  Opening remarks	
001118 - 001432	Miss TAM Kam-lin, The Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour Unions	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1650/14-15(01)]	
001433 - 001742	Mr Nick CHAN, Alliance for Universal Pensions	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(01)]	
001743 - 002050	Mr Raymond HO Man-kit, Momentum 107	Presentation of views	
002051 - 002359	Mr LAI Wai-tong, T.K.O. Concern Network of Universal Pension	Presentation of views	
002400 - 002703	Mr Michael LEE, Liberal Party	Presentation of views	
002704 - 002959	Mr YU Hok-man, Hong Kong Disneyland Cast Members' Union	Presentation of views	
003000 - 003230	Mr Laurence PAK, The Lion Rock Institute	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1704/14-15(01)]	
003231 - 003542	Ms YIM Pik-fan, 中產關注退休保障陣線	Presentation of views	
003543 - 003850	Mr WONG Ho-ming, League of Social Democrats	Presentation of views	
003851 - 004157	Mr LAI Ming-chak, Neo Democrats	Presentation of views	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
004158 - 004511	Mr CHAN Chau-shing, 天主教香港教區 教區勞工牧民中心(九龍)單幢大廈保安關注組	Presentation of views	
004512 - 004824	Ms CHOI Wai-fun, 天主教香港教區 教區勞工牧民中心(九龍)保安護衛關注組	Presentation of views	
004825 - 005135	Mr SIN Chi-man, Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views	
005136 - 005310	Mr LAM Chi-chung, Elderly Council of Tsuen Kwai Tsing District	Presentation of views	
005311 - 005623	Ms CHUNG Bik-mui, Hong Kong Domestic Workers General Union Chairman	Presentation of views <i>(At this juncture, the Chairman resumed the chairmanship.)</i>	
005624 - 005933	Ms LEE Choi-kwan, The Grassrooteer	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(02)]	
005934 - 010242	Mr KAM Man-fung, New People's Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(07)]	
010243 - 010605	Ms CHU Moon-chun, Caretakers Concern Group	Presentation of views	
010606 - 010930	Mr CHUNG Hau-ping, Kwai Fong Estate Elderly Rights Concern Group Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(03)]	
010931 - 011304	Mr CHEUNG Kai-bing, Kwai Chung Estate Residents' Rights Concern Group	Presentation of views	
011305 - 011631	Mr LAI Ming-lai	Presentation of views	
011632 - 012001	Ms Florence CHEUNG, Labour Rights Commune	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1704/14-15(02)]	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
012002 - 012317	Mr TSANG Lui-keung, 利華樓互助委員會	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(04)]	
012318 - 012634	Ms LAU Yau-chun, Industrial Relations Institute	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1704/14-15(03)]	
012635 - 012937	Ms LAU Yee-wan, Women Workers' Cooperative	Presentation of views	
012938 - 013227	Miss Rida CHEUNG, 社區及院舍照顧員總工會	Presentation of views	
013228 - 013534	Ms LAI Yuen-mei, Social Development for Hong Kong's Future	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(05)]	
013535 - 013842	Mr Julian KAN Chi-chung Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(06)]	
013843 - 014156	Ms LEE Wai-ming	Presentation of views	
014157 - 014512	Miss WU Sui-shan, The Association for the Advancement of Feminism	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1636/14-15(02)]	
014513 - 014724	Mr Anthony BUX Sheik, Civic Party	Presentation of views	
014725 - 015030	Mr FU Ka-ho	Presentation of views	
015031 - 015250	Mr YUEN Wai-tak, 爭取基層生活保障聯盟	Presentation of views	
015251 - 015610	Mr NG Koon-kwan, Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1636/14-15(01)]	
015611 - 015941	Chairman Admin	The Administration's response to the views of deputations.	
015942 - 020316	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG	Dr Fernando CHEUNG's grave concern that one-third of the elderly were living below the poverty line. Dr CHEUNG's dissatisfaction that following the release of the Research Report on Future Development of Retirement Protection in Hong Kong (the "Research	



Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Report") compiled by the consultancy team led by Prof Nelson CHOW, the Administration resorted to a delay tactic of conducting a public consultation on retirement protection in the fourth quarter of 2015 ("the public consultation"). His reservations that the relevant policy on retirement protection could be duly worked out within the current-term Government.</p>	
020317 - 020622	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	<p>Views of Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung that universal retirement protection should be implemented without further delay by making use of the \$50 billion earmarked for retirement protection as well as allocating additional provisions by the Government.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG's further query about the reliability of the projected population statistics as well as the need to update the projection of relevant retirement protection proposals based on such statistics and reach a community consensus on the issue before taking forward the subject.</p>	
020623 - 020931	Mr Alan LEONG	<p>Mr Alan LEONG referred members to the deliberations of the former Subcommittee on Retirement Protection formed in the fourth Legislative Council, in which it was observed that if a mean-tested retirement protection scheme was to be implemented, it would create a labelling effect and deter many vulnerable elders from receiving such payment.</p> <p>Mr LEONG considered it reasonable that the rich elderly would be entitled to retirement pension if they had made contribution under a universal retirement protection scheme. His disappointment that the Administration was unwilling to implement the proposed demo-grant as set out in the Research Report.</p>	
020932 - 021236	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's view that universal retirement protection could be effected by way of an annuity scheme in recognition of the past contribution of the elderly to the society. In the light of the huge fiscal reserve, the Administration could simply raise</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		the amount of the monthly Old Age Allowance to \$3,500 for the elderly reaching a specified age and that enterprises be required to contribute to the scheme as appropriate.	
021237 - 021549	Mr POON Siu-ping Chairman Admin	Mr POON Siu-ping's view that a strong call from the community at large for universal retirement protection over the years was clear. The public consultation on the subject to be conducted by the Commission on Poverty was a delay tactic used by the Administration.  The Administration's response to Mr POON's enquiry about the timeframe of the public consultation.	
021550 - 021902	Chairman Mr Laurence PAK, The Lion Rock Institute	The Chairman's remark that the debate on universal retirement protection had lasted for several decades. Her appeal to deputations opposing universal retirement protection to understand the plight of the elderly living in poverty.  Mr Laurence PAK's objection to the implementation of universal retirement protection. His view that public resources should focus on the needy elderly.	
021903 - 022728	Chairman	5-minute break for the meeting	
<i>Session Two</i>			
022729 - 023055	Chairman	Opening remarks for Session Two  Arrangement for the next meeting	
023056 - 023408	Mr Paul LAM Sze-yuen, Secured retired no worrie group	Presentation of views	
023409 - 023642	Mr CHEUNG Kin-pong, 青年支持全民退保委員會	Presentation of views	
023643 - 024008	Ms Mariana CHAN, The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1650/14-15(02)]	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
024009 - 024318	Miss Wendy HUANG Wenjie, Women Concern Group for Rights	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
024319 - 024505	Ms CHI Kwai-yip, Grassroots Women Concern Group on Retirement Protection	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
024506 - 024821	Ms Lily SZE Choi-lee, Grassroots Women Concern Group on Social Security	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
024822 - 024929	Mr David WONG Hung-to, Children's Rights Association	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
024930 - 025123	Miss LEE Suet-lin, Children's Concern Group on the Development of Retirement Protection	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
025124 - 025354	Mr CHENG Kei, Elderly Right League (H.K.)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
025355 - 025541	Ms FOK Mei-zone, Grassroot Worker Concern Group	Presentation of views	
025542 - 025911	Mr NG Wai-tung, Society for Community Organization	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(02)]	
025912 - 030221	Mr LEUNG Shek-lun, Hong Kong Federation of Women's Centres	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1704/14-15(04)]	
030222 - 030548	Ms BUN Muk-nga, Elderly Social Concern Alliance	Presentation of views	
030549 - 030928	Miss TAI Yuet-ching	Presentation of views	
030929 - 031252	Mr HONG Fu-yeuk	Presentation of views	
031253 - 031623	Mr AU YEUNG Kwun-tung, 「全民退保 點解唔得」 關注組	Presentation of views	
031624 - 031956	Mr CHOW Kam-pui, Neighbourhood and Workers Service Centre Chairman	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1604/14-15(03)]	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
031957 - 032151	Mr Paul CHUI, Government Mod 1 Staff General Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1636/14-15(03)]	
032152 - 032508	Mr HO Kai-ming, Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood Chairman	Presentation of views	
032509 - 032821	Mr KU Kwok-wo, North District Employment Concern Group	Presentation of views	
032822 - 033129	Mr Simon TAM, New Territories Evangelical Ambassador	Presentation of views	
033130 - 033435	Mr Augustine YU Siu-po, Catholic Diocese of Hong Kong Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (N.T.)	Presentation of views	
033436 - 033739	Miss Tansy WONG Ka-yee, North District Grass Roots Workers Group	Presentation of views	
033740 - 034101	Mr LAM Yun-kei, North District Outsource Cleaning Workers Concern Group	Presentation of views	
034102 - 034409	Mr CHEUNG Ho-hin, Concern North District Workers Alliance	Presentation of views	
034410 - 034734	Miss CHOW Wing-chi	Presentation of views	
034735 - 035048	Mr CHAU Wai-tak, HK Buildings Management and Security Workers General Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(08)]	
035049 - 035240	Ms TSE Yin-fei, 新界東工人 退休保障關注組	Presentation of views	
035241 - 035713	Mr NG Kin-wing, Grassroots Development Centre	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1673/14-15(09)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
035714 - 035940	Mr CHOI Tin-yam, Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	Presentation of views	
035941 - 040331	Chairman Mr POON Siu-ping Ms Mariana CHAN, The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	<i>(Extension of meeting by 15 minutes)</i>  Mr POON Siu-ping's enquiry and Ms Mariana CHAN's elaboration on her earlier views regarding an informed discussion on different aspects of proposed retirement protection options during the public consultation, including adequacy, sustainability and affordability.  Ms CHAN's reiteration of the need for implementing a universal retirement protection scheme for all citizens, instead of merely targeting at the needy elderly.	
040332 - 041052	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Admin Chairman	Dr Fernando CHEUNG's grave dissatisfaction that the Administration had employed a delay tactic in addressing the strong community call for universal retirement protection which had been advocated for several decades.  The Administration's response to Dr CHEUNG's enquiry about the timeframe of the public consultation and how it would take forward the issue on retirement protection.	
041053 - 041831	Mr Alan LEONG Chairman Admin	Mr Alan LEONG cautioned that based on relevant actuarial studies, the Administration should launch a universal retirement protection scheme no later than 2017 so as to ensure its sustainability. Mr LEONG's disappointment about the Administration's lack of a stance on the issue.  Mr LEONG's reiteration of the advice of overseas academics given to the former Subcommittee on Retirement Protection in respect of the labelling effect on elderly beneficiaries and deficiencies of a means-tested retirement protection scheme, taking into account the overseas experience.	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action Required
		Mr LEONG's enquiry and the Administration's response regarding the approach and expected outcome of the public consultation.	
041832 - 042338	Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman highlighted the different perspectives of the Subcommittee and the Commission on Poverty ("CoP") when studying the subject of retirement protection i.e. universal retirement protection as an individual's right versus retirement protection for needy elderly respectively.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman's reservation that a policy on retirement protection could be duly worked out for implementation within the current-term Government based on the proposed timetable of the public consultation. His suggestion of inviting a few CoP members to the next Subcommittee meeting to exchange views with members on the subject.</p> <p>The Administration's emphasis of its commitment to safeguarding the retirement life of needy citizens.</p>	
042339 - 042706	Chairman	<p>The Chairman's expression of the following views -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) should universal retirement protection scheme not be implemented, the ageing population would also impose a heavy burden on public finance under the existing social security system;</li> <li>(b) the Administration had to address squarely the strong community call over the years for the implementation of universal retirement protection scheme and the fact that a considerable number of youth also expressed their concern over the subject; and</li> <li>(c) while there were divergent views on the issue of universal retirement protection, the Administration should adopt an impartial stance in drawing reference to their views.</li> </ul>	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker(s)</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
042707 - 043359	Chairman Mr CHAU Wai-tak, HK Buildings Management and Security Workers General Union Mr NG Kin-wing, Grassroots Development Centre Admin	The deputations' views and the Administration's response regarding the following -  (a) whether the community at large should contribute to a retirement protection scheme which would merely benefit the needy elderly;  (b) a specific amount should be set aside from the fiscal reserve for retirement protection purpose; and  (c) financial arrangements of various retirement protection proposals, in particular those option(s) to be put forward for consideration in the public consultation.	
043400 - 043735	Chairman	Discussion item and arrangements of the next meeting in July 2015.  Closing remarks.	