

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC133/15-16
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(5)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 8th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 6 November 2015, at 5:55 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, GBS, JP	Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development
Miss Susie HO Shuk-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (Communications and Technology)
Mr Joe WONG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development (Communications and Technology)
Ms Annie CHOI Suk-han, JP	Commissioner for Innovation and Technology
Mr Johann WONG, JP	Deputy Commissioner for Innovation and Technology
Ir Allen YEUNG	Government Chief Information Officer
Mr Victor LAM Wai-kiu, JP	Deputy Government Chief Information Officer (Consulting and Operations)

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Connie FUNG	Legal Adviser
----------------	---------------

Mr Stephen LAM	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Ken WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Raymond SZETO	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Jason KONG	Council Secretary (1)4
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

Item No. 1 – FCR(2014-15)36B

NEW HEAD "GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY BUREAU"

Subhead 000 Operational Expenses

Item No. 2 – FCR(2014-15)37B

NEW HEAD "GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY BUREAU"

HEAD 47 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : OFFICE OF THE GOVERNMENT CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER

HEAD 55 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : COMMERCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT BUREAU (COMMUNICATIONS AND TECHNOLOGY BRANCH)

HEAD 155 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY COMMISSION

Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2014-15)36B

The Committee continued to consider motions proposed to be moved by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FC Procedure") ("37A motions") to express views on the item FCR(2014-15)36B.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

2. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered 1208 to 1209 and 1214 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the questions put, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN

read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

3. At 6:02 pm, the Chairman said that Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung had just submitted 34 37A motions on FCR(2014-15)36B. The Chairman directed that the meeting be suspended for 10 minutes for him to have discussion with those members who had presented, or indicated that they would present, proposed 37A motions without notice at the meeting regarding the way to deal with those proposed motions.

4. The meeting resumed at 6:13 pm.

5. The Chairman informed members that since the beginning of the first meeting today, he had received 50 37A motions from Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung. He called on members wishing to present further 37A motions to do so immediately as he was about to stop accepting 37A motions.

6. At this juncture, Mr WONG Yuk-man, Mr Albert CHAN and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung came up one after the other to the Chairman's table and submitted to the Chairman 63, 9 and 33 proposed 37A motions respectively.

7. At 6:15 pm, the Chairman directed that the meeting be suspended again for another 15 minutes.

8. The meeting resumed at 6:34 pm.

9. On invitation by the Chairman, the Clerk reported that the Committee had finished voting on the questions in respect of each of the 59 37A motions on FCR(2014-15)36B in total that the motions should be proceeded forthwith, and all of the questions were negatived. Several members further presented a number of proposed motions to express views on items FCR(2014-15)36B and FCR(2014-15)37B. The Chairman said that of the 37A motions on FCR(2014-15)36B received during the meetings today, he considered that the 10 motions from Mr Albert CHAN and nine motions from Mr CHAN Chi-chuen to be directly related to the relevant agenda item and would put the questions thereof for the Committee's consideration.

10. The Chairman requested Mr WONG Yuk-man to consolidate his motions on FCR(2014-15)37B and present no more than 30 motions in total after consolidation, which would be dealt with after the item FCR(2014-15)36B was put to vote.

Motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN during the meeting

11. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the 10 motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered 1215 to 1224 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the questions put, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen during the meeting

12. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the nine motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered 1225 to 1233 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the questions put, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

(At 6:50 pm, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung submitted 20 37A motions on FCR(2014-15)36B.)

Voting on FCR(2014-15)36B

13. At 7:04 pm, the Chairman announced that the Committee had dealt with 77 37A motions in respect of the item FCR(2014-15)36B. These included 58 motions submitted before the meetings today and 19 motions submitted during the meetings. He said that he had received from members a total of over 130 proposed motions in the course of meeting today and had to suspend the second meeting of the day twice with a view to perusing them. Still, members had kept presenting proposed motions. The Chairman said that while he respected members' right to propose motions under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on the item, he considered that members presenting proposed motions incessantly during the course of the meeting had caused interruptions to the orderly and efficient conduct of the Committee's business to the extent that it could not carry out its functions effectively and properly. He considered that allowing members to present proposed motions incessantly at the meeting would only delay the proceedings of the Committee, thereby obstructing the Committee from exercising and discharging its functions properly. As the Chairman of FC, he considered it necessary to regulate the progress of the meeting in order to safeguard the interest of the Committee. In order to maintain the orderly, efficient and fair disposition of

the Committee's business, he would stop dealing with 37A motions proposed to be moved by members and the meeting would proceed to vote on the item FCR(2014-15)36B right away.

14. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed grave dissatisfaction towards the Chairman's decision. He approached the Chairman's table without permission to submit more 37A motions. The Chairman ordered Mr LEUNG to return to his seat.

15. The Chairman put the item FCR(2014-15)36B to vote. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman announced that 26 members voted in favour and eight members voted against the item. One member abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr POON Siu-ping
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Mr CHUNG Kwok-pan
(26 members)

Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr Charles Peter MOK
Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Mr TANG Ka-piu
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun

Against:

Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
(8 members)

Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Ms Claudia MO
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok

Abstained:

Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
(1 member)

16. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item FCR(2014-15)36B.

Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure on FCR(2014-15)37B

17. The Committee continued to deal with 37A motions proposed by members to express views on FCR(2014-15)37B.

Motion proposed by Mr Alan LEONG

18. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Mr Alan LEONG numbered 309 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEONG read out his proposed motion during the ringing of the division bell. The question was negatived.

Motion to shorten the duration of the division bell from five to one minute

19. Mr IP Kwok-him moved without notice under paragraph 47 of the FC Procedure that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Committee should proceed to each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute.

20. The Chairman thereupon proposed the question on Mr IP Kwok-him's motion. He also directed that a member, when speaking on the question, might speak once for not more than three minutes.

21. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung requested to move a motion under paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure that the meeting be now adjourned. On invitation by the Chairman, the Clerk explained that pursuant to paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure, a member, when permitted by the Chairman to speak on a proposal, might move without notice a motion to adjourn the discussion on the item or a motion that further proceedings of the Committee be now adjourned. The expression "a proposal" referred to a financial proposal from the Administration or a substantive motion moved by a member on a matter that FC had the power to decide in performing its function. The procedure in paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure was not applicable to the discussion on Mr IP's motion which was a procedural motion moved under paragraph 47 of the FC Procedure to shorten the duration of the division bell.

22. Mr Albert CHAN and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen spoke against the motion.

23. There being no comment from other members, the Chairman put the motion to vote. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman announced that 28 members voted in favour of the motion and six members voted against the motion. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him	Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr IP Kwok-him
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee	Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun
Mr NG Leung-sing	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Mr KWOK Wai-keung
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr TANG Ka-piu	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun
(28 members)	

Against:

Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che	Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip	Mr WONG Yuk-man
Ms Claudia MO	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
(6 members)	

24. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved Mr IP Kwok-him's motion.

Motions proposed by members pursuant to paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure to express views on FCR(2014-15)37B

25. The meeting continued to deal with the remaining 37A motions on FCR(2014-15)37B.

26. At 7:30 pm, the Chairman said that Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung had just submitted a number of 37A motions. The Chairman said that since he

considered that these motions could be consolidated into six motions along three themes, he had returned them to Mr LEUNG for resubmission after consolidation.

27. On enquiry by Mr IP Kwok-him, the Chairman said that there were 14 37A motions remaining to be considered by the Committee. If Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung agreed to consolidate his motions into six motions, there would be a total of 20 37A motions to be considered.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

28. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered 877 and 1210 to 1213 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the questions put, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung

29. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung numbered 1158 to 1167 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the questions put, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

30. At 7:54 pm, the Chairman said that he had just received 12 and three 37A proposed motions on FCR(2014-15)37B from Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Mr Albert CHAN respectively. The Chairman also said that Mr WONG Yuk-man had refused to consolidate his 63 motions into a fewer number or select from them the representative ones. The Chairman announced that he would propose questions on the three motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN for the Committee's consideration.

31. The Chairman announced that while he respected members' right to propose motions under paragraph 37A of the FC Procedure to express views on the item, he considered that members presenting proposed motions incessantly during the course of the meeting had caused interruptions to the orderly and efficient conduct of the meeting to the extent that the Committee could not carry out its functions effectively and properly. The Chairman said that such conduct of members had led him to form the view that these members did not

intend to express views on the item genuinely but to procrastinate the proceedings of the Committee. In order to maintain the orderly, efficient and fair disposition of the business of the Committee, the Chairman said that he would stop proposing questions on 37A motions dealing with 37A motions proposed by members after the Committee finished dealing with the three motions from Mr Albert CHAN, and the Committee would proceed to vote on the item FCR(2014-15)37B.

Motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN during the meeting

32. The Chairman put to vote the questions, one by one, that the motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered 1438 to 1440 be proceeded forthwith. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the questions put, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Voting on FCR(2014-15)37B

33. At 8:00 pm, upon completion of voting on the questions on 37A motions in respect of the item FCR(2014-15)37B, the Chairman said that if there were no further questions from members, he would put the item to vote.

34. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung requested to move a motion under paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure that the meeting be now adjourned. On invitation by the Chairman, the Clerk explained that pursuant to paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure, a member, if permitted by the Chairman to speak on an item, typically a funding proposal from the Administration, might move an adjournment motion. As Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung had not been permitted by the Chairman to speak on the item, he could not move such a motion under paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure.

35. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen raised a point of order and enquired about the purpose of the Chairman asking members whether they had further questions about the item. In response, Legal Adviser explained that the Chairman was asking members, pursuant to paragraph 46 of the FC Procedure, if they had any further questions before he put the item to vote. As such, this was not an occasion where a member was speaking on the agenda item. Under such circumstance, paragraph 39 of the FC Procedure was not applicable.

36. At 8:02 pm, Mr WONG Yuk-man and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung approached the Chairman's bench without permission in protest against the Chairman's decision to put the item FCR(2014-15)37B to vote. The Chairman ruled that the behaviour of Mr WONG Yuk-man was grossly disorderly and ordered him to withdraw from the meeting immediately.

37. The Chairman put the item FCR(2014-15)37B to vote. As members claimed a division, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman announced that 29 members voted in favour of the item and nine members voted against the item. One member abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Mr WONG Kwok-kin	Mr IP Kwok-him
Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun	Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr Charles Peter MOK
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Dr Elizabeth QUAT	Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Mr POON Siu-ping	Mr TANG Ka-piu
Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun	
(29 members)	

Against:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan	Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit	Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Ms Claudia MO	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok	
(9 members)	

Abstained:

Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
(1 member)

38. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.
39. The meeting was adjourned at 8:03 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
22 February 2016