

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC252/15-16

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(16)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 30th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Saturday, 30 January 2016, at 4:23 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon James TO Kun-sun
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Dennis KWOK
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP	Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP	Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 1
Ms Judy CHUNG Sui-kei	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 5
Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP	Director of Highways
Mr Albert LEE Wai-bun	Project Manager (Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Project Management Office), Highways Department
Mr MA Kuen	Chief Engineer (Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities), Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Project Management Office, Highways Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Ms Connie FUNG	Legal Adviser
Mr Stephen LAM	Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2
Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Ken WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Raymond SZETO	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Keith WONG	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

**Item No. 1 – FCR(2015-16)45
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 19 DECEMBER 2015**

PWSC(2015-16)14

HEAD 706 – HIGHWAYS

Transport – Roads

**845TH – Hong Kong–Zhuhai–Macao Bridge Hong Kong Boundary
Crossing Facilities – Reclamation and Superstructures**

Proposed motions on the item FCR(2015-16)45 to be moved by members under
paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure

The Committee continued to deal with the proposed motions to be moved by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FCP").

Motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG

2. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG numbered [0234 and 0235](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr Fernando CHEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Dr KWOK Ka-ki

3. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Dr KWOK Ka-ki numbered [0245, 0246, 0247, 0248, 0250 and 0251](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr KWOK Ka-ki read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motion proposed by Ms Cyd HO

4. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Ms Cyd HO numbered [0252](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for the proposed motion and the division bell was rung for one minute. With the agreement of the Chairman, Ms Cyd HO read out her proposed motion during the ringing of the division bell. The question was negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan

5. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan numbered [0253](#), [0254](#), [0255](#) and [0256](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

6. The Chairman advised that the Committee had dealt with 39 proposed motions submitted by members under paragraph 37A of FCP before the date specified by him. As a total of another 68 proposed motions submitted by 11 members had been received, he had to suspend the meeting for 15 minutes to process those motions.

7. At 4:40 pm, the Chairman announced that the meeting be suspended for 15 minutes.

8. The Chairman resumed the meeting at 4:56 pm. The Chairman advised that 402 and 68 proposed motions to be moved by 12 members under paragraph 37A of FCP had been received in two batches. He remarked that he respected members' approach to strive for their aspirations by employing procedural tactics at meetings to exert pressure on the Administration; however, if members were allowed to propose motions incessantly, the Committee would be obstructed from exercising its functions under the Rules of Procedure and the Public Finance Ordinance (Cap. 2), and he believed this was not the intended purpose of paragraph 37A of FCP. When such behaviour had obviously affected the proper operation of the Committee, he, as the Chairman of the Committee, had the responsibility to safeguard the interests of the Committee and properly control the progress of meetings by reasonable means, so as to ensure the orderly, efficient and fair handling of the agenda items, thereby enabling the Committee to perform its duties. He added that if

members continued to submit proposed motions under paragraph 37A of FCP while a meeting was in progress, it would not be possible for the Committee to deal with such motions immediately.

9. As regards this agenda item, the Chairman said he would, again, refer 43 proposed motions from members to the Committee for voting to decide whether they should be dealt with. However, he observed that individual members had obviously been submitting incessantly large numbers of motions or batches of a few proposed motions during the meeting. Apart from the effect of taking up the meeting time to delay the voting on the agenda items, such actions had no relevance to the purpose of enabling the Committee to properly discharge its duties. If he continued to allow members to hinder the progress of meetings by such means, it would be impossible for the Committee to perform its functions, therefore he had no choice but to decide to stop dealing with the proposed motions submitted by members.

10. Mr Albert CHAN expressed dissatisfaction at the Chairman's decision. He considered that members had the right to submit, without notice, proposed motions in light of the progress of meetings, and that the purpose of such motions was to exert pressure on the Administration, rather than slowing down the progress of meetings. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung also said that he was preparing to submit his proposed motions and asked the Chairman to accept and deal with those motions. The Chairman advised that he had made his decision, and hence the proposed motions further submitted by members would not be dealt with. He would explain his decision to members in writing after the meeting.

11. The Clerk advised that the 43 motions which the Chairman had ruled to deal with included two proposed motions from Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, five from Dr Fernando CHEUNG, three from Ms Claudia MO, nine from Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, eight from Mr WONG Yuk-man, five from Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, three from Mr IP Kin-yuen and eight from Mr Albert CHAN.

Motions proposed by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan

12. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan numbered [0292 and 0293](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG

13. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Dr Fernando CHEUNG numbered [0297](#), [0298](#), [0306](#), [0339](#) and [0340](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Dr Fernando CHEUNG read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Ms Claudia MO

14. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Ms Claudia MO numbered [0327](#), [0328](#) and [0329](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Ms Claudia MO read out each of her proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

15. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr CHAN Chi-chuen numbered [0330](#), [0331](#), [0332](#), [0333](#), [0334](#), [0335](#), [0336](#), [0337](#) and [0338](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

16. In the course of dealing with the aforesaid motions, i.e. at 5:23 pm, as the Electronic Voting System did not function properly when members were voting on Mr CHAN Chi-chuen's motion numbered [0335](#), the Chairman announced that the meeting be suspended for five minutes. The Chairman resumed the meeting at 5:27 pm and invited members to vote anew on the motion.

17. At 5:29 pm, the Chairman announced that the meeting be extended for 15 minutes.

Motions proposed by Mr WONG Yuk-man

18. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr WONG Yuk-man numbered [0341, 0342, 0343, 0344, 0345, 0346, 0400 and 0410](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr WONG Yuk-man read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung

19. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung numbered [0383, 0384, 0385, 0386 and 0387](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr IP Kin-yuen

20. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr IP Kin-yuen numbered [0395, 0396 and 0397](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr IP Kin-yuen read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN

21. The Chairman put to vote, one by one, the questions that the motions proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered [0353, 0354, 0355, 0356, 0357, 0371, 0372 and 0373](#) be proceeded forthwith. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division for each of the proposed motions, and the division bell was rung for one minute for each division. With the agreement of the Chairman, Mr Albert CHAN read out each of his proposed motions during the ringing of the division bell. All the questions were negatived.

Voting on FCR(2015-16)45

22. The Chairman advised that the Committee had dealt with 82 motions proposed to be moved by members under paragraph 37A of FCP to express views on the item FCR(2015-16)45. The Chairman then put the item to vote. As requested by members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman announced that 29 members voted in favour of and 13 members voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Starry LEE Wai-king	Mr CHAN Hak-kan
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr IP Kwok-him	Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun	Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr Steven HO Chun-yin	Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Miss CHAN Yuen-han
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Elizabeth QUAT
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	
(29 members)	

Against:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan	Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung	Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr Alan LEONG Kah-kit	Mr WONG Yuk-man
Ms Claudia MO	Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Mr SIN Chung-kai	
(13 members)	

23. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

24. After voting on the item, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr Albert CHAN and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung walked out in protest. The three Members refused to return to their seats despite the Chairman's advice. The Chairman considered the behaviour of the three Members grossly disorderly and ordered the three Members to withdraw from the meeting. At 6:10 pm, the Chairman announced that the meeting be suspended for five minutes.

Item No. 2 – FCR(2015-16)34
CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND

HEAD 710 - COMPUTERISATION

Hong Kong Police Force

Replacement of the Infrastructure Platform for the Police Operational Nominal Index Computer System and the Criminal Intelligence Computer System

25. The Chairman resumed the meeting at 6:14 pm. He advised that the Committee would continue with the deliberation on the item FCR(2015-16)34, the discussion on which had not yet finished. This item invited members to approve a new commitment of \$81,672,000 for the replacement of an obsolete infrastructure platform that supported the computer systems of the Hong Kong Police ("HKP").

26. Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired the Administration about the estimated lifespan of the new system. He was worried that if the operating lifespans of the system were relatively short, public money would be required to upgrade them within a short time. In addition, he also asked the Administration about the differences between the new system and the existing system, and whether the new system would be used for storing DNA information of individuals.

27. Under Secretary for Security ("US for S") explained that when inviting tender for the new system, HKP would require contractors to provide new systems with at least ten-year serviceable lifespan, which were comparable to the lifespan of similar computer systems. For contractors who could provide systems with more than ten-year lifespan, their tenders might be given extra points as appropriate. If the Committee approved the funding proposal, the anticipated commissioning of the new system would be in May 2017, by then the existing system would reach the end of their ten-year serviceable lifespan. As regards the functions of the system, he pointed out that there would be no difference between the functions of the new system and the old system, which were both used for nominal indexing of criminal records and

analyzing intelligence, but software and hardware of the system would be upgraded to enhance the processing speed and stability, so as to enhance work efficiency and increase the capability in analyzing intelligence. The new systems would not store DNA records, but would provide indices to indicate whether the Government Laboratory's database contained the DNA information of a certain person.

28. Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Dr Elizabeth QUAT expressed support for the funding proposal. Dr Elizabeth QUAT enquired whether the Administration would consider adding new security technologies into the new system to ensure that the system would be protected from cyber attacks, as well as adding other technologies, such as facial identification, to assist the Police in carrying out criminal intelligence work.

29. US for S pointed out that the Administration had attached great importance to the system's security. HKP would access the system through an internal data network. The Office of the Government Chief Information Officer had also requested HKP to ensure that the new system would meet the security requirements. As regards the new functions, although the system would not be added with any new functions, the processing speed would be enhanced upon replacement. In case of a complicated enquiry, the completion time required for processing would be shortened from the existing several hours to 10-odd minutes. In addition, the stability of the new system would also be greater than that of the old system. In case of an emergency like terrorist attack, which would require a large quantity of intelligence analysis work, the systems could stably process a large number of enquiries simultaneously.

30. Mr Alan LEONG pointed out that the Government had conducted a number of tendering exercises for large systems or infrastructure in the past, but the exercises had been under criticism due to the subsequent cost overruns and delay in the completion of the projects. He enquired how the Administration could ensure that the tendering exercises of the new system would not have the same problems.

31. US for S explained that a dedicated team had been set up to monitor the tendering exercises, with a view to ensuring that contractors of the system would meet their requirements and complete the project as scheduled.

32. At 6:28 pm, the Chairman reminded members that there were seven minutes left before the closing time of the meeting.

33. Citing that the Administration had said that the statistics on criminal cases could easily be found in the existing system, Ms Cyd HO sought the Administration's explanation on the reasons why they had all along been unable to provide the Legislative Council ("LegCo") with information about the crime figures relating to "access to computer with criminal or dishonest intent" under Section 161 of the Crimes Ordinance (Cap. 200).

34. US for S explained that the Administration had provided LegCo with the overall statistics on the crime concerned. However, the information requested by Members involved four items of breakdowns of the crime. According to the statistical practice currently adopted by the Police, it did not compile separate breakdown figures in respect of a particular offence. Instead, only the overall figure of an offence would be maintained. As no breakdown figures were available, the Administration were unable to provide such information.

35. Mr SIN Chung-kai enquired whether the Administration would consider adding languages other than Chinese and English on the new system interface for the ease of handling cases involving persons of different nationalities. The Chairman said that the meeting time had reached 6:35 pm. As the meeting had already been extended for 15 minutes, he had to end the meeting. He invited Mr SIN to continue to raise his question at the next meeting.

36. Mr IP Kwok-him suggested that the meeting be further extended, so as to finish dealing with this item. Mr SIN Chung-kai expressed objection to the suggestion. The Chairman then declared that the meeting was adjourned.

37. The meeting was adjourned at 6:35 pm.