立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC267/15-16 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(22)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 45th meeting held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex on Saturday, 12 March 2016, at 11:12 am

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP

Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Hon Claudia MO

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP

Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS

Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai

Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Hon KWOK Wai-keung

Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP

Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP

Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu

Members absent:

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP

Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS

Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon WONG Yuk-man

Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP

Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP

Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP

Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok

Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

Hon Kenneth LEUNG

Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Hon Dennis KWOK

Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan Hon IP Kin-yuen Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP Secretary for Financial Permanent Services and the Treasury (Treasury) Ms Esther LEUNG, JP Secretary Financial Deputy for Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1 Principal Executive Officer (General), Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch) Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3 Ms Jasmine CHOI Suet-yung Principal Assistant Secretary Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)(Works) Chief Assistant Secretary Mr John KWONG Ka-sing for Development (Works) 1, Development Bureau Assistant Director of Mr Tony MOYUNG Hon Lands (Acquisition), Lands Department Chief Estate Surveyor (Acquisition), Ms Joyce NG Suet-yee Lands Department Director of Architectural Services Mr LEUNG Koon-kee, JP Mr HUI Chiu-kin Assistant Director of Architectural Services Services). (Property Architectural Services Department **Director of Drainage Services** Mr Edwin TONG Ka-hung, JP Mr Samson LAI Yiu-kei Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Waste Management Policy) Assistant Director of Environmental Ms Betty CHEUNG Miu-han Protection (Environmental Infrastructure) Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP Director of Civil Engineering and Development Director of Highways Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP

Mr Raymond KONG Tai-wing Deputy Project Manager/Major Works (1), Highways Department Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit Principal Assistant Secretary Development (Planning and Lands) 5, Development Bureau Director Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP Assistant of Home Affairs (2) Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong Department District Planning Officer (Fanling, Ms Maggie CHIN Man-yi Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East), Planning Department Deputy Director of Social Welfare Mr LAM Ka-tai, JP (Services) Assistant Director of Social Welfare Mr KOK Che-leung (Subventions) Assistant Secretary-General (Capital), Mr Kelvin SIU Yun-piu Grants Committee University Secretariat Chief Maintenance Surveyor (School Mr LEE Kam-yuen **Premises** Maintenance), Education Bureau Mr Murphy CHIU Hon-fai Senior Maintenance Surveyor (School Maintenance), **Premises** Education Bureau Dr LAI Shu-ming Head of Estates, Health and Safety Division, Vocational Training Council Mr LEUNG Wing-lim, JP Assistant Director of Water Supplies (New Works) Mr Timothy CHENG Leung-kit Chief Systems Manager (Governance and Resources). Office of the Government Chief Information Officer Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Mr LO Kwok-kong

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT Assistant Secretary General 1

Programme), Housing Department

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO

Mr Ken WOO

Senior Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Keith WONG

Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Keith WONG Council Secretary (1)5 Mr Raymond SZETO Council Secretary (1)6

Miss Queenie LAM Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2 Mr Frankie WOO Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Miss Yannes HO Legislative Assistant (1)6

<u>Action</u>

At 11:12 am, the Chairman declared the meeting commenced. At that time, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Ms Claudia MO lingered at the Chairman's podium, with Mr CHAN Chi-chuen occupying the Chairman's seat. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, Mr Albert CHAN, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr Alvin YEUNG and Ms Cyd HO also gathered in front of the Chairman's podium.

- 2. <u>The Chairman</u> advised that as he needed to discuss subsequent arrangements of the meeting with representatives of different parties and factions, he had to suspend the meeting for 20 minutes.
- 3. At 11:12 am, The Chairman announced that the meeting be suspended for 20 minutes.
- 4. The meeting resumed at 11:30 am. At that time Mr Albert CHAN, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Ms Claudia MO were occupying the seat at the Chairman's podium. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Ms Cyd HO, Mr Albert HO and Mr Gary FAN stood in protest with placards in their hands in front of the Chairman's podium. The Chairman remarked that there were a number of important but uncontroversial items that needed to be scrutinized in the meeting, including the funding proposals on block allocations under the Capital Works Reserve Fund involving close to 7 000 government projects, a total funding amount of over \$12 billion, and the jobs of 13 000 workers. Moreover, many public officers were in attendance to answer questions from members. He requested the above members to return to their seats, so that the meeting could resume as soon as possible and meeting time would not be wasted.
- 5. As these members refused to return to their seats and were chanting slogans, the meeting could not proceed. In view of this, the Chairman announced at 11:31 am that the meeting be suspended again for 20 minutes.

- 6. The meeting resumed at 11:47 am. At that time, Mr Albert CHAN, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Ms Claudia MO continued to occupy the seat at the Chairman's podium in protest. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan, Ms Cyd HO, Mr Gary FAN, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Mr Albert HO, Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Ms Emily LAU, Mr Frederick FUNG, Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che, Mr Alan LEONG, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr Alvin YEUNG also gathered in front of the Chairman's podium to stage a protest. The Chairman reiterated that there were a lot of agenda items to deal with in that day's meeting, including the funding proposals on block allocations under the Capital Works Reserve Fund, and the proposal to seek supplementary provision for the Elderly Health Care Voucher Scheme. He said that the needs of society were weightier than members' resentment. Filibustering at meetings of this Council would hinder the progress of society. He requested these members to return to their seats, so as not to let members of the public down.
- 7. Mr Albert CHAN requested the Chairman to immediately deal with the motion of no confidence in the Deputy Chairman proposed by Mr LEE Cheuk-yan in the meeting held earlier that day. The Chairman explained that even if he allowed Mr LEE Cheuk-yan to submit a motion in a shorter notice, he would not deal with it immediately in this meeting. Instead, he would convene a meeting on another day to deal with it.
- 8. At 11:49 pm, the Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned early because these members were reluctant to return to their seats and prevented the meeting from proceeding. He announced that the next meeting would start at 2:30 pm. The Chairman conveyed an apology to the public officers in attendance for the Committee's failure to scrutinize the items on the agenda and procrastination.
- 9. The meeting was adjourned at 11:49 am.

<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 24 June 2016