立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC280/15-16 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(22)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 47th meeting held in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Complex on Saturday, 12 March 2016, at 4:43 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman) Hon Albert HO Chun-yan Hon LEE Cheuk-yan Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip Hon Claudia MO Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai Hon CHAN Chi-chuen Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki Hon KWOK Wai-keung Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung Hon IP Kin-yuen Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu

Members absent:

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman) Hon James TO Kun-sun Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP Hon WONG Yuk-man Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP Hon WU Chi-wai, MH Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP Hon Kenneth LEUNG Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Hon Dennis KWOK Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3
Ms Jasmine CHOI Suet-yung	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)(Works)
Mr John KWONG Ka-sing	Chief Assistant Secretary for Development (Works) 1, Development Bureau
Mr Tony MOYUNG Hon	Assistant Director of Lands (Acquisition), Lands Department
Ms Joyce NG Suet-yee	Chief Estate Surveyor (Acquisition), Lands Department
Mr LEUNG Koon-kee, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Mr HUI Chiu-kin	Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services), Architectural Services Department
Mr Edwin TONG Ka-hung, JP	Director of Drainage Services
Mr Samson LAI Yiu-kei	Assistant Director of Environment Protection (Waste Management Policy)
Ms Betty CHEUNG Miu-han	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Environmental Infrastructure)
Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr Peter LAU Ka-keung, JP	Director of Highways
Mr Raymond KONG Tai-wing	Deputy Project Manager/Major Works (1), Highways Department

Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) 5, Development Bureau
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department
Ms Maggie CHIN Man-yi	District Planning Officer (Fanling, Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East), Planning Department
Mr LAM Ka-tai, JP	Deputy Director of Social Welfare (Services)
Mr KOK Che-leung	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Subventions)
Mr Kelvin SIU Yun-piu	Assistant Secretary-General (Capital), University Grants Committee Secretariat
Mr LEE Kam-yuen	Chief Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Mr Murphy CHIU Hon-fai	Senior Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Dr LAI Shu-ming	Head of Estates, Health and Safety Division, Vocational Training Council
Mr LEUNG Wing-lim, JP	Assistant Director of Water Supplies (New Works)
Mr Timothy CHENG Leung-kit	Chief Systems Manager (Governance and Resources), Office of the Government Chief Information Officer
Mr LO Kwok-kong	Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Housing Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Ken WOO	Senior Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Keith WONG	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)6
Miss Queenie LAM	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5
Miss Yannes HO	Legislative Assistant (1)6

<u>Action</u>

Item No. 1 – FCR(2015-16)48 RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 17 FEBRUARY 2016

At 4:43 pm, the Chairman declared that the meeting commenced. At that time, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen was then sitting on the bench at the seat of another member, which was opposite the Chairman's podium. Mr Albert CHAN, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Mr Gary FAN and Ms Claudia MO were standing in front of the Chairman's podium in protest. These members criticized the Deputy Chairman of the Finance Committee ("FC") for abusing his powers when presiding over the deliberation on the proposal for additional funding for the construction works of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link. They demanded that the FC Chairman declare the decision of the Committee on 11 March 2016 in respect of the supplementary provisions invalid. The Chairman demanded that these members return to their seats, but his repeated urges were in vain. At 4:44 pm, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung threw books at the Chairman's podium. The Chairman regarded Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's conduct as grossly disorderly. He ordered him to withdraw from the meeting immediately and declared that the meeting be suspended for 10 minutes.

2. The meeting resumed at 4:54 pm. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr Gary FAN and Ms Claudia MO were still staying in front of the Chairman's podium. Noting that these members did not return to their seats as he had urged again, the Chairman pointed out that the conduct of these members was grossly disorderly and ordered these three members to withdraw from the meeting immediately. The Chairman announced that the meeting be adjourned for 5 minutes.

The meeting resumed at 5:00 pm. 3. At that time, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen was standing on the members' bench which he was occupying, and a number of members had also left their seats and come in front of the Chairman's podium. In response to the Chairman's demand, these members returned to their seats, except Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr Albert CHAN and Ms Claudia MO, who continued to stay in front of the Chairman's podium. Subsequently, Mr Albert CHAN also stood in protest on the bench at the seat of another member, which was opposite the Chairman's podium. At 5:02 pm, the Chairman ruled that these members' conduct was grossly disorderly. He ordered these 3 members to withdraw from the meeting immediately, and announced that the meeting be adjourned for 5 minutes so that security personnel would be able to assist the Clerk to take action.

4. The meeting resumed at 5:07 pm. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Mr Albert CHAN were still standing in protest on the members' bench. <u>The Chairman</u> advised that as order and safety at the meeting were affected, he had to declare early adjournment of the meeting.

5. The meeting was adjourned at 5:08 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat 13 July 2016