

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC335/15-16
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(29)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 62nd meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 20 May 2016, at 3:00 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Members absent:

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr YEUNG Tak-keung, JP	Commissioner for Sports, Home Affairs Bureau
Ms Linda LAW Lai-tan	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Recreation and Sport) ²
Mrs Alice YU NG Ka-chun	Project Director (3), Architectural Services Department
Mr Raymond LAU	Senior Project Manager 332, Architectural Services Department
Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP	Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) ⁷
Mr LAU Ka-keung, JP	Director of Highways
Mr Jonathan LEUNG Man-ho	Government Engineer (Railway Development) ¹ , Highways Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Raymond SZETO

Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Ms Michelle NIEN

Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

The Chairman said that two meetings were scheduled today to deal with the agenda items. As he was unable to chair the second meeting due to some important engagement, it would be chaired by the Deputy Chairman, Mr CHAN Kam-lam.

Arrangement for cancellation of meetings

2. Expressing dissatisfaction with the cancellation of the two additional Finance Committee ("FC") meetings scheduled on 21 May 2016, Ms Emily LAU was concerned that there might not be sufficient time for FC to deliberate the remaining items within the current term of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"). Mr SIN Chung-kai queried that the reason for cancelling the two meetings was that the relevant discussion papers were not yet ready. In response, Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) said that papers for the agenda items had all along been put forward to FC for approval as soon as they were ready. In light of the experience gained in the past four FC meetings, the Administration was of the view that there should be sufficient time in this meeting to deal with the discussion items scheduled on the agenda.

Item No. 1 – FCR(2016-17)26

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 23 APRIL 2016**

PWSC(2015-16)53

HEAD 707 – NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT

Recreation, Culture and Amenities – Sports facilities

**259RS – Cycle tracks connecting North West New Territories with North
East New Territories – Tuen Mun to Sheung Shui section (Remaining)**

3. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval of the recommendation of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") made at its meeting held on 23 April 2016, i.e. the recommendation in PWSC(2015-16)53, in relation to the remaining works of the cycle tracks connecting North West New Territories with North East New Territories – Tuen Mun to Sheung Shui section. PWSC recommended the upgrading of 259RS concerned to Category A at an estimated cost of \$890.9 million in money-of-the-day prices. No request for separate voting of such proposal in FC meeting was made by members.

4. There being no question from members, the Chairman put the item to vote. The Chairman was of the view that the proposal was supported by a majority of the members voting and declared that the proposal was approved.

Item No. 2 – FCR(2016-17)18

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 31 MARCH 2016**

EC(2015-16)17

**HEAD 53 – GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : HOME AFFAIRS
BUREAU**

Subhead 000 – Operational expenses

5. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval of the recommendation of the Establishment Subcommittee ("ESC") made at its meeting held on 31 March 2016, i.e. the recommendation in EC(2015-16)17, in relation to the retention of one supernumerary post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C for a period of about 19 months and creation of one supernumerary post of Government Architect for a period of 44 months in the Recreation and Sport Branch of Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB") to provide dedicated support at the directorate level to take charge of the detailed planning

Action

and implementation of the Multi-purpose Sports Complex ("MPSC") project in Kai Tak. A request for separate voting of such proposal in FC meeting was made by members.

Need for the construction of MPSC in Kai Tak

6. Mr Albert CHAN expressed opposition to the planning and site selection of MPSC. Mr CHAN pointed out that large-scale activity venues built in countries around the world in recent years tended to be away from urban areas to ensure crowd evacuation safety. Hence, he doubted whether it was appropriate for MPSC to be constructed in the urban area and opined that the said site was more appropriate for constructing public housing.

7. Commissioner for Sports, HAB ("C for S") said that the planning and site selection of MPSC were decided after a long period of consultation and discussion upon undergoing the relevant statutory procedures. As the facilities in MPSC, including the main stadium, the public sports ground and the indoor multi-purpose sports centre, would be open to public when they were not in use for events, members of the public could also benefit from these facilities.

8. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed opposition to the construction of the main stadium of MPSC. Pointing out that the number of spectators of local sports events was on the low side while the number of events participated by visiting teams from overseas was limited, Mr LEUNG queried whether the main stadium could be fully utilized upon completion. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen shared the same concern, and by making reference to the follow-up paper submitted by HAB to ESC on 27 April 2016 (LC Paper No. EC82/15-16(01)), he pointed out that there were not too many sports events held in Hong Kong Stadium and other venues in recent years which were capable of attracting attendance over 20 000 and queried whether the main stadium with a capacity of 50 000 seats could be fully utilized.

9. In response, C for S advised that the last refurbishment of Hong Kong Stadium was completed over 20 years ago, its facilities were no longer sufficient for coping with high-level sports events, and thus it was necessary for Hong Kong to build the main stadium. To ensure maximized utilization of the main stadium, an operations consultant had been appointed to draw up business plans for the future operations of MPSC.

Action

10. Mr WU Chi-wai opined that the cost of the main stadium of MPSC was rather high, and whether it was necessary to construct the stadium remained a controversy. He enquired whether consideration would be given to first building the public sports ground and the indoor multi-purpose sports centre, which were less controversial, so that the general public would benefit and delays in taking forward MPSC as a whole could be avoided. Mr WU also enquired whether the Administration had established any criteria for assessing the effectiveness of operations of the main stadium.

11. C for S advised that as sports facilities currently available in Hong Kong were insufficient for organizing high-level sports events, there was a pressing need to build large-scale venues. Making an estimation from the preliminary cost of MPSC put forward to LegCo last year, the cost of building the main stadium constituted about one-third of the cost of the whole MPSC. Regarding its operations, the operations consultant was gathering information in relation to performance indicators, including the information required in the tender documents of MPSC, and an account of these would be given to the LegCo when approval of funding was to be sought in the future.

12. Dr LAM Tai-fai was in support of the construction of MPSC with a view to facilitating the promotion of sports for all and providing a venue for organizing large-scale activities other than sports. Dr LAM suggested that the Administration should make it more convenient for students to make use of MPSC facilities, so as to cultivate young people's talents and interests in sports. C for S pointed out that a two-month public engagement exercise would be launched to give an introduction of MPSC, including sending letters to various schools. Furthermore, students could use the MPSC facilities when such facilities were not occupied for holding events, and the design of the indoor sports centre allowed it to be partitioned into space for carrying out different types of sports, which would be suitable for schools to organize athletics meets there.

Proposed facilities in MPSC in Kai Tak

13. Mr MA Fung-kwok suggested building a water sports centre in the waters near Kai Tak and at the planning stage, considering to design the roads of MPSC in such a way that could be used as racetracks to serve the needs of sports events and increasing the floor area of MPSC to provide more space for different types of sports. In response, C for S advised that the Administration was studying issues related to water sports and racetracks, and it would strive to maximize the use of the floor area of MPSC.

Action

14. Dr LAM Tai-fai suggested that flexibility should be included in the design of the main stadium so that different types of sports events could be held there. In addition, Dr LAM noted that athletes' treatment facilities were available in existing overseas sports venues. He enquired whether such treatment facilities would be set up in MPSC. C for S responded that a physiotherapy centre and related facilities had been included in the existing planning of MPSC.

Overseeing the construction and management of MPSC

15. Dr LAM Tai-fai urged the Administration to closely monitor the expenditure of constructing MPSC so as to ensure the quality of facilities and avoid delays of works. Mr Albert CHAN was concerned about whether the cost of the MPSC project would overrun and enquired how the Administration could ensure the safety of the facilities. C for S undertook to closely monitor the works progress and expenditures, and advised that the Administration had drawn reference to the design of overseas multi-purpose sports venues and in the course of designing the main stadium of MPSC, consideration would be given to multi-purpose venues.

16. Mr WU Chi-wai requested for an interim report elaborating on how MPSC would be operated to attract organizers of activities to hold events in MPSC, as well as analyzing the trend of upcoming events in Hong Kong and the neighbouring regions. Mr WU was also concerned about the impact of the completion of the main stadium on the roles and utilization rates of existing similar venues, such as the Hong Kong Coliseum and the Hong Kong Stadium.

17. C for S responded that the operations consultant had consulted views of various stakeholders and was drafting a report covering the views of various stakeholders on the facilities in the venue and activities expected to be held in the venue, etc. It was expected that the report would be completed by the end of May and would be uploaded onto the Internet. C for S undertook to deliver the report to Members and report the project progress to the Panel on Home Affairs of LegCo.

Duties, staffing arrangement and job requirements of the two posts proposed to be retained and created

18. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok and Mr LEUNG Che-cheung were in support of the approval of this staffing proposal, so as to promote the planning and development of MPSC as well as the relevant sports policy.

Action

19. Mr MA Fung-kwok, Mr LEUNG Che-cheung and Miss CHAN Yuen-han enquired about the details of the duties and responsibilities of the supernumerary post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C, designated as Principal Assistant Secretary (Recreation and Sport)2 ("PAS(RS)2") proposed to be retained, and whether the post holder would be required to possess relevant expertise in sports. Miss CHAN Yuen-han enquired whether the Administration would consider filling the post of PAS(RS)2 through HAB's internal re-deployment.

20. In response, C for S advised that the post of PAS(RS)2 proposed to be retained was already created in 2014 and would report to C for S who oversaw sports policy. Given that the MPSC project was in the planning stage, the Administration proposed to retain the existing supernumerary post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C and it would be filled by an Administrative Officer to oversee the planning and coordination of the MPSC project, to closely monitor the work of various consultants, including the operations consultant and the technical services consultant, and to steer to ensure that Government's policy objectives were met. Under PAS(RS)2, there was an MPSC project team to provide expertise. In addition, PAS(RS)2 was also responsible for overseeing and taking forward the policy review of the Private Recreational Leases ("PRLs"), including policy input upon refining the recommendations subject to the outcome of the public/stakeholder consultations.

21. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired about the entry requirements for the post of Government Architect proposed to be created, and how HAB could ensure that the architect employed would be fully capable of overseeing the MPSC project, especially the construction of the retractable roof of the main stadium. In response, C for S advised that HAB would liaise with the Architectural Services Department to learn and gain experience of similar projects so as to lay down the entry requirements of the post of Government Architect proposed to be created.

22. Mr YIU Si-wing enquired whether the Administration would define different roles for the major sports venues, including the Hong Kong Stadium, the Hong Kong Coliseum and MPSC, for accommodating different types of activities. C for S responded that it was expected that MPSC would replace the Hong Kong Stadium, and the indoor sports centre's capacity for accommodating spectators would be in between those of the Hong Kong Coliseum and the Queen Elizabeth Stadium.

Action

Others

23. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen requested the Administration to provide the addresses of the land held by the holders of PRLs granted under PRLs by the names of those PRLs holders. C for S agreed to provide the information on the addresses of the land granted under PRLs.

24. There being no further questions from members, the Chairman put the item to vote. The Chairman was of the view that the proposal was supported by a majority of the members voting and declared that the proposal was approved.

Item No. 3 – FCR(2016-17)23

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE ESTABLISHMENT SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 2 MARCH 2016**

EC(2015-16)15

HEAD 60 – HIGHWAYS DEPARTMENT

Subhead 000 – Operational expenses

25. The Chairman advised that this item sought FC's approval of the recommendation of ESC made at its meeting held on 2 March 2016, i.e. the recommendation in EC(2015-16)15, in relation to the retention of one supernumerary post of Chief Engineer in Highways Department for a maximum period of six years to provide dedicated support for monitoring the completion of the Shatin to Central link ("SCL") project and Kwun Tong Line Extension ("KTE") project by the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"). A request for separate voting of such proposal in FC meeting was made by members.

Monitoring the railway projects

26. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung noted that under the "concession" approach, MTRCL should have conducted risk assessment before the commencement of the SCL project to minimize claims arising from the works. However, hard soil in the underground was discovered during the construction of Whampoa Station and thus caused delays to the project. Mr LEUNG enquired whether risk assessment had been conducted before commencing the works of Whampoa Station and how to ensure higher accuracy of such risk assessment.

Action

27. Director of Highways ("D of Hy") responded that Whampoa Station was included in the KTE project. MTRCL was responsible for the financing, design and construction of this railway project. The Administration was given to understand that MTRCL had conducted risk assessment and ground investigation on sites including Whampoa Station before commencing the works. D of Hy explained that given that MTRCL faced different challenges, including the need to maintain the carriageways in the district, together with the fact that underground utilities were congested and the underground rock layers were looser than what was detected from ground investigation, excavation of land under Whampoa Station had to be carried out with great caution. In addition, the works of the tunnels and platforms of Whampoa Station were subject to noise control and such works could not be carried out round the clock as originally planned. All these causes contributed to the delays of the project.

28. At 5:02 pm, the Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned.

29. The meeting was adjourned at 5:02 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat

30 September 2016