

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC310/15-16

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(30)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 64th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 27 May 2016, at 3:15 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu

Members absent:

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) ¹
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Thomas CHAN Chung-ching, JP	Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) ¹
Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP	Project Manager (Hong Kong Island and Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr David LO Kwok-chung	Chief Engineer (Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Donna TAM Yin-ping	District Planning Officer (Sai Kung and Islands), Planning Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO
Mr Keith WONG
Mr Frankie WOO
Miss Yannes HO

Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Council Secretary (1)5
Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

Item No. 1 – FCR(2016-17)28

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 4 MAY 2016**

PWSC(2016-17)9

HEAD 706 – HIGHWAYS

Transport – Roads

814TH – Retrofitting of noise barriers on Tuen Mun Road (Fu Tei Section)

PWSC(2016-17)3

HEAD 703 – BUILDINGS

Law and Order – Police

**237LP – Kowloon East Regional Headquarters and Operational
Base-cum-Ngau Tau Kok Divisional Police Station**

The Chairman advised that this item sought the approval from the Committee of the recommendations of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") made at its meeting held on 4 May 2016, i.e. the recommendations in PWSC(2016-17)3 and PWSC(2016-17)9. The former recommended the upgrading of 237LP - Kowloon East Regional Headquarters and Operational Base-cum-Ngau Tau Kok Divisional Police Station to Category A at an estimated cost of \$3,186 million in money-of-the-day prices; while the latter recommended the upgrading of 814TH - Retrofitting of noise barriers on Tuen Mun Road (Fu Tei Section) to Category A at an estimated cost of \$786.2 million in money-of-the-day prices. No member requested for separate voting on the aforesaid recommendations at a Finance Committee ("FC") meeting.

2. The Chairman declared that he was a salaried consultant of Munich Reinsurance Company.

3. As no member raised question, the Chairman put the item to vote. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

Item No. 2 – FCR(2016-17)25

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 29 FEBRUARY 2016**

PWSC(2015-16)55

HEAD 707 – NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT

Civil Engineering – Land development

786CL – Tung Chung New Town Extension

4. The Chairman advised that this item sought the approval from the Committee of the recommendation of PWSC made at its meeting held on 29 February 2016, i.e. the recommendation in PWSC(2015-16)55, which was about the upgrading of part of 786CL - Tung Chung New Town Extension as 799CL, entitled "Tung Chung New Town Extension - detailed design and site investigation", to Category A at an estimated cost of \$729.5 million in money-of-the-day prices; and the retention of the remainder of 786CL in Category B. Some members requested for separate voting on the recommendations at a FC meeting.

5. PWSC had discussed these recommendations at its meetings held on 24 and 29 February 2016 and deliberated for a total of about two hours. The Administration had also provided a supplementary information paper (LC Paper No. PWSC200/15-16). The related minutes of meetings and supplementary paper had been issued to members and uploaded to the FC's website for members' easy reference.

6. The Chairman reminded members that questions raised at the FC should relate directly to the contents of the agenda item. Members should also avoid repeating their own or other members' arguments. On wider questions of policy, members should raise them either in the Legislative Council ("LegCo") or at meetings of an appropriate panel.

7. The Chairman declared that he was a salaried consultant of Munich Reinsurance Company.

Public markets

8. Miss Alice MAK, Miss CHAN Yuen-han and Mr Steven HO were gravely concerned about the shortage of public markets in Tung Chung District. These members enquired about the Administration's plan to develop additional public markets in Tung Chung District and the Tung Chung New Town Extension ("TCNTE") area, and whether sufficient sites had been reserved.

9. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen criticized the inadequate planning of public markets in Tung Chung District and the TCNTE area, which failed to cater for the needs of the local residents. They urged the Administration to give an undertaking right away that additional public markets would be developed in the district.

10. Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)¹ ("DS(PL)1") advised that the Administration recognized the aspirations and concerns of members and the public regarding provision of public markets in Tung Chung District and the TCNTE area, and it would develop sufficient markets in accordance with the requirements set out in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, so that residents in Tung Chung District and the TCNTE area could purchase fresh food. For instance, the Housing Authority was currently developing public markets within public housing developments in Areas 56 and 39 of Tung Chung, which were expected to complete in 2016-2017 and 2018-2019 respectively. In addition, the Development Bureau ("DEVB") would proactively examine the development of other public markets in the TCNTE area in collaboration with the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB"), Planning Department ("PlanD") and Food and Environmental Hygiene Department. Sufficient land had been planned as Government, Institution or Community ("GIC") sites, which could be used for provision of the aforesaid facilities when necessary. The Administration would brief relevant panels on the progress in due course. Miss Alice MAK requested the Administration to provide a written response to state the above position.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued vide LC Paper No. FC240/15-16(01) on 15 June 2016.]

11. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Ms Claudia MO and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung noted that, according to the Recommended Outline Development Plan ("RODP") submitted by the Administration for the TCNTE area, detailed planning had been made for certain recreational facilities. However, no reference had been made in the RODP regarding specific arrangements on members' request for development of public markets. These members doubted if the Administration would proactively follow up on the related work.

12. Miss CHAN Yuen-han opined that representatives from FHB should attend the meeting to respond to members' request for development of public markets in the TCNTE area.

13. Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) advised that, only the preliminary planning of the TCNTE area had been completed at this stage, and more information on the specific arrangements for various community facilities would be available subject to completion of the detailed design as proposed in this funding application. Given that the required detailed design and site investigation work had not yet commenced, the relevant Government departments were unable to come up with a concrete design for, or be further committed in, the development of public markets at present. Mr NG Leung-sing concurred with the Administration's response.

Social welfare facilities

14. Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr Dennis KWOK, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Ms Claudia MO criticized the Administration for failing to plan for sufficient social welfare facilities in Tung Chung District and the TCNTE area to cater for the needs of elderly persons and persons with disabilities living in the community. For example, as there was no special school in Tung Chung District, people in need in the district had to travel far away to schools in Tsuen Wan District. Moreover, certain special education services had a waiting time by the count of years.

15. DS(PL)1 advised that, as far as planning was concerned, the Administration would reserve sufficient GIC sites and floor areas in the TCNTE area with a view to facilitating relevant Government departments and organizations for provision of appropriate social welfare facilities.

16. District Planning Officer (Sai Kung and Islands), Planning Department ("DPO(SKIs)/PlanD") supplemented that, as far as planning work was concerned, DEVB and PlanD would comply with the requirements of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines and consult the Social Welfare Department ("SWD") in earmarking sufficient land for provision of social welfare facilities. With regard to the TCNTE area, preliminary planning was in place under which floor areas in the TCNTE area would be earmarked for provision of various social welfare facilities, including Integrated Family Service Centre (1 180 square meters ("m²")), Social Security Field Unit (1 020 m²), sub-base of Family and Child Protective Services Unit (190 m²), three Integrated Children and Youth Services Centres (1 390 m² reserved for each centre), two Residential Care Homes for the Elderly ("RCHE") with 150 places each (3 470 m² reserved for each RCHE), RCHE with Day Care Unit for Elderly (150 m²), Neighborhood Elderly Centre (670 m²), two Child Care Centres (1 080 m² reserved for each centre), sub-base of District Support Centre

for Persons with Disabilities (380 m²) and Integrated Community Centre for Mental Wellness (790 m²). Detailed design work would be commenced in due course and SWD would also provide professional opinions in this regard. Dr Fernando CHEUNG criticized that the planning of the aforesaid social welfare facilities failed to alleviate the problem of inadequate special education services.

17. In response, DPO(SKIs)/PlanD pointed out that land had been reserved in Area 108 of Tung Chung for building a special school, and the relevant project was already at the detailed design stage.

18. Mr Dennis KWOK requested the Administration to provide a timetable for the aforesaid work. Dr KWOK Ka-ki requested the Administration to provide detailed information on floor areas reserved for various social welfare facilities.

[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued vide LC Paper No. FC240/15-16(01) on 15 June 2016.]

Traffic and employment in Tung Chung District

19. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung note the Administration's anticipation that about 40 000 jobs would be created locally in the TCNTE area; he enquired about the relevant plan and requested a breakdown by type of jobs.

20. DPO(SKIs)/PlanD advised that a gross floor area of about 500 000 m² had been planned by the Administration for office use and a gross floor area of 327 000 m² for retail use, which together would facilitate creation of a total of 40 000 jobs. Among these jobs, about 18 000 jobs would be positions for low-skilled workers, while the remaining would be positions for middle management positions or professional positions.

21. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung expressed concerns that new population and jobs would lead to an increased number of trips from people working across districts, which would further aggravate the burden of the transport system in Tung Chung District. Ms Claudia MO shared a similar concern.

22. Mr Michael TIEN considered that the development of TCNTE would lead to a considerable increase in local population, so it was necessary to enhance the transport system. He requested the Administration to consider provision of a light rail system in the district.

23. DPO(SKIs)/PlanD advised that, according to the statistics of population census, the percentage of the existing workforce in the total population of Tung Chung District was 50%, in which only about 9.4% were working within the district. The Administration hoped that those new jobs could increase the percentage of working population working within the district. Meanwhile, the Administration would also enhance the transport system in Tung Chung District in light of the additional demands.

24. In response to the recommendation on enhancing the transport system in Tung Chung District, DS(PL)1 and Director of Civil Engineering and Development ("DCED") pointed out that the Administration was currently conducting a consultation exercise and a consultancy study on Topside Development at Hong Kong Boundary Crossing Facilities Island of Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge ("HZMB"), which included a study topic on a transport system connecting three districts, i.e. HZMB artificial island, airport island and Tung Chung. Light rail would be one of the transportation options.

Planning for Lantau

25. Mr Alan LEONG remarked that Lantau development was an important new town development project in Hong Kong in recent years, which was a matter of great public concern. When deliberating the project at PWSC, some members expressed concern about the environmental impact of Lantau development and its effect in further tightening the integration between Hong Kong and the Mainland, etc. Yet, the Administration had until now failed to disclose the detailed planning for Lantau development in response to members' and public concerns.

26. DS(PL)1 advised that Lantau development was a plan for the people of Hong Kong. The Administration took forward the TCNTE work in accordance with the Revised Concept Plan for Lantau of 2007. On the planning of the TCNTE area, in order to be better acquainted itself with the views of the public, the Administration had conducted a three-stage public engagement process since 2012 and had given a briefing to the Panel on Development.

Programme of the construction of TCNTE

27. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noted the Administration's anticipation that detailed design and associated site investigation works would be completed in 2021 for the first population intake in the TCNTE area by 2023, subject to funding approval for the item. He queried whether it would be too short a time for the works to be completed in just two years, and he requested the Administration to give a detailed account on the programme of these works.

28. DCED advised that the whole extension programme would be implemented in phases. The Administration anticipated that the works in the southwestern part of the reclamation area adjacent to Area 56 of Tung Chung would be completed for the first population intake in 2023. The Administration would submit funding applications for the reclamation and construction works upon completion of the detailed design in phases before 2021, with a view to ensuring completion of that part of works by 2023.

Concerns about the environment and fisheries

29. Mr Albert CHAN criticized the lack of legislation in Hong Kong to regulate the noise levels caused by aircraft movements and the backward policy that lagged behind those in other developed regions.

30. Mr Steven HO enquired how the Administration would cater for the needs of fishermen affected by the reclamation works of TCNTE, such as provision of facilities such as berthing spaces for fishing boats.

31. DS(PL)1 and DCED advised that the Administration recognized the fishermen's views and their demands for berthing spaces for fishing boats; it would thoroughly consult the relevant trades upon the commencement of TCNTE's detailed design work.

Motion that discussion on FCR(2016-17)25 be now adjourned

32. At 4:55 pm, Dr KWOK Ka-ki moved a motion under paragraph 39 of the Finance Committee Procedure that discussion on FCR(2016-17)25 be now adjourned. The Chairman thereupon proposed the question that the discussion on FCR(2016-17)25 be adjourned. The Chairman directed that each member, when speaking on the motion, could speak once for not more than three minutes.

33. Dr KWOK Ka-ki spoke on the motion. Dr KWOK criticized that, while the Administration had given undertakings in response to members' request on multiple occasions during LegCo's deliberations on various development projects, it had gone back on its word after approval had been given and dishonoured the undertaking it made to LegCo. Regarding this item, the Administration had repeatedly said that active consideration would be given to developing public markets and social welfare facilities (such as places for the elderly and sheltered workshops), but it had fallen short of giving any undertaking. He expressed concern that the Administration would go back on its word again.

34. Dr Fernando CHEUNG, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Ms Cyd HO and Mr Alan LEONG spoke in support of Dr KWOK Ka-ki's motion. These members remarked that, since PWSC commenced the deliberation on the item a few months ago, a number of members had proposed many recommendations in respect of local facilities, for example, the development of government markets and social welfare facilities (such as places for the elderly and sheltered workshops), but the Administration had failed to give any undertaking on the ground that decisions had yet been made by relevant bureaux. Therefore, they were of the view that the Committee should adjourn the deliberation on the item, and that the Administration should explain in clear terms how the aforesaid recommendations would be implemented before submitting any funding proposal to FC for deliberation.

35. Miss Alice MAK and Mr LEUNG Che-cheung spoke against Dr KWOK Ka-ki's motion. These members remarked that, although the Administration was unable to provide substantive responses to various requests made by members in respect of TCNTE at this stage, it did not mean that the Committee should delay the approval of the item by means of "filibustering", which affected the progress of building facilities under the item that could benefit Tung Chung's existing residents.

36. At 5:15 pm, the Chairman declared that the meeting be adjourned.

37. The meeting was adjourned at 5:15 pm.