

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC316/15-16

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(32)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

**Minutes of the 70th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 3 June 2016 at 7:20 pm**

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS
Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon NG Leung-sing, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP

Members absent:

Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent Fang Kang, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Esther LEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Laurie LO Chi-hong	Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (1)
Mr Vincent FUNG Hao-yin	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Civic Affairs) 1
Mr Alan SIN Kwok-leung	Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects), Architectural Services Department
Mr James CHAN Yum-min	Chief Executive Officer, Po Leung Kuk
Mrs Bridget YU CHAN Wai-ping	Principal Social Services Secretary (Family, Child Care, Children and Youth), Po Leung Kuk
Mr Eddie LEUNG Yu-cheung	Head of Property and Works, Po Leung Kuk
Ms Amy FUNG	Deputy Executive Director, The Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups
Ms Phoenix NGAI	Supervisor, The Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups
Mr C H NG	Managing Director, Handi Architects Limited
Mr Kevin YEUNG Yun-hung	Under Secretary for Education
Mr Ronald LING Pak-ki	Assistant Secretary for Education (Further Education) 2
Dr Lawrence CHAN Wan-ching	Deputy Executive Director (C), Vocational Training Council

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Keith WONG

Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Raymond SZETO

Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Miss Yannes HO

Legislative Assistant (1)6

Action

Item No. 2 – FCR(2016-17)33

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 4 MAY 2016**

PWSC(2015-16)60

**HEAD 708 - CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND
EQUIPMENT**

Subventions - Miscellaneous

**44QJ - Youth Hostel Scheme – Construction works by Po Leung Kuk for
the youth hostel project in Ma Tin Pok, Yuen Long**

Item No. 3 - FCR(2016-17)34

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 18 MAY 2016**

PWSC(2015-16)10

**HEAD 708 - CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND
EQUIPMENT**

Subventions - Miscellaneous

**41QJ - Youth Hostel Scheme – Construction by The Hong Kong
Federation of Youth Groups**

Motion that the further proceedings of the Committee be now adjourned

The Chairman resumed the meeting. Members continued to deliberate on the motion that the further proceedings of the Committee be now adjourned moved by Mr Albert CHAN at the second meeting of today.

2. Mr IP Kwok-him spoke against the motion. He opined that the operation of youth hostels by non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") did not involve transfer of benefits. He enquired about the percentage of the rental of youth hostels in the monthly income of the young people, and whether the NGOs operating the youth hostels ("operating organizations") would submit reports to the Administration on the use of operating surplus.
3. Mr Albert HO was concerned that paying the construction costs for the two Youth Hostel Scheme ("YHS") would set a precedent such that NGOs would continue asking the Government to build youth hostels on the land they have in the future.
4. Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs ("DSHA") replied that the rental paid by tenants of youth hostels accounted for 14%-18% of the mean monthly incomes of the qualified applicants. It was expected that after paying the rental, the tenants could still have savings. Regarding the qualification of the operating organizations, he explained that the objective of the YHS was to encourage NGOs to unleash the potential of under-utilized sites they held. Only non-profit making NGOs with good track record would be considered for participation in YHS. Furthermore, the operating organizations had to submit audited financial report of the youth hostel to the Administration annually; such reports would also be published for monitoring by the public.
5. Mr Albert CHAN spoke to conclude his motion.
6. The Chairman then put the motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that seven members voted in favour of the motion and 24 members voted against the motion. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
(7 members)

Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen

Against:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him
Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen

Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr IP Kwok-him	Mr Paul TSE Wai-chun
Mr James TIEN Pei-chun	Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Ms CHAN Yuen-han	Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong	Mr POON Siu-ping
Mr TANG Ka-piu	Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
(24 members)	

7. The Chairman declared that Mr Albert CHAN's motion was negatived.

Rental level of youth hostels

8. Ms Emily LAU reiterated that the rental level of youth hostels was too high. Dr CHIANG Lai-wan enquired about the rental level of the other three youth hostels (i.e. in Sheung Wan, Mongkok and Jordan) under the YHS.

9. DSHA replied that the above three youth hostel projects were still at their initial design stage. The rental level could not be determined at the present moment.

Relaxing the eligibility for youth hostel tenants to apply for public rental housing

10. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen found it contradictory that the Administration allowed young people living with their families in public rental housing ("PRH") to apply for youth hostel but refused to let tenants of youth hostels apply for PRH at the same time. Mr Albert HO urged that consideration should be given to allowing youth hostel tenants to apply for PRH at the same time.

11. DSHA replied that if youth hostel tenants were allowed to remain on the Waiting List for PRH during their tenanship, they would keep scoring points which would increase their opportunity to move into PRH. That would be unfair to other applicants for single person PRH units who were not youth hostel tenants.

Mode of youth hostel development

12. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung and Mr Albert CHAN urged the Administration to consider acquiring land for youth hostel development, which was more cost effective than paying construction costs to NGOs responsible for the operation. Moreover, it could ensure that ownership of the hostels rested with the Administration.

13. DSHA advised that the Government had no policy for acquisition and purchase of private land for development of youth hostels. Under the YHS, the youth hostels were operated by NGOs holding the land concerned.

14. Mr IP Kwok-him enquired whether the private developer had given the land to Po Leung Kuk ("PLK") for the development of youth hostel. Chief Executive Officer, PLK replied in the affirmative and advised that necessary procedures were being carried out in accordance with the Memorandum of Understanding.

15. Ms Cyd HO requested the Administration to submit the grant and operation agreements entered into between the Administration and PLK and the Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups respectively in respect of the youth hostels and the land leases in the next round of funding application.

16. Mr Abraham SHEK remarked that he and Business and Professionals Alliance for Hong Kong to which he belonged supported YHS.

Motion proposed by member under Paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedures

17. At 8:20 pm, the Committee dealt with the proposed motion moved by Mr Albert CHAN in respect of FCR(2016-17)33 and FCR(2016-17)34 under Paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedures.

18. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered [0001](#) in respect of item FCR(2016-17)33 be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division in respect of the motion and the division bell was rung for five minutes. With the consent of the Chairman, Mr Albert CHAN read out his proposed motion during the ringing of the division bell. The Chairman declared that the question was negatived.

Voting on item no. FCR(2016-17)33

19. The Chairman put item no. FCR(2016-17)33 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that 13 members voted in favour of and 10 members voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan
Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Mr IP Kwok-him
Mr YIU Si-wing
Ms CHAN Yuen-han
Mr POON Siu-ping
(13 members)

Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen
Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr MA Fung-kwok
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen

Against:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan
Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
(10 members)

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan
Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

20. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

Motion proposed by member under Paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedures

21. The Chairman put to vote the question that the motion proposed by Mr Albert CHAN numbered [0001](#) in respect of item FCR(2016-17)34 be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division in respect of the motion and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that the question was negated.

Voting on item no FCR(2016-17)34

22. The Chairman put item no. FCR(2016-17)34 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that 18 members voted in favour of and three members voted against the motion. The votes of individual members were as follows –

For:

Mr Albert HO Chun-yan	Mr CHAN Kam-lam
Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing	Mr TAM Yiu-chung
Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Mr WONG Kwok-hing
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr WONG Ting-kwong
Ms Cyd HO Sau-lan	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr IP Kwok-him	Mr NG Leung-sing
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Dr Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok	Ms CHAN Yuen-han
Miss Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Mr POON Siu-ping
(18 members)	

Against:

Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	
(3 members)	

23. The Chairman declared that the Committee approved the item.

Item No. 4 - FCR(2016-17)35

HEAD 156 - GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : EDUCATION BUREAU

Subhead 700 - General Non-recurrent

New Item - "Pilot Subsidy Scheme for Students of Professional Part-time Programmes"

24. The Chairman said that this item invited the Finance Committee to approve the creation of a new commitment of \$200 million for the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") to implement Pilot Subsidy Scheme for Students of Professional Part-time Programmes ("Pilot Scheme"). The Education Bureau had consulted the Panel on Education on the relevant proposal on 9 May 2016.

List of Eligible Programmes/Qualifications under Vocational Training Council

25. Mr Albert HO noted that the 55 programmes set out in the List of Eligible Programmes/Qualifications ("eligible programmes") under VTC were mostly programmes relating to construction and town planning as well as engineering and technology. He suggested that consideration should be given to expansion of the coverage of the Pilot Scheme to include programmes relating to other disciplines.

26. Under Secretary for Education ("USED") replied that as the Pilot Scheme would last for 3 years, trades with pressing manpower needs would be selected for the trial run of the Scheme. The Administration would consider whether the scope of subsidized programmes would be expanded when the Pilot Scheme was reviewed.

27. Dr Kenneth CHAN indicated his support for this item and enquired whether there were adequate numbers of eligible programmes, enrolment and tutors under the Pilot Scheme to avoid students having to switch to other programmes in the middle of a course. He urged the Administration to give an undertaking that the Panel on Education would be briefed on the progress in the future.

28. Deputy Executive Director, VTC ("DED, VTC") replied that the eligible programmes were Vocational Training Council's self-financing programmes, which would be offered only when there was adequate enrolment, and most of them had been offered in the past. USED added that there were about 1 500 people enrolling in the relevant programmes in 2015-2016. If programmes were offered successfully in the first academic year, they would be run through the end of the programmes. Students would not be asked to switch to other programmes due to inadequate student enrolment mid-course. At the request of Dr Kenneth CHAN, USED undertook that the Panel on Education would be briefed on the progress subsequent to the implementation of the Pilot Scheme.

Employment for Graduates

29. Ms Emily LAU referred to the remarks of the Hong Kong Science Park that there were at present limited number of students enrolling in faculty of engineering in universities, and the engineering discipline had difficulty attracting young people to join the trade. However, most of the programmes set out in the List of Eligible Programmes/Qualifications were programmes relating to engineering and technology. She asked about the prospect of

employment in the engineering discipline based on the understanding of the Administration.

30. USED replied that the number of enrolment intake for the relevant programmes in the eight subsidized tertiary institutions had not witnessed any marked decrease. Moreover, in line with Hong Kong's initiative in the development of technological engineering, the Education Bureau had pro-actively introduced science, technology, engineering and mathematics (also known as "STEM") education in primary and secondary schools in recent years to stimulate the interests of the youngsters in these subjects. Coupled with the overall development of innovation and technology in the society, students would find the career prospect in relevant trades attractive. Furthermore, the eligible programmes under the Pilot Scheme were intermediate-level programmes whose target might be different from that of the engineering faculty in the universities, as they were targeted at people who possessed working experiences in relevant trades and wished to enhance their skills and knowledge.

31. Mr WONG Kwok-hing supported the item. He suggested that the Administration should keep communicating with the Labour and Welfare Bureau and companies relevant to the trades of the eligible programmes for creation of working opportunities for students of the eligible programmes. He further suggested that the working hours of the relevant trades should be taken into account in the class arrangement of the eligible programmes.

32. USED responded that as students of the Pilot Scheme were mostly practitioners in the relevant trades who had enrolled in the eligible programmes for self-enhancement, the proposal regarding opportunities of job placements might not be suitable. USED said that VTC would take into account of the working hours of different trades regarding the course arrangement of the eligible programmes.

33. Mr Andrew LEUNG declared that he was a former Chairman of VTC and he was currently involved in VTC's consultative framework. He enquired whether VTC had considered the needs of the trades in the design of the programmes. DED, VTC affirmed that the trades had been consulted to ensure that the programmes could meet the needs of different industries.

Qualifications Framework (QF) Levels

34. Ms CHAN Yuen-han indicated her support for the item, but she found it inadequate that the programmes were pitched at QF level 5 the highest. She asked the Administration on the decision-making on how the programmes were pitched at in terms of QF level.

35. USED replied that the eligible programmes were mainly of practical nature which aimed to assist working adults in self-enhancement; as such, most of the programmes were higher diploma or professional diploma programmes which were pitched at QF level 3 to level 5. Among which, QF level 5 was equivalent to bachelor's degree level while QF level 4 was equivalent to sub-degree level. Mr Andrew LEUNG added the Hong Kong Council for Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications was responsible for accrediting the QF levels of Vocational Training Council programmes, and the same applied to the eligible programmes under the Pilot Scheme.

Reimbursement of Subsidies

36. Mr Albert HO pointed out that students who were granted subsidies for the part-time programmes under the Pilot Scheme had to pay the tuition fees upfront and reimbursement of 60% of the tuition fees of eligible programmes would be made at the end of each term of the programme by instalments upon successful completion. This might pose economic pressure on some of the students requiring subsidies. Mr HO suggested imbursement of subsidies on an accountable basis upon commencement of programme. Ms Emily LAU supported Mr Albert HO's proposal.

37. USED said that the purpose of this imbursement method was that students receiving subsidies would be required to complete one whole term of the programme and perform satisfactorily to the Education Bureau before they could be refunded the fee for the term they had completed.

38. There being no further questions from members, the Chairman put Item no. FCR (2016-17)35 to vote.

39. The Chairman considered that the majority of members who had voted, voted in favour of this proposal, and he declared that the proposal was approved.

40. The meeting was adjourned at 9:14 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat

15 September 2016