

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)1963/15-16  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/1/15

**Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene**

**Subcommittee on  
Issues Relating to Animal Welfare and Cruelty to Animals**

**Minutes of 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting  
held on Monday, 25 April 2016, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Claudia MO (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG Ngok-kiu

**Members absent** : Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

**Public Officers attending** : Item I  
  
Ms Hinny LAM Shuk-yee  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 3  
  
Miss Swing YAU Sze-wing  
Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 5  
  
Dr Henry CHEUNG Siu-ming  
Principal Veterinary Officer  
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

Dr Michelle YEUNG Lee  
Senior Veterinary Officer (Technical Services)  
Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Josephine SO  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Ivy CHENG  
Senior Council Researcher 3

Ms Wendy LO  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG  
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

---

Action

**I. Safety of pet food products in Hong Kong**  
(LC Paper No. CB(2)1328/15-16(01) and IN02/15-16)

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex A**).

Follow-up actions required of the Administration

Admin

2. The Administration was requested to provide written response to issues/concerns raised by members as set out in **Annex B**.

*(Post-meeting note: The English and Chinese versions of the Administration's response were issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1425/15-16(04) on 6 and 13 May 2016 respectively).*

**II. Date of next meeting and item for discussion**

Date of next meeting

3. Members agreed that to avoid clashing with the anticipated continuation of the Council meeting commencing on 11 May 2016, the next meeting of the Subcommittee originally scheduled for 13 May 2016 be rescheduled to 9 May 2016. Members also agreed to discuss the item "Government's efforts in management of stray animals" at the next meeting.

Action

*(Post-meeting note: A circular notifying members of the rescheduling of the fourth Subcommittee meeting was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)1370/15-16 on 26 April 2016.)*

**III. Any other business**

4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 9:55 am.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
9 August 2016

**Proceedings of the meeting of the  
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Animal Welfare and Cruelty to Animals  
on Monday, 25 April 2016, at 8:30 am  
in Conference Room 2 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)/Discussion</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
000124 - 000144	Chairman	The Chairman's opening remarks.	
<b><i>Item I - Safety of pet food products in Hong Kong</i></b>			
000145 - 001444	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on issues relating to the safety of pet food products in Hong Kong (LC Paper No. CB(2)1328/15-16(01)).	
001445 - 001720	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	Enquiry on the timetable for introducing into the Legislative Council the proposed amendments to the Public Health (Animals and Birds) (Animal Traders) Regulations (Cap. 139B).	
001721 - 002504	Chairman Mr CHAN Hak-kan Admin	<p>Expressing concern that the number of complaints relating to the hygiene and quality of commercial pet food available in the market had been on the rise in recent years and there was no dedicated legislation regulating the safety of pet food products sold in Hong Kong, Mr CHAN Hak-kan considered that the Administration should put in place a regulatory regime for pet food products sold in the territory, so as to prevent sub-standard products from entering the local market. Regarding the Administration's proposed study on commercial pet food products available in Hong Kong which would be conducted by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department ("AFCD"), Mr CHAN sought details about the timetable for launching the study and the estimated time for completion.</p> <p>The Administration's response that:</p> <p>(a) on the safety of pet food, there were at present no commonly adopted standards at the international level. Most of the commercial pet food items consumed in Hong Kong were imported from places such as the United States and the European Union which had put in place regulations governing pet food products, and had set safety standards on their own. The</p>	<b>Admin (item (a) (i) of Annex B refers)</b>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>Administration was aware that these places had a rather prominent pet food manufacturing industry, supplying both the domestic markets as well as exports;</p> <p>(b) in 2014 and 2015 respectively, the Consumer Council conducted two studies on commercial pet food available in the market. The test results showed that all of the samples were free of contamination from microbes;</p> <p>(c) the number of complaints with regard to pet food products received by AFCD over the past few years indicated that the quality and hygiene standards of pet food in Hong Kong were generally satisfactory; and</p> <p>(d) nevertheless, taking into account the results of the studies and suggestions from the Consumer Council, the Administration saw merits in and was contemplating conducting regulator testing on commercial pet food products available in the territory. The focus of the test would be on a few common microbial contaminants and substances of concern. The test results would enable the Administration's assessment, on a more informed basis, whether and the extent to which the safety of pet foods was a concern and how the present measures on pet food products might be enhanced. The test results would be released for public information.</p> <p>Mr CHAN's further enquiries and the Administration's response regarding the complaint channels available for pet owners and the follow-up actions taken by AFCD upon receipt of a complaint.</p>	
002505 - 003759	Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin	<p>The Deputy Chairman's enquiry and the Administration's response concerning the number of complaints received by AFCD in relation to the safety of pet food products in recent years.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman's view that the Administration should not solely rely on the regulatory measures adopted by pet food</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>manufacturing countries in ensuring the quality and hygiene standards of pet food in Hong Kong. The Administration should consider introducing specific legislation to regulate pet food products in Hong Kong. She sought details of the proposed study on pet food products, including (i) the scope of the study, including the sampling size and types of pet food products to be taken for testing, the inspection frequency, the microbial contaminants and substances of concern to be focused on in the tests, and the study method to be adopted; and (ii) the estimated cost to be incurred for conducting the study.</p> <p>The Administration's response that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) it targeted to test around 200 to 300 products during a two-year period. The focus of the test would be on a few common micro-organisms and contaminants, by making reference to the studies conducted by the Consumer Council and other overseas regulatory authorities;</li> <li>(b) the Administration would handle the procurement of the services for the study in accordance with the Stores and Procurement Regulations, which included preparation of tender documents, invitation of tenders through open tender, and selection of service providers via a tender committee based on the endorsed assessment criteria; and</li> <li>(c) the proposal of introducing legislation to regulate pet food might increase the compliance cost for the trade, resulting in monopolization of the market by major pet food importers and fewer choices of pet food products for consumers. The Administration hoped that the study could provide useful information and reference for the Government in considering whether the present measures on pet food products should be enhanced.</li> </ul> <p>Responding to the Chairman's enquiry, the Administration explained that as some pet food products might not be imported into Hong Kong</p>	<p><b>Admin (item (a) (ii) &amp; (iii) of Annex B refers)</b></p>

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>on a regular basis, the Administration would need time to collect samples of different types and consignments of pet food products for testing. Hence, a two-year period was proposed for the study.</p>	
003800 - 004834	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Admin</p>	<p>Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered the establishment of a legislative framework in Hong Kong for regulating pet food products could provide a legal basis for the future development of local pet food production industry. Expressing concern about suspected cases of illness of pets caused by consumption of imported pet food, he called on the Administration to commence regular testing on commercial pet food available in Hong Kong, study the feasibility of enacting legislation to regulate the safety and hygiene standards of pet food, and step up public education as appropriate in this respect.</p> <p>The Administration advised that AFCD had closely monitored and would continue to monitor pet food incidents within the territory and outside Hong Kong. If necessary, follow-up actions would be taken. The Administration would also step up public education on issues related to the health and welfare of pets.</p>	
004835 - 005504	<p>Chairman Mr Alvin YEUNG Admin</p>	<p>Mr Alvin YEUNG enquired about the number of complaint cases received involving false trade descriptions of pet food products under the Trade Descriptions Ordinance (Cap. 362) and the follow-up actions taken by the Customs and Excise Department, including prosecutions instituted. The Administration undertook to provide the requisite information after the meeting.</p> <p>Mr YEUNG's enquiry and the Administration's response about past cases of illness of pets suspected to be caused by consumption of problematic pet food.</p>	<p><b>Admin (item (b) of Annex B refers)</b></p>
005505 - 010155	<p>Chairman Miss Alice MAK Admin</p>	<p>Miss Alice MAK considered it necessary for the Administration to introduce legislation to regulate pet food products in Hong Kong. She asked whether the Administration would conduct testing on homemade snacks and festive food for pets (including those products</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action Required
		<p>sold online) under the proposed study on pet food products.</p> <p>The Administration advised that while it would be difficult to establish safety standards for regulating homemade pet food/those products not commonly found in the market, the Administration intended to include these types of pet food for testing in the study. AFCD would also educate pet owners to feed their pets with appropriate food that suited their pets.</p>	
010156 - 011030	Chairman Ms Cyd HO Admin	<p>Ms Cyd HO shared other members' view that it was necessary for the Administration to introduce dedicated legislation regulating the safety of pet food products sold in the territory. In her view, the enactment of local legislation governing pet food could help safeguard animal health and prevent outbreak of animal transmitted diseases. The Administration advised that AFCD would step up publicity to remind pet owners to handle pet food (in particular raw and undercooked pet food) with care and be vigilant in maintaining personal hygiene to lower the public health risk.</p> <p>At the request of Ms HO and the Chairman, the Administration would provide supplementary information, in writing, on the scope of the proposed study on commercial pet food and the estimated cost for conducting the study.</p>	<b>Admin (item (a) (ii) &amp; (iii) of Annex B refers)</b>
011031 - 012220	Chairman Deputy Chairman Ms Cyd HO Admin	<p>The Chairman's declaration of interests.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that the establishment of a legislative framework to regulate pet food products in Hong Kong could provide a legal basis for future development of local pet food production industry, thereby creating employment opportunities. His remark that members of the Subcommittee had arrived at a consensual view that the Administration should put in place a regulatory regime for pet food products available in the market, regardless of whether they were pre-packaged, processed or homemade food, locally produced or imported from places outside Hong Kong. He suggested that in considering the formulation of the legislative framework, the Administration should draw reference from overseas experience to ensure that the quality of commercial pet</p>	



<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)/Discussion</b>	<b>Action Required</b>
		<p>food in Hong Kong would meet the international safety standards.</p> <p>The Chairman requested the Administration to provide information on whether the suppliers where Hong Kong imported pet food products had dedicated legislation regulating the safety of pet food products.</p>	<b>Admin (item (c) of Annex B refers)</b>
012221 - 012346	Chairman Mr CHAN Chi-chuen Admin	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen considered that the Administration should conduct testing on dry pet food, raw and undercooked pet food, as well as health food products for pets under the proposed study on commercial pet food products. The Administration advised that it would take into account Mr CHAN's suggestions.	
<b><i>Item II - Date of next meeting and item for discussion</i></b>			
012347 - 012614	Chairman Deputy Chairman Clerk	<p>Rescheduling of meeting in May 2016 and item for discussion at the next meeting.</p> <p>The Chairman's closing remarks.</p>	

**Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene**

**Subcommittee on Issues Relating to Animal Welfare and Cruelty to Animals**

**List of follow-up actions**

<b>Date of meeting</b>	<b>Follow-up action required</b>	<b>Administration's response</b>
25 April 2016	<p>In the context of discussing the item "Safety of pet food products in Hong Kong", the Administration was requested to provide the following information:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) in relation to the study on commercial pet food available in Hong Kong, being contemplated by the Administration and to be conducted after the tendering process had been completed, the details of the study including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(i) the timetable for launching the study and the estimated time for completion;</li> <li>(ii) the scope of the study, including, inter alia, the sampling size and types of pet food products to be taken for testing, the inspection frequency, the microbial contaminants and substances of concern to be focused on in the tests, and the study method to be adopted;</li> <li>(iii) the estimated cost, if available, to be incurred for conducting the study;</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Response from the Administration awaited.

Date of meeting	Follow-up action required	Administration's response
	<p>(b) the number of complaint cases received involving false trade descriptions of pet food products under the Trade Descriptions Ordinance (Cap. 362) and the follow-up actions taken by the Customs and Excise Department, including prosecutions instituted; and</p> <p>(c) information on whether the suppliers where Hong Kong imported pet food products had dedicated legislation regulating the safety of pet food products.</p>	

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
9 August 2016