

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)759/15-16

(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/FE

Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene

Minutes of meeting

**held on Tuesday, 8 December 2015, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, BBS, MH
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP, PhD, RN
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP
Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon WONG Yuk-man
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Christopher CHUNG Shu-kun, BBS, MH, JP
- Member attending** : Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

**Member
absent** : Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan, JP

**Public Officers
attending** : Item IV

Professor Sophia CHAN Siu-chee, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Mr Kenneth CHAN Siu-yum
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 1

Mr Ricky CHENG Wing-kei
Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Dr HO Yuk-yin, JP
Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment
and Communication), Centre for Food Safety
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Dr LEE Siu-yuen, JP
Assistant Director (Food Surveillance and Control),
Centre for Food Safety
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr LI Ka-kei
Assistant Director (Operations) 1
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr WONG Hon-meng
Assistant Director (Waste Reduction and Recycling)
Environmental Protection Department

Item V

Professor Sophia CHAN Siu-chee, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Diane WONG Shuk-han
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Mr LI Ka-kei
Assistant Director (Operations) 1
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr LAM Wing-hong
Assistant Director (Operations) 2
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Ms Rhonda LO Yuet-yee
Coordinator (Hawker Assistance Scheme)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Item VI

Professor Sophia CHAN Siu-chee, JP
Under Secretary for Food and Health

Miss Diane WONG Shuk-han
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food) 2

Mr FORK Ping-lam
Assistant Director (Operations) 3
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr CHIU Yu-chow
Assistant Director (Grade Management and
Development Division)
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Clerk in attendance : Miss Josephine SO
Chief Council Secretary (2) 2

Staff in attendance : Ms Wendy LO
Senior Council Secretary (2) 2

Miss Emma CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2) 2

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes
(LC Paper No. CB(2)347/15-16)

The minutes of the special meeting held on 6 October 2015 were confirmed.

II. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting

2. Members noted that no information paper had been issued since the last meeting.

III. Date of next meeting and items for discussion

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)376/15-16(01) and (02))

3. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting scheduled for Tuesday, 12 January 2016 at 2:30 pm -

(a) Supply chain of powdered formula; and

(b) Private Columbaria Bill: Anticipated issues that must be handled at the initial stage of the implementation of the regime under the Ordinance.

IV. Public consultation on regulation of edible fats and oils and recycling of "waste cooking oils": findings and observations

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)376/15-16(03) and (04))

4. At the invitation of the Chairman, Under Secretary for Food and Health ("USFH") gave a general account of the views collected during the public consultation exercise on the legislative proposals to regulate edible fats and oils and the recycling of "waste cooking oils". With the aid of power-point presentation, Consultant (Community Medicine) (Risk Assessment and Communication), Centre for Food Safety ("C(CM)(RAC)/CFS"), Assistant Director (Food Surveillance and Control), Centre for Food Safety, Assistant Director (Waste Reduction and Recycling), Environmental Protection Department and Assistant Director (Operations) 1, Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("AD(Ops)1/FEHD") took turns to brief Members on the Administration's main findings and observations about the public views received, as detailed in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)376/15-16(03)). Members noted the updated background brief (LC Paper No. CB(2)376/15-16(04)) prepared by the Legislative Council ("LegCo") Secretariat on the subject.

(Post-meeting note: The softcopy of the power-point presentation materials was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)429/15-16(01) on 8 December 2015.)

Overall observations and proposed way forward

5. In response to Dr Helena WONG's enquiry about the current position on the proposals and the Administration's proposed way forward for regulating the safety and quality standards for edible fats and oils and the recycling of "waste cooking oils", USFH advised that -

- (a) having considered the views collected during the consultation exercise, the Administration would refer to the standards of the Codex Alimentarius Commission ("Codex") as the blueprint in working out the specific details of the proposed legislation to regulate the safety and quality standards for edible fats and oils. The regulatory framework would align with international practices and meet the requirements of the World Trade Organization. The Administration considered that adoption of the proposed limits of 5 ppb for aflatoxins and Benzo[a]pyrene ("B[a]P") in edible fats and oils would enhance food safety and have limited impact on the trade;
- (b) regarding the proposed requirement for certification of edible fats and oils, the Administration noted the concerns of the trade and acknowledged that there might be implementation difficulties. The Administration would explore the acceptance of officially recognized certificates (e.g. Certificate of Free Sale, Manufacturer's Declaration, etc.) issued by oil exporting jurisdictions. In this connection, it had to examine the conditions for issuing these documents among different places of origin to ensure that the documents could in practice safeguard the food safety of the edible fats and oils concerned;
- (c) it was not a common practice overseas to apply the same set of safety and quality standards for fresh oils to "reused oils" or "cooking oils in use". As an alternative, it was proposed to issue a set of guidelines on good practices for the trade's reference and commission studies in cooperation with local universities for such purposes. The trade would be involved during the process; and
- (d) on the regulation of recycling of "waste cooking oils", the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") planned to launch the registration scheme for eligible local collectors/processors/exporters of "waste cooking oils" according to the proposed timetable. EPD had been in close liaison with the recycling trade regarding the concern of the catering industry on

Action

whether there were enough recyclers of "waste cooking oils" in the market. The recycling trade generally considered that there was sufficient local capacity for collecting and processing all the "waste cooking oils" generated by licensed restaurants, factory canteens and food factories in Hong Kong.

6. The Chairman declared that he owned a company with business in recovering used cooking oils. He said that Members belonging to the Liberal Party were generally supportive of the regulatory approach set out in the Administration's paper.

7. Mr WONG Yuk-man suggested that an inter-departmental task force be set up to provide one-stop support services to help the trade comply with the new requirements. The task force should be designated to provide advice and assistance to manufacturers/importers of edible fats and oils and collectors/processors of "waste cooking oils" in matters relating to testing and certification as well as application for licences for the collection, processing and import/export of "waste cooking oils". These apart, the task force should handle public enquiries and enhance promotion and public education on the proposed regulatory regime. In his view, the Administration should closely monitor the implementation of the new system and consider the need to review it in future.

8. In response to Mr WONG Kwok-hing's enquiry about the proposed level of penalty for non-compliance with the requirements under the new regime, USFH explained that the proposed regulatory framework would involve amendments to different provisions in existing legislation including the relevant regulations under the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap. 132) and the Waste Disposal Ordinance (Cap. 354). The Administration would consider the proposed penalty levels in the legislative process.

Regulation of edible fats and oils

Certification system for edible fats and oils

9. Mr Vincent FANG welcomed the Administration's willingness to address the trade's concerns over the certification requirements by exploring the feasibility of accepting Certificate of Free Sale, Manufacturer's Declaration or similar documents issued by oil exporting jurisdictions.

10. Mr WONG Yuk-man said that it was not an international practice to require an official certificate for edible oils and fats. He envisaged that there would be practical difficulties in implementing the certification requirements,

Action

in particular if unscrupulous edible oils importers imported problematic oils from places of manufacture, such as the Mainland, by using counterfeit certificates. He suggested that importers should be required to provide a certificate issued by an independent testing institution officially recognized in Hong Kong (i.e. those institutions that could perform the relevant tests and were recognized under the Hong Kong Laboratory Accreditation Scheme) in order to ensure that the imported products would fulfil the proposed safety and quality standards for edible fats and oils. Mr WONG added that he was supportive of the proposal to require importers and manufacturers of edible fats and oils to provide copies of certificates or other supporting documents to their downstream distributors or retailers for the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD")'s inspection.

Safety and quality standards for edible fats and oils

11. Mr WONG Yuk-man supported the proposed limits of 5 ppb for aflatoxins and B[a]P in edible fats and oils.

12. Mr Vincent FANG said that some manufacturers of peanut oil had expressed grave concern about the proposal to tighten the maximum level of aflatoxins in peanut oil from the existing level of 20 ppb stipulated in the Harmful Substances in Food Regulations (Cap. 132AF) to the statutory limit of 5 ppb. He and Mr CHAN Han-pan both considered the proposed standards for aflatoxins and B[a]P in edible fats and oils too stringent and not proportionate to the risk levels of edible fats and oils, which would lead to compliance issues and might affect production costs and the availability of certain types of edible oils in the market. They questioned the rationale for setting the proposed stringent limits for aflatoxins and B[a]P in Hong Kong in the absence of corresponding Codex standards. Mr CHAN further enquired whether the Administration had made reference to practices of overseas jurisdictions in proposing the limits. The Deputy Chairman considered that the Administration should explain clearly to the public the rationale for setting the proposed regulatory standards for aflatoxins and B[a]P in edible fats and oils.

13. USFH and C(CM)(RAC)/CFS responded with the following points -

- (a) in proposing the statutory safety and quality standards for edible fats and oils, the Administration had taken into account overseas practices and local situation, the Codex standards, the dietary exposure to those harmful substances and the feasibility of adopting the proposed standards. Since aflatoxins and B[a]P could both cause cancers in humans, the Administration considered it necessary to strike a reasonable balance between protecting public health and facilitating market operation;

Action

- (b) for aflatoxins and B[a]P which Codex had not established corresponding limits, the Administration considered that the "ALARA" (as low as reasonably achievable) principle should be adopted to control contaminants in food, given the significant food safety and public health implications;
- (c) according to CFS's food surveillance results, 99% of the edible fat and oil samples met the proposed standard for aflatoxins at 5 ppb which was the regulatory standard adopted in Singapore. Hence, the Administration believed that adoption of the proposed standard should have limited impact on the trade;
- (d) the Administration also believed that by stipulating a tighter B[a]P limit, it could motivate the trade to take appropriate measures (such as further refining of oil during processing to reduce the B[a]P level in their products) to safeguard public health. Hence, the adoption of the proposed standard (i.e. a limit of 5 ppb for B[a]P) would help enhance food safety; and
- (e) B[a]P was a kind of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons ("PAHs"). The Joint Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations/World Health Organization Expert Committee on Food Additives pointed out that vegetable fats and oils (owing to higher concentrations of PAHs in this food group) were one of the major contributors of PAHs intake. Based on CFS's past food surveillance data, only some 5% of edible fat and oil samples contained B[a]P higher than the proposed limit of 5 ppb. As such, the impact of the proposed limit on food supply would be limited. It should be noted that the proposed standard at 5 ppb was less stringent than that adopted by the European Union and Korea.

14. The Chairman considered that the Administration should assess the impact of tightening the limit of aflatoxins in edible fats and oils on the supply within Hong Kong of peanut oil. He opined that the Administration should make reference to the practices of other jurisdictions, apart from Singapore, in setting the proposed limit of aflatoxins in edible fats and oils, in order to ensure in Hong Kong the stable supply of oil products while protecting public health.

Regulation of "reused oils"

15. Mr WONG Yuk-man expressed support for the Administration's plan to develop guidelines for good practices in using frying oils for reference by

Action

the food trade to obviate the need to regulate "reused oils" and "cooking oils in use". Dr Helena WONG however was concerned that the guidelines would not have any binding effect. Mr WONG Kwok-hing considered that the Administration should specify in the guidelines the definition of and the criteria for assessing the quality of "reused oils" (e.g. the maximum number of times the oils could be reused before they had to be disposed of). C(CM)(RAC)/CFS responded that taking into account international practices and the fact that the number of times that oils could be reused depended on multiple factors, the Administration anticipated considerable difficulty in terms of regulation, enforcement and prosecution. At this stage, a more pragmatic approach would be to address the statutory standards for edible fats and oils for sale in the market first. As for "reused oils", the Administration would commission studies by local universities to assist CFS to develop guidelines for good practices in using frying oils.

Regulation of recycling of "waste cooking oils"

16. Mr WONG Kwok-hing noted that the Administration would consider setting an exemption level for food premises generating only a small amount of "waste cooking oils" or grease trap waste. He sought elaboration on the term "small quantities" under the scenarios set out in paragraph 42 of the Administration's paper. AD(Ops)1/FEHD advised that some food premises might generate only a small amount of "waste cooking oils". The disposal of, for example, one or two small bottles of "waste cooking oils" after the cooking process would be regarded as "small quantities".

17. Following up on the Administration's reply, the Chairman opined that the Administration should consider stipulating clearly the maximum amount of grease trap waste that could be mixed with other kitchen waste. He said that all effluents from restaurants were expected to be filtered through the grease traps before discharged into the drains as the installation of proper grease traps was a prerequisite requirement for the issue of restaurant licences, and EPD would conduct regular inspections on samples of effluent taken from restaurants. While FEHD would consider allowing the licensees to mix small quantities of "waste cooking oils" with other kitchen waste, restaurant operators should endeavour to prevent blockage of drains.

18. The Deputy Chairman said that restaurants might end up disposing of all "waste cooking oils" generated from cooking process or having to pay registered licensed collectors to take away their "waste cooking oils" if there was a drop in the collection price of "waste cooking oils" in future. He and Mr CHAN Han-pan hoped that measures be drawn up by the Administration to tackle the unintended disposal activities after the implementation of the relevant legislation. The Chairman added that the Administration should clarify how it would assess the sufficiency of registered "waste cooking oils" collectors providing the required collection service.

V. Progress report on the implementation of the Hawker Assistance Scheme

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)376/15-16(05) and (06))

19. At the invitation of the Chairman, USFH and AD(Ops)1/FEHD briefed Members on the progress of the implementation of the five-year Assistance Scheme for Hawkers in Fixed-pitch Hawker Areas ("the Assistance Scheme"), including the application statistics under the Assistance Scheme, as detailed in the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)376/15-16(05)). Members noted the background brief prepared by the LegCo Secretariat on the subject (LC Paper No. CB(2)376/15-16(06)).

20. Referring to the requests raised in a submission tabled at the meeting from Federation of Hong Kong Kowloon New Territories Hawker Associations, Mr WONG Kwok-hing enquired whether the Administration would consider issuing new hawker licences to existing registered assistants with experience in the hawking trade ("registered assistants") and giving them priority in filling any vacant fixed hawker pitches in the relevant hawker areas where they had been doing business for years.

(Post-meeting note: The submission tabled at the meeting was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(2)427/15-16 on 8 December 2015.)

21. USFH responded that the Administration noted the aspiration of some registered assistants to be allowed to apply for fixed-pitch hawker licences when the vacant pitches were made available in future. The Administration would carefully consider the matter at a suitable time after the initiatives under the Assistance Scheme to relocate and reconstruct hawker stalls had been completed by June 2018, taking into account the circumstances of individual hawker areas, including their fire safety and environmental hygiene situations, the business environment, comments of relevant departments, as well as the views of the relevant District Council ("DC") and local residents.

22. In response to Mr KWOK Wai-keung's enquiry about the number of registered assistants employed by hawkers who had surrendered their hawker licences, USFH advised that as at the end of October 2015, 491 applications had been received from eligible hawkers for surrender of their licence in return for an ex-gratia payment ("EGP"). Among the 491 licence holders, 322 had employed assistants involving a total of 394 registered assistants.

23. Mr WONG Kwok-hing, Mr KWOK Wai-keung and Miss CHAN Yuen-han expressed grave concern that the livelihood of the registered assistants working for those fixed-pitch hawkers who had surrendered/would

Action

surrender their licence for EGP would be seriously affected if the Administration did not give priority to review and approve their applications for transfer of their employers' fixed-pitch hawker licences. In their views, the Administration should start reviewing without any delay the circumstances of individual hawker areas, with a view to issuing new fixed-pitch hawker licences to registered assistants to fill the vacant pitches in the hawker areas. Sharing a similar view, the Deputy Chairman said that the Administration should commence the preparation work for issuing new fixed-pitch hawker licences, taking into account the implementation progress of the Assistance Scheme and in anticipation of the total number of licences to be surrendered by targeted hawkers.

24. USFH responded that as the number of licences to be surrendered by hawkers could not be ascertained until the conclusion of the Assistance Scheme, the Administration considered it appropriate to conduct the review on issuing new licences after the expiry of the Assistance Scheme in June 2018.

25. USFH and Coordinator (Hawker Assistance Scheme), FEHD ("C(HAS)/FEHD") further advised that in the past few months, FEHD had been closely liaising with eligible hawkers on surrender of their licence in return for an EGP or application for a grant to reconstruct in-situ or to relocate their stalls. During the process, there had been requests for rationalizing the overall layout of hawker stalls where circumstances permitted, so as to alleviate the crowded conditions in some hawker areas. Some hawkers whose stalls were connected with another due to historical reasons also requested that the stalls be separated by making use of the space vacated upon the relocation of some stalls. FEHD would look into the matter to see if and how these requests could be acceded to.

26. Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that while she was not opposed to the idea of rationalizing the overall layout of hawker stalls, she hoped that the improvement measures to be taken by the Administration would not unduly affect the business environment of the hawker areas. USFH responded that the Administration noted her view and agreed to take it into consideration.

27. In response to Miss CHAN Yuen-han's enquiry about the application statistics, C(HAS)/FEHD advised that as at the end of October 2015, 1 824 and 491 applications had respectively been received for reconstruction grant to upgrade the stall structures to the required fire safety standard and surrender of hawker licences for EGP, making a total of 2 315 applications (accounting for about 53.4% of all the eligible hawkers). For the remaining hawkers, some 1 000 were operating "morning set-up and evening dismantle"

Action

Hawker Permitted Place stalls in Tung Choi Street, Temple Street and Nelson Street, and another 1 000 were operating fixed-pitch stalls mainly in Eastern and Wan Chai Districts. While some hawkers operating in these areas had started to surrender licences since November 2015, eligible hawkers who had not yet exercised their option to surrender their licence in return for an EGP or apply for a grant to reconstruct their stalls might do so before the five-year Assistance Scheme expired in June 2018.

28. Responding to the Deputy Chairman, C(HAS)/FEHD advised that among the 491 EGP applications, 65 came from the 496 "selected hawker stalls" which must be relocated since they were located directly in front of staircase discharge points of adjacent buildings or obstructing the operation of fire engines or other emergency vehicular access. As the Administration expected that more EGP applications would be received before the five-year Assistance Scheme expired in June 2018, the ultimate number of vacant pitches made available under the voluntary licence surrender arrangement should be adequate to accommodate the relocation of all the selected hawker stalls.

29. Regarding Ms Claudia MO's concern about the proposed relocation of hawker stalls in Yen Chow Street Hawker Bazaar ("YCSHB"), C(HAS)/FEHD said that the hawker stalls in YCSHB were not covered by the Assistance Scheme which targeted mainly at 4 300 hawker stalls operating in 43 fixed-pitch hawker areas identified by the Administration as having higher fire risks. Assistant Director (Operations) 2, FEHD advised that FEHD was liaising with the licensed hawkers operating in YCSHB on the moving out arrangements. The moving out of all the stalls was expected to be completed by around mid-2016.

30. Dr Kenneth CHAN opined that the Administration should provide in its discussion paper information on measures taken/to be taken by the Administration for promoting the long-term development of the hawking trade and improving the business environment of the fixed-pitch hawker areas under discussion after the relocation and reconstruction exercises. USFH advised that the Administration's paper sought to give Members an overview of the implementation progress of the Assistance Scheme, so as to facilitate focused discussion on the matter. The Administration would give due consideration to views received in this respect.

VI. Keep Clean @ Hong Kong : Our Home

(LC Paper Nos. CB(2)376/15-16(07) and (08), CB(2)2155/14-15(01), CB(2)152/15-16(01) and CB(2)314/15-16(01))

31. At the invitation of the Chairman, USFH briefed Members on the

Action

measures proposed by the Administration for sustaining the community's cleansing efforts after the "Keep Clean 2015 @ Hong Kong: Our Home" Campaign ("the Campaign"), as detailed in its paper (LC Paper No. CB(2)376/15-16(07)). Members noted the information note (LC Paper No. CB(2)376/15-16(08)) prepared by the LegCo Secretariat on the subject.

(To allow sufficient time for discussion, the Chairman directed that the meeting be extended for about 10 to 15 minutes.)

32. Ms Claudia MO said that some residents living in Hung Hom in areas close to the construction sites of the Shatin to Central Link had complained about rodent problem. She considered that the Administration should keep up its efforts in clearing hygiene blackspots in the territory, particularly those areas affected by major public work projects.

33. In response, USFH advised that on top of routine cleansing services carried out by FEHD and the relevant departments, the Administration had proposed establishing a platform for regular exchange of views between the Secretary for Food and Health ("SFH") and the Chairmen and Vice-chairmen of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Committees ("FEHCs") under DCs every six months, through which the latest overall environmental hygiene situations, including key areas requiring attention and possible ways to tackle specific hygiene problems, could be discussed. Assistant Director (Operations) 3, FEHD ("AD(Ops)3/FEHD") supplemented that FEHD's frontline staff continued to monitor the cleanliness of streets and public areas, the hygiene blackspots in particular, by conducting regular site audits/inspections. Moreover, FEHD's staff also conducted regular inspections to construction sites to ensure anti-mosquito and rodent control work was properly carried out. The District Environmental Hygiene Superintendents of FEHD also maintained close liaison with DCs and district personalities in tackling hygiene problems identified in the districts. Ms MO's concerns over the environmental hygiene conditions of the construction sites referred to would be relayed to the responsible District Environmental Hygiene Office for follow-up.

34. The Deputy Chairman and Mr CHAN Han-pan said that Members belonging to the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong supported the Campaign and had reported 131 hygiene blackspots to the relevant departments for their follow-up actions. In their views, FEHD's practice of awarding outsourced contracts under the existing service contract tendering mechanism to the lowest bidder was the root cause for inferior cleansing services. They urged the Administration to conduct a full review of its cleansing contract tendering system, with a view to improving FEHD's street cleansing services. USFH responded that the

Action

Administration was exploring ways of improving the relevant tendering arrangements as well as contract supervision and management. FEHD was reviewing the cleansing contract tendering system, guided by the need to uphold the requirements on service quality and observe the principle of value for money. FEHD would also strengthen its supervision of outsourced street cleansing services through the provision of additional supervisory staff and sustained efforts to keep the service performance of contractors under close monitoring, in a bid to ensure that the contractors delivered in accordance with the contract requirements.

35. The Deputy Chairman and Mr CHAN Han-pan both considered that FEHD should consolidate the experience gained from the Campaign and step up its cleansing efforts in various districts. Mr CHAN hoped that the Administration would consider delegating more power and responsibilities to DCs in the management and supervision of outsourced street cleansing services, and explore the feasibility of introducing in Hong Kong automated/more advanced systems for refuse collection. The Deputy Chairman opined that the Government should also review the existing refuse collection procedures to see if further improvements could be made. Sharing similar views, Mr KWOK Wai-keung considered that more resources should be made available for different districts to sustain the enhanced cleansing services after the Campaign.

36. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD responded that -

- (a) the Administration noted the views of Members and would take them into consideration;
- (b) during the Campaign, relevant bureaux and departments had made use of their existing resources and mobilized support from different sectors to enhance cleansing work under their purview. To sustain the momentum of the Campaign, FEHD would endeavor to secure more resources for enhancing the cleansing services in the 18 districts;
- (c) FEHD would also review and adjust its strategies on enhancing district environmental hygiene, taking into account community sentiments as reflected at the meetings proposed to be held regularly between SFH and DCs' FEHCs;
- (d) the District Environmental Hygiene Superintendents of FEHD could flexibly deploy their resources, e.g. street washing teams and roving cleansing teams, to tackle particular hygiene problems; and

Action

- (e) in the long run, FEHD would review the cleansing contract tendering system, including the need to include additional service requirements when drawing up new cleansing service contracts in the future.

37. Noting that FEHD had plans to reinforce street washing services provided to the 18 districts by enhancing the service requirements for street washing when the street cleansing contracts in the respective districts were next due for renewal, Mr KWOK Wai-keung asked whether the contractors would be required to provide additional services at a fixed contract price. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD advised that the enhanced services requirements would be stipulated clearly in the tender documents. The Government would expect that the tender prices to be offered by tenderers would reflect all relevant cost for providing the enhanced services. FEHD would ensure that the contract requirements would be met through strengthened supervision after the award of contract.

38. Mr SIN Chung-kai enquired whether it was the plan of the Government to launch a territory-wide cleaning campaign on a regular basis, or to conduct such campaign only when there was deterioration in the community's environmental hygiene conditions. Dr Helena WONG raised a similar enquiry and asked whether the Campaign would be organized in 2016 again. Dr Kenneth CHAN said that to his understanding, the Campaign was criticized by some members of the public and the media as a waste of resources and lacking effectiveness in tackling long-standing hygiene problems. In his view, it would be more practical for the relevant departments to strengthen their routine cleansing work to improve environmental hygiene rather than spending substantial resources to organize the Campaign.

39. In response, USFH advised that other than the "Team Clean" campaign introduced in the wake of the Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome crisis, the Administration had launched large-scale cleaning campaigns respectively in 2009 and 2013. While FEHD would provide routine cleansing services to maintain environmental hygiene, launching territory-wide cleaning campaigns would help enhance public awareness and promote concerted efforts to improve environmental hygiene. USFH stressed that although the Government did not have a timetable for launching territory-wide cleaning campaigns, SFH would, as mentioned earlier, regularly exchange views with DCs' FEHCs in order to formulate targeted measures to tackle hygiene problems identified in the districts.

40. Noting that a number of events and activities that helped fortify cross-sectoral collaboration and community-wide participation had been

Action

conducted during the Campaign between August and September 2015, Dr Helena WONG enquired about the details of these initiatives and requested the Administration to provide a detailed breakdown of the expenditure on various initiatives, including that on publicity and public education activities to enhance public awareness of their responsibility to upkeep personal, home and community hygiene. In response, AD(Ops)3/FEHD gave an account of the initiatives undertaken by FEHD during the Campaign for improving the environmental hygiene. USFH and AD(Ops)3/FEHD further advised that relevant bureaux and departments had made use of their existing resources through internal deployment of staff and mobilized support from different sectors to enhance cleansing work under their purview. At Dr WONG's request, the Administration would provide the requested information in writing.

Admin

41. Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed doubt as to whether the collaboration among various bureaux and departments in improving environmental hygiene could be sustained after the Campaign. USFH advised that during the Campaign, the participating bureaux and departments had joined hands to step up their cleansing efforts in areas under their purview and promote the importance of keeping Hong Kong clean. While FEHD would continue to play its coordinating role in sustaining the community's cleansing efforts after the Campaign, it would follow up with the bureaux/departments concerned to address the environmental hygiene issues reflected through the DCs' FEHC network.

VII. Any other business

42. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:45 pm.