

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1969/15-16
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/14

Panel on Welfare Services

**Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the
Future Development of Elderly Services Schemes**

**Minutes of the fifth meeting
held on Tuesday, 17 May 2016, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che (Chairman)
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Members absent : Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Public Officers attending : Item I

Mr Steve TSE
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare
(Special Duties)
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Ms PANG Kit-ling
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
Social Welfare Department

Ms Diana CHU
Chief Social Work Officer (Elderly)3
Social Welfare Department

**Attendance by : Item I
invitation**

Labour Party

Mr David CHIU
Deputy Chairman

The Forthright Caucus

Mr LO Ho-yuen
Representative

Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam

Ms FUNG Miu-ha

Concerning Home Care Service Alliance

Ms Ishigami LEE Fung-king Alice

青年民協

Mr Calvin HO Kai-ming
召集人

人手比例不符最低工資關注組

Mr WONG Kwai-sang

將軍澳長者民生關注會

Ms MAK Yuen-lin

Elderly Health Concern Group

Ms LAW Ching-fung
Representative

Long Term Care Concern Group

Ms Xu Taozhi
Representative

Elderly Rights League

Mr KWOK Chi-yin
Representative

Elderly Medical Service Concern Group

Mr LIN Wai-kiu
Community Organizer

Alliance for Universal Pension

Mr CHAN Hok-fung
Organizer

The Grassrooteer

Ms LEE Choi-kwan
Chairlady

葵芳邨長者權益關注組

Mr CHUNG Hau-ping
Member

Chinese Grey Power

Mr CHEUNG Kai-ping
Member

Grassroots Development Centre

Mr NG Kin-wing
Member

Miss WONG Tsz-yan

Ms Christine FONG Kwok-shan, Member of Sai Kung
District Council

Mr CHONG Ka-wai

HKSWGU-Elderly Community Care Services Concern
Group

Mr YIP Kin-chung
Member

Dr LEE Chun-wing

前線員工權益關注組

Miss Rida CHEUNG
Member

Clerk in attendance : Mr Colin CHUI
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

Staff in attendance : Ms Rita LAI
Senior Council Secretary (2) 1

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Ms Ada TANG
Clerical Assistant (2) 4

Action

I. Sustainable financing for elderly services
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1484/15-16(01) to (02),
CB(2)1530/15-16(01) to (04) and CB(2)1568/15-16(01)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received oral representations from 23 deputations/individuals attending the meeting.

3. Dr Fernando CHEUNG suggested and members agreed that the Administration be requested to provide information on the government subsidy as at 31 March 2016 for the 25 000 non-subsidized care-and-attention places occupied by elderly persons receiving

Action

Comprehensive Social Security Assistance which was funded by the Government and administered by the Social Welfare Department.

II. Date of next meeting and item(s) for discussion

[LC Paper No. CB(2)669/15-16(01)]

4. Members noted that the next meeting of the Subcommittee would be held on 11 June 2016 to receive views from the public on sustainable development and planning for elderly services.

III. Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:31 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 August 2016

**Proceedings of the fifth meeting of the
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the
Future Development of Elderly Services Schemes
on Tuesday, 17 May 2016, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - Sustainable financing for elderly services</i>			
000423 - 000708	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000709 - 001137	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the current financing arrangements for long-term care ("LTC") services for the elderly. [LC Paper No. CB(2)1484/15-16(01)]	
001138 - 001499	Chairman Labour Party	Presentation of views	
001500 - 001809	Chairman The Fortright Caucus	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(01)]	
001810 - 002115	Chairman Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam	Presentation of views	
002116 - 002433	Chairman Ms FUNG Miu-ha	Presentation of views	
002434 - 002710	Chairman Concerning Home Care Service Alliance	Presentation of views	
002711 - 003023	Chairman 青年民協	Presentation of views	
003024 - 003335	Chairman 人手比例不符最低 工資關注組	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(02)]	
003336 - 003634	Chairman 將軍澳長者民生關 注會	Presentation of views	
003635 - 003724	Chairman Elderly Health Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(03)]	
003725 - 003943	Chairman Long Term Care Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(03)]	

003944 - 004340	Chairman Elderly Rights League	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(03)]	
004341 - 004648	Chairman Elderly Medical Service Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(03)]	
004649 - 004957	Chairman Alliance for Universal Pension	Presentation of views	
004958 - 005156	Chairman The Grassrooteer	Presentation of views	
005157 - 005512	Chairman 葵芳邨長者權益關 注組	Presentation of views	
005513 - 005825	Chairman Chinese Grey Power	Presentation of views	
005826 - 010130	Chairman Grassroots Development Centre	Presentation of views	
010131 - 010440	Chairman Miss WONG Tsz-yan	Presentation of views	
010441 - 010750	Chairman Ms Christine FONG Kwok-shan, Member of Sai Kung District Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1530/15-16(04)]	
010751 - 011111	Chairman Mr CHONG Ka-wai	Presentation of views	
011112 - 011433	Chairman HKSWGU-Elderly Community Care Services Concern Group	Presentation of views	
011434 - 011744	Chairman Dr LEE Chun-wing	Presentation of views	
011745 - 012046	Chairman 前線員工權益關注 組	Presentation of views	
012047 - 012622	Chairman Admin	The Administration's response to the views of deputations as follows: (a) the Administration attached great importance to provision of elderly care service. Public expenditure on elderly services had increased by 55% from 2012. In 2016-2017,	

		<p>government recurrent spending on social welfare accounted for 19% of the total recurrent government expenditure of the year, second only to education;</p> <p><u>Community support and care services</u></p> <p>(b) the Administration had continued to strengthen the provision of existing community support and care services and residential care services ("RCS") for the elderly and introduce new schemes as appropriate. Examples included the extension of the Government Public Transport Fare Concession Scheme for the Elderly and Eligible Persons with Disabilities to green minibus by phases since 29 March 2015 and increase in the number of places for carers under a two-year Pilot Scheme on Living Allowance for Carers of Elderly Persons from Low Income Families ("the Pilot Scheme"), which was rolled out in June 2014, from 2 000 to 4 000. In addition, the implementation of the Pilot Scheme on Community Care Service Voucher for the Elderly ("CCSV Pilot Scheme") aimed to test the feasibility of the "money-following-the-user" funding approach, under which the Government provided subsidies to eligible elderly persons in the form of service vouchers, allowing them to choose the service provider, the type of service and the service package that suited their individual needs. The Second Phase of the CCSV Pilot scheme would be launched in 2016 with extension of service scope from eight districts to all 18 districts in the territory; and</p> <p><u>Residential care services</u></p> <p>(c) the Administration's ongoing commitment to providing subsidized RCS for elderly persons would continue. The Administration would continue to bid for resources for construction of new residential homes for the elderly ("RCHes") /RCHes with day care units ("DCUs") to meet the demand, including those for persons with disabilities. In addition, the Labour and Welfare Bureau and non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") were actively pursuing projects under the Special Scheme on Privately Owned Sites for Welfare Uses whereby participating NGOs would, through expansion, redevelopment or new development on their sites, provide more elderly and rehabilitation service facilities and other service facilities supported by the Social</p>	
--	--	---	--

		<p>Welfare Department ("SWD"). Based on the rough estimation, about 9 000 additional elderly service places, including 7 000 RCS places and 2 000 day care places for the elderly, would be provided if the some 60 proposals received were completed smoothly.</p> <p><u>Sustainable financing for elderly services</u></p> <p>(a) the Administration noted that both deputations and the Government shared a common goal of achieving sustainable financing for elderly services though there might be different views on the suitable approach to be adopted. The Administration encouraged "sharing of responsibility" in the provision of elderly services under which users with less financial means were provided with more financial support. For instance, a sliding scale of co-payment with five levels was in place under the CCSV Pilot Scheme, thereby achieving the principles of "sharing of responsibility" and "affordable users pay";</p> <p>(b) the Administration noted the suggestion of introducing taxation reform, which was not a simple task. Views on sustainable financing for elderly services was collected during the public engagement of the Elderly Services Programme Plan ("ESPP") and such views would be taken into account; and</p> <p>(c) the Administration also noted deputations' concerns about the subject of retirement protection. The views received during the relevant consultation exercise would be duly considered.</p>	
012623 - 013148	Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Admin	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's view that there was a pressing need for the Administration to address the LTC needs of the elderly persons. Dr CHEUNG's grave concern about the waitlisting situation of various kinds of CCS, including those under the Integrated Home Care Services ("IHCS"), Enhanced Home and Community Care Services, Integrated Discharge Support Programme for Elderly Patients ("IDSP") and day care services of DCUs. Dr CHEUNG echoed deputations' view that RCS should be the last resort, having regard to the elderly persons' wish of ageing in place.</p> <p>Dr CHEUNG's enquiry about the Administration's plan to increase the provision of CCS, such as meal delivery and on-site care services, so that elderly hospital discharges would be able to age in place without being re-admitted to hospitals after hospital discharge.</p>	

		<p>The Administration's response that under IDSP, each participating hospital would set up a Discharge Planning Team which would collaborate with a Home Support Team to be operated by an NGO commissioned by the Hospital Authority to jointly provide transitional rehabilitation services and/or community care and support services during the eight-week service duration to elderly persons upon hospital discharge as necessary. If the elderly dischargees required care and support services on a long-term basis after being discharged from IDSP, SWD would assess their LTC needs and arrange mainstream community care and support services for the elderly persons as appropriate.</p> <p>The Administration's negative reply to Dr CHEUNG's further enquiry about whether the expenditure on RCS in 2016-2017 (i.e. \$4,702.9 million) had included the government subsidy for the 25 000 non-subsidized care-and-attention places occupied by elderly persons receiving the Government-funded and SWD-administered Comprehensive Social Security Assistance. The Administration's consent to provide relevant information after the meeting.</p>	ADMIN
013149 - 013809	Chairman Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung Admin	<p>Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung's grave concern about the incompatibility of views between the community and the Administration towards financing for provision of elderly services. In his view, the community considered that provision of elderly services should be on a non-means-tested basis and the Administration should allocate more public resources in this regard. Nevertheless, the Administration adopted the principle of "co-payment".</p> <p>Mr LEUNG urged that the Administration should conduct a comprehensive review of provision of various kinds of elderly services which were currently insufficient to meet the service needs. In conducting the review, the Administration should also set service targets and make projection on expenditure in respect of provision of elderly services.</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows:</p> <p>(a) the Elderly Commission ("EC") had been tasked with formulating ESPP. In completing the task, EC and the relevant working group would take into account the current and planned provision of elderly services, and make reference to the relevant studies, reports, initiatives and demographic/service statistics relating to</p>	

		<p>elderly persons;</p> <p>(b) the formulation of ESPP was structured into three stages. During the second (Formulation) stage, views from service users, service providers and other relevant stakeholders on issues that required further deliberation in drawing up ESPP had been gathered. Focus groups and public consultation forums had been organized to identify key issues that needed to be addressed in ESPP. The Consultant Team ("CT") had completed analysing the views gathered in the public engagement exercise, as well as gathering information and statistics that should be taken into account in drawing up the preliminary recommendations of ESPP; and</p> <p>(c) the views expressed by deputations at the meeting and members of the Subcommittee on provision of elderly services were noted and would be further studied.</p>	
<p>013810 - 014335</p>	<p>Chairman Deputy Chairman Admin</p>	<p>The Deputy Chairman's disappointment at the Administration's lack of service planning and commitment of provision of elderly care services, having regard to its stress of a projected deficit of annual expenditure for elderly services within 15 years.</p> <p>The Deputy Chairman's suggestion of the following which had all along been put forth by the welfare sector:</p> <p>(a) increase in the provision of CCS (such as meal delivery services and household cleaning under IHCS (Ordinary Cases)) for those elderly persons who had been assessed to be of mild level by the Standardized Care Need Assessment Mechanism for Elderly Services, so as to prevent their health condition from deteriorating to moderate level of impairment which would require much more resources for service provision with a higher level of care (such as service provided by RCHes); and</p> <p>(b) further development of the CCSV Pilot Scheme with increase in the monthly allowance (currently at \$2,000 under the Community Care Fund ("CCF") Pilot Scheme on Living Allowance for Carers of Elderly Persons from Low Income Families) so that elderly persons in need of LTC services could, with the help of recognized home carers, receive proper home-based care services and continue to age in their own place without</p>	

		<p>being admitted to RCHEs prematurely or making use of the day care services.</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows:</p> <p>(a) it was projected that as the trend of ageing population continued and assuming no inflation and no service enhancement, a structural deficit could strike in within 15 years;</p> <p>(b) the Deputy Chairman's suggestion in paragraph (a) above was noted. However, so far the Administration was not aware of studies that could quantify the effectiveness of strengthening provision of CCS to elderly persons with mild impairment in preventing their health conditions from deteriorating to a higher level of impairment; and</p> <p>(c) the Second Phase of the CCF Pilot Scheme on Living Allowance for Carers of Elderly Persons from Low Income Families would benefit an additional 2 000 eligible carers, making a total of 4 000 beneficiaries for the two phases of the Pilot Scheme. A review would be conducted on the Pilot Scheme in due course.</p>	
<p>014336 - 014806</p>	<p>Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung Admin</p>	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's grave concern that in the past five years, an average of about 5 000 elderly persons on the Central Waiting List for subsidized LTC services ("CWL") (i.e. RCS and/or CCS) passed away each year before service places were allocated to them.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG's enquiry about whether the Administration had drawn up a service provision plan for elderly care services, including earmarking of suitable sites for setting up elderly facilities by the Development Bureau, formulation of complementary housing policy for elderly residents in public rental housing estates and making projection on the relevant expenditure.</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows:</p> <p>(a) the Administration pointed out that "ageing in place" was the Government's fundamental elderly care policy and elderly persons might require different types of care services, including home-based and centre-based services as well as RCS, according to their individual situation. In the formulation of ESPP, consideration would be given to optimizing public resources for</p>	

		<p>provision of elderly care services as appropriate; and</p> <p>(b) given that the formulation of ESPP was still in progress, no specific recommendations for elderly care services could be revealed at present. In the formulation of ESPP, issues relating to identification of suitable sites and premises for elderly facilities had been taken into consideration and reference had been made to relevant statistics and studies.</p>	
014807 - 015221	Chairman	<p>The Chairman's views as follows:</p> <p>(a) enhancement of CCS, including home-based and day care services, could help reduce the number of elderly persons queuing up for RCS on CWL as well as the time span in RCHEs. Having regard to the fact that the cost of RCS far exceeded that of CCS, enhancement of CCS would help mitigate the financial pressure on needs of RCS. The Administration should consider allocating part of the \$800 million, say half of the lump sum, earmarked to meet the expenses under the proposed Pilot Scheme on Residential Care Services Voucher for the Elderly to enhance provision of CCS. In addition, CT of ESPP should conduct assessment on the needs of CCS and work out the relevant expenditure projection; and</p> <p>(b) provision of LTC services should not be based on age. Related issues should be addressed in ESPP.</p>	
015222 - 015237	Chairman	The Chairman's invitation of further views from deputations.	
015238 - 015339	Chairman 前線員工權益關注組	Presentation of further views	
015340 - 015445	Chairman Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam	Presentation of further views	
015446 - 015549	Chairman Ms FUNG Miu-ha	Presentation of further views	
015550 - 015654	Chairman 人手比例不符最低工資關注組	Presentation of further views	

015655 - 015801	Chairman Elderly Medical Service Concern Group	Presentation of further views	
015802 - 015912	Chairman Alliance for Universal Pension Admin	Presentation of further views	
015913 - 020018	Chairman Grassroots Development Centre	Presentation of further views	
020019 - 020124	Chairman Miss WONG Tsz-yan	Presentation of further views	
020125 - 020142	Chairman	The Chairman's request for the Administration to take note of the further views expressed by the deputations.	
<i>Agenda item II – Date of next meeting and item(s) for discussion</i>			
020143 - 020203	Chairman	Item for discussion at the next meeting.	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 August 2016