

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1970/15-16
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/3/14

Panel on Welfare Services

**Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the
Future Development of Elderly Services Schemes**

**Minutes of the sixth meeting
held on Saturday, 11 June 2016, at 9:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che (Chairman)
Hon TANG Ka-piu, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Member absent : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan

Public Officers attending : Item I

Mr Steve TSE
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare
(Special Duties)
Labour and Welfare Bureau

Ms PANG Kit-ling
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
Social Welfare Department

Ms Lilian CHEUNG
Chief Social Work Officer (Elderly)1
Social Welfare Department

Mr Sebastian TSE Shu-to
Chief Social Work Officer (Elderly)2
Social Welfare Department

Mr Virgil HSU Kam-lung
Chief Manager/Management (Support Services) 2

**Attendance by : Item I
invitation**

Ms Christine FONG Kwok-shan, Member of Sai Kung
District Council

Our Bus Terminal

Mr CHAN Ka-long
Chairman

Mr CHAN Hing-lun

Miss WONG Tsz-yan

Hong Kong Alzheimer's Disease Association Carer
Support Sub-committee

Ms Ishigami LEE Fung-king Alice
Chairman

Christian Family Service Centre

Ms TSANG Ching-tak
Senior Service Manager

Mr FU Woon-pun

Young Civics

Mr Joshua LI Chun-hei
Vice Chairman

長期護理關注平台

Mr KWONG Wing-tai

Elderly Rights League

Ms CHAN Mu-zhen
Representative

Elderly Health Concern Group

Ms CHOI Yuen-tze
Representative

Long-term-care Concern Group

Ms YUEN Suk-yan
Representative

Community Health for Elders League

Ms LEUNG Lai-ping
Representative

Society for Community Organization

Mr NG Wai-tung
Community Organizer

關注家居照顧服務大聯盟

Ms MAK Yuen-lin

Rainbow of Hong Kong

TOMMYjai
Executive Officer

Rainbow Action

岑子杰
Spokesperson

Women Coalition of HKSAR

楊煒煒
發言人

Gay & Grey

Shmily
Volunteer

鄭詠龍

Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam

Civic Party

Mr Ken TSANG

Clerk in attendance : Mr Colin CHUI
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

Staff in attendance : Ms Rita LAI
Senior Council Secretary (2) 1

Miss Maggie CHIU
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Ms Ada TANG
Clerical Assistant (2) 4

Action

I. Sustainable development and planning for elderly services
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1642/15-16(01) to (02) and
CB(2)1727/15-16(01) to (06)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Subcommittee received oral representations from 22 deputations/individuals attending the meeting.

Action

3. The Subcommittee shared deputations' views on and concerns about deficiencies of provision of various kinds of elderly care services and requested that relevant government policy bureaux/departments to work collaboratively to address the different service needs of elderly persons, including the following:

- (a) the Labour and Welfare Bureau ("LWB") to liaise with the Transport Department with regard to the suggestion of implementing a subsidy scheme for low-floor green minibuses running to and from public hospitals; and
- (b) LWB to relay to the Food and Health Bureau/Department of Health concerns about elderly persons' need for dental services having regard to the fast ageing population, the suggestion of relaxing the age limit of service targets of the Elderly Health Care Voucher Scheme and the insufficient number of Elderly Health Centres.

4. The Chairman advised that a report on the deliberation of the Subcommittee in the past meetings would be prepared by the Secretariat for submission to the Panel of Welfare Services. The confirmed report would be uploaded onto the website of the Legislative Council for consideration by the Administration and reference by members of the public.

II. Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 11:38 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
9 August 2016

**Proceedings of the sixth meeting of the
Subcommittee on Issues Relating to the
Future Development of Elderly Services Schemes
on Saturday, 11 June 2016, at 9:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - Sustainable development and planning for elderly services</i>			
000111 - 000406	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000407 - 001544	Chairman Admin	Briefing by the Administration on the issues of land and space, planning and review, human resources, case management, public-private collaboration, medical-social collaboration, elderly housing and retirement protection in connection with future development of elderly services schemes. [LC Paper No. CB(2)1642/15-16(01)]	
001545 - 001940	Chairman Ms Christine FONG Kwok-shan, Member of Sai Kung District Council	Presentation of views	
001941 - 002241	Chairman Our Bus Terminal	Presentation of views	
002242 - 002548	Chairman Mr CHAN Hing-lun	Presentation of views	
002549 - 002855	Chairman Miss WONG Tsz-yan	Presentation of views	
002856 - 003203	Chairman Hong Kong Alzheimer's Disease Association Carer Support Sub-committee	Presentation of views	
003204 - 003514	Chairman Christian Family Service Centre	Presentation of views	
003515 - 003829	Chairman Mr FU Woon-pun	Presentation of views	
003830 - 004141	Chairman Young Civics	Presentation of views	

004142 - 004432	Chairman 長期護理關注平台	Presentation of views	
004433 - 004732	Chairman Elderly Rights League	Presentation of views	
004733 - 005024	Chairman Elderly Health Concern Group	Presentation of views	
005025 - 005336	Chairman Long-term-care Concern Group	Presentation of views	
005337 - 005507	Chairman Community Health for Elders League	Presentation of views	
005508 - 005826	Chairman Society for Community Organization	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/15-16(01)]	
005827 - 010132	Chairman 關注家居照顧服務 大聯盟	Presentation of views	
010133 - 010441	Chairman Rainbow of Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/15-16(02)]	
010442 - 010755	Chairman Rainbow Action	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/15-16(03)]	
010756 - 011103	Chairman Women Coalition of HKSAR	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/15-16(04)]	
011104 - 011220	Chairman Gay & Grey	Presentation of views	
011221 - 011333	Chairman 鄭詠龍	Presentation of views	
011334 - 011649	Chairman Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam	Presentation of views	
011650 - 012017	Chairman Civic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)1727/15-16(05)]	
012018 - 012131	Chairman	The Chairman's summary of issues raised by deputations, including subsidy scheme for low-floor green minibus running to and from various public hospitals, dental services for elderly persons, relaxing the age limit of service targets of the Elderly Health Care Voucher Scheme, insufficient number of Elderly Health	

		<p>Centres, case management, severe insufficient provision of home-based services, lack of kitchen facilities in the new Day Care Centres/Units for the Elderly ("DEs/DCUs"), population of and insufficient provision of service for elderly persons from sexual minorities as well as universal retirement protection.</p> <p>The Chairman's advice that concerns relating to the first three issues should be relayed to the Food and Health Bureau ("FHB") and the Department of Health for follow-up.</p>	<p>ADMIN</p>
<p>012132 - 012604</p>	<p>Chairman Admin</p>	<p>The Administration's response to the views and concerns of deputations as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) deputations' views on and suggestions of medical services for elderly persons would be relayed to FHB/Department of Health for consideration; (b) suggestion of government subsidy scheme for low-floor green minibus would be relayed to the relevant government bureau/department for consideration; (c) the Administration's provision of long-term care ("LTC") services to those who were in need was in line with the principle of "ageing in place" and had been increasing resource allocation for centre-based and home-based community care services ("CCS") for the elderly. Since June 2015, the Administration had provided some additional 1 600 places. In addition, the number of vouchers issued under the Pilot Scheme on Community Care Service Voucher for the Elderly ("CCSV Pilot Scheme") would be substantially increased from 1 200 to 3 000 in the second phase. A sliding scale of co-payment with five levels was determined based on household income. There was no upper limit on the household income; (d) the Administration had all along been adopting a multi-pronged approach to increase the provision of elderly service facilities, including the construction of residential care homes for the elderly ("RCHEs"), DEs/DCUs, etc. The Social Welfare Department ("SWD") had been working with relevant government departments in identifying suitable sites and locations in various development projects that could be used to provide subsidized elderly services. Factors taken into account by SWD included the needs of the local 	

		<p>community, overall demand for elderly services, floor area requirements of different elderly facilities, location and accessibility of the site as well as advice from relevant government departments on site constraints, development parameters and limitations;</p> <p>(e) the Administration was committed to enhancing the service quality of RCHEs. With a substantial increase in manpower in the merged licensing offices of RCHEs and that of Residential Care Homes for Persons with Disabilities ("RCHDs") in 2016-2017, SWD would comprehensively strengthen the inspection and monitoring of RCHEs and RCHDs. In addition, training for private RCHE managers and staff would be strengthened and relevant measures would be introduced at a later stage; and</p> <p>(f) with the Administration's effort in increasing the supply of nursing home places, the average waiting time for nursing home places had been reduced to 27 months.</p>	
<p>012605 - 013128</p>	<p>Chairman Dr Fernando CHEUNG Admin</p>	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's query about the effectiveness of the proposed strengthening of inspections and monitoring of RCHEs. Dr CHEUNG's view that the Administration should squarely address the service quality of RCHEs by way of making amendments to the Residential Care Homes (Elderly Persons) Ordinance ("the Ordinance") so as to raise the service standard, including manpower provision and spatial requirements. His enquiry about the Administration's plan in this regard.</p> <p>Dr CHEUNG's further view that the proposed increase in the number of CCS places was not proportional to the elderly population in need of LTC services and therefore could hardly meet the service needs. The Administration should be committed to substantially increasing the provision of CCS.</p> <p>The Administration's response as follows:</p> <p>(a) as mentioned earlier, the Administration was committed to enhancing the service quality of RCHEs. As a short-term measure, SWD would strengthen the inspection and monitoring of RCHEs/RCHDs with reorganization of the licensing offices and increase in manpower. In addition, training would be provided for managers and frontline staff of RCHEs;</p>	

		<p>(b) public engagement exercise for collecting views on formulating recommendations for the Elderly Services Programme Plan ("ESPP") had been conducted. The suggestion of making amendments to the Ordinance was noted;</p> <p>(c) the Administration acknowledged that there was room for improvement in the provision of CCS. In addition to the provision of an additional of some 1 600 places since June 2015, it was estimated that there would be 2 000 day care places for the elderly upon completion of some 60 projects under the Special Scheme on Privately Owned Sites for Welfare Uses ("the Special Scheme");</p> <p>(d) the number of vouchers issued under the CCSV Pilot Scheme would be substantially increased from 1 200 in the first phase to a total of 3 000 in the second phase which was expected to launch in the fourth quarter of 2016; and</p> <p>(e) the number of quotas for carers under the Second Phase of the Pilot Scheme on Living Allowance for Carers of Elderly Persons from Low Income Families, which was funded by the Community Care Fund, would be increased from 2 000 to 4 000.</p>	
<p>013129 - 013536</p>	<p>Chairman Mr Alan LEONG</p>	<p>Mr Alan LEONG's grave disappointment about the Administration's lack of specific policy on improving the service quality of RCHEs over the years, having regard to the Administration's huge fiscal reserve and the fact that Hong Kong was an affluent society. His further disappointment about the waitlisting situation of the residential care services ("RCS") given that an average of about 5 000 elderly persons on the Central Waiting List for subsidized LTC services passed away each year before service places were allocated to them.</p> <p>Mr LEONG's remarks that the Civic Party shared the community concern about a pressing need of fundamental changes to the elderly policy, including enhancement of the service quality of RCHEs by means of making amendments to the Ordinance which aimed to, e.g. increase manpower provision, and formulation of support measures, facilitate elderly persons' ageing in the community.</p> <p>Mr LEONG's further remarks that there was considerable objection to the implementation of the Pilot Scheme on Residential Care Service Voucher for the Elderly</p>	

		<p>("the RCSV Pilot Scheme"), having regard to the sub-standard situation of private RCHes.</p>	
<p>013537 - 014213</p>	<p>Chairman</p>	<p>The Chairman shared deputations' concern that more than 5 000 elderly persons were waiting for service under the Integrated Home Care Services ("IHCS") and that the actual number of elderly persons in need of LTC services far exceeded the figure.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that the estimation of increase in the provision of CCS could hardly address the service needs, having regard to the fact that the 2 000 day care places for the elderly under the Special Scheme would only be available in 10 years' time and the holders of 3 000 vouchers under the Second Phase of CCSV Pilot Scheme were in fact on CWL for RCS.</p> <p>The Chairman's enquiries as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) whether the Administration would revisit its policy on provision of kitchen facilities in new day care centres, having regard to the importance of meal services; and (b) population of elderly persons from sexual minorities and whether the Administration would consider providing dedicated services for them. <p>The Administration's response as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the current-term government had since 2010 introduced various pilot schemes for provision of elderly care services. Given the nature of the pilot schemes, the number of places was increased progressively with a view to developing further as appropriate. For instance, the number of vouchers issued under the CCSV Pilot Scheme would be substantially increased from 1 200 in the first phase to a total of 3 000 in the second phase; (b) with a view to providing more service options of elderly care services, organizations meeting the specified service requirements could participate in the relevant pilot schemes. As regards CCSV Pilot Scheme, the main service providers were from the welfare sector. In implementing the pilot schemes, the Administration would listen to the views of service users and the public and make improvement as appropriate. For example, instead of a single voucher value, different voucher values were set under the Second 	

		<p>Phase of the CCSV Pilot Scheme, having regard to the pattern of service utilization by service users with co-payment values based on means test so as to cater for the various needs of the service users;</p> <p>(c) as regards service need of the elderly persons from sexual minorities, the study of the Advisory Group on Eliminating Discrimination against Sexual Minorities, which was set up under the Constitutional and Mainland Affairs Bureau, considered that it was important to take anti-discrimination measures and avoid discriminatory practices in the society. SWD would disseminate the relevant message to the welfare organizations and provide training for the staff as appropriate so as to enhance their sensitivity towards service users who were elderly from sexual minorities;</p> <p>(d) issues relating to provision of kitchen facilities in new DEs/DCUs would be further studied; and</p> <p>(e) the waitlisting situation for IHCS was noted. The Administration would study and explore measures as appropriate to address the need for home care service.</p> <p>The Chairman's view that the Administration should allocate more public resources to address the service needs for IHCS.</p>	
014214 - 014342	Chairman Our Bus Terminal	Presentation of further views	
014343 - 014435	Chairman Mr CHAN Hing-lun	Presentation of further views	
014436 - 014550	Chairman Miss WONG Tsz-yan	Presentation of further views	
014551 - 014657	Chairman Christian Family Service Centre	Presentation of further views	
014658 - 014740	Chairman 長期護理關注平台	Presentation of further views	
014741 - 015020	Chairman Admin	<p>The Administration's response to the further views of deputations as follows:</p> <p>(a) concerns about privatization of subsidized services were noted. The Administration pointed out that RCHEs meeting the</p>	

		<p>specified service requirements could participate in the RCSV Pilot Scheme. It was expected that elderly persons would have more choices of RCHEs that could better meet their needs. In addition, it was recommended by the relevant Consultant Team that case management would be provided by SWD under the RCSV Pilot Scheme so that elderly persons would receive assistance and advice in choosing and applying for suitable LTC services;</p> <p>(b) suggestion of introducing a subsidy scheme for low-floor green minibus would be studied by relevant bureau/department;</p> <p>(c) the Administration would consider strengthening the publicity efforts for the various elderly care services. At present, there was an elderly portal, called "eElderly" (www.e123.hk), which featured topical interests of the elderly including information on elder care; and</p> <p>(d) the services under the Enhanced Home and Community Care Services ("EHCCS") had been regularized. The suggestion of changing the funding mode to annual subvention under lump sum grant subvention system was noted.</p>	
015021 - 015141	Chairman Society for Community Organization	Presentation of further views	
015142 - 015252	Chairman 關注家居照顧服務 大聯盟	Presentation of further views	
015253 - 015346	Chairman Rainbow of Hong Kong	Presentation of further views	
015347 - 015438	Chairman 鄭詠龍	Presentation of further views	
015439 - 015549	Chairman Miss CHEUNG Nga-lam	Presentation of further views	
015550 - 015745	Chairman Admin	<p>In response to the views of deputations, the Administration's advice as follows:</p> <p>(a) in view of the shortage of manpower for inspecting the management of RCHEs, it was necessary to increase the manpower provision. At present, there was only 38 officers in the Social Work Inspectorate</p>	

		<p>Team while the total number of RCHEs was more than 700;</p> <p>(b) the suggestion of providing wage supplement to frontline staff for undertaking noxious work in RCHEs involved use of public resources. It needed to be studied carefully;</p> <p>(c) SWD would meet relevant deputations to discuss provision of services for elderly persons from sexual minorities. On whether information on population of elderly persons from sexual minorities could be collected during population census, SWD would further liaise with the Census and Statistics Department; and</p> <p>(d) the Administration acknowledged the need for allocating more public resources for provision of CCS and the issue would be looked into.</p>	
015746 - 020130	Chairman	<p>The Chairman's summary of issues raised by deputations as follows:</p> <p>(a) insufficient provision of elderly care services. The Administration was requested to conduct assessment of the needs of CCS in the formulation of ESPP for the coming five to 10 years, so as to address the waitlisting situation of elderly services, including around 10 000 elderly persons waiting for day care services and services under IHCS and EHCCS;</p> <p>(b) the Labour and Welfare Bureau ("LWB") to liaise with the Transport Department with regard to the suggestion of implementing a subsidy scheme for low-floor green minibuses running to and from hospitals (or at least two minibuses for each route);</p> <p>(c) FHB to address</p> <p>(i) the elderly persons' need for dental services, having regard to the fast ageing population; and</p> <p>(ii) the suggestion of relaxing the age limit of service targets of the Elderly Health Care Voucher Scheme; and</p> <p>(d) SWD to consider extending the service duration for case management which currently lasted for six months only.</p>	

		Preparation of report on the deliberations of the Subcommittee for consideration by the Administration and reference by members of the public.	Secretariat
020131 - 020515	Chairman Miss CHAN Yuen-han	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's view that the Under Secretary for Food and Health should attend the meeting on planning for provision of medical services (e.g. dental services) for elderly persons.</p> <p>Miss CHAN's further concern about the inadequacy of public dental services for the elderly persons within their neighbourhood.</p> <p>Miss CHAN's view that suitable sites for setting up elderly facilities on ground floor should be earmarked in new public housing estate developments.</p>	
020516 - 020825	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung's grave concern about deficiencies of various kinds of elderly services, including dental services, CCS and RCS, as well as elderly poverty and retirement protection.</p> <p>Mr LEUNG's view that the Administration should adopt appropriate population policy and implement universal retirement protection to address the issues and that various policy bureaux, including LWB, Development Bureau, FHB should work collaboratively.</p>	
020826 - 020859	Chairman	Closing remarks.	