



26<sup>th</sup> February, 2018

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
The Chairman of Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities  
Room 714 Legislative Council Complex  
1 Legislative Council Road  
Central, Hong Kong

**立法會 CB(2)944/17-18(01)號文件**  
**LC Paper No. CB(2)944/17-18(01)**

Dear Hon. Tse,

**RE: Accountability of EDB’s enhanced funding for the implementation of  
the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework”**

I am writing to bring to your attention to the lack of accountability of the Education Bureau’s (EDB) enhanced recurrent funding for the implementation of the “Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework” (Learning Framework), in the hope that you would discuss this issue at the LegCo Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities meeting tomorrow (27<sup>th</sup> February).

Since 2014, the EDB spent about \$200 million every year to allocate an additional funding to primary and secondary schools admitting non-Chinese speaking students to support the implementation of the Learning Framework and the learning and teaching of Chinese language of non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students with the aim to bridge them to mainstream Chinese Language classes. Depending on the number of NCS students in the school, the amount of funding ranges from \$50,000 to \$1.5 million per year for each funded school.

Unison recently conducted the “**Research on the Accountability of the EDB Enhanced Funding for the Implementation of ‘Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework’ in schools**” and examined the websites and uploaded school documents of *97 Primary Schools* and *86 Secondary Schools* in Yau Tsim Mong, Yuen Long and Eastern districts. It was found that **the implementation of the funding and Learning Framework lack accountability and transparency, and it is difficult for stakeholders and the public to monitor the implementation and its effectiveness.** The full report can be accessed here: <https://goo.gl/xgJfnu>.



Information on the support measures for NCS students subsidised by the enhanced funding and their effectiveness are largely inaccessible by the public

The research revealed that **not all schools that received the enhanced funding disclosed this information publicly**. Among those schools that indicated the receipt of enhanced funding, **about 20% of them did not provide information related to the support measures** for the learning and teaching of NCS students on their school websites or uploaded documents; important information, such as adapted Chinese curriculum, Chinese class arrangement or Chinese learning performance of NCS students, is largely missing. Furthermore, **a large majority of the surveyed schools published their school websites, annual plans and annual reports in Chinese only**; just a few of them provided information that was fully bilingual. A small number of schools uploaded the plans or reports on the enhanced funding, but all of them provided only the Chinese version.

The EDB did not ensure the transparency and accountability of the implementation of the enhanced funding and Learning Framework

Starting from the 2014/15 school year, **the EDB has set up a dedicated team to examine the annual plans** submitted by the funded schools, conduct supervisory visits to the schools, **collect feedback from major stakeholders**<sup>1</sup> through questionnaires, interviews, etc. and **verify them against the schools' annual reports**.<sup>2</sup> The EDB has also commissioned the University of Hong Kong to analyse the overall Chinese learning performance of NCS students using the Assessment Tools. **Nonetheless, the public has almost no access to the above information and results, especially for non-Chinese speaking stakeholders and members of the public.**

Consequence of lack of transparency and accountability

Strong quality assurance, monitoring and evaluation, and accountability mechanisms are necessary to ensure the implementation of policy goals. The lack of transparency of the enhanced

---

<sup>1</sup> Including the principal and the coordinator of the enhanced support measures for NCS students, Chinese Language teachers teaching NCS students, parents of NCS students, NCS students and non-governmental organisations in collaboration with the schools concerned.

<sup>2</sup> LC Paper No. CB (2)254/16-17(01), 22 November 2016



funding implies that the public had limited ways and means to monitor the effectiveness of these funding and holding the government accountable.

Unison's suggestions

In order to enhance the transparency and accountability of the enhanced funding and Learning Framework, **the EDB should ensure that separate and publicly accessible funding plans and reports are uploaded to the school websites**, and the documents should include **information on the support measures as well as Chinese learning progress and performance of NCS students**. The EDB should also disclose the research framework for the evaluation of the Learning Framework, and provide **a clear timeline for the launch of the evaluation report**.

It will be much appreciated if you could circulate this letter and attachments to other members in the Panel of Education for their understanding on this issue. Attached are the executive summary and press release of the aforementioned research.

Yours sincerely,

Phyllis Cheung  
Executive Director

Attachments:

1. Executive Summary: Research on the Accountability of the EDB Enhanced Funding for the Implementation of 'Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework' in schools
2. Press release on 26<sup>th</sup> February, 2018



教育局支援學校推行「中國語文課程第二語言學習架構」額外撥款的問責性之研究  
香港融樂會（2018年2月）

**研究撮要**

自2014年起，教育局推行「改善非華語學生的中文學與教」及「支援非華語學生課後中文學習」計劃，為中小學提供額外經常性撥款。資助的目的是支援校本推行「中國語文課程第二語言學習架構」（學習架構），從而協助非華語學生的中文學與教，並過渡至主流中文學習。視乎非華語學生的人數，每所獲撥款的學校每年得到5萬至150萬元的資助。每個學年的總撥款額約港幣2億元。

是次研究旨在評估以上所提及的撥款和學習架構的問責性和透明度。是次研究檢視了在油尖旺、元朗和東區共97所小學和86所中學的學校網頁，以及上載至學校網頁的年度計劃和報告，並記錄和分析了當中與獲取和使用額外撥款有關的資料。為了進一步評估不諳中文的市民能否從以上資料獲得有關撥款的資訊，是次調查亦記錄和分析了學校網頁、年度計劃和年度報告內使用的語言。

**研究結果**

1. 只有28.9%（28所）小學和22.1%（19所）中學在其學校網頁和上載文件表示獲發額外撥款；然而，教育局的數據顯示在調查地區內，有38.1%（37所）小學和31.4%（27所）中學獲發「改善非華語學生的中文學與教」計劃的撥款。比較以上的數據，會發現並非所有獲額外撥款的學校均公開透露此資訊。這顯示額外撥款缺乏透明度。
2. 在透露獲發額外撥款的學校當中，約兩成未有在其學校網頁或上載文件，提供有關非華語學生的學與教支援措施的資訊。除此之外，大部份學校沒有提供中文調適課程、中文課編班安排或非華語學生的中文學習表現等重要資訊。這顯示額外撥款缺乏問責性，公眾難以監察撥款的成效。
3. 大部分的學校只提供中文版本的網頁、年度計劃和年度報告；只有少數提供完整的雙語版本。有少數學校上載了額外撥款的計劃或報告到學校網頁，但全部只有中文版本。不諳中文的持分者和公眾人士難以得知有關額外撥款的發放和運用的資訊。

**政策建議**

1. 教育局應檢視監督機制，並確保學校把獨立的撥款計劃書和報告上載至學校網頁供公眾閱覽，而且當中需包括額外撥款所資助的非華語學生支援措施的資料，及根據教育局的評估工具或校本評核匯報非華語學生的中文學習表現，以加強額外撥款的透明度和助公眾評估額外撥款的成效。
2. 教育局應公開學習架構的檢討研究框架，並為檢討報告的發佈提供清楚的時限，以確保學習架構的檢討過程透明和具問責性。



2018 年 2 月 26 日

致：港聞版及教育版採訪主任（供即時發佈）

新聞稿

**教育局年撥二億支援 少數族裔學中文效果成謎**

**香港融樂會公佈**

**《教育局支援學校推行「中國語文課程第二語言學習架構」額外撥款的問責性之研究》報告**

香港融樂會連同郭榮鏗議員及麥美娟議員於二月二十六日舉辦記者招待會，公佈《教育局支援學校推行「中國語文課程第二語言學習架構」額外撥款的問責性之研究》報告。教育局自 2014 年起每年撥款約 2 億元，向取錄非華語學生的中小學，提供 5 萬至 150 萬元不等的額外資助，以支援學校推行「中國語文課程第二語言學習架構」，從而協助非華語學生的中文學與教，並過渡至主流中文學習。香港融樂會發現，有關撥款和學習架構欠缺問責性和透明度，各持分者和公眾難以監察其落實的過程和成效。是次研究檢視了在油尖旺、元朗和東區共 97 所小學和 86 所中學的學校網頁，以及上載至學校網頁的年度計劃和報告，並記錄和分析了當中與獲取和使用額外撥款有關的資料。

研究結果顯示，並非所有獲發額外撥款的學校均公開透露此資訊。在透露獲發額外撥款的學校當中，約兩成未有在其學校網頁或上載文件中，提供有關非華語學生的學與教支援措施的資訊，而且大部份學校沒有提供中文調適課程、中文課編班安排的重要資訊；亦沒有列出非華語學生的中文學習進度以交代撥款成效等。此外，大部分的學校資料只提供中文版本，以致不諳中文的持分者和公眾人士難以得知有關額外撥款的發放和運用的資訊。

研究的主要結果，請參看「研究撮要」附件或完整報告 <https://goo.gl/xgJfnu>。

立法會議員郭榮鏗表示獲得教育是每個學生的基本權利。少數族裔雖然是社會上的少數，但作為本地居民的一份子，理應與本地華裔生一樣能透過主流教育制度，獲取足夠的語文能力以支援日後升學就業、及貢獻社會的機會。「學習架構」實行至今已第四年，政府已投放逾八億的公帑以「校本」形式支援非華語學生的中文學習；學生一代代長大，若公眾無從得知及監察款項及架構的成效及用處，只會拖慢學生更有效學習中文的步伐。

立法會議員麥美娟表示多年來在議會上討論少數族裔的中文教育，卻從沒多大進展。她觀察到有少數族裔即使是香港土生土長，經歷過 12 年主流教育後，仍然會因語言障礙難以獲取公共服務，及只能找到低或非技術的工作。在教育方面，若政府能投放更多資源，相信可以幫助非華語學生，但政府同時有責任加強運用撥款的監管和透明度，確保撥款用得其所，同



時令家長都能夠知道學校有何具體方法支援非華語學生。若政府不加強監管，亦會影響公眾對這些措施的支持。

### 政策建議

為加強額外撥款和學習架構的透明度和問責性，教育局應確保學校把獨立的撥款計劃書和報告上載至學校網頁供公眾閱覽，而且當中需包括非華語學生支援措施和中文學習表現等的資料。教育局亦應公開學習架構的檢討研究框架，並為檢討報告的發佈提供清楚的時限。

*附件：《教育局支援學校推行「中國語文課程第二語言學習架構」額外撥款的問責性之研究》  
研究撮要*

傳媒查詢，請聯絡本會項目經理卓文寶小姐（電話 2789 3246）。