

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC137/17-18
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(10)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 18th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Saturday, 18 March 2017, at 8:30 am

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP

Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

Members absent:

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Carol YUEN, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3
Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)(Works)
Mr Joseph LO Kwok-kuen	Chief Assistant Secretary for Development (Works) 1, Development Bureau
Mr Tony MOYUNG Hon	Assistant Director of Lands (Acquisition), Lands Department
Ms Joyce NG Suet-ye	Chief Estate Surveyor (Acquisition), Lands Department
Mrs Sylvia LAM YU Ka-wai, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mr Dennis LAW Kar-cheuk	Acting Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Mr MAK Ka-wai, JP	Deputy Director of Drainage Services
Ms Betty CHEUNG Miu-han	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Environmental Infrastructure)
Mr Samson LAI Yiu-kei	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Waste Management Policy)

Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr WONG Wai-man, JP	Project Manager (New Territories East), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Ricky LAU Chun-kit, JP	Head of Civil Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHUI Wing-wah	Deputy Director of Highways
Mr Kelvin LO Kwok-wah	Project Manager (Major Works), Highways Department
Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) 5, Development Bureau
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department
Mr KOK Che-leung	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Subventions)
Ms PANG Kit-ling	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
Mr Kenneth WOO Chi-man	Chief Executive Officer (Subventions/Planning), Social Welfare Department
Miss Winnie WONG Ming-wai	Deputy Secretary-General (1), University Grants Committee Secretariat
Mr LEE Kam-yuen	Chief Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Ms PING Tak-wai	Senior Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Mr WONG Chung-leung, JP	Deputy Director of Water Supplies
Mr Dominic KWONG Kam-keung	Chief Systems Manager (Governance and Resources), Office of the Government Chief Information Officer
Mr Kenneth LEUNG Tak-yan	Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Transport and Housing Bureau
Mr IP Shing-tim	Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Ms Ada LAU

Senior Council Secretary(1)7

Mr Raymond SZETO

Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Ms Michelle NIEN

Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

The Chairman reminded members of the requirements under Rule 83A and Rule 84 of the Rules of Procedure.

Item No. 1 — FCR(2016-17)86

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE
MADE ON 22 FEBRUARY 2017**

PWSC(2016-17)37

CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND

HEAD 701 — LAND ACQUISITION

HEAD 702 — PORT AND AIRPORT DEVELOPMENT

HEAD 703 — BUILDINGS

HEAD 704 — DRAINAGE

HEAD 705 — CIVIL ENGINEERING

HEAD 706 — HIGHWAYS

HEAD 707 — NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT

HEAD 708 (PART) — CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS

HEAD 709 — WATERWORKS

HEAD 710 — COMPUTERISATION

HEAD 711 — HOUSING

Block allocations

2. The Chairman said that the Finance Committee ("FC") started its deliberation on this item on 24 February 2017 and would continue with the discussion. This item invited FC to:

- (a) approve a total allocation of \$12,420.2 million for 2017-18 for the block allocations under the Capital Works Reserve Fund;
- (b) increase the approved allocation for Subhead 9100WX under Head 709 for 2016-17 by \$68.2 million from \$785.3 million to \$853.5 million; and
- (c) revise, with effect from 2017-18, the ambit of Subhead 6101TX under Head 706.

3. The Chairman declared that he was an independent non-executive director of The Bank of East Asia ("BEA"). In view of the position held by the Chairman in BEA, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung wondered whether it would be more appropriate for the Deputy Chairman to chair the discussion of this item. In response, the Chairman said that he did not consider it necessary for the Deputy Chairman to take the chair.

4. The Chairman reiterated his direction given before the end of the 17 March 2017 meeting that at this meeting, members might each speak on this item for the last round for not more than three minutes.

Motion to adjourn discussion on the item FCR(2016-17)86

5. At 8:41 am, Mr CHU Hoi-dick, when speaking on the item, moved without notice under paragraph 39 of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FCP") that discussion on the item FCR(2016-17)86 be adjourned. The Chairman proposed the question and directed that each member might speak once for not more than three minutes.

6. Mr CHU Hoi-dick spoke on his motion. Mr CHU expressed his hope that, by way of passage of a motion to adjourn the discussion on this item by FC, the Administration might then withdraw from the block allocations proposal the two land acquisition items relating to the Wang Chau development plan in Yuen Long, and improve the entire Wang Chau development plan by, among others, formulating better options for handling brownfield sites and relocating affected residents to expedite the implementation of the plan. In the meantime, the Administration might resubmit the remaining items under the block allocations proposal at the FC meetings on 1 April. He believed those items would then be smoothly approved by FC.

7. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Dr YIU Chung-yim, Mr LAM Cheuk-ting, Mr Nathan LAW, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr Jeremy TAM, Mr Andrew WAN, Mr SHIU Ka-chun and Dr LAU Siu-lai spoke in support of the motion. They generally held that the Administration should withdraw the items relating to the Wang Chau development plan. Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok and Mr Holden CHOW spoke against the motion.

8. Mr CHU Hoi-dick spoke in reply. The Chairman put to vote the motion that discussion on the item be adjourned. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The motion was negatived. The votes of individual members were set out in **Annex**.

9. FC continued with the deliberation on the item FCR(2016-17)86.

Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge project

10. Mr Andrew WAN enquired:

- (a) whether the Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") was a representative of the Hong Kong side in the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Authority ("HZMBA");
- (b) about the powers and responsibilities of the Hong Kong side in respect of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge ("HZMB"), as well as the ratio of Hong Kong's contribution in the construction costs of HZMB;
- (c) about the repayment period for loans to finance the project and the amount of interest payable;
- (d) the projected annual vehicle flow of HZMB and the expected income to be generated by HZMB annually; and
- (e) whether the relevant income could cover the repayment of the financing loans.

11. Deputy Director of Highways advised that the three governments were represented in the Joint Works Committee of the Three Governments ("JWC") which was tasked to take forward the HZMB project, and STH was a representative of the Hong Kong Government in JWC. Moreover, the Hong Kong Government was also represented in HZMBA under JWC. As for the financing arrangement, he said that the Administration would provide supplementary information after the meeting.

[*Post-meeting note*: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. FC153/16-17(01) (Chinese version only) on 31 May 2017.]

Subhead 8100EX under Head 708—Alterations, additions, repairs and improvements to the campuses of the University Grants Committee-funded institutions

Improvement of building management system in 19 buildings in main campus for integrated monitoring, the University of Hong Kong

12. Noting that this project sought to achieve "integrated monitoring", Dr CHENG Chung-tai enquired about the meaning of "integrated monitoring" and whether it would cover the installation of closed-circuit televisions or other security facilities. Deputy Secretary-General (1), University Grants Committee Secretariat replied that under the proposed project, the building management system in 19 buildings in the main campus of the University of Hong Kong would be standardized, and the works involved would include the installation of lighting, air-conditioning, lift/elevator and other electrical equipment in some of these buildings and such equipment would be linked to the building management headquarters. The installation of security systems was not covered by this project.

Subhead A007GX under Head 710—New Administrative Computer Systems

Confidential messaging application, Leisure and Cultural Services Department

13. Regarding the funding for the enhancement of the existing confidential messaging application, Mr Jeremy TAM enquired about the justifications for the Administration to make a separate funding application solely for the Leisure and Cultural Services Department. Chief Systems Manager (Governance and Resources), Office of the Government Chief Information Officer advised that all government departments (including the Leisure and Cultural Services Department) were equipped with confidential messaging applications. Various departments would raise updating proposals to enhance and strengthen the functions of such applications at different times, having regard to their specific needs.

[*Post-meeting note*: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. FC153/16-17(01) (Chinese version only) on 31 May 2017.]

Wang Chau development plan in Yuen Long

14. Mr KWONG Chun-yu asked whether STH would attend the meeting to be held on 31 March 2017 to meet with residents affected by the plan and discuss the relocation arrangement. He requested that all relevant Directors of Bureaux had to attend the meeting. Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department replied that as the Administration was still discussing the meeting arrangement, he could not respond to Mr KWONG Chun-yu's enquiry at the moment but he undertook to relay Mr KWONG's request to relevant parties.

Other items

15. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen requested the Administration to provide written responses to his enquiries raised at the second meeting held on 17 March 2017, which included:

- (a) regarding Subhead 7100CX under Head 710, the date on which the findings of the Preliminary Feasibility Study on Developing the New Territories North were published and the relevant findings (if the paper had been published);
- (b) the completion date of the review of the Private Recreational Lease policy and the date on which the review findings were published; and
- (c) given that the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link West Kowloon Terminus might have customs facilities under the co-location arrangement, and an area in the Terminus had to be designated as the Mainland jurisdiction for use by the Mainland authorities, in this connection:
 - (i) the arrangements for paying the construction costs of the water supply facilities in the Terminus and the recurrent expenses to be incurred by those facilities, including whether such costs and expenses would be fully borne by the Hong Kong Government or would be shared with the Mainland authorities; and

- (ii) details of the funding application for upgrading the customs technology facilities at Hong Kong's border control point, including whether the funds would only be spent on the systems within the Hong Kong jurisdiction in the Terminus or would also be used for upgrading the relevant Mainland systems.

[*Post-meeting note*: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. FC153/16-17(01) (Chinese version only) on 31 May 2017.]

Land acquisition items under the block allocations proposal

16. Dr YIU Chung-yim noted that the Administration, when dealing with land acquisition items under the block allocations, might commence its work in advance by, say, negotiating with owners the compensation for land resumption. He enquired about the channels through which members could learn about the future land resumption plans of the Administration so as to monitor the work of the Government. Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3 ("DSFST(T)(3)") said that under the block allocations mechanism, the Government provided the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), on an annual basis, with a list of public works projects (including new projects) to be carried out in the following year, and written reports were also submitted in a timely manner to update LegCo with the latest progress. Year-end reports were also submitted to give LegCo an account of the works progress and the expended funds.

Other views

17. Noting that the Administration had, in its written response dated 14 March 2017 in respect of the motion proposed by Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Dr YIU Chung-yim under FCP 21, alleged that the motion proposed by Mr CHU and Dr YIU would give rise to serious financial implications and other risks, and concluded that the motion would not be in the public interest, Mr Nathan LAW expressed dissatisfaction with such allegations and conclusions.

18. DSFST(T)(3) responded that the creation of items under the block allocations proposal was authorized by LegCo under an established mechanism, and some of the projects under the proposal had already commenced, with contracts already signed with contractors. If the funding application (including those projects which had already commenced) was handled according to the mechanism proposed by the two Members, the scenarios as predicted in the Government's response might become reality.

Motion for the adjournment of further proceedings of FC

19. At 9:59 am, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung moved without notice under FCP 39 that further proceedings of FC be then adjourned. The Chairman proposed the question and directed that each member might speak once for not more than three minutes.

20. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on his motion. He said that the Wang Chau development plan in Yuen Long was a controversial project with extensive implications. Apart from requesting the Administration to withdraw items relating to the plan from the block allocations proposal, members had also put forward options to improve the development plan. However, the Administration had turned a deaf ear to their requests and suggested options. He therefore proposed that further proceedings of FC be then adjourned.

21. Dr YIU Chung-yim, Mr Nathan LAW, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr Jeremy TAM, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Dr LAU Siu-lai spoke in support of the motion. Dr YIU, Mr LAW, Mr CHAN and Dr LAU said that as members had proposed viable alternatives to deal with the block allocations proposal and the Wang Chau development plan, the Administration should take the adjournment as an opportunity for it to think through those options, and a win-win-win situation might then be achieved. Given that there were over 9 000 items under the block allocations proposal, Mr TAM and Mr LEUNG said that it was simply unrealistic to expect members to have a thorough discussion within such a short period of time. Dr Junius HO and Dr CHIANG Lai-wan spoke against the motion.

22. The meeting concluded at 10:29 am.

點名表決DIVISION: 1

日期 DATE: 18/03/2017

時間 TIME: 09:31:16 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 動議中止議程文件 FCR(2016-17)86 的討論
Motion that discussion on FCR(2016-17)86 be now adjourned

動議人 MOVED BY:

出席 Present : 48

投票 Vote : 47

贊成 Yes : 13

反對 No : 34

棄權 Abstain : 0

結果 Result : 否決 Negative

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	出席	PRESENT	葉建源	IP Kin-yuen		
涂謹申	James TO			葛珮帆	Dr Elizabeth QUAT	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	廖長江	Martin LIAO	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	潘兆平	POON Siu-ping	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔣麗芸	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	反對	NO
李國麟	Prof Joseph LEE			盧偉國	Ir Dr LO Wai-kiok	反對	NO
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	鍾國斌	CHUNG Kwok-pan		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	楊岳橋	Alvin YEUNG		
李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO	尹兆堅	Andrew WAN	贊成	YES
陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO	朱凱迪	CHU Hoi-dick	贊成	YES
梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG			吳永嘉	Jimmy NG	反對	NO
黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO	何君堯	Dr Junius HO	反對	NO
葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP			何啟明	HO Kai-ming	反對	NO
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	林卓廷	LAM Cheuk-ting	贊成	YES
梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES	周浩鼎	Holden CHOW	反對	NO
毛孟靜	Claudia MO			邵家輝	SHIU Ka-fai	反對	NO
田北辰	Michael TIEN	反對	NO	邵家臻	SHIU Ka-chun	贊成	YES
何俊賢	Steven HO	反對	NO	柯創盛	Wilson OR	反對	NO
易志明	Frankie YICK	反對	NO	容海恩	YUNG Hoi-yan	反對	NO
胡志偉	WU Chi-wai			陳沛然	Dr Pierre CHAN		
姚思榮	YIU Si-wing	反對	NO	陳振英	CHAN Chun-ying	反對	NO
馬逢國	MA Fung-kwok	反對	NO	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
莫乃光	Charles Peter MOK			張國鈞	CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	反對	NO
陳志全	CHAN Chi-chuen	贊成	YES	許智峯	HUI Chi-fung		
陳恒鎔	CHAN Han-pan	反對	NO	陸頌雄	LUK Chung-hung	反對	NO
梁志祥	LEUNG Che-cheung	反對	NO	劉國勳	LAU Kwok-fan	反對	NO
梁繼昌	Kenneth LEUNG			劉業強	Kenneth LAU		
麥美娟	Alice MAK	反對	NO	鄭松泰	Dr CHENG Chung-tai	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki			鄭俊宇	KWONG Chun-yu	贊成	YES
郭偉強	KWOK Wai-keung	反對	NO	譚文豪	Jeremy TAM	贊成	YES
郭榮鏗	Dennis KWOK			羅冠聰	Nathan LAW	贊成	YES
張華峰	Christopher CHEUNG	反對	NO	姚松炎	Dr YIU Chung-yim	贊成	YES
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG			劉小麗	Dr LAU Siu-lai	贊成	YES
黃碧雲	Dr Helena WONG						

秘書 CLERK

