

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC138/17-18
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(10)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 19th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Saturday, 18 March 2017, at 10:43 am

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP

Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

Members absent:

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public officers attending:

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Carol YUEN, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3
Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)(Works)
Mr Joseph LO Kwok-kuen	Chief Assistant Secretary for Development (Works) 1
Mr Tony MOYUNG Hon	Assistant Director of Lands (Acquisition)
Ms Joyce NG Suet-yee	Chief Estate Surveyor (Acquisition), Lands Department
Mrs Sylvia LAM YU Ka-wai, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mr Dennis LAW Kar-cheuk	Acting Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Mr MAK Ka-wai, JP	Deputy Director of Drainage Services
Ms Betty CHEUNG Miu-han	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Environmental Infrastructure)

Mr Samson LAI Yiu-kei	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Waste Management Policy)
Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr WONG Wai-man, JP	Project Manager (New Territories East), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Ricky LAU Chun-kit, JP	Head of Civil Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHUI Wing-wah	Deputy Director of Highways
Mr Kelvin LO Kwok-wah	Project Manager (Major Works), Highways Department
Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) 5
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department
Mr KOK Che-leung	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Subventions)
Ms PANG Kit-ling	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
Mr Kenneth WOO Chi-man	Chief Executive Officer (Subventions/Planning), Social Welfare Department
Miss Winnie WONG Ming-wai	Deputy Secretary-General (1), University Grants Committee Secretariat
Mr LEE Kam-yuen	Chief Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Ms PING Tak-wai	Senior Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Mr WONG Chung-leung, JP	Deputy Director of Water Supplies
Mr Dominic KWONG Kam-keung	Chief Systems Manager (Governance and Resources), Office of the Government Chief Information Officer
Mr IP Shing-tim	Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

Staff in attendance:

Mr Derek LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Ms Ada LAU

Senior Council Secretary (1)7

Mr Raymond SZETO

Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Ms Michelle NIEN

Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

**ITEM 1 — FCR(2016-17)86
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 22 FEBRUARY 2017**

PWSC(2016-17)37

Capital Works Reserve Fund

HEAD 701 — LAND ACQUISITION

HEAD 702 — PORT AND AIRPORT DEVELOPMENT

HEAD 703 — BUILDINGS

HEAD 704 — DRAINAGE

HEAD 705 — CIVIL ENGINEERING

HEAD 706 — HIGHWAYS

HEAD 707 — NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT

HEAD 708(PART) — CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS

HEAD 709 — WATERWORKS

HEAD 710 — COMPUTERISATION

HEAD 711 — HOUSING

Block allocations

Motion for the adjournment of further proceedings of FC

The Finance Committee ("FC") continued to debate the motion moved by Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung under paragraph 39 of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FCP") that further proceedings of FC be then adjourned. Mr James TO, Mr SHIU Ka-chun and Mr CHU Hoi-dick spoke in support of the motion. They requested the Administration to take out the items under the development project at Wang Chau, Yuen Long from the block allocations proposal.

2. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke in reply in respect of the motion. The Chairman put the motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The motion for the adjournment of further proceedings of FC was negated. The votes of individual members were set out in **Annex I**. FC continued with the deliberation on item FCR(2016-17)86.

Members' views on the agenda item and the Chairman

3. Mr James TO enquired whether the Secretaries of Departments of the Administration or even the Chief Executive noted the strong views held by some FC members on the block allocations proposal. In response, the Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3 said that officials of the ranks of Directors of Bureaux and above noted members' views.

4. At 11:02 am, the Chairman remarked that, given the substantial number of motions proposed by members under FCP 37A ("37A motions") at today's meeting, to facilitate the orderly and efficient conduct of the meeting, he directed that each of those members who submitted motions at the meeting to select and submit three of such motions to FC for voting on whether they should be proceeded with forthwith. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Dr LAU Siu-lai expressed dissatisfaction. At that juncture, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen left his seat and spoke aloud. At 11:07 am, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung approached the Chairman's podium. The Chairman ordered him to return to his seat, otherwise the Chairman would order him to leave the conference room. Mr CHU Hoi-dick, Dr LAU Siu-lai and Mr Nathan LAW also approached the Chairman's podium. At 11:07 am, the Chairman directed that the meeting be suspended for 10 minutes.

5. The meeting resumed at 11:20 am. The Chairman announced the arrangements for the handling of 37A motions by FC and advised that he would later rule on the motions to be proposed by Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Dr YIU Chung-yim under FCP 21. Mr James TO considered that the Chairman's arrangements for handling 37A motions were inappropriate. The Chairman disagreed.

Motions proposed by members under paragraphs 37A and 47 of the Finance Committee Procedure

6. At 11:23 am, FC started to vote on the questions of whether the 37A motions should be proceeded with forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. After the Chairman declared that FC had negated the question of proceeding with the first 37A motion forthwith, Mr CHAN Hak-kan moved without notice a motion under FCP 47 that in the event of further divisions being claimed in respect of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, FC should proceed with each of such divisions immediately after the division bell had been rung for one minute. The Chairman proposed the question, and directed that each member might speak on the question once for not more than three minutes.

7. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Ms Claudia MO, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Dr LAU Siu-lai, Mr CHU Hoi-dick, Mr Jeremy TAM, Mr James TO, Mr HUI Chi-fung, Dr YIU Chung-yim, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Mr Nathan LAW, Mr SHIU Ka-chun and Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke against the motion. In gist, they considered that the block allocations proposal involved a wide range of public works items, and members needed more time to understand the contents of the motions and give consideration to them. Some members also expressed discontent about the Chairman's restriction on the number of 37A motions that members were allowed to propose. Mr Steven HO spoke in support of the motion.

8. The Chairman put the motion to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The motion was passed. The votes of individual members were set out in **Annex II**.

9. FC continued to vote, one by one, on the questions of whether the remaining 37A motions should be proceeded with forthwith. In this session of meeting, FC voted on the questions of whether the following 37A motions should be proceeded with forthwith. The results were as follows:

Members proposing the motions	Serial nos. of the motions	Whether to proceed with the motions forthwith
Dr LAU Siu-lai	0029, 0030, 0031, 0032, 0033, 0034	No
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho	0081	No
Mr Nathan LAW Kwun-chung	0016, 0017, 0018, 0022	No
Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	0282, 0283, 0284	No

10. At 12:35 pm, the Chairman ordered the close of the meeting.

Legislative Council Secretariat
12 February 2018

點名表決 DIVISION: 2
日期 DATE: 18/03/2017
時間 TIME: 10:59:15 上午 AM

動議 MOTION: 動議委員會現即休會
Motion that further proceedings of the Committee be now adjourned

動議人 MOVED BY:

出席 Present : 47
投票 Vote : 46
贊成 Yes : 14
反對 No : 32
棄權 Abstain : 0
結果 Result : 否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	出席	PRESENT	葉建源	IP Kin-yuen	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	葛珮帆	Dr Elizabeth QUAT	反對	NO
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES	廖長江	Martin LIAO	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			潘兆平	POON Siu-ping	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔣麗芸	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan	反對	NO
李國麟	Prof Joseph LEE			盧偉國	Ir Dr LO Wai-kiwok	反對	NO
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	鍾國斌	CHUNG Kwok-pan	反對	NO
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	楊岳橋	Alvin YEUNG		
李慧琼	Starry LEE	反對	NO	尹兆堅	Andrew WAN	贊成	YES
陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	反對	NO	朱凱迪	CHU Hoi-dick	贊成	YES
梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG			吳永嘉	Jimmy NG	反對	NO
黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	反對	NO	何君堯	Dr Junius HO		
葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP			何啟明	HO Kai-ming	反對	NO
謝偉俊	Paul TSE	反對	NO	林卓廷	LAM Cheuk-ting		
梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES	周浩鼎	Holden CHOW	反對	NO
毛孟靜	Claudia MO			邵家輝	SHIU Ka-fai	反對	NO
田北辰	Michael TIEN	反對	NO	邵家臻	SHIU Ka-chun	贊成	YES
何俊賢	Steven HO	反對	NO	柯創盛	Wilson OR	反對	NO
易志明	Frankie YICK	反對	NO	容海恩	YUNG Hoi-yan	反對	NO
胡志偉	WU Chi-wai			陳沛然	Dr Pierre CHAN		
姚思榮	YIU Si-wing	反對	NO	陳振英	CHAN Chun-ying		
馬逢國	MA Fung-kwok	反對	NO	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
莫乃光	Charles Peter MOK			張國鈞	CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	反對	NO
陳志全	CHAN Chi-chuen	贊成	YES	許智峯	HUI Chi-fung		
陳恒鎔	CHAN Han-pan	反對	NO	陸頌雄	LUK Chung-hung	反對	NO
梁志祥	LEUNG Che-cheung	反對	NO	劉國勳	LAU Kwok-fan	反對	NO
梁繼昌	Kenneth LEUNG			劉業強	Kenneth LAU		
麥美娟	Alice MAK	反對	NO	鄭松泰	Dr CHENG Chung-tai	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki			鄭俊宇	KWONG Chun-yu	贊成	YES
郭偉強	KWOK Wai-keung	反對	NO	譚文豪	Jeremy TAM	贊成	YES
郭榮鏗	Dennis KWOK			羅冠聰	Nathan LAW	贊成	YES
張華峰	Christopher CHEUNG	反對	NO	姚松炎	Dr YIU Chung-yim	贊成	YES
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG			劉小麗	Dr LAU Siu-lai	贊成	YES
黃碧雲	Dr Helena WONG						

秘書 CLERK

點名表決DIVISION: 4
日期 DATE: 18/03/2017
時間 TIME: 12:17:50 下午 PM

動議 MOTION: 動議其後就相同議程項目下任何議案或待議議題進行點名表決時，委員會須在點名表決鐘聲響起一分鐘後進行點名表決
Motion that in the event of further divisions being claimed of any motions or questions under the same agenda item, the Committee do proceed such divisions immediately after the division bell has been rung for one minute

動議人 MOVED BY:

出席 Present : 43
投票 Vote : 41
贊成 Yes : 27
反對 No : 14
棄權 Abstain : 0
結果 Result : 通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
陳健波	CHAN Kin-por	出席	PRESENT	葉建源	IP Kin-yuen		
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	葛珮帆	Dr Elizabeth QUAT	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	廖長江	Martin LIAO	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			潘兆平	POON Siu-ping	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	蔣麗芸	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan		
李國麟	Prof Joseph LEE			盧偉國	Ir Dr LO Wai-kiok	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	鍾國斌	CHUNG Kwok-pan		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES	楊岳橋	Alvin YEUNG		
李慧琼	Starry LEE	贊成	YES	尹兆堅	Andrew WAN	反對	NO
陳克勤	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成	YES	朱凱迪	CHU Hoi-dick	反對	NO
梁美芬	Dr Priscilla LEUNG			吳永嘉	Jimmy NG	贊成	YES
黃國健	WONG Kwok-kin	贊成	YES	何君堯	Dr Junius HO		
葉劉淑儀	Mrs Regina IP			何啟明	HO Kai-ming	贊成	YES
謝偉俊	Paul TSE			林卓廷	LAM Cheuk-ting		
梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO	周浩鼎	Holden CHOW	贊成	YES
毛孟靜	Claudia MO	反對	NO	邵家輝	SHIU Ka-fai		
田北辰	Michael TIEN	贊成	YES	邵家臻	SHIU Ka-chun	反對	NO
何俊賢	Steven HO	贊成	YES	柯創盛	Wilson OR	贊成	YES
易志明	Frankie YICK	贊成	YES	容海恩	YUNG Hoi-yan	贊成	YES
胡志偉	WU Chi-wai			陳沛然	Dr Pierre CHAN		
姚思榮	YIU Si-wing			陳振英	CHAN Chun-ying	贊成	YES
馬逢國	MA Fung-kwok	贊成	YES	陳淑莊	Tanya CHAN		
莫乃光	Charles Peter MOK			張國鈞	CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	贊成	YES
陳志全	CHAN Chi-chuen	反對	NO	許智峯	HUI Chi-fung	反對	NO
陳恒鑽	CHAN Han-pan	贊成	YES	陸頌雄	LUK Chung-hung	贊成	YES
梁志祥	LEUNG Che-cheung	贊成	YES	劉國勳	LAU Kwok-fan	贊成	YES
梁繼昌	Kenneth LEUNG			劉業強	Kenneth LAU		
麥美娟	Alice MAK			鄭松泰	Dr CHENG Chung-tai	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki			鄭松泰	KWONG Chun-yu	反對	NO
郭偉強	KWOK Wai-keung	贊成	YES	譚文豪	Jeremy TAM	反對	NO
郭榮鏗	Dennis KWOK			羅冠聰	Nathan LAW	出席	PRESENT
張華峰	Christopher CHEUNG	贊成	YES	姚松炎	Dr YIU Chung-yim	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG			劉小麗	Dr LAU Siu-lai	反對	NO
黃碧雲	Dr Helena WONG						

秘書 CLERK