

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. FC139/17-18  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref: FC/1/1(10)

**Finance Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 20<sup>th</sup> meeting**  
**held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**  
**on Saturday, 18 March 2017, at 12:50 pm**

**Members present:**

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon IP Kin-yuen

Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan  
Hon CHAN Chun-ying  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Members absent:**

Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Hon Alvin YEUNG

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

**Public officers attending:**

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-yee, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Carol YUEN, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 3
Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)(Works)
Mr Joseph LO Kwok-kuen	Chief Assistant Secretary for Development (Works) 1
Mr Tony MOYUNG Hon	Assistant Director of Lands (Acquisition)
Ms Joyce NG Suet-yee	Chief Estate Surveyor (Acquisition), Lands Department
Mrs Sylvia LAM YU Ka-wai, JP	Deputy Director of Architectural Services
Mr Dennis LAW Kar-cheuk	Acting Assistant Director of Architectural Services (Property Services)
Mr MAK Ka-wai, JP	Deputy Director of Drainage Services
Ms Betty CHEUNG Miu-han	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Environmental Infrastructure)
Mr Samson LAI Yiu-kei	Assistant Director of Environmental Protection (Waste Management Policy)

Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr WONG Wai-man, JP	Project Manager (New Territories East), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr Ricky LAU Chun-kit, JP	Head of Civil Engineering Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr CHUI Wing-wah	Deputy Director of Highways
Mr Kelvin LO Kwok-wah	Project Manager (Major Works), Highways Department
Mr Ivan CHUNG Man-kit	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) 5
Miss Charmaine WONG Hoi-wan, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works), Home Affairs Department
Mr KOK Che-leung	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Subventions)
Ms PANG Kit-ling	Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Elderly)
Mr Kenneth WOO Chi-man	Chief Executive Officer (Subventions/Planning), Social Welfare Department
Miss Winnie WONG Ming-wai	Deputy Secretary-General (1), University Grants Committee Secretariat
Mr LEE Kam-yuen	Chief Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Ms PING Tak-wai	Senior Maintenance Surveyor (School Premises Maintenance), Education Bureau
Mr WONG Chung-leung, JP	Deputy Director of Water Supplies
Mr Dominic KWONG Kam-keung	Chief Systems Manager (Governance and Resources), Office of the Government Chief Information Officer
Mr Kenneth LEUNG Tak-yan	Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Transport and Housing Bureau
Mr IP Shing-tim	Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

**Staff in attendance:**

Mr Derek LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Ms Ada LAU

Senior Council Secretary(1)7

Mr Raymond SZETO

Council Secretary (1)5

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Ms Michelle NIEN

Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

Action

**ITEM 1 — FCR(2016-17)86  
RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS  
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 22 FEBRUARY 2017**

**PWSC(2016-17)37**

**Capital Works Reserve Fund**

**HEAD 701 — LAND ACQUISITION**

**HEAD 702 — PORT AND AIRPORT DEVELOPMENT**

**HEAD 703 — BUILDINGS**

**HEAD 704 — DRAINAGE**

**HEAD 705 — CIVIL ENGINEERING**

**HEAD 706 — HIGHWAYS**

**HEAD 707 — NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT**

**HEAD 708(PART) — CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS**

**HEAD 709 — WATERWORKS**

**HEAD 710 — COMPUTERISATION**

**HEAD 711 — HOUSING**

**Block allocations**

Motions proposed by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance  
Committee Procedure

The Finance Committee ("FC") continued to vote on whether to proceed with the motions proposed by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure ("FCP") forthwith. The results were as follows:

Member proposing the motions	Serial nos. of the motions	Whether to proceed with the motions forthwith
Mr Nathan LAW Kwun-chung	<a href="#">0041, 0058, 0060, 0073</a>	No
Dr YIU Chung-yim	<a href="#">0170, 0127, 0160, 0162</a>	No
Mr Andrew WAN Siu-kin	<a href="#">0125, 0148</a>	No
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	<a href="#">0206, 0213, 0233, 0279</a>	No
Ms Claudia MO	<a href="#">0129</a>	No
Mr HUI Chi-fung	<a href="#">0235, 0238, 0267, 0241</a>	No
Dr CHENG Chung-tai	<a href="#">0136, 0255, 0257, 0264</a>	No
Mr SHIU Ka-chun	<a href="#">0234, 0236, 0245, 0248</a>	No
Mr CHAN Chi-chuen	<a href="#">0038, 0039, 0040, 0082</a>	No
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	<a href="#">0288</a>	No

Ruling of the Chairman on the motions proposed to be moved by members under paragraph 21 of the Finance Committee Procedure

2. Mr CHU Hoi-dick asked if he might move further motions under FCP 21 on this agenda item if it was approved by FC at the meeting today. The Chairman advised that members might not move further motions on this agenda item if it was approved by FC.

3. At 1:37 pm, the Chairman said that he had made a ruling on the five motions proposed to be moved by Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Dr YIU Chung-yim under FCP 21 on 15 March 2017, and all five motions were ruled out of order. He would circulate the written ruling to the two Members and other members later.

4. The Chairman said that before the meeting today, Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Dr YIU Chung-yim had, further to the aforesaid five motions, proposed to move another five motions under FCP 21 on this agenda item, but as the time of submission of the motions proposed to be moved by Mr CHU and Dr YIU had failed to meet the notice requirement specified in FCP 21, he would not deal with the five further motions.

5. At 1:38 pm, there being no further question from members, the Chairman put the item FCR(2016-17)86 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for one minute. The Chairman declared that 29 members voted for and 1 member voted against the item. The votes of individual members were as follows:

*For:*

Mr Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Mr CHAN Hak-kan	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Mr Michael TIEN Puk-sun	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming	Mr YIU Si-wing
Mr MA Fung-kwok	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Mr LEUNG Che-cheung	Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Dr Elizabeth QUAT	Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Mr POON Siu-ping	Dr CHIANG Lai-wan
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Jimmy NG Wing-ka
Mr HO Kai-ming	Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing	Mr CHAN Chun-ying
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr LAU Kwok-fan	
(29 members)	

*Against:*

Dr CHENG Chung-tai  
(1 member)

6. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

7. At 1:38 pm, after the Chairman declared that the agenda item be put to vote, Mr CHU Hoi-dick expressed dissatisfaction towards the Chairman's handling of and ruling on the motions moved by Dr YIU Chung-yim and him under FCP 21 on this item. Mr CHU then approached the Chairman's podium. Subsequently, some more members left their seats, and spoke aloud in front of the Chairman's podium.

Issue of order

8. At 1:40 pm, the Chairman directed that the meeting be suspended due to issue of order in the conference room. The meeting resumed at 1:52 pm. Given that the order in the conference room could not be restored, the Chairman declared that the meeting had to end early.

9. The meeting ended at 1:52 pm.