

# **立法會**

## ***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. FC185/17-18

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(22)

### **Finance Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 44<sup>th</sup> meeting  
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex  
on Friday, 2 June 2017, at 3:30 pm**

#### **Members present:**

Hon CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen

Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon CHAN Chun-ying  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Members absent:**

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

**Public officers attending:**

Ms Elizabeth TSE Man-ye, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Carol YUEN, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Kenneth LEUNG Tak-yan	Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Transport and Housing Bureau
Mr LAM Sai-hung, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr David LO Kwok-chung	Chief Engineer (Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Ann Mary TAM Kwai-ye	Chief Architect (5), Housing Department
Mr IP Shing-tim	Chief Civil Engineer (2), Housing Department

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Ms Ada LAU	Senior Council Secretary (1)7
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Miss Queenie LAM	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

Action

**Item No. 1 — FCR(2017-18)5**

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS  
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 16 MARCH 2017**

**PWSC(2016-17)39**

**HEAD 711 — HOUSING**

**Civil Engineering— Land development**

**781CL — Infrastructure works for public housing  
development at Area 54, Tung Chung**

The Chairman reminded members of the requirements under Rule 83A and Rule 84 of the Rules of Procedure. He also declared that he was an independent non-executive director of The Bank of East Asia Limited.

2. The Chairman said that the Finance Committee ("FC") would continue with the deliberation on the item FCR(2017-18)5. The item sought FC's approval of the recommendation of the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") made at its meeting held on 16 March 2017, i.e. the recommendation in PWSC(2016-17)39 to upgrade 781CL to Category A at an estimated cost of \$284.8 million in money-of-the-day prices for the construction of infrastructure to support the proposed public housing development at Area 54, Tung Chung.

Meeting arrangement

3. Mr CHU Hoi-dick asked the Chairman to confirm whether it was true that, as recently reported by the media, FC would convene meetings on Thursday(s) by using the time slots originally scheduled for meetings of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"). The Chairman advised that the relevant arrangement was still being contemplated by the President of LegCo in consultation with Members belonging to different political parties and groupings.

Project costs

4. Dr YIU Chung-yim asked the Administration to explain why the construction of sewers was the costliest item of works under the proposed project, and whether the hotel development project under construction in Area 53a, Tung Chung would be affected should the completion of such sewers be delayed.

5. Chief Engineer (Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department ("CE/Is/CEDD") explained that:

- (a) the proposed sewers would straddle existing transport infrastructure such as the North Lantau Highway as well as the MTR Airport Express Line and Tung Chung Line. To minimize the impact of construction works on those infrastructure, part of the sewers would be constructed using the trenchless excavation method which was costlier than the traditional "open cut" method;
- (b) the proposed sewers would collect sewage from both the public housing development in Area 54 as well as the hotel development project in Area 53a, Tung Chung; and
- (c) according to the lease conditions, the developer of the hotel development in Area 53a, Tung Chung was required to install temporary sewage treatment facilities to cope with the sewage generated from the project. Hence, there would be no immediate impact on sewage treatment of the hotel development project even if the completion of the proposed public sewers was behind schedule.

Construction waste generated from the project

6. Noting the Administration's estimate that 61% of the inert construction waste generated from the proposed works would be delivered to public fill reception facilities for subsequent reuse, Mr Andrew WAN asked if there was still room to increase the amount of inert construction waste reused on site in order to reduce the costs of transporting and handling such waste.

7. Director of Civil Engineering and Development ("DCED") and CE/Is/CEDD explained that in the present case, inert construction waste was mainly generated as a result of excavation works associated with the construction of sewers, and not all the inert construction waste generated could be reused in the site of the proposed project. At the planning and design stages, the Administration had already considered the design and construction sequence of the proposed works in order to reduce, where possible, the generation of construction waste. Prior to the commencement of construction, the contractor would also submit a plan on the handling of inert construction waste to the Administration. The Administration would take the opportunity to further explore with the contractor possible measures to reduce inert construction waste on site.

Public housing development at Area 54, Tung Chung

8. Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired why all flats constructed under the proposed public housing development at Area 54, Tung Chung were subsidized sale flats, without any provision made for public rental housing ("PRH") units. He also asked whether the Administration would lower the price of Home Ownership Scheme flats, taking into account the spiralling property prices in recent years.

9. Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Transport and Housing Bureau ("CCE(PWP)/THB") said that of the public housing units already and being constructed in Tung Chung New Town, about 75% were PRH units, while subsidized sale flats accounted for about 25%. The said ratio was generally in line with that proposed under the Long Term Housing Strategy.

10. The Chairman advised that as the planning of public housing development and price level of subsidized sale flats involved wider policy issues, Members should raise the relevant questions at meetings of the Panel on Housing.

11. Mr Nathan LAW requested the Administration to provide a written reply setting out its rationale for constructing all proposed housing units at Area 54, Tung Chung as subsidized sale flats. Mr Andrew WAN and Mr CHU Hoi-dick also asked the Administration to provide supplementary information on the following:

- (a) the full main text of the Transport Impact Assessment report conducted in relation to the proposed development at Area 54, Tung Chung; and

- (b) the micro climate study report on the proposed development at Area 54, Tung Chung and the nearby buildings.

*[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide FC205/16-17(02) on 30 June 2017.]*

Transport planning for the vicinity of Area 54, Tung Chung

12. Mr Holden CHOW called on the Administration to expeditiously conduct an assessment on the long-term transport infrastructure needs for the vicinity of Area 54, Tung Chung, in order to cope with the need of new population intake through sound planning of transport services before the completion of new housing development in the area.

13. In response, CCE(PWP)/THB pointed out that transport facilities supporting the housing development project at Area 54, Tung Chung would be constructed under the proposed scope of the works project. Provision would be made for several bus stops in the proposed carriageway for future use. The Transport Department would comprehensively review the transport service demand in the area one or two years before the completion of new housing development at Area 54, Tung Chung. Consultation with the Islands District Council ("IsDC") would be held in due course over the transport planning proposals.

14. Mr YIU Si-wing sought information on the scope of the hotel development project at Area 53a, Tung Chung, and enquired whether parking area for coaches would be provided; and if so, how many coach parking spaces would be available.

15. CCE(PWP)/THB advised that the Administration would provide supplementary information as per Mr YIU Si-wing's questions. He pointed out that under the proposed works project, a coach parking area for about 10 coaches would be constructed in the vicinity of Area 54, Tung Chung.

*[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide FC205/16-17(02) on 30 June 2017.]*

16. Mr Nathan LAW opined that the Administration should minimize the number of mandatory cycle dismount zones when designing the new cycle track. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked whether the cycle track proposed under the works project would connect the existing cycle track network in Tung Chung; whether cycle parking space would be provided along the cycle track; and whether pedestrian crossings along the cycle track would be designed to provide barrier-free access. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung asked whether a jogging track could also be provided alongside the proposed cycle track.

17. DCED responded that: ☐

- (a) under the scope of the works project, a cycle track with parking area for about 60 bicycles would be constructed to the north of Ying Hei Road;
- (b) the above cycle track would connect to the existing cycle track at Tung Chung Waterfront Road to allow cyclists access to Tung Chung Town Centre. Pedestrian crossings along the cycle track would be designed to provide barrier-free access;
- (c) a route map of the cycle track was attached in the Annex to the supplementary information paper previously provided by the Administration to PWSC ([PWSC121/16-17\(01\)](#));
- (d) in future, a cycle track network of about 12 km would be available to connect Tung Chung, Tung Chung East ("TCE") and Tung Chung West ("TCW"). In the course of studying the overall planning of TCE Extension and TCW Extension, the Administration would consider measures to improve the accessibility of the cycle track network; and
- (e) a number of facilities were currently available in Tung Chung for the use of joggers, such as the pedestrian walkway along Tung Chung waterfront promenade or the cycle track.

18. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung considered that the provision of 60 cycle parking spaces was highly inadequate to cope with the demand of future population in Area 54, Tung Chung. As such, the Administration should actively consider the additional provision of cycle parking spaces, so as to encourage cycling as a means for commuting.



19. CCE(PWP)/THB and Chief Architect (5), Housing Department ("CA/HD") stated that the number of cycle parking spaces to be provided in Area 54, Tung Chung was determined by making reference to the requirements set out in the current Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG"). If necessary, the proposed cycle parking space under the works project could be expanded to accommodate about 90 bicycles. According to the current plan, about 220 cycle parking spaces would also be provided for the public housing development at Area 54, Tung Chung (i.e. the ratio of one cycle parking space for every 15 flats). Consideration would be given to increasing the number of cycle parking spaces during the detailed design stage of the said housing development project.

20. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung maintained that the planning guidelines in relation to the provision of cycle parking spaces set out in the current HKPSG were outdated. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung requested the Administration to provide information on the date on which the said guidelines came into force.

*[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide FC205/16-17(02) on 30 June 2017.]*

#### Community facilities in Areas 54 and 56 of Tung Chung

21. Mr Andrew WAN asked whether space had been reserved by the Administration for the construction of community and recreational facilities in Area 54, Tung Chung. Criticizing the inadequate provision of social welfare facilities in Tung Chung as a whole, Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about the planning for provision of social welfare facilities in Areas 54 and 56 of Tung Chung. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung was concerned about whether youth facilities such as self-study rooms and reading rooms would be constructed in Area 54, Tung Chung.

22. CCE(PWP)/THB and CA/HD advised that:

- (a) the Administration would provide suitable community and recreational facilities in Area 54, Tung Chung by making reference to the planning guidelines set out in HKPSG. In gist, such facilities to be provided would include kindergarten, children playground, badminton court, basketball court, and so on, but not self-study room or reading room; and

- (b) the funding proposal on advance works relating to Tung Chung New Town Extension was discussed by PWSC on 31 May 2017. In the supplementary information paper provided by the Administration to PWSC after the meeting ([PWSC184/16-17\(01\)](#)), an overview on the planning for the provision of social welfare facilities in TCE Extension was set out in paragraphs 14 and 15.

23. Dr Fernando CHEUNG considered that the facilities in Areas 54 and 56 of Tung Chung might not be able to cope with the needs of the elderly and persons with disabilities. He requested the Administration to provide information on the elderly centre which was closest to Area 54, Tung Chung, including its location and distance from Area 54, Tung Chung.

*[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide FC205/16-17(02) on 30 June 2017.]*

24. Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Dr LAU Siu-lai noted that no provision had been made for a wet market in Area 54, Tung Chung, and the closest wet market would be the one to be located in Ying Tung Estate at Area 56, Tung Chung. They were worried that such planning would create inconvenience for residents living in Area 54, Tung Chung (particularly, the elderly people), and asked whether the Administration would designate certain commercial facilities in Area 54, Tung Chung for the operation of supermarkets or fresh provision shops, so as to facilitate local residents to shop for foods and daily necessities. Mr Nathan LAW and Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired about the planning guidelines in relation to the provision of wet markets.

25. In response, CA/HD pointed out that:

- (a) a wet market and other commercial facilities would be provided in Ying Tung Estate, while Area 54, Tung Chung would be provided with one storey of commercial facilities. Taking into account the actual circumstances, the Housing Department ("HD") would determine the use of commercial facilities about one year prior to the completion of housing development in Area 54, Tung Chung, and some shop premises might be used for the operation of fresh provision shops;

- (b) the Administration had undertaken a detailed survey on the plan to provide a wet market in Area 56, Tung Chung. According to the findings of the survey, the wet market could serve Ying Tung Estate, as well as the future population arising from nearby public and private housing development projects. Hence, it was not necessary to provide another wet market in Area 54, Tung Chung; and
- (c) the wet market in Ying Tung Estate would be located near to Area 54, Tung Chung.

26. The Chairman and Dr LAU Siu-lai enquired about the process of consulting IsDC on the location of the said wet market. CCE(PWP)/THB and CA/HD responded that the relevant housing development project and its supporting facilities had already been discussed by IsDC. HD had also consulted IsDC twice to explain the arrangement in relation to the provision of wet markets. The Administration's proposal was generally supported by members of IsDC.

27. Mr CHU Hoi-dick and Dr KWOK Ka-ki respectively requested the Administration to provide supplementary information as follows:

- (a) the report of the survey conducted by the Administration when planning for provision of markets in Area 56, Tung Chung, in order to explain its view that the wet market in Area 56, Tung Chung was able to cope with the need of future population in Area 54, Tung Chung; and
- (b) the arrangements to facilitate the use of pedestrian crossing facilities connecting Areas 54 and 56 of Tung Chung (with each of such facilities marked on a map) by the elderly and persons with disabilities, and the time needed for these persons to walk from Area 54, Tung Chung to Area 56, Tung Chung via the pedestrian crossing facilities.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide FC205/16-17(02) on 30 June 2017.]

Scope of questions raised by members on the agenda item

28. The Chairman reminded members from time to time that their questions must be directly related to the agenda item under discussion. Regarding the present item, he hoped members could confine their questions to the relevant infrastructure as far as possible. In this connection, Mr CHU Hoi-dick, Mr Andrew WAN, Dr YIU Chung-yim and Mr Jeremy TAM stated the view that as far as the present item was concerned, the Chairman's direction would practically narrow down the scope of discussion by members. Dr YIU pointed out that the present item was concerned with the provision of supporting facilities for a public housing project, and the Administration was not required to seek funding approval from LegCo for the construction of the public housing project itself. If members could not raise questions on the supporting facilities related to the public housing project in the context of FC, they would not be able to effectively monitor the implementation of public housing projects by the Government. Mr TAM concurred with Dr YIU's view. The Chairman however did not agree with Dr YIU's view.

Motions proposed by members under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure

29. At 5:11 pm, the Committee started to vote on whether the motions proposed by a member under paragraph 37A of the Finance Committee Procedure would be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. The voting results were as follows:

Member proposing the motions	Motion numbers	Motions be proceeded forthwith or not
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	<a href="#">0001, 0002, 0003</a>	No

Voting on the item FCR(2017-18)5

30. There being no further question on the item, the Chairman put the item FCR(2017-18)5 to vote. The Chairman declared that the majority of the members present and voting were in favour of the item proposed by the Administration. The item was approved.

31. The meeting ended at 5:30 pm.