

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. FC229/17-18

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(29)

**Finance Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 61<sup>st</sup> meeting  
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex  
on Friday, 14 July 2017, at 2:30 pm**

**Members present:**

Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Kenneth LEUNG  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon IP Kin-yuen  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP  
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon SHIU Ka-chun  
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim  
Dr Hon LAU Siu-lai

**Members absent:**

Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan

Hon CHAN Chun-ying  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon LUK Chung-hung

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

**Public officers attending:**

Mr Andrew LAI Chi Wah, JP	Acting Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Jenny CHOI Mui-fun	Acting Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)1
Mr Alfred ZHI Jian-hong	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Kevin YEUNG Yun-hung, JP	Secretary for Education
Mr Brian LO Sai-hung, JP	Acting Permanent Secretary for Education
Mrs Angelina CHEUNG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Education (6)
Mr Godwin LAI Kam-tong	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education (Special Education), Education Bureau

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Anita SIT	Assistant Secretary General 1
--------------	-------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Mr Derek LO	Chief Council Secretary (1)5
Ms Ada LAU	Senior Council Secretary(1)7
Mr Raymond SZETO	Council Secretary (1)5
Mr Frankie WOO	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3
Ms Michelle NIEN	Legislative Assistant (1)5

---

**Item No. 2 — FCR(2017-18)24**

**HEAD 156 — GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT: EDUCATION  
BUREAU**

**Subhead 000 —Operational expenses**

The Finance Committee ("FC") continued with the deliberation on item FCR(2017-18)24.

Non-means-tested subsidy for self-financing undergraduate studies

*Impact of non-means-tested subsidy on sub-degree programmes*

2. Mr HUI Chi-fung, Ms Claudia MO, Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung and Mr MA Fung-kwok considered that resources were not allocated in a fair manner as the Administration's provision of a non-means-tested annual subsidy of \$30,000 only covered self-financing undergraduate programmes and not the self-financing sub-degree programmes run by the eight University Grants Committee ("UGC")-funded institutions. These members pointed out that as some students might regard the \$30,000 non-means-tested subsidy as a financial incentive and choose to pursue self-financing undergraduate programmes, ultimately the operation of sub-degree programmes might either shrink or cease.

3. Mr Tommy CHEUNG was also of the view that the coverage of the \$30,000 non-means-tested subsidy would limit students' choices for further studies. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung enquired that before the Administration finalized the details of the non-means-tested subsidy, whether it had compared the self-financing undergraduate programmes to be benefited under this initiative with the self-financing sub-degree programmes offered by the eight UGC-funded institutions in terms of their standard and quality.

4. Secretary for Education ("SED") responded that:

- (a) the major roles played by UGC-funded universities were to offer degree programmes which did not require accreditation by the Hong Kong Council for Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications, and to conduct researches. Self-financing sub-degree programmes operated by the arms of UGC-funded universities were accredited by the UGC-funded universities concerned. As such, the Administration considered that including self-financing sub-degree programmes into the coverage of the \$30,000

non-means-tested subsidy would blur the Government's policy on UGC-funded universities as well as the positioning of those universities;

- (b) except for the admission threshold of sub-degree programmes which was set at the attainment of "22222" in the Hong Kong Diploma for Secondary Education Examination ("HKDSE"), all undergraduate programmes required students to meet the admission threshold of at least "3322" in HKDSE ("eligible students"). The latest HKDSE results showed that of all the students sitting for HKDSE, 40% were eligible students, and over 69% attained "22222" or above. It could therefore be seen that about 29% of students still met the requirements for pursuing sub-degree programmes. Hence, the operation of sub-degree programmes would not cease due to loss of students;
- (c) self-financing undergraduate programmes and self-financing sub-degree programmes mainly competed for eligible students. The Administration agreed that the \$30,000 non-means-tested subsidy would become a new factor for eligible students to take into consideration when choosing the type of programmes for their studies; and
- (d) according to past experience, it was noted that among the 40% of students who were eligible, about 25% pursued subsidized undergraduate programmes, about 11% pursued self-financing undergraduate programmes, and only about 4% of eligible students chose to pursue sub-degree programmes. The Administration would review the positioning and functions of sub-degree programmes under the eight areas for further review and actions ("further initiatives").

*Non-means-tested subsidy for studies in Mainland institutions*

5. Ms Claudia MO enquired whether eligible students pursuing eligible undergraduate programmes run by Mainland institutions could obtain the \$30,000 non-means-tested subsidy on top of the \$5,000 non-means-tested subsidy. Mr Tommy CHEUNG considered that the \$5,000 non-means-tested subsidy might not be sufficient for students pursuing eligible undergraduate programmes in institutions located in major Mainland cities (such as Shanghai). Mr MA Fung-kwok expressed views similar to those of Mr CHEUNG and his support for this item, in particular the provision of non-means-tested subsidies to students pursuing

eligible undergraduate programmes run by Mainland institutions, so as to achieve the vision of the Chief Executive to nurture "a sense of national identity, a love for Hong Kong and an international perspective" as stated in her election manifesto.

6. In response, SED pointed out that:

- (a) the purpose of the non-means-tested subsidy was to support students in paying tuition fees rather than meeting their living expenses. Taking into account that the tuition fee levels in the Mainland were lower than those in Hong Kong, the Administration would disburse different rates of non-means-tested subsidy to eligible students pursuing undergraduate programmes in institutions in the two places; and
- (b) eligible students pursuing eligible undergraduate programmes run by Mainland institutions would not be provided with the \$30,000 non-means-tested subsidy for self-financing undergraduate studies in Hong Kong.

Support for science-related subjects and vocational education

7. Mr LAU Kwok-fan noted that the number of students taking science-related elective subjects in HKDSE had been declining. He requested the Administration to enhance support for science-related subjects starting from the secondary levels, and to nurture science and technological talents by improving curriculum design and ensuring that students with knowledge in the relevant subjects would be admitted to related programmes offered by higher education institutions. Mr Tommy CHEUNG requested the Administration to enhance the development of vocational education.

8. SED responded that:

- (a) the Administration had all along been concerned about the taking of elective subjects by senior secondary students. As HKDSE required students to take two to three elective subjects, which was fewer than that before the implementation of HKDSE, the number of students taking various elective subjects had dropped accordingly. However the Administration had also enhanced the promotion of Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics ("STEM") education;

- (b) the Government would review the existing curriculum arrangements when taking forward further initiatives, so as to provide multiple opportunities for students to develop under different subjects and in life-wide learning, thereby enabling their all-round development; and
- (c) higher education institutions enjoyed autonomy in their admission of students. Yet, the Administration also hoped that when admitting students, higher education institutions would consider if the students met the prerequisites for pursuing their programmes so as to enroll, on a merit basis, the most suitable students in various disciplines of study.

#### Kindergarten education

9. Mr Tommy CHEUNG advised that the Liberal Party urged the Administration to make good use of the remaining \$1.4 billion (by deducting the funding for this item from the \$5 billion new provision for expenditure on education) to extend as soon as possible the voucher scheme to private independent kindergartens in 2018-2019 school year, so as to ease their pressure of increasing tuition fees and to provide financial assistance to children from middle-class families for enrolling in those kindergartens. SED advised that the Administration would consider Mr CHEUNG's views when reviewing the Free Quality Kindergarten Education Policy.

#### Educational needs of grass-roots students

10. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung advised that the present item had not taken into consideration the needs of grass-roots families and grass-roots students. He requested the Administration to review this issue in the near future in order to address their aspirations, such as increasing the rates under the School Textbook Assistance Scheme and the Subsidy Scheme for Internet Access Charges.

#### Procedural matters

11. At 3:12 pm, the Chairman advised that he was informed by the Legislative Council Secretariat that the Court of First Instance of the High Court had delivered a judgment on the cases concerning the oath-taking of LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai. The Chairman directed that the meeting be suspended.

12. The meeting resumed at 3:47 pm. The Chairman informed members that pursuant to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on the judicial review of the cases concerning the oath-taking of the aforesaid four persons, the four persons had been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), and were not allowed to exercise the powers and functions of a member of LegCo. The Chairman ordered the four persons to leave the conference room.

13. A commotion broke out in the conference room. The Chairman declared that today's meeting ended, and the meeting on the next day would be held as scheduled. The meeting ended at 3:48 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat  
12 April 2018