

立法會
Legislative Council

Ref : CB2/HS/2/16

LC Paper No. CB(2)933/16-17
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities

**Minutes of the meeting
held on Monday, 12 December 2016, at 2:00 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP (Chairman)
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon KWOK Wai-keung
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
- Member attending** : Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
- Public Officers attending** : Mr Kevin YEUNG Yun-hung
Under Secretary for Education
- Ms Jessie WONG Hok-ling
Deputy Secretary for Education (2)

Mr Sheridan LEE Sha-lun
Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum
Development)
Education Bureau

Ms IP Ling-bik
Principal Assistant Secretary (Education Commission
and Planning)
Education Bureau

Mr WOO Chun-sing
Principal Assistant Secretary (Kindergarten Education)
Education Bureau

Attendance by : Item I
invitation

The Civic Party

Mr Andy YU Tak-po

Mr MAK Ip-sing
Member of Yuen Long District Council

Oxfam Hong Kong

Ms WONG Shek-hung
Hong Kong Programme Manager

Mr POON Wing-lok

LINK Centre

Mr TSANG Kwong-wing
Project Manager

Hong Kong Community Network

Mr FAN Kwok-fai
Director of Service

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Ms LAW Lam
Officer (Family Community Service)

Miss Farah BEGUM

Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union

Dr FUNG Wai-wah
President

Dr WANG Danping

Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for
Workers – Kowloon

Mr Shoaib HUSSAIN
Assistant Programme Officer

Hong Kong Unison

Ms Phyllis CHEUNG
Executive Director

Society for Community Integration

Ms Mandy CHEUK
Project Officer

Ms Payal BISWAS

Mr Carlitos-L ESCUETA

Ms Margaret HOLMES

Ms Bushra KHALIQ

Ms Sirjana RAI

Equal Access Group

Ms Sujata TAMANG

Chinese as a Second Language Concern Group

Ms Kabir ASFA
Spokesperson

Parents Concern Group

Ms Dhessi Kiranjeet KAUR
Spokesperson

ToKwaWan Ekta Housing Concern Group

Mr Ali AMJAD
Spokesperson

Miss Malik ANSAH

Ms Abeer TAFAZZUL

Ms Trisha TRAN

Ms Kamajit KAUR

Equal Opportunities Commission

Mr HO Wing-keung
Senior Equal Opportunities Officer (EM Unit)

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Chief Council Secretary (2) 3

Staff in attendance : Miss Cindy HO
Senior Council Secretary (2) 3

Mr Dennis HO
Council Secretary (2) 3

Mrs Fonny TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2) 3

Action

I. Education for children of ethnic minorities – implementation progress of the "Chinese language as the second language" curriculum, placement of ethnic minority students and support measures to these students and to schools admitting them
[LC Paper No. CB(2)338/16-17(01)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex I**).

2. The Subcommittee received views from 27 deputations/individuals attending the meeting. The Subcommittee noted the following major views expressed by the deputations:

- (a) concern was raised as to whether the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" ("Learning Framework") was developed from the perspective of second language learners. Some deputations said that the Learning Framework was developed from the Chinese Language curriculum, which was developed for students whose mother tongue was Chinese and who were presumably proficient in Chinese. They considered that the Learning Framework did not help much to improve the quality of Chinese language learning for non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students. Deputations also remarked that the performance descriptors of the Learning Framework were unclear and there was a lack of detailed guidance on pedagogic methods and teaching materials under the Learning Framework. It was considered that there was a need for a more comprehensive "Learning Chinese as a second language curriculum" with clear and concrete targets, suitable teaching materials for NCS students and evaluation tools;
- (b) as NCS students' early start in learning the Chinese language would greatly facilitate their adaptation to mainstream curriculum and social integration, the Administration should look into the practice of individual kindergartens ("KGs") specifically those adopting Chinese proficiency as the admission criterion and take actions as appropriate;
- (c) deputations considered that NCS students would benefit more in Chinese language learning from an immersed Chinese language environment of the school and each school should provide an inclusive environment with Chinese speaking and NCS students studying together. The Administration was asked to address the

concern over high concentration of NCS students in a few schools by:

- strengthening dissemination of school information (e.g. number of teachers with professional training in teaching NCS students, learning and teaching modes and the availability of school-based support measures for teaching Chinese to NCS students) to ethnic minority parents to help them make informed school choice; and
 - publicizing to ethnic minority parents the list of secondary and primary schools (currently about 200) which were provided with the enhanced funding from \$800,000 to \$1,500,000 per year to support NCS students' learning of Chinese language with a view to widening ethnic minority parents' school choice.
- (d) there would be room for further improvements in the dissemination of information to ethnic minority parents (such as information on Student Financial Assistance Schemes) and in the communication between schools and ethnic minority parents. The language of schools' circular letters to parents should cater for the needs of ethnic minority parents, including those who were not conversant in English;
- (e) it was suggested that schools should be required to have a certain percentage of their teachers having relevant training to cater for NCS students' needs in learning the Chinese language as teaching second language learners required different skills. Some deputations also considered it necessary for teachers to receive cultural sensitivity training to have better understanding of racial diversity;
- (f) some deputations opined that the General Certificate of Secondary Education (Chinese) examination was equivalent to local primary two level. Such a low Chinese proficiency level would have an adverse impact on the employability of NCS students who were arranged to study for and take this examination;
- (g) concern was raised about the difference between the amount of the additional funding received by schools admitting 10 or more NCS students (from \$800,000 to \$1,500,000 per year) and schools admitting less than 10 (i.e. \$50,000). It was suggested that the amount of additional funding should be calculated on a pro-rata basis, taking into account the number of NCS students admitted; and

- (h) the Administration was requested to revisit the provision of school places for NCS students with special educational needs as at present there was only one special school for non-locals.

3. The Administration made the following major response:

- (a) a series of measures to support the learning and teaching of the Chinese language of NCS students had been implemented, including:
 - (i) implementing the Learning Framework in primary and secondary schools since the 2014-2015 school year. The Learning Framework was developed from the perspective of second language learners with a systematic set of learning targets, learning objectives and expected learning outcomes which were arranged in "small" steps at different learning stages in accordance with the curriculum. The Learning Framework was complemented by various supporting learning and teaching materials and teacher professional development programmes and catered for the different needs and aspirations of NCS students; and
 - (ii) continual promotion of early adaptation of NCS children to the local education system to ethnic minority parents through dissemination of relevant information (e.g. admission to primary and secondary one in public sector schools, Household Application for Student Financial Assistance Schemes, etc.) in English and Chinese as well as six major ethnic minority languages. KGs were required to provide information on their admission arrangements (including admission guidelines and application forms) in bilingual version. The Education Bureau ("EDB") would follow up with individual KGs for possible irregularities where necessary; and
- (b) the Learning Framework, which had been implemented for two years only since the 2014-2015 school year, would be reviewed in the light of its implementation. EDB would continue to organize diversified and progressively advanced professional development programmes to strengthen the capability of teachers in implementing the Learning Framework, and elements of cross-cultural understanding had been embedded into the programmes to enhance the cultural sensitivity of teachers. In

Admin

response to members' concerns, the Administration agreed to explore ways to encourage more teachers to enroll for the in-service training programmes on teaching Chinese language as a second language.

Motion

4. A motion (at **Annex II**) was moved by Ms Claudia MO at the meeting. The Chairman put the motion to vote. Seven members voted for the motion. No members voted against it and no members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was passed.

Admin

(Post-meeting note: A letter was sent to the Administration on 13 December 2016 requesting the Administration to provide a written response to the motion.)

II. Application for late membership

[LC Paper No. CB(2)245/16-17(01)]

5. Members accepted Mr Dennis KWOK's application for late membership.

III. Any other business

6. The Chairman reminded members that the next meeting would be held on 9 January 2017 at 2:30 pm. The Chairman proposed and members agreed to discuss employment support services for ethnic minorities at the next meeting.

7. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:21 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
7 March 2017

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities
on Monday, 12 December 2016, at 2:00 pm
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
<i>Agenda item I - Education for children of ethnic minorities – implementation progress of the "Chinese language as the second language" curriculum, placement of ethnic minority students and support measures to these students and to schools admitting them</i>			
000357 - 000722	Chairman	Opening remarks	
000723 - 001021	The Civic Party	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)366/16-17(01)]	
001022 - 001337	Mr MAK Ip-sing Member of Yuen Long District Council	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(01)]	
001338 - 001647	Oxfam Hong Kong	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(03)]	
001648 - 001954	Mr POON Wing-lok	Presentation of views	
001955 - 002241	LINK Centre	Presentation of views	
002242 - 002552	Hong Kong Community Network	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(04)]	
002553 - 002905	The Hong Kong Council of Social Service	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)416/16-17(01)]	
002906 - 003147	Miss Farah BEGUM	Presentation of views	
003148 - 003500	Hong Kong Professional Teachers' Union	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)338/16-17(03)]	
003501 - 003807	Dr WANG Danping	Presentation of views	
003808 - 004113	Catholic Diocese of HK Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon)	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(05)]	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
004114 - 004445	Hong Kong Unison	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(06)]	
004446 - 004755	Society for Community Integration	Presentation of views	
004756 - 005041	Ms Payal BISWAS	Presentation of views	
005042 - 005324	Mr Carlitos-L ESCUETA	Presentation of views	
005325 - 005641	Ms Margaret HOLMES	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)416/16-17(02)]	
005642 - 005903	Ms Bushra KHALIQ	Presentation of views	
005904 - 010544	Ms Sirjana RAI	Presentation of views	
010545 - 010751	Equal Access Group	Presentation of views	
010752 - 011121	Chinese as a Second Language Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)416/16-17(03)]	
011122 - 011539	Parents Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)416/16-17(03)]	
011540 - 012047	ToKwaWan Ekta Housing Concern Group	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)416/16-17(03)]	
012048 - 012532	Miss Malik ANSAH	Presentation of views	
012533 - 012824	Ms Abeer TAFAZZUL	Presentation of views	
012825 - 013133	Ms Trisha TRAN	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(07)]	
013134 - 013527	Ms Kamajit KAUR	Presentation of views	
013528 - 013839	Equal Opportunities Commission	Presentation of views [LC Paper No. CB(2)368/16-17(01)]	
<i>Break</i>			

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
014404 - 014832	Chairman Administration	The Administration's initial responses to the views and concerns expressed by the deputations	
014833 - 015134	Chairman Ms Claudia MO	Voting on a motion moved by Ms Claudia MO The Administration was requested to provide a written response to the motion.	Admin (Paragraph 4 of minutes)
015135 - 020006	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Dr Fernando CHEUNG Administration	<p>Ms Claudia MO and Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) to help non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students learn the Chinese language more effectively, the Administration should develop a "Learning Chinese as a second language curriculum" for NCS students with teaching materials, benchmarking and assessment criteria provided for teachers;</p> <p>(b) currently Jockey Club Sarah Roe School under the English Schools Foundation was the only special school in Hong Kong adopting English as the medium of instruction but the school fee was not affordable to many ethnic minority parents. They urged the Administration to provide more school places for NCS students with special educational needs ("SEN"). They pointed out that many NCS students with SEN were studying in mainstream schools or special schools adopting Chinese as the medium of instruction, and these students suffered from the language barrier in addition to their own disabilities;</p> <p>(c) Ms MO requested the Administration to consider making the part on Chinese literature of Paper One of the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education ("HKDSE") (Chinese Language) Examination optional for NCS students as suggested by the Equal Opportunities Commission [LC Paper No. CB(2)368/16-17(01)];</p> <p>(d) Dr CHEUNG pointed out that although the Education Bureau ("EDB") had translated the "Household Application for Student Financial Assistance Schemes" leaflet into six ethnic minority languages, according to a survey conducted by the Diocesan Pastoral Centre for Workers (Kowloon) [LC Paper No. CB(2)326/16-17(05)], only 5.94% of the ethnic minority respondents had obtained the leaflets in their first language from the school. He suggested that assistance should be provided (e.g. through the support services centres) to ethnic minority families in obtaining the relevant information and in completing the application forms; and</p> <p>(e) the Administration should note that the percentage of ethnic minority students admitted to universities was</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>disproportionately low compared with Chinese speaking students. Dr CHEUNG considered that if the "Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework" ("Learning Framework") was unable to help ethnic minority students learn the Chinese language more effectively, it would be very difficult for them to pursue further studies and seek employment, and their chance of upward mobility would become slim.</p> <p>The Administration responded that EDB would continue to evaluate the effectiveness of the support measures for NCS students (including the Learning Framework) and refine them as appropriate, with a view to facilitating NCS students' mastery of the Chinese language and integration into the community.</p>	
020007 - 020427	Chairman Mr Andrew WAN Administration	<p>Mr Andrew WAN expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) the Administration should consider the need for providing a "Learning Chinese as a second language" curriculum with assessment tools and suitable teaching materials and guidelines;</p> <p>(b) the Administration should explore ways to boost the enrolment rate of teachers for the in-service training programmes on teaching Chinese language as a second language; and</p> <p>(c) the difference between the amount of additional funding received by schools admitting 10 or more NCS students (from \$800,000 to \$1,500,000 per year) and schools admitting less than 10 (i.e. \$50,000) was considered unfair to the latter. For those schools admitting less than 10 NCS students, the amount of additional funding should be calculated on a pro-rata basis.</p> <p>The Administration stressed that the Learning Framework was developed from the perspective of second language learners and provided a systematic set of expected learning outcomes at different learning stages. In light of the different starting points for NCS students, their learning processes might vary and teachers should set progressive learning targets and expected learning outcomes of the NCS students according to the Learning Framework with the use of a "small-step" learning approach to enhance the learning effectiveness of NCS students in the Chinese language.</p>	
020428 - 020849	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration	<p>Mr CHU Hoi-dick expressed the following views:</p> <p>(a) he opined that the expected standard of the Chinese language acquired by NCS children who were born and brought up in</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		<p>Hong Kong should be on a par with that of their Chinese speaking counterparts through effective teaching and learning. He expressed concern about the lack of teaching materials as well as a holistic curriculum on learning Chinese as a second language, and pointed out that the Chinese textbooks were all written by native Chinese speakers for native Chinese learners; and</p> <p>(b) to prevent over-concentration of NCS students in the former so-called "designated schools", he suggested setting a certain ratio of NCS students to Chinese speaking students in each school.</p> <p>The Administration advised that having due regard to views of stakeholders, it was considered not pragmatic to set such a ratio. Like other parents, parents of NCS students might take into account various factors (e.g. the location of their residence) in choosing schools for their children. The Administration pointed out that EDB had been strongly encouraging parents of NCS students, through briefing sessions, Notes on How to Complete the "Application Form for Admission to Primary One", etc., to consider schools with an immersed Chinese language learning environment to facilitate their children's learning and mastery of the Chinese language.</p>	
020850 - 021313	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW Administration	<p>Mr Holden CHOW enquired whether the Administration would consider providing additional alternative Chinese language qualifications for NCS students, given that the HKDSE (Chinese Language) Examination was generally considered too difficult for NCS students while the level of the General Certificate of Secondary Education (Chinese) examination was considered too low.</p> <p>The Administration informed members that to provide an additional channel for NCS students fulfilling the specified circumstances to obtain an alternative Chinese language qualification to enhance their opportunities for further studies and employability, Applied Learning Chinese (for Non-Chinese Speaking Students) ("ApL(C)") courses pegged at the Qualifications Framework Levels One to Three had been provided starting from the 2014-2015 school year for NCS students at senior secondary levels with different needs and aspirations to articulate under the multiple pathways. ApL(C) consisted of practical elements which were linked to broad professional and vocational fields, and ApL(C) results were reported as "Attained" and "Attained with Distinction" in HKDSE. In response to Mr CHOW's further enquiry, the Administration advised that ApL(C) was a component of the senior secondary curriculum leading to HKDSE, and that NCS students might choose to sit for HKDSE (Chinese Language)</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s) / Discussion	Action required
		Examination or study ApL(C) courses having regard to their aptitudes and aspirations.	
021314 - 021738	Chairman Mr Andrew WAN Administration	<p>Mr Andrew WAN opined that schools admitting less than 10 NCS students still had to put in extra teaching resources for their NCS students and additional resources commensurate with the number of NCS students admitted should be provided for these schools. The Administration explained that the NCS students in schools admitting less than 10 NCS students would benefit from the immersed Chinese language environment of their schools and since the 2014-2015 school year, additional resources had been provided for implementation of school-based support measures (e.g. extended after-school Chinese learning activities to support their NCS students) to consolidate what their NCS students had learnt in classes.</p> <p>At the suggestion of Mr WAN, the Administration agreed to explore ways to encourage more teachers to enroll for the in-service training programmes on teaching Chinese language as a second language.</p>	Admin (Paragraph 3(b) of minutes)
<i>Agenda item II - Application for late membership</i>			
021739 - 021953	Chairman Mr Holden CHOW Mr Dennis KWOK	Mr Dennis KWOK's application for late membership was accepted.	
<i>Agenda item III - Any other business</i>			
021954 - 022052	Chairman	<p>Item for discussion item at next meeting</p> <p>Closing remarks</p>	

少數族裔權益事宜小組委員會

在2016年12月12日會議上就議程第I項

"少數族裔兒童的教育——'中文作為第二語言'課程的推行進展、少數族裔學生的入學情況，以及為該等學生和取錄該等學生的學校提供的支援措施"通過的議案

"本小組委員會促請政府當局，就'中國語文課程第二語言學習架構'制定客觀清晰的衡工量值指標，以監察其成效並提供改善方案。局方亦應為老師提供更多統一而合適的'學習架構'教材及指引，從而減輕老師不必要的行政負擔，專注做好課堂上的教與學。另外，教育局應收集及公開各中小學的非華語學生數據，以便學者、非政府組織及平機會等作跟進研究，確保局方倡議的融合教育得以有效落實，真正惠及非華語學生。"

動議人：毛孟靜議員

(Translation)

Subcommittee on Rights of Ethnic Minorities

Motion passed under agenda item I

"Education for children of ethnic minorities – implementation progress of the 'Chinese language as the second language' curriculum, placement of ethnic minority students and support measures to these students and to schools admitting them" at the meeting on 12 December 2016

"This Subcommittee urges the Administration to formulate a set of clear and objective value-for-money indicators for the 'Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Learning Framework' in order to monitor its effectiveness and provide improvement plans. In respect of the 'Learning Framework', the Education Bureau ("EDB") should also provide teachers with more unified and suitable teaching materials and guidelines to alleviate the unnecessary administrative burden on teachers, thereby allowing them to focus on bettering teaching and learning in class. Besides, EDB should collect and make public the data relating to non-Chinese speaking ("NCS") students in various primary and secondary schools to facilitate follow-up studies by academics, non-governmental organizations, the Equal Opportunities Commission, etc., so as to ensure that the approach of integrated education as advocated by EDB can be effectively implemented for the real benefit of NCS students."

Moved by : Hon Claudia MO