立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)617/17-18 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PL/EA

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Minutes of special meeting held on Monday, 29 May 2017, at 2:30 pm in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present: Hon Tanya CHAN (Chairman)

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP (Deputy Chairman)

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP Hon WONG Ting-kwong, SBS, JP Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP

Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP

Hon CHAN Chi-chuen Hon KWOK Wai-keung

Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP

Hon CHU Hoi-dick Hon HO Kai-ming Hon SHIU Ka-fai Hon HUI Chi-fung Hon KWONG Chun-yu

Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim

Members absent: Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP

Hon Kenneth LEUNG Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin

Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP

Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public Officers attending

For item I

Mr Donald NG

Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (4)

Environmental Protection Department

Mrs Alison LAU

Assistant Director (Special Duties) Environmental Protection Department

Mr Elvis AU, JP

Assistant Director (Nature Conservation and

Infrastructure Planning)

Environmental Protection Department

Mr WONG Hon-meng

Assistant Director (Waste Reduction and Recycling)

Environmental Protection Department

Mr CHEUNG Shing-hsi

Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Community

Relations)

Environmental Protection Department

Attendance by invitation

For Item I

Session one

The Civic Party

District Developer of the New Territories West

Mr SIN Ho-fai

The Youth Civic
Vice Chairperson
Mr Matthew WAN

Individual
Miss CHAO Suet-ying

New People's Party
Community Development Officer
Miss Dana LAU

<u>Democratic Party</u> Spokesperson Miss CHEUNG Kai-yin

Individual
Mr WONG Yue-hon

Chun Shing Development (Hong Kong) Limited and Hong Kong Scrap Plastic Association
Chun Shing - Founder and HKSPA - Vice Chairman
Mr Allan WONG

Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of
Hong Kong
Deputy Spokesperson on Policy
Mr LAU Chun-hoi

The Hiking Supplements
Spokesperson
Mr Ken LO

<u>Labour Party</u> Community Officer Mr CHIU Yan-loy

<u>Individual</u> Dr CHEN Chap-man

Individual
Miss KWAN Kit-man

Greeners Action
Assistant Project Manager
Miss YIP Chui-man

Council of Public Relations Firms of Hong Kong Ms Elizabeth FUNG

Hong Kong Catering Industry Association Vice President Mr TAM Tony

Environmental Association Research and Development Officer Mr Henry YAU

Eco Industry Labour Union Chairman Mr CHAN Pui-ho

The Conservancy Association
Campaign Manager
Mr NG Hei-man

Hong Kong Dumper Truck Drivers Association Chief Executive Mr CHAN Sam-choi

Individual
Professor POON Chi-sun

The Green Earth
Director of Environmental Advocacy
Mr CHU Hon-keung

Hong Kong Food and Environmental Hygiene
Department Staff Rights Union
Chairperson
Mr AU Pong-tim

Globalization Monitor
Chief Coordinator
Ms Rena LAU

Business Environment Council Limited Director, Environmental Management Mr LIN Chi-wai

Carboncare Innolab Project Officer Mr HON Chun-yin

Individual
Mr SO Cheuk-hei

Christian Family Service Centre Service Manager Mr CHAN Ngai-kan

Green Council Limited Senior Project Manager Mr CHOI Chun-pang

Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants & Related Trades
Limited
Vice Chairman
Mr LAM Kwok-leong

Session two

<u>Individual</u> Mr WONG Jor-ki

The Lion Rock Institute
Programme Director
Joe Chan

<u>Individual</u> Miss Lucia CHIU

The Hong Kong Institute of Housing President
Dr Johnnie Casire CHAN

Individual Mr CHIU Ka-wing

Environmental Contractors Management Association

President

Miss YAN Sui-han

Individual

Mr CHAN Kai-wai

Motor Transport Workers General Union (Truck Practitioners Branch)

Branch Director

Mr SIU Tak-hung

Individual

Miss LAM On-ki

Hong Kong Green Building Council (HKGBC)

HKGBC Director cum Chairman of Policy & Research Committee

Mr LEUNG Man-kit

Association of Restaurant Managers Limited

Chairman

Mr LEUNG Chi-wai

<u>Liberal Party</u>

Vice Party Chair

Mr LEE Chun-keung

<u>United Labour Chi Hong Association Limited — Community Recycling Centre</u>

Project Officer

Mr LI Chun-wai

World Green Organisation

Chief Executive Officer

Dr William YU

The Hong Kong General Union of Security and Property

Management Industry Employees

Chairman

Mr CHUNG Man-bun

The Hong Kong Chamber of Cleansing Contractors Limited Executive Secretary
Mr Jason YEUNG

Government Frontline Employees Union Vice Chairperson Ms CHAU Ling-wah

<u>Individual</u> Miss PANG Yuen-yi

Environmental Innovation Council Limited
Project Coordinator
Ms Yvonne LO

<u>關注家居照顧服務大聯盟</u> Miss LAU Oi-lam

<u>Individual</u> Miss MA Ka-po

121C Society for Recycling Chairman Mr CHAN Chit-kwai

<u>Individual</u> Ms Yolanda NG

Hong Kong Waste Disposal Industry Association Chairman Mr Thomas TAM

The Federation of Environmental and Hygienic Services
Executive Director
Mr Richard LAW

Session three

Hong Kong Recycle Materials and Re-production
Business General Association Limited
Mr YIP Man-ki

<u>Individual</u> Mr LAM Kai-sun Hong Kong Wastes and Recyclables Operators Network
Secretary
Mr LO Chi-chung

Friends of the Earth (HK)
Project Officer
Mr Chancy CHAN

The Hong Kong Association of Property Services Agents Chairman Mr POON Kin-leung

Hong Kong Waste Management Association
Vice Chairman
Mr Jude CHOW

<u>朱凱廸新西團隊屯門組</u> Member Mr Aaron TONG

Greenpeace
Senior Campaigner
Miss Katherine MA

<u>Cleaning Workers' Union</u> Organizer Miss LEUNG Wei-ching

The Hong Kong Green Strategy Alliance Mr CHAN K K

Food and Environmental Hygiene Department MOD 1
Staff Branch
Chairman
Mr CHAN Pok-yin

不是垃圾站

Member
Mr LEUNG Tak-ming

Hong Kong Cleaning Association Limited President Mr CHAN Kwok-fai **Island West Dynamic Movement**

Convenor

Mr Sam YIP

Sham Ching Youth Association

計劃主任

Mr FAN Lun-ming

北區婦女運動

Member

Ms HO Shu-yan

關注石湖墟婦女權益小組

Member

Ms ZHONG Caiqun

關注石湖墟婦女小組

Member

Ms SHI Yu-pei

新界福傳大使

Member

Mr TAM Nai-chun

北區就業問題關注組

Member

Ms YANG Fang

倩慧舍

Member

Mr KU Kwok-wo

新界外判清潔工關注組

Member

Mr LAM Kai-on

天主教勞工牧民中心 一 新界

Staff

Ms TSE Yuk-man

Individual

Ms YU Hin-pik

Clerk in : Ms Angel SHEK

attendance Chief Council Secretary (1)1

Staff in : Ms Anki NG

attendance Senior Council Secretary (1)1

Miss Mandy POON

Legislative Assistant (1)1

Action

1. Receiving public views on the proposed implementation arrangements for municipal solid waste charging

(LC Paper No. CB(1)697/16-17(01) —Administration's paper on "Implementation arrangements for

municipal solid waste charging"

LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(01) —Updated background brief on

"Introduction of municipal solid waste charging in Hong Kong" prepared by the Legislative

Council Secretariat)

Meeting with deputations/individuals and the Administration

Submissions from deputations/individuals not attending the meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(28) — Dr Winnie LAW, The University

of Hong Kong (English version

only)

LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(29) — Dr Billy C H HAU, The

University of Hong Kong

(English version only)

LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(30) — Professor Irene LO, The Hong

Kong University of Science and Technology (Chinese version

only)

- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(31) Hong Kong Environmental Protection and Recycle Industry Sustainable Development Association Limited (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(32) The Hongkong Federation of Youth Groups (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(34) Wisdom Regeneration (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(35) Community Leap (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(36) Miss Hilda MAK (English version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(37) The Hong Kong Association of Property Management Companies (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(38) Smart Governance Lab (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper Nos. CB(1)978/16-17(39) Green Sense (Chinese version and CB(1)1016/16-17(04) only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(40) 都市固體廢物收費計劃關注大聯盟 (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(41) Sik Sik Yuen (Chinese version only)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(14) Dr CHUNG Shan-shan (English version only)

Presentation of views by deputations/individuals

The Panel received views from a total of 78 deputations/individuals on the Government's proposed implementation arrangements for municipal solid waste ("MSW") charging. A summary of the views of these deputations/individuals is in the **Annex**.

(*Post-meeting note*: 14 submissions from deputations/individuals on the subject were received after the meeting. The submissions were circulated to members via email (LC Paper Nos. CB(1)1035/16-17(01) to (14)) on 31 May 2017.)

Administration's response to major issues raised

- 2. <u>The Deputy Director of Environmental Protection(4)</u> ("DDEP(4)") provided a consolidated response to the major issues raised by the deputations/individuals as follows
 - (a) since announcing the proposed implementation arrangements for MSW charging in March 2017, the Administration had been engaging different stakeholders to solicit their views relating to the proposed arrangements. Hong Kong had been lagging behind in introducing MSW charging when compared to neighbouring cities such as Seoul and Taipei City, and would need to expedite its work;
 - on recycling support, the Environmental Protection Department (b) ("EPD"), through the Environmental Campaign Committee ("ECC") and the Environment and Conservation Fund ("ECF"), had been providing recycling bins ("RBs") to different residential, commercial and industrial buildings. The programme currently covered over 80% of Hong Kong's population. With reference to experiences in other cities, the implementation of waste charging was usually accompanied by a reduction of the number of litter containers ("LCs") in public places to discourage abusive use of LCs to evade MSW The number of RBs would also be adjusted to enhance the RB to LC ratio. Based on a set of planning parameters as identified through a consultancy study, the number of LCs in public places would be gradually reduced by 40%. The current RB to LC ratio of 1:14 would be enhanced to 1:6 and the number of RBs in public places would be progressively increased by about 45% from 2 700 to 4 000 by the time when MSW charging was planned to take effect in 2019 at the earliest:

- (c) in enhancing the recycling of waste plastic bottles, EPD would strengthen promotional and educational efforts on clean recycling with a view to driving home the significance of keeping recyclables clean, which had an important bearing on their recycling value and recyclability. Outreaching service would also be provided to step up educational efforts on the ground, and render on-site assistance and support to the property management companies ("PMCs") and residents to practise proper waste source separation and clean recycling. On increasing the types and quantities of recyclables collected by the Community Green Stations ("CGSs"), EPD had been progressively developing CGSs in the 18 districts to reinforce environmental education at the community level and enhance assistance to local communities in the collection of recyclables, including electrical appliances and clothes;
- (d) as food waste constituted a high proportion of MSW, enhancing food waste recycling was therefore essential. The first Organic Resources Recovery Centre ("ORRC"), which was expected to commence operation in late 2017/early 2018, would have a daily treatment capacity of 200 tonnes of food waste, while the second ORRC, which was currently under tendering arrangements, would have a daily treatment capacity of 300 tonnes of food waste. The two ORRCs together could help reduce food waste disposed of at landfills by some 500 tonnes per day;
- to drive behavioural change through policies and legislation to reduce waste, plastic shopping bag ("PSB") levy had been extended to the entire retail sector in Hong Kong since April 2015 after its first introduction in 2009. The implementation of MSW charging would increase the amount of different recyclables that had to be properly While there was currently a good private collected and treated. market for higher-value recyclables (e.g. metal and paper), EPD had been progressively developing producer responsibility schemes ("PRSs") to provide closed-loop recycling systems with a view to turning specific low-value recyclables into reusable resources. In 2016, two pieces of enabling legislation for two PRSs targeting at waste electrical and electronic equipment and glass beverage containers had already been enacted. As announced in the 2017 Policy Address, the Government would commission a feasibility study on how to implement a PRS targeting at suitable plastic containers;

- (f) regarding compliance facilitation and enforcement, enforcement measures could be broadly divided into two phases. During the first six months after the commencement of MSW charging ("the phasing-in period"), the frontline staff of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") at the waste reception points would conduct visual screening to see if the waste handed over to them had been properly wrapped in designated garbage bags or affixed with oversized waste labels, and would reject any waste that did not comply with the requirements. Warnings would be given in non-compliant cases and enforcement actions would be taken in case the nature and magnitude of the offence called for enforcement. Based on the incident reports from the public and PMCs, a list of "black-spots" would be drawn up for conducting inspection and enforcement actions against offenders in private buildings. After the phasing-in period, strict enforcement actions would be taken and relevant manpower resources would also be increased to strengthen the taking of enforcement actions. Fixed penalty tickets at \$1,500 each would be issued to offenders intercepted on the spots. If a three-person household used a 10-litre designated garbage bag daily, they had to pay about \$30 per month for the MSW charges. Therefore, the penalty level would be equivalent to about three years' charging fee and should have provided sufficient deterrent effect;
- (g) on public education and publicity, experiences in other cities showed that public education was a key factor for the successful implementation of MSW charging. EPD would continue to consult various stakeholders on the implementation arrangements. To enhance public awareness and understanding, EPD would be mounting a major publicity campaign under the theme of "Dump Less, Save More" and would also collaborate with relevant organizations such as youth groups and schools in organizing various publicity and promotional activities.
- (h) while the responsibility to reduce waste should be shared by the whole community and exemption from MSW charging was not recommended, the Council for Sustainable Development ("SDC") recommended that the needs of people with financial hardship should be addressed. The Administration was discussing with relevant bureaux and departments ("B/Ds") with a view to striking a balance in achieving waste reduction through MSW charging while not creating undue financial burden on the disadvantaged groups; and

- (i) on the gate fee arrangement, some deputations were concerned that it might create cash flow and bad debt problems for private waste collectors ("PWCs") if their clients failed to repay them in time or refused to pay back the fee. The Administration would adopt an open attitude to consider other possible arrangements and measures, and continue discussion with the stakeholders concerned.
- 3. The Assistant Director (Waste Reduction and Recycling) supplemented that FEHD had a stringent contract management system in place to ensure that the recyclables collected at roadside were properly processed. To facilitate on-site monitoring, the contractor was required to use transparent plastic bags for collection of recyclables, and the bags should be printed with the words "used for collecting recyclables". The contractor was also required to nominate collection vehicles to transfer such recyclables to designated recycling fields but not landfills. Those collection vehicles had also installed Global Positioning Systems for tracking purposes. The contractor would provide monthly data to EPD and FEHD on the quantity and types of recyclables collected for monitoring purpose.

Discussion

Promotion of source separation and recycling of waste

- 4. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung considered that the existing support facilities for recycling were inadequate. He said that before the implementation of MSW charging, the Administration should provide adequate recycling facilities in the community to facilitate the public to separate waste (including food waste) at source and enhance the collection of recyclable materials. He noted that there were mixed views in the community towards the implementation of MSW charging. He enquired whether the Administration would take account of those views and reconsider the timetable for the implementation of MSW charging. DDEP(4) responded that the Administration fully recognized the importance of enhancing support for waste reduction and recycling to complement the implementation of MSW charging. Different recycling measures had been implemented and the Administration would continue to embark on new initiatives to promote recycling and reduction of waste.
- 5. Noting that a substantial amount of waste produced in households was food waste, Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired whether the Administration would consider providing designated food waste bags for recycling under MSW charging. He also requested for the reports and findings on the pilot scheme on MSW charging conducted by EPD in 2014, and the consultancy study on the land requirements of the recycling industry, which would facilitate the Government to formulate land

support measures for waste recovery and recycling activities, and review the tendering arrangement in letting out short-term tenancy sites.

6. The Assistant Director (Nature Conservation and Infrastructure Planning) responded that in 2015, the Administration conducted the "Food Waste Recycling in Housing Estates" programme by subsidizing housing estates to recycle food waste. As at May 2017, over \$30 million had been approved for funding applications from over 30 housing estates. Over 3 000 households from the approved housing estates had registered under the projects to process the source-separated food waste through the on-site food waste treatment facilities, and over 400 tonnes of food waste had been recycled. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration agreed to provide a written response on the measures taken or to be taken on promoting and implementing food waste recycling.

(*Post-meeting note*: The Administration's response was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1347/16-17(02) on 31 July 2017.)

7. <u>DDEP(4)</u> responded that EPD conducted a Pilot Scheme on MSW charging in seven housing estates in 2014 with a view to attaining a better understanding of the operational arrangements of the three different modes of quantity-based waste charging (i.e. "charging by the weight of waste disposed of by the building", "charging by the volume of waste disposed of by the building" and "charging by household using designated garbage bags"). The results showed that "charging by household using designated garbage bags" could better realize the "polluter-pays" principle and provide a stronger incentive to reduce waste. The reduction in waste under the Pilot Scheme was about 10% to 15%, even though no MSW charges had actually been imposed under the Scheme. At the request of the Chairman, the Administration agreed to provide a written response on the results and findings of the Pilot Scheme on MSW charging conducted by EPD in 2014.

(*Post-meeting note*: The Administration's response was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1347/16-17(02) on 31 July 2017.)

- 8. The Assistant Director (Waste Reduction and Recycling) advised that the consultancy study on the land requirements of the recycling industry was still in progress, and would take about three to six months to complete. The results of the study would be posted on EPD's website for public reference in due course.
- 9. <u>Dr YIU Chung-yim</u> said that majority of the deputations were of the view that more should be done to enhance the reduction and recovery of waste at source and to require manufacturers to take responsibility of recovering packaging materials of their products to avoid the excessive use of packaging materials.

1 1011111

Admii

<u>Dr YIU</u> and the <u>Deputy Chairman</u> asked whether the Administration would consider introducing a PRS on packaging materials so as to provide economic incentives to encourage manufacturers to recover and recycle the packaging materials of their products collected at retail outlets. <u>Mr CHU Hoi-dick</u> enquired about the implementation progress of various PRSs for different kinds of recyclable materials (including waste tyres, waste wood, packaging materials and rechargeable batteries etc) as set out in "Hong Kong: Blueprint for Sustainable Use of Resources 2013-2022".

- 10. <u>DDEP(4)</u> responded that EPD had been progressively developing PRSs to provide closed-loop recycling systems. The considerations for introducing a PRS on a particular type of materials included the estimated amount of reduced waste to be disposed of at landfills and whether the target products to be regulated could be clearly defined under the law. The Administration would commission a feasibility study on how to implement a PRS targeting at suitable plastic containers. Two pieces of enabling legislation for two PRSs targeting at waste electrical and electronic equipment and glass beverage containers had already been enacted in 2016. On measures to reduce excessive packaging, the Administration would enhance publicity on waste reduction at source, which was the policy objective for introducing MSW charging.
- 11. In response to Mr CHU Hoi-dick's enquiry, <u>Prof POON Chi-sun</u> responded that, in his view, implementing PRSs and increasing recycling facilities had long been considered necessary by the Administration, and the implementation of MSW charging would be the most effective means in driving behavioural changes in reducing waste and would provide incentives for producers, recyclers and the public to practise waste reduction at source. He considered that PRSs targeting at particular types of materials (such as plastic bottles and plastic bags) were only complementary measures.
- 12. Mr HUI Chi-fung, Dr YIU Chung-yim and Dr Elizabeth QUAT opined that the MSW charges collected should be ploughed back to an account designated for initiatives related to waste management and recycling. Mr HUI enquired about the revenue to be generated from the proposed MSW charging to the Government in the Administration's estimation, and in his view, the estimated revenue to be generated could be around \$1 billion per annum, which could be utilized for supporting the development of community recycling schemes and network, and providing enhanced support for local recycling industries (such as supporting research and development activities and introducing measures on tax and land concession). Dr QUAT urged the Administration to enhance efforts in promoting waste reduction at source and recycling of waste.

- 13. <u>DDEP(4)</u> responded that the MSW charging level was proposed to be set at \$0.11 per litre for designated garbage bags and the gate fee at \$365 or \$395 per tonne. As the charging mechanisms and the gate fee arrangement would be subject to further consideration by the Administration, it would be difficult to estimate at this stage the annual amount of MSW charges to be collected. The annual non-recurrent expenditure on environmental protection for waste collection and disposal was about \$2.7 billion, and for recycling was about \$1.3 billion. The Administration would seek additional resources for new initiatives related to waste management and recycling as might be required under the established mechanism.
- 14. <u>Dr Priscilla LEUNG</u> enquired about the efforts to be made by the Administration to assist the community, in particular the elderly, to practise waste source separation and food waste recycling. She also enquired about the specific measures for disposal and recycling of clinical waste. <u>DDEP(4)</u> responded that the Administration planned to strengthen its outreaching service to help step up education efforts on the ground and render on-site assistance and support to the community to practise proper waste source separation and clean recycling. On treatment of clinical waste, two sets of Code of Practice were issued by EPD to provide guidelines for proper handling and disposal of clinical waste by hospitals and private clinics.

Charging by designated garbage bags and gate fee

15. On the charging mechanism, Mr CHU Hoi-dick said that many deputations had expressed concerns on the proposed gate-fee arrangement which would require PWCs to pay the gate fee upfront and to apportion the charges amongst their clients, and enquired whether the Administration would consider adopting the charging mode of pre-paid designated garbage bags instead. DDEP(4) responded that the Administration proposed to adopt two primary charging arrangements for MSW charging, one was "charge by pre-paid designated garbage bags" which would mainly apply to residential households, and the other was "charge by a gate fee based on the weight of waste disposed of at landfills and refuse transfer stations", which would apply mainly to the commercial and industrial sectors. The Administration took note of the suggestion and would adopt an open attitude in the discussion with relevant stakeholders on how the arrangements could be modified.

Financial assistance to the needy

16. Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired about the measures to be taken by the Administration to relieve people with financial hardship of the burden of MSW charges, in particular whether any community funding schemes under non-government organizations would be available to assist the needy. DDEP(4) responded that while no exemption would be provided to the needy in relation to

MSW charges, the Administration was discussing with the relevant B/Ds with a view to addressing the needs of people with financial hardship, in particular recipients under the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") Scheme and elderly persons receiving Old Age Living Allowance as suggested by some deputations.

17. In response to Mr CHU Hoi-dick's enquiry, <u>Prof POON Chi-sun</u> said that he would incline to support any measures put forth by the Administration to address the needs of people with financial hardship (e.g. CSSA recipients) in this regard.

Offsetting of waste charges by corresponding reduction in rates

18. <u>Dr YIU Chung-yim</u> opined that consideration should be given to offsetting the MSW charges by a corresponding reduction in rates, and incentives should also be offered to encourage reduction in waste disposal. <u>DDEP(4)</u> responded that the MSW charges collected would form part of the Government's general revenue, which might be used for future environmental protection and recycling projects if necessary. Rates were one of Hong Kong's indirect taxes based on the rateable value of the properties, which were unrelated to the waste quantity disposed of from the property. In addition, rates had evolved over time and now formed part of the Government's general revenue without any specific relevance to the expenditures on waste collection and disposal. On offering incentives for waste reduction, measures such as offering coupons in community recycling projects had been initiated. Large scale incentive-offering scheme would not be appropriate as MSW charging was premised on the "polluter-pays" principle.

Enforcement measures

- 19. The Deputy Chairman, Dr YIU Chung-yim and Dr Elizabeth QUAT enquired about the possible difficulties encountered in taking enforcement actions in future against non-compliances with the requirements under MSW charging, and the relevant enforcement measures to be taken by the Administration to overcome those difficulties. Dr YIU enquired about the measures to be taken to combat illegal disposal of large quantity of waste by parallel traders in the Northern District. Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired about the number of additional staff required for taking enforcement actions against such disposal.
- 20. <u>DDEP(4)</u> responded that frontline staff of FEHD would conduct visual screening at the waste reception points and reject non-compliant waste. In addition, EPD and FEHD would, based on incident reports, conduct surveillance and enforcement actions at different waste reception points. The Administration would consider enhancing efforts in taking enforcement actions on individual

Action

Admin

floors of multi-storey buildings and at waste disposal "black-spots". The Administration would also develop good practice guides for reference by the relevant sectors. The number of additional staff required for taking enforcement actions would depend on the details of the implementation arrangements. At the request of Dr YIU Chung-yim, the <u>Administration</u> agreed to provide a written response on the possible difficulties in taking enforcement actions and the relevant measures to overcome those difficulties.

(*Post-meeting note*: The Administration's response was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1347/16-17(02) on 31 July 2017.)

Concluding remarks

21. The Chairman enquired about the timeframe for introducing the legislative proposal for MSW charging. DDEP(4) responded that the Administration would take into account views of the deputations and the stakeholders concerned, and refine where necessary the implementation arrangements for MSW charging. The Administration aimed at introducing the legislative proposal in the last quarter of 2017 as far as practicable, with a view to implementing the scheme in the second half of 2019 at the earliest.

II. Any other business

22. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 7:38 pm.

Council Business Division 1
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
23 February 2018

Panel on Environmental Affairs

Special meeting on Monday, 29 May 2017, at 2:30 pm in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Receiving public views on the proposed implementation arrangements for municipal solid waste charging

Summary of views and concerns expressed by deputations/individuals

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns	
Sess	ion One		
1.	The Civic Party	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(01)(Chinese version only)	
2.	The Youth Civic	 While the proposed charging level of the municipal solid waste ("MSW") charging scheme ("the Scheme") was generally acceptable to the public, the Administration should provide financial assistance to people with financial hardship and announce such details as early as possible. Expressed concerns about the manpower arrangements for taking enforcement actions against fly-tipping, and how enforcement actions would be taken against offenders in private residential buildings while minimizing unnecessary intrusion into the privacy of the individual households. 	
3.	Miss CHAO Suet-ying	 To prevent aggravation of fly-tipping as a result of MSW charging, the Administration should enhance measures to promote waste recycling and resource sharing in the community before implementing the Scheme. The Administration should subsidize the installation of more recycling facilities for different types of recyclables at residential buildings/estates. Monetary rewards should be offered to individual households to incentivize recycling and alleviate the financial impact of the Scheme on low-income households. 	
4.	New People's Party	 Supported in principle the introduction of MSW charging to reduce waste. Expressed concern about potential aggravation of fly-tipping in residential buildings/estates as a result of MSW charging, which might lead to environmental hygiene problems and disharmony among residents. The Administration should upgrade the capacities of waste separation and recycling facilities in residential buildings/estates before implementing the Scheme. 	

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
5.	Democratic Party	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(02)(Chinese version only)
6.	Mr WONG Yue-hon	 Expressed concerns about the manpower arrangements for enforcing MSW charging, and coordination between the Environmental Protection Department and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD") in carrying out enforcement actions. To facilitate enforcement actions, rewards should be offered to individuals who provided valid information on non-compliance to the authorities. The Administration should clarify whether the use of non-designated garbage bags would be an offence under the Scheme. The Administration should support the recycling industry in recycling domestic food waste.
7.	Chun Shing Development (Hong Kong) Limited and Hong Kong Scrap Plastic Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(02)(Chinese version only)
8.	Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong	 Supported in principle the introduction of MSW charging. The proposed charging level was too high for low-income households as well as small and medium-sized enterprises ("SMEs"). The Administration should consider granting exemption from MSW charging to recipients of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance ("CSSA") and senior citizens aged 65 or above. To assist individuals and SMEs in reducing waste and to complement the implementation of the Scheme, the Administration should provide more recycling facilities and upgrade the recycling network in the community. As a transitional arrangement, the Administration should provide designated garbage bags to the public free-of-charge in the first three years of the implementation of the Scheme.
9.	Labour Party	 Supported the implementation of the Scheme. Questioned the ability of the Administration to take enforcement actions against non-compliant waste producers in private residential buildings. As many recycling operators were reluctant to accept waste plastics collected in residential estates, the Administration should explore ways to tackle this problem.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns	
10.	Dr CHEN Chap-man	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(03)(English version only)	
11.	The Hiking Supplements	 Expressed concern about the financial burden that MSW charging would impose on the grassroots. A charging mechanism based on the weight of waste disposed of by individual households should be adopted for residential buildings/estates. 	
12.	Greeners Action	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(05)(Chinese version only) and LC Paper No. CB(1)1016/16-17(04)(Chinese version only)	
13.	Council of Public Relations Firms of Hong Kong	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(03)	
14.	Hong Kong Catering Industry Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)1016/16-17(01)(Chinese version only)	
15.	Environmental Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(07)(English version only)	
16.	Eco Industry Labour Union	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(08)(Chinese version only)	
17.	The Conservancy Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)1016/16-17(04)(Chinese version only)	
18.	Miss KWAN Kit-man	 Expressed concerns about the financial burden that MSW charging would impose on people with financial hardship; and that some recyclables collected by three-colour waste separation bins ("three-colour bins") were eventually landfilled. The designated garbage bags should be made of biodegradable plastics or other environment-friendly materials. 	
19.	Hong Kong Dumper Truck Drivers Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(09)(Chinese version only)	
20.	Professor POON Chi-sun	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(04)(English version only)	
21.	The Green Earth	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(33)(Chinese version only) and LC Paper No. CB(1)1016/16-17(04)(Chinese version only)	
22.	Hong Kong Food and Environmental Hygiene Department Staff Rights Union	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(05)(Chinese version only)	

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
23.	Globalization Monitor	 The Administration should put in place more effective measures, such as producer responsibility schemes ("PRSs"), to reduce waste generation and improve recycling rates before implementing the Scheme. The proposed MSW charges would be disproportionally heavy for low-income households. The Administration should focus on reducing MSW from commercial and industrial ("C&I") sources instead.
24.	Business Environment Council Limited	 Supported the introduction of MSW charging. The Administration should launch initiatives to boost the market demand for Hong Kong's recyclables. The designated garbage bags should be made of locally-recycled plastics to help achieve a circular economy. The Administration should clarify if the designated garbage bags would be biodegradable or merely "degradable".
25.	Carboncare Innolab	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(10)(Chinese version only)
26.	Mr SO Cheuk-hei	 Expressed concerns about the possible difficulties in enforcing against non-compliance and fly-tipping, and the inadequacy of existing measures to promote waste separation and recycling in Hong Kong. The sale of designated garbage bags by the Government was tantamount to competing with private garbage bag manufacturers/sellers for profits. The Administration should consider discontinuing MSW charging in future after attainment of certain targets in waste reduction.
27.	Christian Family Service Centre	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(06)(Chinese version only)
28.	Green Council Limited	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(11)(Chinese version only)
29.	Hong Kong Federation of Restaurants & Related Trades Limited	 The Administration should consider providing tax relief to the catering and related trades to offset MSW charges. The Administration should incentivize the installation of food waste treatment/recycling facilities in shopping centres to help reduce C&I food waste disposal, and establish regional recycling centres to facilitate food waste recycling. The designated garbage bags should be durable enough to prevent leaks.

	Name of	
No.	deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
Sessi	ion Two	
30.	Mr WONG Jor-ki	 Expressed concern about the financial burden that MSW charging would impose on people with financial hardship, especially senior citizens who were not CSSA recipients. The Administration should commission a study on the existing outlets and possible local use of different recyclables, with a view to improving relevant policy measures to boost recycling rates.
31.	The Lion Rock Institute	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(07)(Chinese version only)
32.	Miss Lucia CHIU	 A vast majority of domestic MSW could be recycled provided that suitable recycling facilities were accessible to individual households. Refuse Collection Points ("RCPs") should be retrofitted to serve the additional function of resource recovery. Expressed concern on the existing practice of separating waste and recyclables in medical institutions.
33.	The Hong Kong Institute of Housing	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(12)(Chinese version only)
34.	Mr CHIU Ka-wing	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(08)(Chinese version only)
35.	Environmental Contractors Management Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(13)(Chinese version only)
36.	Mr CHAN Kai-wai	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(09)(Chinese version only)
37.	Motor Transport Workers General Union (Truck Practitioners Branch)	 Objected to the proposed gate fee arrangement, under which private waste collectors ("PWCs") would have to pay the gate fee upfront for waste disposed of at landfills or refuse transfer stations. This arrangement would create cash flow and bad debt problems for PWCs if their clients delayed or defaulted on repayments. The Administration should construct more waste treatment facilities to turn waste into energy.
38.	Miss LAM On-ki	 To complement the implementation of the Scheme, the Administration should enhance its measures to promote recycling and provide more assistance to non-governmental organizations in launching recycling programmes. It should also expedite the implementation of initiatives to recycle domestic food waste. RCPs should be retrofitted to serve the additional functions of resource recovery and waste separation.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns		
39.	Hong Kong Green Building Council	 Supported the implementation of the Scheme. To complement the implementation of the Scheme, the Administration should strengthen public education on waste reduction and separation, and upgrade the recycling network in the community. MSW charges collected should be ploughed back to an account designated for recycling-related initiatives. The Administration should encourage the use of locally-recycled materials in Hong Kong to help achieve a circular economy, and expedite the construction and commissioning of Organic Waste Treatment Facilities. 		
40.	Association of Restaurant Managers Limited	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(14)(Chinese version only)		
41.	United Labour Chi Hong Association Limited — Community Recycling Centre	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(10)(Chinese version only)		
42.	World Green Organisation	 The Administration should implement the Scheme expeditiously and fine-tune it in the light of operational experience and problems encountered. A District Liaison Group should be established in each district to discuss the problems encountered and identify possible solutions. Each District Liaison Group might comprise representatives from the Administration, owners' corporations of buildings/estates, property management companies ("PMCs"), District Council and other stakeholders. 		
43.	The Hong Kong General Union of Security and Property Management Industry Employees	 The Administration should strengthen public education on MSW charging and proper disposal/separation of waste in general before implementing the Scheme. Expressed concern that MSW charging would aggravate fly-tipping in residential buildings/estates, especially in old buildings without a refuse storage room. The Administration should issue guidelines for PMCs and cleaning companies on how to handle waste disposed of by non-compliant waste producers. 		

	Name of	
No.	deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
44.	The Hong Kong Chamber of Cleansing Contractors Limited	 A single charging mechanism using pre-paid designated garbage bags and oversized waste labels should be adopted across-the-board to avoid confusion and the financial risk faced by PMCs under the proposed gate fee arrangement. The Administration should issue guidelines for PMCs and cleaning companies on how to handle waste disposed of by non-compliant waste producers.
45.	Government Frontline Employees Union	 Expressed concerns that the Scheme would increase the workload of frontline staff of FEHD and its contractors, and lead to more complaints against them from the general public. Expressed concern about the financial burden that MSW charging would impose on the grassroots. As the fee for handling waste was already included in the rent of public rental housing estates, the Scheme would lead to "double charging".
46.	Miss PANG Yuen-yi	 For the purpose of waste reduction, the Administration should put in place effective measures targeted at producers' responsibilities, consumers' responsibilities and recycling in a comprehensive manner. For instance, the Administration should mandate the use of recyclable materials by producers in certain products to facilitate recycling in the downstream. The Administration should ensure that there were sufficient recycling facilities in the community before implementing the Scheme. The report of the pilot scheme on MSW charging launched in 2014 in seven housing estates should be made available to the public for reference.
47.	Environmental Innovation Council Limited	• The Administration should enhance support for the recycling industry to ensure there would be adequate outlets for the increased amounts of recyclables after the implementation of the Scheme.
48.	關注家居照顧服務大聯 盟	 Expressed concern about the financial burden that MSW charging would impose on people with financial hardship, especially senior citizens who were not CSSA recipients. The Administration should offer exemption or reduced charging rates for institutions such as residential care homes for the elderly. Exemption should also be granted to people with disabilities who unavoidably produced a significant amount of clinical waste.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
49.	Miss MA Ka-po	 Supported the implementation of the Scheme. A single charging mechanism using pre-paid designated garbage bags and oversized waste labels should be adopted for all residential buildings/estates. The Administration should set up a dedicated office to take enforcement actions related to MSW charging, and conduct patrols in residential buildings and fly-tipping black spots on the streets. The Administration should expedite the implementation of PRSs for plastic bottles and packaging materials, and prohibit the use of microplastics and disposable tableware in Hong Kong.
50.	121C Society for Recycling	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(15)(Chinese version only)
51.	Ms Yolanda NG	 The Administration should set up a dedicated office to take enforcement actions related to MSW charging, and enhance public education on waste reduction. The opening hours and locations of RCPs and service hours of refuse collection vehicles should be reviewed to better cater for the needs of the public.
52.	Hong Kong Waste Disposal Industry Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(16)(Chinese version only)
53.	The Federation of Environmental and Hygienic Services	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(18)(Chinese version only)
54.	Liberal Party	 Objected to the implementation of the Scheme. Expressed concern about "double charging" as charges for waste collection had already been included in government rates. Expressed concerns about the possible difficulties in enforcing against non-compliance and fly-tipping, and the lack of outlets for local recyclables.
Sess	ion Three	
55.	Ms YU Hin-pik	 RCPs and other public facilities that were currently underutilized should be retrofitted to serve the additional function of resource recovery. The Administration should support programmes that promoted waste reduction and reuse in the community (such as waste-gift exchange programmes). The Administration should step up monitoring of cleaning companies' performance to ensure that recyclables collected in three-colour bins were not mishandled.

	Name of	
No.	deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
		Work related to waste management and recycling should be streamlined and undertaken by a single department.
56.	Hong Kong Recycle Materials and Re-production Business General Association Limited	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(17)(Chinese version only)
57.	Mr LAM Kai-sun	 Supported the implementation of the Scheme. A vast majority of domestic MSW could be recycled or reused provided that suitable recycling facilities were accessible to individual households and community resource sharing programmes were in place. The Administration should improve the management of three-colour bins to avoid mishandling so as to rebuild public confidence in them.
58.	Hong Kong Wastes and Recyclables Operators Network	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(19)(Chinese version only)
59.	Friends of the Earth (HK)	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(20)(Chinese version only)
60.	The Hong Kong Association of Property Services Agents	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(21)(Chinese version only)
61.	Hong Kong Waste Management Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)1016/16-17(03)(Chinese version only)
62.	朱凱廸新西團隊屯門組	 For the purpose of waste reduction, the Administration should put in place effective measures targeted at producers' responsibilities, consumers' responsibilities and recycling in a comprehensive manner. A basic waste disposal allowance should be set up under the Scheme such that an individual household would not need to pay any MSW charge if its daily MSW disposal amount was within a prescribed limit. The Administration should launch initiatives to upgrade the capabilities of the local recycling trade.
63.	Greenpeace	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(22)(Chinese version only)
64.	Cleaning Workers' Union	The Administration should increase the manpower of FEHD's frontline staff to cope with the additional workload arising from the implementation of the Scheme.

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
		 Guidelines should be issued to frontline staff of FEHD and its contractors on how to handle waste disposed of by non-compliant waste producers. The Administration should step up monitoring of cleaning contractors' performance to ensure that recyclables collected in three-colour bins were properly handled.
65.	The Hong Kong Green Strategy Alliance	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(11)(English version only)
66.	Food and Environmental Hygiene Department MOD 1 Staff Branch	 Expressed concern that MSW charging would aggravate fly-tipping, increase the workload of FEHD's frontline staff, and lead to more complaints against them from the general public. Expressed concern about "double charging" as charges for waste collection had already been included in government rates. Expressed disappointment about the lack of domestic food waste recycling facilities in the community and a PRS on packaging materials.
67.	不是垃圾站	 RCPs should be retrofitted to serve the additional functions of resource recovery and resource sharing. The Administration should launch a pilot scheme in this regard. The Administration should provide affordable land for the development of the local recycling industry, and made available to the public the report of its study on land requirement for supporting the recycling industry.
68.	Hong Kong Cleaning Association Limited	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(27)(Chinese version only)
69.	Island West Dynamic Movement	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(25)(Chinese version only)
70.	Sham Ching Youth Association	LC Paper No. CB(1)978/16-17(26)(Chinese version only)
71.	北區婦女運動	LC Paper No. CB(1)1035/16-17(13)(Chinese version only)
72.	關注石湖墟婦女權益小 組	 The small living space and hectic lifestyle of the grassroots in Hong Kong rendered it difficult for them to separate waste at home to facilitate recycling. Subdivided flat tenants, who needed to dispose of their waste in litter containers in public places due to space constraints in their living environment, would be

No.	Name of deputation/individual	Submission / Major views and concerns
		 inconvenienced by the reduction of the number of litter containers following the implementation of MSW charging. Expressed concern about the lack of outlets for local recyclables.
73.	新界福傳大使	 The implementation of MSW charging should be deferred until mandatory source separation of waste had been introduced by legislative means and the local recycling network had been expanded. The Administration should provide affordable land for the development of the local recycling industry.
74.	關注石湖墟婦女小組	 The hectic lifestyle of the grassroots in Hong Kong rendered it difficult for them to separate waste at home to facilitate recycling. The Administration should provide convenient recycling facilities for people with disabilities and senior citizens, and promote resource sharing in the community.
75.	北區就業問題關注組	 MSW charges collected should be invested into new social services for the grassroots. Exemption from MSW charging should be granted to people who were receiving various kinds of financial assistance from the Government, in addition to providing financial assistance for recipients of CSSA.
76.	倩慧舍	 Objected to the implementation of the Scheme. Expressed concern about "double charging" as charges for waste collection had already been included in government rates. The Administration should launch a PRS on packaging materials. Members of the public should be allowed to exchange recyclables for designated garbage bags without additional fees.
77.	新界外判清潔工關注組	 Expressed concern that MSW charging would aggravate fly-tipping, increase the workload and turnover of FEHD's frontline staff, and lead to more complaints against frontline staff from the general public. The Administration should explain how frontline staff of FEHD should handle waste disposed of by non-compliant waste producers.

No.	Name of deputation/individual		Submission / Major views and concerns
78.	天主教勞工牧民中心——新界	•	Expressed concern that MSW charging would aggravate fly-tipping, and increase the workload of the frontline staff of FEHD's contractors. Work related to waste management and recycling should
			be streamlined.

Council Business Division 1
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
23 February 2018