# 立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)240/16-17 (These minutes have been cleared with the Chairman)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

#### **Panel on Transport**

#### **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 18 November 2016, at 10:00 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

**Members present**: Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)

Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Deputy Chairman) Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon Claudia MO

Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP

Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Alvin YEUNG

Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH

Hon CHAN Chun-ying Hon Tanya CHAN

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP

Hon LUK Chung-hung Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim

**Members absent**: Hon CHU Hoi-dick

Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Hon YUNG Hoi-yan

Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP

Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung

**Clerk in attendance:** Ms Sophie LAU

Chief Council Secretary (4)6

**Staff in attendance :** Ms Macy NG

Senior Council Secretary (4)6

Miss Katherine CHAN Council Secretary (4)6

Ms Margie LI

Senior Legislative Assistant (4)3

Ms Emily LIU

Legislative Assistant (4)6

Miss Ariel SHUM Clerical Assistant (4)5

### Action

# I. Election of Chairman (and Deputy Chairman)

#### **Election of Chairman**

Mrs Regina IP, the member present who had the highest precedence presided over the election of the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") of the 2016-2017 session.

Mrs Regina IP called for nominations for the chairmanship of the Subcommittee.

2. <u>Mr CHAN Han-pan</u> nominated Mr Michael TIEN and the nomination was seconded by <u>Mr LAU Kwok-fan</u>. <u>Mr Michael TIEN</u> accepted the nomination. <u>Mr Alvin YEUNG</u> nominated Ms Tanya CHAN and the nomination was seconded by <u>Mr Jeremy TAM</u>. <u>Ms Tanya CHAN</u> accepted the nomination.

- 3. As there was no other nomination, <u>Mrs Regina IP</u> announced a vote by secret ballot. After all members had cast their votes, <u>Mrs Regina IP</u> invited Mr CHAN Han-pan and Mr Alvin YEUNG, who had nominated the candidates to monitor the counting of votes.
- 4. <u>Mrs Regina IP</u> announced that a total of 11 and 6 members voted for Mr Michael TIEN and Ms Tanya CHAN respectively. <u>Mrs Regina IP</u> declared Mr Michael TIEN elected as the Chairman of the Subcommittee of the 2016-2017 session. Mr TIEN then took the chair.

#### **Election of Deputy Chairman**

- 5. <u>The Chairman</u> called for nominations for the deputy chairmanship of the Subcommittee for the 2016-2017 session. <u>Mr CHAN Han-pan</u> nominated Mr LAU Kwok-fan and the nomination was seconded by <u>Mr Wilson OR</u>. <u>Mr LAU Kwok-fan</u> accepted the nomination. <u>Mr Jeremy TAM</u> nominated Ms Claudia MO and the nomination was seconded by <u>Ms Tanya CHAN</u>. <u>Ms Claudia MO</u> accepted the nomination.
- 6. As there was no other nomination, <u>the Chairman</u> announced a vote by secret ballot. After all members had cast their votes, <u>the Chairman</u> invited Mr CHAN Han-pan and Mr Jeremy TAM, who had nominated the candidates to monitor the counting of votes.
- 7. <u>The Chairman</u> announced that a total of 12 and 6 members voted for Mr LAU Kwok-fan and Ms Claudia MO respectively. <u>The Chairman</u> declared Mr LAU Kwok-fan elected as the Deputy Chairman of the Subcommittee for the 2016-2017 session.

# II. Proposed schedule of meetings for the 2016-2017 session

- 8. <u>Members</u> agreed that the bimonthly regular meetings of the Subcommittee would be held on the first Friday at 10:45 am. Special meetings would be held to discuss any urgent matters where necessary.
- 9. The Chairman remarked that the regular meeting in December 2016 was proposed to be held on 9 December 2016 as the first and second meetings were too close to each other, and the regular meeting in February 2017 was proposed to be rescheduled for 10 February 2017 as 3 February 2017 was close to the Chinese New Year Holidays. He also added that the regular meeting in April 2017 was proposed to be held on 28 April 2017 due to the clash with the Special Finance Committee meeting, Easter holiday and regular

meeting of the Panel on Transport. <u>Members</u> noted and endorsed the proposed meeting schedule which was tabled at the meeting.

(*Post-meeting note*: The meeting schedule of the Subcommittee was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)148/16-17 on 21 November 2016.)

#### III. Proposed items to be discussed at the next meeting

- 10. <u>The Subcommittee</u> deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
- 11. <u>Members</u> noted that the "List of issues suggested to be considered", the "List of follow-up actions" and the letter from Ms Tanya CHAN proposing to discuss the progress of the construction of the South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)") were tabled at the meeting.

(*Post-meeting note*: The "List of issues suggested to be considered", the "List of follow-up actions" and the letter from Ms Tanya CHAN were issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(4)142/16-17(01), (02) and (03) on 21 November 2016.)

12. <u>Members</u> then suggested items to be discussed at meetings of the 2016-2017 session.

#### Railway projects under construction

- 13. <u>Ms Tanya CHAN</u>, <u>Ms Claudia MO</u>, <u>Dr Elizabeth QUAT</u> and <u>Mr Wilson OR</u> expressed concern about the progress of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL"). <u>Ms CHAN</u> and <u>Ms MO</u> had concern over the estimated increase in the construction cost of the project and that of the conservation works arising from archaeological discoveries at To Kwa Wan Station. <u>Dr QUAT</u> also expressed concern about the project delay and cost overrun faced by SCL. <u>Ms CHAN</u>, <u>Ms MO</u> and <u>Dr QUAT</u> proposed discussing the progress of the construction of SCL at the next meeting.
- 14. <u>Ms Tanya CHAN</u> expressed concern over the commissioning date of SIL(E). Both <u>Ms CHAN</u> and <u>Ms Claudia MO</u> suggested discussing the construction of SIL(E) at the coming meeting. In addition, <u>Ms MO</u> enquired about the issue of the co-location of customs, immigration and quarantine facilities of the Mainland and the Hong Kong section ("HKS") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") as well as the

progress of the construction and financial situation of the project. She suggested discussing the construction of this railway project at the coming meeting.

15. Given that a number of railway projects suffered different degree of delay in construction and faced cost overrun, <u>Dr YIU Chung-yim</u> urged to introduce the appointment of independent surveyors to monitor the implementation of all local railway projects, in particular the arrangement of works contracts, cost and time control.

#### **Others**

- 16. <u>Mr CHAN Han-pan</u> urged the Administration to reconsider the proposal of constructing the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan (Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan Link) due to population growth and the latest development plans in the New Territories. Also, <u>Mr CHAN</u> and <u>the Deputy Chairman</u> were concerned about the detailed planning of the Northern Link, including the physical alignment, locations of stations and implementation progress. <u>Mr Wilson OR</u> expressed concern over the implementation details of the East Kowloon Line.
- 17. <u>Mr CHAN Han-pan</u> wished to discuss whether the Administration would consider constructing a light rail system to enhance the connectivity of Tung Chung with other places in Lantau or not.
- 18. Mr LUK Chung-hung raised to discuss the possibility of developing an elevated light rail system in the proposed Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area. Besides, in view of the implementation of a number of railway projects under planning, Mr LUK urged the Administration and the MTR Corporation Limited to examine the demand and supply of manpower resources and training up of different personnel for the overall railway network.
- 19. <u>Members</u> agreed to discuss the following items at the next meeting to be held on Friday, 9 December 2016 at 10:45 am:
  - (a) Progress update of the construction of HKS of XRL;
  - (b) Progress update of the construction of SCL; and
  - (c) Progress update of the construction of SIL(E) and the Kwun Tong Line Extension.

20. <u>The Chairman</u> suggested starting the next meeting earlier to allow sufficient time for discussion and the actual meeting time would be announced later. <u>Members</u> agreed.

# IV. Any other business

21. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:25 am.

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
5 December 2016

# **Panel on Transport**

# **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

#### Proceedings of the meeting on Friday, 18 November 2016, at 10:00 am in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required		
	Agenda Item I – Election of Chairman (and Deputy Chairman)				
000114 – 001627	Mrs Regina IP Mr CHAN Han-pan Mr LAU Kwok-fan Mr Michael TIEN Mr Alvin YEUNG Mr Jeremy TAM Ms Tanya CHAN Mr Wilson OR Ms Claudia MO	Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman.			
Agenda Ite	Agenda Item II – Proposed schedule of meetings for the 2016-2017 session				
001628 - 001805	Chairman	Discussion on the proposed schedule of meetings for the 2016-2017 session tabled at the meeting.			
Agenda Ite	em III – Proposed items t	o be discussed at the next meeting	1		
001806 – 001952	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN	The Chairman invited members' views on the proposed items to be discussed at meetings of the 2016-2017 session.  Ms CHAN suggested discussing the progress of the construction of the South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)") and the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL") at the coming meeting.			
001953 – 002053	Chairman Ms Claudia MO	Ms MO proposed discussing the progress of the construction of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link, SCL and SIL(E) at the next meeting.			
002054 - 002111	Chairman Dr Elizabeth QUAT	Dr QUAT suggested discussing the progress of the construction of SCL at the coming meeting.			
002112 - 002202	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr CHAN proposed urging the Administration to reconsider the proposal of constructing the Coastal Railway between Tuen Mun and Tsuen Wan (Tuen Mun to Tsuen Wan Link), and discussing the detailed planning of the Northern Link.			
002203 – 002320	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim	Dr YIU urged to introduce the appointment of independent surveyors to monitor the implementation of all local railway projects.			

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required		
002321 -	Chairman	Mr OR proposed discussing the progress of the			
002339	Mr Wilson OR	construction of SCL and the implementation details of the East Kowloon Line.			
002340 -	Chairman	The Deputy Chairman suggested discussing the			
002416	Deputy Chairman	detailed planning of the Northern Link.			
002417 -	Chairman	Mr LUK proposed discussing the development of			
002454	Mr LUK Chung-hung	an elevated light rail system in the proposed Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area, and the demand and supply of manpower resources and training up of different personnel for the overall railway network.			
002455 -	Chairman	Discussion items for the next meeting.			
002609	Ms Tanya CHAN				
Agenda Ite	Agenda Item IV – Any other business				
002610 – 002616	Chairman	Closing remarks.			

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
5 December 2016