

# 立法會

## *Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(4)864/16-17  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

### **Panel on Transport**

### **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

### **Minutes of special meeting on Tuesday, 17 January 2017, at 2:30 pm in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present :** Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, JP  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kiwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan  
Hon CHAN Chun-ying  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung  
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim
- Members attending :** Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP  
Hon KWOK Wai-keung  
Hon HUI Chi-fung

**Members absent** : Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai

**Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item I**

Mr Philip HAR  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)<sup>4</sup>  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Dr LEUNG Kin-man  
Assistant Director/Railways  
Electrical and Mechanical Services  
Department

Miss Rachel KWAN  
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Bus and  
Railway  
Transport Department

**Agenda item II**

Miss Crystal YIP  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)<sup>1</sup>  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Miss Rachel KWAN  
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Bus and  
Railway  
Transport Department

**Attendance by invitation : Agenda item I**

Mr Francis LI  
Chief of Operating  
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Terry WONG  
General Manager – Infrastructure Maintenance  
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Eric LEE  
Senior Manager – External Affairs  
MTR Corporation Limited

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Sophie LAU  
Chief Council Secretary (4)6

**Staff in attendance :** Miss Katherine CHAN  
Council Secretary (4)6

Ms Emily LIU  
Legislative Assistant (4)6

---

Action

**I. Power outage incident and other incidents involving station facilities occurred at the South Island Line (East)**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)416/16-17(01) - MTR Corporation Limited's paper on the power outage incident and other minor incidents involving station facilities occurred at the South Island Line

LC Paper No. CB(4)416/16-17(02) - Paper on the construction of the South Island Line (East) prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)

Action

LC Paper No. CB(4)374/16-17(01) - Joint letter from Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and Hon Tanya CHAN on the railway incidents of the South Island Line (East))

At the invitation of the Chairman, Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)4 ("PAS(T)4") briefed members on the power outage incident occurred at the South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)") on 29 December 2016. Chief of Operating of the MTR Corporation Limited ("CO/MTRCL"), with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)441/16-17(01)], then briefed members on the preliminary investigation results in respect of the incident, and follow-up measures undertaken by the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"). He informed members that MTRCL had set up an internal panel to conduct a review in collaboration with an independent expert, and would submit a report to the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department ("EMSD") upon completion of the review.

2. The Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Malfunctioning of Power Remote Control Device at Wong Chuk Hang Depot

3. Noting the preliminary investigation result that one of the wires was in poor contact at the terminal of the Power Remote Control ("PRC") Device at Wong Chuk Hang ("WCH") Depot, Ms Claudia MO asked if this problem should be attributed to quality issues or faulty wires. Mr CHAN Chun-ying asked if MTRCL had, after the incident, inspected all other PRC Devices of the same model along other railway lines to ensure their proper functioning. Mr YIU Si-wing asked if malfunctioning of similar systems had occurred before. Given that various facilities of five stations connecting to the malfunctioned PRC Device had been affected during the incident, members including Mr YIU, Mr CHAN Han-pan, Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and Mr Jeremy TAM urged MTRCL to review whether it was a design fault bundling facilities across different stations to the control of a single PRC Device, and consider segregating power control systems of different stations as appropriate.

4. General Manager – Infrastructure Maintenance of MTRCL ("GM/MTRCL") responded that similar incident involving PRC Devices had not happened before, and MTRCL had already conducted a thorough inspection of the existing 43 PRC Devices used along SIL(E) and other railway lines to ensure proper functioning of all such systems. While the preliminary investigation of the incident had revealed that the incident did not

Action

involve any quality issue related to the PRC Device concerned, the aforesaid internal panel would thoroughly look into the causes of the incident, and suggest improvement measures to avoid reoccurrence of similar incident. Among others, it would review the arrangement of connecting station facilities of various stations to one PRC Device, which was to allow staff to remotely control the switching of electrical devices of stations along SIL(E).

5. Ms Tanya CHAN asked when the internal panel's report on the MTRCL incident would be issued. On the request of the Chairman and Mr CHAN Han-pan, MTRCL confirmed that a report on the outcome of the internal panel's review would be submitted to EMSD. The Subcommittee would also be informed of the review outcome.

6. Dr KWOK Ka-ki queried if EMSD had exercised due diligence in inspecting, approving and monitoring the power systems of railway lines. He also urged the Administration to, in addition to the internal review being carried out by MTRCL, engage an independent expert to conduct a review on the incident.

7. In response, PAS(T)4 and Assistant Director/Railways of EMSD indicated that relevant government departments including EMSD were responsible for performing tests and inspections for different parts of the railway systems before commissioning; and being the department responsible for regulating and overseeing the safety of the railway systems, EMSD had set up relevant committees to invite participation of relevant departments including the Fire Services Department and the Police, etc., to consider and vet the design of railway systems, with a view to ensuring safety and security of the railway services. They further indicated that after the said incident, EMSD had immediately conducted an on-site inspection and closely monitored MTRCL's follow-up actions. It would also be responsible for reviewing MTRCL's report on the incident.

Impact on the Ship Impact Detection System at Ap Lei Chau Bridge section

8. Ms Claudia MO and Mr CHAN Han-pan sought clarifications about how the malfunctioning of the PRC Device in the incident had activated the safety protection device of the Ship Impact Detection System ("SIDS") at the Ap Lei Chau Bridge section. Ms MO questioned why there was a service delay of as long as 31 minutes for six train trips, despite the fact that MTRCL staff had already manually switched on the tripped circuit breakers of the power supply system about 16 minutes after the power outage.

Action

9. CO/MTRCL and GM/MTRCL explained that the power disruption triggered by the malfunctioned PRC Device had affected the normal functioning of SIDS at the Ap Lei Chau Bridge section and activated its safety protection mechanism. Trains were therefore prevented from entering that section. As a precautionary measure, operations staff of MTRCL had to conduct an inspection of the Ap Lei Chau Bridge according to established procedures. As such, corresponding deployment of train service was made, and six train trips on SIL(E) were thus affected, with the longest delay being 31 minutes during the incident.

10. Mr KWOK Wai-keung suggested introducing a progressive scale of penalties for service delays due to reoccurrence of similar incidents. PAS(T)4 responded that in accordance with the "Service Performance Arrangement" introduced in 2013 after the review of the Fare Adjustment Mechanism, MTRCL would pay proceeds, starting from \$1 million and subject to a maximum of \$15 million per incident, for service disruptions of 31 minutes or above caused by factors within MTRCL's control, such as equipment failure or human factors.

Contingency arrangements

11. Mr CHAN Chun-ying pointed out that the power outage incident had affected various types of essential facilities at five stations, including the lighting system of WCH Station and Lei Tung Station. He urged MTRCL to review the locations of emergency lighting at WCH Station and Lei Tung Station as some areas of the two stations were very dark during the incident. Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and Dr YIU Chung-yim shared similar concerns about the safe evacuation of passengers, including wheelchair users and persons with disabilities, as the lifts and/or escalators of the affected stations were temporarily out of service during the incident. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan said that some passengers were trapped inside the lifts. He also pointed out that public announcements about the service disruption at the station concourses were inadequate, and many passengers freely entered the affected stations via the entry/exit gates, which were being kept opened during the incident. Mr CHAN Han-pan pointed out that some frontline staff were unable to provide the latest information on the incident to the passengers. Given that SIL(E) was a Fully Automated Operation line, Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed concern about whether there were inadequate MTRCL staff to assist passengers in case of emergency.

12. CO/MTRCL indicated that backup power supply was activated during the incident to resume operations of major facilities as quickly as practicable and minimize service disruptions. Yet, the safety devices of some lifts and

Action

escalators had stopped them from operating due to the power dip occurred when interfacing with the backup power supply. When conducting the review of the incident, MTRCL's internal panel would take into account members' suggestions including reviewing the locations of the emergency lighting. That said, he stressed that MTRCL had put in place stringent contingency measures including evacuation procedures, and had conducted over a hundred drills and evacuation exercises for emergency situation before the opening of SIL(E) to ensure the effectiveness of the relevant procedures. The needs of wheelchair users and persons with disabilities were taken into account when planning the relevant procedures. During the power outage incident, MTRCL had provided latest train service information to passengers through various means, including public announcements in stations, on trains and via the MTR Mobile Apps. It would continue to review the existing arrangements from time to time, and make efforts in reducing inconvenience to passengers during incidents to the minimum.

MTRCL 13. At Dr YIU Chung-yim's request, CO/MTRCL agreed to provide supplementary information on the time required for activating the backup power supply systems; and whether the activation complied with the specified standard.

14. The Chairman considered it necessary for MTRCL to enhance its backup power supply systems to ensure uninterrupted power supply in case of main power outage. On his enquiry regarding why backup power supply was activated in certain but not all stations along SIL(E) during the power outage incident; and whether the contractor of the power supply system of each station was the same or not, MTRCL agreed to provide supplementary information for members' reference.

Testing and trial runs before commissioning of the South Island Line (East)

15. The Chairman asked about the standard duration for conducting tests and on-track trial runs before commissioning of new railway lines, such as for the West Island Line ("WIL") and Kwun Tong Line Extension ("KTE"), and whether that for SIL(E) had been shortened to meet the target opening time at the end of 2016. He queried why the problem of the PRC Device in question was not discovered during the trial runs.

16. CO/MTRCL advised that the trial run period for new railway lines, such as for WIL and KTE, was normally two months before commissioning, whereas it took three months for conducting trial runs for SIL(E).

Action

17. Mr Jeremy TAM enquired if similar power outage incidents had occurred during the testing and trial runs of SIL(E). Mr KWOK Wai-keung and Dr KWOK Ka-ki expressed disappointment about the service disruptions on the second day of opening of SIL(E) despite the long testing and trial run period. Mr KWOK Wai-keung also doubted that the testing and trial runs had put too much focus on the trains, while many defects of the ancillary facilities were not corrected. For example, he pointed out that the levels of the train and platform edges were not the same at Admiralty Station of SIL(E), which might pose safety problem to passengers. Ms Tanya CHAN also relayed the comments and suggestions of passengers and residents living nearby the South Horizons Station, including the need for additional signages at Exit C, and turning down the volume of the public announcement systems at the entrances/exits for less important announcements to minimize disturbance to the residents living nearby.

18. In reply, CO/MTRCL explained that MTRCL had already conducted lots of testing of SIL(E), including installation and interface tests commenced respectively in September and November 2015. He advised that in the course of testing and trial runs of SIL(E), MTRCL did not detect any problems in the power supply system. He said that during the early stage of the operation of a new railway line, operational hiccups might not be avoidable as it would take time for systems to run in. He indicated that MTRCL would take into account members' views and continue to make improvements to the operations of SIL(E).

Future development of the South Island Lines

19. Mr KWOK Wai-keung asked how MTRCL would substantiate the forecast daily patronage of SIL(E) of about 170 000, given that the daily patronage had merely reached 110 000 since its commissioning in December 2016. He observed that not many people in the district had chosen to use the feeder services for interchanging with SIL(E). Hence, he urged MTRCL to instead provide more fare concessions and promotional schemes to boost patronage of SIL(E). Ms Tanya CHAN, however, expressed concern that as SIL(E) was a medium system with small stations accommodating only three-car trains, this would limit the capacity of SIL(E) catering for the population growth in the district in future. Hence, she asked if the train frequency could be increased.

20. CO/MTRCL indicated that the current daily patronage of SIL(E) was in line with MTRCL's expectations. A stable growth in passenger numbers reaching some 170 000 passenger trips per day by 2031 was expected, given the competition edge of railway providing a reliable and faster transport



services with reduced and more predictable journey times unaffected by weather and traffic conditions. He further advised that the current train frequency of SIL(E) was approximately every 3.5 minutes per train during peak hours and approximately every 4.5 minutes per train during non-peak hours. The signalling system would be able to support higher train frequency in light of future growth in passenger numbers.

21. On Mr KWOK Wai-keung's further enquiry about the planning and implementation progress of SIL(West), PAS(T)4 advised that according to the Railway Development Strategy 2014, an indicative implementation window from 2021 to 2026 was recommended for the relevant planning, subject to the actual programme for the development and redevelopment of public housing in the Wah Fu area as well as the build-up of transport demand.

## **II. Public transport reorganization plan for the commissioning of the South Island Line (East)**

(LC Paper No. CB(4)416/16-17(03) - Administration's paper on the public transport reorganization plan for the commissioning of the South Island Line

LC Paper No. CB(4)403/16-17(01) - Administration's response to the letter from Hon Tanya CHAN on the public transport reorganization arrangement for the commissioning of the South Island Line (East)

LC Paper No. CB(4)318/16-17(01) - Letter from Hon Tanya CHAN on the public transport reorganization arrangement for the commissioning of the South Island Line (East)

LC Paper No. CB(4)416/16-17(02) - Paper on the construction of the South Island Line (East) prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)

Action

22. At the invitation of the Chairman, Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)<sup>1</sup> briefed members on the latest arrangements of the public transport reorganization plan ("the PT Plan") to tie in with the commissioning of SIL(E).

23. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Bus route reorganization

24. Mr Nathan LAW and Ms Tanya CHAN were concerned that the service adjustment or cancellation of bus routes under the PT Plan, and in particular those routes overlapping with the new railway lines but serving also other areas that remained outside of the railway catchment, would bring inconvenience to commuters in the districts concerned. Citing some bus routes to be adjusted under the PT Plan, such as Citybus route nos. 47P and 71, New World First Bus ("NWFB") route nos. 66, 78, 91, 94 and 94X, and Cross Harbour Route no. 671, they requested the Administration to holistically review the needs for bus services by the local communities concerned before finalizing the PT Plan.

25. Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Bus and Railway ("AC/B&R") explained that prior to the commissioning of SIL(E), the Transport Department ("TD") had consulted the Southern District Council on the PT Plan in May 2016. It conducted the first round of survey between October and December 2016 to gather the average occupancy rates during the peak hours of the affected routes under the PT Plan before the commissioning of SIL(E). Another round of survey would be conducted between 6 and 22 February 2017 (i.e. after the public and school holidays) for assessing the change in passengers' travelling pattern and demand for those routes. TD would then review whether to fine-tune the PT Plan or not with reference to the survey outcome, and would liaise with the Southern District Council before implementation. The Administration would seek to implement the PT Plan in phases within about six months after the commissioning of SIL(E). At the current stage, except for the service reduction of Citybus route no. 629 series serving visitors travelling to/from Ocean Park and Admiralty Station/Central due to a significant drop of patronage of about 87% after the commissioning of SIL(E), no adjustment had been introduced to other bus routes in relation to the commissioning of SIL(E) so far.

Action

26. Apart from conducting surveys, Dr YIU Chung-yim urged TD to consult local residents on the PT Plan with a view to better understanding their travelling needs, and introducing suitable bus and green minibus ("GMB") services connecting new railway stations and their peripheral areas.

27. AC/B&R stressed that apart from survey results, TD had also been canvassing the views of the local community through different channels and took them into account as appropriate. For example, TD had provided eight franchised bus and GMB feeder routes serving the new railway stations to facilitate access by residents in the Southern District starting from the first day of the commissioning of SIL(E) having regard to the views of the communities concerned.

28. Mr YIU Si-wing suggested redeploying the bus resources so saved from the reorganization of bus services for enhancing the bus services elsewhere, such as those for popular tourist spots, such as the Peak, Hollywood Road, Lan Kwai Fong and Lascar Row. He also hoped that the Administration would enhance the promotion of sightseeing bus routes to visitors.

29. AC/B&R said that TD and bus operators had taken into consideration the demand for bus services by tourists where appropriate in preparing and processing the annual Bus Route Planning Programmes. Meanwhile, bus operators had been operating bus routes serving popular tourist spots (such as NWFB routes nos. H1 and 15). TD would continue to work with bus operators to promote bus services to cater for tourists' needs as necessary.

Reorganization of other road-based transport services

30. Mr Frankie YICK relayed the trades' concerns about the impact of the commissioning of SIL(E) on GMBs, and urged the Administration to expedite the implementation of the PT Plan to deploy those GMBs serving routes with low patronage to routes with higher demand.

31. AC/B&R indicated that new GMB feeder routes connecting new railway stations had already been introduced to tie in with the commissioning of SIL(E). Although the overall utilization of these new routes was not high, this was not unusual at the early stage of commissioning and the passenger number was growing slightly with more commuters choosing the new feeder services for access to railway stations.

Action

**III. Any other business**

32. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4:26 pm.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
18 April 2017

## Panel on Transport

## Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the special meeting  
on Tuesday, 17 January 2017, at 2:30 pm  
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
<i>Agenda Item I – Power outage incident and other incidents involving station facilities occurred at the South Island Line (East)</i>			
000611 – 000910	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the power outage incident occurred at the South Island Line (East) ("SIL(E)") on 29 December 2016.	
000911 – 001943	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL")	With the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)441/16-17(01)], MTRCL briefed members on the preliminary investigation results of the cause of the incident, and follow-up actions taken by MTRCL.	
001944 – 002344	Chairman Mr CHAN Chun-ying MTRCL	Mr CHAN's views on the causes of the power outage incident and MTRCL's response.	
002345 – 002852	Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL	Ms MO's views on the causes of the power outage incident and MTRCL's response.	
002853 – 003516	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung Administration MTRCL	Mr KWOK's views on the testing and trial runs of SIL(E), patronage of SIL(E), "Service Performance Arrangement" and the implementation progress of the South Island Line (West), and the Administration/MTRCL's responses.	
003517 – 004009	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim MTRCL	Dr YIU's views on the contingency arrangement for the power outage incident and MTRCL's response.	MTRCL to provide supplementary information as detailed in paragraph 13 of the minutes.
004010 – 004736	Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration	Dr KWOK's views on the testing and trial runs of SIL(E) and operation of SIL(E), and the Administration's response.	
004737 – 005315	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN MTRCL	Ms CHAN's views on the causes of the power outage incident, operation of SIL(E) and patronage of SIL(E), and MTRCL's response.	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
005316 – 005755	Chairman Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan MTRCL	Mr CHEUNG's views on the contingency arrangement for the power outage incident and MTRCL's response.	
005756 – 010351	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration MTRCL	Mr YIU's views on the causes of the power outage incident and Administration/MTRCL's responses.	
010352 – 010940	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM MTRCL	Mr TAM's views on the causes of the power outage incident and testing and trial runs of SIL(E), and MTRCL's response.	
010941 – 011506	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan MTRCL	Mr CHAN's views on the causes of the power outage incident and the contingency arrangement, and MTRCL's response.	MTRCL to provide supplementary information as detailed in paragraph 5 of the minutes.
011507 – 011834	Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting MTRCL	Mr LAM's views on the causes of the power outage incident and the contingency arrangement, and MTRCL's response.	
011835 – 012348	Chairman MTRCL	The Chairman's views on the contingency arrangement for the power outage incident and testing and trial runs of SIL(E), and MTRCL's response.	MTRCL to provide supplementary information as detailed in paragraph 14 of the minutes.
012349 – 012658	Chairman Mr KWOK Wai-keung Administration MTRCL	Mr KWOK's views on the patronage of SIL(E) and the implementation progress of the South Island Line (West), and the Administration/MTRCL's responses.	
<i>Agenda Item II – Public transport reorganization plan for the commissioning of the South Island Line (East)</i>			
012659 – 013038	Chairman Administration	The Administration briefed members on the latest arrangements of the public transport reorganization plan ("the PT Plan") for the commissioning of SIL(E).	

<b>Time marker</b>	<b>Speaker</b>	<b>Subject(s)</b>	<b>Action required</b>
013039 – 013601	Chairman Mr Nathan LAW Administration	Mr LAW's views on the impact and implementation details of the PT Plan and methodology for analysis of the change in passengers' travelling pattern, and the Administration's response.	
013602 – 014211	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration	Ms CHAN's views on the impact and implementation details of the PT Plan and methodology for analysis of the change in passengers' travelling pattern, and the Administration's response.	
014212 – 014520	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim Administration	Dr YIU's views on the methodology for analysis of the change in passengers' travelling pattern and the Administration's response.	
014521 – 014945	Chairman Mr Frankie YICK Administration	Mr YICK's views on the impact and implementation details of the PT Plan and the Administration's response.	
014946 – 015438	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration	Mr YIU's views on the impact and implementation details of the PT Plan and the Administration's response.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Any other business</i>			
015439 – 015500	Chairman	Closing remarks.	