

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)119/17-18
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on
Friday, 28 April 2017, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

Members present : Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Nathan LAW Kwun-chung
Dr Hon YIU Chung-yim

Members attending : Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP

Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon KWONG Chun-yu

Members absent : Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, MH, JP
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai

[According to the Judgment of the Court of First Instance of the High Court on 14 July 2017, LEUNG Kwok-hung, Nathan LAW Kwun-chung, YIU Chung-yim and LAU Siu-lai have been disqualified from assuming the office of a member of the Legislative Council, and have vacated the same since 12 October 2016, and are not entitled to act as a member of the Legislative Council.]

Public officers attending : **Agenda item III**

Mr Andy CHAN, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)²

Mr Philip HAR
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)⁴

Miss Rachel KWAN
Assistant Commissioner/Bus & Railway
Transport Department

Dr LEUNG Kin-man, JP
Assistant Director/Railways
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Mr CHAN Chau-fat
Chief Engineer/Railways 1
Electrical and Mechanical Services
Department

Agenda item IV

Mr Andy CHAN, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)2

Mr Philip HAR
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)4

Mr Raymond CHENG Nim-tai
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7

Mr Anthony YUEN Woo-kok
Chief Engineer (Railway Development)1-3
Highways Department

Agenda item V

Mr Andy CHAN, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)2

Mr Philip HAR
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)4

Mr Donald LAM
Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)4B

**Attendance by
invitation** :

Agenda item III

Ms Linda SO
Corporate Affairs Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Adi LAU
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Francis LI
Chief of Operating
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Terry WONG
General Manager — Infrastructure Maintenance
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item IV

Ms Linda SO
Corporate Affairs Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Adi LAU
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Francis LI
Chief of Operating
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Ken WONG
General Manager — Projects
MTR Corporation Limited

Agenda item V

Ms Linda SO
Corporate Affairs Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Adi LAU
Operations Director
MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Francis LI
Chief of Operating
MTR Corporation Limited

Ms Barbara CHANG
Principal Legal Advisor — Operations
MTR Corporation Limited

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (4)6

Staff in attendance : Miss Katherine CHAN
Council Secretary (4)6

Ms Emily LIU
Legislative Assistant (4)6

Action

I. Information papers issued since the last regular meeting on 10 February 2017

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)556/16-17(01), - Letter from Hon LUK
CB(4)583/16-17(01) and Chung-hung on the fire
CB(4)701/16-17(01) incident at MTR train on
10 February 2017, letter
from Dr Hon Elizabeth
QUAT on issues relating to
the contingency
arrangements for major
railway incidents and the
Administration's response

LC Paper Nos. CB(4)618/16-17(01) - Letter from Hon YUNG
and CB(4)924/16-17(01) Hoi-yan on the service
disruption of the East Rail
Line on 21 February 2017
and the Administration's
response

LC Paper Nos. CB(4)663/16-17(01) - Joint letter from Dr Hon
and (02) and CB(4)697/16-17(01) KWOK Ka-ki, Hon Alvin
YEUNG and Hon Jeremy
TAM Man-ho and letter
from Hon CHU Hoi-dick
on issues relating to the

co-location of customs, immigration and quarantine facilities at the West Kowloon Terminus of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link and the Administration's response

LC Paper Nos. CB(4)693/16-17(01) - Letters dated 13 and 15
and CB(4)702/16-17(01) March 2017 respectively
from Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT and Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan on withdrawal of membership)

Members noted the above papers which had been issued since the last regular meeting of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") on 10 February 2017.

II. Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 2 June 2017

(LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(02) - List of follow-up actions)

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next regular meeting to be held on Friday, 2 June 2017:

(a) Progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong Section of ("HKS") the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL");

(b) Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link; and

(c) Manpower resources for railway services.

3. On Ms Tanya CHAN's enquiry regarding whether the Administration would give an account of the implementation of Hong Kong and Mainland customs, immigration and quarantine procedures for HKS of XRL at the next

regular meeting of the Subcommittee, Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)² responded that the Administration would make announcement in due course.

4. The Chairman suggested and members agreed to include the following items on the list of outstanding items for discussion by the Subcommittee:

- (a) feasibility of constructing a rail link between the proposed Tung Chung East Station and the existing Airport Station; and
- (b) feasibility of constructing a fully automatic operation railway system to connect the new development areas in New Territories West with the West Rail Line.

III. Service disruption of Kwun Tong Line on 10 April 2017

(LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(03) - MTR Corporation Limited's paper on the overhead line incident on MTR Kwun Tong Line on 10 April 2017

LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(04) - Paper on service disruption of Kwun Tong Line on 10 April 2017 and contingency arrangements for railway incidents by the MTR Corporation Limited prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (background brief))

5. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

6. The Administration/MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") was requested to:

- (a) explain why it had taken as long as two hours and 20 minutes to handle the incident, and whether the time could be shortened;
- (b) respond whether and how the Administration would explore with MTRCL and other public transport operators on opening up transport data; and

- (c) provide the recent turnover rate of MTRCL's rail maintenance staff.

(Post-meeting note: The Chinese version of the supplementary information was circulated vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1286/16-17(01) on 22 June 2017.)

IV. Progress update on enhancement of MTR station facilities

(LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(05) - MTR Corporation Limited's paper on the latest progress of enhancement of MTR station facilities

LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(06) - Paper on MTR station facilities prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief)

LC Paper No. CB(4)793/16-17(01) - Letter from Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun on the incident of flooding from a burst water pipe in the South Horizons Station on 14 February 2017

LC Paper Nos. CB(4)583/16-17(02) and CB(4)847/16-17(01) - Letter from Hon Tanya CHAN on issues relating to the contingency arrangements for major railway incidents and the Administration's response)

7. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).
8. The Administration/MTRCL was requested to:
- (a) advise whether MTRCL was required to pay land premium in respect of the shops inside new railway stations;
- (b) advise whether there was any plan for installing additional lifts at Kowloon Station and Austin Station to cope with the future

passenger flow arising from the developments in the area including the West Kowloon Cultural District; and

- (c) provide further information on the replacement of 160 chillers, including whether the new chillers were air-cooled or water-cooled, and how energy efficiency could be enhanced after the replacement.

(Post-meeting note: The Chinese version of the supplementary information for items (b) and (c) was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1286/16-17(01) on 22 June 2017.)

V. Report on the review of the Mass Transit Railway By-laws and Mass Transit Railway (North-West Railway) Bylaw

(LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(07) - MTR Corporation Limited's paper on the review of Mass Transit Railway By-laws and Mass Transit Railway (North-West Railway) Bylaw

LC Paper No. CB(4)890/16-17(08) - Paper on the review of the Mass Transit Railway By-laws and Mass Transit Railway (North-west Railway) Bylaw prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (updated background brief))

9. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

(At 1:06 pm, the Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes.)

VI. Any other business

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:41 pm.

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 28 April 2017, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I — Information papers issued since the last regular meeting on 10 February 2017</i>			
000330 – 000347	Chairman	Members noted the information papers issued since the last regular meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item II — Items for discussion at the next regular meeting on 2 June 2017</i>			
000348 – 000838	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration	Members agreed on the items for discussion at the next regular meeting, and the inclusion of two items on the list of outstanding items for discussion.	
<i>Agenda Item III — Service disruption of Kwun Tong Line on 10 April 2017</i>			
000839 – 003003	Chairman Administration MTR Corporation Limited("MTRCL")	Briefing by the Administration and MTRCL [LC Paper No. CB(4)948/16-17(01)]	
003004 – 003431	Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL	<p>Given that the faulty support components that had led to the incident of service disruption of Kwun Tong Line ("KTL") had yet to enter its aging cycle, Ms MO queried about:</p> <p>(a) the cause, other than aging, of the sudden loosening of the faulty support components; and</p> <p>(b) how MTRCL would ensure that similar problem would not occur to the 800 similar support components that were currently in use.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) the faulty support components were sent to an independent expert for laboratory examination to find out the cause of the damage. The examination was expected to complete in around two months; and</p> <p>(b) inspection of the 800 similar support components were conducted and it was confirmed that they were all in good conditions.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003432 – 003855	Chairman Deputy Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Deputy Chairman enquired about:</p> <p>(a) improvements to be made by MTRCL on its handling of railway incidents; and whether it would offer compensation to the affected passengers; and</p> <p>(b) whether the Administration would review the policy of using railway as the backbone of the public transport system and enhance other public transport services, in light of the inconvenience caused to a large number of commuters and the traffic standstill during serious railway service disruptions.</p> <p>MTRCL replied that:</p> <p>(a) having regard to the views collected from the affected passengers, MTRCL would seek improvements including enhancing the dissemination of train service information to passengers during service disruptions; and</p> <p>(b) under the Service Performance Arrangement, MTRCL would have to set aside an amount for this incident. The amount paid would be used for fare concessions. Given the large number of passengers affected, it was not practicable to compensate them individually.</p>	
003856 – 004318	Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting MTRCL	<p>Expressing grave concern that it had taken as long as 40 minutes before the passengers stranded on two affected trains were detrained, Mr LAM urged MTRCL to expedite detrainment, and install detectors to enable timely detection of irregularities in the railway network for taking prompt actions. He also considered that MTRCL should set out a chronology of events when reporting to members on railway incidents in future to facilitate understanding.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) after occurrence of the incident, the MTR Operations Control Centre ("OCC") had immediately arranged inspection and recovery according to established procedures. OCC made a number of attempts to resume power supply for the two affected trains to proceed to the platform for detrainment, but to no avail. In around 40 minutes after the incident had occurred, OCC decided to detrain the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>passengers of the two trains in accordance with the safety procedures; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL was conducting a review after the incident to explore room for improvement in its fault-finding method and procedures.</p>	
004319 – 004741	Chairman Mr LUK Chung-hung MTRCL	<p>Mr LUK declared that he was the Director-General of the Hong Kong Railway Employees Union. He asked about:</p> <p>(a) the frequency of conducting visual inspections and other inspections of the overhead lines; and whether the inspection and maintenance work was outsourced; and</p> <p>(b) the turnover rate of frontline maintenance staff; and whether MTRCL would input more manpower for carrying out inspection and maintenance work, and improve the remuneration package of frontline maintenance staff to retain those who were experienced in performing visual inspections.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) it had put in place stringent systems and procedures for regular inspection, maintenance and replacement of railway equipment, including overhead lines. Regular inspections of the overhead lines for mainlines were conducted every one to three months by using equipment; and close-up inspections and maintenance were conducted annually by maintenance staff using elevated platforms. The overhead lines inspection and maintenance work was not outsourced; and</p> <p>(b) the latest independent expert audit completed in November 2016 confirmed that the overall performance of MTRCL's asset management system, which covered its repair and maintenance work, satisfied international standards. The Corporation also placed importance on the training of maintenance staff.</p>	
004742 – 005139	Chairman Mr KWONG Chun-yu MTRCL	<p>Given that the faulty supporting components were inspected only three months before the incident and no irregularity were found, Mr KWONG urged MTRCL to look into the root cause of the damage, comprehensively review its maintenance procedures and implement improvement measures to avoid recurrence of similar incidents.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) it was conducting a detailed investigation of the incident, and had engaged an independent expert to examine the faulty supporting components; and</p> <p>(b) it would seek continuous enhancement in its maintenance work, including exploring the use of equipment for conducting rail inspections after normal train service hours.</p>	
005140 – 005547	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN MTRCL	<p>Ms CHAN considered that MTRCL should provide adequate train service information and instant updates via the MTR Mobile App and on its website during train service disruptions.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that once the service disruption of KTL was expected to cause a delay of eight minutes or more, it would inform relevant government departments. Passengers and the media would be informed of major service disruption through various channels according to the established procedures.</p> <p>At the request of Ms CHAN, the Administration agreed to provide supplementary information regarding whether and how it would explore with MTRCL and other public transport operators on opening up transport data.</p>	Admin (paragraph 6(b) of the minutes referred)
005548 – 010025	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM MTRCL	<p>Mr TAM was of the view that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL should disseminate train service information via various channels other than MTR Mobile App to reach out to most passengers, as some passengers were not using MTR Mobile App; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL should provide clearer information on free shuttle bus service and alternative public transport services available near the affected MTR stations.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) it had provided information on alternative public transport services, such as franchised bus routes, bus stop locations and free MTR shuttle bus boarding/alighting points on large information displays installed at the affected stations; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) additional station staff were deployed to provide necessary information and assistance to the affected passengers.	
010026 – 010511	Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Chairman opined that the overall handling of the incident by MTRCL, including the recovery measures taken, was unacceptable. He urged MTRCL to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) explain why it had taken as long as two hours and 20 minutes to resume service in the incident, and why it had not detrained passengers on the affected train while carrying out inspection in parallel; (b) seriously consider investing in a detection system to detect irregularities on all parts of the railway network, including the support components and overhead lines; and (c) as the overhead line system was prone to external damages, consider the adoption of a third rail system, like the one used in the Light Rail Transit of Singapore, for providing electric power to the railway through a semi-continuous rigid conductor placed alongside or between the rails of a railway track. <p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the process of resuming power supply for the trains stalled in the affected section to proceed to platforms for detraining the passengers had taken a relatively longer period of time, thus delaying the subsequent inspection to be carried out on track. The handling time was therefore prolonged. It would provide further details of the sequence of events as per the Chairman's request; (b) when an irregularity at a particular section was detected in the railway system, the safety protection system would be automatically triggered to stop the train service under the fail-safe design principle. Arrangements would be made for conducting inspection by maintenance staff; and (c) the third rail system could not be adopted for the railway system in Hong Kong, as the trains currently in operation were designed for use with an overhead line system. 	MTRCL (paragraph 6(a) of the minutes referred)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
010512 – 010920	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung MTRCL	<p>Mr LEUNG believed that MTRCL should have taken out liability insurance to cover indemnity associated with the occurrence of railway incidents. He also expressed the views that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) MTRCL should explore with the Innovation and Technology Bureau on the application of technology and big data on rail operations; and (b) the senior management of MTRCL should try to travel on MTR during peak hours to better understand the operations and the impact of railway incidents during the peak hour rushes. <p>MTRCL noted Mr LEUNG's views. At the request of Mr LEUNG, it agreed to provide supplementary information on the recent turnover rate of its maintenance staff.</p>	MTRCL (paragraph 6(c) of the minutes referred)
010921 – 011326	Chairman Ms YUNG Hoi-yan MTRCL	<p>Ms YUNG considered that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) MTRCL should make better use of advanced technology to improve the fault-finding method and procedures for overhead lines; and (b) MTRCL should review and expedite the process of detrainning passengers stranded in the cramped train compartments, and deploy more staff to provide assistance and distribute bottled water and towels to the stranded passengers. <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) it would actively explore the use of advanced technology in rail inspection and maintenance work; and (b) the back-up power supply had enabled continuous functioning of emergency lighting and ventilation system on the affected trains during the incident. It would explore if there was room for improvement in earlier detrainment and arrangement, including deploying more staff to assist the affected passengers. 	
011327 – 011739	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO referred to the service suspension of Tseung Kwan O Line and part of KTL in December 2013 which was caused by a broken fastening wire for an overhead line support bracket near Tiu Keng Leng Station. Expressing concern over yet another serious service disruption involving the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>overhead line system, Ir Dr LO suggested taking precautionary measures, such as installing additional support components.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that Ir Dr LO's views would be relayed to the responsible departments.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item IV — Progress update on enhancement of MTR station facilities</i>			
011740 – 013320	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>Briefing by the Administration and MTRCL [LC Paper No. CB(4)948/16-17(02)]</p> <p>On the Chairman's enquiry, the Administration advised that if members so requested, the Administration and MTRCL would be pleased to provide progress update on enhancement of MTR station facilities at an interval of every one or two years.</p>	
013321 – 013746	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	<p>Ir Dr LO expressed the views that:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL should expedite provision of public toilets at all stations; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL should consider setting up more living art stages at different MTR stations, in addition to the one at Hong Kong Station, with a view to promoting station art and providing more performance opportunities for professional and amateur performers. He declared that he had performed at the Living Art Stage at Hong Kong Station before.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) it would first accord priority to providing public toilets at 10 interchange stations. At stations without public toilets, passengers might approach station staff for using staff toilets if needed; and</p> <p>(b) it would actively consider Ir Dr LO's suggestion of setting up more living art stages at other MTR stations.</p>	
013747 – 014219	Chairman Mr Nathan LAW MTRCL	<p>Mr LAW enquired about:</p> <p>(a) the progress of any study conducted on the provision of free Wi-Fi service on board all MTR trains; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) whether the incident of flooding from a burst water pipe at the South Horizons Station on 14 February 2017 was caused by human error or design fault; and the reason why thinner fire resistance boards were used for constructing the roof of Entrance/Exit B of the station, yet no waterproof works had been carried out earlier.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) given the large volume of passengers of MTR, it was technically challenging to cope with the high loading demand if free Wi-Fi service was to be provided on board all MTR trains. It would need to further study the feasibility in this regard; and</p> <p>(b) given that the portion of Entrance/Exit B of South Horizons Station was located within a void surrounded by concrete structure for placing underground utilities underneath the road level, fire resistance boards were used for constructing its roof due to space constraint of the void. As the void was completely isolated, it was assessed that it would not be affected by underground water or rain. Due consideration was also given on the risk of water pipe leakage nearby at the design stage. After the incident, improvement works were carried out to strengthen the waterproof facilities at Entrance/Exit B.</p>	
014220 – 014631	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Ms CHAN was concerned about:</p> <p>(a) the interests of the residents of South Horizons as MTRCL promised only to ensure seven years of warranty of the underground utilities at Entrance/Exit B of the South Horizons Station in its easement; and</p> <p>(b) the lack of progress in providing breastfeeding rooms at MTR stations. She was discontented that MTRCL had been letting out station space for setting up MTR shops to earn rental income, but was unwilling to provide breastfeeding rooms.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) when planning for the provision of breastfeeding rooms, factors including the availability of space, and impact on passenger</p>	Admin (paragraph 8(a) of the minutes referred)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>flow and evacuation arrangements at stations would need to be fully taken into account; and</p> <p>(b) MTRCL would include breastfeeding rooms at new stations in the design and planning for future new railway lines in the Railway Development Strategy 2014 ("RDS 2014"). As for existing stations, it would first study the feasibility of providing breastfeeding rooms at interchange stations.</p> <p>On Ms CHAN's enquiry, the Administration agreed to supplement if MTRCL was required to pay land premium in respect of the shops inside new railway stations.</p>	
014632 – 015059	Chairman Dr Helena WONG MTRCL	<p>Dr WONG considered that as a breastfeeding room would not occupy much space, MTRCL should actively identify suitable space at each station for setting up a breastfeeding room.</p> <p>MTRCL reiterated that it would plan for the provision of breastfeeding rooms at stations of future new railway lines in RDS 2014, and study the feasibility of providing breastfeeding rooms at existing interchange stations first.</p> <p>On Dr WONG's further enquiry, it would supplement whether there was any plan for installing additional lifts at Kowloon Station and Austin Station to cope with the future passenger flow arising from the developments in the area including the West Kowloon Cultural District.</p>	MTRCL (paragraph 8(b) of the minutes referred)
015100 – 015502	Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL	<p>Ms MO enquired about:</p> <p>(a) whether breastfeeding within MTR premises would breach the Mass Transit Railway By-laws ("MTR By-laws"); and</p> <p>(b) whether and when MTRCL would install a passenger lift at Entrance/Exit A, or at a new entrance/exit of Mei Foo Station to enhance barrier-free access to the station.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) passengers who had to breastfeed their babies could contact station staff for arranging a suitable area for them; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) MTRCL had been studying different proposals of retrofitting a lift at or near Entrance/Exit A of Mei Foo Station taking into account various factors including technical feasibility. In the meantime, passengers could use the external lift at Entrance/Exit E which was not too far away from Entrance/Exit A.</p>	
<p>015503 – 015927</p>	<p>Chairman Mr LUK Chung- hung MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr LUK enquired about:</p> <p>(a) the plan and timetable for installing public toilets at all MTR stations;</p> <p>(b) whether MTRCL would designate areas inside MTR stations for passengers to consume food and drinks bought from MTR shops; and</p> <p>(c) the criteria and procedures for selecting artworks for displaying at MTR stations under the "art in station architecture" programme, and whether the artworks were mostly from local or overseas artists.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) as it would be more complicated taking forward retrofitting works for public toilets at existing stations that were in operation every day, it planned to start with 10 interchange stations with the retrofitting works targeted for completion by 2020;</p> <p>(b) given the high patronage of MTR service, consumption of any food or beverages within the paid area would not be allowed with a view to maintaining a safe, clean and comfortable travelling environment for passengers; and</p> <p>(c) the artworks displayed at MTR stations were created by both local and overseas artists, and selection was done having regard to the views of an advisory panel comprising MTRCL architects, external experts and artists including an expert from the Leisure and Cultural Services Department.</p>	
<p>015928 – 020338</p>	<p>Chairman MTRCL</p>	<p>The Chairman referred to the recent water leak incident in South Horizons Station and queried about:</p> <p>(a) the reasons for and considerations of deciding to use thinner fire resistance boards, instead of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>steel plates, for constructing the roof of Entrance/Exit B of South Horizons Station; and</p> <p>(b) whether MTRCL would accede to the requests of the residents of South Horizons for providing warranty for the water pipes at Entrance/Exit B for a reasonably longer period in its easement.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) given the isolated location of Entrance/Exit B within a void which was unaffected by underground water or rain, as well as the space constraint of that void, fire resistance boards were used for constructing the roof;</p> <p>(b) MTRCL was carrying out improvement works to further separate the structure of the station and other underground utilities, and apply water resistant coatings to the roof; and</p> <p>(c) MTRCL would further liaise with the residents of South Horizons with regard to their concerns over the warranty period of the underground utilities at Entrance/Exit B in the easement.</p>	
020339 – 020731	Chairman Mr HO Kai-ming MTRCL	<p>Mr HO pointed out that there was only a ramp installed at Entrance/Exit C of Lam Tin Station to enable barrier-free access to the station. Besides, it took over 30 minutes to walk from Entrance/Exit C to the residential housing estates, which were indeed closer to Entrance/Exit A, and along the way there was not any barrier-free access facility at some road crossings. Mr HO urged MTRCL to install a lift at Entrance/Exit A to enhance barrier-free access to the station.</p> <p>MTRCL explained that:</p> <p>(a) currently, all MTR stations were equipped with at least one barrier-free access facility to facilitate physically-challenged persons to enter or leave the stations. An access ramp was provided at Entrance/Exit C of Lam Tin Station for this purpose;</p> <p>(b) provision of barrier-free access facilities at other entrances/exits was not feasible due to technical constraints and complex land ownership issues; and</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(c) refurbishment of the escalators at Entrance/Exit A of Lam Tin Station would be carried out. MTRCL would closely monitor the work progress and impact on the passenger flow.	
020732 – 021124	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim MTRCL	<p>Dr YIU enquired about:</p> <p>(a) the provision of bicycle parking spaces next to MTR stations;</p> <p>(b) the interim measures for meeting the relevant need of some passengers before breastfeeding rooms were available at MTR stations; and</p> <p>(c) further details of the replacement of 160 chillers, including whether the new chillers were air-cooled or water-cooled, and how energy efficiency could be enhanced after the replacement.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) bicycle parking spaces were currently available in the vicinity of some MTR stations;</p> <p>(b) when planning for the provision of bicycle parking spaces near MTR stations, it had to take into account a number of factors, including space and environment constraints, and support from the Government;</p> <p>(c) passengers could contact station staff for assistance so that a suitable area would be arranged for them for breastfeeding; and</p> <p>(d) it would supplement further information on the details of the chiller replacement programme as per Dr YIU's request.</p>	MTRCL (paragraph 8(c) of the minutes referred)
<i>Agenda Item V— Report on the review of the Mass Transit Railway By-laws and Mass Transit Railway (North-West Railway) Bylaw</i>			
021125 – 022202	Chairman Administration MTRCL	Briefing by the Administration and MTRCL [LC Paper No. CB(4)948/16-17(03)]	
022203 – 022635	Chairman Mr James TO Administration	Mr TO was disappointed that the review of the MTR By-laws and Mass Transit Railway (North-West Railway) Bylaw ("hereinafter collectively referred to as "the two sets of bylaws") was unreasonably delayed for many years. Due to the delay, the public had been unfairly subject to	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>some obsolete regulations which in his views should be repealed or updated long ago. To name a few, he considered that the prohibition of loitering should be lifted, ringtones from incoming calls on mobile phones should be exempted from the restrictions on the play or use of devices that generated noises, the definition of "abusive language" should be refined, drinking of water should be allowed within the paid area, etc.</p> <p>In response, the Administration said that after consulting the Subcommittee, the Administration and MTRCL would proceed with the drafting of the relevant legislative amendments for submission to the Legislative Council. On Mr James TO's further enquiry, the Administration advised that the legislative amendments to the two sets of bylaws would be subject to approval by the Legislative Council.</p>	
022636 – 023042	Chairman Mr Alvin YEUNG MTRCL	<p>Mr YEUNG considered it unreasonable to require removal of a wheel before a bicycle could be brought into railway premises, and this was inconsistent with the Government's policy direction of promoting cycling as a means of green transportation. He further said that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the bare bicycle fork might pose safety risks to other passengers; (b) MTRCL should instead directly stipulate in the two sets of bylaws that cycling inside railway premises was prohibited; (c) MTRCL should allow passengers to carry bicycles without removing a wheel during non-peak hours on a trial basis; and (d) MTRCL should relax the existing restriction to allow passengers carrying bicycles to board and stay at both the first and last cars of the trains during non-peak hours. <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) given the high patronage of the railway service, careful consideration should be given so as not to cause inconvenience to other passengers while facilitating the carriage of bicycles by some passengers. As such, only folded bicycles or bicycles with a wheel removed were allowed inside railway premises; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(b) it would carefully study Mr YEUNG's suggestion of allowing passengers carrying bicycles without a wheel removed to board and stay at both the first and last cars of trains during non-peak hours.	
023043 – 023453	Chairman Mr Nathan LAW	<p>Mr LAW considered that:</p> <p>(a) the requirement of removing a wheel brought immense inconvenience to passengers carrying bicycles. MTRCL should play a role in facilitating the public to use bicycles for short-distance commuting or leisure purpose, and help promote a low-carbon lifestyle;</p> <p>(b) drinking of water should be allowed within the paid area. Even so, it was still easy for MTR enforcement staff to ascertain whether the passengers concerned were drinking water or other beverages. It was understandable that some passengers would need to drink water especially when they felt unwell;</p> <p>(c) as the relevant provisions in the two sets of bylaws that regulated passengers causing nuisance could already be applied on regulating the use of abusive language by passengers, duplicated provisions in the two sets of bylaws should be repealed; and</p> <p>(d) the proposed revision of the heading of "improper dressing" as "soiling of another person's clothing" should be carefully reviewed to avoid unnecessary disputes.</p> <p>MTRCL noted his views.</p>	
023454 – 023903	Chairman Dr YIU Chung-yim MTRCL	<p>Dr YIU expressed the views that:</p> <p>(a) the requirement of removing a bicycle wheel had caused much inconvenience to passengers carrying bicycles; and</p> <p>(b) it was only necessary to stipulate the prohibition of cycling inside MTR premises, but not necessary to require the removal of a bicycle wheel as a condition of carriage of bicycles in MTR premises.</p> <p>MTRCL reiterated that:</p> <p>(a) as the railway network was heavily used, it sought to facilitate the request for carriage of</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>bicycles into railway premises, while minimizing the impact on other MTR passengers; and</p> <p>(b) having considered various factors and views of stakeholders, MTRCL decided to let passengers bring a folded bicycle or a bicycle with a wheel removed on the railway as it would occupy less space. As this arrangement had been implemented effectively for some time, MTRCL would like to use this arrangement as a basis to set clear guidelines and regulations regarding the carriage of bicycles.</p>	
023904 – 024339	Chairman MTRCL	<p>The Chairman expressed the views that:</p> <p>(a) carriage of a bicycle without removing a wheel would occupy considerable space on train compartments and cause annoyance to other passengers, particularly during peak hours;</p> <p>(b) MTRCL could allow passengers carrying oversized musical instruments, bulky belongings like easels, and long objects such as fishing rods to board at the rear end of trains;</p> <p>(c) consumption of beverages should not be prohibited at platforms as some passengers, particularly those elderly passengers, might have the genuine need to drink water especially when they felt unwell. The Chairman declared that he was a Senior Citizen Card holder; and</p> <p>(d) MTRCL should consider relaxing the restriction on the consumption of beverages in the paid area to allow drinking bottled beverages with a screw cap, which would less likely spill over and make the places dirty.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <p>(a) it spared no effort to provide a safe, clean and comfortable travelling environment for passengers. To help achieve this, no person should consume any food or beverages including water within the paid area; and</p> <p>(b) it had carefully examined the request for allowing passengers to drink water in paid area. Yet, there were concerns over the impact on maintaining good hygiene and the difficulties in enforcement.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
024340 – 024730	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN MTRCL	<p>Ms CHAN was of the views that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) consumption of beverages held in proper containers, such as cups or tumblers with lids, should be allowed. It was the responsibility of MTRCL to overcome enforcement issues; (b) there was no need to stipulate the removal of a wheel as a bicycle carriage condition. A provision to prohibit cycling in railway premises should suffice; and (c) duplicated provisions on the use of abusive language within MTR premises in the two sets of bylaws should be repealed. It was however necessary to define clearly the differences between "abusive language" and "threatening language". <p>MTRCL noted Ms CHAN's views.</p>	
024731 – 025151	Chairman Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung	<p>Mr LEUNG expressed the views that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the meaning of "threatening, abusive, obscene or offensive language" should be clearly defined and differentiated; (b) MTRCL should allow passengers to carry bicycles without removing a wheel in the railway on a trial basis; (c) MTRCL should allow consumption of beverages, including water, in the paid area; and (d) to ensure sufficient space at station concourses for enabling a smooth flow of passengers, MTRCL should not convert a large part of the concourses as retail shops. 	
025152 – 025653	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM MTRCL	<p>Mr TAM pointed out that passengers were allowed to bring animals into railway premises in many cities. He considered that MTRCL should review and relax the relevant restrictions with reference to the practice in the railway system of other places, and consult passengers' views in this regard.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) some railway operators in overseas places also forbade passengers from bringing animals across railway premises; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(b) as the MTR system currently served more than five million passenger trips per day, it had to carefully consider the diverse views of passengers travelling on MTR on this matter.</p> <p>The Chairman decided that, in view of the insufficient meeting time, the motion raised by Dr YIU Chung-yim on this agenda item would be dealt with at the next regular meeting.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item VI — Any other business</i>			
025654 – 025657	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
27 October 2017