

**立法會**  
***Legislative Council***

LC Paper No. PWSC284/17-18  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/1(26)B

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee  
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 27<sup>th</sup> meeting  
held in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex  
on Monday, 28 May 2018, at 2:30 pm**

**Members present:**

Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP  
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP  
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP  
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP  
Hon HUI Chi-fung  
Hon LUK Chung-hung  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon KWONG Chun-yu  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Members absent:**

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon AU Nok-hin

**Public officers attending:**

Mr Raistlin LAU Chun, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) <sup>3</sup>
Mr HON Chi-keung, JP	Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)
Ms Selene TSOI Sze-long, JP	Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands) <sup>3</sup>

Mr Elvis AU Wai-kwong, JP	Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (1)
Ms Margaret HSIA Mai-chi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Dr Raymond SO Wai-man, BBS, JP	Under Secretary for Transport and Housing
Mr Tony LI Yeuk-yue	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) <sup>2</sup>
Mr TANG Wai-leung	Deputy Commissioner (Planning and Technical Services) Transport Department
Mr Wilson PANG Wai-shing	Assistant Commissioner (Technical Services) Transport Department
Mr Freeman WONG Wing-kwong	Chief Engineer (Traffic and Transport Survey) (Acting) Transport Department
Ms Shirley LEUNG Cheuk-lam	Senior Engineer (Survey and Projects) Transport Department
Mr Jack CHAN Jick-chi, JP	Under Secretary for Home Affairs
Ms Linda LAW Lai-tan	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (Recreation and Sport) <sup>2</sup>
Mrs Sylvia LAM YU Ka-wai, JP	Director of Architectural Services
Mr Edward TSE Cheong-wo	Project Director (3) Architectural Services Department
Mr Raymond LAU	Senior Project Manager 332 Architectural Services Department
Ms Jane AU YEUNG Lai-sze	Senior Project Manager 327 Architectural Services Department

Mr Gary WONG Shek-wah	Senior Project Manager 325 Architectural Services Department
Mr Anthony YOW Kin-fai	Senior Project Manager 328 Architectural Services Department
Mr Simon LIU Wai-shing	Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Leisure Services)3
Mrs Doris FOK LEE Sheung-ling	Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Leisure Services)1
Ms Linda CHEUNG Yuk-shan	Chief Executive Officer (Planning)2 Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Mr Michael CHIU Yat-on	Chief Executive Officer (Planning)1 Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Dr Christine CHOI Yuk-lin, JP	Under Secretary for Education
Mrs Elina CHAN	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education (Infrastructure and Research Support)
Mrs Gloria LI HO Suk-wa	Principal Inspector (Special Education Support )1 Education Bureau
Mr Derek TSANG	Senior Architect (School Improvement Works Section) Education Bureau
Mr Patrick SO	Building Services Engineer (School Improvement Works Section) Education Bureau
Mr Stephen IP Shing-tak	Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects) (Acting) Architectural Services Department
Mr Jacky WU Kwok-yuen	Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works)5
Mr Edwin TONG Ka-hung, JP	Director of Drainage Services

Mr TAI Wai-man	Chief Engineer (Project Management) Drainage Services Department
Mr CHOI Chun-ming	Chief Engineer (Consultants Management) Drainage Services Department
Mr CHAU Sai-wai	Deputy Director of Water Supplies (Acting)
Mr Joseph CHUNG Siu-wing	Chief Engineer (Development)2 Water Supplies Department
Ms Eugenia CHUNG Nga-chi, JP	Assistant Director of Home Affairs (2)
Mr Steve TSE Ling-chun, JP	District Officer (Kwun Tong) Home Affairs Department
Mr Rick CHAN Tin-chu, JP	District Officer (Wan Chai) Home Affairs Department
Mr Martin KWAN Wai-cheong	Chief Engineer (Works) Home Affairs Department
Mrs Alice CHING WOO Wai-ling	Chief Project Manager 303 Architectural Services Department
Mr Chris LIU Chi-ho	Chief Project Manager 302 Architectural Services Department
Ms LAI Mei-ling	Chief Leisure Manager (Kowloon) Leisure and Cultural Services Department
Ms Becky LEE Pui-ling	Chief Leisure Manager (Hong Kong East) (Acting) Leisure and Cultural Services Department

**Attendance by invitation:**

Mr Stephen NG Kam-chun, BBS, MH, JP	Chairman Wan Chai District Council
--	---------------------------------------

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Doris LO

Chief Council Secretary (1)2

**Staff in attendance:**

Mr Raymond CHOW

Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Ms Anki NG

Council Secretary (1)6

Ms Alice CHEUNG

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1

Miss Queenie LAM

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU

Legislative Assistant (1)2

Ms Christy YAU

Legislative Assistant (1)7

Ms Clara LO

Legislative Assistant (1)8

---

Action

The Chairman advised that there were five funding proposals on the agenda for the meeting, all of which were items carried over from the previous meeting of the Subcommittee. He reminded members that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP") of the Legislative Council ("LegCo"), they should disclose the nature of any direct or indirect pecuniary interests relating to the funding proposals under discussion at the meeting before they spoke on the proposals. He also drew members' attention to Rule 84 of RoP on voting in case of direct pecuniary interest.

**Head 706 – Highways**

**PWSC(2018-19)18    29TC    Installation of Additional Traffic Detectors, Speed Map Panel and Journey Time Indication Systems**

2. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)18, sought to upgrade 29TC to Category A at an estimated cost of \$262.7 million in money-of-the-day ("MOD") prices for installation of some 600 sets of traffic detectors on strategic routes (including 410 sets of video detectors, 20 sets of automatic licence plate recognition detectors and 170 sets of bluetooth detectors); provision of 16 new sets of Journey Time Indication Systems ("JTISs"); and enhancement of an existing Speed Map Panel. The Administration had consulted the Panel on Transport on the proposed works on 27 April 2018. Panel members supported the submission of the relevant funding proposal to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the Panel's discussion was tabled at the meeting.

Scope of the proposed project

3. The Deputy Chairman said that he supported the proposed works in principle. He enquired whether the proposed works were aimed at bringing the traffic detector coverage of strategic routes in Hong Kong from 80% to 100%. Deputy Commissioner (Planning and Technical Services), Transport Department ("DC(PTS)/TD"), replied in the affirmative.

4. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noticed that during its consultation with the Panel on Transport on the proposed works in April 2018, the Administration had stated in its discussion paper that some 520 sets of traffic detectors would be installed, a number different from the some 600 sets that were currently proposed. He enquired about the reason for deciding to install and the types of the 80 additional sets of traffic detectors.

5. Assistant Commissioner (Technical Services), Transport Department ("AC(TS)/TD"), replied that the Transport Department ("TD") had also consulted the views of District Councils ("DCs") on the proposed works alongside its consultation with the Panel on Transport. In view of the request for additional JTISs received during the consultation, TD decided to step up the provision of JTISs after consideration. To that end, about 80 additional sets of bluetooth detectors would be installed for computation of the average journey time on the road sections concerned for display on JTISs.

Operation of the traffic detectors and Journey Time Indication Systems

6. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired how the proposed bluetooth detectors could obtain sufficient data to work out the average vehicular speed and journey time, given that not all vehicles on the road were equipped with bluetooth devices or had them activated. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen also enquired about the operation of the bluetooth detectors and JTISs, and whether the journey time referred to the time required for a vehicle to travel from a point to another on a given road section.

7. AC(TS)/TD explained that overseas experience showed that bluetooth detectors and the associated systems could compute the average vehicular speed and journey time (i.e. the time required for a vehicle to travel from a point to another) on a particular road section as long as a certain proportion of vehicles had their bluetooth devices activated. The journey time would be displayed on JTISs.

8. Mr MA Fung-kwok enquired whether the proposed traffic detectors were akin to some road monitoring systems in the Mainland, which could

detect conditions on the road as well as the horn sounding of vehicles. DC(PTS)/TD said that the detectors could not detect the horn sounding of vehicles on the road.

Traffic data collected by traffic detectors

9. The Deputy Chairman noted that the proposed automatic licence plate recognition detectors would capture images for identification of licence plate numbers of vehicles on the road. Vehicle licence plate numbers would be cryptographically hashed before transmission, and then matched with TD's vehicle licensing system for identification of vehicle classes. The Deputy Chairman enquired: (a) whether the data could be restored after being hashed; (b) whether TD would save the images; (c) whether the aforesaid traffic detectors would be connected with other computer systems, whereby allowing access to data relating to personal data in those computer systems; and (d) whether the Administration would make open the traffic data collected by the traffic detectors.

10. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen was concerned about the data privacy issue that might possibly arise from the collection of vehicle data by traffic detectors. Mr CHAN enquired about the operation details of the automatic licence plate recognition detectors, including why licence plate numbers had to be captured for identification of vehicle classes, and whether the identification was done instantly and automatically. Mr CHAN also enquired whether the relevant government departments would use the automatic licence plate recognition detectors to track the locations of vehicles in the future, and whether the Administration would put the automatic licence plate recognition detectors into use only after it had obtained the consent of all motorists in Hong Kong.

11. Under Secretary for Transport and Housing, DC(PTS)/TD and AC(TS)/TD responded that in addition to being used for the purposes of automatic detection of traffic incidents and traffic management, the real-time traffic data collected by traffic detectors would also be made open for public reference and utilization through government websites and TD's mobile applications. As for the proposed automatic licence plate recognition detectors, the aim was to collect data on vehicle classes. The vehicle licence plate numbers analyzed from the images captured were cryptographically hashed, and then matched instantly with the vehicle licensing system for identification of the vehicle classes. The licence plate numbers could not be restored after being hashed. After use, the vehicle licence plate numbers and the images would be deleted immediately without being saved. Neither would those detectors be connected with other computer systems.

12. DC(PTS)/TD added that although the traffic detectors could detect vehicle sizes, data of licence plate numbers were still required for TD to identify the vehicle classes accurately through matching with the vehicle licensing system.

13. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noted that TD would release through its website the traffic data collected by traffic detectors after removing the personal data. He was concerned whether TD would maintain in its server a separate set of traffic data with the personal data retained, in addition to the set for public release on its website which had the personal data removed. DC(PTS)/TD stressed that TD used the same set of traffic data with personal data removed for both internal maintenance and public release.

14. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired whether the images captured by traffic detectors would be released on TD's website only in a low-resolution format. DC(PTS)/TD replied in the affirmative.

15. Mr Jeremy TAM and Mr Andrew WAN shared the concern about the data privacy issue arising from the use of traffic detectors. Mr Jeremy TAM enquired whether it was technically possible for the traffic detectors to capture high-resolution images; if so, whether TD would assign access rights to exercise control over the frontline operational staff/other relevant personnel who could capture and/or make record of the high-resolution images.

16. Mr Andrew WAN enquired whether the Administration proposed the immediate deletion of images and licence plate numbers captured by traffic detectors after use as per the mandatory requirement of relevant legislation, or merely as its administrative measure; if it was merely an administrative measure, whether other law enforcement agencies could access those information under a court order.

17. DC(PTS)/TD and Chief Engineer (Traffic and Transport Survey) (Acting), Transport Department, responded that the proposed traffic detectors were technically capable of capturing and making record of high-resolution images. However, TD would not make such an arrangement.

18. Senior Engineer (Survey and Projects), Transport Department ("SE(SP)/TD"), supplemented that licence plate numbers were analyzed automatically from the high-resolution images captured by the automatic licence plate recognition detectors, and then cryptographically hashed and matched with the vehicle licensing system. The images and licence plate numbers would be deleted automatically afterwards without leaving any record. In other words, no manual operation was involved in the entire

process. Neither could frontline operational staff access the high-resolution images.

19. DC(PTS)/TD further explained that TD had consulted the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data in compliance with the requirements of the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Cap. 486) ("PDPO"), and he reiterated that the data of the images captured and licence plate numbers would be deleted immediately after use.

20. Mr Jeremy TAM enquired whether TD, in the future event of receiving requests from law enforcement agencies (e.g. the Hong Kong Police Force) to make record of and hand over the traffic data collected by traffic detectors for purposes such as crime detection and investigation, could upgrade the function of the traffic detectors on its own to serve the request of those law enforcement agencies without the need of seeking endorsement of LegCo. The Deputy Chairman and Mr WU Chi-wai raised similar questions.

21. Regarding the traffic detectors currently in operation, Mr Andrew WAN enquired whether TD had deleted all the images captured in the past two years, and whether law enforcement agencies had requested access to those data.

22. DC(PTS)/TD said that TD had conducted privacy impact assessment to ensure that traffic detectors would be compliant with the privacy protection requirements. Furthermore, TD was required to handle all the personal data collected by traffic detectors (including those currently in operation) strictly in accordance with PDPO and TD's internal guidelines. As mentioned above, the traffic detectors would not make record of and save the images captured. As such, TD was unable to provide those images at the request of law enforcement agencies.

23. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen requested the Administration to advise whether the bluetooth detectors would make record of the Media Access Control ("MAC") addresses of bluetooth devices in vehicles, and when the relevant data would be deleted after they had been used by the authorities.

24. AC(TS)/TD indicated that the MAC addresses of bluetooth devices in vehicles would be deleted immediately after they were used by TD to generate data on the average vehicular speed and journey time on a particular road section.

25. Mr MA Fung-kwok pointed out that driving route navigation was available on many online maps. He enquired whether the relevant traffic

data were provided by TD. SE(SP)/TD said that the traffic data used by those online maps were collected by the software developers concerned, instead of being provided by TD.

26. There being no further questions from members on the item, the Chairman put the item to vote.

27. The item was voted on and endorsed. The Chairman consulted members on whether the item would require separate voting at the relevant meeting of the Finance Committee ("FC"). No member made such a request.

### **Head 703 – Buildings**

- PWSC(2018-19)22    288RS    Swimming pool complex and open space in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai**
- 275RS    Provision of heated pool at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex, Wong Tai Sin**
- 427RO    Open space in Area 47 and 48, North District**
- 433RO    Open space in Area 6, Tai Po**
- 291RS    Redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium – pre-construction activities**

28. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)22, sought to upgrade 288RS, 275RS, 427RO, 433RO and 291RS (part) to Category A at the respective estimated costs of \$1,336 million, \$576.5 million, \$123.7 million, \$93.8 million and \$45.4 million in MOD prices for the development of a swimming pool complex and open space in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai; the provision of a heated pool at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex, Wong Tai Sin; the development of open space in Area 47 and 48, North District; the development of open space in Area 6, Tai Po; and the pre-construction activities for the redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium respectively. The Administration had consulted the Panel on Home Affairs on the five projects on 23 April 2018. Panel members had no objection to the submission of the five funding proposals to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the Panel's discussion was tabled at the meeting.

### **288RS — Swimming pool complex and open space in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai**

29. Mr Andrew WAN expressed support for the development of the swimming pool complex and open space in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai. He was

concerned why the swimming pool complex was provided with an indoor heated training pool with the size of 25 metres ("m") x 25 m only, but not a standard-size 50 m x 25 m indoor swimming pool to meet the needs of winter swimmers.

30. Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Leisure Services)3 ("AD(LS)3/LCSD") explained that the proposed swimming pool complex in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai, was positioned as a district swimming pool complex. As such, it was equipped with a main outdoor pool that measured 50 m x 25 m and came with a spectator stand with a capacity of 700, fit for hosting swimming competitions and activities of local schools and sports organizations. The 25 m x 25 m indoor heated training pool was provided additionally in the proposed swimming pool complex having regard to the usage of the two existing public heated swimming pools in Yuen Long district (i.e. Yuen Long Swimming Pool and Ping Shan Tin Shui Wai Swimming Pool) and the needs of swimmers of different ages and skill levels.

31. Mr LUK Chung-hung was concerned that the development of the swimming pool complex in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai, had been delayed for a prolonged period. Mr LUK enquired about the actual construction period of the proposed works project; why the cost of works was planned to be phased up to 2025-2026; and whether the construction period could be shortened so that residents could enjoy the facilities as soon as possible.

32. Under Secretary for Home Affairs ("USHA") and Director of Architectural Services ("DArchS") responded that subject to the funding approval of FC, the Administration planned to commence construction in the fourth quarter of 2018 for completion in the third quarter of 2022. The Administration would look into the possibility of further shortening the construction period of the proposed works project. Moreover, the project expenditure was phased up to 2025-2026 because the Administration would settle the final account and release the retention money to the contractors only after confirming that all works requirements had been fulfilled.

33. Mr LUK Chung-hung suggested that street fitness facilities be provided in the landscaped area of Site A (i.e. the site earmarked for construction of the proposed swimming pool complex). The Administration undertook to consider Mr LUK's suggestion.

34. Dr CHENG Chung-tai pointed out that in the future, the new swimming pool complex was expected to attract many residents from the vicinity who would make their way by cycling. He enquired about the location and number of bicycle parking spaces within the boundary of the

swimming pool complex. Dr CHENG also asked why the Administration provided a community garden at Site A instead of more bicycle parking spaces.

35. USHA, DArchS and AD(LS)3/LCSD replied that the Administration would provide about 20 bicycle parking spaces within the boundary of the proposed swimming pool complex. Furthermore, a small number of bicycle parking spaces were available at the adjacent Tin Sau Road Park, in addition to some 860 bicycle parking spaces at other locations in the vicinity, such as Tin Sau and Tin Yat Light Rail Stations. In response to members' concern, the Administration would consider increasing the number of bicycle parking spaces within the boundary of the swimming pool complex without bringing any implications on the layout of the venue. In addition, the Administration planned the reprovisioning of a community garden under the proposed project because a community garden currently located within the proposed construction site was the only of its kind in Yuen Long district and immensely popular.

36. Mr CHU Hoi-dick pointed out that Site C of the proposed swimming pool complex was currently a vacant site available for free use by local residents. He was concerned about the many restrictions that would be imposed on users after the site had been developed into an open space and put under the management of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD"). Mr CHU also requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on the costs required for the construction works at Site C.

37. In response, USHA and AD(LS)3/LCSD said that Site C would be developed into a landscaped sitting-out area equipped with fitness facilities and open for public use. LCSD would manage the sitting-out area in accordance with the Pleasure Grounds Regulation (Cap. 132BC) on the premise that the activities of users should not cause any disturbances to other users. The Administration undertook to provide information on the costs required for the construction works at Site C after the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC252/17-18\(01\)](#) on 19 June 2018.)*

38. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether unisex toilets and changing rooms, and other facilities such as sundecks and sunbathing chairs would be provided at the proposed swimming pool complex in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai, and the modified Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex.

39. USHA replied that both swimming pool complexes would be equipped with unisex toilets and changing rooms. Moreover, six and four family changing rooms would be provided at the proposed swimming pool complex in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai, and the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex respectively. Assistant Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Leisure Services)1 ("AD(LS)1/LCSD") and AD(LS)3/LCSD added that swimmers might enjoy sunbathing in the outdoor areas of the two swimming pool complexes, and the Administration would consider providing sunbathing chairs at those locations.

40. Mr Jeremy TAM commended the Administration's effort to provide family changing rooms at the two swimming pool complexes and hoped that family changing rooms would also be provided at similar facilities to be constructed in future.

41. Mr CHU Hoi-dick said that some residents of Tin Shui Wai were concerned that while sites had been identified in the district for development of the proposed swimming pool complex and a Heritage Conservation and Resources Centre, the location for public market development was still pending confirmation. Mr CHU enquired about the location for public market development in Tin Shui Wai.

42. Referring to the Administration's supplementary information paper for the Subcommittee ([LC Paper No. PWSC218/17-18\(01\)](#)), USHA indicated that the land resources of the project site for the proposed swimming pool complex development had been put to optimal use. Surrounded by Tin Sau Road Park, Grandeur Terrace and the Light Rail and having no motorways for direct access by ordinary vehicles, Site A of the project, which was earmarked for construction of the swimming pool complex, was unable to meet the needs of frequent goods loading and unloading activities and thus not suitable for public market development. The Administration had been in a proactive search for other suitable locations for public market development in Tin Shui Wai.

275RS — Provision of heated pool at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex, Wong Tai Sin

43. Mr Jeremy TAM said that he supported the provision of a heated pool at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex. Noting that the Morse Park Swimming Pool would be closed for 15 months during the first phase of the proposed works, Mr TAM requested the Administration to ensure that the closure period of the swimming pool for carrying out the proposed works would be confined to one summer swimming season only.

44. DArchS replied that subject to FC's funding approval, the Administration planned to commence the first phase of works in the fourth quarter of 2018. As such, the Morse Park Swimming Pool would be closed for summer in 2019 and reopened in around April 2020 (i.e. before summer) after completion of the first phase of works.

45. Mr Wilson OR said that he supported the five proposed projects under PWSC(2018-19)22. As some members of the public were concerned about the closure of the Morse Park Swimming Pool for 15 months in order for works to be carried out, he enquired whether there was any alternative plan to minimize the impact on swimmers during this period, and whether the closure period could be shortened.

46. USHA and DArchS responded that the proposed project of the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex would be delivered in two phases to minimize the impact of the works on swimmers. As mentioned above, the Morse Park Swimming Pool would be closed for 15 months in the first phase for works to be carried out in the main switch room and for renovation of the existing pool facilities. During this period, swimmers would need to go to the Hammer Hill Road Swimming Pool or Kowloon Tsai Swimming Pool instead. Mr Wilson OR requested the Administration to give a written account of the measures it would take to ensure the timely re-opening of the main pool, diving pool and teaching pool at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex in around April 2020.

*(Post-meeting note: The written response provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC252/17-18\(01\)](#) on 19 June 2018.)*

47. Mr HO Kai-ming said that he supported the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex project. He was concerned whether the works would include improvement of the working environment of lifeguards by, for instance, improving the design of lifeguard stands in light of the need for lifeguards to work long hours in hot weather, so as to retain the lifeguard manpower.

48. AD(LS)1/LCSD replied that the scope of works for the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex included the provision of a staff rest room to improve the working environment of the pool staff. Besides, electric fans would be retrofitted at lifeguard stands. Lifeguards on duty at lifeguard stands would change shifts every 30 minutes. The Administration would also consider other measures that could further improve the working environment of lifeguards.

49. Mr Jeremy TAM was concerned whether the Administration would take the opportunity of this project at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex to upgrade the existing main pool for it to meet international standards and retrofit additional facilities for water quality improvement.

50. AD(LS)1/LCSD and Project Director (3), Architectural Services Department ("PD(3)/ArchSD"), explained that the proposed project sought to construct a new heated indoor secondary pool and a new outdoor children's pool at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex. New filtration plants would be provided for these new pools but the scope of the proposed project did not include enhancement of the facilities and filtration plant of the existing main pool.

51. Mr Jeremy TAM enquired whether parking spaces were provided at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex, such as parking spaces for coaches carrying students to attend swimming galas at the swimming pool.

52. USHA said that although parking spaces were not provided at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex, coaches were allowed to pick up and drop off students there. A large number of parking spaces were provided at the adjacent Temple Mall South and Temple Mall North. On the other hand, the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex was easily accessible as swimmers could travel to the swimming pool by MTR via Wong Tai Sin Station or by many bus and minibus routes. Residents nearby could also reach the swimming pool by various pedestrian walkways.

53. Referring to the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex and the open space in Area 47 and 48, North District, as examples, Ms Claudia MO noticed that consultants' fees for contract administration and management of resident site staff were payable to the engineering consultants for these works projects. She enquired about the duties of the engineering consultants in the course of the main works other than their participation in the pre-construction activities of the projects; and whether the Administration would adopt the tendering practice of "the lowest bidder wins" in the selection of engineering consultants.

54. Mr Wilson OR opined that the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") already had in-house professionals to conduct studies on various projects and also design and supervise the relevant works. Mr OR noted that the consultants' fees accounted for \$10 million in the total cost of \$576.5 million for the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex project, whereas for 291RS (i.e. redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium — pre-construction activities) which cost \$45.4 million, the fees payable to the engineering consultant for design and preparation of tender documents amounted to

\$35.9 million. He enquired about the reason for the great disparity in the proportion of consultants' fees in the project cost between the two projects, and the respective scopes of duties of ArchSD and the engineering consultants under the two projects.

55. DArchS responded that the Government would invite tenders for the construction contract of the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex subject to FC's funding approval. The engineering consultant engaged would be tasked with, among other things, assisting the Administration in evaluating the tenders, monitoring the delivery of contract terms by the contractors (i.e. contract administration), and management of the resident site staff. The engineering consultancy contract was awarded by way of open tendering in accordance with the Stores and Procurement Regulations, and a "two-envelope" bidding system was adopted whereby the technical proposal and tender price proposal would be assessed. ArchSD would be responsible for project management, which included coordination with different government departments, such as assisting in the submission of proposals on the areas to be occupied by various facilities at the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex after completion of the works for approval by the Property Vetting Committee. At the request of Mr Wilson OR, the Administration would give a written account of the respective scopes of duties of ArchSD and the engineering consultant under the Morse Park Swimming Pool Complex project after the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The written response provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC252/17-18\(01\)](#) on 19 June 2018.)*

427RO — Open space in Area 47 and 48, North District

56. Mr CHU Hoi-dick noted that from 2006 to 2010, the Administration had, for many times, consulted the relevant committees of the North DC on the proposed open space development in Area 47 and 48, North District, and it was after almost eight years in 2018 that updates on the progress of the proposal were provided to the relevant committees. Mr CHU was concerned why the proposed project had been delayed for so long, and whether the Administration would enhance the existing mechanism for resource allocation under the Capital Works Reserve Fund to enable works projects with local support to commence as soon as possible.

57. AD(LS)3/LCSD explained that the Administration started to plan the development of a proposed soccer pitch at the open space site in Area 47 and 48, North District, in 2006. In view of the concern of local DC members about the effects of lighting and noises of the activities at the soccer pitch on

nearby residential areas and schools, the Administration proposed in 2008 that the site be used as passive open space, and accepted the view of members of the local community that a pet garden be developed at the site. The Administration eventually finalized the design of the proposed project in 2010. Given the need for the Government to take forward a large number of competing projects, this project was submitted to the Subcommittee and FC for consideration only recently.

58. Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)3 ("DS(Tsy)3/FSTB") added that every year, different policy bureaux would prioritize the public works projects under their respective ambits. After making comprehensive consideration, the policy-making level of the Administration would decide on the overall priorities of works projects under different policy purviews and then seek funding approval from the Subcommittee and FC in due course (i.e. for upgrading the projects from Category B to Category A). In fact, the works projects proposed by the Administration annually had been increasing in number and in funding amount, so as to meet the aspirations of the public and society.

59. Mr CHU Hoi-dick requested the Administration to provide a list of works projects which were incorporated as Category B- and B+ projects for members to express their views on when they should be upgraded to Category A.

60. DS(Tsy)3/FSTB said that Category B- projects were usually at the pre-construction stage and their details had yet to be finalized. Premature release of the project list was inappropriate as it might give rise to sensitive speculations unnecessarily. For Category B+ projects, which were normally put forward for consideration by the Subcommittee and FC within a short time span, members could generally find out about the list from the annual work plan submitted by the Government to the Subcommittee.

61. Mr CHU Hoi-dick was concerned that of a total of 248 trees within the boundary of the proposed open space in Area 47 and 48, North District, 234 trees would be felled during construction. He enquired whether those trees had grown during the past decade or so because of delay on the part of the Administration in carrying out the construction works. Mr CHU also noticed that there were 382 trees at the swimming pool complex in Area 107, Tin Shui Wai, and some 100 trees at the open space in Area 6, Tai Po, and many of these trees would be felled during construction. In this connection, he enquired how the Administration would dispose of the felled trees properly to prevent them from being sent to landfills.

62. DArchS replied that the Administration conducted an inspection in February 2018 to ascertain the number and conditions of the trees at the project site of the proposed open space in Area 47 and 48, North District. As for trees felled during construction, the works departments/contractors would draw up corresponding plans according to the conditions of the trees, including on-site reuse.

63. Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (1) added that the yard waste generated during construction would be reused as far as practicable depending on its quality. Only trees that could not be put to other suitable uses would be disposed of at landfills. After completion of the Integrated Waste Management Facilities near Shek Kwu Chau, yard waste could be sent there for incineration, thereby reducing the pressure on landfills and generating power through a waste-to-energy process.

64. Mr Holden CHOW enquired why a jogging track and a pet garden were provided at the open space in Area 47 and 48, North District, but not at the open space in Area 6, Tai Po, despite that the two sites were of similar size. Mr CHOW opined that even though no jogging track would be provided at the open space in Area 6, Tai Po, such a facility should still be provided at other locations in the district.

65. AD(LS)3/LCSD responded that despite the absence of a pet garden at the open space in Area 6, Tai Po, pet garden facilities were available at Kwong Fuk Park and Chung Nga Road Children's Playground for use by residents in Tai Po. Moreover, jogging tracks were also provided at many sports facilities in Tai Po. The open space in Area 6, Tai Po, would provide a pebble walking trail, which would be of a relatively passive nature. The Administration would consider providing jogging tracks in the future development of other sports facilities in the district.

66. Mr CHU Hoi-dick was dissatisfied that only two pet gardens were provided in Tai Po district. He opined that such an arrangement could hardly cater to the needs of local residents who wished to bring their pets along and enjoy time with them.

#### 433RO — Open space in Area 6, Tai Po

67. Mr Gary FAN was concerned that while parking spaces were insufficient in Tai Po, many sites in the district where short-term tenancy ("STT") temporary car parks had been operating were resumed by the Administration for other development purposes. In this connection, Mr FAN urged the Administration to consider adopting the development model of "single site, multiple use" and adding underground car parks in its

future site planning. Mr FAN also enquired about the technical difficulties to be encountered in the provision of underground car parks.

68. USHA said that the Administration had considered providing parking spaces at the proposed open space in Area 6, Tai Po, to address the parking space shortage in the district. However, as the design of the proposed open space had been broadly completed, the addition of parking spaces would require major amendments to the design and an application for rezoning to the Town Planning Board, which would result in considerable delay in the construction of open space in Area 6, Tai Po, and a substantial increase in the project cost. As such, the Administration would not provide parking spaces at the open space concerned. Despite that, many car parks/parking spaces were currently available in Tai Po for use by motorists, including the STT temporary car park adjacent to the site of the proposed open space. Moreover, to address the parking space shortage in Tai Po, about 200 parking spaces would be provided under the development of a sports centre, a community hall and football pitches in Area 1, Tai Po, which was underway. A site adjacent to the proposed open space was also designated for sports centre development in the future. The Administration would actively consider providing parking spaces within the boundary of that sports centre.

69. The Chairman and Mr Gary FAN requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on the rough estimate of the additional construction costs involved and the impact on project progress on the assumption that an underground car park was provided under the project at this stage, and the number of existing public parking spaces in the vicinity of the site and the estimated number of public parking spaces to be provided in other development projects in future.

*(Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC252/17-18\(01\)](#) on 19 June 2018.)*

70. Mr CHU Hoi-dick noticed that two basketball-cum-volleyball courts would be provided at the proposed open space in Area 6, Tai Po, and two schools in the vicinity of the open space also had two basketball courts. Mr CHU considered that in planning the proposed open space, the Administration should discuss with the schools concerned the arrangement of opening up the schools' basketball courts for public use, so as to release the space of one basketball court in the open space for other recreational purposes.

71. AD(LS)3/LCSD responded that the provision of basketball courts at the proposed open space in Area 6 was necessary because there were not

enough basketball courts in Tai Po district according to the relevant standards and guidelines stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines.

291RS (part) — Redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium — pre-construction activities

72. Mr Andrew WAN said that he supported the pre-construction activities for the redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium. He enquired whether a cover would be provided at the east spectator stand after redevelopment. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether the Administration could still revise the design for redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium after completion of the proposed pre-construction activities to allow the addition of a cover to the east spectator stand.

73. USHA replied that a cover was currently provided at the west spectator stand but not the east spectator stand of Yuen Long Stadium. After redevelopment, the seating capacity of the west spectator stand would increase from some 2 000 to about 4 000, and all seats would be provided under a permanent cover. In view of the average attendance of activities hosted in Yuen Long Stadium, which varied between 1 000 to 2 000, from the angle of cost-effectiveness and considering that the seating capacity of the west spectator stand could largely accommodate the spectators of various activities held at Yuen Long Stadium, the Administration had no intention to provide a cover at the east spectator stand at this stage.

74. USHA also said that the proposed pre-construction activities included the design and site investigation works for the redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium, as well as preparation of tender documents for the redevelopment project. In view of the concerns raised by the public and members, the Administration would request the engineering consultant to study the possibility of adding a temporary cover to the east spectator stand of Yuen Long Stadium when necessary during the proposed pre-construction activities. Upon completion of the study, the Administration would consult the local DC on the findings.

75. Mr Andrew WAN opined that according to the Administration, Yuen Long Stadium would be able to host large-scale sports events after redevelopment and since such events would attract a large number of spectators, the Administration's explanation that the seating capacity of the west spectator stand would be sufficient to accommodate the spectator attendance was far from convincing. Mr WAN requested the Administration to provide a cover at the east spectator stand in the redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium. Mr KWONG Chun-yu and Ms Claudia MO raised a

similar request. Mr KWONG also enquired about the rough estimate of the additional construction cost involved for the addition of a cover to the east spectator stand, while Ms MO enquired whether technical difficulties or high construction cost was the reason for the Administration's decision of not adding a cover to the east spectator stand.

76. DArchS responded that a rough estimate of the additional construction cost involved for adding a cover to the east spectator stand of Yuen Long Stadium was not available at the moment. She further explained that as the current design of Yuen Long Stadium was not fully up to international standards, the Administration would, during redevelopment of the Stadium, upgrade the design for it to meet international standards. However, given the complex geological conditions of Yuen Long district and the size constraint of Yuen Long Stadium as it was surrounded by other buildings on all sides (see the site plan of Yuen Long Stadium at Annex 1 to Enclosure 5 to [PWSC\(2018-19\)22](#)), the Administration considered that after the reprovisioning of the turf football pitch and the athletic tracks and fields facilities, the addition of a permanent cover to the east spectator stand would encounter quite a lot of technical difficulties. That said, the Administration would request the engineering consultant to look into what current techniques and light-weight materials could be used for providing a temporary cover during the proposed pre-construction activities.

77. The Chairman and Mr KWONG Chun-yu requested the Administration to further advise on what current techniques and light-weight materials could be used when considering the provision of a temporary cover at the east spectator stand of Yuen Long Stadium, and explain specifically with examples of existing facilities. Referring to the cover of the Hong Kong Stadium as an example, Mr Andrew WAN pointed out that light-weight materials had been used for the covers of many stadiums in Hong Kong and overseas. The Administration should therefore draw reference from these experiences and explore ways to provide a cover at the east spectator stand of Yuen Long Stadium. The Administration undertook to provide the information requested by the Chairman and Mr KWONG in writing after the meeting.

*(Post-meeting note: The written response provided by the Administration was circulated to members vide [LC Paper No. PWSC252/17-18\(01\)](#) on 19 June 2018.)*

78. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether unisex toilets would be provided at Yuen Long Stadium after redevelopment. USHA replied in the affirmative.

79. The Chairman advised that the Administration would put forward specific design proposals for redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium upon completion of the proposed pre-construction activities. Members might then express their views to the Administration at the relevant Panel(s). Mr CHU Hoi-dick was concerned that if members failed to strive for the addition of a cover to the east spectator stand of Yuen Long Stadium now, the Administration would refuse to provide a cover at the east spectator stand in the future on the ground that the design of the redevelopment project had been completed.

80. As the contents of some questions put forward by members on various works projects under PWSC(2018-19)22 involved broad policy issues, the Chairman reminded members that such policy issues should be raised with the relevant Panel(s).

Motion proposed under paragraph 32A of the Public Works Subcommittee Procedure

81. At 4:36 pm, the Chairman said that he had received one motion proposed by Mr Gary FAN under paragraph 32A of the Public Works Subcommittee Procedure. The Chairman considered the proposed motion directly related to the agenda item.

82. The Chairman put to vote the question that the proposed motion be proceeded forthwith. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The question was negatived.

Voting on PWSC(2018-19)22

83. There being no further motions proposed under paragraph 32A or further questions from members on the item, the Chairman put PWSC(2018-19)22 to vote.

84. The item was voted on and endorsed. Mr Gary FAN requested that 433RO (i.e. open space in Area 6, Tai Po) under the item be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting. Mr KWONG Chun-yu requested that 291RS (part) (i.e. redevelopment of Yuen Long Stadium – pre-construction activities) under the item be voted on separately at the relevant FC meeting.

*[At 4:44 pm, the Chairman declared that the meeting be suspended for five minutes for members to take a short break. The meeting resumed at 4:50 pm.]*

**Head 708 – Capital Subventions and Major Systems and Equipment**

<b>PWSC(2018-19)23</b>	<b>32ED</b>	<b>Conversion to Heung Hoi Ching Kok Lin Association Buddhist Po Kwong School</b>
	<b>33ED</b>	<b>Provision of Boarding Section of Hong Chi Pinehill School and reprovisioning of Boarding Section of Hong Chi Pinehill No. 2 School in Tai Po</b>

85. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)23, sought to upgrade 32ED and 33ED to Category A at the respective estimated costs of \$197.6 million and \$170.2 million in MOD prices. The Administration had consulted the Panel on Education on the funding requests for the two projects on 13 April and 2 February 2018 respectively. Panel members supported the submission of the two funding requests to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the discussion of the Panel on Education was tabled for members' information.

Details of work division and consultants' fees for the proposed projects

86. Mr Tony TSE said that he supported the two proposed projects. He enquired about the work division among the Education Bureau ("EDB"), the relevant works departments of the Government and the school management regarding the implementation of the two proposed projects, such as the arrangements for design, contract administration and works progress supervision. Mr TSE also enquired whether special facilities would be provided at the proposed new boarding section of Hong Chi Pinehill School and the reprovisioned boarding section of No. 2 School to cater for the students' needs.

87. Under Secretary for Education ("USED") replied that broadly speaking, EDB was responsible for the planning of the projects, and ArchSD for advising on the technical arrangements and works details, while the school sponsoring body ("SSB") had to undertake such work as invitation of tenders and design in accordance with the procedures. She further said that the project for the two Hong Chi Pinehill Schools sought to provide boarding places for children with moderate intellectual disability ("ID") and severe ID. Different from those provided for children with mild ID, the equipment for those with moderate and severe IDs would include some special medical devices and facilities.

88. Mr Tony TSE noted that according to paragraph 5 of Enclosure 1 and that of Enclosure 2 to [PWSC\(2018-19\)23](#), the consultants' fees for the two proposed projects were \$10.7 million and \$4.3 million respectively. He

asked the reason for the vast difference in the consultants' fees, the scope of duties of the consultants engaged in the two proposed projects, and whether project design was included. Chief Technical Adviser (Subvented Projects), Architectural Services Department, replied that the project of Heung Hoi Ching Kok Lin Association Buddhist Po Kwong School ("Po Kwong School") required more consultancy support and hence higher consultants' fees as it involved expansion of the school premises and construction of new boarding facilities. The project of the two Hong Chi Pinehill Schools mainly involved construction of new boarding facilities. The nature of the works was relatively simple, and thus the consultants' fees were lower. The cost of design was already included in the consultants' fees of the two proposed projects.

89. Senior Architect (School Improvement Works Section), Education Bureau, supplemented that EDB was responsible for the project of Po Kwong School and internal supervision. An engineering consultant had also been engaged to undertake the design and supervision of the project. The project of Po Kwong School incurred higher consultants' fees, given its more comprehensive work in such items as site investigation, design and studies. It was learnt that the SSB concerned did not need any financial assistance from the Government for the implementation of part of the pre-construction activities of the project for the two Hong Chi Pinehill Schools. Mr Tony TSE suggested that remarks on the breakdown of the consultants' fees should be added in the Administration's funding proposal to set out in detail the itemized expenditure and external financial assistance obtained for the project.

Shortage of boarding places and associated facilities for children with intellectual disabilities

90. Mr LAU Kwok-fan said that he supported the two proposed projects. Mr LAU pointed out that although the conversion project of Po Kwong School included the provision of 60 new boarding places for children with moderate ID, the number of such places, which was constrained by factors such as the lack of land in the vicinity of the school, was obviously insufficient. He urged the Administration to tackle the shortfall of boarding places for children with IDs, and make early planning to pre-empt the shortage of boarding places for adults when these children grew up in the future. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed similar concerns. The Chairman advised that members might follow up on the related broader policy issues in the relevant Panel(s).

91. USED replied that the Administration had all along been proactive in tackling the long waiting time for boarding places for children with moderate

ID. Upon completion, the two proposed projects would provide a total of 120 boarding places for children with moderate ID, which should be able to alleviate the shortage of boarding places for children with moderate ID in Tai Po and North District. In addition, 60 reprovisioned boarding places would be provided for children with severe ID by Hong Chi Pinehill No. 2 School.

92. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed support for the two proposed projects. He said that the expansion project of Po Kwong School had spanned nearly 10 years from proposal to funding application. He hoped that the Administration would commence the works as soon as possible. He opined that the facilities provided at schools for children with mild and moderate IDs should meet the requirements of the latest policy and initiatives to the largest possible extent, such as the new initiative of providing occupational therapy service in special schools. However, Po Kwong School was unable to provide any occupational therapy room owing to the lack of space at the site. In addition, he remarked that children with mild ID were not provided with boarding places under the current policy. He pointed out that currently, there were also students with mild ID studying in such schools as Po Kwong School, some of whom had been allocated temporary accommodation in small group homes ("SGHs") for children with mild ID. However, given the shortage of SGH places, some of them had to travel to other districts to attend schools. He hoped that apart from increasing the number of boarding places for children with moderate and severe IDs, the Administration would also consider providing additional associated medical facilities and boarding places for children with mild ID in tandem.

93. USED responded that the conversion project of Po Kwong School, for which the arrangements were all set, would have to be re-designed if an occupational therapy room was to be added at this stage, thus causing inevitable delay in the works progress. EDB encouraged the school management to make flexible use of special rooms and other facilities to meet the need of providing occupational therapy for students. The Administration would do its best to provide the necessary services for children with IDs in need. As regards the provision of boarding places for children with mild ID, it was imperative to give thorough consideration in compliance with certain basic principles.

94. There being no further questions from members on the item, the Chairman put the item to vote.

95. The item was voted on and endorsed. The Chairman consulted members on whether the item would require separate voting at the relevant FC meeting. No member made such a request.

**Head 704 – Drainage**

**PWSC(2018-19)24 172CD Rehabilitation of underground stormwater drains**  
**108CD West Kowloon drainage improvement – inter-reservoirs transfer scheme**

96. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)24, sought to upgrade part of 172CD and 108CD to Category A at the respective estimated costs of \$122.8 million and \$1,222 million in MOD prices. The Administration had consulted the Panel on Development on 172CD and 108CD on 27 March and 24 April 2018 respectively. Panel members generally supported the submission of the two funding requests to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the discussion of the Panel on Development was tabled for members' information.

172CD — Rehabilitation of underground stormwater drains

*Impacts of the works*

97. Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired whether fresh water supply would be affected, and about the impact on the community, during the rehabilitation and replacement of the stormwater drains.

98. Director of Drainage Services ("DDS") replied that the proposed project, which concerned mainly the rehabilitation of stormwater drains in all the 18 districts in Hong Kong, would not affect fresh water supply. The Administration had recently consulted the 18 DCs on the proposed project, and DCs had expressed support. Chief Engineer (Project Management), Drainage Services Department ("CE(PM)/DSD"), supplemented that the proposed project, comprising condition surveys and rehabilitation of drains, would be carried out mainly by using trenchless technologies. Such implementation procedures would have fewer impacts on the traffic and environment in the vicinity.

*Technologies employed*

99. Dr Fernando CHEUNG was concerned about the industrial safety of the project, and enquired whether workers were required to enter underground pipelines to perform excavation works, including hand-dug

tunnelling. He also enquired whether rehabilitation would be carried out immediately upon discovery of any pipe failure during the condition surveys, and whether the relevant emergency repair cost had been included in the funding proposal.

100. CE(PM)/DSD replied that the project concerned the rehabilitation of drains with diameters up to about 450 millimetres, which were relatively small. Workers need not work inside the pipelines. DDS added that when implementing the proposed project, the Drainage Services Department ("DSD") would deploy closed-circuit television ("CCTV") cameras inside the drains for survey and analysis of their structural conditions. If any immediate risk of bursting or collapse was detected, the maintenance contractor would be called in to carry out reinforcement works. Moreover, DSD would make further plans of repairing drains with high failure risk based on actual needs, which included considering the need to submit separate funding requests for conducting the relevant rehabilitation works.

101. Mr Vincent CHENG said that he supported the proposed project. He urged the Administration to employ more technologies that did not require road excavation to minimize the inconvenience caused to the public.

102. CE(PM)/DSD replied that the Administration employed mainly three types of advanced technologies for drainage rehabilitation. The first one was the cured-in-place-pipe ("CIPP") lining technology that would be applied in the proposed project, whereby a soft liner would be put into the pipe and then hardened. The second one was slip-lining, whereby a hard fiberglass liner would be put into the pipe. The third one was spirally-wound lining, whereby a winding machine would be placed inside the pipeline to form a liner, after which grouting would be carried out. As regards which technology would be adopted, and when and under what circumstances it would be adopted, it hinged on a number of technical factors, such as the loading capacity required, whether it was feasible to open the manhole covers to conduct the works, whether there was the need to put in large pipes and open up shafts of different sizes to reach down to the drains, and whether there would be water flowing inside the drains.

103. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether the Administration would also install sensing devices to detect sewage flowing into and blockages of stormwater drains during the implementation of the proposed rehabilitation.

104. DDS replied that the Administration was exploring the use of new technologies, such as installation of sensing devices inside the drains, to monitor the drainage conditions. To that end, a delegation of the Development Bureau had visited the United Kingdom to study the local use

of fibre-optic technology, whereby fibre-optic sensors were installed inside the drains to detect temperature changes in the pipelines.

105. Mr Gary FAN noted that the Administration was establishing the Water Intelligent Network ("WIN") in phases to monitor the conditions of fresh water mains the total length of which was about 8 000 kilometres. He enquired whether WIN covered the underground stormwater drains of 2 400 kilometres, and about the technological details of the sensing devices employed.

106. DDS replied that the technology adopted for WIN was to identify areas with problematic pipes in the water distribution network through continuous monitoring of water pressure and water flow in pipes. Such technology was not applicable to non-pressurized underground stormwater drains. Moreover, usually larger in diameter for discharge of stormwater directly into the sea, underground stormwater drains were different from fresh water mains used by the Water Supplies Department ("WSD"). Under the proposed project, DSD would use CCTV equipment rather than the technology adopted for WIN to survey the conditions of underground stormwater drains. DSD would keep an eye on new technological development and conduct trial application of relevant technologies for monitoring drainage where appropriate.

#### *Consultants' fees*

107. Ms Claudia MO pointed out that the proposed project involved consultants' fees of about \$800,000. She enquired about the tasks to be undertaken by the consultants engaged, and whether such tasks needed to be outsourced to external consultants because of insufficient in-house staff.

108. DDS replied that the consultants' fees only accounted for about 0.65% of the cost of the proposed project. The Administration considered it appropriate to engage consultants to undertake the design and management of the proposed project. The engagement of consultants was reasonable utilization of Hong Kong's professional human resources. It was also conducive to optimum deployment of manpower and other resources in the works departments so that different projects could be implemented concurrently. Permanent Secretary for Development (Works) added that the Administration considered engagement of consultants in public works projects as a means of appropriate utilization of government resources. Given the large number of public works projects, appropriate use of outsourced resources on the market could prevent excessive expansion of manpower in government departments.

*Misconnections and expedient connections of drains*

109. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether survey would also be conducted on expedient connections of sewers with stormwater drains during the condition surveys on underground stormwater drains, how such cases would be handled upon discovery, and whether such cases were common in the past. He also asked how long the serviceable life of stormwater drains could be extended after completion of the proposed rehabilitation.

110. DDS replied that the Administration had checked for expedient connections of drains through collection of special data, such as rising water levels in the drains on rain-free days. DSD would make records and analysis of any anomalies detected, and where appropriate, seek assistance from other law enforcement departments (e.g. the Environmental Protection Department ("EPD") and the Buildings Department ("BD")), with a view to rectifying the expedient connections of drains. Expedient connections discovered during DSD's regular surveys of drains had been relatively rare. According to the past records, DSD had found expedient connections of drains in tracing the root causes after discovery of emission of odours from stormwater drains or receipt of complaints. He further said that with the application of the relatively new technology of installing internal lining through the drains, the underground stormwater drains were expected to have a serviceable life of at least 40 to 50 years after completion of the proposed rehabilitation.

111. Mr CHAN Han-pan expressed support for the proposed project. He said that misconnections of drains were quite common in old districts. That might be related to imperfect distribution of stormwater drains and sewers in earlier days, including the absence of manholes in some sewerage systems and the lack of a sewerage system in some rural areas where sewers would be directly connected to stormwater drains. He enquired whether and how the Administration would initiate inter-departmental actions or prosecutions against expedient connections of drains.

112. DDS replied that the Administration was aware of the possible occurrence of expedient connections and pollution of stormwater drains. DSD would work with relevant departments (e.g. BD) for rectification. Moreover, the Administration would step up civic education and advise garages or eateries not to discharge sewage directly into roadside stormwater drains. Where necessary, DSD might work with the law enforcement departments, such as EPD and BD, to take out prosecutions. DSD had been working closely with EPD and BD in previous joint operations with satisfactory records of rectification of misconnections of drains.

113. Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (1) supplemented that the relevant departments had set up an inter-departmental collaboration platform for identification and rectification of serious misconnections of drains. Actions taken included construction of additional sewers, installation of dry weather flow interceptors at suitable locations, beefing up public education and publicity, and strengthening law enforcement actions.

108CD — West Kowloon drainage improvement — inter-reservoirs transfer scheme

*Increasing storage and flood protection*

114. Mr CHU Hoi-dick enquired whether the inter-reservoirs transfer scheme ("IRTS") would be implemented in other reservoirs in Hong Kong apart from the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir and the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir as proposed in the scheme.

115. Principal Assistant Secretary for Development (Works)5 replied that the proposed project aimed at flood protection by implementing the proposed IRTS from the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir, taking advantage of the close proximity of the two reservoirs. At this stage, the Administration had no plans to build any water tunnels or implement IRTS between other reservoirs for the purpose of flood protection.

116. Mr CHU Hoi-dick noted that the proposed IRTS would facilitate the transfer of the collected surface runoff from the Kowloon group of reservoirs to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir, by which an additional fresh water yield was expected to be generated every year. He enquired how the Administration worked out the average annual additional fresh water yield of about 3.4 million cubic metres, and whether fresh water would be transferred to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir before the storage in the Kowloon group of reservoirs reached the point of overflow.

117. DDS replied that before the construction of the transfer tunnel, owing to the relatively small capacities of the Kowloon group of reservoirs, overspill of stormwater during the rain would be discharged directly to the sea via the Lai Chi Kok drainage tunnel ("LCKDT"). After completion of the proposed IRTS, the surface runoff collected from the Kowloon group of reservoirs could be transferred to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir, which was larger in capacity, thereby slightly lowering the water level in the Kowloon group of reservoirs for continual catchment of stormwater. It was estimated that an additional fresh water yield of about 3.4 million cubic metres could thus be generated annually on average. The estimate was mainly derived by calculating the difference between the usual water level in the Kowloon

Byewash Reservoir and a certain maximum storage level to be maintained in the future, representing the additional storage capacity for fresh water.

118. Deputy Director of Water Supplies supplemented that after completion of the proposed IRTS, WSD would limit the storage of the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir to the level of 108 metres. Exceedance above this level would be transferred to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir via the transfer tunnel. Given that the top water level of the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir was 115 metres, it meant that an extra capacity of about 350 000 cubic metres could be released for collection of more stormwater in the reservoir, facilitating optimum use of water resources. Overflow of the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir might still occur in the event of extraordinarily heavy rainfall that overwhelmed the extra capacity released. DDS further said that 350 000 cubic metres was not small in terms of storage capacity. For example, members might draw reference from Tai Hang Tung Stormwater Storage Tank and Happy Valley Stormwater Storage Tank, which currently had storage capacities of 100 000 and 60 000 cubic metres respectively.

119. Ms Claudia MO mentioned the flooding of Ma Tau Wai Road which happened some years ago. She said that after inspection, the Administration had acknowledged the need of flood protection works to prevent recurrence of similar incidents. She enquired about the work division between DSD and WSD in the proposed project. She also noted that roadside sewers were often clogged, resulting in flooding of roads. She enquired whether the Administration could affirm that similar situations would not happen again in Hong Kong.

120. DDS replied that the proposed project would be implemented jointly by DSD and WSD, with DSD undertaking the flood protection work and WSD responsible for fresh water supply. Leveraging on the different storage capacities, IRTS would transfer stormwater from the Kowloon group of reservoirs to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir via the water tunnel, with a view to raising the flood protection standard. The proposed project was therefore a joint effort of the two departments, enhancing flood protection in the urban areas of West Kowloon on the one hand, and increasing the annual fresh water yield by about 3.4 million cubic metres on the other.

121. DDS added that DSD adopted three-pronged flood prevention measures to cope with rainstorms. First, drainage interception tunnels were built upstream to intercept the runoff from flowing into the urban areas and then discharge it to the sea. In midstream, floodwater storage tanks were built as a strategy to withstand the peak flow from the upstream and midstream before discharge to the sea. Lastly, drainage improvement works

were currently carried out downstream on an ongoing basis. Since drains were prone to clogging from time to time because of the activities of eateries and commercial establishments nearby, DSD officers would do their best to clear the drains around and during the rainy season to prevent blockages of drains.

122. Mr Gary FAN enquired whether the funding being sought for IRTS included future repair and maintenance costs. He also asked whether the proposed project aimed at technically increasing the storage capacities of the Kowloon group of reservoirs. DDS said that apart from the construction of the water tunnel connecting the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir with the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir, IRTS would not change the scale of the Kowloon group of reservoirs. The project mainly involved the construction of a water tunnel and its intake and outfall structures to transfer water from the Kowloon Byewash Reservoir to the Lower Shing Mun Reservoir without the use of any pumps, taking advantage of the difference in levels between the two reservoirs (i.e. an altitude difference of about 20 metres).

#### *Technologies employed*

123. Mr Vincent CHENG said that he supported the proposed project. He said that the Administration applied technologies involving the use of large machines in tunnel boring to undertake projects in West Kowloon years ago, so as to relieve flood pressure arising from rainfall in West Kowloon. He asked whether, in respect of the proposed project, large machines would continue to be used for tunnel boring or new technologies would be adopted, and about the percentage decrease in flooding that could be achieved after project completion.

124. DDS replied that the Administration carried out the works of LCKDT using large tunnel boring machines in 2012, and the diameter of tunnels bored then was 4.9 metres. Similar tunnel boring machine technology would be used to build a water tunnel with a length of about 2.8 kilometres and a diameter of about 3 metres under the proposed IRTS. For maintenance of the drains, the Administration would employ new technologies as far as practicable, so as to minimize the impacts on the public and traffic.

#### *Project cost*

125. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen noted that the proposed water tunnel project cost some \$1,200 million to build, which translated into a cost of \$450 million per kilometre for its total length of about 2.8 kilometres. He

enquired whether the project cost was on the high or low side by comparison with similar projects.

126. DDS replied that LCKDT, which was completed in 2012, had a length of 3.7 kilometres and a diameter of 4.9 metres, and its project cost was \$1,669.1 million, which translated into a cost of around \$230,000 per metre. The cost of the proposed project in 2017 prices was estimated to be around \$214,000 per metre, which was similar to that of LCKDT. However, the need of slope reinforcement works and penstock installation had slightly added to the cost estimate of the proposed project.

127. Mr Gary FAN enquired whether the proposed project was among the four projects under the Lai Chi Kok Transfer Scheme ("LCKTS"). He referred to paragraph 25 of Enclosure 2 to [PWSC\(2018-19\)24](#), which stated that with the implementation of the proposed IRTS, the size of the main tunnel of LCKDT could be reduced from 6.4 metres to 4.9 metres, while achieving the same general flood protection level. He enquired whether the proposed project comprised works to reduce the diameter of the main tunnel of LCKDT, and about the timetable of completing the relevant works.

128. DDS replied that the proposed IRTS was among the four projects under LCKTS. LCKTS, which included the construction of LCKDT and the proposed IRTS, could improve flood protection for West Kowloon and reduce the flooding risks of the area. Under the original plan, a main drainage tunnel with a diameter of 6.4 metres should be built. However, it was found upon further study that with the implementation of the proposed IRTS, the diameter of the main tunnel of LCKDT could be scaled down to 4.9 metres to achieve the same level of flood protection at a lower cost. The works of LCKDT had been completed.

129. Ms Claudia MO pointed out that the proposed project involved consultants' fees of about \$10 million. She enquired why consultants had to be engaged for the proposed project. DDS replied that the consultants' fees only accounted for about 0.85% of the cost estimate of the proposed project. The Administration considered it appropriate to engage consultants to undertake the design and management of the proposed project, so that the manpower and other resources of works departments could be deployed effectively to implement different projects concurrently.

130. In response to Ms Claudia MO's enquiries about the New Engineering Contract ("NEC") and the Government's cost estimation mechanism based on the trend rate of change in the price of public sector building and construction output, the Chairman said that the Administration had explained repeatedly

the estimation of project costs in MOD prices and implementation of projects under the NEC form to the Subcommittee at its recent meetings.

131. DS(Tsy)3/FSTB replied that the trend rate of change in the price of public sector building and construction output referred broadly to the Government's forecast of future price changes based on some trend-based assumptions, and it would be adopted to convert the cost estimate of a project from its constant price into the MOD prices. The Chairman said that in case of further doubt, Ms MO might opt to make contact with the relevant officials after the meeting for more detailed explanation.

#### *Commencement date of works*

132. Ms Claudia MO noted that the environmental permit for the proposed project was already issued in May 2009. She enquired why the Administration had only submitted the funding proposal at this stage. DDS said that the Administration confirmed the broad feasibility of the project in around mid-2009, but the timing coincided with the peak of tunnel boring works. From 2008 to 2012, the use of tunnel boring machines was required for all such projects as the drainage tunnels in Lai Chi Kok, Hong Kong West and Tsuen Wan, the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link, Shatin to Central Link, and the Liantang/Heung Yuen Wai Boundary Control Point. The cost might have soared if the proposed project was pursued at the time. It was therefore decided that the funding proposal be held back from submission.

#### *Environmental implications*

133. Referring to paragraph 19 of Enclosure 2 to [PWSC\(2018-19\)24](#), Mr CHAN Chi-chuen pointed out that the Administration estimated that the proposed works would generate 93 100 tonnes of inert construction waste that would be delivered to public fill reception facilities ("PFRFs") for subsequent reuse. He enquired whether there were ways to reduce the construction waste generated from construction works; how the problem of delivering construction waste to landfills would be tackled; and how the impact of construction waste on the surrounding environment would be minimized.

134. Chief Engineer (Consultants Management), Drainage Services Department, replied that the proposed works were estimated to generate about 110 000 tonnes of construction waste. Of these, about 16% would be reused on site; about 83%, which constituted inert construction waste, would be delivered to PFRFs for subsequent reuse; and only less than 0.5%, which constituted non-inert construction waste, would be disposed of at landfills.

As such, more than 99% of the construction waste would be reused. As regards the traffic impact arising from the delivery of construction waste, the Administration estimated that there would be up to 10 trips of works vehicles entering and exiting the project site per hour during the one year or so of tunnel boring works, amounting to about 2% of the traffic capacity of Lower Shing Mun Road.

*Other concerns*

135. Mr LAU Kwok-fan said that he supported the two proposed projects. He was concerned about the meeting progress and urged members to proceed to vote on the agenda item as soon as possible after raising questions on the projects.

Voting on PWSC(2018-19)24

136. There being no further questions on the item from members, the Chairman put PWSC(2018-19)24 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division. Twenty-five members voted for the proposal. No member voted against the proposal or abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

*For:*

Mr Charles Peter MOK (Deputy Chairman)	Ms Starry LEE
Mr Paul TSE	Ms Claudia MO
Mr Michael TIEN	Mr Frankie YICK
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr CHAN Han-pan
Ms Alice MAK	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr CHU Hoi-dick	Dr Junius HO
Mr HO Kai-ming	Mr Holden CHOW
Mr Wilson OR	Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr LAU Kwok-fan	Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr KWONG Chun-yu	Mr Jeremy TAM
Mr Gary FAN	Mr Vincent CHENG
Mr Tony TSE	
(25 members)	

*Against:*

(0 member)

*Abstain:*

(0 member)

137. The Chairman declared that the item was endorsed by the Subcommittee. The Chairman consulted members on whether the item would require separate voting at the relevant FC meeting. No member made such a request.

**Head 707 – New Towns and Urban Area Development**

**PWSC(2018-19)15 458RO Signature Project Scheme (Kwun Tong District) – Construction of Music Fountains at Kwun Tong Promenade**

**68RE Signature Project Scheme (Wan Chai District) – Construction of Moreton Terrace Activities Centre**

138. The Chairman advised that the proposal, i.e. PWSC(2018-19)15, sought to upgrade 458RO and 68RE to Category A at their respective estimated costs of \$49.7 million and \$133.1 million in MOD prices. The Administration had consulted the Panel on Home Affairs on 458RO and 68RE on 21 December 2017. Panel members supported the submission of the two funding proposals to the Subcommittee for consideration. A report on the gist of the Panel's discussion was tabled for members' information.

Project costs

139. Mr LAU Kwok-fan said that he supported the two proposed projects. As the proposed projects had been under deliberation for many years, he was concerned whether the construction costs had increased because of that; whether the Administration had measures in place to offset the increase in construction costs; and whether the proposed projects could be completed within the current cost estimates.

140. PD(3)/ArchSD replied that although the Building Works Tender Price Index had slightly increased over the past few years, the Administration had made minor adjustments, such as simplifying the designs as far as practicable, to ensure that the current costs were kept in line with the earlier estimates. To avoid further cost increase, the Administration hoped that the proposed projects could be endorsed by the Subcommittee as soon as possible.

458RO Signature Project Scheme (Kwun Tong District) — Construction of Music Fountains at Kwun Tong Promenade

*Local and associated consultation exercises*

141. Ms Claudia MO referred to a letter she had just received from the Kowloon East Community, which stated that 90% of local residents were strongly opposed to the construction of music fountains at Kwun Tong Promenade at the cost of nearly \$50 million. Referring to the Administration's pledge that discussion on a controversial item would be deferred, she enquired why the Administration had submitted this controversial item to the Subcommittee for discussion at this stage. She also enquired whether the Administration had communicated and discussed with local resident groups on the construction of the proposed music fountains in addition to consulting the Kwun Tong DC.

142. The Chairman pointed out that at the meeting of the Panel on Home Affairs on 21 December 2017, members expressed support for the submission of the two projects under the Signature Project Scheme ("SPS"), including the proposed music fountain project, to the Subcommittee for discussion.

143. DS(Tsy)3/FSTB responded that according to the consensus reached with Members in March this year, the Administration had all along accorded priority to dealing with the funding proposals for 15 livelihood-related public works projects pursuant to the principle of dealing with straightforward issues first. Those proposals had been deliberated on and endorsed by the Subcommittee without any problem. In addition, out of 22 funding proposals for public works projects that were considered urgent by the Government, 18 proposals involving less or no controversy had been endorsed by the Subcommittee. The remaining four, including the agenda item under discussion, were the difficult ones owing to the involvement of more different views. He took the opportunity to thank members for their cooperation, which allowed the scrutiny of funding proposals for the projects to progress at a satisfactory pace.

144. District Officer (Kwun Tong), Home Affairs Department, supplemented that the SPS project for Kwun Tong had been in the pipeline for a long time. In 2013, the Kwun Tong DC began to adopt a bottom-up approach for DC members to collect proposals from local residents and groups first. In the same year, the Kwun Tong DC established a working group and selected two SPS project proposals, including the proposed music fountain project, out of 16 proposals upon close examination. The proposed music fountain project was supported by members of the previous term of

Kwun Tong DC and the Task Force on Kai Tak Harbourfront Development of the Harbourfront Commission. Members expressed support for the proposed project when the Administration presented it to the Panel on Home Affairs and the Subcommittee for scrutiny in 2015 and 2016 respectively. However, FC was unable to complete the scrutiny of the proposed project before the end of the last LegCo term in July 2016. After that, the Administration presented the proposed project to the Panel on Home Affairs again in December 2017, and received the support of the Panel.

*Operation, maintenance and water consumption of the music fountains*

145. Mr Jeremy TAM said he was opposed to the proposed project. He opined that as Kwun Tong district had an ageing population, the Administration should put resources to proper use, and use the public money to provide facilities for the elderly (such as care facilities), rather than building the music fountains. He enquired about the annual operation and maintenance costs of the music fountains and the volume of water to be consumed annually.

146. USHA replied that construction of the music fountains was one of the two SPS projects of Kwun Tong district, the other being the lift tower at Shung Yan Street, which catered for the needs of the elderly and mobility-impaired persons. FC had approved the funding for the lift tower project, for which construction works were in progress. PD(3)/ArchSD said that the annual operation and maintenance costs of the music fountains were estimated to be around \$1.8 million, including electricity cost of some \$80,000. He further said that wind speed sensors would be installed for the music fountains. The height of the jets of water would be reduced if wind speeds up to a certain level were detected, so as to reduce water consumption.

68RE Signature Project Scheme (Wan Chai District) — Construction of Moreton Terrace Activities Centre

*Project cost*

147. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan said that he supported the proposed project. He pointed out that except for Leighton Hill Community Hall, other locations in Wan Chai district, including the Wan Chai Activity Centre and the Community Garden in Wan Chai Park, provided no performance venues. The future Moreton Terrace Activities Centre could fill the gap of performance venue provision in the district. He noted that the proposed project was estimated to cost \$133.1 million, and the Hong Kong Jockey Club Charities Trust would provide a donation of \$40 million for the project, including \$38 million to cover the capital cost. The

Administration's actual commitment for the cost of the proposed project was \$95.1 million. He enquired about the accuracy of the Administration's estimation and whether extra funds were reserved to meet any shortfall in construction cost of the project that might arise in the future.

148. PD(3)/ArchSD replied that the design of the proposed project had been completed. Contingencies had also been provided under the project cost estimate. The Administration was confident that the project could be completed within budget.

149. Mr LAU Kwan-fan pointed out that most of the SPS projects of other DCs were approaching completion. As the two proposed projects under scrutiny likewise represented proposals submitted only after deliberation by the relevant DCs, he supported the two proposed projects and urged members to vote on the agenda item as soon as possible.

150. The Chairman advised that the Subcommittee would continue to discuss this item at the next meeting. The meeting ended at 6:29 pm.