

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)487/18-19

(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on Friday, 1 June 2018 from 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present :** Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Han-pan, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-ki, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon CHAN Chun-ying
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon LUK Chung-hung
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon AU Nok-hin
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
- Members attending :** Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP

Hon WU Chi-wai, MH

Members absent : Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item II**

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Andy LAM Siu-hong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)3
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Ann CHAN Wai-yan
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)(Special Support)

Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr Alex CHAN Choi-wai
Government Engineer / Railway Development 2
Highways Department

Mr Patrick WONG
Assistant Commissioner/ Bus & Railway
Transport Department

Mr FUNG Kwok-fai
Acting Assistant Director/ Railways
Electrical & Mechanical Services Department

Mr TSE Lok-him
Acting Chief Engineer/ Railways 1
Electrical & Mechanical Services Department

Agenda item III

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Andy LAM Siu-hong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)3
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr Alex CHAN Choi-wai
Government Engineer / Railway
Development 2
Highways Department

Mr FUNG Kwok-fai
Acting Assistant Director/ Railways
Electrical & Mechanical Services Department

Mr TSE Lok-him
Acting Chief Engineer/ Railways 1
Electrical & Mechanical Services Department

Agenda item IV

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr Jonathan LEUNG Man-ho
Government Engineer / Railway Development 1
Highways Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item II**

MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director

Mr Adi LAU
Operations Director

Mr C L LEUNG
General Manager – XRL E&M

Mr Francis LI
Chief of Operating – XRL

Ms Maggie SO
General Manager - Corporate Relations

Agenda item III

MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director

Mr Adi LAU
Operations Director

Mr C L LEUNG
General Manager – XRL E&M

Mr Francis LI
Chief of Operating – XRL

Ms Maggie SO
General Manager - Corporate Relations

Agenda item IV

MTR Corporation Limited

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director

Mr T M LEE
General Manager – SCL and Head of E&M
Construction

Mr Jason WONG
General Manager – SCL Civil (East West Line) and
Projects Management Office

Mr Aidan ROONEY
General Manager – SCL Civil (North South Line)

Ms Prudence CHAN
Senior Manager - Projects and Property
Communications

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Joyce CHING
Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM
Legislative Assistant (4)2

Action

- I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1143/17-18(01), CB(4)1119/17-18(01),
CB(4)1092/17-18(01), CB(4)1045/17-18(01) and
CB(4)930/17-18(01))

Members noted that above papers which had been issued since the last regular meeting of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") on 10 April 2018.

- II. Progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link**
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1151/17-18(01) and (02))

2. At the invitation of the Chairman, Projects Director of MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") and Operations Director of MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong Section ("HKS") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1188/17-18(01)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

3. Mr CHAN Chun-ying declared that he was employed by the Bank of China (Hong Kong) Limited as a consultant. Mr YIU Si-wing declared that

Action

the company he was working for offered ticketing service for the Mainland high-speed trains and was a potential ticketing service provider for the future HKS of XRL. Ms Starry LEE declared that her employer provided audit services to MTRCL but she was not involved in the provision of such services.

4. On members' request, MTRCL agreed to provide a written explanation on the figures and meaning of the terms given in Tables 1 and 2 of Annex 2 (Financial Expenditure) to the progress report of the HKS of XRL project as set out in the Annex to the Administration's paper (LC Paper No. CB(4)1151/17-18(01)).

(Post meeting note: The Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were incorporated in the paper on "Progress and Financial Situation of the Construction of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (Quarterly Report for the Period ending 30 June 2018)" which had been circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)44/18-19(02) on 15 and 24 October 2018 respectively.)

III. Incident at Shek Kong Stabling Sidings of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1151/17-18(03) and (04))

5. At the invitation of the Chairman, Chief of Operating – XRL of MTRCL briefed members on the incident at Shek Kong Stabling Sidings of the HKS of XRL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1188/17-18(02)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

6. On a member's request, the Administration agreed to provide:

- (a) details of the notification mechanism (if any) in respect of incidents occurred during the trial operations of the HKS of XRL, including the criteria for reporting incidents and the time limit (if any) between the actual occurrence of the incident and the actual notification to the relevant Government department(s); and
- (b) the total number of incidents occurred during the trial operations that the relevant Government department(s) had been notified.

Action

(Post meeting note: The Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were incorporated in the paper on "Progress and Financial Situation of the Construction of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (Quarterly Report for the Period ending 30 June 2018)" which had been circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)44/18-19(02) on 15 and 24 October 2018 respectively.)

IV. Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link (LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1151/17-18(05) and (06))

7. At the invitation of the Chairman, General Manager – SCL Civil (East West Line) and Projects Management Office of MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1188/17-18(03)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

(At 10:53 am, the Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes to 11:45 am. At 11:03 am, the Chairman suggested and members agreed to further extend the meeting for 15 minutes to 12:00 noon.)

V. Any other business

8. Members agreed that the Subcommittee should seek for an extension of its work in the 2018-2019 session.

9. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:02 pm.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
29 January 2019

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 1 June 2018 from 8:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting</i>			
000640 – 000726	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN	Ms CHAN's request for a written response from MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") on the joint letter from MTRCL Staff Union and Railway Operation Staff Association concerning the review of remuneration structure of MTRCL staff [LC Paper No. CB(4)930/17-18(01)].	
<i>Agenda Item II – Progress update of the construction of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i>			
000726 – 001218	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)1151/17-18(01)].	
001218 – 002111	Chairman MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1188/17-18(01)].	
002111 – 002615	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration MTRCL	<p>Ms CHAN expressed strong dissatisfaction that the Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") and Under Secretary for Transport and Housing did not attend today's meeting to address members' concerns about recent spate of incidents surrounding the construction projects of the Hong Kong Section ("HKS") of Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") and the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL"). The Chairman advised that STH had agreed to re-arrange his schedule so that he could attend the meeting and join the discussion on agenda item IV on "Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link".</p> <p>Ms CHAN expressed concern over the amount of substantiated claims and its impact on the financial situation of the HKS of XRL project, and the Administration's and MTRCL's response.</p>	
002615 – 003021	Chairman Mr CHAN Chun-ying MTRCL	<p>Declaration of interest by Mr CHAN</p> <p>Mr CHAN's enquiry and MTRCL's response on the figures set out at Annex 2 (Financial Expenditure) to MTRCL's report which was appended to the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)1151/17-18(01)] ("Annex 2").</p>	MTRCL (paragraph 4 of the minutes referred)

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Mr CHAN requested MTRCL to provide written explanations on the figures set out at Annex 2 after the meeting.	
003021 – 003431	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing MTRCL	Declaration of interest by Mr YIU Mr YIU's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the ticketing arrangements of the HKS of XRL.	
003431 – 003943	Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL	Mr TSE's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the figures set out at Annex 2. Mr TSE requested MTRCL to supplement further explanations in writing on the figures and the meaning of the terms given in Tables 1 and 2 of Annex 2. Mr TSE's further enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the interim awards for the unresolved claims.	MTRCL (paragraph 4 of the minutes referred)
003943 – 004506	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration MTRCL	Ms MO enquired about the details of the difference between the amount of cumulative expenditure and the amount of awarded contract sum for the contracts as given in Table 1 of Annex 2. MTRCL advised that the difference included the amount awarded to contractors for substantiated claims and also additional expenditures arising from specific works requirements raised by relevant stakeholders that were different from the terms of the contract concerned. Ms MO's concern about the mechanism for approving the aforementioned additional expenditures, and MTRCL's and the Administration's response.	
004506 – 004918	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration MTRCL	Mr CHAN's enquiry and the Administration's response regarding the commissioning date of the HKS of XRL. Mr CHAN's further enquiry and MTRCL's response on the ticketing arrangements and the charging of service fees for XRL tickets for journeys that started and terminated at Mainland destinations ("Mainland journey tickets").	
004918 – 005325	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai MTRCL	In reply to Mr WU's enquiry, MTRCL advised that the method adopted in the construction of diaphragm wall at the West Kowloon Station	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>("WKS") was the same as the one adopted at the Hung Hom Station Extension of SCL.</p> <p>Mr WU's question and MTRCL's response regarding the inspection and authorization arrangements for the steel bar fixing works of diaphragm wall at WKS before the contractor concerned was allowed to pour the concrete.</p>	
005325 – 005756	Chairman Ms Starry LEE Administration MTRCL	<p>Declaration of interest by Ms LEE</p> <p>Ms LEE's concern and the Administration's response regarding the commissioning date of the HKS of XRL and the financial situation of the project.</p> <p>Ms LEE's view that the details of the financial situation of the HKS of XRL project, including information on both substantiated and unsubstantiated claims, should continue to be submitted regularly to the Subcommittee for members' review after the commissioning of the HKS of XRL.</p> <p>Ms LEE's further enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the ticketing arrangements for the HKS of XRL.</p>	
005756 – 010204	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration MTRCL	<p>In response to Mr FAN's question, the Administration advised that a notification mechanism between MTRCL and the Highways Department ("HyD") was established under which the Administration would be informed of incidents relating to the implementation of the HKS of XRL project.</p> <p>Mr FAN's questions and the Administration's responses regarding the operating arrangements of the HKS of XRL, including train schedule and travelling time of trains departing from WKS to Guangzhou South Station.</p>	
010204 – 010623	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>The Chairman's enquiry and the Administration's response regarding the ticketing arrangements of the HKS of XRL, in particular the authorization of MTRCL to sell Mainland journey tickets in Hong Kong and the associated service fees.</p>	
010623 – 011055	Chairman Dr KWOK ka-ki Administration	<p>Dr KWOK's questions and the Administration's responses regarding the types of train operating along XRL and the availability of Business Class</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
	MTRCL	seats and berths on XRL trains. Dr KWOK's view that the fare levels of XRL were not competitive enough as compared with other alternative modes of cross-boundary transport.	
011055 – 011523	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok Administration	Ir Dr LO's suggestion of offering concessionary XRL fares at the early stage of commissioning of HKS of XRL, and the Administration's response. Ir Dr LO's enquiry and the Administration's response regarding the progress of and time required for the installation of clearance facilities at the proposed Mainland Port Area before the passage of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link (Co-location) Bill.	
011523 – 011944	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai MTRCL	Dr CHENG's question and MTRCL's response regarding the figures set out at Annex 2.	
011944 – 012050	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Administration	Mr AU's questions and the Administration's responses regarding the adoption of passenger real-name ticketing system for the HKS of XRL and the signing of Supplemental Service Concession Agreement between the Administration/Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation and MTRCL.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Incident at Shek Kong Stabling Sidings of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i>			
012050 – 012339	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)1151/17-18(03)].	
012339 – 013204	Chairman MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4) 1188/17-18(02)].	
013204 – 013632	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration MTRCL	Ms CHAN expressed dissatisfaction with the manner in which MTRCL disclosed information about the incidents occurred during the trial operations of the HKS of XRL. She thus requested MTRCL to provide formal documents detailing the investigation results of other incidents which occurred after the derailment incident at Shek Kong Stabling Sidings ("SSS") of the HKS of XRL. Responding to Ms CHAN's question about the notification arrangement in respect of incidents occurred during trial operations, the Administration	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>advised that there were different ways to handle incidents of different nature. In connection with the wheel shift incident at SSS, the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department and the Highways Department had been informed of such incident.</p>	
013632 – 014050	<p>Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL</p>	<p>In response to Ms MO's concern about the recurrences of similar derailment incidents in other parts of the HKS of XRL, MTRCL advised that the unique track configuration at the Running Maintenance Shed ("RMS") Track No. 4 located at SSS leading to this incident did not exist anywhere else in the whole rail of XRL.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that it would handle potential claims relating to the wheel shift incident in accordance with the established procedures set out in the contract concerned. Besides, additional costs arising from the improvement measure to strengthen the curved section of rail at the incident location would be limited due to the fact that the section concerned was only 6.6 meters long.</p>	
014050 – 014517	<p>Chairman Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr FAN's question and the Administration's response regarding the criteria for reporting incidents concerning the implementation of HKS of XRL project.</p> <p>Mr FAN expressed that HyD and its M&V consultant had failed to fulfill its role of monitoring the implementation of railway projects. The Administration explained its stance.</p> <p>In reply to Mr FAN's enquiry, MTRCL advised that the different design consultants were appointed for the design of the maintenance tracks at SSS and that of the mainline tracks.</p>	
014517 – 015020	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Admini MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr CHAN's concern and MTRCL's response regarding the expertise of the design consultant concerned in the construction and the safety of XRL rail, in particular that of the mainline tracks.</p> <p>On Mr CHAN's concern about the notification arrangements in respect of incidents which occurred during the trial operations, MTRCL advised that it had all along handled issues concerning the trial operations of HKS of XRL in an open and transparent manner. MTRCL remarked that one of the objectives of trial operations was to find out areas that required modifications or improvements,</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>particularly in the operations and integration of various systems. MTRCL considered that it was of utmost importance to tackle issues encountered during the trial operations in a timely manner so as to ensure operations would be safe and smooth when the HKS of XRL commissioned.</p> <p>In response to Mr CHAN's enquiry, the Administration confirmed that it was not necessary to strengthen the remaining three maintenance tracks in the SSS maintenance shed as they were all on straight alignment.</p>	
015020 – 015442	Chairman Dr KWOK ka-ki MTRCL Administration	<p>Dr KWOK expressed that the public had lost confidence in both the MTRCL and the Administration, because both MTRCL and the Administration failed to disclose to the public the incidents occurred during the trial operations of the HKS of XRL until they were reported by the media.</p> <p>Responding to Dr KWOK's query if there were other incidents occurred during the trial operations that had not been disclosed, MTRCL reiterated that it had been handling issues concerning the trial operations of HKS of XRL in an open and transparent manner. For instance, it had proactively announced the wheel shift incident to the public by issuing a press statement in the early hours of 4 April 2018.</p> <p>Dr KWOK's suggestion and the Administration's response regarding the appointment of an independent railway expert to ensure safe operations of HKS of XRL before its commissioning.</p>	
015442– 015913	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>The Chairman's enquiry and the Administration's response regarding the scope of incidents requiring notification.</p> <p>The Chairman was dissatisfied with the fact that no heavy penalty was imposed on the design consultant concerned for dereliction of duty in accordance with the current contract terms. In this regard, he asked if MTRCL would consider introducing heavier penalties on a consultant which was found to be at fault in future contracts with a view to enhancing the deterrent effect. MTRCL agreed to consider the Chairman's suggestion.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015913 – 020321	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing MTRCL	Mr YIU's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the progress of trial operations on interfaces with Mainland networks. Mr YIU's suggestion on establishing a notification mechanism on issues relating to the trial operations of the HKS of XRL.	
020321 – 020741	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai MTRCL	Dr CHENG's question and MTRCL's response regarding the appointment of a third-party independent consultant to ensure the safety of the XRL rail.	
020741 – 021149	Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting MTRCL	Mr LAM's query on the reasons why the widened track gauge had not been identified by MTRCL on-site staff during regular inspections, and MTRCL's response.	
021149 – 021622	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Administration MTRCL	Mr AU's questions and MTRCL's responses regarding: (a) the impact of the improvement measures on the maintenance costs of the RMS Track No. 4; and (b) the wearing of wheels of the XRL trains concerned. Mr AU requested the Administration to provide: (a) details of the notification mechanism, if any, in respect of incidents occurred during the trial operations of the HKS of XRL, including the criteria for reporting incidents and the time limit, if any, between the actual occurrence of the incident and the actual notification to the relevant Government department(s); and (b) the total number of incidents occurred during the trial operations that the relevant Government department(s) had been notified.	Admin (paragraph 6 of the minutes referred)
021622 – 022032	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	Ir Dr LO's suggestion of fostering technology and experience exchange with the Mainland railway operators who had substantive experience in the operation of high-speed rail. Ir Dr LO's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the experience of MTRCL's staff/contractors in respect of the operation of	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		high-speed rail.	
022032 – 022445	Chairman Mr LUK Chung-hung MTRCL	Mr LUK's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the criteria adopted in the selection of design consultant of the I-beam assembly structure supporting the maintenance tracks at RMS. In reply to Mr LUK's enquiry, MTRCL advised that all additional costs arising from the implementation of improvement measures would be borne by the design consultant concerned.	
<i>Agenda Item V – Any other business</i>			
022445 – 022620	Chairman Administration	Members agreed to seek for an extension of the Subcommittee's work in the 2018-2019 session.	
<i>Agenda Item IV – Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link</i>			
022620 – 023237	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)1151/17-18(05)].	
023237 – 023753	Chairman MTRCL Mr CHAN Han-pan	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4) 1188/17-18(03)].	
023753 – 024158	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai Administration MTRCL	Mr WU raised the following views and questions: (a) MTRCL should furnish a comprehensive report elucidating the sequence of events relating to the incident of substandard steel works found at a platform slab of the Hung Hom Station Extension under the SCL project ("the incident"); (b) when HyD (together with its Monitoring and Verification ("M&V") consultant) and the Transport and Housing Bureau were informed of the incident; (c) whether the cutting of steel bars to fake proper installation into the couplers would amount to an illegal act according to the works contract concerned; if yes, what follow-up actions would be taken by the Administration; and (d) whether MTRCL would provide documentary proof that the concreting process was allowed to proceed only after the rectification works had been completed; and the date(s) of such documentation.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The Administration advised that it was very concerned about the incident. HyD had already requested MTRCL to submit an incident report so that the public would be given a full account of the incident. The Administration further advised that it learnt about the incident only from media reports. Nonetheless, the Administration stressed that MTRCL would report to the Administration on matters concerning the implementation of SCL project having regard to actual circumstances as and when necessary. The Administration undertook to refer the matter to law enforcement agencies for follow-up actions in case any criminality was suspected.</p>	
024158 – 024608	<p>Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN Administration</p>	<p>Ms CHAN considered that MTRCL had lied when it revised the time when the deficient coupling works were first identified to August 2015 from December 2015 as stated on MTRCL's press statement issued on 31 May 2018. She expressed strong dissatisfaction that MTRCL had not reported the incident to the Police back in 2015. Pointing out that an Independent Expert Panel was set up by the Administration in 2014 to review the project management, monitoring mechanism and other matters relating to the delay of HKS of XRL project, Ms CHAN urged the Administration to set up a similar panel to look into the works quality problems associated with the SCL project so as to ascertain the safety of all MTRCL's construction works and other construction works in Hong Kong.</p>	
024608 – 025024	<p>Chairman Dr KWOK Ka-ki Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Dr KWOK's question and MTRCL's response regarding the time when the substandard steel works were first identified.</p> <p>The Administration advised that it had required MTRCL to submit an incident report and to arrange an independent third-party expert to carry out load test in order to address the public's concern. The Administration would critically examine the report upon receipt from MTRCL.</p>	
025024 – 025430	<p>Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting MTRCL</p>	<p>In response to Mr LAM's questions, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) the on-site staff identified in August 2015 that some threaded steel bars had been cut short; as the deficient coupling works were repeatedly found in December 2015, MTRCL had sent an email to the contractor requesting for</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>immediate rectification actions;</p> <p>(b) the concreting works for the 32 construction bays which made up the East West Corridor platform slab were completed in August 2016;</p> <p>(c) concreting works for the slab concerned were only allowed to proceed after the completion of all rectification works; and</p> <p>(d) different types of rectification works would be carried out as appropriate depending on the nature of the workmanship issues in question.</p> <p>Mr LAM held the view that the conflicting information rendered by MTRCL regarding the discovery of the substandard steel works was misleading.</p>	
025430 – 025835	Chairman Mr LAU Kwok-fan MTRCL	Mr LAU's concern and MTRCL's response regarding the carrying capacity of the new trains upon the completion of the replacement of 12-car trains with 9-car trains on the East Rail Line.	
025835 – 030242	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM MTRCL	<p>Mr TAM expressed discontent that MTRCL took no follow-up actions against the concerned parties including the contractors, even though it was obvious that someone was suspected of committing fraud so as to cover up the flawed steel works.</p> <p>MTRCL considered that it was important to ensure that all rectification works were completed in accordance with the relevant requirements and standards once irregularities were detected.</p> <p>Mr TAM criticized MTRCL for its dereliction of duties in failing to follow up on suspected fraudulent act.</p>	
030242 – 030649	Chairman Mr Alvin YEUNG Administration	<p>Mr YEUNG was of the view that MTRCL could no longer be trusted, he therefore urged the Administration to set up an independent expert panel to investigate into the incident.</p> <p>The Administration considered that the investigation on the incident had to be based on facts and conducted in an impartial manner. To this end, the Administration had requested MTRCL to provide an incident report and to arrange an independent expert to conduct a load test to affirm the structural integrity of the platform slab in</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		question. In case the Administration had found any misconduct from the incident report submitted by MTRCL or the investigation conducted afterwards, the Administration would refer the matter to law enforcement agencies for follow-up actions.	
030649 – 031056	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration	Mr CHAN's question and the Administration's response regarding the role and responsibility of HyD and its M&V consultant in monitoring the implementation of the SCL project.	
031056 – 031500	Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL Administration	<p>In reply to Ms MO's question, MTRCL responded that the cutting of threaded steel bars was not found in other sites of the SCL.</p> <p>Ms MO asked whether the Administration/MTRCL would take legal actions against the main contractor who obviously had committed fraud to cover up the substandard steel works. The Administration responded that before taking any necessary follow-up actions, it was important to let MTRCL have an opportunity to provide a full account of the incident.</p>	
031500 – 031902	Chairman Mr LUK Chung-hung MTRCL	Mr LUK's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the feasibility of maintaining the operation of 12-car trains along the East Rail Line upon the commissioning of SCL.	
031902 – 032318	Chairman Administration MTRCL	<p>Responding to the Chairman's enquiry, MTRCL advised that there were over tens of thousands locations along the SCL at which verifications by both the staff of the main contractor and the on-site inspectors of MTRCL were required before the concreting works began.</p> <p>Given that the defective workmanship of the concrete connection joints at the Hung Hom North Approach Tunnels of SCL was revealed only after a portion of the concrete on the surface of the tunnel had been removed, the Chairman asked whether the connection of steel bars at the concerned connection joints had been duly certified and signed off according to the established verification process before the concreting process began. MTRCL replied that there was room for improvement in respect of site supervision.</p> <p>The Chairman called on the Administration to set up an independent commission of inquiry to</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		investigate into the monitoring system of MTRCL on the implementation of railway projects.	
032318 – 032724	Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL	In reply to Ir Dr LO's enquiry, MTRCL advised that on five occasions between August and December 2015 that MTRCL on-site inspectors identified threaded steel bars being cut and not screwed into couplers on site. In December 2015, having identified that some deficient coupling works continued in the construction of the platform slab, MTRCL on-site staff considered that it was necessary to bring the issue to the attention of the senior management of both MTRCL and the main contractor. MTRCL had requested the main contractor to undertake measures to prevent recurrences of similar incidents. No further incidences of cut threaded steel bars were discovered by MTRCL staff after December 2015. MTRCL further affirmed that each of the 32 construction bays had been checked to ensure that its quality met the required standards.	
032724 – 033127	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin Administration MTRCL	<p>On Mr AU's concern over the quality of the couplers, MTRCL advised that around 26,000 couplers were used in the 32 construction bays which made up the East West Corridor platform slab, and all these couplers were in compliance with the specified requirements and the manufacturer's recommendations.</p> <p>Mr AU was dissatisfied that no parties concerned were held responsible for the alleged cover-up of the substandard steel works. The Administration stressed that any follow-up actions to be undertaken should be based on facts. The Administration would refer the matter to law enforcement agencies for follow-up actions if it involved criminal elements.</p>	
033127 – 033545	Chairman Mr Gary FAN Administration	Mr FAN criticized the Administration and MTRCL for having failed to duly monitor the implementation of the SCL project. Pointing out that a number of remedial measures were carried out to rectify the defective workmanship found at the Hung Hom North Approach Tunnels, he queried why similar remedial measures were not adopted at the platform slab in question. Mr FAN held the view that the incident involved criminal elements as someone had deliberately covered up the substandard steel works. He urged the Administration to arrange the Subcommittee to visit	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>the construction sites concerned and set up an independent commission of inquiry to investigate into the incident.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that MTRCL should be given an opportunity to provide detailed explanations on the incident to the public. The Administration considered it fair and reasonable to take necessary follow-up actions against the concerned parties in case any misconduct was found from the incident report submitted by MTRCL.</p>	
033545 – 033559	Chairman Administration	Closing remarks	