

立法會

Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)591/18-19
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of special meeting on Friday, 6 July 2018, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex

- Members present :** Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon AU Nok-hin
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
- Members attending :** Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP

Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP

Members absent : Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP

Public Officers attending : **Agenda item I**

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing
(Transport)1
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and
Housing (Transport)7
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Daniel CHUNG Kum-wah, JP
Director of Highways
Highways Department

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP
Principal Government Engineer / Railway
Development
Highways Department

Mr Jonathan LEUNG Man-ho
Government Engineer / Railway Development 1
Highways Department

Attendance by invitation : **Agenda item I**

MTR Corporation Limited

Prof Frederick MA
Chairman

Mr Lincoln LEONG
Chief Executive Officer

Dr Philco WONG
Projects Director

Ms Linda SO Ka-pik
Corporate Affairs Director

Mr Jason WONG
GM – SCL Civil East West Line and Projects
Management Office

Mr Neil NG
Project Manager – SCL Civil –North South Line

Samsung-Hsin Chong JV

Mr Steven MEREDITH
Board Member

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sophie LAU
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Joyce CHING
Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM
Legislative Assistant (4)2

Action

I. Issues relating to construction works at To Kwa Wan Station and Exhibition Centre Station under the Shatin to Central Link project

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)1354/17-18(01) and (02))

At the invitation of the Chairman, Projects Director of MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed members on issues relating to construction works at To Kwa Wan Station and Exhibition Centre Station under the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL") project with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)1365/17-18(01)).

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

3. On a member's request, MTRCL agreed to provide information on its waste management plan in respect of the usage of inert excavation materials and construction waste generated during new railway projects.

(Post-meeting note: the supplementary information was circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)298/18-19(01) on 6 December 2018.)

(At 10:18 am, the Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes to 10:45 am.)

Motion

4. The Chairman advised that he had received a motion proposed by Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and two amendments to Mr LAM's motion proposed respectively by Mr CHAN Han-pan and Mr LAU Kwok-fan, and Mr Gary FAN. The Chairman considered that the proposed motion and amendments to motion were directly related to the agenda item under discussion.

5. The Chairman then referred members to the original motion moved by Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and amendments moved by Mr CHAN Han-pan and Mr LAU Kwok-fan, and Mr Gary FAN –

Original motion moved by Mr LAM Cheuk-ting

"本會強烈譴責：

一、 運房局及港鐵監管工程嚴重失職；

Action

- 二、 相關承辦商不按合約圖則進行工程，損害工程質素，威脅工人安全；
- 三、 禮頓一再拒絕公開交代事件，及出席本會會議，毫無企業操守；

並要求嚴懲相關機構及責任人，及削減港鐵管理人酬金。"

(Translation)

"This Subcommittee strongly condemns:

- (1) the Transport and Housing Bureau and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") for their serious dereliction of duty in monitoring the construction works;
- (2) the contractors concerned for their failure to carry out the works according to the contract drawings, thereby compromising the quality of works and putting the safety of workers at risk;
- (3) Leighton Contractors (Asia) Limited ("Leighton") for its repeated refusal to give an open account of the incident and attend meeting of this Subcommittee as well as its lack of corporate ethics.

it also demands that the relevant parties and responsible persons be severely punished and the project management fee payable to MTRCL be reduced."

Motion as amended by Mr CHAN Han-pan and Mr LAU Kwok-fan (Amendment proposed by Mr CHAN and Mr LAU was marked in italic)

"本會強烈譴責：

- 一、 運房局及港鐵監管工程嚴重失職；
- 二、 相關承辦商不按合約圖則進行工程，損害工程質素，威脅工人安全；

Action

三、 禮頓一再拒絕公開交代事件，及出席本會會議，毫無企業操守；

並要求嚴懲相關機構及責任人，及削減港鐵管理人酬金，

四、 *同時，政府作為港鐵最大股東並且是董事局成員，應就連串事件，扣減管理層薪酬或獎金，以示向公眾問責。*"

(Translation)

"This Subcommittee strongly condemns:

- (1) the Transport and Housing Bureau and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") for their serious dereliction of duty in monitoring the construction works;
- (2) the contractors concerned for their failure to carry out the works according to the contract drawings, thereby compromising the quality of works and putting the safety of workers at risk;
- (3) Leighton Contractors (Asia) Limited ("Leighton") for its repeated refusal to give an open account of the incident and attend meeting of this Subcommittee as well as its lack of corporate ethics;

it also demands that the relevant parties and responsible persons be severely punished and the project management fee payable to MTRCL be reduced;

- (4) *meanwhile, in the light of the recent spate of incidents, the Government, being the majority shareholder of MTRCL and represented on the Board of Directors of MTRCL, should deduct the remunerations or bonuses of the company's management to show accountability to the public."*

Action

Motion as amended by Mr Gary FAN (Amendment proposed by Mr FAN was underlined)

"本會強烈譴責：

- 一、 運房局及港鐵監管工程嚴重失職；
- 二、 相關承辦商不按合約圖則進行工程，損害工程質素，威脅工人安全；
- 三、 禮頓一再拒絕公開交代事件，及出席本會會議，毫無企業操守；

並要求嚴懲相關機構及責任人，及削減港鐵管理人酬金，

四、 同時，政府作為港鐵最大股東並且是董事局成員，應就連串事件，扣減管理層薪酬或獎金，以示向公眾問責；及

五、 港鐵主席馬時亨應引咎辭職，陳帆局長應問責下台。"

(Translation)

"This Subcommittee strongly condemns:

- (1) the Transport and Housing Bureau and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") for their serious dereliction of duty in monitoring the construction works;
- (2) the contractors concerned for their failure to carry out the works according to the contract drawings, thereby compromising the quality of works and putting the safety of workers at risk;
- (3) Leighton Contractors (Asia) Limited ("Leighton") for its repeated refusal to give an open account of the incident and attend meeting of this Subcommittee as well as its lack of corporate ethics;

Action

it also demands that the relevant parties and responsible persons be severely punished and the project management fee payable to MTRCL be reduced;

(4) *meanwhile, in the light of the recent spate of incidents, the Government, being the majority shareholder of MTRCL and represented on the Board of Directors of MTRCL, should deduct the remunerations or bonuses of the company's management to show accountability to the public; and*

(5) Chairman of MTRCL, Frederick MA Si-hang, should take the blame and resign, while Secretary Frank CHAN should be held accountable and step down."

6. Members agreed that the amendment proposed by Mr Gary FAN be proceeded with at the meeting. The Chairman said that the Subcommittee would first vote on the amendment proposed by Mr Gary FAN. Upon request of Mr CHAN Han-pan, the Chairman ordered that the voting bell be rung for five minutes. Responding to Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and Mr Gary FAN's enquiries whether ringing voting bell was required, the Chairman pointed out that in accordance with Rule 24(i) of the House Rules, before a matter was voted upon at a meeting of a committee, a voting bell would be rung if the chairman ordered, on his own motion or upon the request of a member of the committee, that the members of the committee be notified of the voting.

7. The Chairman reminded members that non-Subcommittee members did not have voting right in respect of the business of the Subcommittee. At members' request, the Chairman ordered a division. Of the members present for voting, nine members voted for, seven member voted against the amendment and no member abstained. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Ms Claudia MO
Mr CHU Hoi-dick
Ms Tanya CHAN
Mr Jeremy TAM
Mr AU Nok-hin
(9 members)

Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr Gary FAN

Action

Against:

Mrs Regina IP
Mr CHAN Han-pan
Dr Junius HO
Mr Tony TSE
(7 members)

Mr YIU Si-wing
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok
Mr LAU Kwok-fan

Abstain:

(0 member)

8. The Chairman declared that the amendment moved by Mr Gary FAN was carried and thus there was no need to deal with the amendment moved by Mr CHAN Han-pan and Mr LAU Kwok-fan as well as the original motion moved by Mr LAM Cheuk-ting.

9. The Administration was requested to provide written response to the motion passed.

(Post-meeting note: the wording of the motion passed was circulated to members on 11 July 2018 vide LC Paper No. CB(4)1369/17-18(01) and the Administration's written response was circulated to members on 29 January 2019 vide LC Paper No. CB(4)486/18-19(01).)

II. Any other business

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:44 am.

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
26 February 2019

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 6 July 2018, from 8:30 am
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Issues relating to construction works at To Kwa Wan Station and Exhibition Centre Station under the Shatin to Central Link project</i>			
000458 – 001533	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Ms Tanya CHAN Mr LAM Cheuk-ting Mr Tony TSE	<p>Discussion on the arrangements relating to the special meeting scheduled for Friday, 13 July 2018 to discuss issues relating to the alleged substandard steel works at Hung Hom Station under the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL") project.</p> <p>Responding to Ms MO's enquiry, the Chairman advised that relevant contractors/subcontractors being invited to attend the special meeting held today or to be held next week would not be protected by the privileges and immunities provided under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) when addressing the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee").</p> <p>Ms CHAN's suggestion and the Chairman's response regarding the moving of a motion at today's meeting to seek the Council's authorization under section 9(2) of Cap. 382 for the Subcommittee to exercise the powers conferred by section 9(1) of that Ordinance, so as to order relevant parties to attend the special meeting scheduled for the following week to answer questions in relation to the works quality of the Hung Hom Station Extension.</p> <p>The Chairman further reminded Mr Steven MEREDITH, Board Member of the Samsung-Hsin Chong Joint Venture ("Samsung-Hsin Chong"), that when addressing to the Subcommittee, he was not protected by the privileges and immunities provided under Cap. 382.</p>	
001533– 001905	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration on the agenda item [LC Paper No. CB(4)1354/17-18(01)].	
001905 – 004010	Chairman MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)1365/17-18(01)].	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
004010 – 004414	Chairman Ms Claudia MO MTRCL Samsung-Hsin Chong	<p>Ms MO sought clarifications and MTRCL's response on the following issues in relation to the construction of internal wall at To Kwa Wan Station:</p> <p>(a) the extent to which the reinforcement within the concrete wall had been removed; and</p> <p>(b) whether the reuse and recycling of construction waste generated on-site met the relevant requirements prescribed by the Environmental Protection Department.</p> <p>Responding to Ms MO's request for an open apology, Samsung-Hsin Chong said that the removal of reinforcement in localized areas of the internal wall was an error and that remedial proposals had been proposed to MTRCL for its consideration.</p> <p>Ms MO expressed dissatisfaction with the opening remarks of the Secretary of Transport and Housing ("STH") because it seemed to her that STH did not need to be held accountable for the works quality problems of the SCL.</p>	
004414 – 004822	Chairman Mr Gary FAN MTRCL	<p>Mr FAN's view that the mechanism of both the Administration and MTRCL for monitoring the implementation of SCL project had collapsed. He was gravely concerned about MTRCL's reporting mechanism and the suspected cover-up of the removal of steel reinforcement from the concrete wall at To Kwa Wan Station by the parties concerned. Mr FAN considered that both the Chairman of MTRCL and STH should be held accountable for the works quality problems of the SCL and step down.</p> <p>Mr FAN's query and MTRCL's response regarding the number of steel reinforcement bars being removed from the concrete wall and the photo record of the reinforcement remedial works carried out by the contractor.</p>	
004822 – 005229	Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting MTRCL	<p>Mr LAM's view that the site supervision system of MTRCL for the SCL project had collapsed. Pointing out that the contractor concerned disregarded the Non-Conformance Reports ("NCRs") issued by MTRCL in respect of the excavation works at Exhibition Centre Station, Mr LAM commented that MTRCL, as the project</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>manager of the SCL project, had failed to properly supervise its contractor.</p> <p>Mr LAM's question and MTRCL's response regarding the method adopted to remove the cover layer of the internal wall concerned at To Kwa Wan Station as proposed under the remedial proposal.</p>	
005229 – 005710	Chairman Mr LAU Kwok-fan Administration MTRCL	<p>Mr LAU's enquiry and the Administration's response on whether the project management cost of SCL payable to MTRCL would be reduced. Mr LAU's comment that remunerations and bonuses of MTRCL's management should be deducted in light of the recent spate of incidents.</p> <p>The Administration advised that it would handle the incidents concerned seriously having regard to the facts of all related issues. The Administration would reserve all the rights to pursue the responsibilities of and recover relevant costs incurred from MTRCL in case MTRCL was found to be at fault upon completion of the investigation conducted afterwards.</p> <p>Mr LAU's further question and MTRCL's response regarding the responsibility on the part of the Registered Geotechnical Engineers employed by MTRCL who failed to take appropriate actions to stop the contractor concerned from carrying out excavation beyond the allowable depth at Exhibition Centre Station.</p>	
005710 – 010119	Chairman Mr WU Chi-wai MTRCL	<p>Mr WU's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the reasons for Leighton-China State Joint Venture ("Leighton-China State"), the contractor responsible for the excavation works at Exhibition Centre Station, to carry out excavation exceeding the allowable depth before the proper installation of temporary lateral struts.</p>	
010119 – 010540	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN MTRCL	<p>Ms CHAN's concern on the following issues:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the project management cost of SCL payable to MTRCL; (b) the maximum limit on the amount of claims that the Administration was entitled to pursue against MTRCL as set out in the entrustment agreement; and 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>(c) the competence of the Projects Director of MTRCL in steering and monitoring the SCL project.</p> <p>MTRCL responded that its project team had all along made its best endeavours to take forward the SCL project. Notwithstanding the recent shortcomings on the implementation of the project, MTRCL stressed that safety was always the Corporation's top priority and that it would not compromise safety and quality of works of the SCL project.</p>	
010540 – 010959	<p>Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Dr CHENG's question regarding the reasons for Leighton-China State's refusal to attend the meeting, and the Administration's and MTRCL's response.</p>	
010959 – 011411	<p>Chairman Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok MTRCL</p>	<p>Ir Dr LO sought clarifications and MTRCL's response regarding the excavation depth of the railway station construction works at Exhibition Centre Station and relevant details concerning the installation of temporary lateral strut level.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO requested MTRCL to provide information on its waste management plan in respect of the usage of inert excavation materials and construction waste generated during new railway projects.</p>	<p>MTRCL (paragraph 3 of the minutes referred)</p>
011411 – 011830	<p>Chairman Mr Alvin YEUNG Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr YEUNG's question and the Administration's response regarding the project management cost of SCL payable to MTRCL.</p> <p>Mr YEUNG's call for disclosing the SCL entrustment agreement, and the Administration's response.</p>	
011830 – 012253	<p>Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Administration MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr CHAN's questions and the Administration's responses on:</p> <p>(a) the terms of reference of the Commission of Inquiry appointed by the Chief Executive in Council to inquire into issues relating to the diaphragm wall and platform slab construction works at the Hung Hum Station Extension under the SCL project; and</p> <p>(b) possibility to reduce the project management costs of SCL payable to MTRCL.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Mr CHAN's question and MTRCL's response on the deduction of remunerations and bonuses for the management.	
012253 – 012712	Chairman MTRCL Samsung-Hsin Chong	<p>In reply to the Chairman's enquiry, Samsung-Hsin Chong responded that it was an error that prior approval from MTRCL had not been sought before removing part of the reinforcement from the internal wall concerned at To Kwa Wan Station.</p> <p>The Chairman's enquiries and MTRCL's responses regarding:</p> <p>(a) the reasons for the GM – SCL Civil East West Line and Project Projects Management Office of MTRCL not identifying the removal of reinforcement at the internal wall concerned during regular site inspection; and</p> <p>(b) the reasons for the Project Manager – SCL Civil – North South Line of MTRCL not seeking assistance from the senior management after having learnt that Leighton-China State had disregarded the NCR issued and continued to proceed with the excavation works.</p>	
012712 – 013120	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick	<p>Mr CHU raised the following views/ queries:</p> <p>(a) citing the defective workmanship at the Hung Hom North Approach Tunnels as an example, Mr CHU opined that the apology made by MTRCL was not sincere;</p> <p>(b) the information provided respectively by the Administration and MTRCL pertaining to the incident on the excavation works at Exhibition Centre Station was inconsistent; and</p> <p>(c) Projects Director of MTRCL informed members in his earlier reply that although the contractor had carried out backfilling works at localized areas subsequent to the receipt of NCR on 10 May 2018, over-excavation lower than the allowable depth had continued at another localized area. The information given by Projects Director was inconsistent with the details set out in paragraph 7 of Enclosure II of Annex 2 to the</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		Administration's paper.	
013120 – 013535	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing Administration	<p>Mr YIU's concern and the Administration's/MTRCL's response regarding:</p> <p>(a) MTRCL's works supervision mechanism of the SCL project, and relevant disciplinary system against its officers who violated internal procedures and guidelines; and</p> <p>(b) the safety and quality of the construction of the SCL project, and the possible impact on the progress of the project due to the incidents concerned.</p>	
013535 – 013950	Chairman Mrs Regina IP Administration	Mrs IP's question and the Administration's response regarding the details of the monitoring system of the SCL project such as frequency of inspections.	
013950 – 014411	Chairman Mr AU Nok-hin MTRCL Administration	<p>Mr AU's questions and MTRCL's responses regarding:</p> <p>(a) the disclosure of SCL entrustment agreement; and</p> <p>(b) possibility to deduct remunerations and bonuses for the management.</p> <p>Responding to Mr AU's further question, the Administration clarified that the contractor had submitted two documents to MTRCL on 19 June 2018, including a remedial proposal and a design check concerning the over-excavation at Exhibition Centre Station.</p>	
014411 – 014820	Chairman Mr Jeremy TAM MTRCL Administration	<p>Mr TAM's question and MTRCL's response regarding the follow-up actions required of Leighton-China State after the issuance of NCRs.</p> <p>Mr TAM was strongly dissatisfied with MTRCL's failure to stop the excavation works beyond the allowable depth by the contractor concerned at Exhibition Centre Station and report the incident to the Administration.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated its stance that the incident on the excavation works at Exhibition Centre Station that the contractor concerned had carried out excavation beyond the allowable depth without prior approval from MTRCL was considered unacceptable.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Mr TAM requested the Administration to investigate into whether the contractor concerned had breached the relevant law and whether the individuals concerned should bear the criminal liability.</p>	
014820 – 015304	<p>Chairman Mr Tony TSE MTRCL</p>	<p>Mr TSE's enquiry and MTRCL's response regarding the follow-up actions taken to implement the recommendations put forward in reports submitted by the Independent Board Committee of MTRCL and the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link Independent Expert Panel appointed by the Administration to enhance the monitoring and reporting mechanism of railway projects.</p>	
015304 – 015720	<p>Chairman Mr James TO Administration</p>	<p>Mr TO's question and the Administration's response regarding the appropriate time for MTRCL to notify the Administration of the issues relating to the alleged cutting of threaded steel bars at the Hung Hum Station Extension.</p> <p>Pointing out that the Administration disregarded the email sent by a representative from the China Technology Corporation Limited requesting for a meeting with the Transport and Housing Bureau in September 2017, Mr TO wondered whether the Administration had deliberately turned a blind eye to the alleged defective steel works at the Hung Hom Station Extension. He considered that STH should step down.</p>	
015720 – 020123	<p>Chairman Dr Junius HO MTRCL</p>	<p>Dr HO's questions and MTRCL's responses regarding:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) the impact of the three incidents, namely alleged defective steel works at the Hung Hom Station Extension, the removal of reinforcement in localized areas of the internal wall at To Kwa Wan Station and the over-excavation at Exhibition Centre Station, on the progress of the SCL project; (b) the assessment on the amount of loss arising from the abovementioned three incidents; and (c) any contingency plan in place to continue with the construction works at Exhibition Centre Station in case either Leighton-China State or the Administration had decided to 	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		terminate the works contract.	
020123 – 020227	Chairman Ms Claudia MO Administration	Ms MO's view that STH should be held responsible for the series of problems with the SCL project and step down. The Administration's response.	
020227 – 020331	Chairman Mr Gary FAN MTRCL Administration	Mr FAN's questions and MTRCL's/Administration's responses regarding: (a) whether the Chairman of MTRCL would take the blame and resign; and (b) whether STH would step down as a show of accountability.	
020331– 020435	Chairman Ms Tanya CHAN MTRCL	Ms CHAN's question on whether MTRCL had reported any violation or law-breaking situation found to the Police, and MTRCL's response.	
020435 – 020544	Chairman MTRCL	In response to the Chairman's enquiry, MTRCL advised that the performance of the contractors concerned would be taken into account in future tendering exercises. Tender for future works contract submitted by Leighton-China State might not be considered in view of the recent incidents.	
020544 – 020649	Chairman Mr LAM Cheuk-ting MTRCL	Mr LAM's question on whether Dr Philco WONG would resign from the office of Projects Director of MTRCL and President of the Hong Kong Institution of Engineers, and MTRCL's response.	
020649 – 020806	Chairman Mr CHU Hoi-dick Administration MTRCL	In reply to Mr CHU's question, the Administration advised that based on the information currently available, there was no clear evidence indicating that Leighton-China State had breached the law notwithstanding the fact that it had disregarded the NCR issued and proceeded with the excavation works.	
020806 – 020933	Chairman Dr CHENG Chung-tai MTRCL	Dr CHENG's concern and MTRCL's response on the safety of Sung Wong Toi Station.	
020933 – 021840	Chairman Mr CHAN Han-pan Mr LAM Cheuk-ting Mr Gary FAN	Mr LAM Cheuk-ting and Mr Gary FAN's enquiries on arrangements relating to ringing of voting bell. Voting on amendment to Mr LAM Cheuk-ting's motion proposed by Mr Gary FAN	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item II –Any other business</i>			
021840 – 021845	Chairman	Closing remarks	

Council Business Division 4
Legislative Council Secretariat
26 February 2019