

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)895/17-18
(These minutes have been seen by
the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PS/2/16

Panel on Development and Panel on Home Affairs

**Joint Subcommittee to monitor the implementation of
the West Kowloon Cultural District Project**

**Minutes of meeting held on
Wednesday, 20 December 2017, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

- Members present** : Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH (Chairman)
Hon Tanya CHAN (Deputy Chairman)
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
- Member attending** : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP

**Public officers
attending**

: **Agenda items I and II**

Mrs Betty FUNG CHING Suk-ye, JP
Permanent Secretary for Home Affairs

Mrs Angelina CHEUNG FUNG Wing-ping, JP
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (2)

Mr Eric CHENG Siu-fun
Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West
Kowloon Cultural District)

Agenda item II

Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen, JP
Project Manager (Home Affairs Bureau)

**Attendance by
invitation**

: **Agenda items I and II**

Mr Duncan PESCOD, GBS, JP
Chief Executive Officer
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Mr Louis YU
Executive Director, Performing Arts
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Ms Alison FRIEDMAN
Artistic Director, Performing Arts
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Ms Lisa TSANG
Head, Venue Operations (Performing Arts)
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda item I

Ms Suhanya RAFFEL
Executive Director, M+
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda item II

Mr Jeremy STOWE
Director, Project Control
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Clerk in attendance : Ms Doris LO
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Mandy LI
Council Secretary (1)2

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)2

I Cultural software development for the West Kowloon Cultural District

(LC Paper No. CB(1)354/17-18(01) — Administration's paper on cultural software development for the West Kowloon Cultural District

LC Paper No. CB(1)354/17-18(02) — Paper on the development of cultural software and mode of management of the West Kowloon Cultural District project prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat (Updated background brief))

The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

II Update on the development of the Art Park and Freespace

(LC Paper No. CB(1)354/17-18(03) — Administration's paper on update on the development of the Art Park and Freespace

LC Paper No. CB(1)354/17-18(04) — Paper on the development of the Art Park and

Freespace prepared by the
Legislative Council
Secretariat (Updated
background brief))

2. The Joint Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

III Any other business

Date of the next meeting and items for discussion

3. Members agreed that the next meeting would be scheduled for Friday, 9 February 2018, from 8:30 am to 10:30 am to discuss the following items proposed by the Administration:

- (a) Update on the financial situation of and the enhanced financial arrangement for the West Kowloon Cultural District project; and
 - (b) Update on the development of Xiqu Centre.
4. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:38 am.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 April 2018

Panel on Development and Panel on Home Affairs

**Proceedings of meeting of the Joint Subcommittee to Monitor
the Implementation of the West Kowloon Cultural District Project
held on Wednesday, 20 December 2017, at 8:30 am
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
Agenda Item I – Cultural software development for the West Kowloon Cultural District			
001644-004358	Chairman Administration West Kowloon Cultural District Authority ("WKCD")	Briefing by the Administration and WKCD [LC Paper Nos. CB(1)354/17-18(01) and CB(1)376/17-18(01)]	
004359-004938	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCD	<p>Dr WONG enquired about:</p> <p>(a) how WKCD would enhance collaborations with and support for arts teachers and educators in local schools and universities with a view to maximizing efforts in promoting arts education and developing students' ability in appreciating arts; and</p> <p>(b) whether WKCD had launched summer programmes for students to let them have an advanced understanding of the West Kowloon Cultural District ("WKCD") in preparation for the commissioning of its arts and cultural facilities.</p> <p>WKCD indicated that:</p> <p>(a) arts education, including the important elements of training the trainers, audience building and community engagement were among the key on-going initiatives of WKCD. For example, M+ had organized a school and community outreach programme <i>M+ Rover</i> each year since 2016. Other initiatives included the monthly <i>Freespace Happening</i> programme held in the Nursery Park, the <i>101 Lecture/Workshop Series</i> offering free learning and participatory courses in major performing arts forms, and exhibitions at M+ Pavilion, etc.; and</p> <p>(b) M+ held <i>M+ Summer Camp</i> in the past three summers. The camps had attracted over 300 students from different schools and backgrounds so far.</p> <p>Dr WONG acknowledged the above efforts of WKCD and hoped to see the continuation and expansion of those</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		programmes that had reaped positive results and to reach more audience.	
004939-005619	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCDA	<p>The Deputy Chairman was concerned if the diverse views of some local xiqu performers on the appointment of a non-Chinese Artistic Director, Performing Arts would have any impact on WKCDA's plans relating to the Xiqu Centre soon to be opened. She further asked about:</p> <p>(a) whether WKCDA would consider further extending the duration of the M+ internship programme to over six months, and initiating some forms of interface between the M+ internship programme and the Arts Administrator Trainee Programme under the Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD");</p> <p>(b) how WKCDA would support longer running productions in the light of its "Performing Arts Venue Hiring Policy"; and details of the charging mechanism for venue hiring, including how the box office income would be shared between WKCDA and the hirers for ticketed events, as well as the setting of the ticket prices such as for the Tea House Theatre programmes.</p> <p>WKCDA indicated that the Authority maintained close contacts with the xiqu community, in particular The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong (香港八和會館), on the development of the Xiqu Centre. The Head of Xiqu had been appointed recently to take up the task of, among others, enhancing the collaboration between WKCDA and the xiqu community. Besides, the Xiqu Centre Advisory Panel would advise the Performing Arts Committee on the management and operation of the Xiqu Centre and other matters relating to the development of the xiqu art form. WKCDA further responded that:</p> <p>(a) it would continue to review the arrangements including the duration of the M+ internship programme. Apart from this programme, the Venice Biennale Internship Programme was another ongoing initiative of M+ offering the chance for interns to gain unique insight into the working of the international art exhibitions; and</p> <p>(b) under the artistically-driven approach for according priority in venue booking, the Performing Arts Department of WKCDA would determine the priority for staging artistic events with due consideration to the duration of the performance period of the productions and the art forms. Generally speaking,</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>longer run productions would be given higher priority in booking. A two-tier venue charging approach comprising a base hiring fee and a percentage share of box office income would be adopted for ticketed events. Under this approach, WKCDA could recover the basic event-generated costs and out-of-pocket expenses. In addition, through financial risk-sharing, small and medium-sized performing companies might be able to stage productions of longer duration. At the moment, the price-setting would be subject to the approval of the Board of WKCDA. There would be an announcement in the coming months.</p>	
005620-010239	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCDA	<p>Mr YIU enquired about:</p> <p>(a) in pursuit of its vision to become a world-class arts and cultural hub, whether it would be adequate focusing on local performances, or there should be plans on and budget for inviting also renowned arts groups from the Mainland and the overseas to stage performances at WKCD; if the latter, the proportion of groups to be invited; and</p> <p>(b) the expected number of full-time and part-time docent volunteers when WKCD facilities were in operation; and whether WKCDA would collaborate with local travel agents and provide training to local tourist guides on the provision of docent services in WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA explained that:</p> <p>(a) with priority given to the grooming of local arts groups and performers, the Authority had also forged partnerships with overseas organizations in support of the long-term development of Hong Kong's performing arts ecology. For example, WKCDA had signed memoranda of understanding with institutions in the Mainland, Australia, the United Kingdom, Finland, etc. It would bring artists from other parts of the world to Hong Kong to present their works, thereby providing a platform for artistic inspiration and exchanges. Meanwhile, WKCDA had also joined the Silk Road International League of Theatres initiated by the China Arts and Entertainment Group, and had been working closely with associations and troupes in the region with a view to promoting traditional Chinese performing arts to a wider audience;</p> <p>(b) WKCDA would update members on the latest</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>financial situation of the WKCD project including the uses of its budget at the meeting of the Joint Subcommittee in February 2018; and</p> <p>(c) M+ team had launched a docent volunteer programme with about 105 docent volunteers engaged so far to give regular tours of its exhibitions. The number of docent volunteer was expected to grow significantly. WKCDA also maintained close contacts with the Hong Kong Tourism Board ("HKTB") on promoting WKCD.</p>	
010240-010838	Chairman WKCDA	<p>The Chairman asked about:</p> <p>(a) details of the WKCDA's publicity work for WKCD;</p> <p>(b) whether any tracking survey was conducted on the young local artists participated in the "Rising Stars of Cantonese Opera" programme; if so, of the details, such as whether they were still working in the xiqu sector after the programme;</p> <p>(c) details of the capacity building initiatives and public programmes to be taken forward in 2018 and so; and</p> <p>(d) whether the base hiring fee under the venue charging mechanism would adequately cover the operating costs of the performing arts venues in WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <p>(a) it had made use of various internet and multi-media channels to engage the community and young people were a particular target. It also used the traditional media channels. WKCDA had appointed a company to deal with international media and communication matters. Also, WKCDA attended Legislative Council meetings on a regular basis to keep members abreast of the latest developments at WKCD;</p> <p>(b) it had organized a range of professional development and audience building programmes since 2012, and the professionals nurtured would be well-prepared for the opening of the arts and cultural venues in WKCD. The Xiqu Centre would open in late 2018, to be followed by Freespace in 2019 where special programmes produced by WKCDA would be staged throughout the opening year.; and</p> <p>(c) WKCDA would strive to achieve financial</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>sustainability for its venues while theatres and museums generally would not generate much profit. It was expected that the hiring income should cover most of the operating costs, such as electricity and cleaning fees, etc., of the performing arts venues.</p>	
010839-011348	<p>Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCDA</p>	<p>Ms MO enquired about:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) a rough estimate range on the latest project cost for WKCD; (b) whether WKCDA could ensure the international exchange programmes would cater for not only conventional established artists but also fringe artists in Hong Kong; and (c) whether <i>Rethinking Pei: A Centenary Symposium</i>, organized by M+ in October and December 2017, would be held at other performing arts venues in Hong Kong (e.g. City Hall, Arts Centre, Cultural Centre, etc.). <p>WKCDA advised that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) given that the budget estimates for 2018-2019 were subject to approval by the Board of WKCDA, it was not appropriate to disclose relevant information at this stage. Generally speaking, WKCDA expected that the operating deficit would increase further in the coming years; (b) WKCDA had initiated a number of cultural exchange and collaboration programmes to broaden and deepen exchanges between art communities and artists of all levels, diverse cultures and origins; and (c) M+ had organized <i>Rethinking Pei: A Centenary Symposium</i> with the Graduate School of Design at Harvard University and the Department of Architecture at The University of Hong Kong. The symposium was well received by attendees in Boston and Hong Kong. M+ programmes and pedagogical approaches would make contemporary visual culture accessible to visitors of all ages, backgrounds, and needs. 	
011349-011940	<p>Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA</p>	<p>Dr WONG agreed with the proposed guiding principles under the venue hiring policy for WKCD. She asked how the hiring charges would be set at an affordable level, particularly for the micro, small and medium-sized</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>performing companies and how the hiring charges would compare to that of LCSD. She further opined that:</p> <p>(a) WKCDA should maximize utilization of the performing arts venues, and support small and medium-sized arts groups by introducing a concessionary charging rate; and</p> <p>(b) WKCDA should consider providing concession tickets for senior citizens, retirees and students.</p> <p>WKCDA explained that:</p> <p>(a) under the proposed charging mechanism for ticketed events, the nature of the programme and other factors would be taken into account, while the sharing of financial risks between the hirer and WKCDA would better support the small and medium-sized performing companies; and</p> <p>(b) WKCDA provided concessionary tickets for its programmes, e.g. Rising Stars of Cantonese Opera. For individual programmes, different ticketing arrangements might be adopted.</p>	
011941-012413	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCDA	<p>The Chairman and the Deputy Chairman both asked about the considerations and criteria for staging productions organized or co-organized by WKCDA, and the proportions of such productions in all productions to be staged at the performing arts venues in WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that each performing arts venue was characterized by its unique artistic mission and identity. In determining the priority of productions to be staged at the venues, one of the key factors would be their artistic considerations. Only a small proportion (i.e. about 10%) of the programmes was expected to be produced by WKCDA.</p>	
012414-012725	Chairman Mr YIU Si-wing WKCDA	<p>Mr YIU asked about:</p> <p>(a) the expected visitor sources for WKCD and their respective proportion, and future resources deployment for promoting WKCD to visitors from other places; and</p> <p>(b) any plans for collaboration with HKTB on publicity programmes for WKCD.</p> <p>WKCDA explained that:</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>(a) it would target all visitors both locally and internationally. To attract visitors from long-haul markets, WKCDA was stepping up publicity efforts including in-flight advertising for promoting WKCD and its events. The proportion of visitors from different locations would depend on the nature of each programme, WKCDA did not set a target proportion as a whole; and</p> <p>(b) WKCDA had regular contacts, and maintained close liaison with the Tourism Commission and HKTB to launch joint marketing activities. It would discuss with HKTB on the arrangement to provide relevant training for tour guides.</p>	
012726-013059	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCDA	<p>Ms MO enquired about the measures for supporting small sized and minority arts groups.</p> <p>WKCDA indicated that:</p> <p>(a) WKCDA had supported two local indie bands, viz GDJYB (雞蛋蒸肉餅) and ANWIYCTI (A New World If You Can Take It), to represent Hong Kong at the renowned <i>Iceland Airwaves Music Festival 2017</i>; and</p> <p>(b) it positively encouraged street entertainment to take place within the district, and had established a Street Performance Scheme, under which more than 300 Street Performance Permits ("SP Permits") had been issued since its establishment.</p>	
Agenda Item II – Update on the development of the Art Park and Freespace			
013100-014440	Chairman Administration WKCDA	<p>Briefing by the Administration and WKCDA [LC Paper Nos. CB(1)354/17-18(03) and CB(1)376/17-18(02)]</p> <p>Extension of meeting for 10 minutes</p>	
014441-014900	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCDA	<p>Ms MO enquired about:</p> <p>(a) given that street performances were expected to be impromptu by nature, how WKCDA would frame such performances under the Street Performance Scheme and rank those which should be allowed to be performed in WKCD and those not;</p> <p>(b) whether a street performer was required to pay a</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>permit fee when applying for an SP Permit; and</p> <p>(c) the maximum number of SP Permits could be issued by WKCDA.</p> <p>WKCDA explained that:</p> <p>(a) it would not prescribe what the street performers would perform. The guidelines under the Street Performance Scheme mainly meant for safety and to ensure cooperation and mutual respect in the sharing of public space by street performers. On this premise, street performances should take place at specific locations and without obstructing emergency vehicular access. The Authority did not censor the content of performances and had no intention to rank or regulate the performances; and</p> <p>(b) applicants should apply in person for SP Permits, which were valid for one-year, at a cost of HK\$100. There was no upper limit on the number of permit to be issued. As at December 2017, 398 SP Permits had been issued by WKCDA since the establishment of the Street Performance Scheme.</p>	
014901-015419	Chairman Deputy Chairman WKCDA	<p>The Deputy Chairman sought explanation on:</p> <p>(a) further details of the progress of the Art Park, particularly the statutory procedures of Phase 1, and details of Phase 3 of the Art Park;</p> <p>(b) whether WKCDA would revisit the guidelines for street performance and the policy for issuing SP Permits; and</p> <p>(c) whether and when the Young Performers and the West Kowloon Street Performer Programme would be launched; if so, of the details.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <p>(a) it had submitted a statutory form to the Fire Services Department and the Buildings Department for the opening of Phase 1 of the Art Park;</p> <p>(b) the interfacing car park would be provided next to M+ underneath the eastern part of the Art Park, providing 209 parking spaces. The contractor would provide soft landscaping on the top of the interfacing car park</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>upon full completion of the construction of M+ building; and</p> <p>(c) WKCDA did not see any urgency for launching the Young Performers Programme as there were only a few young performers under the age of 16 taking part in the events held at the Nursery Park. The West Kowloon Street Performer Programme programme aimed for performers who could demonstrate the professionalism and skills to present a polished performance.</p>	
015420-015952	Chairman Dr Helena WONG WKCDA	<p>Dr WONG enquired about the facilities to be provided in the Art Park, including whether there would be sufficient elderly-friendly facilities such as benches and rain/sun shelters. She also asked whether ferry piers would be provided in WKCD, and whether WKCDA had liaised with potential operators on the provision of ferry service for WKCD to tie in with the opening of Phase 1 of the Art Park.</p> <p>WKCDA responded that:</p> <p>(a) benches would be provided along the promenade. In addition, to promote a vibrant, green, "walkable" environment for visitors, a new form of autonomous and zero-emissions vehicle was being operated on a trial basis. There would also be retail and dining facilities at the Double Edged Design in the southern edge of the Art Park, as well as café in Freespace; and</p> <p>(b) there were two existing public landing steps within WKCD. WKCDA had proposed to take up the management responsibility of these public landing steps to facilitate the provision of water transport connection to be operated by third party providers. The proposal was subject to the approval of relevant government departments. An agreement could be reached and if all the permits were in place on time, the facilities could be in place by the opening of M+.</p>	
015953-020820	Chairman Dr Priscilla LEUNG WKCDA Administration	<p>Dr LEUNG was of the view that:</p> <p>(a) WKCDA should collaborate with the Education Bureau on the promotion of arts education in schools;</p> <p>(b) WKCDA should strengthen its support to encourage wider participation by the local community in arts and cultural activities; and</p> <p>(c) WKCDA should consider and liaise with relevant bureaux and departments on the introduction of water</p>	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required
		<p>taxi service to connect WKCD with Kai Tak Cruise Terminal.</p> <p>WKCD responded that it endeavoured to promote knowledge and appreciation of performing arts in schools and to cultivate art in the community through a wide spectrum of audience building schemes and arts educational activities.</p> <p>The Administration explained that it would not be financially viable for WKCD to provide water taxi service on its own. That said, the Administration would explore the feasibility of the provision of water taxis serving locations with major tourist attractions within Victoria Harbour. Subject to the completion of such study and the availability of public landing steps/ferry piers within WKCD, the Administration was open to the suggestion of providing WKCD with water taxis if the service was to be introduced.</p>	
020821-020919	Chairman WKCD	<p>The Chairman enquired whether SP Permit holders would be allowed to provide public entertainment anywhere within the district, e.g. the open area outside the Xiqu Centre.</p> <p>WKCD explained that the guideline for street performance was applicable for public open spaces within WKCD, including the open area outside the Xiqu Centre.</p>	
020920-021134	Chairman Ms Claudia MO WKCD	<p>Ms MO noted with concern the restrictions imposed on street performances in WKCD, such as the volume control, and the requirement that performers should be able to transport and remove all their instruments, props and equipment within three minutes. She doubted how WKCD would attract street performers in spite of such restrictions.</p> <p>WKCD responded that it should ensure the best interests of public safety and security as well as striking a proper balance among the various activities that would take place in WKCD. While WKCD was pleased to provide performance opportunities for street performers, it expected and required all those performing within WKCD to fully understand and agree with the notions of street performance that the guidelines promoted.</p>	
Agenda Item III – Any other business			
021135-021220	Chairman	Date of the next meeting and items for discussion	

Time marker	Speaker(s)	Subject(s)/Discussion	Action required

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
30 April 2018