

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(3) 486/18-19

Ref : CB(3)/M/OM

Tel : 3919 3300

Date : 21 March 2019

From : Clerk to the Legislative Council

To : All Members of the Legislative Council

Council meeting of 27 March 2019

**Amendments to motion on
implementing the Toll Adjustment Proposal**

Further to LC Paper No. CB(3) 429/18-19 issued on 1 March 2019, five Members (Hon Jeremy TAM, Hon LUK Chung-hung, Hon Gary FAN, Hon CHAN Han-pan and Hon AU Nok-hin) have respectively given notice of their intention to move amendments to the Secretary for Transport and Housing (“STH”)’s above motion at the Council meeting of 27 March 2019. As directed by the President, the respective amendments will be printed in the terms in which they were handed in on the Agenda of the Council.

2. The President will order **a joint debate** on the above motion and the five amendments. To facilitate Members’ debate, the President will:

- (a) call upon STH to speak and move his motion, and then propose the question on STH’s motion;
- (b) call upon the five Members who wish to move amendments to speak in the following order, but no amendment is to be moved at this stage:
 - (i) Hon Jeremy TAM;
 - (ii) Hon LUK Chung-hung;
 - (iii) Hon Gary FAN;
 - (iv) Hon CHAN Han-pan; and
 - (v) Hon AU Nok-hin;

- (c) invite other Members to speak;
- (d) call upon STH to speak on the amendments;
- (e) in accordance with Rule 34(5) of the Rules of Procedure, call upon the five Members to move their amendments in the order set out in (b) above. The President will first invite Hon Jeremy TAM to move his amendment, and forthwith propose and put to vote the question on Mr TAM's amendment;
- (f) after Mr TAM's amendment has been voted upon, deal with the other four amendments; and
- (g) after all amendments have been dealt with, call upon STH to reply. Thereafter, the President will put to vote the question on STH's original motion, or his motion as amended, as the case may be.

3. Members are invited to note that each Member (including amendment mover) can only **speak once and the time limit is 15 minutes. Public officer(s) will not be subject to any speaking time limit.**

4. For Members' reference, the terms of the original motion and the marked-up version of the amendments are set out in the **Appendix.**

(Dora WAI)
for Clerk to the Legislative Council

Encl.

(Translation)

**Motion debate on
“Implementing the Toll Adjustment Proposal”**

1. Secretary for Transport and Housing’s original motion

Regarding the Government’s proposal to adjust the tolls of private cars, taxis and motorcycles for using the three road harbour crossings with effect from 1 January 2020 (“Toll Adjustment Proposal”) with a view to rationalising cross-harbour traffic which will bring about benefits to society as a whole, with expected benefits including alleviating cross-harbour traffic congestion, reducing the obstruction of non-cross-harbour traffic by cross-harbour traffic queues, saving the commuting time for citizens using public transport and reducing emission from vehicles, etc., this Council supports the Government to introduce into this Council legislative amendments relating to the Cross-Harbour Tunnel and Eastern Harbour Crossing for the implementation of the Toll Adjustment Proposal, and to seek funding approval from the Finance Committee for the Western Harbour Crossing Toll Compensation Scheme.

2. Motion as amended by Hon Jeremy TAM

~~Regarding the Government’s proposal~~ *The SAR Government proposes* to adjust the tolls of private cars, taxis and motorcycles for using the three road harbour crossings with effect from 1 January 2020 (“Toll Adjustment Proposal”) with a view to rationalising cross-harbour traffic which will bring about benefits to society as a whole, with expected benefits including alleviating cross-harbour traffic congestion, reducing the obstruction of non-cross-harbour traffic by cross-harbour traffic queues, saving the commuting time for citizens using public transport and reducing emission from vehicles, etc., ~~this Council supports the Government to introduce into this Council legislative amendments relating to the Cross-Harbour Tunnel and Eastern Harbour Crossing for the implementation of the Toll Adjustment Proposal, and to seek funding approval from the Finance Committee for the Western Harbour Crossing Toll Compensation Scheme;~~ *yet, constrained by their locations of residence and work, many people must inevitably use the Cross-Harbour Tunnel (“CHT”) or Eastern Harbour Crossing (“EHC”) for travelling to their destinations, and, despite the toll adjustments, they will not easily switch to those more remote road harbour crossings; the Government’s proposal to substantially increase the tolls of CHT and EHC will add to people’s burden; hence, this Council requests the Government to discuss with the Western Harbour Tunnel Company Limited to further reduce the tolls of the Western Harbour*

Crossing (“WHC”), making room for lowering the rates of the toll increases for CHT and EHC, and to ensure that people can afford the relevant tolls and a social consensus is forged, which are the prerequisites for introducing into this Council the Toll Adjustment Proposal; in the long run, as the number of vehicles continues to grow, WHC will face congestion and by then, the proposal for traffic rationalisation among the road harbour crossings will be unable to alleviate congestion; hence the Government should explore cross-harbour traffic measures other than road harbour crossings as soon as possible, including the introduction of additional ferry services across the harbour or water bus services, and expeditiously conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study, so as to formulate long-term measures for ameliorating cross-harbour traffic congestion.

Note: Hon Jeremy TAM’s amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

3. Motion as amended by Hon LUK Chung-hung

~~Regarding the Government’s proposal~~ *The disparity in the design capacities of the three road harbour crossings and the traffic demands they can meet, especially the failure to fully and effectively utilise the capacity of the Western Harbour Crossing (“WHC”), has resulted in an uneven distribution of cross-harbour traffic among the three road harbour crossings and led to problems such as traffic congestion, so the Government proposes to adjust the tolls of private cars, taxis and motorcycles for using the three road harbour crossings with effect from 1 January 2020 (“Toll Adjustment Proposal”) with a view to rationalising cross-harbour traffic which will bring about benefits to society as a whole, with expected benefits including alleviating cross-harbour traffic congestion, reducing the obstruction of non-cross-harbour traffic by cross-harbour traffic queues, saving the commuting time for citizens using public transport and reducing emission from vehicles, etc.; however, raising the relevant tolls of the Cross-Harbour Tunnel (“CHT”) and Eastern Harbour Crossing (“EHC”) will increase the transport expenses of motorists and passengers using these two harbour crossings; hence, this Council requests that the existing tolls of CHT and EHC remain unchanged and, under this prerequisite,* supports the Government to ~~introduce into this Council legislative amendments relating to the Cross Harbour Tunnel and Eastern Harbour Crossing for the implementation of the Toll Adjustment Proposal, and to seek funding approval from the Finance Committee for the Western Harbour Crossing~~ *WHC Toll Compensation Scheme.*

Note: Hon LUK Chung-hung’s amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

4. Motion as amended by Hon Gary FAN

~~Regarding the Government's proposal~~ *The Chief Executive's proposal in the 2018 Policy Address* to adjust the tolls of private cars, taxis and motorcycles for using the three road harbour crossings with effect from 1 January 2020 ("Toll Adjustment Proposal") ~~with a view to rationalising~~ *has aroused huge controversy in society; while the Toll Adjustment Proposal seeks to rationalise* cross-harbour traffic which will bring about benefits to society as a whole, with expected benefits including alleviating cross-harbour traffic congestion, reducing the obstruction of non-cross-harbour traffic by cross-harbour traffic queues, saving the commuting time for citizens using public transport and reducing emission from vehicles, etc., *many people have questioned the Government's use of public money to pay a total compensation of up to \$1.8 billion to the Western Harbour Tunnel Company Limited; besides, since the Government took over the Eastern Harbour Crossing ("EHC") in 2016, it has failed to deal with the toll disparity between the Cross-Harbour Tunnel ("CHT") and EHC; furthermore, the Government's current proposal of increasing certain tolls of EHC for the purpose of rationalising the vehicular flows of CHT and the Western Harbour Crossing ("WHC") is unfair to residents of Tseung Kwan O, Kowloon East and Hong Kong Island East; hence, this Council supports requests that the Government should shelve its plan* to introduce into this Council legislative amendments relating to ~~the Cross-Harbour Tunnel CHT and Eastern Harbour Crossing EHC~~ for the implementation of the Toll Adjustment Proposal, and *its plan* to seek funding approval from the Finance Committee for the ~~Western Harbour Crossing WHC~~ Toll Compensation Scheme; *that if the Government puts forth a toll adjustment proposal again in the future, the proposal should take account of the affordability of motorists and passengers and aim at easing the burden of transport expenses on the public; and that the Government should expeditiously conduct the Fourth Comprehensive Transport Study and formulate measures for controlling the growth in vehicles and road traffic flows, in a bid to improve the cross-harbour traffic congestion in the long run.*

Note: Hon Gary FAN's amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

5. Motion as amended by Hon CHAN Han-pan

~~Regarding the Government's proposal~~ *the Chief Executive's proposal in the 2018 Policy Address* to adjust the tolls of private cars, taxis and motorcycles for using the three road harbour crossings with effect from 1 January 2020 ("Toll Adjustment Proposal") with a view to rationalising cross-harbour traffic which will bring about benefits to society as a whole, with expected benefits including alleviating cross-harbour traffic congestion, reducing the obstruction of

non-cross-harbour traffic by cross-harbour traffic queues, saving the commuting time for citizens using public transport and reducing emission from vehicles, etc., this Council supports *in principle* the Government to ~~introduce~~ *adopt measures for achieving a more balanced traffic distribution among the three road harbour crossings to ease the cross-harbour traffic congestion; regarding the Toll Adjustment Proposal put forth by the Government, this Council accepts the proposed toll reduction for private cars using the Western Harbour Crossing (“WHC”) from the existing \$70 to \$50, but has reservation about the toll increases for the Cross-Harbour Tunnel (“CHT”) and Eastern Harbour Crossing (“EHC”) from the respective \$20 and \$25 at present to \$40, considering that this will greatly increase the burden on CHT and EHC users and is extremely unfair to them; in addition, the commissioning of the Central-Wan Chai Bypass will have substantive impact on the traffic distribution among the three road harbour crossings; hence, this Council urges the Government to first assess the relevant situation and then put forth a new toll adjustment proposal which includes the following details:*

- (1) *to dispense with the need for substantial increase in the tolls of CHT and EHC;*
- (2) *to ensure a reduction in cross-harbour franchised bus fares; and*
- (3) *to include non-franchised buses (i.e. “residents’ coaches”), green minibuses, etc., into the scope of toll exemption, so as to reduce the fares of such means of transport;*

this Council also urges that the Government should secure a broad social consensus on the new toll adjustment proposal before introducing into this Council legislative amendments relating to the ~~Cross-Harbour Tunnel CHT and Eastern Harbour Crossing EHC~~ for the implementation of the Toll Adjustment Proposal, and to seek that adjustment proposal, and seeking funding approval from the Finance Committee for the ~~Western Harbour Crossing WHC~~ Toll Compensation Scheme; and that the Government should set up more park-and-ride facilities in the relevant districts, improve the ancillary transport facilities at the portal areas of various road harbour crossings, and study the construction of a fourth road harbour crossing, so as to further enhance the rationalisation of cross-harbour traffic.

Note: Hon CHAN Han-pan’s amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

6. Motion as amended by Hon AU Nok-hin

Regarding the Government’s proposal to adjust the tolls of private cars, taxis and motorcycles for using the three road harbour crossings with effect from

1 January 2020 (“Toll Adjustment Proposal”) with a view to rationalising cross-harbour traffic which will bring about benefits to society as a whole, with expected benefits including alleviating cross-harbour traffic congestion, reducing the obstruction of non-cross-harbour traffic by cross-harbour traffic queues, saving the commuting time for citizens using public transport and reducing emission from vehicles, etc., this Council ~~supports~~ ***agrees in principle to*** the Government ~~to introduce~~ ***introducing*** into this Council legislative amendments relating to the Cross-Harbour Tunnel and Eastern Harbour Crossing for the implementation of the Toll Adjustment Proposal; and ~~to seek~~ ***seeking*** funding approval from the Finance Committee for the Western Harbour Crossing Toll Compensation Scheme, ***while urging the Government to implement the Toll Adjustment Proposal in a gradual and orderly manner and conduct a timely review of its effect on traffic diversion and the burden it imposes on people.***

Note: Hon AU Nok-hin’s amendment is marked in ***bold and italic type*** or with deletion line.