

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. FC219/18-19
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : FC/1/1(16)

Finance Committee of the Legislative Council

Minutes of the 17th meeting
held at Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex
on Friday, 1 March 2019, at 3:00 pm

Members present:

Hon CHAN Kin-por, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Hon CHAN Chun-ying, JP (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, GBS, JP
Prof Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, GBS, JP
Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-kin, SBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun, JP
Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon Steven HO Chun-yin, BBS
Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP
Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS
Hon MA Fung-kwok, SBS, JP
Hon Charles Peter MOK, JP
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP

Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, BBS, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Hon KWOK Wai-keung, JP
Hon Dennis KWOK Wing-hang
Hon Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan
Hon IP Kin-yuen
Dr Hon Elizabeth QUAT, BBS, JP
Hon Martin LIAO Cheung-kong, SBS, JP
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, SBS, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan
Hon Alvin YEUNG
Hon Andrew WAN Siu-kin
Hon CHU Hoi-dick
Hon Jimmy NG Wing-ka, JP
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP
Hon HO Kai-ming
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting
Hon Holden CHOW Ho-ding
Hon SHIU Ka-fai
Hon SHIU Ka-chun
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH
Hon YUNG Hoi-yan
Dr Hon Pierre CHAN
Hon Tanya CHAN
Hon CHEUNG Kwok-kwan, JP
Hon HUI Chi-fung
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai
Hon KWONG Chun-yu
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon AU Nok-hin
Hon Vincent CHENG Wing-shun, MH
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS
Hon CHAN Hoi-yan

Members absent:

Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, GBS, JP
Hon Kenneth LAU Ip-keung, BBS, MH, JP

Public officers attending:

Ms Alice LAU Yim, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Ms Carol YUEN, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Mike CHENG Wai-man	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)
Mr Michael HONG Wing-kit	Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Transport and Housing Bureau
Mr Stephen YIM Yu-chau	Chief Architect (Development and Standards Section), Housing Department
Mr Rudolf LEE Yun-cheung	Chief Civil Engineer (1), Housing Department
Mr Peter MOK Pang-ching	Deputy Head of Civil Engineering Office (Project and Environmental Management), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Mr TSE Chun-tat	Chief Engineer (Special Duties) (Works), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Noel TSANG Fung-yi	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Financial Services) (Insurance and Retirement Scheme)
Mr Leslie TANG Wai-kong	Commissioner for Census and Statistics
Ms Marion CHAN Shui-yu	Deputy Commissioner for Census and Statistics
Ms Iris LAW Chui-fung	Assistant Commissioner for Census and Statistics (Social)
Ms Edith CHAN Lai-shan	Senior Statistician (Information Technology)1, Census and Statistics Department

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Anita SIT

Assistant Secretary General 1

Staff in attendance:

Ms Ada LAU

Senior Council Secretary (1)7

Miss Bowie LAM

Council Secretary (1)1

Miss Queenie LAM

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)2

Mr Frankie WOO

Senior Legislative Assistant (1)3

Miss Yannes HO

Legislative Assistant (1)7

Action

The Chairman reminded members of the requirements under Rules 83A and 84 of the Rules of Procedure.

Item 1 — FCR(2018-19)85

**RECOMMENDATION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS
SUBCOMMITTEE MADE ON 30 JANUARY 2019**

PWSC(2018-19)36

HEAD 711 — HOUSING

Civil Engineering — Land development

**821CL — Site formation and infrastructure works for public
housing development at Yan Wing Street, Yau Tong**

2. The Finance Committee ("FC") continued with the discussion on item FCR(2018-19)85.

3. The Chairman advised that the item sought the approval of FC of the recommendation made by the Public Works Subcommittee ("PWSC") at its meeting held on 30 January 2019 vide PWSC(2018-19)36 regarding the upgrading of 821CL—Site formation and infrastructure works for public housing development at Yan Wing Street, Yau Tong to Category A at an estimated cost of \$111.8 million in money-of-the day prices.

4. The Chairman declared that he was an independent non-executive director of The Bank of East Asia and a senior advisor of the Well Link Insurance Group Holdings Limited.

Traffic impact assessment and supply of parking spaces in the district*Traffic impact assessment report*

5. Referring to Table 3.2 of the traffic impact assessment ("TIA") report for the proposed public housing development in Yau Tong (i.e. Enclosure 2 to LC Paper No. PWSC125/18-19(01)) prepared by the consultant commissioned by the Hong Kong Housing Authority ("HA") in 2016, Mr WU Chi-wai noted that in 2015, the operational performance of both Junction A during peak hours in the evening ("PM Peak") and Junction B during peak hours in the morning ("AM Peak") as well as PM Peak were above 100%. But as shown in a table in the latter part of the TIA report, the relevant figures (i.e. the anticipated operational performance of the junctions after completion of the project) had gone down in the absence of any major improvement works. He enquired about the reasons for such a change in those figures. Mr WU also asked about the reasons for indicating the operational performance of different junctions by either a percentage or a decimal in the aforesaid tables.

6. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired about the meaning of those figures with value greater than 1 in Table 5.6, as well as the red line marker in Drawing 5.1 of the TIA report. She pointed out that while according to the TIA report, improvement works would be carried out at the junction of Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Chiu Road, paragraph 5.2 of the TIA report only stated that traffic control measures would be proposed. She enquired about the actual improvement works to be conducted for the junctions at Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Chiu Road and Cha Kwo Ling/Ko Fai Road, as well as the consequence if no improvement works were conducted.

7. Chief Civil Engineer (1), Housing Department ("CCE(1)/HD") responded that:

- (a) generally speaking, for traffic signalized junctions (such as Junctions B and E in Table 3.2 of the TIA report), overloading might happen only if the reserve capacity ("RC") was less than 15%. For priority junctions (such as roundabouts), RC would be indicated by a decimal value;
- (b) as shown in Table 5.2 of the TIA report, RCs of Junction E at Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Chiu Road during AM Peak and PM Peak would drop to 3% and 15% respectively after the intake of the public housing development project at Yan Wing Street, Yau Tong ("the YWS Project"). Upon completion of improvement works (involving primarily traffic signal

adjustments) at Junction E, it was envisaged that RCs of the said junction during AM Peak and PM Peak would rise to 15% and 24% respectively in 2027; and

- (c) according to the TIA report for the private housing development project near the junction at Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Fai Road in Yau Tong Bay, traffic improvement works would be implemented by the said private development project at the above junction. Upon completion of the relevant improvement works, RCs of the said road junction would be able to cope with the anticipated traffic flow.

8. Chief Civil Engineer (Public Works Programme), Transport and Housing Bureau ("CCE(PWP)/THB") supplemented that as indicated in paragraph 5.3.3 of the TIA report, the traffic impact caused by the development of the YWS Project to the junction at Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Chiu Road was minimal.

Overall traffic impact assessment for Yau Tong district in the future

9. While expressing support for the item, Mr WU Chi-wai pointed out that the traffic impact caused by the proposed development of a new campus of the Vocational Training Council ("VTC") at Cha Kwo Ling Road was not covered by the TIA report. Mr WU requested the Administration to conduct a cumulative TIA for the YWS Project, VTC campus development at the harbourfront site of Cha Kwo Ling Road and other development projects in Yau Tong district (including the associated road improvement measures), so that members could understand the overall future traffic conditions in Yau Tong district upon completion of those projects. Ms Tanya CHAN expressed similar views. The Administration advised that it would provide the relevant information after the meeting.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC151/18-19(01) on 12 April 2019.]

10. Mr Wilson OR was concerned about the impact that would be caused by the new population to local traffic upon completion of the YWS Project. He enquired about the findings of TIA in this regard.

11. CCE(1)/HD responded that:

- (a) when the YWS Project was at the planning stage in 2016, there was no plan to develop a new campus of VTC in Cha Kwo Ling. Therefore, the traffic impact of the VTC campus development project was not covered by the TIA report. Generally speaking, when a new development project was proposed, the project proponent would liaise with the Transport Department ("TD") to review whether it was necessary to assess the traffic impact of the new project; and
- (b) according to the TIA report completed in 2016, the existing road junctions in the area, except the junction at Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Chiu Road, could cope with the traffic flow generated by the new population upon the completion of the proposed development. However, according to projections made in the TIA report, RCs of the junction at Cha Kwo Ling Road/Ko Chiu Road during AM Peak and PM Peak would drop to 3% and 15% respectively in 2027. Hence, improvement works would be required at the aforesaid road junction.

12. CCE(PWP)/THB supplemented that as a general rule, TIA of developments planned at a later stage would take into account the traffic impact of earlier development projects already under planning.

Parking spaces in Yau Tong district

13. Mr WU Chi-wai pointed out that as mentioned in the TIA report for the project, parking lots or parking spaces would be provided by other development projects in Yau Tong district. Given that at present many vehicles were parking along both sides of Cha Kwo Ling Road, he was worried about the lack of comprehensive planning on the Administration's part for parking arrangements in the district, resulting in the insufficient supply of parking lots or parking spaces in the district to meet future demand.

14. Mr Gary FAN expressed support for the item. Referring to page 4 of LC Paper No. PWSC125/18-19(01) which stated that "Transport Department has requested development projects to adopt the high-end vehicle parking standards under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines ("HKPSG") as the planning target", he sought an explanation from the Administration of the relevant details. He also enquired whether

the Administration could adopt the maximum vehicle parking standards as the planning target.

15. CCE(PWP)/THB responded that:

- (a) apart from adhering to the planning targets specified in HKPSG, after discussion with TD, HA would provide an additional 27 parking spaces for the YWS Project; and
- (b) the aforesaid provision of parking spaces did not include parking spaces for the social welfare facilities under the YWS Project, which would include five parking spaces for minibuses and one loading/unloading bay for ambulances.

16. Mr WU Chi-wai requested the Administration to provide information on the supply and demand of parking spaces in Yau Tong district and how the Administration planned to meet the demand for parking spaces in the district. The Administration agreed to provide the relevant information after the meeting.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC151/18-19(01) on 12 April 2019.]

Public transport services

17. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung was concerned whether public transport services (including buses, minibuses and MTR) provided in the district could meet local demand. Mr LEUNG enquired about the projected quantity of public transport services provided in the district, as well as the details of coordination between the Administration and TD.

18. CCE(1)/HD responded that:

- (a) the YWS Project, which was developed as Lei Yue Mun Estate Phase 4, was only about 50 m from the bus terminus at Yau Tong Estate, about 250 m from Yau Tong Public Transport Interchange ("PTI"), and about 580 m from Yau Tong MTR Station. Hence, the Administration believed that the existing hardware facilities including the aforementioned bus terminus, PTI and MTR Station would be sufficient to meet the demand of local residents for public transport services. That said, HA would also discuss with TD prior to the intake of the YWS

Project whether the frequencies of public transport services would need to be adjusted; and

- (b) in view that about 2 000 public housing units would be provided by the YWS Project and the district was currently served by 14 bus routes, two bus termini, one MTR Station, five green minibuses routes and four red minibuses routes, the Administration believed that the existing public transport services would be sufficient to meet the demand.

19. CCE(PWP)/THB supplemented that the provision of public transport services had already been assessed in the TIA report. Moreover, about one year before the intake of the YWS Project, HA would work together with TD to coordinate various matters relating to the provision of public transport services, such as making adjustments to routings or increasing service frequencies. As such, the Administration was confident that sufficient public transport facilities would be provided in the district for local residents in the future.

Yard waste produced by construction works

20. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired about the percentages of inert and non-inert construction waste produced by the construction works. CCE(PWP)/THB responded that the relevant information was set out in paragraph 17 of PWSC(2018-19)36.

21. Mr Dennis KWOK declared that he was a member of HA. Ms Tanya CHAN pointed out that more than 300 trees would be felled under the project. She enquired whether the Administration would consider the recycling of the felled trees. Ms Claudia MO and Mr Dennis KWOK expressed similar views. Ms CHAN and Mr KWOK requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on the handling and recycling of felled and removed trees, and other yard wastes generated by public works projects in the past (especially the recycling of such to construction materials for use in other public works projects). Chief Architect (Development and Standards Section), Housing Department ("CA(D&S)/HD") responded that when implementing the construction projects, HA would avoid transporting the felled trees to landfills for disposal as far as possible. While it was HA's hope that the trees concerned could be recycled and reused, detailed arrangements would have to be worked out through coordination with the relevant authorities. He said that the Administration would provide supplementary information after the meeting in response to the questions raised by Ms CHAN and Mr KWOK.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC151/18-19(01) on 12 April 2019.]

Construction cost of the public housing development at Yan Wing Street, Yau Tong

22. Ms Claudia MO asked what the construction cost of the public housing units under the YWS Project was; whether the plot ratios of the site had been fully utilized; and whether any basement would be constructed under the buildings.

23. CCE(PWP)/THB responded that:

- (a) based on the buildings contracts of major public housing development projects awarded by HA in 2017-2018, the estimated average construction cost was about \$800,000 per public housing unit, and such units would only be completed in the coming few years. The average construction unit cost of the YWS Project would be more or less at the same level;
- (b) the relevant plot ratios had been fully utilized; and
- (c) there would be no basement under the buildings.

Ancillary facilities, construction cost and supporting infrastructure

Ancillary facilities

24. Mr Wilson OR was concerned whether the provision of proposed ancillary facilities could dovetail with the development of the YWS Project. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung enquired whether residential care homes for persons with disabilities could be included as part of the ancillary facilities under the YWS Project.

25. CA(D&S)/HD responded that the YWS Project was expected to be completed in 2024-2025. According to the information provided by the Social Welfare Department ("SWD"), apart from the residential care home for the elderly ("RCHE") which would commence operation in 2026-2027, other social welfare/education facilities could commence operation in 2025-2026.

26. CCE(PWP)/THB responded that:

- (a) of the eight social welfare/education facilities provided under the YWS Project, the social and recreational centre for the disabled would provide service for the disabled; and
- (b) when the YWS Project was at the planning stage, HA had already liaised with the departments concerned to plan for the provision of social welfare/education facilities. Currently, those eight social welfare/education facilities under the current YWS Project were provided as a result of coordination efforts made by the Administration with various departments.

27. Mr Gary FAN and Mr IP Kin-yuen were concerned whether there would be sufficient provision of public sector school places in the district to meet local demand. Mr FAN asked whether the number of primary school places in the district would be sufficient to meet demand after the completion of the YWS Project. Pointing out that two schools in Kwun Tong district would be closed in the 2023-2024 school year, he enquired whether the Administration would consider increasing the provision of school facilities. Mr IP requested the Administration to provide supplementary information on the following: whether the Education Bureau ("EDB") had offered advices for the YWS Project (if yes, the Administration should give a brief account of such advices), especially how to cope with the additional demand for public sector school places due to changes in the population of school-age children in the district after the completion of residential units under the project.

28. In response, CA(D&S)/HD and CCE(PWP)/THB advised that the Administration had consulted the local District Council on the YWS Project. The District Council requested that more study rooms be provided in the district. Due to space constraint of the site for the YWS Project, it was not feasible to construct school facilities thereunder. The Administration would provide supplementary information after the meeting in response to the questions raised by Mr IP Kin-yuen.

[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC151/18-19(01) on 12 April 2019.]

Planning and construction costs of ancillary facilities

29. Dr Pierre CHAN expressed support for the development of public housing. He asked which high-level committee or bureau was responsible for planning the provision of hospitals, schools, RCHEs, etc. under the YWS Project. He also enquired about the relationship between the planning of such facilities and the requirements set out in HKPSG. CCE(PWP)/THB responded that the Town Planning Board ("TPB") was responsible for the approval of applications for land use rezoning. Views on the provision of such facilities could be presented to TPB for consideration in the course of land use rezoning. Members could also give their views in the context of discussion by the relevant Panels. He added that when development projects were at the planning stage, the Administration would circulate the relevant master plans which set out the planning parameters to other departments concerned for comments.

30. Ms Claudia MO requested the Administration to provide information on the construction costs of ancillary facilities (including social welfare/education facilities and other facilities) provided under the YWS Project as set out in Enclosure 2 to PWSC(2018-19)36. The Administration agreed to provide the relevant information after the meeting.

[*Post-meeting note:* The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC151/18-19(01) on 12 April 2019.]

31. While expressing support for the provision of ancillary facilities in public housing projects, Mr Dennis KWOK was worried that after the completion of ancillary facilities under the YWS Project, there might not be sufficient manpower to provide services at the facilities concerned. He thus asked whether the Administration would liaise with the departments concerned at the early stage of project commencement. CCE(PWP)/THB responded that the departments concerned had already been informed of the project and would make manpower planning accordingly.

Arrangement of scrutiny of this item

32. At 3:50 pm, the Chairman said that only a handful of FC members were asking loads of questions at the meeting, while most members would like to put the item to vote. Therefore, he intended to conclude discussion and then put the item to vote after members who indicated their wish to speak had done so.

Voting on FCR(2018-19)85

33. At 4:03 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2018-19)85 to vote. At the request of members, the Chairman ordered a division, and the division bell was rung for five minutes. The Chairman declared that 46 members voted in favour of the item, while no member voted against the item or abstained from voting. The votes of individual members were as follows:

For:

Prof Joseph LEE Kok-long	Ms Starry LEE Wai-king
Dr Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun	Mr WONG Kwok-kin
Ms Claudia MO	Mr Steven HO Chun-yin
Mr Frankie YICK Chi-ming	Mr WU Chi-wai
Mr YIU Si-wing	Mr MA Fung-kwok
Mr Charles Peter MOK	Mr CHAN Chi-chuen
Mr CHAN Han-pan	Mr LEUNG Che-cheung
Ms Alice MAK Mei-kuen	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
Mr KWOK Wai-keung	Mr Christopher CHEUNG Wah-fung
Dr Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung	Dr Helena WONG Pik-wan
Dr Elizabeth QUAT	Mr Martin LIAO Cheung-kong
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok	Mr Alvin YEUNG
Mr Jimmy NG Wing-ka	Dr Junius HO Kwan-yiu
Mr HO Kai-ming	Mr LAM Cheuk-ting
Mr Holden CHOW Ho-ding	Mr SHIU Ka-fai
Mr SHIU Ka-chun	Mr Wilson OR Chong-shing
Ms YUNG Hoi-yan	Dr Pierre CHAN
Ms Tanya CHAN	Mr CHEUNG Kwok-kwan
Mr HUI Chi-fung	Mr LUK Chung-hung
Mr LAU Kwok-fan	Dr CHENG Chung-tai
Mr Jeremy TAM Man-ho	Mr Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Mr AU Nok-hin	Mr Vincent CHENG Wing-shun
Mr Tony TSE Wai-chuen	Ms CHAN Hoi-yan
(46 members)	

34. The Chairman declared that the item was approved.

Order at the meeting

35. At 4:04 pm when the division bell was ringing, Mr IP Kin-yuen requested that in future, the Chairman should arrange the attendance of public officers responsible for planning at FC meetings to answer questions raised by members. In the meantime, some members shouted from their seats. The Chairman said that policy issues should not be discussed at FC

meetings. The Chairman also requested members not to shout from their seats.

**Item 2 — FCR(2018-19)86
CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND**

HEAD 710 — COMPUTERISATION

Census and Statistics Department

**New Subhead — "Information Technology Equipment and Services
for the 2021 Population Census"**

36. The Chairman advised that the item sought FC's approval for the creation of a new commitment of \$202,680,000 for acquiring information technology ("IT") equipment and related services for the 2021 Population Census ("21C"). The Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau consulted the Panel on Financial Affairs on the relevant proposal on 7 January 2019. The Panel had spent about 43 minutes on the deliberation of the proposal.

37. At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr Christopher CHEUNG, Chairman of the Panel on Financial Affairs, briefed members on the outcome of discussion held by the Panel on the financial proposal. Mr CHEUNG said that while the Panel did not oppose the submission of the funding proposal to FC for consideration, some members opined that the data collection approach adopted for the said population census should be more in keeping with the times. They suggested that the Administration should consider adopting the big data readily available in the public and private sectors for conducting population censuses in the future, so as to reduce costs and enhance accuracy of the data. Some members called on the Administration to increase the sampling fraction in those areas and buildings with a large number of subdivided units ("SDUs") to ensure the collection of more accurate data on SDUs. Mr CHEUNG pointed out that members had also enquired about the estimated costs for acquiring IT equipment and related services for the 21C and the disposal arrangements for the mobile tablets acquired for the purpose after completion of the 21C.

Acquisition of mobile tablets

38. Ms Claudia MO and Dr KWOK Ka-ki were concerned about problems in the use of mobile tablets, as well as the related security issues. Ms MO pointed out that according to enumerators of the 2016 Population By-census ("16BC"), there were many problems with the mobile tablets,

including the loss of data uploaded onto the server, explosion of chargers, etc. She requested the Administration to give an undertaking that the model used for the 16BC would not be acquired again under the present item. Dr KWOK enquired whether the Administration would ban the supplier of mobile tablets used for the 16BC from bidding again or deduct the scores of its tender.

39. Commissioner for Census and Statistics ("C for C&S") responded that:

- (a) a Senior Systems Manager of the Office of the Government Chief Information Officer would assist in the procurement of mobile tablets under the item. Prior to procurement, the Administration would set out the specifications of mobile tablets as appropriate for conducting the census and ensure that the mobile tablets and accessories to be acquired for census operation could meet international safety standards, while mobile tablets provided by suppliers would be subject to safety tests conducted by an independent organization. Furthermore, if mobile tablets provided by suppliers were unsafe, the tenders they submitted should have failed in the technical assessment of tender evaluation; and
- (b) when procuring the mobile tablets, the Administration would evaluate the technical and price aspects of tenders in accordance with the existing tendering procedures. As tenders had yet to be invited, the Administration could hardly say at the moment whether specific organizations would be banned from the tender exercise. That said, past performance would affect the scores of suppliers in the technical assessment of tender evaluation.

40. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen and Dr Pierre CHAN enquired about the number of mobile tablets to be acquired under the item.

41. Assistant Commissioner for Census and Statistics (Social) ("AC/C&S(S)") responded that about 17 000 mobile tablets would be acquired under the item, at an estimated cost of some \$60 million (for both the hardware and software of mobile tablets).

42. Dr Fernando CHEUNG enquired about the respective weightings of price and quality when evaluating the tenders for supplying the mobile tablets for the 21C. In response, C for C&S said that the Administration

would conduct the tender exercise for acquiring the mobile tablets for the 21C according to the tender requirements (to be revised at a later stage).

43. Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) supplemented that with effect from 1 April 2019, the Government would encourage the procurement departments to adopt marking schemes more widely in the tendering process. Under the general marking scheme framework, the weighting of price factor would range from 30% to 50%, while technical weighting would range from 50% to 70%. Any deviation from the marking scheme framework would require prior approval. It clearly demonstrated the great importance the Administration attached to quality and creativity in procurement.

44. Mr Charles Peter MOK expressed support for the item. He considered that the Administration should procure the mobile tablets at reasonable prices instead of the lowest prices. Dr Pierre CHAN was worried that the procurement of mobile tablets in bulk within a short time would result in price fluctuations. He asked how the Administration could exercise effective monitoring on the procurement process. Senior Statistician (Information Technology)1, Census and Statistics Department ("SS(IT)1/C&SD") responded that given the large number of mobile tablets to be acquired, the Administration would follow the practice in the 16BC and invite two to three successful tenderers as suppliers. Dr CHAN requested the Administration to provide a breakdown of the non-recurrent expenditure of \$78,389,000 earmarked for the procurement of hardware of the IT system for the 21C. The Administration agreed to provide the relevant information after the meeting.

[Post-meeting note: The supplementary information provided by the Administration was issued to members vide LC Paper No. FC136/18-19(01) on 18 March 2019.]

Reuse of hardware and software

45. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen asked whether the Administration could reuse the computer equipment (including the hardware and software) acquired for the 16BC. He also enquired about the arrangement for reusing the computer equipment under this item after the 21C. Mr AU Nok-kin raised similar questions. Dr Fernando CHEUNG sought details about the donation of mobile tablets after the 16BC. Mr Holden CHOW asked whether the upgraded IT system under the item could be used by other departments in the future. Mr AU enquired about the estimated number of mobile tablets to be redeployed to other government departments or

donated to public schools and/or non-governmental organizations after completion of the 21C.

46. AC/C&S(S) responded that:

- (a) of the computer equipment used in the 16BC, many hardware items had become obsolete and could not be reused, while 18 sub-systems would be reused after enhancement and amalgamation;
- (b) while most of the sub-systems would be reused, their functions would need to be upgraded to meet the operational requirements of the 21C (for example, the 21C would be conducted on a larger scale, and it was necessary to process the "Short Form" questionnaires which were not used in the 16BC); and
- (c) after completion of the 21C, the Administration planned to redeploy the mobile tablets to other government departments or donate them to public schools/non-governmental organizations. Taking the 16BC as an example, of the some 6 100 mobile tablets acquired, about 100 were kept by the Administration for internal use, while the remaining tablets that were in good condition had been donated to non-governmental organizations.

47. C for C&S supplemented that the Census and Statistics Department ("C&SD") would liaise with EDB and SWD for arrangements to donate the mobile tablets.

Suggestions on data collection for ethnicity, sexual minorities/sexual orientation and other data topics

48. Ms Claudia MO and Mr CHAN Chi-chuen requested the Administration to consider including some additional data topics. Ms MO requested that data on ethnicity be collected to facilitate the Government's formulation of policies on ethnic minorities. Mr CHAN requested the Administration to collect data on sexual minorities, so that policies in this regard could be made. Mr Holden CHOW said that in view of the privacy issues and social controversy involved, he had reservation about the suggestion to collect data relating to sexual orientation.

49. C for C&S responded that:

- (a) the data item of the respondent's ethnicity was included in the 21C; and
- (b) the Administration envisaged that under the current social situation, the respondents might not provide information on their sexual orientation truthfully. As such, the data so collected by the Administration might not be accurate. Therefore, the relevant information would not be collected in the 21C. Nevertheless, with changes in social values in the future, the Administration would reassess whether the relevant information could be collected.

50. Mr Jeremy TAM enquired about the following:

- (a) given that an additional data topic on "elderly persons requiring care" would be introduced in the 21C, he requested the Administration to set out clearly the definition of "elderly persons requiring care";
- (b) how questions concerning "elderly persons requiring care" would be formulated in the questionnaires for the 21C;
- (c) whether the respondents would be asked if they were new arrivals in Hong Kong and about the problems they might have; and
- (d) whether the respondents would be asked if there were children with special education needs ("SENs") in their households.

51. AC/C&S(S) responded that:

- (a) "elderly persons requiring care" referred to elderly persons who required care in their daily lives;
- (b) the Administration would continue to study and design suitable questions to be included in the questionnaires;
- (c) the Administration had all along collected statistical data on new arrivals and published thematic reports on them. In the population censuses/by-censuses, the respondents would be asked about their place of birth and period of residence in

Hong Kong. By doing so, the Administration would know whether the respondents were new arrivals; and

- (d) in 2019-2020, the Administration would conduct a survey on persons with disabilities, including persons with autism and SEN students.

52. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired about the following:

- (a) how the Administration determined the scope of data to be collected in population censuses; and
- (b) as the Administration had indicated that the prevalence of "households with ethnic minorities" would be taken into account in the 21C, whether it meant that the Administration would conduct analysis based on the ethnicity data collected under the data topics of "demographic and socio-economic characteristics" and "housing characteristics".

53. C for C&S responded that the data collected by the Administration in population censuses were related to problems of public concern in Hong Kong. The Administration would first consult academics, various groups and organizations such as the Legislative Council on the data topics. Afterwards, such views would be analyzed and submitted to the Statistics Advisory Board for advice. He confirmed that data on ethnicity would be collected and analyzed in population censuses.

54. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired about the meaning of the data topic of "economic activity status" in the 16BC. AC/C&S(S) responded that "economic activity status" was meant to distinguish between persons who were engaged in productive work or not. Examples of persons not engaged in productive work would include "home-makers", "students", etc.

55. In response to the enquiry from Ms Claudia MO, C for C&S confirmed that data on Hong Kong people who had emigrated overseas could not be collected by means of population censuses.

56. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that given the aging population, it would be most important to collect data on the population requiring long-term care and the characteristics of their carers through the population censuses. He enquired whether questions in this regard could be included in both the "Long Form" and "Short Form" questionnaires. C for C&S responded that the Administration's initial plan was to collect the relevant data in the 21C. In the course of designing the questions, the

Administration would consult the data users, so that the collected data could meet the needs of the community.

Data collection methods

Combining population census data, administrative data and big data

57. Mr Gary FAN asked whether apart from keeping up with the times in terms of IT application, the Administration would follow the overseas practice of combining population census data with administrative data, in order to cut down on the amount of public funds earmarked for data collection. Dr Pierre CHAN sought the views of the Administration on the use of big data.

58. C for C&S responded that:

- (a) the Administration had already adopted IT applications in the past to assist in data collection, including the introduction of e-Questionnaires ("eQs") in the 2011 Population Census ("11C"). While eQs could only be submitted through desktop computers at that time, the use of mobile devices was now supported so that the respondents could fill in eQs anytime and anywhere;
- (b) according to the experience of the Administration, many elderly persons were inclined to provide information in telephone interviews. Thus, the Administration would develop a system for conducting telephone interviews;
- (c) big data might not be representative enough. For instance, data from social media could only reflect the characteristics of their users specifically and might not necessarily represent those of members of the public in Hong Kong; and
- (d) sharing the use of data stored by the authorities and other organizations would require legal authorization for the relevant procedures.

Collecting data relating to subdivided units and housing

59. Dr KWOK Ka-ki enquired about the method used by the Administration to collect data on SDUs and whether data relating to the housing needs and living environment of the respondents could also be

collected at the same time to facilitate the Government's formulation of policies on SDUs.

60. Dr CHENG Chung-tai pointed out that in the past, the enumerators had encountered certain difficulties when gaining access to SDUs for the purpose of conducting the interviews. Mr Jeremy TAM pointed out that as SDU households in industrial buildings were worried about breaking the law if their cases were discovered, they were reluctant to respond to the questions in population censuses. Mr KWONG Chun-yu expressed similar views. Mr TAM asked whether the Administration had any data concerning the previous response rates of SDU households in industrial buildings and what measures would be taken to improve the response rate of such households. Mr TAM also asked how the Administration got hold of information about which units in industrial buildings were taken up as residence.

61. C for C&S responded that:

- (a) as SDUs were mostly found in residential buildings aged 25 years or more, professional staff of C&SD would inspect the relevant buildings first to identify whether there were SDUs inside the buildings;
- (b) through on-site inspections, the Administration would assess whether there were persons residing in the industrial buildings by observing the surroundings of the units for signs of habitation;
- (c) in the 16BC, only a very small number of SDU households in industrial buildings had responded to the survey. It was partly because at the initial stage of interviews, a fire had broken out in an industrial building, and the SDU households had become reluctant to provide information;
- (d) for the 21C, the Administration would approach experts and organizations familiar with and trusted by SDU households in industrial buildings for advice and assistance, with a view to improving the response rate of such households. C&SD would evaluate the quality of data before deciding whether the statistics on SDU households in industrial buildings would be published; and
- (e) SDU households in industrial buildings could rest assured about providing information to C&SD because it was against

the law for C&SD to provide the information collected in population censuses to other government departments.

62. Given the difficulties in collecting data on SDUs, Mr Andrew WAN was concerned about the accuracy of statistics on SDUs released by the Administration previously. He also enquired how the Administration could collate information on the number of vacant units. C for C&S responded that the Administration was well-experienced in collating information on SDUs in residential buildings, so the relevant statistics were accurate. However, regarding information on SDUs in industrial buildings, the Administration had yet to release accurate statistics at the moment. For the terms "occupied quarters" and "vacant units", they were related to different concepts. As the definition of "vacant units" was involved, it would be difficult for the Administration to collate information through the population censuses. As far as he knew, information on the number of vacant units was kept by the Rating and Valuation Department.

63. Mr Tony TSE enquired whether data relating to housing would be collected through the population censuses. AC/C&S(S) responded that data relating to housing, such as the amount of rentals and mortgage repayment, would be collected through the population censuses.

Telephone interviews and face-to-face interviews

64. Ms Tanya CHAN sought information on the IT sub-systems for the 21C and asked whether the telephone interviews would be conducted through automated systems or by human enumerators. AC/C&S(S) replied that the IT system for the 21C consisted of 16 sub-systems, including a newly-developed sub-system for conducting telephone interviews. The telephone interviews would be conducted by human enumerators.

65. Dr CHENG Chung-tai was concerned that for telephone interviews, the respondents would have to call back to provide information. He enquired how the Administration could ensure that no telephone deception would occur. Dr CHENG also asked how a respondent could verify the caller's identity to prevent disclosing information to imposters if it was necessary for the respondent to provide supplementary information by phone after a face-to-face interview.

66. Mr Christopher CHEUNG was concerned that cases might happen involving imposters posing as enumerators and asking for money from the respondents, asking them irrelevant questions, etc. He enquired how the aforesaid situations could be prevented.

67. C for C&S responded that:

- (a) according to the existing legislation, it was against the law for any person to pose as an enumerator. Secondly, the Administration would send letters to the respondents before the population census. Furthermore, the enumerators would not ask the respondents to provide any sensitive information, such as their Hong Kong Identity Card numbers, assets, etc. Also, the enumerators would not conduct telephone interviews with the respondents or seek information via email on their own initiative. The Administration would convey the above information to the public and enhance publicity in this regard to facilitate the identification of genuine enumerators by members of the public; and
- (b) to avoid causing inconvenience to the public and due to cost concerns, the Administration intended to reduce the use of face-to-face interviews for data collection as far as possible.

68. AC/C&S(S) supplemented that in case it was necessary for a respondent to provide supplementary information after a face-to-face interview, he could do so by calling the relevant telephone number. During the phone call, the respondent could state his address and the information of the contact person already provided during the face-to-face interview, so that the Administration could identify the caller.

69. Mr AU Nok-hin enquired about the estimated percentages of respondents providing data via eQs and by manually filling in the questionnaires; and whether the Administration would need to recruit more enumerators to conduct interviews if the number of respondents who submitted data via eQs was lower than expected. C for C&S reiterated that the Administration would strive to reduce the percentage of face-to-face interviews as far as possible. AC/C&S(S) supplemented that according to the experience gained in the 11C where eQs could be submitted via desktop computers, 30% of the respondents had submitted "Long Form" questionnaires via eQs, while in the 16BC, 40% of the respondents had submitted data via eQs or telephone interviews. Given that "Short Form" questionnaires could also be submitted through various means in the 21C, the Administration expected that 60% of the respondents would submit data via eQs, telephone interviews or by mail.

70. In response to the question from Mr AU Nok-hin, AC/C&S(S) clarified that the respondents could also submit "Long Form" questionnaires through smart phones.

Time limit, geographical location and methods for responding to questionnaires by respondents

71. Mr Holden CHOW enquired about how the Administration would deal with cases where no response was provided by the respondents after the deadline. C for C&S responded that the respondents were required by law to respond to the questionnaires. He said that as a facilitation measure, the respondents could submit data through various means. AC/C&S(S) supplemented that the respondents would have 36 days to submit data. During the first stage which lasted for 18 days, the respondents could submit data via self-enumeration of eQs or telephone interviews. In the second stage, enumerators would conduct face-to-face interviews with the households which had yet to submit data according to records in the system.

72. Mr Alvin YEUNG sought the meaning of allowing respondents to respond to the questionnaires from foreign places, i.e. whether the population census would cover those persons who had emigrated abroad. C for C&S responded that the scope of the population census only covered people living in Hong Kong. If the respondents had travelled to other places during the survey period, they could submit data from abroad via eQs. But if the respondents had emigrated abroad for a long time, they would not be covered under the scope of the population census.

73. Mr CHAN Chi-chuen enquired whether a respondent could submit sensitive information by himself in the questionnaire. C for C&S responded that although the population census was conducted on a household basis, the respondents could choose to submit data individually, such as via eQs.

Disclosure of collected data

74. Mr WU Chi-wai enquired whether the data collected (including the raw data) would be disclosed as open data for public use, and what types of data would be disclosed.

75. Mr AU Nok-hin pointed out that some users had reflected the view that the Interactive Data Dissemination Service ("IDDS") of C&SD was not user-friendly. He hoped that the Administration could listen to the views of users and enhance the said system.

76. C for C&S responded that:

- (a) the Administration had compiled 40 000 commonly used statistical tables according to the results of the 16BC for online access by the public;
- (b) members of the public could also produce statistical tables according to their own needs by using IDDS. At present, 60 000 statistical tables had been produced by members of the public with IDDS;
- (c) the Administration expected that the design of IDDS for the 21C would be enhanced. To keep up with the times, the Administration would introduce machine-readable data formats to dovetail with the big data trend; and
- (d) under the principle of not compromising the privacy of personal data, the Administration would disclose the data collected from the population census as far as possible.

77. Mr AU Nok-hin enquired whether the Administration had collated thematic reports and population census reports to facilitate the comparison of relevant data by users. AC/C&S(S) responded that data relating to all population in Hong Kong were often listed in the thematic reports for comparison purpose.

Cloud platform

78. Given the development of the Government Cloud Platform ("GovCloud") by the Administration, Mr WU Chi-wai asked whether the "cloud hosting services" mentioned in FCR(2018-19)86 referred to GovCloud. Mr Charles Peter MOK asked whether GovCloud would be ready for deployment by the Administration at the time of conducting the 21C.

79. AC/C&S(S) responded that the Administration would adopt GovCloud if the cloud hosting services used for the 21C could then be supported by GovCloud. SS(IT)1/C&SD supplemented that at present, C&SD had yet to have any information on the charges of the next generation GovCloud. C&SD would make reference to the relevant charges when they were announced by the relevant departments.

IT security and personal data protection

80. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired whether the main system and sub-systems were subject to the same level of security protection. AC/C&S(S) responded that the security measures would apply to all the computer systems. Prior to system implementation, a third party would conduct tests on system security and personal data protection.

81. Ms Tanya CHAN enquired whether the relevant data could only be accessed by designated C&SD staff.

82. Mr Christopher CHEUNG expressed support for the item. He enquired about the measures for protecting personal data under the item. Mr Alvin YEUNG asked whether such measures for protecting personal data had also been adopted for the last population by-census. Mr Charles Peter MOK pointed out that there might be risks of information leakage if members of the public submitted their questionnaires via mobile phones connected through non-government WiFi or from overseas places. Mr YEUNG called on the Administration to consider including a warning statement in the computer system to remind members of the public about the potential risks of information leakage involved in using public WiFi connection. Mr YEUNG also enquired whether the Administration would release all internet protocol ("IP") addresses for submission of data by the respondents or block those IP addresses which were unsafe.

83. C of C&S responded that:

- (a) any disclosure of personal data was an offence under the Census and Statistics Ordinance (Cap. 316). The Administration would remind the enumerators of the same during training and briefings, as well as by sending reminders through the computer system to their mobile tablets;
- (b) to prevent the disclosure of personal data due to the loss of mobile tablets used for data collection, the Administration would remind the enumerators every day that they should always bring along their mobile tablets. Moreover, to reduce data storage in the mobile tablets, all data stored in the tablets should be uploaded to the central data bank automatically after each interview. In addition, in case any mobile tablet was lost, all data stored in the device would be deleted automatically once the tablet was accessed by a third party;

- (c) the above measures had already been adopted in the last population by-census. The Administration would consider enhancing the measures for protecting personal data, including giving consideration to the acquisition of alert devices which would issue warning signals to the enumerators in case they were some distance away from their mobile tablets;
- (d) the Administration would remind the respondents of the need to protect their personal data, so as to avoid any leakage of data;
- (e) the Administration noted the suggestion made by Mr Alvin YEUNG about the inclusion of a warning statement in the computer system; and
- (f) the Administration would need to study the matter relating to the blocking of IP addresses which were unsafe.

Costs

84. Mr AU Nok-hin enquired about the meaning of "one-off cost avoidance of \$56,175,000" as mentioned in FCR(2018-19)86. AC/C&S(S) replied that the said amount referred to the additional costs to be borne by the Administration if the proposed system was not implemented.

85. Mr Tony TSE enquired about the amount of additional costs incurred for the item when compared with those for the 11C, as well as the reasons for the additional costs. C for C&S responded that the costs for the item were about 1.4 times higher than those for the 11C. The additional costs were incurred for various reasons, including the need to enhance service quality, the increasing number of respondents, the rate of inflation, as well as the application of IT in the population census for the sake of improving data quality and security.

86. In response to the question from Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, C for C&S said that the costs for the item already included the expenditure for acquiring the computer system for analyzing the census data.

Personal safety of enumerators

87. Mr KWONG Chun-yu noted that the Administration would recruit students to conduct the interviews. He was concerned about the measures

to be taken by the Administration to ensure the personal safety of the enumerators or avoid conflicts between the enumerators and respondents.

88. C for C&S responded that two enumerators would be deployed to work as a team to conduct the household interviews. The enumerators would also be provided with training on the protection of personal safety (such as training to prevent dog bite) with a view to raising their safety awareness. AC/C&S(S) supplemented that comprehensive training would be provided to the enumerators, including that on communication skills. Regarding the training to prevent dog bite, the enumerators would be reminded that they should ask before entering a premises whether there was any dog inside, and if so, they should ask the household to keep the dog(s) away from the living room. In the course of training, films would also be shown to remind the enumerators that they should always be on guard and avoid going to dangerous places. The Administration would focus on reminding the enumerators that personal safety was the top priority while they were at work. According to the 16BC, all those measures could effectively protect the personal safety of enumerators.

89. Mr Gary FAN enquired whether the Administration would deploy one male enumerator to work in pair with one female enumerator when conducting the household interviews in order to ensure their personal safety. Ms Claudia MO opined that given the potential risks of male enumerators being accused of indecent assault, it was more preferable to deploy one male enumerator to work in pair with one female enumerator when conducting the household interviews, such that the female enumerator could act as a witness if necessary. Deputy Commissioner for the Census and Statistics Department ("DC for C&S") responded that the feasibility of deploying a male enumerator to work in pair with a female enumerator when conducting the household interviews would depend on the proportion of sexes in the recruited enumerators. Nonetheless, the Administration would remind the enumerators to be always on guard and stay away from danger.

Time for conducting census operations

90. Mr Gary FAN pointed out that while the population censuses in 1991 and 2001 were both conducted in March, the time was subsequently changed to the summer vacation period. But during the summer vacation period, many people would go on holiday overseas, while new arrivals would return to the Mainland. As a result, data collected during the period were not comprehensive enough. He enquired whether the Administration would consider adjusting the time for conducting census operations to, say, March or April. DC for C&S responded that according

to the Administration's experience, better results would be achieved if population censuses were conducted during the summer vacation period, not to mention the fact that respondents would be given 36 days to submit data. Based on past experiences, the Administration could reach most of the respondents during the said number of days.

Order at the meeting

91. At 4:21 pm, Mr Gary FAN expressed dissatisfaction over the speaking time arrangement and comments made by the Chairman. The Chairman said that even when the speaking time limit had been exceeded, he had always tried to allow members to finish asking their questions and the officials to finish giving their responses. It was thus unreasonable if Mr FAN was still dissatisfied. When speaking, the Chairman alleged that Mr FAN was "insane". Mr Gary FAN requested the Chairman to determine whether according to Rule 41(4) of the Rules of Procedure ("RoP"), it was offensive to a member to describe him as "insane", and he also requested the Chairman to withdraw the said expression. Some members (including Ms Claudia MO, Dr KWOK Ka-ki and Ms Tanya CHAN) spoke aloud in their seats, claiming that the Chairman's comment was tantamount to insulting the member and raising points of order in this connection. Dr Junius HO however said that the conduct of Mr Gary FAN and Ms Tanya CHAN was grossly disorderly and requested the Chairman to order them to withdraw from the meeting pursuant to RoP 45(2).

92. The Chairman advised that it was his ruling that the expression "insane" he just used was not inappropriate as he was only expressing his feelings at that time about the member deviating from the procedures of the meeting during discussion on the item, and no point of order was involved.

93. At 4:33 pm, the Chairman suspended the meeting due to disorder at the meeting. The meeting resumed at 4:46 pm.

94. After the meeting resumed, Dr KWOK Ka-ki, Ms Claudia MO, Mr CHAN Chi-chuen, Mr KWONG Chun-yu, Dr CHENG Chung-tai and Mr AU Nok-hin continued to express views on the comments made by the Chairman. Dr Junius HO and Mr Martin LIAO however spoke in support of the Chairman's ruling.

95. The Chairman stated that he maintained the ruling he made previously. The Chairman reiterated that it was not his intention to insult mentally ill persons, and he only used the expression "insane" to express his feelings when the member had deviated from the procedures of the

meeting. The Chairman said that he hoped members could respect each other and refrain from insulting other members and public officials. The Chairman also pointed out that he did not have the power to rule whether the expression "insane" could be used in future meetings.

Voting on FCR(2018-19)86

96. At 7:07 pm, the Chairman put item FCR(2018-19)86 to vote. The Chairman was of the view that the majority of the members present and voting were in favour of the item, and he declared that the item was approved.

97. The meeting ended at 7:07 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat
23 July 2019