

**Urgent by Fax (2543 9197)**

本署檔號 Our Ref. : TD SS/152/02-1

來函檔號 Your Ref. : CB4/PAC/R72

電話號碼 Tel. No. : 3842 5942

圖文傳真 Fax : 2186 7519

9 October 2019

Mr Anthony Chu  
 Clerk to Public Accounts Committee  
 Legislative Council Complex  
 1 Legislative Council Road  
 Central, Hong Kong

Dear Mr Chu,

**Public Accounts Committee****Consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72****Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces**

I refer to your letter of 4 September 2019, seeking further information to facilitate the Public Account Committee's consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72.

The requested information in English is now enclosed for your reference.

Yours sincerely,

( LAU Hon-wai, Simon )  
 for Commissioner for Transport

c.c. Transport and Housing Bureau [Attn: PAS(T)2]

Fax No. 3904 1774

九龍油麻地海庭道十一號西九龍政府合署南座十樓  
 10th floor South Tower West Kowloon Government Offices 11 Hoi Ting Road Yau Ma Tei Kowloon  
 電話 Tel (852) 2804 2600 傳真 Fax (852) 2824 0433  
 網址 Web Site: <http://www.td.gov.hk>

## Public Accounts Committee

### Consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72 Planning, Provision and Management of Public Parking Spaces

Enquiries from Clerk of the Public Accounts Committee dated 4 September 2019

The Administration was requested to provide the following information:

Part 3: Management of government multi-storey car parks

1. According to the reply dated 19 June 2019 from the Director of Architectural Services, the maintenance works carried out to the Kwai Fong Car Park (mainly concrete repairs to the ceiling of 7<sup>th</sup> floor) between November 2015 and October 2018 did not affect the opening of its rooftop for car parking. Why did the Transport Department (“TD”) not consider re-opening the rooftop parking spaces for public use during the aforesaid period;

#### Reply

1. The reasons for not opening the rooftop of Kwai Fong Car Park between November 2015 and October 2018 are as follows –
  - (a) As revealed from the chronology of events from October 2013 to 19 November 2015 contained in THB’s reply dated 25 July 2019 and the chronology of events from 8 July 2014 to 6 May 2019 at the Annex to THB’s reply dated 9 May 2019 (attached herewith for easy reference), there has been serious water leakage on the rooftop of Kwai Fong Car Park since late 2013, causing a lot of concrete spalling on 7/F and warranting the consideration of re-roofing works.
  - (b) At the works meeting attended by TD and the Architectural Services Department (“ArchSD”) on 8 July 2014, the works consultant of ArchSD stated that the re-roofing works would be carried out on the rooftop of Kwai Fong Car Park and **the rooftop would be turned into a works site**. Subsequently, ArchSD’s contractor took over the roof together with 7/F of the Car Park and commenced the repair works (including re-roofing works) on 8 April 2015. On 9 November 2015, ArchSD completed the works on barrier-free access facilities, but the **re-roofing works were still underway**.
  - (c) Upon checking works progress with ArchSD, TD was advised on 19 November 2015 that ArchSD had sorted out the technical constraints and designed a new re-roofing system. However, given that the re-roofing works would incur higher construction cost, **the re-roofing works would not be carried out within 2015**. ArchSD further stated that it was attempting to sort out the funding issue and would keep TD informed of progress in due course.

**\*Note by Clerk, PAC:** See Appendix 14 of this Report for the reply from Director of Architectural Services dated 19 June 2019; Appendix 7 for the reply from Secretary for Transport and Housing dated 25 July 2019; and Appendix 6 for the reply from Secretary for Transport and Housing dated 9 May 2019.

- (d) Notwithstanding that repair and maintenance works by way of localised epoxy injection was being carried out to the Kwai Fong Car Park from 2015 to 2018, spalling concrete has been found at the ceiling soffit with water seepage at various locations of the ceiling of 7/F. As revealed from past available records, whilst 7/F of the Car Park was handed over by ArchSD to TD in January 2016 and was opened in February 2016, water seepage problems emerged, rendering the need for closure of the affected car parking spaces to enable repair works to be done. Noting then that the re-roofing works had yet to be completed and in order to avoid the haphazard operation of the car parking spaces concerned, TD considered that the rooftop was temporarily not suitable for parking until and unless there was a clear way forward to deal with the long-standing water seepage problem for the period from 2015 to 2018.
- (e) On 27 November 2017, TD secured the agreement with ArchSD to conduct a site meeting at which TD raised the need for repair works to be done such that TD could resolve the problems and prepare for the re-opening of the roof of the Car Park for parking purpose. In the meantime, the need for using the roof as a temporary vehicle detention centre arose in April 2018 to compensate for the shortage of suitable detention spaces for those vehicles which have to be impounded temporarily in accordance with section 93 of the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374). With the eventual confirmation of ArchSD to proceed with the basic repair works on the roof and the works completion in November 2018, the roof was subsequently opened for use as a temporary vehicle detention centre with effect from 1 April 2019.
- (f) As stated in THB's reply dated 9 May 2019, TD will review the feasibility of opening part of the roof for car parking purpose, while continuing to reserve the remaining part for vehicle detention purpose. We aim to complete the review by end 2019.

#### Part 4: Management of on-street parking spaces

##### Management of on-street metered parking spaces

2. **according to paragraph 4.2 of the Audit Report, the principle of maintaining 15% of on-street parking spaces empty was formulated in 1967 and reaffirmed in 1972 and 2000. Please advise the rationale behind this principle, whether any reviews have been conducted since then on the applicability of this principle under the changing circumstances over the years. If yes, the outcome of the reviews; if not, reason(s) for not doing so;**

#### Reply

2. Setting the target of achieving 15% vacancy (or 85% occupancy) of on-street parking spaces means that for every 10 spaces, there will be on average one to two spaces vacant at any one time to cater for on-going motorists' demand,

**\*Note by Clerk, PAC: See Appendix 6 of this Report for the reply from Secretary for Transport and Housing dated 9 May 2019.**

keeping the vehicle circulation time to a minimum, thereby avoiding additional burden on road traffic. The rationale is to strike a balance between the use of kerbside space for parking to address short-term parking need and possible disruption to local traffic in the provision of on-street parking spaces in areas of high parking demand and limited road space. The yardstick of 15% vacancy is in line with various overseas research findings that vacancy below 15% would result in a sharp increase in circulation time for searching for a space<sup>1</sup>.

TD is actively monitoring the parking situation in Hong Kong and considers it appropriate to continue to adopt 15% vacancy (or 85% occupancy rate) of on-street parking as a target.

3. **according to paragraph 4.4(a) of the Audit Report, the contractor engaged by TD for the management of on-street metered parking spaces is required to retrieve data from all on-street parking meters at least once every four days by portable data retrievers, and upload all data to the central computer system. Please advise whether the contractor was able to comply with such requirements in 2018; if not, the number of non-compliance cases and the penalties, if any, for such non-compliances;**

### **Reply**

3. In accordance with the contract for management, operation and maintenance of the parking meter system, the contractor shall be responsible for the retrieval, handling, storage and uploading of the transaction data in accordance with the contract in a timely manner, or it shall be liable to (i) bear any administrative fee charged by the clearing service provider, and (ii) compensate the Government for the aggregate amount of all transaction data that the clearing service provider might refuse to take into account as a result of the contractor's late uploading or transmission.

At present, the contractor is required under the contract to retrieve data from on-street parking meters at least once every four days. In 2018, there were four cases whereby the contractor failed to comply with the aforesaid requirement because the contractor's staff were unable to access the parking meters concerned due to the obstruction/occupation of metered parking spaces by fallen trees/tree branches, bamboo sticks or construction waste. In accordance with the contract, the contractor had reported these cases to the government departments concerned for clearing the sites. Upon clearance of the obstruction/occupation of the metered parking spaces concerned, transaction data of the associated parking meters concerned were subsequently retrieved and processed properly by the contractor resulting in no loss of parking revenue. As the above non-compliance cases were caused by external factors beyond the contractor's control, and there was no resultant loss of parking revenue because the transaction data was properly kept in the

---

<sup>1</sup> Overseas researches indicate that the time for a car to circulate on roads in searching for a parking space would be in the range of about 2 to 3 minutes when the vacancy rate stays at 15% or more, but would increase sharply to some 20 minutes when the vacancy rate drops to 10% and below.

parking meters concerned and subsequently retrieved, no penalty was imposed against the contractor.

- 4. with reference to paragraph 4.4(b) of the Audit Report, please provide the number of cases reported by the contractor managing on-street metered parking spaces each year from 2016 to 2018:**
- a. The Hong Kong Police Force (“the Police”) on: (i) obstruction at a metered parking space; (ii) a metered parking space occupied by a vehicle which appears to be abandoned or a vehicle with extensive defective bodywork; and (iii) meters installed in areas of high parking demand but collecting extraordinarily low amount of parking meter revenue;**
  - b. The Lands Department (“LandsD”) on the occupation of metered parking space by any object other than a vehicle; and**
  - c. The Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (“FEHD”) on the parking space with rubbish identified;**

**Reply**

4. The numbers of cases reported by the contractor to the concerned government departments between 2016 and 2018 are as follows -

	2016	2017	2018
(a) to the Police on			
(i) obstruction at a metered parking space <sup>2</sup>	162	1 150	1 276
(ii) a metered parking space occupied by a vehicle which appears to be abandoned or a vehicle with extensive defective bodywork <sup>3</sup>	23	83	34
(iii) meters installed in areas of high parking demand but collecting extraordinarily low amount of parking meter revenue <sup>4</sup>	24 234	28 796	21 935
(b) to LandsD on the occupation of metered parking space by any object other than a vehicle	102	1 154	1 273
(c) to FEHD on the parking space with rubbish identified	91	219	505

<sup>2</sup> Some obstruction cases were referred to the Police and LandsD simultaneously as they were perceived by the frontline staff of the contractor as under both departments’ purview. As such, there might be double counting of these cases.

<sup>3</sup> The abandoned vehicle cases were reported to the Police by the contractor in accordance with the contract. The cases were also copied to the LandsD by the contractor in parallel to facilitate timely removal of the abandoned vehicles concerned.

<sup>4</sup> The contractor provided monthly report to the Police on meters installed in areas of high parking demand but collecting extraordinarily low amount of parking meter revenue. The figures refer to the numbers of metered parking spaces included in the monthly report in the respective year.

5. **according to paragraph 4.8 of the Audit Report, the results of the utilisation survey conducted on all metered parking spaces from 2015 to 2018 indicated that the metered parking fee evasion rate had remained stable at around 30%. In this regard, please advise the existing procedures to handle the evasion cases and whether there are any new measures/strategies to address the fee evasion problem;**

**Reply**

5. At present, the contractor is required under the contract to inspect all on-street parking meters at least once every four days. If individual parking spaces are found to be occupied by vehicles but without payment of parking fees, the contractor will report the case(s) to the Police for follow-up actions. In addition, the contractor will issue a report to the Police on a monthly basis in respect of those parking meters installed in areas of high parking demand but collecting extraordinarily low amount of parking meter revenue, in order to draw their attention to the potential fee evasion cases.

TD has already kick-started preparatory work, including the award of contract to a new operator in May 2019, for installation of new parking meters by phases starting from the first half of 2020 to replace the existing ones. Each new parking meter will be fitted with occupancy sensors to detect whether the relevant metered parking space is occupied or not. The backend system will provide real-time information on metered parking spaces being occupied but without payment of parking fees. TD has planned to share this real-time information on the locations of these parking spaces with the Police for their reference.

6. **according to Table 9 in paragraph 4.9 of the Audit Report, from 2015 to 2018, on average, the objective of maintaining the 15% parking space availability rate was not met in 15 (40%) of the 37 districts. In particular, this objective had not been met in many of the districts in Kowloon. Please advise:**
- a. **Whether TD has looked into the reason(s) behind, particularly the situation in Kowloon; if yes, the details; if not, why not; and**
  - b. **Whether TD has taken any actions to improve the parking spaces availability rate of on-street parking spaces in Kowloon, if yes, what actions have been taken and were these actions effective; if not, why not;**

**Reply**

6. (a) In general, the availability rate hinges on three parameters, i.e. demand, supply and charge rate of the on-street parking spaces. From 2015 to 2018, the charge rate remained at a low level of \$2 per 15 minutes (maximum) while the territory-wide supply of on-street metered parking spaces maintained at a relatively constant level of about 18 000. During the same period, the parking demand continued to rise with the overall increase in the number of licensed vehicles. This has rendered

some districts, which have the following characteristics, not being able to meet the 15% availability rate target –

- (i) districts already fully developed decades ago with insufficient or nil ancillary parking spaces at that time;
- (ii) districts with mixed land uses (mixed residential, commercial, retail, entertainment, etc.), accommodating high density of residential and working population, constituting considerable home-end and destination-end parking demand; and
- (iii) districts with limited land and road space for provision of more parking spaces.

Most districts in Kowloon have inherited the above characteristics. There are a lot of old developments in Kowloon, scattering over various districts such as Kowloon City, Hung Hom, Yau Tsim Mong, To Kwa Wan, etc. which do not have adequate ancillary parking facilities. Hence, on-street parking becomes very crucial in addressing parking needs. Also, the highly mixed land use nature of Kowloon has given rise to high residential and working population density in comparison with Hong Kong Island and the New Territories<sup>5</sup>, thus inducing higher parking demand of both home-end and work-end trips. Unless land occupied by old developments could be unleashed through re-development proposals, new land could hardly be identified for increasing parking spaces in Kowloon substantially.

- (b) We have adopted a multi-pronged approach to increase the parking provision. The measures that we have adopted include (a) requiring developers to provide parking spaces at the higher end of the parking standards under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (“HKPSG”) for new developments; (b) adopting the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses” to provide public car parking spaces in suitable “Government, Institution or Community” facilities and public open space projects (e.g. the underground public car park in the proposed open space at Sze Mei Street, San Po Kong); and (c) planning for trials of automated parking systems (e.g. in Yen Chow Street, Sham Shui Po).

On-street parking and loading/unloading spaces would only be designated where road capacity permits, i.e. not causing congestion or inconvenience to other road users. Against this principle, TD cautiously increased on-street parking spaces in Kowloon in the past three years, with 152 spaces already put in place (comprising 19 for private cars, 101 for motorcycles, 28 for coaches and 4 for goods vehicles). For off-street parking spaces in Kowloon, about 1 500 had been planned, of which 1 109 were commissioned, comprising 992 for private cars, 63 for motorcycles, 25 for coaches and 29 for goods vehicles.

---

<sup>5</sup> For instance, according to the 2018 data from the Census and Statistics Department, the population density of Kowloon is 48 250 persons per square kilometre, which was much higher than that of Hong Kong Island (15 670 persons per square kilometre) and the New Territories (4 110 persons per square kilometre).

7. **with reference to paragraph 4.11 of the Audit Report, why were different parking fees charged in close meter locations and provide a copy of the guidelines on the setting of on-street metered parking fees;**

**Reply**

7. TD finds it appropriate to consider the charge on a case-by-case basis, having regard to prevailing traffic conditions, overall parking space supply and demand, as well as acceptance of users.

Metered parking spaces have often been set up at different times and hence may have adopted different charge levels with due consideration of the then traffic conditions, overall supply and demand, and acceptance of users. If the overall utilisation of the cluster of metered parking spaces at same locality does not generally reach the threshold (85% occupancy) for adjustment, and the traffic flow has not been adversely affected by cars searching for parking spaces, no adjustment would normally be considered. That said, TD is reviewing the charging level of metered parking spaces at same locality with different parking fees with a view to unifying the rate as appropriate. The target is to complete the review by end 2019, and subject to the outcome of local consultation where it is deemed necessary, the adjustments will be implemented in various locations as appropriate progressively.

In the case of Kowloon City as quoted in the Audit Report, the parking spaces at Inverness Road recorded a utilisation rate of 86.7% on weekdays in 2018, exceeding our target of 85% marginally. Hence, TD is reviewing the need for adjusting the charging level accordingly and will consult the local community in due course.

8. **according to paragraph 4.13 and 4.14 of the Audit Report, TD had set out in its internal guidelines that parking meters for private cars and van-type light goods vehicles should be of 30-minute duration in core commercial areas, and two-hour duration at the outskirts. However, the Audit examination revealed that parking meters with different types of “longest parking period” for each transaction were installed in the same street and that the term “core commercial areas” had not been defined in TD’s internal guidelines. What are the reasons for allocating parking meters with different types of “longest parking period” for each transaction in the same street and advise how the term “core commercial areas” had been/should be defined to facilitate the compliance with the internal guidelines by TD staff;**

**Reply**

8. The intention of providing metered parking spaces with a parking duration of at most 30 minutes per payment in core commercial areas in preference to other longer parking duration is to encourage turnover of parked vehicles. In this context, core commercial areas generally refer to places where short duration business activities frequently take place (e.g. short visits to banks and quick stop-over etc.).



Notwithstanding the above, in view that mixed land use has become very commonly found in Hong Kong, the need to adopt different “longest parking period” for on-street parking spaces in close proximity arises. The aim is to balance the competing needs and yet to provide convenience to the motorists.

Apart from commercial areas, other areas of different development setting are facing competing parking demand which requires different parking durations, e.g. visiting a park and purchasing in a convenience shop next to the park. TD will allocate the parking meters with different “longest parking period” to suit different needs. This can be demonstrated in the case of Wood Road as quoted in the Audit Report. The 2 parking spaces with the longest parking period of 2 hours are to cater for users of the nearby Wan Chai Park whereas the 4 parking spaces with the longest parking period of 30 minutes are to cater for other users, such as shoppers, taxi drivers, etc. who only stop over for a short period.

9. **according to paragraph 4.15(a) and Photograph 4 of the Audit Report, Audit visit discovered that the metered parking spaces at Kam Shan Country Park Car Park were set with different operating period. Please explain/advise:**
- a. **Why different meter operating periods were applied to the parking spaces for the same vehicle type in some parking places; and**
  - b. **Whether there are any guidelines on setting operating periods for on-street metered parking spaces; if yes, please provide a copy of such guidelines; if not, how the operating period of a metered parking space is determined;**

### **Reply**

- 9.
- (a) While there are ten different types of operating periods for on-street metered parking spaces as depicted in Appendix G of the Audit Report, the majority of them adopt the charge period covering at least 8:00am to 8:00pm on weekdays (99.7%) and 10:00am to 10:00pm on general holidays (96.3%). The intention is to encourage turnover during the high time motorists use their cars for commuting, business or leisure activities. In some situations, on-street parking spaces located in close vicinity require adoption of different operating periods to address different parking needs. Taking the parking site located beside Kam Shan Country Park quoted in the Audit Report as an example, while it is necessary to charge motorists for on-street parking to encourage turnover of the parking spaces, TD has to provide a portion of the spaces free of charge during general holidays so as to facilitate motorists to engage with long hour countryside activities (e.g. hiking or cruising), as it would not be possible for them to return every two hours to pay the parking fee.
  - (b) While part (a) above provides the current practice in considering the operating period of on-street parking spaces, it has to be determined on a case-by-case basis having regard to the general activities taking place in the district concerned, parking needs of the motorists, and prevailing

traffic conditions. In this regard, TD provides broad guiding principles instead of rigid detailed guidelines. In the Transport Planning and Design Manual, Clause 4.3.2<sup>6</sup> and 4.4.9<sup>7</sup> of Chapter 4 are relevant to the determination of operating period in that metered parking spaces are primarily for short term parking involving a high turnover, and the operating period of the meters shall normally end at 2400 hour. However, such operating period shall be adjusted to meet the need and traffic condition of the district concerned. Depending on locations, the demand for short-term parking and high turnover may diminish at different time at night. In such cases, the operating hours would therefore be set to end at 2000, 2200 or 2400 hour depending on locations.

- 10. with reference to paragraph 4.15(b) of the Audit Report about the utilisation of on-street metered parking spaces beyond the pre-set operating periods, TD has agreed to, according to paragraphs 4.19(a)(iii) and 4.20(c), conduct regular survey and consider extending the meter operating periods for parking spaces with high utilisation. Please advise the progress in this regard;**

**Reply**

10. TD has conducted desktop study on the operating period of parking meters, and has preliminarily identified about 220 metered parking spaces the operating period of which might need to be reviewed for extension. For these parking spaces, TD will conduct on-site surveys at suitable time to collect the latest utilisation rate and aims to complete the review by end 2019 / early 2020. Once the review is completed, TD will consult the local community and relevant District Councils on the extension.
- 11. according to paragraph 4.17 of the Audit Report, Audit analysis of the quarterly reports on low-utilised parking meters for the period from 2016 to 2018 revealed that 212 parking meters covering 399 parking spaces with persistent low utilisation were not redeployed. Please advise whether TD has looked into the reason(s) behind; if yes, the details; if not, why not;**

**Reply**

11. Since 2018, 33 parking meters were released for possible relocation to other locations. TD has to proceed with the relocation cautiously because, once the associated parking spaces become non-metered, it may give rise to traffic management problems such as illegal prolonged parking.

---

<sup>6</sup> Clause 4.3.2 states “Metered parking spaces should be primarily for short term parking involving a high turnover, so that the facility would be available for use by many motorists. Meters permitting half, one or two hour parking should be used.”

<sup>7</sup> Clause 4.4.9 states “To encourage the use of on-street parking spaces in industrial areas for the overnight parking of goods vehicles, the period of meter operation should be shortened to 2000 hour instead of the normal 2400 hour termination.”

12. **According to paragraphs 4.19(a)(ii) and 4.20(b) of the Audit Report, TD would review and adjust as appropriate the “longest parking period” for each transaction of existing two-hour parking meters in core commercial areas. Please advise the latest position;**

**Reply**

12. TD is now reviewing the “longest parking period” for each transaction of existing parking meters, with a view to completing the review by end 2019. Preliminarily, it is considered that the “longest parking period” of about 290 metered parking spaces over the territory should be reduced to 30 minutes. TD will consult the local community and relevant District Councils on the reduction in early 2020.
13. **according to paragraphs 4.20(a) and (d) of the Audit Report, TD will review the parking fees for meters charging the low rate and formulate parking fee adjustment mechanism upon the commissioning of the new generation of parking meter system, which is expected to be completed by early 2022. Please advise the interim measures taken/to be taken by TD to achieve its policy intent of short-term on-street parking;**

**Reply**

13. TD is now reviewing the parking fees for meters charging the low rate of \$2 per 30 minutes, with a view to completing the review by end 2019. Preliminarily, it is considered that the charging rate of about 1 600 metered parking spaces should be increased to \$2 per 15 minutes. TD will consult the local community and the relevant District Councils on the increase in early 2020.

*Management of on-street non-metered parking spaces*

14. **according to paragraph 4.24 of the Audit Report, the charging proposal for on-street motorcycle parking spaces could not be pursued after TD’s reviews conducted in 1999, 2006 and 2012 due to technical, operational and enforcement problems. Please elaborate the difficulties in implementing such proposals;**

**Reply**

14. The enforcement, technical and operational problems revealed in past reviews are summarised below -

Enforcement aspects

In order to charge on-street motorcycle (“MC”) parking through metering, a pre-requisite is to correctly identify a MC for which the required fee has been paid, with a metered parking space. Because of the small size and weight of an MC, it is possible that after a motorcyclist has parked his/her vehicle at a designated parking space and paid the parking fee, a newcomer might move the original MC aside and then share the parking space. The newcomer may

even move the original MC away from the designated parking space, and then occupy the entire vacated space. In such circumstances, it is difficult to determine who has paid or should pay. A motorcyclist may claim that he/she had paid the parking fee but is not so regarded, because his/her MC has been moved away from the metered parking space. There may be enforcement difficulty if these problems are not overcome.

Technical and operational aspects

In an attempt to overcome the above problems, TD, in collaboration with the Police, has looked into the feasibility of providing some installation to enable a motorcyclist to secure his/her MC to a designated parking space. The device can also serve as a security measure to prevent theft. Three trials on such devices were conducted in 2000, 2008 and 2010/11 respectively, during which securing / security devices were installed at four locations, including Ashley Road, Wyndham Street, Sunning Road and Connaught Road West. Records were taken on the usage of these devices during the trials.

The devices basically comprised some special railings installed at the edge of the footpath adjacent to the parking spaces on the carriageway. The railings allowed chaining the parked MCs to prevent them from being moved sideways or away from the designated parking spaces where they had been parked. However, the usage rates in the three trials were all below 5%. This indicated reluctance of the motorcyclists to chain their MCs to the railings to enhance security. It was therefore concluded that the trials were not successful in that the railings would unlikely be widely used by motorcyclists as a security device to prevent theft. Instead of managing the utilisation of on-street MC parking spaces through metering (i.e. charging), TD will continue to adopt measures to increase the supply of MC parking spaces. For details, please refer to response to Item 15(c) below.

- 15. according to paragraph 4.25 of the Audit Report, a survey conducted by TD in 2017 on on-street motorcycle parking spaces revealed that the utilisation rate of these parking spaces was over 85% in 446 (76%) parking spaces surveyed and 618 motorcycles considered not roadworthy were found in 278 (47%) parking place surveyed. According to paragraph 4.26 of the Audit Report, Audit surveyed 100 parking places from November 2018 to January 2019 and discovered that motorcycles considered not roadworthy were still found in 28 parking places. Audit considered that the abandoned vehicle problem might be attributable to enforcement difficulties. Please advise:**
- a. The procedures for handling prolonged parking at non-metered parking spaces by TD and the difficulties encountered;**
  - b. Whether TD had taken measures to remove the aforesaid 618 motorcycles; if yes, the actions taken and the number of motorcycles involved; if not, why not; and**
  - c. Whether TD still considers that there is no imminent need to regulate on-street motorcycle parking by metering despite the high utilisation situation of on-street motorcycle parking spaces and the issues of abandoned motorcycles and illegal parking indicated by**

**the 2017 survey; if yes, the reason(s); if not, any planned actions on the regulation;**

**Reply**

15.

- (a) In general, after identification of abandoned motorcycles at on-street parking spaces (either through surveys conducted by TD or through complaints received by TD or other departments), LandsD will be responsible for posting of notice under section 6(1) of the Land (Miscellaneous Provisions) Ordinance (Cap. 28) requiring the occupation of the land to cease before a specified date. Thereafter, the abandoned motorcycle will be removed by LandsD. As regards abandoned vehicles that cause serious obstruction and danger to other road users, the Police will remove such vehicles in accordance with the Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap. 374).
- (b) TD referred the 618 motorcycles mentioned to the concerned departments according to the procedures mentioned in (a) above. Recently, TD has taken stock of the current status of the 618 motorcycles concerned and noted that 545 of these motorcycles no longer stay in the same parking place. TD will continue to follow up with the concerned departments on the remaining cases and keep monitoring the situation.
- (c) The rationale of not metering motorcycle parking spaces is explained in the reply to item (14) above. To deal with the current shortage of motorcycle parking spaces, TD will continue to actively pursue the following measures to increase the supply of parking spaces -
  - (i) requiring developers to provide parking spaces at the higher end of the parking standards under HKPSG for new developments;
  - (ii) following the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses” to provide public car parking spaces (including motorcycle spaces) in suitable “Government, Institution or Community” facilities and public open space projects;
  - (iii) providing additional on-street motorcycle parking spaces in various districts, including the use of space underneath flyovers; and
  - (iv) requiring temporary car parks providing motorcycle parking spaces to clearly indicate at the entrance the availability of such parking spaces and the relevant parking fees, as a measure to promote motorcycle parking at temporary car parks.

Furthermore, TD will continue to work closely with relevant departments to step up efforts in handling cases of illegal occupation of parking spaces for motorcycles.

Part 5: Implementation of parking-related technology initiatives

16. **with reference to paragraph 5.6 of the Audit Report regarding the completeness of car park location information in the “HKeMobility” mobile application, please advise: -**
- (a) **whether TD has looked into the reason(s) for missing information of 525 car parks from the mobile applications: if yes,**
  - (b) **whether the owners/operators of those 525 car parks refused to provide the relevant information; and**
  - (c) **the reason(s) why the location of those 525 car parks could not be provided by the mobile application;**

Reply

16. To enhance user-friendliness, TD integrated three mobile applications to an all-in-one mobile application, HKeMobility, in July 2018. At that time, TD’s internal parking data system, covering the car park location information and supporting the automatic data migration and regular updating in “HKeMobility”, was under enhancement, resulting in the information of some car parks temporarily unavailable to the public. Upon completion of the system enhancement work in end 2018, the full set of car park data, including car park location information, was uploaded to the “HKeMobility” for dissemination to the public since February 2019. Thereafter, in order to ensure continuous update of such information, car park information data stored in TD’s internal data system will be uploaded to HKeMobility at regular intervals automatically.
17. **according to paragraph 5.8 of the Audit Report, TD had approached three departments (i.e. the Government Property Agency (“GPA”), the Housing Department (“HD”) and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (“LCSD”)) in 2015 and 2016 to solicit their support in providing parking vacancy information. However, the outcome was not satisfactory because not all the agreements with the car park operators contained a clause requiring the provision of parking vacancy information to TD. In this regard, please advise whether TD had requested the relevant departments to include such clause in their new agreements with car park operators; if yes, please explain why there had been no improvement in the provision of parking vacancy information by the “HKeMobility” mobile application as at 31 December 2018; if not, why not;**

Reply

17. In mid-2016, TD met with the three departments, including HD, LCSD and GPA, to explain the procedures for updating the parking vacancy information and encouraged the departments to include relevant clauses in their new agreements with car park operators specifying the provision of parking vacancy information.

With these departments’ efforts and contributions, the parking vacancy information of the first batch of 11 car parks (comprising 8 under HD, 2 under

LCSD and 1 under GPA) has been disseminated through TD's mobile application since end 2016/early 2017.

TD conducted follow-up meetings with these departments again in early 2019, and shared a new standard clause of parking information for short-term tenancy car park. In response, these departments re-affirmed their support to the Government's open data policy and agreed to incorporate new requirements during renewal of their car park management contracts to achieve the parking information dissemination in HKeMobility. At as early September 2019, GPA has already taken steps to include new clauses into their two renewed carpark contracts.

- 18. with reference to paragraph 5.9 of the Audit Report regarding the sample check conducted by Audit on the provision of supplementary information of 30 car parks (including the 11 government multi-storey car parks) by the "HKeMobility" mobile application, please advise whether TD had looked into the reason(s) for the unavailability or incompleteness of supplementary information of those 30 car parks discovered by Audit; if yes, please provide the details; if not, why not and is there any plan put in place/to be put in place by TD to improve the situation;**

**Reply**

18. To further enhance the data content of government public car parks, TD sought inputs from the departments (i.e. HD, LCSD and GPA) and standardised the information to be disseminated in early 2019. The supplementary information such as payment information, electric vehicle ("EV") charging services information and opening hours has been progressively released to the public since May 2019.

For non-government car parks, operators could, at their discretion, reveal other supplementary car park information on the car park information page, including hyperlinks to car park operators' specific websites. As some information (such as parking fee and privileges) is subject to change frequently to suit operators' own business needs, it is more preferable for operators to disseminate such information to the public via the web address of the carpark, rather than direct display in HKeMobility. Having said that, TD will keep encouraging the operators to provide the supplementary information on a voluntary basis.

- 19. according to paragraph 5.14(e) of the Audit Report, TD was arranging opening "on-street non-metered parking spaces" dataset suitable for dissemination to the public via the Public Sector Information Portal tentatively by mid-2019. Please advise the progress;**

**Reply**

19. The "on-street non-metered parking spaces" data has been opened up and made available at the Government Public Sector Information portal

(data.gov.hk) under On-Street Parking dataset of Road Network (2nd Generation) since 2 July 2019.

- 20. with reference to paragraph 5.16(b) of the Audit Report regarding the 66 complaints received by TD from EV owners/drivers from March 2017 to October 2018 on the occupation of parking spaces equipped with EV chargers in the government multi-storey car parks by non-EVs, please advise whether follow-up actions had been taken by TD in respect of the complaints; if yes, please provide the details; if not, why not;**

**Reply**

20. While parking spaces in TD's car parks equipped with EV chargers are not reserved for exclusive use by EVs in view of high parking demand, priority for parking by EVs will be arranged by the contractors for management, operation and maintenance of TD's car parks during non-peak periods.

Upon receiving the complaints, the contractors have been reminded to continue the above arrangements to put traffic cones on parking spaces equipped with EV chargers during non-peak periods to enable EVs to use the concerned parking spaces.

- 21. according to the reply dated 13 June 2019 from the Director of Environmental Protection and the reply dated 25 July 2019 from the Secretary for Transport and Housing, the installation of parking bay display and guidance system at TD's car parks has been taken forward. Please advise the expected completion date of the project;**

**Reply**

21. According to the latest schedule, the works agent of the project, i.e. the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department, will complete the tender for the Bay Guidance System by early 2020 and commence the installation works at TD's car parks in mid-2020 with a view to fully completing the project by early 2021.

- 22. according to the reply dated 25 July 2019 from the Secretary for Transport and Housing, the expenditure incurred for the maintenance and enhancement of the "HKeMobility" mobile application since its launch in July 2018 amounted to \$1.84 million. Please advise the details of the maintenance and enhancement works, whether TD considers the amount justifiable from the value-for-money perspective given that the application has only operated for one year and its development cost was just \$600,000.**

**\*Note by Clerk, PAC:** *See Appendix 22 of this Report for the reply from Director of Environmental Protection dated 13 June 2019 and Appendix 7 of this Report for the reply from Secretary for Transport and Housing dated 25 July 2019.*



## **Reply**

22. As an initiative under the Hong Kong Smart City Blueprint promulgated in December 2017, TD integrated three pre-existing applications (i.e. HKeTransport, HKeRouting and eTraffic News) into an all-in-one mobile application. The all-in-one mobile application “HKeMobility” was launched in July 2018 with development costs of \$600,000.

Since the launch in July 2018, HKeMobility has been gaining popularity, with more than 2 million downloads and an average daily hit rate approaching 30 000, as at September 2019.

Since July 2018, there have been 11 occasions of major upgrading of HKeMobility to cater for additional features and functions, including extending walking network to Mong Kok and Yau Mai Tei, residents’ service information, cycling information, bus services information, information on Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge Hong Kong Boundary Crossing, provision of road works information, estimated time of arrival for MTR Tseung Kwan O Line/Tung Chung Line/West Rail Line/Airport Express, services status of MTR service, etc. Among all additional features, the extension of walking network costs about \$1.1 million to collect and verify the walking route data. Therefore, the development cost of \$600,000 should not be directly compared with the subsequent enhancement and maintenance costs.