

香港特別行政區政府
The Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

政府總部
運輸及房屋局
運輸科
香港添馬添美道 2 號
政府總部東翼



Transport and
Housing Bureau
Government Secretariat
Transport Branch
East Wing, Central Government Offices,
2 Tim Mei Avenue,
Tamar, Hong Kong
電話 Tel. No.: 3509 7181
傳真 Fax No.: 3904 1774

本局檔號 OUR REF.: THB(T) CR 1/5591/2019
來函檔號 YOUR REF.: CB4/PAC/R72

9 May 2019

Mr Anthony Chu
Clerk to Public Accounts Committee
Legislative Council Complex
1 Legislative Council Road
Central, Hong Kong

Dear Mr Chu,

Public Accounts Committee

Consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72

Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces

I refer to your letter of 26 April 2019 requesting us to provide information on various subjects to facilitate the Public Accounts Committee's consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72.

The requested information in English and Chinese is now enclosed for your reference. Please note that, for item (f), the reply is a consolidated reply from the Transport and Housing Bureau and the Hong Kong Police Force.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Hillman Chow', written over a white background.

(Hillman Chow)
for Secretary for Transport and Housing

c.c. Commissioner for Transport 2802 2361
Commissioner of Police 2866 2579

Public Accounts Committee

Consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72 Planning, Provision and Management of Public Parking Spaces

Enquiries from Clerk of the Public Accounts Committee dated 26 April 2019

To facilitate the Public Accounts Committee's consideration of Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 72 ("Audit Report"), I should be grateful if you could provide us with the information below:

Planning and provision of public parking spaces

- (a) According to Table 1 in paragraph 1.9 of the Audit Report, there are 9 220 parking spaces in Government, Institution or Community ("G/IC") developments. Please set out the conditions on the use of these parking spaces such as the opening hours;

Reply

- (a) The public parking spaces in G/IC developments are mainly parking spaces in government buildings, parks, sports facilities, markets, educational institutions and hospitals that are provided for use by the general public. The hourly charge rates and the operating hours of the premises will vary depending on the services provided by the facilities and the contract terms of the car park operators.
- (b) According to paragraph 2.3 of the Audit Report, the Transport Department ("TD") projected that the parking space ratio would further drop to less than 1 in the coming years. Please provide both the projected increase and reduction in the number of public car parking spaces, with reasons leading to such changes, and the parking space ratio in the coming three years;

Reply

- (b) As at end December 2018, the number of private cars (inclusive of van-type light goods vehicles which can be parked in private car parking spaces) was 616 220, whereas the number of parking spaces available for private cars was 675 264. The ratio was about 1.10.

As at the first quarter of 2019, the annual growth rate of licensed private cars over the past 12 months was about 2%. Should this trend continue and projecting on this basis, the estimated numbers of private cars in the next three years would be about 628 500, 641 100 and 653 900 respectively.

As for the projection on the supply of public parking spaces for private cars in future, since the provision of new parking spaces is contingent on the results of district consultation and progress of individual development projects, TD does not compile specific projection. However, it was observed that in the past three years (2016 to 2018), the average growth rate of private car parking space provision was about 1.3% per annum. Should this trend continue and assuming the above-mentioned car growth rate, the related parking space ratio would drop by about 0.01 per year in the next three years.

The Government will continue to closely monitor the parking needs of different districts and take measures to increase parking spaces as necessary, including designating suitable on-street locations as night-time parking spaces; requiring developers to provide parking spaces at the higher end of the parking standards under the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines for new developments; following the principle of “Single Site, Multiple Uses” to provide public car parking spaces in suitable GIC facilities and public open space projects; and taking forward a pilot study on automated parking systems, with a view to promoting wider use of such systems in government and private car parks where circumstances permit.

- (c) With reference to Table 2 in paragraph 2.4 of the Audit Report, please provide the distribution between hourly charged parking spaces and monthly charged parking spaces for each of the following types of public parking spaces: G/IC developments and public housing developments, private developments, government multi-storey car parks and short-term tenancy car parks;

Reply

(c) The distribution between hourly charged parking spaces and monthly charged parking spaces provided by government car parks under TD's purview is tabulated below. TD does not have information about the distribution of parking spaces in other types of car parks.

Car Park	Private Car		Motorcycle	
	No. of Parking Spaces	Quota of Monthly/Quarterly Tickets	No. of Parking Spaces	Quota of Monthly/Quarterly Tickets
(1) Yau Ma Tei	770	345	76	65
(2) Star Ferry	380	60	37	20
(3) City Hall	170	55	27	25
(4) Rumsey Street	835	380	148	135
(5) Aberdeen	293	290	51	45
(6) Kwai Fong	477	420	93	80
(7) Tsuen Wan	545	510	34	30
(8) Shau Kei Wan	386	343	72	65
(9) Tin Hau	429	330	75	70
(10) Sheung Fung Street, Wong Tai Sin	268	267	74	70
(11) Kennedy Town	195	170	37	36
Total	4,748	3,170	724	641

Except the 10 reserved parking spaces at Star Ferry Car Park, all parking spaces in TD's car parks are not reserved for monthly/quarterly patrons. Car park operators may allow hourly parking of other individual motorists, subject to the occupancy by the monthly/quarterly patrons in the car parks.

- (d) Mechanism/measure(s) put in place by the Government to ensure reasonable distribution of hourly charged and monthly charged parking spaces in private developments;

Reply

- (d) The Government does not regulate the distribution of hourly charged and monthly charged parking spaces of car parks in private developments, which is a matter for the market to determine.

Management of government multi-storey car parks

- (e) referring to paragraphs 3.16 to 3.24(a) of the Audit Report about the unused rooftop parking spaces at Kwai Fong Car Park, a chronology of works/events/decisions taken by TD and/or the car park operator in respect of the rooftop parking spaces from the completion of security installation works in October 2013 to the decision to use it as a temporary vehicle detention centre. When will the rooftop parking spaces be reopened for general parking purpose;

Reply

- (e) The chronology of works/events/decisions taken by TD and/or the car park operator in respect of the rooftop parking spaces of Kwai Fong Car Park (“the Car Park”) from the completion of security installation works in October 2013 to the decision to use it as a temporary vehicle detention centre is given at the **Annex**.

The roof of the Car Park has been used as a temporary vehicle detention centre to cater for the need for detention of those vehicles involved in unauthorised use for hire and reward since 1 April 2019. TD will review the need for the vehicle detention centre and examine the feasibility of opening up part of the roof space for car parking purpose.

- (f) referring to Case 4 in paragraphs 3.21 and para. 3.22 of the Audit Report, reasons for the delay in handling an abandoned vehicle at Rumsey Street Car Park by the Hong Kong Police Force (“HKPF”) and the existing procedures for TD/HKPF to handle cases of abandoned vehicles at

government car parks which are not within the scope of the Road Traffic (Parking on Private Roads) Regulations (Cap. 374O);

Reply

(f) The following is a co-ordinated reply from TD and HKPF.

TD's car parks are designated as private roads under regulation 7 of the Road Traffic (Parking on Private Roads) Regulations (Cap. 374O). Private road signs are erected at the entrance of the car parks.

At present, TD's car park contractors are required to comply with the operational requirements set out in a specific section entitled "Impounding, Removal, Storage and Disposal of Vehicles" in the contracts to handle abandoned vehicles. On the condition that the provisions of Cap. 374O have been followed, the contractors should ensure that the authorised officers use approved immobilisation devices to impound suspected abandoned vehicles, advise the owners to remove the vehicles and deliver the vehicles to the Police pursuant to the contracts if the owners fail to remove the vehicles. An abandoned vehicle is defined as a vehicle not having a Monthly or Quarterly Parking Ticket which has been stationary at a parking space for a continuous period of 30 days or more. In the light of the contract provisions, TD's car park contractors have all along delivered the abandoned vehicles found in the car parks to the Police upon completion of required procedures, including issuing letters to the vehicle owners, publication of relevant notices in newspapers, etc.

In this specific case, the car park contractor has taken action to liaise with the owner after finding the vehicle not having a Monthly or Quarterly Parking Ticket which had been stationary at a parking space for a continuous period of 30 days or more, with a view to removing the vehicle upon confirmation that the vehicle was an abandoned one. In December 2016, the Police received a request of the contractor for taking over three abandoned vehicles, including the subject vehicle, which were reportedly impounded under Cap. 374O in the Rumsey Street Car Park. Correspondences were then exchanged between the Police and TD's contractors to ascertain whether the requirements of Cap. 374O had been met. Under normal circumstances, the Police would only remove

vehicles or other obstructions on the road if they have caused serious obstructions or posed imminent danger to other road users. Each request for disposal would be considered on a case-by-case basis, having regard to circumstances like availability of space in the Police's vehicle pounds. In January 2019, the subject vehicle in Case 4 was accepted for disposal based on such considerations and after satisfying that the requirements of Cap. 374O had been met. Noting that the contractors failed to closely follow up on this case and other 12 cases mentioned in the report, resulting in delay of vacating the parking spaces for public use in a timely manner, TD has required since February 2019 the contractors to submit monthly returns on the handling of abandoned vehicles. TD will arrange staff to conduct surprise inspections to ensure that the returns are correct and updated in order to enhance the monitoring of performance of car park contractors in this regard.

Given the latest advice of the Department of Justice that it may not be the most desirable way to handle abandoned vehicles in such circumstances by virtue of Cap. 374O, TD has already directed its car park contractors to rely on the "Conditions of Parking and Use", which have all along been displayed in the car parks, to handle abandoned vehicles pursuant to contractual arrangements. As at today, there is no abandoned vehicle in TD's car parks.

- (g) referring to paragraph 3.25 of the Audit Report about the provision of closed-circuit television ("CCTV") security systems in government car parks, the handling and retention period of the relevant CCTV footage;

Reply

- (g) At present, a total of 125 CCTV cameras were installed at various locations in the 11 car parks under TD's purview for security, anti-theft and monitoring purposes. These CCTVs cover specific areas 24 hours a day and are equipped with recording function. Carpark contractors have issued internal guidelines in accordance with the data protection principles under the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance (Cap. 486) to their staff for proper handling of video footage. Generally speaking, the video footage will be erased after 14 days. In addition, notices are displayed at concerned locations installed with CCTV system to inform

the public that the relevant areas are under CCTV surveillance.

In the light of the Audit Commission's recommendation, TD has in collaboration with the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") and the Crime Prevention Bureau of the Police embarked on a review of the provision of CCTVs in TD's car parks, including conducting visits to some car parks to review the existing provision and identify locations where additional CCTV cameras are needed.

Implementation of parking-related technology initiatives

- (h) according to paragraph 5.8 of the Audit Report, TD approached the Government Property Agency ("GPA"), Housing Department ("HD") and Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") in 2015 and 2016 to solicit their support in providing parking vacancy information of government venues, but the outcome was not satisfactory. Please provide the details of the outcome, including the relevant responses from these three departments.

Reply

- (h) Since 2015, TD has approached GPA, HD and LCSD appealing for their support in disseminating real-time parking vacancy information to the public through TD's mobile application. In mid-2016, TD issued letters to these government departments and received their responses in July and November 2016. In general, all three departments supported the Government's open data policy, but they expressed that due consideration should be given to the timing of implementation to release real-time parking vacancy information, one of the reasons being that not all car parks were equipped with systems that could accurately display real-time parking vacancy information. In order to assist these departments in opening up the vacancy information as soon as possible, TD followed up and explained to them the procedures for updating the vacancy information manually, and recommended to them the addition of relevant contract clauses in their future contracts with car park operators specifying the provision of real-time parking vacancy information. With these departments' efforts and contributions, the parking vacancy information of the first batch of 11 car parks was disseminated through TD's mobile application in end 2016/early 2017.

In early 2019, TD conducted follow-up meetings with GPA, HD and LCSD. At the meetings, these departments re-affirmed their support to the Government's open data policy, and also shared with TD the latest information of their car parks opened to the public. It is worth noting that GPA and HD have already taken steps to incorporate new requirements during renewal of their car park management contracts for their car park operators to disseminate parking vacancy information progressively in three to four years' time. Meanwhile, TD will continue to share its experience and provide technical advice to facilitate car park operators' early dissemination of parking vacancy information.

Given that the access control system and vehicle recognition system for the 11 multi-storey car parks under TD's purview have been in use for years and cannot support the function of automatic feeding of parking vacancy information, at present, the car park operators have to update manually the vacancy information on an hourly basis for dissemination. TD is arranging gradual replacement of the aforesaid systems for ten of these car parks (except Yau Ma Tei Car Park which will be affected by the Central Kowloon Route project) so as to facilitate automatic updating of the parking vacancy information and data to TD's mobile application and the Government's public sector information portal "data.gov.hk". TD is progressively disseminating the parking vacancy information of its 10 multi-storey car parks in an automatic manner, with the relevant replacement work to be completed by June 2019.

Besides, TD plans to replace existing parking meters with new ones that will be equipped with vehicle sensors to detect whether a parking space is occupied. The new parking meters will be installed progressively starting from mid-2020 for completion in mid-2022. Upon completion of the installation of the new parking meters, the real-time parking vacancy information of on-street metered parking spaces will be made available to the public.

**Chronology of works/events/decisions
taken by TD and/or the car park operator in respect of
the rooftop parking spaces of Kwai Fong Car Park (“the Car Park”)
from the completion of security installation works in October 2013 to
the decision to use it as a temporary vehicle detention centre**

1.	8 July 2014	TD had a site meeting with ArchSD, its consultant and its contractor on barrier-free access works for the Car Park. At that time, the re-roofing works were also discussed.
2.	18 March 2015	TD had a meeting with the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department, ArchSD, its consultant and its contractor to discuss the works arrangements and programme. TD considered that to facilitate the works and avoid damage to vehicles by spalled concrete falling from the ceiling, the whole 7/F of the Car Park should be closed. Accordingly, the roof had to be closed as well when construction works were carried out on the roof.
3.	8 April 2015	ArchSD’s contractor took over the roof and commenced the works.
4.	8 October 2015	TD asked ArchSD about the progress of the works.
5.	9 November 2015	ArchSD completed the works (excluding the re-roofing works) and handed over the roof together with 7/F of the Car Park back to TD.
6.	12 November 2015	ArchSD’s consultant informed ArchSD (with copy to TD) that the works had been completed satisfactorily and that the site had been handed over to TD on 9 November 2015. The consultant also informed that the re-roofing works were eventually not carried out.

7.	19 November 2015	ArchSD advised TD that with regard to the re-roofing works, ArchSD had overcome the technical constraints and would keep TD informed of progress in due course.
8.	27 January 2016	ArchSD handed over 7/F to TD after repair of spalled concrete at ceiling soffit. The minor water dripping at 9 locations (involving closure of seven parking spaces) found during the joint handover inspection was repaired on 28 January 2016 (i.e. the following day).
9.	3 February 2016	Though water leakage was still found at some locations on 7/F of the Car Park, TD instructed its car park operator to re-open the whole 7/F for public use except the seven affected parking spaces.
10.	27 November 2017	TD had a site meeting with ArchSD to consider some basic repair works. According to TD, the works were meant to prepare for the re-opening of the roof of the Car Park for parking.
11.	18 April 2018	TD had another site meeting with ArchSD to discuss further the earlier proposed basic repair works. TD planned to use the roof as a temporary vehicle detention centre.
12.	24 April 2018	TD confirmed with ArchSD that ArchSD would proceed with the basic repair works on the roof subject to availability of necessary funding and manpower resources.
13.	19 November 2018	ArchSD's contractor informed TD of the completion of the works in October 2018.
14.	1 April 2019	The roof of the Car Park has been used as a temporary vehicle detention centre with effect from 1 April 2019.
15.	6 May 2019	ArchSD explained that the re-roofing works mentioned by ArchSD in November 2015

		<p>referred to a separate project under planning and that project would only proceed where circumstances permitted.</p> <p>During the joint site visit requested by TD, some locations on the ceiling of 7/F of the Car Park were found having signs of water seepage. ArchSD agreed to carry out repair works accordingly.</p>
--	--	---