

# 立法會

## *Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(4)1234/18-19  
(These minutes have been seen by  
the Administration)

Ref: CB4/PS/1/16

### **Panel on Transport**

### **Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

### **Minutes of meeting on Friday, 7 December 2018, at 8:30 am in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

**Members present** : Hon Frankie YICK Chi-ming, SBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon LUK Chung-hung, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, GBS, JP  
Hon Claudia MO  
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP  
Hon YIU Si-wing, BBS  
Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Dr Hon Helena WONG Pik-wan  
Hon POON Siu-ping, BBS, MH  
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, SBS, MH, JP  
Hon Alvin YEUNG  
Hon CHU Hoi-dick  
Hon HO Kai-ming  
Hon LAM Cheuk-ting  
Hon SHIU Ka-fai  
Hon Wilson OR Chong-shing, MH  
Hon Tanya CHAN  
Hon LAU Kwok-fan, MH  
Dr Hon CHENG Chung-tai  
Hon Jeremy TAM Man-ho  
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai  
Hon AU Nok-hin  
Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen, BBS

**Member attending** : Hon Starry LEE Wai-king, SBS, JP

**Members absent** : Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun, SBS, JP  
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon CHUNG Kwok-pan  
Dr Hon Junius HO Kwan-yiu, JP

**Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item IV**

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Kevin CHOI, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing  
(Transport) 2  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Philip HAR Mung-fei  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport) 4  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr CHAN Chau-fat  
Assistant Director/ Railways  
Electrical & Mechanical Services Department

Mr LEE Man-ho  
Principal Transport Officer/ Bus & Railway 2  
Transport Department

**Agenda item V**

Mr Frank CHAN Fan, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Ms Rebecca PUN Ting-ting, JP  
Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing  
(Transport)1  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Peter MAK Chi-kwong  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and  
Housing (Transport)7  
Transport and Housing Bureau

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming, JP  
Director of Highways  
Highways Department

Mr Robert CHAN Cheuk-ming, JP  
Principal Government Engineer / Railway  
Development  
Highways Department

Mr Ralph LI Tsz-wai  
Acting Government Engineer / Railway  
Development 1  
Highways Department

**Attendance by  
invitation** :

**Agenda item IV**

MTR Corporation Limited

Mr Adi LAU  
Operations Director

Mr Francis LI  
Chief of Operating – HSR

Mr Lam CHAN  
Deputy General Manager – Projects and Property  
Communications

**Agenda item V**

Dr Jacob KAM  
Managing Director – Operations and Mainland  
Business

Mr James CHOW  
Divisional General Manager – Projects

Mr Neil NG  
Project Manager – SCL Civil – North South Line

Mr Patrick CHENG  
Construction Manager – SCL Civil

Ms Prudence CHAN  
Senior Manager – Projects & Property  
Communications

**Clerk in attendance :** Ms Sophie LAU  
Chief Council Secretary (4)2

**Staff in attendance :** Miss Joyce CHING  
Senior Council Secretary (4)2

Ms Jacqueline LAW  
Council Secretary (4)2

Miss Mandy LAM  
Legislative Assistant (4)2

---

**I. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**

(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)149/18-19(01), CB(4)194/18-19(01),  
CB(4)201/18-19(01), CB(4)210/18-19(01), CB(4)218/18-19(01),  
CB(4)245/18-19(01))

Members noted that above papers had been issued since the last regular meeting of the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") on 29 October 2018.

## Action

### **II. Items for discussion at the next meeting** (LC Paper Nos. CB(4)268/18-19(01) – (02))

2. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next meeting to be held on Friday, 1 February 2019 at 8:30 am:

- (a) Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link ("SCL"); and
- (b) Progress update of upgrade of signalling system for railway lines.

### **III. Matters arising from the meeting on 29 October 2018** (LC Paper Nos. CB(4)209/18-19(01)-(07))

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

## Motions

4. The Chairman said that seven motions on "Service disruption of four MTR lines on 16 October 2018" raised at the meeting on 29 October 2018 were not dealt with at that meeting due to insufficient time. The Chairman informed members that Mr LAU Kwok-fan had withdrawn the motion proposed by him as set out in LC Paper No. CB(4)209/18-19(05). As Mr Michael TIEN, Mr Jeremy TAM and Mr Gary FAN were absent at this juncture, the Chairman directed that the motions proposed by them as set out in LC Paper Nos. CB(4)209/18-19(01), (02) and (04) would not be dealt with at the meeting.

5. The Chairman referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LAM Cheuk-ting –

"現時港鐵事故延誤的罰款機制(服務表現安排)，訂明若事故期間，列車仍維持有限度服務，罰款只會計算受延誤影響最長一班列車的時分，作為罰款基準。

本會認為現行罰款機制未能反映多宗事故的嚴重性，促請政府與港鐵應盡快檢討有關機制安排，例如將整段延誤時分及受影響乘客人數等等加入相關機制作為參考元素。"

Action

(Translation)

"Under the current penalty mechanism for MTR service disruption incidents (i.e. the Service Performance Arrangement), if limited train service is maintained during an incident, only the train journey with the longest service delay will be taken as the basis for calculating the level of fines.

This Subcommittee considers that the existing penalty mechanism fails to reflect the seriousness of the spate of incidents that have occurred, and urges the Government and the MTR Corporation Limited to expeditiously review the arrangements under the mechanism, such as including the entire duration of the service disruption and the number of passengers affected, etc., in the relevant mechanism as reference factors."

6. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman ordered a division. A total of 10 members voted for the motion, no member voted against the motion and one member abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried. The votes of individual members were as follows –

*For:*

|                   |                    |
|-------------------|--------------------|
| Mr YIU Si-wing    | Mr CHU Hoi-dick    |
| Mr LAM Cheuk-ting | Mr SHIU Ka-fai     |
| Ms Tanya CHAN     | Mr LUK Chung-hung  |
| Mr LAU Kwok-fan   | Dr CHENG Chung-tai |
| Mr AU Nok-hin     | Mr Tony TSE        |
| (10 members)      |                    |

*Against:*

(0 member)

*Abstain:*

Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok  
(1 member)

7. The Chairman then referred members to the following motion moved by Mr LAU Kwok-fan and seconded by Mr Wilson OR –

"10月16日港鐵罕有地出現荃灣線、港島線、觀塘線及將軍澳線四條鐵路線故障事件。鑒於當天港鐵只能提供有限度

Action

服務，其他交通工具因未能一時承載數百萬來自港鐵乘客，致上班繁忙時間交通出現嚴重混亂，多條往來市區及新界主要幹道幾乎癱瘓，受影響市民往往動輒三數倍時間前往目的地而怨聲載道，就此，本委員會促請政府：

- 一、 敦促港鐵公司徹查事故並提出有效改善方案，避免同類事件再次發生；
- 二、 檢視現行主要公共交通工具發生故障時的運輸安排，理順目前緊急事故協調中心的調配能力；
- 三、 訂立監察機制，確保港鐵公司落實服務延誤應變措施；
- 四、 提高港鐵列車服務延誤罰則，修改現行計算延誤時間的方法，及補償列車故障車票優惠等，並將服務表現與管理層年度獎金掛鈎。"

(Translation)

"On 16 October (2018), a rare incident occurred when the train services of four MTR lines, i.e. Tsuen Wan, Island, Kwun Tong and Tseung Kwan O Lines, were disrupted. Given that only limited MTR services were available that day and other public transport modes were unable to serve millions of MTR passengers right away, there had been serious traffic chaos during the morning rush hours and a number of major roads connecting the urban areas and the New Territories were almost paralyzed, the passengers affected complained that they had to spend triple or more the normal time to get to their destinations. In this connection, this Subcommittee calls on the Government to:

1. urge the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") to conduct a thorough investigation into the incident and put forward effective improvement proposals to prevent the recurrence of similar incidents;
2. review the existing transport arrangements in the event of a major public transport failure, and enhance the existing coordination capacity of the Emergency Transport Coordination Centre ;

Action

3. introduce a monitoring mechanism to ensure that MTRCL will implement contingency measures during service disruption;

4. raise the level of penalty for MTR train service disruption, revise the current mechanism for calculating the duration of service disruption, and request MTRCL to provide fare concessions as compensation for train failures, and link MTRCL's service performance with the annual incentives given to its senior management."

8. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman ordered a division. A total of eight members voted for the motion, no member voted against the motion and one member abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried. The votes of individual members were as follows –

*For:*

Mr YIU Si-wing  
Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok  
Ms Tanya CHAN  
Mr LAU Kwok-fan  
(8 members)

Mr POON Siu-ping  
Mr SHIU Ka-fai  
Mr LUK Chung-hung  
Dr CHENG Chung-tai

*Against:*

(0 member)

*Abstain:*

Mr Tony TSE  
(1 member)

9. The Chairman then referred members to the following motion moved by Mr AU Nok-hin –

"本會對政府未能妥善協調部門和港鐵應對10月16日信號系統故障事件深表遺憾。

運輸署應檢討緊急事故交通協調中心(ETCC)是否行之有效，公開交代各線"鐵路系統故障時緊急公共交通工具服務行動表"，要求港鐵檢討"善意車費安排"是否恰當足夠，適時向本會交代。"

(Translation)



Action

"This Subcommittee expresses deep regret that the Government has failed to properly coordinate the efforts of the departments concerned and the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") to deal with the incident of signalling system failure that took place on 16 October.

The Transport Department should review whether the Emergency Transport Coordination Centre (ETCC) has been operating effectively, make public the "Action Checklists on Emergency Public Transport Services for Breakdown of MTR" in respect of various railway lines, request MTRCL to review whether "the goodwill arrangement for offering fare concessions" is appropriate and adequate, and report the results to this Subcommittee in due course."

10. The Chairman put the motion to vote. The Chairman ordered a division. A total of 10 members voted for the motion, no member voted against the motion and two members abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried. The votes of individual members were as follows –

*For:*

Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok  
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting  
Ms Tanya CHAN  
Mr LAU Kwok-fan  
Mr AU Nok-hin  
(10 members)

Mr CHU Hoi-dick  
Mr SHIU Ka-fai  
Mr LUK Chung-hung  
Dr CHENG Chung-tai  
Mr Tony TSE

*Against:*

(0 member)

*Abstain:*

Mr YIU Si-wing  
Mr POON Siu-ping  
(2 members)

*(Post-meeting note: The Chinese version of the Administration's response was circulated to members on 21 January 2019 vide LC Paper No. CB(4)441/18-19(01).)*

Action

**IV. Operation of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou – Shenzhen – Hong Kong Express Rail Link**  
(LC Paper Nos. CB(4)268/18-19(03) - (05))

11. At the invitation of the Chairman, Operations Director of MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") briefed members on the operation of the Hong Kong Section ("HKS") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL") with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper No. CB(4)306/18-19(01)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

12. On members' request, the Administration/MTRCL agreed to provide the following information:

- (a) a written response on whether the legal advice from the Department of Justice and/or the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data had been sought regarding the implementation of "List of Dishonest Persons" in Hong Kong and the transferal of passengers' personal data to the Mainland operators of High Speed Rail according to the Personal Information Collection Statement stipulated by MTRCL;
- (b) the ratio of long-haul passengers and short-haul passengers among the average daily patronage of 50 030 for the HKS of the XRL;
- (c) fare revenues for the HKS of the XRL received by MTRCL in total in the month of November 2018; and
- (d) in respect of Annex 1 (Financial Expenditure) to MTRCL's report which was appended to the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)268/18-19(04)]:
  - (i) whether the costs of the HKS of the XRL project would be about \$81 billion, i.e. the sum of cumulative expenditure for the awarded contracts (\$71.4 billion) given in Table 1 and estimated amount of unresolved claims (i.e. difference between amount claimed and interim award for unresolved claims which was about \$9.6 billion) given in Table 2;

Action

- (ii) a breakdown of the amount of cumulative expenditures that exceeded the awarded contract sums by type of reason given in footnote 1, including unfavourable ground conditions, changes in design and so on;
- (iii) whether the number of unresolved claims as at 30 September 2018 set out in Table 2 would further increase or not;
- (iv) further explain the figures, including amount claimed and amount awarded, for claims resolved and unresolved given in Table 2; and
- (v) the time limit for the contractors concerned to submit claims to MTRCL in accordance with the contract terms.

*(Post-meeting note: The Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were circulated to members on 3 June and 29 July 2019 respectively vide LC Paper No. CB(4)965/18-19(01).)*

Motion

13. The Chairman advised that he had received a motion proposed by Mr Michael TIEN. He considered that the proposed motion was directly related to the agenda item under discussion.

14. The Chairman put Mr Michael TIEN's motion to vote –

"港鐵作為高鐵香港段的營運者，需為高鐵收益自負盈虧，港鐵應盡全力增加客流量，吸引更多市民乘坐高鐵，以保持高鐵的合理商業回報，本委員會促請政府，要求港鐵為高鐵乘客提供港鐵轉乘優惠，參考機場快線的轉乘優惠計劃，以便利市民以港鐵接駁至高鐵，從而增加高鐵客流量。"

(Translation)

"The MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL"), as the operator of the Hong Kong section of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL"), should be responsible for the profits and losses with respect to the revenue from XRL. MTRCL should try its utmost to increase passenger flow and to attract more members of the

Action

public to travel by XRL, so as to ensure reasonable commercial returns from XRL. This Subcommittee urges the Government to request MTRCL to provide interchange discounts for XRL passengers by making reference to the interchange discount scheme applicable to Airport Express, with a view to facilitating members of the public to interchange from MTR to XRL, thereby increasing the passenger flow of XRL."

15. The Chairman ordered a division. A total of nine members voted for the motion, no member voted against the motion and no member abstained from voting. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried. The votes of individual members were as follows –

*For:*

Mr Michael TIEN  
Dr Helena WONG  
Mr HO Kai-ming  
Mr LUK Chung-hung  
Mr Tony TSE  
(9 members)

Mr YIU Si-wing  
Mr POON Siu-ping  
Mr LAM Cheuk-ting  
Mr AU Nok-hin

*Against:*

(0 member)

*Abstain:*

(0 member)

*(Post-meeting note: The Chinese version of the Administration's response was circulated to members on 21 January 2019 vide LC Paper No. CB(4)441/18-19(02).)*

**V. Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link (LC Paper Nos. CB(4)268/18-19(06) - (07), CB(4)292/18-19(01))**

16. At the invitation of the Chairman, the Secretary for Transport and Housing ("STH") briefed members on the latest progress of the construction of SCL.

*(Post-meeting note: The speaking note of STH was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)303/18-19 on 7 December 2018.)*

Action

17. At the invitation of the Chairman, Divisional General Manager— Projects and Managing Director – Operations and Mainland Business of MTRCL briefed members on the progress update of the construction of the SCL with the aid of a powerpoint presentation (LC Paper Nos. CB(4) 306/18-19(02) - (03)). The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings at **Annex**).

18. On a member's request, the Administration was requested to provide supplementary information on the cash flow situation of the SCL project, and to advise members whether MTRCL had adequate cash flow to continue with the SCL works.

*(Post meeting note: The Chinese and English versions of the supplementary information were circulated to members vide LC Paper No. CB(4)492/18-19(01) on 30 January and 30 April 2019 respectively.)*

*(At 9:50 am, the Chairman extended the meeting for 15 minutes to 10:45 am.)*

**VI. Any other business**

19. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:48 am.

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
20 September 2019

**Panel on Transport**

**Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways**

**Proceedings of the meeting  
on Friday, 7 December 2018, at 8:30 pm  
in Conference Room 1 of the Legislative Council Complex**

| <b>Time marker</b>   | <b>Speaker</b>  | <b>Subject(s)</b>  | <b>Action required</b>                              |
|--|---|--|---|
| <i>Agenda Item I – Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting</i>  |   |  |   |
| 000654 –<br>000713   | Chairman  | Members noted the information papers issued since the last regular meeting.  |   |
| <i>Agenda Item II – Items for discussion at the next meeting</i>   |   |  |   |
| 000714 –<br>000929   | Chairman<br>Ms Tanya CHAN   | Members agreed on the items for discussion at the next regular meeting.<br><br>Ms CHAN requested the Administration to report regularly or to submit quarterly report to the Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways ("the Subcommittee") on the operation of the Hong Kong Section ("HKS") of the Guangzhou-Shenzhen-Hong Kong Express Rail Link ("XRL").  |   |
| <i>Agenda Item III – Matters arising from the meeting on 29 October 2018</i>   |   |  |   |
| 000930 –<br>001343   | Chairman<br>Mr LAM Cheuk-ting<br>Mr LAU Kwok-fan<br>Mr AU Nok-hin | Voting on motions relating to the service disruption of four MTR lines on 16 October 2018 raised at the meeting on 29 October 2018 which were not voted on at that meeting due to insufficient time.   |   |
| <i>Agenda Item IV – Operation of the Hong Kong Section of the Guangzhou – Shenzhen – Hong Kong Express Rail Link</i> |   |  |   |
| 001344 –<br>001904   | Chairman<br>Administration  | Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper No. CB(4)268/18-19(03)].  |   |
| 001905 –<br>002226   | Chairman<br>MTRCL   | Briefing by MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") with the aid of a powerpoint presentation [LC Paper No. CB(4)306/18-19(01)].   |   |
| 002227 –<br>002648   | Chairman<br>Ms Tanya CHAN<br>Administration<br>MTRCL              | Ms CHAN was deeply concerned that pursuant to the Personal Information Collection Statement stipulated by MTRCL, passengers' personal data might be transferred outside Hong Kong to High Speed Rail's Mainland railway operators and other third party service providers.<br><br>At Ms CHAN's request, the Administration/MTRCL undertook to provide a written response on whether legal advice from the Department of Justice and/or the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data had been | Admin/ MTRCL (paragraph 12 of the minutes referred) |

| Time marker     | Speaker  | Subject(s)   | Action required |
|-----------------|--|--|-----------------|
|                 |  | <p>sought regarding the implementation of "List of Dishonest Persons" in Hong Kong and the transferal of passengers' personal data to the Mainland operators of High Speed Rail according to the above-said Personal Information Collection Statement.</p>   |                 |
| 002649 – 003117 | <p>Chairman<br/>Mr LAU Kwok-fan<br/>Administration</p>             | <p>Noting that upon the commissioning of the HKS of the XRL, the average daily patronage of the Intercity Through Train ("ITT") was 7 000, representing a year-on-year decrease of 28%. Mr LAU asked if the Administration would consider decreasing the train frequency of ITT while increasing that of the East Rail Line ("ERL"), with a view to enhancing the carrying capacity of the latter.</p> <p>The Administration pointed out that the travel patterns of passengers had been changing since the commissioning of the HKS of the XRL. It would closely monitor the patronage of ITT and ERL and consider whether the service for ITT should be adjusted in future.</p> <p>Mr LAU called on the Administration to arrange additional direct XRL train services to certain Mainland destinations including Shantou and Hunan. The Administration responded that it had been exploring with the Mainland authorities to provide direct train services to more Mainland cities.</p> |                 |
| 003118 – 003545 | <p>Chairman<br/>Ir Dr LO Wai-kwok<br/>Administration<br/>MTRCL</p> | <p>Ir Dr LO enquired if there were sufficient public parking spaces available in the West Kowloon Station ("WKS") to meet the passenger need. MTRCL advised that there were about 500 parking spaces in WKS which were adequate to meet the demand of passengers taking private vehicles to WKS during peak periods such as the National Day Golden Week.</p> <p>In response to Ir Dr LO's enquiry about the provision of sleeper high speed train service to long-haul destinations, the Administration responded that the provision of sleeper train service would be subject to the maintenance works of the XRL network, which could be carried out by the railway operators at night time only. The Administration would continue to explore with the Mainland authorities for the provision of sleeper train service running between WKS and long-haul</p>   |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker   | Subject(s)   | Action required |
|-----------------|---|--|-----------------|
|                 |   | <p>destinations.</p> <p>Ir Dr LO expressed his views on the holistic assessment strategy for Hung Hom Station Extension as he would not be available to join the discussion on the agenda item of SCL project. He considered that the sampling method for selecting the opening-up locations and the proposed method to carry out the opening-up works was scientific. In considering the sampling size, a proper balance had to be struck between the overall structural safety of the platform slabs and the test results. In his view, it was also appropriate to conduct a load test to ascertain the structural integrity of the platform slabs in question.</p>  |                 |
| 003546 – 004014 | Chairman<br>Mr LAM Cheuk-ting<br>Administration | <p>Mr LAM was of the view that ERL had been overloaded and given that the population in the northeast New Territories would be substantially increased by 2030, he asked what measures would be implemented by the Administration to alleviate the traffic pressure on the road networks between the New Territories and the urban areas.</p> <p>The Administration responded that apart from the widening works at Tai Po Road (Shatin Section), the study on the implementation of Trunk Road T4 was also underway. The Administration believed that the above two projects could alleviate traffic congestion in the North District and the New Territories East.</p>   |                 |
| 004015 – 004445 | Chairman<br>Mr AU Nok-hin<br>Administration     | <p>Mr AU expressed his dissatisfaction on the implementation of "List of Dishonest Persons" and considered that the Administration should provide an appeal mechanism for Hong Kong citizen whose name was put on the list to lodge an appeal.</p> <p>In response to Mr AU's enquiry, the Administration advised that the Mainland had promulgated a notice on restricting seriously dishonest persons from taking trains and civil aircraft in accordance with the relevant policy and regulations, and had made public the list of dishonest persons on the Internet. Therefore, there was no question of being not open and transparent in implementing the "List of Dishonest Persons". The Administration added that the HKS of the XRL was a cross-boundary railway and that would be irresponsible for the Hong Kong railway operator to sell tickets to persons who were restricted from</p> |                 |



| Time marker     | Speaker  | Subject(s)  | Action required                                 |
|-----------------|--|---|---|
|                 |  | <p>taking trains by the Mainland authorities.</p> <p>On Mr AU's enquiry about the financial position of the HKS of the XRL, the Administration advised that the patronage had been increasing progressively since the HKS of the XRL commenced operation. Overall, the financial position of the HKS of the XRL after its commissioning had been satisfactory.</p>  |   |
| 004446–004943   | Chairman<br>Mr CHU Hoi-dick<br>Administration                  | <p>Mr CHU enquired about:</p> <p>(a) the ratio of long-haul passengers and short-haul passengers among the average daily patronage of 50 030 for the HKS of the XRL;</p> <p>(b) fare revenues for the HKS of the XRL received by MTRCL in total in the month of November 2018; and</p> <p>(c) whether the number of unresolved claims as at 30 September 2018 set out in Table 2 of Annex 1 (Financial Expenditure) to MTRCL's report which was appended to the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(4)268/18-19(04)] would further increase or not.</p> <p>The Administration undertook to provide the above information after the meeting.</p>   | Admin<br>(paragraph 12 of the minutes referred) |
| 004944 – 005402 | Deputy Chairman<br>Mr POON Siu-ping<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>Mr POON enquired about the circumstances under which the Administration would consider adjusting the service for ITT. The Administration responded that subject to the patronage of ITT and the passenger demand on cross-boundary transport, it would consider adjusting the service of ITT as and when appropriate.</p> <p>In response to Mr POON's enquiry regarding deployment of staff and the monitoring mechanism on the recruitment of staff by MTRCL's service contractors, MTRCL advised that:</p> <p>(a) there had been some public holidays in both Hong Kong and the Mainland during the early stage of commissioning of HKS of XRL. In view of the expected high patronage, MTRCL had deployed additional staff in WKS from other railway lines to</p> |   |

| Time marker     | Speaker  | Subject(s)  | Action required |
|-----------------|--|---|-----------------|
|                 |  | <p>ensure smooth operation of the HKS of the XRL. The staff concerned had already returned to their original positions; and</p> <p>(b) the service contractors had to abide by the standards and requirements set by MTRCL in providing relevant services; MTRCL would monitor the performance of its service contractors and would take immediate actions against the non-performing service contractors.</p>  |                 |
| 005403 – 005852 | Chairman<br>Dr CHENG<br>Chung-tai<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>Dr CHENG was concerned that the percentage of Hong Kong residents among the inbound and outbound passengers of XRL was only about 30%, which was much lower than the earlier forecast made by the Administration in 2009.</p> <p>The Administration explained that XRL was a brand new cross-boundary transport mode for Hong Kong. Hong Kong residents might need time to adapt to this new means of travelling. Noting that MTRCL had been collaborating with the travel industry to promote travelling by XRL, the Administration trusted that the ratio of Hong Kong residents among the passengers of XRL would increase progressively with increasing number of Hong Kong residents enjoying the convenient services of XRL. MTRCL added that the number of tour groups using XRL had been increasing significantly. XRL was expected to receive more than 300 tour groups from mid-November 2018 to the coming Christmas holidays. MTRCL would continue to actively promote XRL to the public.</p> <p>As regards Dr CHENG's enquiry about the operating margin of the XRL project, the Administration responded that since the HKS of the XRL had commenced operation for just two months, the Administration would report the financial position of the HKS of the XRL to the Subcommittee at an appropriate time.</p> |                 |
| 005853 – 010437 | Chairman<br>Mr LUK Chung-hung<br>Administration              | Mr LUK expressed his dissatisfaction over the XRL fare structure, the provision of train service information on the High Speed Rail App and the ticket purchase and collection arrangements for Hong Kong passengers.   |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker   | Subject(s)   | Action required |
|-----------------|---|--|-----------------|
|                 |   | <p>The Administration responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the Mainland railway operator would announce the "published fares" and "implemented fares" of the high-speed train routes according to its current practice. Taking time-varying patronage situation and demand for seats of different classes into account, the Mainland railway operator would offer certain discounts to the "published fares" and the discounted fares were referred to as the "implemented fares";</li> <li>(b) it had been pressing ahead the enhancement of the Mainland ticketing system with CR so that passengers from Hong Kong might register an account and purchase tickets at the Mainland ticketing website using an e-mail and collect tickets using self-service Mainland ticketing machines; and</li> <li>(c) it would work in tandem with MTRCL to roll out more facilitation arrangements such as introducing e-tickets and online purchase of Mainland journey tickets to cater for the needs of different passenger groups.</li> </ul> |                 |
| 010438 – 010855 | Chairman<br>Mr YIU Si-wing<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>Mr YIU declared that the company he worked for was one of the designated ticket agents for the HKS of the XRL. He enquired whether MTRCL would consider:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) simplifying the ticket purchase and collection procedures for passengers travelling on XRL trains running between WKS and destinations in Shenzhen and obviating these passengers the need to purchase train tickets in advance;</li> <li>(b) offering further fare concessions during non-peak periods or low seasons to (i) Hong Kong residents so as to attract them to experience the XRL services and (ii) passengers of train trips running between WKS and Guangzhou South and Shenzhen North stations.</li> </ul> <p>MTRCL responded that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) it would step up its publicity and promotional efforts to enhance the understanding of the</li> </ul>   |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker  | Subject(s)  | Action required                                 |
|-----------------|--|---|---|
|                 |  | <p>community on the ticketing arrangement for short-haul trains; and</p> <p>(b) it would consider the suggestion of offering further fare discount to Hong Kong residents and would continue its discussion with CR on concessionary fares.</p>   |   |
| 010856 – 011406 | Chairman<br>Mr CHAN Han-pan<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>Mr CHAN raised a number of suggestions on improving the services of the XRL, including enhancement of the Mainland ticketing website (i.e. www.12306.cn) and the High Speed Rail App so as to facilitate the online purchase and collection of tickets by Hong Kong passengers, relaxation of baggage restrictions, enhancement of train service to Fuzhou and improvement of the waiting arrangement before boarding the train.</p> <p>The Administration reiterated that both the Administration and CR were in support of online purchase of Mainland journey tickets by Hong Kong passengers and were working to overcome the policy and technical challenges. MTRCL further advised that noting the public concern regarding the restrictions on baggage, it had been discussing with CR in this regard. MTRCL would consider the suggestions raised by Mr CHAN as appropriate.</p> |   |
| 011407 – 011830 | Chairman<br>Mr Tony TSE<br>Administration              | <p>Mr TSE suggested that the ticket collection arrangement should be simplified and that additional ticket collection points should be provided.</p> <p>With reference to Annex 1 (Financial Expenditure) to MTRCL's report which was appended to the Administration's paper, Mr TSE sought the following information:</p> <p>(a) a breakdown of the amount of cumulative expenditures that exceeded the awarded contract sums by type of reason given in footnote 1, including unfavourable ground conditions, changes in design and so on;</p> <p>(b) further explain the figures, including amount claimed and amount awarded, for claims resolved and unresolved given in Table 2; and</p>  | Admin<br>(paragraph 12 of the minutes referred) |

| Time marker  | Speaker   | Subject(s)  | Action required |
|--|---|---|-----------------|
|  |   | <p>(c) the time limit for the contractors concerned to submit claims to MTRCL in accordance with the contract terms.</p> <p>The Administration undertook to provide the information after the meeting.</p>  |                 |
| 011831 – 012240  | Chairman<br>Mr Michael TIEN<br>MTRCL            | <p>Mr TIEN urged the Administration and MTRCL to provide interchange discounts for XRL passengers with a view to boosting the patronage of the XRL.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that the patronage of the XRL had been increasing progressively since its commencement of operation in September 2018. Nevertheless, it should consider providing different types of fare concessions as and when appropriate.</p>   |                 |
| 012241 – 012347  | Chairman<br>Mr Michael TIEN<br>Administration   | Voting on motion proposed by Mr TIEN.   |                 |
| <i>Agenda Item V – Progress update of the construction of the Shatin to Central Link</i> |   |   |                 |
| 012348 – 012509  | Chairman  | Extension of meeting by 15 minutes.   |                 |
| 012510 – 013112  | Chairman<br>Mr LAM Cheuk-ting<br>Administration | Briefing by the Administration [LC Paper Nos. CB(4)268/18-19(06) and CB(4)292/18-19(01)].   |                 |
| 013113 – 014106  | Chairman<br>MTRCL                               | Briefing by MTRCL with the aid of powerpoint presentation [LC Paper Nos. CB(4)306/18-19(02) and (03)].  |                 |
| 014107– 014340   | Chairman<br>Ms Claudia MO<br>Administration     | <p>Ms MO considered that the sampling size of 168 couplers (i.e. less than 1% of the total number of couplers used in the connection of the diaphragm walls and the platform slabs at the Hung Hom Station Extension) as proposed in the holistic assessment strategy was too small.</p> <p>In response to Ms MO's suggestion of increasing the sampling size to around 3% of the total number of couplers used, the Administration advised that in selecting the locations of the opening up, the Administration had invited an expert team from the University of Hong Kong to conduct random sampling. The opening-up locations would be randomly selected based on a scientific and statistical approach. It would consider a greater</p> |                 |

| Time marker        | Speaker  | Subject(s)   | Action required |
|--------------------|--|--|-----------------|
|                    |  | sampling size and identify any follow-up actions required subject to the investigation findings and needs.   |                 |
| 014341 –<br>014624 | Chairman<br>Deputy Chairman<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>The Deputy Chairman enquired about the completion timeframe of the feasibility study on the partial commissioning of some stations and sections of the Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section.</p> <p>The Administration advised that the partial commissioning options should take into account the technical feasibility to partially commissioning the railway section, the capacity of the railway system, the modification to the signalling system, the compatibility of the road transport, etc. MTRCL added that it would consider all possible options in respect of the partial commissioning of Tuen Ma Line under SCL and, in considering the options, would accord priority to practicability and railway operational safety.</p>   |                 |
| 014625 –<br>014939 | Chairman<br>Mr Michael TIEN<br>MTRCL                   | <p>Mr TIEN elaborated on his motions about increasing the sampling size of the opening up locations at Hung Hom Station Extension and the partial commissioning of the Tuen Ma Line of SCL from Tai Wai up to Diamond Hill Station.</p> <p>MTRCL confirmed that the open-up locations would cover both the top and bottom steel reinforcement layers of the EWL slab. MTRCL was concerned that the integrity and overall structure of the station structure might be affected if the sampling size was too large. In response to Mr TIEN’s suggestion of running single track bi-directional operations train service between Diamond Hill and Ho Man Tin stations, MTRCL explained that there were technical and operational difficulties to be considered and addressed. Nevertheless, MTRCL reiterated that it would consider all possible options in respect of the partial commissioning of Tuen Ma Line under SCL.</p> |                 |
| 014940 –<br>015236 | Chairman<br>Mr LAM Cheuk-ting<br>Administration        | Mr LAM considered MTRCL not an appropriate body to steer the investigation and testing works proposed under the three-stage holistic assessment strategy, in particular the structural analysis on the works of the Hung Hom Station Extension as proposed in the third stage. In his view, the analysis should be conducted by an independent third-party expert. He urged the Administration   |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker  | Subject(s)  | Action required |
|-----------------|--|---|-----------------|
|                 |  | <p>to ensure that MTRCL would not be able to interfere the analysis results.</p> <p>The Administration replied that the relevant government departments would carry out stringent checking throughout the process to ensure the reliability of the results. In particular, the MTRCL would submit the record drawings to the Buildings Department for vetting.</p>  |                 |
| 015237 – 015532 | Chairman<br>Mr AU Nok-hin<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>Mr AU was deeply concerned about the structural safety of other stations under SCL, since they were located on government land or unleased land and were exempted from the provisions of the Buildings Ordinance (Cap. 123). Given the wide public concern on the structural safety of the Hung Hom Station Extension, he was of the view that the Administration should adopt a more stringent approach in carrying out the opening-up works, including increasing the number of opening-up locations.</p> <p>The Administration responded that representatives from the Buildings Department and the Highways Department would monitor the whole opening-up process. MTRCL took the view that the random sampling method currently adopted was objective, scientific and commonly used in statistical studies.</p> |                 |
| 015533 – 015806 | Chairman<br>Mr YIU Si-wing<br>MTRCL                  | <p>Mr YIU raised concern about the delay in the construction of the Exhibition Centre Station and its possible impact on the target commissioning date of the Hung Hom to Admiralty Section.</p> <p>MTRCL advised that given the discovery of wartime unexploded ordnances at the works sites in Wan Chai North and the settlement issues leading to a temporary suspension of excavation works at the Exhibition Centre Station, the work progress of the Hung Hom to Admiralty Section had been affected. MTRCL had been proactively exploring measures to recover the progress so as to minimize the risks on construction delay, while the opening of Hung Hom to Admiralty Section will also be dependent on the opening of Tuen Ma Line.</p>  |                 |
| 015807 – 020103 | Chairman<br>Mr LAU Kwok-fan<br>MTRCL                 | Mr LAU enquired about the details of the scheme proposed by MTRCL in providing financial assistance to the affected residents of building units in the vicinity of To Kwa Wan Station for   |                 |

| Time marker     | Speaker   | Subject(s)   | Action required                                 |
|-----------------|---|--|---|
|                 |   | <p>carrying out repair works in their units. MTRCL responded that apart from a formal compensation mechanism already in place, the community care programme was to provide financial support to those residents in To Kwa Wan in carrying out repair works. Details would be announced shortly and the scheme would be launched in January 2019. A professional surveyor consultant was appointed to administer and manage the execution of the scheme.</p> <p>Mr LAU's concern and MTRCL's response regarding the replacement of 12-car trains with 9-car trains on the East Rail Line.</p> |   |
| 020104 – 020355 | Chairman<br>Mr CHAN Han-pan<br>Administration           | On Mr CHAN's request, the Administration agreed to provide supplementary information on the cash flow situation of the SCL project, and to advise members whether MTRCL had sufficient cash flow to continue with the SCL works.   | Admin<br>(paragraph 18 of the minutes referred) |
| 020356 – 020642 | Chairman<br>Mr POON Siu-ping<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | <p>Mr POON's enquiry and the Administration's response regarding the completion timeframe of the feasibility study on the partial commissioning of SCL.</p> <p>In response to Mr POON's enquiry about the retrofitting of Automatic Platform Gates along the East Rail Line, MTRCL advised that the retrofitting works would be commenced after the replacement of 12-car trains with 9-car trains on the East Rail Line, and would take around one year to complete.</p>  |   |
| 020643 – 020923 | Chairman<br>Dr Helena WONG<br>Administration<br>MTRCL   | <p>Dr WONG was concerned about the overall structural integrity of the works at To Kwa Wan Station.</p> <p>Dr WONG's enquiry and the Administration and MTRCL's response regarding the number of locations to be opened up at Hung Hom Station Extension. MTRCL further explained the non-destructive test and reiterated that it was important to ensure that the integrity and the overall structural safety of the station structure would not be compromised by the verification exercise.</p>   |   |
| 020924 – 021205 | Chairman<br>Mr Gary FAN<br>Administration               | Mr FAN expressed deep concern on the opening-up strategy. His enquiry and the Administration's response as to whether the  |   |



| Time marker        | Speaker  | Subject(s)   | Action required |
|--------------------|--|--|-----------------|
|                    |  | Administration and MTRCL would consider revising the sampling method of opening-up locations to increase the sampling size.  |                 |
| 021206–<br>021506  | Chairman<br>Mr Alvin YEUNG<br>Administration                 | Mr YEUNG urged the Administration and MTRCL to complete as soon as practicable the feasibility study on the option of partial opening of some stations and sections of the Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section. He considered that the Administration should set a deadline for MTRCL to submit its proposal in this regard.<br><br>The Administration reiterated its considerations in assessing the partial commissioning options.   |                 |
| 021507 –<br>021742 | Chairman<br>Mr Jeremy TAM<br>MTRCL                           | Mr TAM asked about the follow-up actions to be taken by MTRCL in the event that all 168 steel bars or couplers exposed for inspection were found not properly connected.<br><br>MTRCL responded that the staged assessment was carefully planned using a scientific statistical sampling method in order to achieve comprehensive verification. According to the holistic assessment strategy, MTRCL would consolidate test results found in the first two stages and proceed to the third stage as soon as possible to conduct a detailed structural analysis on the works for the Hung Hom Station Extension so as to ascertain if the overall condition of the works was acceptable and determine if it was necessary to conduct strengthening works. |                 |
| 021743 –<br>022015 | Chairman<br>Dr CHENG<br>Chung-tai<br>Administration<br>MTRCL | Dr CHENG followed up on Mr Jeremy TAM's enquiry about the follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration and MTRCL in response to different test results.<br><br>The Administration advised that strengthening works might be considered in case the test results of the second stage of the holistic assessment were found unsatisfactory. MTRCL supplemented that appropriate measures including modification or strengthening works would be considered if necessary.  |                 |
| 022016 –<br>022129 | Chairman<br>Mr Gary FAN                                      | Due to insufficient time, the Chairman decided that motions proposed by members in respect of the construction of SCL would be voted on at the next meeting.   |                 |

| <b>Time marker</b>                        | <b>Speaker</b> | <b>Subject(s)</b> | <b>Action required</b> |
|---|----------------|-------------------|------------------------|
| <i>Agenda Item VI –Any other business</i> |                |                   |                        |
| 022130 –<br>022139                        | Chairman       | Closing remarks   |                        |

Council Business Division 4  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
20 September 2019