THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE

in response to the

REPORT OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE No. 72A

of December 2019

22 April 2020

THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE IN RESPONSE TO THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE REPORT NO. 72A DATED DECEMBER 2019

REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 72)

Chapter 1 – Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces

The Government generally accepts the views and recommendations made by the Audit Commission (Audit) and the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) on the planning, provision and management of public parking spaces.

2. The Government has been taking appropriate follow-up actions on PAC's various recommendations proactively with a view to improving the planning, provision and management of public parking spaces. The progress made is reported below.

Policy on provision of parking spaces

3. The Government adopts a transport policy based on public transport with railways as backbone. The Government's current policy on the provision of parking spaces is to accord priority to considering and meeting the parking demand of commercial vehicles, and to provide an appropriate number of private car parking spaces if the overall development permits, but at the same time not to attract passengers to opt for private cars in lieu of public transport, so as to avoid aggravating the road traffic situation.

4. Given the hard fact that land resources are limited in Hong Kong, coupled with the need to address competing demands for land for community and economic development, objectively speaking, it is neither reasonable nor practicable for the Government to increase car parking spaces continuously to catch up with the growth rate of the vehicle fleet. To alleviate road traffic congestion in Hong Kong, the Government will continue to take forward progressively the multipronged measures recommended earlier by the Transport Advisory Committee, including but not limited to measures that address the issues of illegal parking and inadequate parking spaces.

Planning and provision of public parking spaces

5. In taking forward measures that increase the provision of parking spaces, the Transport and Housing Bureau (THB) promulgated to relevant bureaux/departments a host of short- and medium- to long-term measures in October 2018. THB and the Transport Department (TD) also briefed the Legislative Council (LegCo) Panel on Transport on the latest position of the various measures at its meeting on 17 May 2019.

6. As indicated in the 2019 Policy Address Supplement, the Government will continue to provide public parking spaces in suitable Government, Institution or Community facilities and public open space (POS) projects in line with the "single site, multiple uses" principle. To facilitate the provision of public parking spaces in new government facilities, government departments responsible for such projects are required to consult TD on the provision of public parking spaces during the early stage of project planning. In addition, TD plans to promulgate new internal guidelines in Q2 2020 on the principles and requirements for the planning and provision of public parking spaces in new development and redevelopment proposals.

7. In response to public aspirations, TD is also reviewing the respective standards on parking spaces and loading/unloading bays for commercial vehicles as well as the standards on parking spaces for private cars stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) with a view to updating the requirements and thereby increasing the number of private parking spaces in future housing developments. We anticipate that the revised parking standards will be promulgated within 2020. Prior to the promulgation of the revised parking standards, as an interim arrangement, TD will continue to require developers to provide parking spaces at the higher end of the current parking standards in HKPSG for new developments as far as practicable.

8. At the same time, TD will continue to pursue short-term measures to increase the provision of parking spaces, including but not limited to -

- (a) designating suitable on-street locations as night-time parking spaces;
- (b) encouraging schools to allow school buses to park within school premises after school hours;

- (c) advising the Lands Department (LandsD) of a minimum number of specific types of parking spaces to be specified in tenancy agreements of suitable short-term tenancy (STT) car parks where appropriate; and
- (d) where justified, liaising with LandsD to identify suitable reprovisioning sites (if any) for STT car parks that will be terminated for implementation of planned permanent developments, taking into account the parking demand and other competing land uses in the area.

Management of government multi-storey car parks

9. TD will continue to review the parking fees of the 11 government multi-storey car parks under its purview regularly, taking into account the utilisation rates of the car parks and the market situation. TD completed the latest round of the parking fee review in March 2020 and is examining the review results.

10. For the sale arrangements of monthly/quarterly parking tickets in these car parks, TD will continue to review the arrangements at six-month intervals, taking into consideration a host of factors including users' opinions. For seven government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview where monthly parking tickets are sold on a first-come-first-served basis, the car park contractors completed a questionnaire survey in August 2019 on car park users' opinions on the sale arrangements of parking tickets. The results of the survey showed that the majority of users of the car parks did not support the use of balloting for the sale of parking tickets. In respect of the remaining four government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview where parking tickets are sold by balloting, TD will incorporate provisions into new contracts for management and maintenance, requiring prospective car park contractors to begin accepting and processing applications for parking tickets through electronic means from 1 May 2020 onwards in addition to written applications so as to provide more convenience to prospective car park users.

11. TD has all along closely monitored the performance of the car park contractors in the day-to-day management and operation of the 11 government multi-storey car parks under its purview. In response to the Audit's recommendation, TD has requested the contractors to submit monthly reports from February 2019 on their handling of abandoned vehicles occupying parking spaces with a view to enhancing TD's monitoring of the contractors' arrangement in this respect. In order to speed up the handling of abandoned vehicles, TD has enhanced the procedures whereby the contractors can act in accordance with the "Conditions of Parking and Use" displayed at the car parks concerned. When an abandoned vehicle is found, the contractor will send a letter to the address registered by the car owner concerned by registered mail, asking him/her to settle the parking fees payable and remove his/her vehicle from the space it has been occupying, so as to vacate the parking space for public use as soon as possible.

12. In response to the recommendation of Audit and PAC, TD completed a review on the use of the rooftop of Kwai Fong Car Park in December 2019 and has released 54 private car parking spaces therein for public use since 1 January 2020, while maintaining 21 parking spaces for the Temporary Vehicle Detention Centre.

13. In respect of the facilities of government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview, TD completed the replacement of all car park management systems in September 2019 so as to enhance system reliability and service quality, save for the Yau Ma Tei Car Park which has been scheduled for demolition in 2020. Furthermore, to enhance security, TD completed in collaboration with the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) and the Police a review on the provision of closed-circuit television (CCTV) systems in the government car parks under TD's purview. In this connection, EMSD will conduct a tender exercise, among other things, for the installation of additional CCTVs in the car parks concerned as needed in Q2 2020. It is anticipated that the installation works will be completed by Q1 2021.

Management of on-street parking spaces

14. On-street parking facilities are provided to cater for motorists' shortterm parking needs where local traffic conditions permit (i.e. where traffic flow, road safety and the loading/unloading activities of other road users are not affected). In areas with a high parking demand, parking meters are installed at on-street parking spaces for traffic management purposes (i.e. to encourage a greater turnover of vehicles). Motorists are encouraged to make use of off-street parking facilities for longer-term parking.

15. All along, TD has been closely monitoring the utilisation of around 18 000 metered parking spaces and about 17 000 non-metered parking spaces.

16. TD has completed a review of "longest parking period" for each transaction of parking meters. Taking into account the utilisation rates, it was proposed that the "longest parking period" for each transaction of about 290 metered parking spaces should be adjusted downwards to 30 minutes in order to encourage turnover. In this regard, TD commenced consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the concerned metered parking spaces are located on the proposed adjustment in Q1 2020, and would take forward the adjustment progressively after duly evaluating the views gauged.

17. TD has also completed a review of parking fees for parking meters charging the low rate of \$2 per 30 minutes. Based on the assessment that an adjustment of the charging rate of about 1 600 metered parking spaces from the low rate to \$2 per 15 minutes would encourage turnover in view of their high utilisation rates beyond 85%, TD commenced consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the concerned metered parking spaces are located on the proposed adjustment in Q1 2020, and would take forward the adjustment progressively after duly considering the views gauged.

18. In addition, TD has arranged to conduct regular surveys to identify any unlawful occupation of non-metered parking spaces by abandoned vehicles or other objects. The surveys, to be conducted on a half-yearly basis, commenced in December 2019. Should any unlawful occupation of non-metered parking spaces be identified, TD will promptly refer the cases to relevant government departments for follow-up actions as appropriate.

19. TD has engaged a contractor for the procurement, management, operation and maintenance of a new generation of parking meters. The system development of the new generation of parking meters has been completed, and acceptance tests of the system are in progress. According to the latest programme, TD will commence the installation of about 12 000 new generation parking meters by phases from mid-2020 onwards for completion in about two years' time. The Secretary for Transport and Housing introduced the relevant Bill into LegCo on 27 November 2019, which serves to provide a legal basis for the new features and functions of the new parking meters and associated matters. The new parking meters can support payment of parking fees through multiple payment means, including remote payment through mobile application. The new parking meters are also equipped with sensors to detect whether individual parking spaces are occupied so that real-time information on on-street parking space vacancy could be made

available to assist motorists in finding vacant parking spaces, thereby reducing the need for motorists to circulate on roads looking for parking spaces.

Implementation of parking-related technology initiatives

20. TD has been disseminating information of public car parks in the public domain since 2013. With the launch of the "HKeMobility" mobile application in July 2018, TD now makes use of this all-in-one platform to facilitate one-stop search on walking, driving and public transport routes, as well as to disseminate real-time traffic information to members of the public. As at end January 2020, TD disseminated via "HKeMobility" parking vacancy information of 345 public car parks involving a total of about 55 960 parking spaces.

21. As far as government public car parks are concerned, TD has since 2015 met with relevant departments on a number of occasions to explain the procedures for updating the parking vacancy information and to encourage the departments to include relevant clauses in their new agreements with car park operators, specifying the requirement to provide parking vacancy information. In this connection, the Government Property Agency, Housing Department, and Leisure and Cultural Services Department have taken steps to incorporate new requirements into their new contracts for car park management, requesting car park contractors to disseminate parking vacancy information. With the progressive renewal of car park management contracts, it is expected that the parking vacancy information of suitable government car parks could be fully disseminated in three to four years.

22. For non-government public car parks, TD will continue to liaise with and introduce practical technology solutions to car park operators to facilitate their adoption of suitable options to collect and disseminate parking vacancy information and data.

23. The Environmental Protection Department (EPD) acknowledged PAC's comments regarding "Implementation of parking-related technology initiatives". EPD is taking suitable follow-up actions to implement Audit's relevant recommendations, installing over 1 000 additional public chargers by 2022 and co-operating with TD on the provision of information regarding real-time availability of electric vehicle (EV) chargers in the government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview.

24. TD will continue to co-operate with the Environment Bureau and EPD in implementing the new policy and initiatives for EVs, including installing more EV chargers in the government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview as far as practicable, and examining measures to discourage non-EV drivers to use parking spaces equipped with EV chargers.

25. To provide more parking spaces and to increase spatial efficiency, TD is actively studying pilot projects for automated parking systems (APS) to ascertain the feasibility and applicability of APS in Hong Kong. Compared with conventional car parks, the APS car parks will be able to provide 30% to 100% more parking spaces within the same footprint. The relevant consultancy study is expected to be completed in April 2020.

26. TD is taking forward six APS pilot projects to acquire and consolidate experience in building, operating and managing different types of APS and the associated financial arrangements. This will pave the way for the wider application of APS in government and privately operated public car parks in the future. TD has so far identified four sites for launching APS pilot projects, including an STT site in Tsuen Wan, a POS site at the junction of Yen Chow Street and Tung Chau Street in Sham Shui Po, and two proposed government building sites at Chung Kong Road in Sheung Wan and Sheung Mau Street in Chai Wan. In connection with the STT site in Tsuen Wan, TD has already secured support from the Tsuen Wan District Council, and will carry on with the preparatory work for tender invitation. As regards the pilot project in Sham Shui Po, TD is currently assessing the technical feasibility after securing support from the Sham Shui Po District Council. For the proposed APS projects in Sheung Wan and Chai Wan, TD will consult the relevant District Councils in due course.

Conclusion and recommendations

27. The progress made on actions taken by the Government, in the light Encl. of the recommendations of the Audit and the PAC, is set out in Enclosure.

- 7 -

Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces Progress in implementing the Audit's and PAC's Recommendations

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date	
Part 2: Plan	Part 2: Planning and provision of public parking spaces		
Demand and	l supply of parking spaces		
Para. 2.17(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should closely monitor the parking space ratio for private cars and take appropriate measures to address the issue of decreasing ratio where necessary.	TD will continue to closely monitor the parking space ratio for private cars. TD is actively pursuing short- and medium- to long-term measures to increase parking provision, which include providing public parking spaces in suitable Government, Institution or Community (G/IC) facilities and public	
Para. 110 (Page 52, 1st bullet, item (b)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges the Transport Department (TD) to closely monitor the parking space ratio for private cars and take appropriate measures to increase the supply of parking spaces in accordance with the growth in number of private cars to meet the widening shortfall.	open space (POS) projects in line with the "single site, multiple uses" principle and revising the parking standards in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG) to update the requirements for provision of private parking spaces.	
Planning an	d provision of long-term public parkir	ig spaces	
Para. 2.17(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should review the planning standards of parking spaces for private cars in the housing developments promulgated in the HKPSG.	TD commissioned in August 2018 a review on the parking standards in HKPSG, covering the planning standards of parking spaces for private cars in housing developments. TD targets to promulgate the revised parking standards under HKPSG within 2020 after stakeholder consultation with a view to increasing the future provision of private parking spaces in housing developments where possible.	
Para. 2.17(c) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should consider issuing internal guidelines for establishing the requirements for public parking spaces in new development and redevelopment proposals.	TD is drawing up internal guidelines to set out the principles and requirements for the planning and provision of public parking spaces in new development and redevelopment proposals. The internal guidelines are scheduled for issuance in Q2 2020.	

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 110 (Page 53 (g)) of the PAC report	PAC strongly urges TD to issue internal guidelines for establishing the requirements for public parking spaces in new development and redevelopment proposals.	
Para. 2.17(d) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should, in consultation with the Sai Kung District Council, endeavour to work out a reprovisioning plan for the short-term tenancy (STT) car park in Tseung Kwan O Area 66 (see Case 1).	The Tseung Kwan O Area 66 project is currently under planning and the impact assessment study on various technical aspects will be carried out by relevant government departments. Subject to the outcome of the study, TD will work out relevant details within 2020 and then gauge the views of the Sai Kung District Council.
Para. 2.17(e) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should, drawing lessons from Case 1, critically review the demand for parking spaces in planning the reprovisioning of car parks in future.	TD will take into account the experience gained from Case 1 and critically review the demand for parking spaces in planning the reprovisioning of car parks. In line with the principle of "single site, multiple uses", TD would work closely with the project proponents at the early stage of long-term developments to explore the feasibility of in-situ reprovisioning of parking spaces as part of the development. This will be taken as an on-going task for future reprovisioning projects.
Para. 2.17(f) of the Audit Report Para. 110 (Page 53,	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should ascertain the reasons for the under-utilisation of light goods vehicle (LGV) parking spaces in Case 2 and draw lessons to improve the planning and provision of public car parks in private developments. PAC strongly urges TD to step up its efforts in monitoring the utilisation	TD has been monitoring the utilisation of the subject car park by site surveys conducted in August 2017 and April 2019. In addition, through surveys of illegal parking situation in the vicinity of the subject car park, TD is keeping track of the local parking demand of LGV to ascertain that the provision of LGV parking spaces is generally in line with the demand.
(h)) of the PAC Report	of the public lorry park in private developments and ascertain the reasons for the under-utilisation of LGV parking spaces in Case 2 above, including whether a high	TD will continue carrying out site surveys to facilitate the planning and provision of public parking spaces in private developments.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	parking fee is a factor, and implement improvement measures as necessary.	
Para. 2.17(g) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should, drawing lessons from Case 3, improve the future planning of car parks which provide both private car and LGV parking spaces at the same locality.	Having regard to the experience gained from Case 3, TD considers that putting up clear directional signs and road markings at car parks will facilitate drivers to park their vehicles at the right parking spaces. Also, actions such as impounding or removal of any vehicles which are parked in the area in contravention of any signs or road markings may be considered pursuant to the Road Traffic (Parking on Private Roads) Regulations (Cap. 374O) for proper management of parking spaces in car parks.
Para. 110 (Page 53, 1st bullet, item (a)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges the Lands Department (LandsD) to step up its inspection efforts to ensure private lot owners' compliance with land lease conditions to provide parking spaces for public use, and take appropriate enforcement action against non-compliance cases in a timely manner.	In August and October 2018, LandsD issued internal guidelines to District Lands Offices (DLOs) to monitor and check compliance with lease conditions on the provision of public facilities within private developments, including public parking spaces, in accordance with the prevailing guidelines. To reinforce the message within the department, LandsD consolidated the above guidelines and reminded DLOs of the same in May 2019.
		Taking Case 2 as an example, District Lands Office/Kowloon West (DLO/KW) carried out an annual inspection of the subject car park in October 2019 and found no breach of lease conditions governing the subject car park.
		As no irregularities were detected in the site inspection carried out in October 2019 and the monitoring work will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
No. Para. 110 (Page 53, 1st bullet, item (b)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges LandsD to explore with TD feasible measures to assist car park operators of private developments in dealing with the occupation of LGV parking spaces by private cars.	LandsD in collaboration with TD has explored measures to assist car park operators of privately operated public car parks in dealing with the occupation of LGV parking spaces by private cars. Taking Case 3 as an example, DLO/KW had issued an advisory letter to the lot owner who replied on 28 June 2019 informing that management measures would be put in place against the improper parking by private cars. No irregularities were found in DLO/KW's subsequent site inspections carried out on 16 August, 11 October and 20 November 2019. As no irregularities were detected in the site inspections carried out in August, October and November 2019 and the monitoring work will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress
		report. Meanwhile, if the owner could show that the parking demand for LGV in the area concerned is low, subject to TD's advice and agreement, LandsD may consider an application from the owner to convert the parking spaces for other uses with a view to putting the parking spaces to their optimal uses, subject to such terms and conditions as may be imposed (including but not limited to the payment of premium).
Para. 110 (Page 53, 2nd bullet) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges the Architectural Services Department (ArchSD) to proactively monitor the progress of the maintenance and repair works of government car parks and take appropriate follow-up actions in a timely manner.	ArchSD conducted an experience sharing session in December 2019 to remind its staff to proactively and closely monitor the progress of the maintenance and repair works of government car parks referred by TD, and take appropriate follow-up actions, including liaising with TD as necessary and in a timely manner.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the follow-up action of this PAC's recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going
		basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Planning and provision of temporary public parking spaces

Para. 2.17(h) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should, in liaison with the Director of Lands, step up efforts to identify suitable reprovisioning sites in a timely manner if it is considered necessary to reprovision STT car parks that will be terminated for long-term developments, taking into account LandsD's specific views in paragraph 2.16 of the Audit Report.	Temporary public parking spaces provided under STTs are only stop-gap measures. STT sites cannot be maintained for parking purpose perpetually as they would eventually be used for implementing planned permanent developments which prevail over temporary/short-term uses. Besides, there is tremendous pressure in the supply of fresh STT sites for competing uses pertinent to the function of this city, in one way or the other.
		Notwithstanding the above, where justified, TD will continue to liaise with LandsD to identify suitable reprovisioning sites (if any) for STT car parks which will be terminated for implementation of planned permanent developments, taking into account the parking demand and other competing land uses in the area. This will be carried out as an on-going task.
Para. 2.17(i) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should formulate a strategy for providing more long-term public parking spaces, especially for commercial vehicles, to meet the shortfall arising from the termination of STT car parks in the near future, taking into account LandsD's specific views in paragraph 2.16 of the Audit Report.	 The strategy for providing more long-term public parking spaces has been established on multiple fronts - (a) the Government will provide public parking spaces in suitable G/IC facilities and POS projects in line with the principle of "single site, multiple uses"; (b) the Government plans to provide more parking spaces within the same footprint in future government

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		car parks through wider application of automated parking systems (APSs); and
		(c) for land sale sites and projects under lease modifications, TD will propose incorporation of suitable requirements in the relevant leases for provision of public parking spaces where possible, taking into account the technical feasibility and without compromising the development potential of the sites.
Para. 2.18 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Lands should, in collaboration with the Commissioner for Transport, carry out inspections and take actions to rectify the irregularities identified in Case 3.	In relation to the actions taken regarding Case 3, DLO/KW had issued an advisory letter to the lot owner, who replied on 28 June 2019 informing that management measures would be put in place against the improper parking situation. DLO/KW's subsequent site inspections carried out on 16 August, 11 October and 20 November 2019 found no irregularities.
		In the future, TD and LandsD will co-operate to monitor the situation and LandsD will take necessary lease enforcement actions if there is breach of the relevant clauses in the lease regarding the irregularities as identified in Case 3.
Para. 2.19 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Secretary for Transport and Housing should, in consultation with relevant government bureaux and departments, promulgate a circular setting out the criteria for considering whether and how public parking spaces should be provided under individual G/IC developments and open space projects.	The THB/TD are liaising with relevant bureaux/departments to promulgate a circular with a view to setting out the requirement for incorporating public car parking spaces in government projects in consultation with TD as part of the project scope.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 110 (Page 50, 1st bullet, item (b)) of the PAC Report	PAC notes that the internal guidelines are being reviewed to require all government departments to consult TD on the need to provide public car parks during the early stage of project planning.	
Para. 111 (Page 54, 2nd bullet, item (a)) of the PAC Report	PAC recommends that TD should consider providing incentives to encourage developers to provide more hourly charged parking spaces in their car parks or including in the land lease conditions of private developments a clause requiring the provision of a specified number of hourly charged parking spaces with a view to increasing the availability of public parking spaces.	The Government considers that the mode of operation of privately-operated public car parks is a commercial decision which is driven by market forces, in particular the actual parking needs of the public. It is therefore desirable to allow flexibility for car park owners to respond to fluctuations in parking needs. Notwithstanding the above, for land sale sites and projects under lease modifications, TD will propose incorporation of suitable requirements for provision of public parking spaces in the lease conditions in suitable development proposals. As the follow-up actions will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Para. 111 (Page 54, 2nd bullet, item (b)) of the PAC Report	PAC recommends that TD should, in liaison with LandsD, identify suitable sites, particularly those without an immediate implementation programme for long-term development, to provide more temporary public parking spaces in districts with parking demand with a view to ensuring better utilisation of scarce land resources.	Temporary public parking spaces provided under STTs are only stop-gap measures. STT sites cannot be maintained perpetually for parking purpose as they would eventually be used for implementing planned permanent developments which prevail over temporary/short-term uses. Besides, there is tremendous pressure in the supply of fresh STT sites for competing uses pertinent to the function of this city, in one way or the other. Notwithstanding the above, TD will continue to liaise with LandsD to

No. Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	identify suitable sites (if any) for provision of more temporary public parking spaces in districts with evident parking demand, taking into account other competing land uses in the area.As the follow-up actions will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Part 3: Management of Government multi-storey car parks

Review of parking fees and sale of parking tickets

• •		-
Para. 3.12(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should take into due consideration the high utilisation rates of parking spaces, the lower-than-market parking fees for private cars and van-type LGVs, and the concessionary parking fees for taxis in TD's future parking fee review exercises.	TD will continue to review the parking fees of the government multi-storey car parks under its purview regularly, taking into account the utilisation rates of the car parks and the market situation. TD completed the latest round of the parking fee review in March 2020 and is examining the review results.
Para. 3.12(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should take further actions to improve the sale arrangements of monthly/quarterly parking tickets in the government multi-storey car parks.	TD will continue to review the sale arrangements of monthly/quarterly parking tickets regularly, taking into consideration a host of factors including users' opinions and acceptability. To support the aforementioned review, TD's contractors conduct questionnaire surveys at six-month intervals to ascertain the latest opinions of car park users about the sale of parking tickets by balloting. In August 2019, the contractors completed a round of questionnaire surveys for seven government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview where monthly parking tickets are still sold on a first- come-first-served basis. The next round of surveys is planned for April 2020.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		In respect of the remaining four government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview where parking tickets are sold by balloting, TD will incorporate provisions into their new contracts for management and maintenance of those car parks, requiring the prospective car park contractors to accept and process applications for parking tickets through electronic means from 1 May 2020 onwards in addition to written applications so as to provide more convenience to prospective car park users.
Para. 110 (Page 52, 1st bullet, item (c)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges TD to put in place a mechanism to monitor the availability and occupancy rates of public parking spaces in government multi-storey car parks on a regular basis.	To better monitor the availability and occupancy rates of parking spaces in the government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview, TD has embarked on a project for installing the Bay Guidance System at its car parks. The sensors to be installed on individual parking spaces could collect real-time parking occupancy information, which could not only assist drivers in identifying vacant parking spaces, but also facilitate the handling of abandoned vehicles by identifying vehicles that have been parked at the same parking spaces for a prolonged period and are suspected to be abandoned vehicles.
		TD has imposed requirements in the tender to include the above-mentioned identification feature as well as the automatic dissemination of alert messages to the car park contractors to facilitate the handling of abandoned vehicles. The tender exercise will commence in Q2 2020, and it is anticipated that the installation works will start in the second half of 2020 for completion in Q2 2021.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date	
Non-availab	Non-availability of parking spaces for public use		
Para. 3.23(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should put the 75 rooftop parking spaces at Kwai Fong Car Park into effective use as soon as practicable.	Since 1 April 2019, the roof of Kwai Fong Car Park has been used as a temporary vehicle detention centre to cater for the need for detention of vehicles involved in unauthorised use for hire and reward.	
Para. 110 (Page 52, 1st bullet, item (d)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges TD to consider how the rooftop parking spaces of Kwai Fong Car Park could be put to good use in the long run, taking into account the utilisation rate of parking spaces on rooftop and the additional maintenance cost arising from its chronic water seepage problem.	TD completed a review on the use of the rooftop of Kwai Fong Car Park in December 2019. While keeping 21 parking spaces for the Temporary Vehicle Detention Centre, the remaining 54 private car/van parking spaces have been released for public use since 1 January 2020. Kwai Fong Car Park is now providing a total of 531 and 93 parking spaces for private cars/vans and motorcycles respectively.	
Para. 110 (Page 52, 1st bullet, item (e)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges TD to enhance its future liaison with ArchSD in respect of the maintenance and repair works of government car parks with a view to minimising the related impact on the availability of parking spaces for public use.	TD will enhance liaison with works departments for early completion of maintenance and repair works in the car parks with a view to re-opening the affected parking spaces as soon as possible. As the follow-up actions on this PAC's recommendation have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.	
Para. 3.23(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should explore feasible ways to remove abandoned vehicles with a view to releasing the occupied parking spaces in the government multi-storey car parks expeditiously, including ascertaining the applicability of the Road Traffic (Parking on Private Roads) Regulations.	In order to speed up the process of handling abandoned vehicles, TD has enhanced the procedures whereby the contractors of government car parks under TD's purview can act in accordance with the "Conditions of Parking and Use" displayed at the car parks concerned. When an abandoned vehicle is found, the contractor will send a letter to the address registered by the car owner concerned by registered	

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 110 (Page 52, 1st bullet, item (f)) of the PAC Report	PAC strongly urges TD to explore effective measures to assist contractors in removing abandoned vehicles in government multi-storey car parks with a view to releasing the occupied parking spaces expeditiously.	mail, asking him/her to settle the parking fees payable and remove his/her vehicle from the space it has been occupying. Where the vehicle owners have failed to pay the parking fees and remove the vehicles from the car parks within the specified period, the contractor may impound the vehicles with authorised immobilisation devices and serve notices by registered post to the vehicle owners again, stating that the concerned vehicles would become government property and the Government would be entitled to sell the vehicles if the vehicles concerned are not driven away and the accrued parking fees remain unsettled, so as to vacate the parking spaces for public use as soon as possible. As the follow-up actions on this recommendation have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Para. 3.23(c) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should improve the monitoring of the contractors' performance in taking follow-up action in respect of abandoned vehicles.	Since February 2019, TD has requested its car park contractors to submit monthly returns on the numbers and details of abandoned vehicles in government car parks for TD's monitoring of their performance. TD has been deploying staff regularly
		to inspect its car parks to monitor the work of the car park contractors. During the inspections, TD staff would check whether the monthly returns have properly reflected the latest situation of abandoned vehicles.
		As the follow-up actions on this Audit recommendation have been implemented and will be carried out on

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Facilities m	anagement	
Para. 3.29(a) of the Audit Report Para. 111 (Page 56, 1st bullet, item (a)) of the PAC Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should review the adequacy of closed-circuit television (CCTV) security systems installed in government multi-storey car parks, especially for those with only a small number of CCTV cameras, and take necessary measures to enhance the security of the car parks. PAC notes that TD has, in collaboration with ArchSD and the Hong Kong Police Force (the Police), embarked on a review of the provision of CCTVs in TD's car parks.	In collaboration with the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) and the Police, TD completed a review on the provision of CCTV security systems in government car parks under TD's purview with a view to enhancing security. In this connection, EMSD will conduct a tender exercise, among other things, for the installation of additional CCTVs in the car parks concerned as needed in Q2 2020. It is anticipated that the installation works will be completed in Q1 2021.
Para. 3.29(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should expedite the replacement work of the Car Park Management System (CPMS) and draw lessons from the problem of slow progress of CPMS replacement to avoid recurrence of similar problem in the future.	TD completed the replacement of all CPMS in September 2019 so as to enhance system reliability and service quality, save for the Yau Ma Tei Car Park which is scheduled for demolition in 2020 to pave the way for the construction of the Central Kowloon Route. TD will monitor the management systems and keep in view the need for replacement. As the follow-up action on this Audit recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date		
Part 4: Mar	Part 4: Management of on-street parking spaces			
Managemen	nt of on-street metered parking spaces			
Para. 4.19(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should review the fee charging arrangements of on-street metered parking spaces with a view to improving the implementation of the on-street parking policy (i.e. maintaining a parking space availability rate of 15%) and protecting government revenue, including –			
	 (i) reviewing parking fees for meters charging the low rate (i.e. \$2 per 30 minutes), in particular those installed on streets where there are both meters charging the high (\$2 per 15 minutes) and the low rates; 	TD has completed a review of parking fees for on-street parking meters charging the low rate of \$2 per 30 minutes. It is recommended that the charging rate of about 1 600 metered parking spaces should be adjusted from the low rate to \$2 per 15 minutes in order to encourage turnover in view of their high utilisation rates beyond 85%. TD commenced consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the concerned metered parking spaces are located on the proposed adjustment in Q1 2020, and would take forward the adjustment progressively after duly evaluating the views gauged.		
	 (ii) reviewing the "longest parking period" for each transaction of the 2-hour parking meters installed at parking spaces for private cars and van-type LGVs in core commercial areas, and adjusting the "longest parking period" for each transaction to 30 minutes as appropriate; and 	TD has completed a review on "longest parking period" for each transaction of existing parking meters. Taking into account the utilisation rates, the "longest parking period" for each transaction of about 290 metered parking spaces is proposed to be adjusted downwards to 30 minutes in order to encourage turnover. TD commenced consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the		

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		concerned metered parking spaces are located on the proposed adjustment in Q1 2020, and would take forward the proposed adjustment progressively after duly considering the views gauged.
	(iii) before the installation of the new generation of parking meter systems, monitoring the utilisation of parking spaces beyond the pre-set operating periods by conducting regular surveys, and considering extending the meter operating periods for parking spaces with high utilisation.	TD has conducted a desktop study on adjusting the operating period of parking meters. Having considered the utilisation of the parking spaces, TD has preliminarily identified about 220 metered parking spaces concerned, the operating period of which might need to be extended. In this connection, TD commenced consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the concerned metered parking spaces are located on the proposed adjustment in Q1 2020, and would take forward the proposed extension progressively after duly considering the views gauged.
Para. 111 (Page 59, 1st bullet, item (e)) of the PAC Report	PAC notes that TD has kick-started the preparatory work for the installation of new parking meters by phases starting from the first half of 2020. Its backend system will provide real-time information on those metered parking spaces which are being occupied but without payment of parking fees.	TD has engaged a contractor for the procurement, management, operation and maintenance of a new generation of on-street parking meters. The system development in respect of the new parking meters has been completed, and acceptance tests of the system are in progress. TD will commence the installation of about 12 000 new generation parking meters by phases from mid-2020 onwards for completion in about two years' time. The new parking meters can support payment of parking fees through multiple payment through mobile application. The new parking meters are also equipped with sensors to detect whether individual parking spaces are occupied so as to provide real-time information to assist motorists in finding vacant parking spaces, thereby reducing the need for

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		motorists to circulate on roads looking for parking spaces.
Para. 4.19(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should expedite the setting up of a parking fee adjustment mechanism to achieve the policy intent of short-term on-street parking.	The Government had proactively re-visited the proposed increase in maximum fee chargeable for parking at metered parking spaces and originally planned to effect the increase by way of the Road Traffic Legislation (Parking Spaces)(Amendment) Bill 2019. In the light of the latest social and economic conditions and community sentiment, the Government has decided to withhold the proposed increase in the maximum fee to avoid increasing the financial burden of motorists and the transport trades.
Para. 4.19(c) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should formulate a meter replacement plan before the end of serviceable life of the new generation of parking meter systems.	The Contracts for "Procurement cum Management, Operation and Maintenance of New Generation of Parking Meter System" have already included provisions requiring the contractors to complete a review on vehicle sensing technologies and electronic payment means by the end of the 6th contract year (i.e. in early 2025). TD will examine the review reports with a view to considering the way forward regarding the future management of the metered parking spaces and taking timely action to replace or enhance the new parking meter system to be installed by phases from mid-2020 onwards.
Para. 4.19(d) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should before the installation of the new generation of parking meter systems, closely monitor the implementation of the parking meter redeployment plans.	TD will continue to closely monitor the plan for redeployment of parking meters as an on-going task before the installation of the new generation of parking meter system.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date	
Management of on-street non-metered parking spaces			
Para. 4.30(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should take measures to ensure that on-street non-metered parking spaces are utilised effectively with a view to improving the parking space availability rate, including –		
	 (i) conducting regular surveys to assess the need to install meters and/or to detect unlawful occupation of parking spaces; 	TD has arranged to conduct regular surveys on a half-yearly basis to assess the need to install meters and to identify any unlawful occupation of on-street non-metered parking spaces by abandoned vehicles or other objects. The most recent survey commenced in December 2019. TD will continue to carry out the surveys as an on-going task.	
	 (ii) reviewing the justification for providing free on-street parking spaces at some locations (see paragraph 4.28(a) of the Audit Report) to meet longer-term parking needs; and 	TD will continue to monitor the utilisation of existing on-street non-metered parking spaces and review the justification for providing free on-street parking spaces at specific locations to address motorists' longer-term parking demand.	
	(iii) for parking places where both metered and non-metered parking spaces are provided (see paragraph 4.28(b) of the Audit Report), considering installing parking meters for the non-metered parking spaces to better manage parking demand, taking into account utilisation rates.	TD will carry out site inspections for on-street non-metered parking spaces as an on-going task to ascertain the need for metering.	
Para. 4.30(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should ensure the accuracy of the inventory list of on-street non-metered parking spaces and the information provided in the "HKeMobility" mobile application.	TD has taken measures to ensure the accuracy of the inventory list of on-street non-metered parking spaces and the information provided in the "HKeMobility" mobile application. For example, TD converted the "on-street non-metered parking spaces"	

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		information into a geographic information system-enabled data set suitable for dissemination to the public via Public Sector Information (PSI) Portal, uploaded the information onto the "HKeMobility" mobile application and opened them to the PSI Portal in mid-2019. To achieve continual updating of such information, the on-street non-metered parking spaces information can be automatically uploaded onto the "HKeMobility" mobile application at regular intervals. As the follow-up actions recommended by Audit have been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	lementation of parking-related techn	ology initiatives
Para. 5.13(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should take measures to improve the dissemination of parking information via the "HKeMobility" mobile application and the "Hong Kong eRouting" website,	
	 (i) taking improvement measures to enhance the completeness and accuracy of the information provided by the "HKeMobility" mobile application; 	Upon completion of the system enhancement work in end 2018, the full set of car park data stored in TD's internal data system, including car park location information, had been uploaded onto the "HKeMobility" mobile application and has been disseminated to the public since February 2019. Thereafter, in order to ensure the continuous updating of such information, car park data stored in TD's internal data system are automatically uploaded onto "HKeMobility" at regular intervals.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the follow-up actions have been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
	 (ii) continuing to make efforts to work closely with the relevant departments (e.g. Government Property Agency (GPA), Housing Department (HD) and Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) — see paragraph 5.8 of the Audit Report) to provide parking vacancy information of government venues; 	TD conducted follow-up meetings with the departments concerned (i.e. GPA, HD and LCSD) again in early 2019, and shared a new standard tenancy clause concerning the provision of parking information for STT car parks for their reference. In response, these departments re-affirmed their support for the Government's open data policy and agreed to incorporate the new clause into their car park contracts upon expiry of the existing ones, with a view to disseminating the parking information to the public via "HKeMobility" mobile application and the PSI Portal (i.e. data.gov.hk). As at early December 2019, GPA and HD included new requirements into the contracts of a total 12 retendered government car parks, including two managed by GPA and 10 managed by HD, requiring the car park operators to provide parking information. The above three departments will include similar requirements in suitable new car park contracts.
	(iii) providing more supplementary information of car parks in the "HKeMobility" mobile application as far as practicable; and	To further enhance the data content of government public car parks, TD sought input from the departments (i.e. GPA, HD and LCSD) and disseminated standardised information in early 2019. Supplementary information, such as parking fee, availability of electric vehicle (EV) charging services and opening hours of the car park, has been progressively released to the public since May 2019.
		For non-government car parks, operators could, at their discretion, reveal other supplementary car park

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		information on the car park information page, including hyperlinks to car park operators' specific websites. As some information (such as parking fee and promotion) is subject to change frequently to suit operators' own business needs, it is preferable for operators to disseminate such information to the public via the website of the car park, rather than direct display on "HKeMobility" mobile application. Having said that, as an on-going task, TD will continue to encourage car park operators to provide the supplementary information.
	 (iv) considering incorporating the searching function in the "HKeMobility" mobile application for locations of both on-street metered and non-metered parking spaces. 	The search function on "HKeMobility" mobile application for locations of on-street parking spaces was launched in early July 2019.As the follow-up action has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Para. 5.13(b) of the Audit Report	Commissioner for Transport should	As at end January 2020, the number of car parks with vacancy information disseminated by TD through the PSI Portal (data.gov.hk) increased to 196. TD will continue to encourage the owners or operators of public car parks to open up their parking data in the PSI Portal. "On-street non-metered parking spaces" data have been opened up and made available at the PSI Portal (data.gov.hk) under On-Street Parking data set of Road Network (2nd Generation) since early July 2019.
		As the follow-up actions have been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations		Progress to Date
Para. 5.13(c) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should review the way forward for the "Hong Kong eRouting" website, taking into account its usage statistics, maintenance and enhancement cost, and new developments in information technology.	"Hong Ko its launch. eRouting" daily visits January 20 maximum 1 000. With a vie route searc at the san resources, "Hong Ko the existin	en monitoring the usage of ng eRouting" website since It is noted that "Hong Kong website reached 900 average s during the period between 019 and October 2019, with average daily visits of about w to maintaining the driving the service for the public, and ne time better utilising the TD plans to integrate the ong eRouting" website into g "Hong Kong eTransport" mid-2020.
Provision ar	d management of EV charging facilit	ies	
Para. 5.17(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Environmental Protection should, in collaboration with the Commissioner for Transport, explore the need and feasibility of installing EV chargers in the three government multi-storey car parks without EV chargers, i.e. Aberdeen, Kennedy Town and Kwai Fong Car Parks.	The Government has allocated \$1 million to install additional mediu chargers at government car parks op to the public, including Aberdeen C Park, Kennedy Town Car Park a Kwai Fong Car Park under TE purview. Subject to technic feasibility, over 1 000 additional pub	

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		TD and its car park contractors will continue to provide assistance to the EPD in installing more EV chargers in government car parks under TD's purview.
Para. 5.17(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Environmental Protection should, in collaboration with the Commissioner for Transport, consider introducing administrative measures to facilitate both EV and non-EV drivers with an aim to ensure that parking spaces equipped with EV chargers are available for use by EVs.	The Government plans to set up a smart system for the Government's public EV charging network to support the development of Smart City. The system will include instant electronic information on the status of EV chargers. EPD will work closely with TD on the provision of real-time availability information of EV chargers in the car parks under TD's purview in order to facilitate EV drivers to identify vacant parking spaces equipped with chargers. In order to assist drivers in identifying EV parking spaces, electronic display panels will be installed at the entrance of government car parks to display the real-time availability of parking spaces with EV chargers TD will provide assistance to EPD in examining measures to cater for the need for EV chargers, including the installation of more EV chargers in government car parks under TD's purview. Nevertheless, reserving some parking spaces with EV chargers for exclusive use by EVs will affect the availability of parking spaces for conventional vehicles. TD will take into account the parking demand in specific car parks when providing assistance to EPD in examining the measures.
Para. 5.17(c) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Environmental Protection should, in collaboration with the Commissioner for Transport, take into account the	To increase the availability of EV charging-enabled parking spaces for EV drivers, EPD plans to install additional EV chargers at locations that are less popular or less convenient to

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	occupation problem of parking spaces equipped with EV chargers by non-EVs and explore measures to discourage non-EV drivers to park their cars at such spaces in planning suitable locations for the installation of EV chargers at car parks in the future.	car park users, for instance the parking spaces on upper floors of the car parks or locations further away from exit or lift where possible, so as to minimise the likelihood of parking at these locations by drivers who do not require charging. The plan will be implemented when the Government installs over 1 000 additional medium chargers at government car parks in the coming three years. TD will fully cooperate with Environment Bureau and EPD when the new policy and initiatives for EVs are implemented, including installing more EV chargers in government car parks under TD's purview as far as practicable, and examining measures to discourage non-EV drivers from using those parking spaces equipped with EV
Para. 111 (Page 61, 2nd bullet, item (c)) of the PAC Report	PAC notes that EMSD has taken forward the installation of Bay Guidance System at TD's car parks. It will complete the tender for the system by early 2020 and commence the installation works at TD's car parks in mid-2020 with a view to fully completing the project by early 2021.	chargers. EMSD will commence the tender exercise in Q2 2020 and plans to start the installation works at government car parks under TD's purview in the second half of 2020 for full completion by Q2 2021.
Implementa	tion of automated parking systems	
Para. 5.23 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Transport should step up efforts in implementing APSs in government car parks based on the recommendations of the related pilot study.	To provide more parking spaces, TD is actively studying the pilot use of APS. The study is expected to complete in April 2020.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations PAC strongly urges TD to closely monitor the progress of the pilot study on APSs and step up efforts in implementing APSs in government car parks based on the recommendations of the pilot study.	Progress to Date TD has deployed a dedicated team to oversee the planning and implementation of APSs in government car parks. Under the APS pilot study, TD is taking forward six APS pilot projects, and has identified four pilot sites for adopting APSs and is conducting pre-construction planning. The four pilot sites identified include an STT site in Tsuen Wan, a POS at the junction of Yen Chow Street and Tung Chau Street in Sham Shui Po and two proposed government building sites on Chung Kong Road in Sheung Wan and Sheung Mau Street in Chai Wan. For the STT site in Tsuen Wan, TD has already secured support from the Tsuen Wan District Council, and will carry on with other preparatory work for tender invitation. As regards the pilot project in Sham Shui Po, TD is currently assessing the technical feasibility after securing support from the Sham Shui Po District Council. For the proposed APS projects in Sheung Wan and Chai Wan, TD will consult the relevant District Councils in due course.
		TD will consider the wider application of APSs in government car parks, having regard to the outcome of these pilot projects.
