Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Laying of the Report The Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year end 31 March 2018 and his Report No. 71 on the results of value for money audits were laid in the Legislative Council ("LegCo") on 28 November 2018. The Public Accounts Committee ("the Committee")'s Report (Report No. 71) was subsequently tabled on 20 February 2019, which met the requirement of Rule 72 of the Rules of Procedure of LegCo that the Report be made within three months of the Director of Audit's Report ("Audit Report") being laid.

2. **The Government Minute** The Government Minute in response to the Committee's Report No. 71 was laid in LegCo on 15 May 2019. A progress report on matters outstanding in the Government Minute was issued on 30 October 2019. The latest position and the Committee's further comments on these matters are set out in paragraphs 3 to 69 below.

Monitoring of charitable fund-raising activities

(Paragraphs 3 to 5 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a director of the 3. Absolutely Fabulous Theatre Connection and the Heifer International Hong Kong Limited respectively, an Executive Committee Member of the Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited, a founder member of the Construction Industry Charity Fund and a member of the School Council of St. Stephen's Girls' College, all of which might have conducted fund-raising activities. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun participated in that he had charitable fund-raising declared Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that he was a member of the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong, which might have conducted fund-raising activities. Hon LAM Cheuk-ting declared that he was a member of the Democratic Party, which might have conducted fund-raising activities. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Assessment Committee of the Liberal Party Caring Foundation, which might have conducted fund-raising activities, and unremunerated honorary adviser or honorary member to some non-governmental organizations ("NGOs"). Hon Tanya CHAN declared that she was a member of the Civic Party, which might have conducted fund-raising activities.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

4. The Committee was informed that:

- the Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB") had been assigned to coordinate inputs from the relevant bureaux/departments ("B/Ds") in formulating a response to the Law Reform Commission's recommendations on the monitoring of the operation of charities. The Administration had introduced a series of administrative measures in phases with effect from 1 August 2018 and 1 April 2019 after making reference to the recommendations in the Law Reform Commission Report, the Audit Report and the Committee's Report, with a view to enhancing the transparency of charitable fund-raising activities, safeguarding the interests of donors and facilitating the conduct of fund raising activities; and
- since 1 April 2019, the Administration had introduced a logo for display by holders of licences and permits relating to charitable fund-raising activities during charitable fund-raising activities for identification by members of the public.
- 5. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of squatter and licensed structures

(Paragraphs 6 to 9 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 6. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a non-official member of the Hong Kong Housing Authority ("HKHA").
- 7. The Committee was informed that:

Monitoring of squatter and licensed structures

taking into account the overall enforcement priorities under the squatter control policy, any genuine difficulties encountered by the occupants and local sentiments, as well as any special policy considerations relevant to businesses operating in that particular area, the Lands Department ("LandsD") was considering a pilot scheme for

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

regularization of warranted cases for consideration with relevant B/Ds; and

Rates, government rent and licence fees on squatter and licensed structures

- LandsD was conducting an overall review of the license fee charging mechanism for Government Land Licences. The review would, among others, identify obsolete uses hence obsolete fee items and consider arrangements for revising the fees in respect of the remaining items. Upon completion of the stocktaking of Government Land Licences, LandsD would be in a better position to review the way forward. The digitization of Government Land Licence records was expected to be completed by 2020.
- 8. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Kai Tak Cruise Terminal

(Paragraphs 10 and 11 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 9. The Committee was informed that in response to the recommendation of the Audit Commission ("Audit"), the Tourism Commission had completed the mid-term assessment of the economic benefits brought by the cruise industry immediately after collecting the relevant data in 2018. The assessment findings indicated that the value added contribution of the cruise industry in Hong Kong in 2018 was \$1.736 billion, which was within the projection made in 2008 and fell into, ahead of schedule, the range of projected contribution by 2023. The Tourism Commission promulgated in August 2019 the above findings for information by the public and the LegCo Panel on Economic Development.
- 10. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Management of projects financed by the Lotteries Fund

(Paragraphs 12 and 13 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

11. The Committee was informed that:

- regarding the assignment of the social centre for the elderly to the Administration (Case 7 in the Audit Report), the Government Property Agency ("GPA") completed in April 2019 the vetting of the revised assignment plan submitted by the developer. The assignment procedure would be duly completed pending the developer's confirmation of the conditions of assignment and payment arrangements; and
- the Social Welfare Department ("SWD"), through LandsD, issued a letter in August 2019 to urge again the grantee and the developer to complete the assignment procedure without delay, and warn them of the possible lease enforcement action in case of further delays. When the assignment procedure was completed, SWD would arrange finalization of the project accounts after reimbursement of the project cost to the developer.
- 12. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Government's support and monitoring of charities

(Paragraphs 3 to 5 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

13. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a director of the Absolutely Fabulous Theatre Connection and the Heifer International Hong Kong Limited respectively, a founder member of the Construction Industry Charity Fund and a board member of the Construction Industry Skills Training Centre Limited. He was also a member of the School Council of St. Stephen's Girls' College. In addition, he was involved in the construction of the new headquarters of Scout Association of Hong Kong. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was a member of Scout Association of Hong Kong and was involved in the work of a number of charities. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Assessment Committee of the Liberal Party Caring Foundation.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

14. The Committee was informed that:

Administration of tax exemption of charities and tax-deductible donations

in response to the recommendations of Audit and the Committee, the Inland Revenue Department was reviewing the taxability of the profits derived as specified in Chapter 1 of the Audit Report No. 68 after the issue of Profits Tax returns to all the seven charities involved;

Administration of land granted to charities for operating welfare/social services

- among the eight cases named in the Audit Report in which the leases specifically permitted the running of hostels/dormitories, the relevant B/Ds confirmed that they were satisfied with the current use or operation of hostels/dormitories under Leases F, G, H, I, J, M and N. As regards Lease L, the grantee had submitted audited accounts for the years of 2015 to 2018. In July 2019, LandsD requested further information and documents, particularly those showing the use of surplus income from the grantee;
- as at September 2019, LandsD had completed the stock-taking of private treaty grants granted at nil/nominal/concessionary premium from 1 January 2010 to 31 December 2017. LandsD would continue to undertake the stock-taking exercise in phases and share the findings with the relevant B/Ds, with a view to reminding the relevant B/Ds of their monitoring roles and responsibilities under the relevant protocol in respect of the private treaty grants overseen by them;

Regulation of Chinese temples

- in December 2017, the Chinese Temples Committee ("CTC") re-entered into an agreement for three years with one of the delegated organizations. The CTC Secretariat had been discussing with the other delegated organization with a view to re-entering into an agreement as soon as possible;
- the management of 20 delegated temples was delegated to eight organizations, including charitable and district organizations. One delegated organization had uploaded the financial information of the temple on its website. The delegation agreements with the other

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

six delegated organizations had been revised with clauses added to specify that CTC was authorized to disclose the financial information of the temples for public inspection onto its website. CTC would impose the same clauses on the agreement of the remaining delegated organization which was pending re-entry; and

Way Forward

- to improve the transparency and accountability of charities, the Administration had introduced the following measures with effect from 1 August 2018 and 1 April 2019 respectively:
 - (a) uploading all audited accounts submitted by organizations, which filed applications on or after 1 August 2018 and obtained approval to organize charitable fund-raising activities from SWD or charitable lottery events from the Home Affairs Department ("HAD"), to the page of GovHK on fund-raising activities for reference by the public;
 - (b) setting up a dedicated hotline for handling enquiries or complaints about charitable fund-raising activities held by organizations in public places;
 - (c) issuing the "Good Practice Guide on Charitable Fund-raising" ("the Guide") jointly by SWD, HAD and the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD"). The Guide, which facilitated the public understanding of donors' rights, had been uploaded to the page of GovHK on fund-raising activities for public information and evaluation of the performance of charitable organizations in organizing fund-raising activities. SWD, HAD and FEHD would step up promotion to encourage the adoption of the Guide by charitable organizations;
 - (d) providing a one-stop service for charitable fund-raising activities organized on government land so that they were no longer required to apply to LandsD separately for temporary occupation of government land when applying for permit or licence for different kinds of fund-raising activities. The permit or licence approval authority would consult LandsD and notify the charitable organizations direct of the application results; and

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

- (e) providing a one-stop service for processing application for waiver of Temporary Hawker Licence in connection to Public Subscription Permit involving charity sale fund-raising activities. SWD would forward the relevant information to FEHD for processing the waiver application and the organizations needed not submit separate applications to FEHD, which would notify the organizations direct of the application results.
- 15. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of district council funds for community involvement projects (Paragraphs 6 to 9 of Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 16. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a member of the Business and Professionals Alliance for Hong Kong with some members being District Council ("DC") members. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was a DC member. Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that he was a member of the Central Committee of the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong and many district organizations had invited him as a consultant or an honorary president. Hon LAM Cheuk-ting declared that he was a member of the Democratic Party with a number of its members being DC members and he himself was a member of North DC, and DC members belonging to the Democratic Party might have applied for and organized activities using the funds to DCs for implementing community involvement projects in districts. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Liberal Party, and unremunerated honorary adviser or honorary member to some NGOs. Hon Tanya CHAN declared that she was a member of the Civic Party and DC members belonging to the Civic Party might have applied for and organized activities using the funds to DCs for implementing community involvement projects in districts.
- 17. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019 that in response to the recommendations of the Audit and the Committee on management of conflicts of interest in community involvement projects, HAD had issued guidelines on "other declarable interests" and good practice in handling declaration of interests and making rulings at meetings by Chairpersons to the DC Secretariats. As at 15 April 2019, 14 DCs had adopted the guidelines and 16 DCs had adopted the good practice.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

18. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Fresh food wholesale markets

(Paragraphs 6 and 7 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

19. The Committee was informed that:

Reprovisioning of private and public fresh food wholesale markets

- depending on the results of the "Technical Study on Potential Sites for Relocation of Wholesale Markets and for Other Industrial Uses in North West Tsing Yi" and other consideration, the Administration was exploring Fu Tei Au and other possible sites for relocation of the Cheung Sha Wan Temporary Poultry Market and would consider the way forward in consultation with the relevant stakeholders;
- the Finance Committee ("FC") of LegCo approved in May 2019 the proposed project for reprovisioning of the North District Temporary Wholesale Market for Agricultural Products. The project commenced in September 2019 with the target completion date in the second quarter of 2021. The Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department and the Civil Engineering and Development Department would continue to liaise with the trade on the user requirements of the re-provisioned market; and

Way forward

- a holistic review on the roles and functions of the Fish Marketing Organization and Vegetable Marketing Organization, including their strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats, had not yet been completed. Audit's recommendations would be taken into full account when mapping out the way forward.
- 20. From the List of outstanding items of the LegCo Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene, the Committee notes that the Administration had commissioned a consultancy study on the present-day functions and purpose of the wholesale business in the sale of fresh food produce, and the study is expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2020. The Committee also notes that the item

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

"Wholesale market consultancy study" is tentatively scheduled for discussion in the Panel meeting in the second quarter of 2020.

21. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts

(Paragraphs 8 and 9 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

22. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of academic programmes

Admission of non-local students

- the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts ("HKAPA") had reviewed the tuition fee level for non-local students admitted in 2018-2019 and 2019-2020. The latest tuition fee level for non-local students was set at a level sufficient to recover all additional direct costs as recommended by Audit. The tuition fee for non-local students in 2020-2021 would be reviewed in early 2020;

Student unit cost

taking into account that the number of student enrolment had a direct impact on the student unit cost, HKAPA was implementing different measures with a view to increasing student enrolment. included: (a) issuing admission offers earlier (before the end of March); (b) launching the new one-year Diploma in Foundation Studies programme in 2019-2020 academic year as an alternative entry degree programmes to for local applicants; (c) implementing the online application system by phases to facilitate the application process. Applications for 2020-2021 academic year could be submitted through the system. For 2019-2020 academic year, there was an increase in the total number of student intake as well as student enrolment to the undergraduate and post-secondary programmes;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Governance and government monitoring

- HAB was considering the incorporation of changes into the Memorandum of Administrative Arrangements that were mutually agreed with HKAPA and were in line with the prevailing Government subvention guidelines; and

Campus improvement and expansion

- the moving in to the on-campus expansion was completed in September 2019. HKAPA was working on the final account of the on-campus expansion project, and would submit the requisite documents together with the final account to the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD") for vetting.
- 23. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of water supply and demand

(Paragraphs 10 and 11 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 24. The Committee was informed that the results of public consultation for the supply of recycled water (including reclaimed water), which was completed in December 2018, indicated that the public were generally supportive of the proposal of using recycled water for non-potable uses. The preparatory work for the associated legislation was in progress. Supply of reclaimed water for flushing was planned to commence in 2022.
- 25. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Planning, construction and redevelopment of public rental housing flats (Paragraphs 12 to 14 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

26. Hon Kenneth LEUNG declared that he was a former member of HKHA; and Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was currently a member of HKHA and engaged in the trading business of construction materials.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

27. The Committee was informed that:

Public Housing Construction Programme 2019-2020 to 2023-2024

- according to HKHA's Public Housing Construction Programme as at September 2019, the estimated total public housing production of HKHA and the Hong Kong Housing Society in the five-year period from 2019-2020 to 2023-2024 would be 100 700 units. The Administration had identified land for the construction of about 248 000 public housing units for the ten-year period from 2019-2020 to 2028-2029, assuming that all sites identified could be delivered on time for housing construction. To further expedite the supply of public housing, the Administration had already implemented the following policies and measures in 2018:
 - (a) allowed a further increase of domestic plot ratio for public housing sites in selected Density Zones of the Main Urban Areas and New Towns by 10% (i.e. up to maximum 30% increase in total) where technically feasible, with a view to optimizing land resources and maximizing public housing supply in the short and medium terms;
 - (b) re-allocated nine private housing sites for public housing development. These sites were expected to provide some 11 000 units; and
 - (c) revised the land premium arrangement for subsidized housing projects of the Hong Kong Housing Society, which would enable the Hong Kong Housing Society to continue to provide rental units and subsidized sale flats and implement the re-development programme of aged rental estates on a financially sustainable basis;

Long Term Housing Strategy Annual Progress Report 2019

- in a press conference held on 18 December 2019, Secretary for Transport and Housing announced the Long Term Housing Strategy Annual Progress Report 2019, which included the following salient points:

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

- (a) according to the latest long term housing demand projection under the Long Term Housing Strategy, the public housing target for the ten-year period from 2020-2021 to 2029-2030 was 301 000 units (comprising 210 000 public rental housing/Green Form Subsidised Home Ownership Scheme units and 91 000 other subsidized sale flats); and
- (b) the Administration had identified land for the construction of about 272 000 public housing units for the same period, assuming that all sites identified could be delivered on time for housing production. The gap between the amount of land identified and the public housing supply target was 29 000 units; and
- the Administration submitted the Long Term Housing Strategy Annual Progress Report 2019 to the LegCo Panel on Housing at the meeting held on 6 January 2020.
- 28. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Recoverability of the outstanding advances to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

(Paragraphs 15 and 16 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 29. The Committee was informed that the Security Bureau reiterated again by letter to the Hong Kong Sub-office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees in August 2019 the Administration's stance and registered the Hong Kong community's expectation of an early recovery of the outstanding advances.
- 30. Given that the outstanding advances had remained since 1998 and follow-up actions taken by the Administration to recover the amount were futile, the Committee suggests to the LegCo Panel on Security that the Administration should consider writing off the outstanding sum.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Small house grants in the New Territories

(Paragraphs 21 to 23 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

31. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was an indigenous villager of the New Territories and had exercised his small house concessionary right to build New Territories small houses.

32. The Committee was informed that:

- the Court of First Instance of the High Court handed down a judgement on 8 April 2019 that the arrangements to apply for grants of government land through the Private Treaty Grant and Land Exchange for building small houses under the small house policy were not the lawful traditional right and interest of the indigenous inhabitants of the New Territories within the meaning of Article 40 of the Basic Law;
- since the above judgment involved the interpretation of Article 40 of the Basic Law which was of constitutional importance, having considered legal advice, the Administration lodged an appeal on 9 July 2019 with the Court of Appeal against the above judgment; and
- the results of appeal on the judicial review might have implications on the small house policy.
- 33. The Committee wrote to Director of Lands on 6 January 2020 to seek information about the Administration's handling of the new applications and applications already received by the Administration for grants of government land through the Private Treaty Grant and Land Exchange for building small houses under the small house policy when the appeal is still in progress. The replies from **Director of Lands** are in *Appendix 3*.
- 34. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Direct land grants to private sports clubs at nil or nominal premium (Paragraphs 24 to 26 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 35. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a member of Hong Kong Country Club, Hong Kong Football Club, Hong Kong Golf Club, Hong Kong Jockey Club, Royal Hong Kong Yacht Club and Shek O Country Club; Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was a member of Hong Kong Jockey Club, Scout Association of Hong Kong and South China Athletic Association; and Hon Kenneth LEUNG declared that he was a member of the Ladies Recreation Club, Craigengower Cricket Club and Foreign Correspondents' Club, Hong Kong.
- 36. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019 that:

Review of the Private Recreational Lease ("PRL") Policy

- the interdepartmental working group convened by HAB completed the PRL policy review and proposed the following recommendations:
 - (a) different handling of the leases held by "community organizations" and "private sports clubs" and granting new special purpose leases (instead of PRLs) to sports and recreational sites held by "community organizations";
 - (b) the lease conditions of the sites held by private sports clubs under PRL policy should be significantly modified to better meet the dual needs of supporting sports development and optimizing land use;
 - (c) taking into account the contribution of private sports clubs in promoting sports development in Hong Kong when considering the renewal of their leases upon expiry;
 - (d) requiring private sports clubs suitable for lease renewal to pay a concessionary premium to be set at one-third of the Full Market Value land premium;
 - (e) requiring private sports clubs to further open up their facilities to eligible outside bodies up to 30% of their total sports capacity and partner with sports organizations to organize sports programmes

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

that could be made available for enrolment by individual members of the public with a minimum sports programme hours of 240 per month;

- (f) drawing up the list of allowable sports supporting facilities and ancillary facilities for PRLs;
- (g) enhancing the monitoring on PRL sites and the corporate governance of the lessess, and enforcement actions against lease breaches; and
- (h) defining the principles in approving applications for new sites for sports and recreational use;
- HAB briefed the Executive Council and the LegCo Panel on Home Affairs on 19 and 25 February 2019 respectively on the outcome of the public consultation on the review of the PRL policy;

Implementation of the "opening-up" requirement

- the Education Bureau ("EDB") promoted the use of PRL sites through issuing an annual circular memorandum to all schools starting from 2018;
- HAB placed another round of advertisements in the print media in February 2019 to encourage eligible outside bodies to use the clubs' facilities, and would consider other publicity measures as necessary;

Monitoring of compliance with lease conditions

- HAB had been monitoring the utilization rates of sports facilities on PRL sites, in particular with regard to the implementation of the opening-up schemes. It had also followed up with individual lessees with low utilization with a view to increasing usage rates;
- LandsD and HAB would consider on a case-by-case basis whether additional lease conditions should be imposed in the new leases according to the recommendations of the interdepartmental working group; and

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

- LandsD, in consultation with HAB and other relevant B/Ds, had completed all the required follow-up actions on cases of irregularities and suspected non-compliance with lease conditions identified in Audit Report No. 61. LandsD had also conducted site inspections of PRLs where lease renewal was not yet due and would follow up in consultation with HAB as appropriate.
- 37. The Committee wrote to Secretary for Home Affairs on 6 January 2020 to enquire about the lease conditions and the latest status of the 16 expired PRLs. The replies from **Secretary for Home Affairs** are in *Appendix 4*.
- 38. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of roadside skips

(Paragraphs 27 to 29 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 39. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019 that:
 - the Joint Working Group on Management of Roadside Skips ("JWG") had conducted joint enforcement operations to tackle the malpractice of indiscriminate placement of idling skips at a number of black spots, including Tseung Kwan O, Sai Kung, Kowloon Bay, Kai Tak and Chai Wan areas. As at the end of 2018, JWG conducted a total of 45 joint enforcement operations. The extent of indiscriminate placement of idling skips at these black spots had been improved;
 - while the consultant study on the setting up of a trade-led voluntary skips registration system was still on-going, JWG aimed to support the trade to kick off the system in the second half of 2019; and
 - JWG would continue to explore options for enhancing the standards of skip operations. Taking into account the progress of the work proposed, JWG would consider whether there was a need to introduce a new regulatory system in the long run.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

40. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of long-term care services for the elderly

(Paragraphs 30 to 32 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

41. The Committee was informed that:

<u>Increasing elderly service facilities</u>

- SWD was currently implementing 45 development projects for the provision of new contract residential care homes for the elderly cum day care units for the elderly and day care centres for the elderly. It was estimated that about 6 400 residential care places (including subsidized and non-subsidized places) and 1 500 day care places for the elderly would be progressively provided from 2019-2020 onwards;
- it was announced in the 2019-2020 Budget that \$20 billion would be allocated for the Administration to purchase properties over some three years for accommodation of welfare facilities, including day care centres for the elderly, etc., to help meet the acute shortfall of premises. The Administration briefed the LegCo Panel on Welfare Services about the proposal on 10 June 2019. Upon securing funding approval from FC, SWD and GPA would start relevant preparatory work as soon as possible;

Other initiatives to increase elderly service places and enhance elderly services

- SWD would continue to implement the Pilot Scheme on Residential Care Service Voucher for the Elderly ("the Pilot Scheme"). The Pilot Scheme planned to issue a total of 3 000 vouchers by phases. The Pilot Scheme, adopting the "money-following-the-user" principle, provided an additional choice for elderly persons in need of residential care service by allowing them to choose the services provided by eligible residential care homes for the elderly operated by NGOs or the private sector according to their needs;
- starting from October 2018, SWD had allocated an additional recurrent expenditure of about \$238 million to all subvented elderly centres

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

(including District Elderly Community Centres and Neighbourhood Elderly Centres) and home care services teams (i.e. Integrated Home Care Services Teams and Enhanced Home and Community Care Services Teams) in the territory to enhance outreaching services for supporting carers living in the community and looking after frail elders;

- SWD continued to implement the Pilot Scheme on Home Care and Support for Elderly Persons with Mild Impairment to provide further assessments for elderly persons waitlisted for Integrated Home Care Services (Ordinary Cases) throughout the territory, and offered home care and support services to those elderly persons assessed to be of mild impairment in accordance with their needs for functional deterioration prevention, so as to enable them to continue to enjoy their life in the familiar community. The Pilot Scheme on Home Care and Support for Elderly Persons with Mild Impairment was expected to provide 4 000 service places, and SWD planned to brief the LegCo Panel on Welfare Services on the progress at the meeting on 13 January 2020;
- to improve the quality of life of service users as well as reduce the burden and pressure of care staff and carers, two rounds of invitations had been conducted in 2019 by SWD to invite eligible elderly and rehabilitation service units to apply for the Innovation and Technology Fund for Application in Elderly and Rehabilitation Care of \$1 billion launched in December 2018 to subsidize them in procurement, rental and trial use of technology products. It was estimated that the bulk of the \$1 billion funding would be progressively disbursed within five years starting from 2019-2020; and
- the 2019-2020 Budget announced that the Administration would allocate some \$200 million for the Lotteries Fund to launch a four-year pilot project providing free Wi-Fi service at more than 1 350 service units subsidized by SWD and operated by NGOs, so as to meet the needs of the use of innovation and technology products in the elderly and rehabilitation care services, strengthen the connection between the elderly and other service users and the community, and enhance the service quality. The project would be implemented from 1 January 2020 onwards.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

42. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Administration of the air traffic control and related services

(Paragraphs 33 to 36 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 43. Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that he was a non-executive director of the Airport Authority Hong Kong.
- 44. The Committee was informed that there were two incidents in June and August 2019 in which displaying and updating of information in the new Air Traffic Management System ("ATMS") were not functioning properly. In November 2019, in response to the Committee's enquiry on the two incidents, the Civil Aviation Department ("CAD") said that:

Brief hitch of ATMS on 13 June 2019

- at 9:06 am on 13 June 2019, individual workstations of the Main System of ATMS experienced a brief hitch, during which some flights and their flight information could not be shown intermittently. The technical staff on-site immediately followed up and carried out investigation. After co-ordinating with the air traffic control ("ATC") supervisors on-site, the technical staff switched from the Main System to the Fallback System, an identical system, according to the established procedures at 9:22 am;
- as a precaution, the Air Traffic Control Officers deferred giving clearance to departing flights for about 16 minutes in accordance with procedures. Arrivals and flights flying through the Hong Kong Flight Information Region ("HKFIR") were not affected. Aviation safety was not affected by the occurrence. The Air Traffic Control Officers were able to keep direct voice communication with the pilots at all times as well as monitor and obtain full information of all flights (including the three essential types of information, i.e. flight position, altitude information and secondary surveillance radar code) in HKFIR through the Automatic Dependent Surveillance-Broadcast display to provide ATC services;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

- the contractor was tasked right after the occurrence to conduct a thorough investigation and provide a long-term solution as soon as possible. At the same time, CAD liaised with the contractor immediately to develop interim arrangement before the contractor provided a long-term solution. The preliminary investigation by the contractor concluded that the occurrence was stemmed from the Surveillance Data Processor ("SDP"). Since the Main System consisted of two identical designed SDPs, in the event of recurrence of similar incidents, the technical staff on-site, after consulting the ATC supervisors on-site, might switch to the other SDP of the Main System, rather than switching to the Fallback System, in order to provide ATC services. The similar incidents on 31 July and 12 August 2019 were properly handled by such interim arrangement;
- according to the report submitted by the contractor in July 2019, when SDP of the Main System processed the flight information of a particular flight, an unexpected data wipe-out of the flight information of that particular flight occurred but the indicators in the SDP continued to indicate the presence of the flight information. As SDP was unable to handle such unanticipated situation, the flight information of the other flights in the same message could not be processed and displayed;
- the contractor had provided a software fix to prevent recurrence of similar incidents. After completion of the on-site testing and safety assessments, the software fix had been successfully implemented to ATMS for operational use since 15 August 2019. Similar incidents had not occurred since then;

Brief hitch of ATMS on 16 August 2019

- at various times in the morning of 16 August 2019, individual workstations of the Main System and the Fallback System of ATMS could not update the flights and their flight information. The individual workstations concerned were then rebooted and resumed normal operation after rebooting. In the afternoon, individual workstations of the Main System experienced a brief hitch again, during which the flights and their flight information could not be updated;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

- as a precaution, after co-ordinating with ATC supervisors on-site, the technical staff switched from the Main System to the Fallback System, an identical system, according to the established procedures at 2:06 pm. Clearance to departing flights was also deferred for about 15 minutes in accordance with procedures. Arrivals and flights flying through HKFIR were not affected. Aviation safety was not affected by the occurrence. The Air Traffic Control Officers were able to keep direct voice communication with the pilots at all times as well as monitor and obtain full information of all flights (including the three essential types of information, i.e. flight position, altitude information and secondary surveillance radar code) in HKFIR through the Automatic Dependent Surveillance-Broadcast display to provide ATC services;
- CAD tasked the contractor right after the occurrence to conduct a thorough investigation and provide a long-term solution as soon as possible. At the same time, CAD liaised with the contractor immediately to develop interim arrangement before the contractor provided a long-term solution. Similar incidents had not occurred since then; and
- the contractor had provided a software fix to prevent recurrence of similar incidents. The software fix would ensure that the cancellation of flight plan of the aircraft concerned with the Special Condition Code was completed prior to the announcement update in order to prevent memory corruption. The on-site testing of the software fix was in progress. Upon completion of the test and relevant safety assessment by CAD, the software fix was expected to be implemented in ATMS in mid December 2019.
- 45. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Use and disposal of vacant school premises

(Paragraphs 37 to 40 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

46. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was the Chairman of Board of Governors of English Schools Foundation and a council member of the St. Stephen's Girls' College.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

47. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019 that:

Allocating vacant school premises ("VSP") for educational or other uses

- in respect of the two VSP on private land that were not earmarked for any use, one of them had already been redeployed by the school sponsoring body for other educational use. EDB was discussing with the school sponsoring body on the surrender of the remaining VSP;
- the 49 VSP under LandsD's purview comprised four VSP on private land that had a cessation/diminution of user clause in the land lease and 45 VSP on government land. For the four VSP on private land, LandsD was processing proposals submitted by the lessees for other uses. For the remaining 45 VSP on government land, LandsD had processed planned uses from B/Ds or short-term tenancy/private treaty grant applications in respect of 29 VSP, and 11 VSP had been/would be included in the list of vacant government sites available for application for short-term uses on the "GeoInfo Map" Website. The remaining five VSP were not available for short-term uses for the time being due to technical reasons, such as possible slope problems, and their situations were kept under review;

Handling cases of VSP not surrendered

- as at end January 2019, among the 41 VSP the physical possession of which had not been delivered to the Administration after cessation of school operation which warranted further action, 19 were under EDB's purview. Of the 19 VSP, 18 had been used for educational purposes. EDB planned to redevelop the only remaining VSP for reprovisioning use and was taking follow-up actions accordingly. Regarding the other 22 VSP, the suitable long-term uses for five would be reviewed; two VSP were reused for school and other educational purposes (hence in compliance with lease conditions); and LandsD had repossessed seven VSP and would continue to recover possession of three VSP and process the proposals submitted by the lessees/occupiers for other uses in respect of five VSP;
- EDB had been discussing with the school sponsoring body with regard to Case 6 in Audit Report No. 65 and had settled the carving out arrangements with the school sponsoring body concerned about the

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

other VSP arising from reprovisioning which was on both private land and government land. The required carving-out works for the latter had commenced since end March 2019 for completion by end December 2019; and

Access to information about VSP available for application for short-term uses

- the list of VSP (amongst other vacant government sites) under LandsD's management and available for application for short-term uses was uploaded onto the "GeoInfo Map" Website and would be updated on an on-going basis. NGOs or social enterprises might submit applications for renting such sites for community, institutional or non-profit making uses on a short-term basis.
- 48. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Joint-office operation on water seepage in buildings

(Paragraphs 43 to 45 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 49. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019 that:
 - the Joint-office formed by FEHD and the Buildings Department was enhancing the new information system, Water Seepage Complaints Management System, by expanding its functions to include generation of letters, minutes, and memo to the Buildings Department and the Water Supplies Department, generation of management reports, data analysis in support of the formulation of performance indicators for handling simple and straightforward cases, etc. The enhancement work was expected to be largely completed in the fourth quarter of 2019; and
 - since the second half of June 2018, the Joint-office had applied testing technologies such as infrared thermography and microwave tomography in three pilot districts (i.e. Kowloon City, Wanchai and Central and Western). With the experience gained and data obtained through the pilot application of the above testing methods, the

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Joint-office would evaluate their effectiveness and refine the technical guidelines and procedures relating to the use of the testing methods. The Joint-office would progressively extend the use of these testing methods to other pilot districts starting from the third quarter of 2019.

50. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Hospital Authority's management of public hospital projects

(Paragraphs 51 and 52 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

51. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019 that:

<u>Project management of the Redevelopment of Caritas Medical Centre</u> (Phase 2)

Project planning

- for on-going projects, the Hospital Authority ("HA") had:
 - (a) incorporated appropriate provisions regarding identification of unrecorded underground utilities and measures to minimize noise and vibration by the contractors in all HA construction contracts;
 - (b) discussed and agreed with medical staff on the noise and vibration limit as well as the scheduling of construction works close to sensitive equipment; and
 - (c) set up monitoring points for close monitoring of noise and vibration;
- HA would continue to incorporate standard provisions related to unrecorded utilities, noise and vibration into new construction contracts;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Construction site safety

- HA had implemented measures for further safety enhancements, which included measures to ensure that its contractors reported all site accidents to HA and its consultants;
- accident statistics were reported to the Supporting Services Development Committee and published on HA's Website in November 2018, and would continue to be reported to that Committee and published annually;

Commissioning of facilities of the North Lantau Hospital (Phase 1)

- mechanism was available for regular monitoring and reporting of the utilization of major medical equipment at cluster level. With the opening of one more ward in September 2018, those not-in-use items at the North Lantau Hospital (Phase 1) were fully utilized and the utilization of major equipment would be increased;
- the standardized Procurement Planning of Furniture and Equipment for commissioning hospital projects was reported to the Supporting Services Development Committee in September 2018; and

Management of minor hospital projects

- the survey results of the building condition of HA's hospitals were reported to HA's Directors' Meeting and the Supporting Services Development Committee in November 2018.
- 52. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Regulation of non-franchised bus and school private light bus services (Paragraphs 53 and 54 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

53. The Committee was informed that:

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Administration of licensing requirements

- having regard to the need to allow flexibility in vehicle deployment to minimize the impact on service users resulting from the Transport Department ("TD")'s proposal to tighten requirement on the vehicle number and the trade's views, TD had reached a consensus with the trade. Upon the renewal of individual service endorsement of a Passenger Service Licence ("PSL"), the trade had to provide service contract(s) to justify the number of vehicles applying for service endorsement. Specifically, the number of vehicles stipulated in the service contract(s) submitted should be at least 50% of the number of vehicles applying for service endorsement. The measure concerned, which involved the re-engineering of administrative workflow, was expected to be implemented in the fourth quarter of 2019;
- TD planned to merge the Passenger Service Licence Certificates ("PSLCs") for scheduled services and non-scheduled services of public non-franchised buses in early 2020;
- TD was studying the feasibility of aligning the validity periods of PSLCs and related PSLs. The review was expected to be completed before the end of 2019;
- TD had extended the scope of the performance pledges to cover renewal cases of PSL/PSLC of school private light buses since September 2019;

Regulatory controls over unauthorized operations

- TD would continue its efforts to shorten the time required for completing investigations and inquiries. At the same time, TD was considering possible long-term measures to prevent PSL holders from avoiding sanctions in consultation with the Department of Justice; and
- TD was exploring the feasibility of issuing fixed penalty ticket to PSL holders who had breached PSL conditions in consultation with the Department of Justice and the Hong Kong Police Force.
- 54. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Operation of the Land Registry

(Paragraphs 55 and 56 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

55. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of services

- as at September 2019, the Land Registry had finished checking 85% of the total 110 000 land registers and filling in the information in respect of the nature of registered documents of some historical transactions not shown in the land registers. The Land Registry expected to complete the task by end 2019 as scheduled;
- the Land Registry provided responses to the comments made by HAD on the revised proposal on computerization of owners' corporation records in June 2019;

Implementation of Land Title Registration System

- the Land Registry conducted several Land Titles Ordinance Review Committee meetings in 2019 to consult committee members on the implementation details of the "new land first" proposal; and
- the Administration expected that consensus would be reached with the stakeholders on the main issues concerning the "new land first" proposal by the first quarter of 2020 and planned to consult the Land Titles Ordinance Steering Committee on the proposed major amendments to the Land Titles Ordinance (Cap. 585) in mid 2020. The Administration would refine the Land Titles (Amendment) Bill according to the comments of the Land Titles Ordinance Steering Committee and work out a more concrete implementation timetable.
- 56. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Provision of government office accommodation and utilisation of government sites

(Paragraphs 59 and 60 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

57. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of government-owned office accommodation

- GPA was examining suitability of the "Government, Institution and Community" sites recommended by the Planning Department for planning new joint-user general office buildings with a view to meeting additional office accommodation needs on a long-term basis;
- relevant B/Ds were actively taking forward the implementation of the nine replacement building projects under the Wan Chai Government Offices Compound relocation exercise. The construction works of the West Kowloon Government Offices had been completed and B/Ds were moving into the Offices in phases by the fourth quarter of 2019. Construction works for the Government Information Technology Building, the Inland Revenue Tower, the Treasury Building and the Immigration Headquarters had commenced. The Government Information Technology Building was expected to complete in 2021, the Inland Revenue Tower and the Treasury Building were scheduled to complete in 2022, while the Immigration Headquarters were expected to complete in 2023. Relevant B/Ds were working on the preparation of the remaining four building projects with a view to seeking funding approval from FC in due course. It was the Administration's target to complete the construction of all the replacement building projects under the Wan Chai Government Offices Compound relocation exercise by 2026;

Utilization of government sites

- GPA had established an ongoing mechanism with ArchSD such that relevant information of all ArchSD's completed projects were provided regularly to GPA for timely update of the site particulars in the Government Property Information System. This updating mechanism was running smoothly and subject to periodic reviews; and
- the traffic impact assessment under the feasibility study for the "Site Formation and Infrastructure Works for the Development at

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Shek Pai Street, Kwai Chung" was largely completed. The Civil Engineering and Development Department was further examining the concerned traffic impact assessment in the light of the departmental comments received recently and would provide supplementary information. TD would review the need for the Kwai Chung Circumferential Road project with reference to the aforementioned traffic impact assessment and relevant supplementary information.

58. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Administration of lump sum grants by the Social Welfare Department (Paragraphs 3 to 5 of Part 6 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

- 59. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun and Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that they were directors and/or advisers to a number of NGOs which might have received lump sum grants ("LSGs") or other subventions from SWD. Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that one of his family members worked in SWD.
- 60. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before the LegCo in May 2019 that:

Financial monitoring

- SWD would draw up a set of cost apportionment guidelines on the use of LSG subvention, including the apportionment arrangement of operation costs between Funding and Service Agreement activities and non-Funding and Service Agreement activities, for NGOs' reference;
- as regards the follow-up on the updated guidelines for the control and monitoring of remuneration practices in respect of senior executives in subvented bodies issued by the Administration Wing on 27 August 2018, SWD informed NGOs through a briefing session held on 6 November 2018 and a notification e-mail issued on 13 December 2018 about the updated guidelines and the specific arrangements and details for the submission of Review Reports on Remuneration

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Packages for Staff in the Top Three Tiers in accordance with the guidelines;

Self-assessment of service quality by NGOs

SWD issued a management letter on 16 July 2019 to remind NGOs of the need for accurate reporting and computing of the Output/Outcome Standards as well as conducting self-assessment on compliance with Essential Service Requirements and Service Quality Standards. The letter also covered the recommendations of the Audit Report and the Committee's Report for NGOs to put in place an internal control mechanism and encouraged NGOs to take corresponding actions;

Monitoring of service delivery by SWD

- SWD had been implementing a special visitation programme since 2016-2017 to conduct visits within five years to all service units not having been visited. As at 30 June 2019, 52.2% of the units under the special visitation programme had been visited;
- SWD had reviewed the manpower needs in 2018-2019 to ensure that adequate manpower would be available to conduct the performance visits;
- as for the arrangement for calculating subventions to the Agreement Service Units providing the Home Care Service for Persons with Service Disabilities and the Integrated Support Service for Persons with Severe Physical Disabilities, SWD and the service operators were focusing the efforts on the extension of service scope, refinement of the subvention calculation principle concerned, and plans to cut short the review cycle of using the number of cases served for calculation of subventions of related service units from one year to six months. SWD would continue to discuss with the service operators the details of the proposal, which was expected to be implemented in 2020-2021;

Governance and management matters

- SWD continued with the on-site assessments in nine randomly selected NGOs between January and March of 2019 to evaluate the actual implementation of Level One guidelines and inspect the implementation records of NGOs concerned, and requested NGOs to

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

list out information relating to the implementation of the relevant criteria and procedures on their Self-assessment Checklists for Level One guidelines starting from 2018-2019 to ensure accurate reporting;

- SWD would, through the LSG Steering Committee and the Working Group on the Implementation Details of the Best Practice Manual, continue its efforts to forge agreement between the management and staff side of NGOs on the final outstanding item relating to staff remuneration policy; and

Review of LSG subvention system

- to carry out the review of the LSG subvention system, the Task Force had collected relevant information and data from NGOs for analysis and detailed deliberation. SWD had also hired a consultancy firm to assist in the exercise. In addition, the Task Force had conducted a number of sector consultation sessions and focus group interviews. The first and second rounds of sector consultation sessions and focus group meetings were held between August 2018 and January 2019 to listen to and collect the views of the stakeholders. The entire review was expected to be completed by mid 2020.
- 61. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Centre for Food Safety: Management of food safety

(Chapter 1 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

62. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2019:

Assessment of food safety risks

- as at the end of August 2019, the contractor had completed interviewing around 70% of targeted survey respondents of the second food consumption survey ("FCS");
- the Centre for Food Safety ("CFS") had instructed the contractor to deploy manpower to expedite the progress of the fieldwork survey and

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

gear up for the data processing work, with a view to completing the second FCS by mid 2021;

- after completing the second FCS, CFS would start planning for the FCS on the younger population having regard to the experience from the second FCS;

Food surveillance programme

- in June 2019, CFS reported to the LegCo Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene a series of improvement measures which had been implemented. These included:
 - (a) reducing the sampling rate for testing pesticide residues in fruits and vegetables which were of relatively low risk to reallocate resources to testing of other food hazards, and increasing the proportion of online food samples for microbiological testing;
 - (b) promulgating new operational guidelines to frontline staff to revise the sampling rates for different types of food outlets at the retail level;
 - (c) promulgating new operational guidelines to staff to specify delivery of food samples to the laboratories within 14 working days from the sampling date and set out contingency measures for compliance against changes of delivery schedules; and
 - (d) CFS had revamped its information technology systems to closely monitor the delivery time of all food samples, and strengthened staff supervision to ensure delivery of food samples to the laboratories within the specified timeframe;

Management of food incidents and complaints

- CFS had put in place a new measure to compile complaint management information on a periodic basis for the Food Complaint Risk Analysis Panel to monitor the follow-up of food complaints;
- CFS had published updated guidelines to the trade and staff specifying that food traders must dispose of the recalled foods under the supervision of CFS officers and submit food recall progress reports to

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

CFS as required for enhanced monitoring of food recall exercises. The guidelines had taken effect since April 2019. CFS had also issued new guidelines to its staff requiring them to keep proper records of actions taken; and

Communicating with the public on food safety risks

- CFS would continue to step up efforts in disseminating food safety information and advice to the public, including strengthening the use of its Facebook page, enriching multimedia materials and extending the operating hours of its roving exhibitions.
- 63. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of signboards by the Buildings Department (Chapter 4 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

64. The Committee was informed that:

- improvement and enhancement of the Minor Works Control System computer system for more efficient tracking of desktop and site audit cases as well as monitoring and reviewing the operation and effectiveness was anticipated to be completed on schedule in the first quarter of 2020;
- following the revision of the standard record sheet for desktop and site audit check results in January 2019 to differentiate cases requiring follow-up actions from those rectified cases, training courses on the usage of the standard record sheet were held in July 2019 reminding staff of the importance and accuracy of computer data, and reminding them to follow the procedures properly; and
- sample assessments had commenced in July 2019 to estimate the manpower and time needed to extract information on legal signboards from existing building records, with a view to establishing a database of legal signboards to facilitate control and enforcement actions. It was anticipated that the sample assessments would be completed in March 2020.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

65. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Radio Television Hong Kong: Provision of programmes

(Chapter 5 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

66. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before the LegCo in May 2019 that:

Production of programmes

- Radio Television Hong Kong ("RTHK") completed its review of the acquisition policy for television ("TV") and radio programmes with reference to standard government procurement procedures;
- RTHK sought comments from the Independent Commission Against Corruption on the updated acquisition policy for TV programmes and the newly formulated acquisition policy for radio programmes. Independent Commission Against Corruption made no further comment on the two sets of policy. The updated and newly formulated acquisition policies had been fully implemented;
- to assess the cost-effectiveness of the Community Involvement Broadcasting Service, RTHK conducted the first focus group study in November 2019;

Broadcasting of programmes and new media services

- starting from 1 April 2019, RTHK TV 31 no longer broadcast miscellaneous contents. RTHK TV 32 has produced more programme varieties, including live coverage of local sports events, live relay of important Mainland and overseas events, as well as short interview videos on various topics;

Evaluation of programmes and other administrative issues

- a RTHK TV Channel Penetration Survey would be conducted in December 2019 to collect information and data on the penetration/take-up pattern of the Digital Terrestrial Television channels, viewing habits and preferences of the audience with a view to

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

ascertaining the reasons for low TV ratings. On the basis of the information and data collected, RTHK would be in a better position to work out measures to address the issue of low TV ratings. Results of the Penetration Survey were expected to be available in the first quarter of 2020;

as for radio programmes, a Radio Audience Survey would be conducted in April each year. Information on the appreciation index of selected radio programmes would also be collected on a sample basis so as to monitor the quality of radio programmes. The share of total listening time per channel and the appreciation index of each radio channel would be reported in the Controlling Officer's Report from 2021-2022 onwards;

Evaluation of school education television programmes

- the Curriculum Development Council accepted, with the agreement and endorsement of the Ad Hoc Committee on the Development of School ETV Programmes under the Curriculum Development Council and the Curriculum Development Council Committee on Learning Resources and Support Services, EDB's suggested follow-up actions on school education television, including re-positioning education television service, forging a more flexible relationship with RTHK and increasing the scale of commissioning the production of multimedia resources. EDB had drawn up concrete strategic plans in October 2019;
- in the 2018-2019 school survey, in-depth interviews with teachers and students and on-site opinion polls among students were included to gauge more holistically the usage of education television multimedia resources inside and outside the classroom and to better understand their effectiveness in supporting learning; and
- data analysis of the 2018-2019 school survey was in progress. The survey findings would be available by January 2020.
- 67. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

Barrier-free facilities at government premises

(Chapter 6 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 71)

68. The Committee was informed that:

Work of the Labour and Welfare Bureau over barrier-free facilities at government premises and Buildings Department in updating Design Manual

the Technical Committee on Design Manual: Barrier Free Access had started discussion of 24 items involving proposals for improving the Design Manual that had not been discussed by the Technical Committee in recent meetings and would consider the remaining four items in the coming meeting in end of 2019;

Work of FEHD and Leisure and Cultural Services Department ("LCSD") in providing and managing barrier-free facilities under their management

- FEHD had completed a new round of annual access audits using the improved checklists and compiled the lists of barrier-free facilities in various public venues under its management. The lists of barrier-free facilities had been uploaded onto FEHD's Website for public information since September 2019. The lists would be updated on a regular basis with reference to the results of the annual access audits thereafter;
- LCSD had reviewed its current arrangements in the management of barrier-free facilities and promulgated guidelines on the frequency and manner of conducting access audits and the format of the audit checklists in August 2019;
- LCSD had strengthened the training for staff with a view to enhancing their awareness, knowledge and skills in handling accessibility issues, and implemented measures to ensure that Access Officers would receive the training within one year upon their appointment as Access Officer;
- on the deficiencies in provision, maintenance and control of barrier-free facilities at venues managed by FEHD, for the location where the improvement works of the passageway to one accessible toilet were technically infeasible owing to site constraint, directional

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

signs, accessible route and lift had been provided for people in need to get access to the other accessible toilets in the same building;

- LCSD had also:

- (a) checked other venues not covered by the audit report during regular venue inspections, and would promptly arrange for rectification of any damage or irregularities of barrier-free facilities;
- (b) taken follow-up action against deficiencies relating to provision of barrier-free facilities identified in the stocktaking exercise in all venues and any identified deficiencies would be reported to the maintenance agent for rectification;
- (c) sought and would continue to seek technical advice and support of ArchSD to enhance and strengthen the provision of barrier-free facilities beyond the basic requirements as appropriate, especially for new venues and major renovation projects;
- (d) released the information on barrier-free facilities on LCSD's Website in May 2019;
- (e) provided training on accessibility issues to 294 out of 347 Access Officers (up to 31 July 2019); and
- (f) completed the capacity enhancement of the relevant computer system to keep separate statistics on the number of complaints received in relation to accessibility issues in LCSD venues. These statistics were submitted to the senior management regularly;

Management of retrofitting works for barrier-free facilities at government premises

- ArchSD was reviewing the existing operational procedure to enhance the control mechanism on the issuance of works orders for improving project administration for retrofitting works;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2018 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 71) [P.A.C. Report No. 71]

- in the light of the incidents involving slippery tactile guide paths, ArchSD had studied suitable materials with reference to Design Manual: Barrier Free Access 2008; and
- among the 14 outstanding premises in FEHD's Public Toilet Refurbishment Programme, refurbishment works for eight premises had been completed and another four were scheduled for completion within 2019. ArchSD would continue to work closely with FEHD to take forward the remaining refurbishment works as soon as practicable.
- 69. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.