

**THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE**

**in response to the**

**REPORT OF  
THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE  
No. 75A**

**of May 2021**

**18 August 2021**



# **THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE IN RESPONSE TO THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE REPORT NO. 75A DATED MAY 2021**

## **REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 75)**

### **Chapter 1 – Collection and removal of marine refuse by the Marine Department**

The Government accepts the views and recommendations made by the Audit Commission (Audit) and the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) on the collection and removal of marine refuse by the Marine Department (MD). The Environment Bureau (ENB) and MD have taken follow-up actions as appropriate. The progress made is reported below.

#### ***Administration of marine refuse cleansing and disposal contracts***

2. Since July 2005, MD has fully outsourced the marine refuse cleansing and disposal services. There are two existing contracts for marine refuse cleansing and disposal services, i.e. one for the whole of Hong Kong waters and another for the additional cleansing service in Tai Po District. Audit revealed the following areas for improvement in the administration of these two contracts by MD.

#### ***Reporting of the quantity of marine refuse collected***

3. Following Audit's recommendations, MD has investigated the cause of the discrepancies in the quantity of marine refuse collected as reported by the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) and MD respectively from 2012 to 2019. The discrepancies arose from the different methods of measurement adopted by the two departments. EPD's records were based on the actual weight of the municipal solid waste disposed of by the contractor at landfills and refuse transfer stations while MD estimated the quantities of marine refuse collected by volume (in terms of number of bags) and converted the estimated volume into tonnes for reporting in MD's Controlling Officer's Reports (CORs).

4. In this connection, MD, with consent from ENB and following the practice of the International Maritime Organization, has started to measure the quantity of refuse collected from the sea and vessels by volume in "cubic metres" from 1 January 2021. In response to PAC's recommendations, MD is actively exploring the adoption of other performance indicators in its CORs to reflect the effectiveness of its marine refuse cleansing work. In addition, MD is examining ways to include other quantitative indicators to monitor the performance of the contractor more effectively.

*Reimbursement of disposal charges to the contractor*

5. In the tender documents of the contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters issued in 2017, the handling of costs arising from the disposal of refuse at refuse transfer stations was not specified. To avoid ambiguity, Audit has recommended that MD should clearly specify the arrangement for charges incurred in refuse disposal at refuse transfer stations for tender exercises in future. MD will specify clearly in future tender documents of the contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters that refuse disposal costs shall be borne by the contractor.

*Monitoring of refuse transportation vehicles*

6. Regarding the attendance records of refuse transportation vehicles used by the contractor, MD has requested the contractor to duly comply with the requirement of maintaining proper records for inspection by MD from August 2020 onwards.

7. In addition, in response to Audit's recommendation that the designated refuse transportation vehicle should not be used for purposes other than transporting marine refuse, MD has reached an agreement with the contractor that such vehicle should not be used for purposes other than transporting marine refuse.

*Sub-contracting arrangement*

8. Regarding the contractor's sub-contracting arrangement in hiring vehicles to transport marine refuse on land, MD has reminded the contractor that the terms and conditions under the contracts should be strictly complied with in future. Should there be any breaches in the contract requirements again, MD will promptly investigate and take necessary actions such as imposing penalties as per the terms of contracts and claiming against the contractor for administration costs arisen. The relevant breach will also be properly recorded in writing.

*Inviting tenders for cleansing and disposal services*

9. MD is conducting a comprehensive review on the tender of the next marine refuse cleansing and disposal service contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters. It will make reference to the recommendations of the Central Tender Board in 2017 to enhance tender competition, including allowing a longer tender period for the tenderers to prepare proposals, shortening the contract period to allow more flexibility and allowing a longer gearing up period for successful tenderers to mobilise the necessary resources. MD will also consider other way such as splitting contract service areas and removing unnecessary contract service requirement to reduce the contract price, with the aim to achieve the most cost-effective tender award. In addition, MD will monitor and regularly review the effectiveness of marine refuse cleansing and disposal work to ensure its cost-effectiveness and service quality.

## ***Monitoring of marine refuse cleansing and disposal services***

### *Monitoring of marine refuse cleansing work*

10. To ensure that each part of the service areas is clean and free from refuse as required under the contracts, MD will step up daily cleanliness patrols in the 12 patrol areas with its four existing patrol launches, and will conduct regular cleanliness patrols by helicopters to meet the patrolling requirements of each area as stipulated in its internal guidelines. In addition, MD has strengthened its monitoring work from November 2020 onwards by reviewing the frequency of patrols conducted for each area in the middle of each month. Whenever it is identified that an area has not been arranged with any patrol, officers will be deployed for conducting patrols in the area concerned at the earliest opportunity.

11. Furthermore, to improve the effectiveness in selecting patrol areas for conducting daily cleanliness patrols, MD has amended its guidelines to specify that reference should be made to the service requests received in selecting patrol areas.

12. As for the daily monitoring of the contractor's marine refuse cleansing work, MD will instruct the contractor to clean up the area concerned when marine refuse reports are received, including those from typhoon shelters and promenades. Upon the contractor's completion of the cleansing work, where circumstances permit, MD officers will inspect the cleanliness condition of the water area concerned. In case the cleanliness condition is still unsatisfactory after the cleansing work, MD will instruct the contractor to allocate resources and manpower to strengthen the cleansing work until the cleanliness condition is up to standard.

13. MD will also conduct surprise checks on the priority areas including typhoon shelters during patrols to ensure that the sea surface cleanliness condition is up to standard. MD will inform the contractor to clean up any water areas found to be of unsatisfactory cleanliness condition.

14. Under certain circumstances, for instance, after typhoons and rainstorms, or when floating refuse is accumulated between mooring vessels where it is difficult or impossible to reach, the contractor may need a longer time than the time limit as specified in the contract to re-establish the sea surface cleanliness condition. MD has already reminded the contractor to keep the department informed in case the cleansing work cannot be completed within the specified time limit due to such circumstances, and to continue the cleansing work until it is completed. MD will instruct the contractor to redeploy vessels as necessary to facilitate the cleaning up of water areas that are inaccessible by normal work boats, and will also contact the ship owners concerned to temporarily shift their vessels away from the berthing area to facilitate the contractor's cleansing work.

15. The use of non-compliant vessels by the contractor in conducting marine refuse cleansing work is a matter of serious concern to MD. Upon receipt of the Audit Report, MD instructed the contractor to stop using non-compliant vessels in conducting marine refuse cleansing work immediately. After further investigation, MD issued Performance Default Notices to the contractor. The contractor undertook not to use non-compliant vessels in conducting marine refuse cleansing work in future. MD has also stepped up its monitoring measures to avoid recurrence of similar incidents.

*Monitoring of the management of marine refuse collection points (MRCPs)*

16. Since January 2021, MD officers have been inspecting the conditions of MRCPs from time to time during daily patrols of various areas, including whether the refuse is properly stored in covered temporary storage containers and whether the MRCPs are clean and tidy.

17. Ap Lei Chau MRCP is mainly used for handling marine refuse collected from the southern waters of Hong Kong. About 30% to 40% of marine refuse collected in Hong Kong was transported from Ap Lei Chau MRCP to the disposal sites for disposal every year. This MRCP also provides essential support to the cleansing work of the southern waters of Hong Kong and the Aberdeen Typhoon Shelters by saving the travelling time taken by work boats to the other MRCPs in Hong Kong, especially during the typhoon season when more frequent cleansing work is required. Hence, there is a genuine need to retain this MRCP.

18. Regarding the replacement of the lifting appliance in Ap Lei Chau MRCP, MD and the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department have finalised the arrangements and the replacement is expected to complete by November 2021. Before the replacement, the contractor will arrange refuse collection vessels equipped with lifting appliance for unloading refuse to the temporary storage containers.

19. Cha Kwo Ling MRCP is mainly used for handling marine refuse collected from the eastern waters of Hong Kong and has been in use since 1995. It has to be retained at this stage as about 20% to 30% of marine refuse collected in Hong Kong was transported from Cha Kwo Ling MRCP to disposal sites for disposal every year. Nevertheless, since Cha Kwo Ling MRCP may have to be relocated in tandem with the development plan of the district, it will not be cost-effective to repair the lifting appliance and then to demolish it shortly afterward. As the contractor has arranged refuse collection vessels equipped with lifting appliance for unloading marine refuse collected to the temporary storage containers, MD will not repair the lifting appliance in Cha Kwo Ling MRCP for the time being.

20. Regarding the undesirable hygiene conditions of Cha Kwo Ling MRCP, MD has already instructed the contractor to improve its cleansing work. MD agreed that the contractor's management of the MRCs in the past was unsatisfactory. As stated in paragraph 16 above, from January 2021 onwards, MD has strengthened its monitoring of the contractor's performance and increased the number of surprise checks on MRCs to ensure that the relevant requirements are complied with.

### ***Other related issues***

#### *Enforcement against marine littering*

21. MD attaches great importance to keep the various zones of Hong Kong waters clean, and deploys launches to perform daily patrols in Hong Kong waters against marine littering at sea and prosecute those who commit marine littering. However, prosecution against marine littering is not easy since uniformed enforcement officers of MD on board patrol boats can easily be seen and people usually will not litter in the presence of enforcement officers.

22. To improve the effectiveness of the enforcement actions, about 30% of the anti-marine littering operations have been conducted by officers in plain clothes since 2021. During the operations, enforcement officers in plain clothes will patrol along coastal areas and take enforcement actions against marine littering.

23. To raise public awareness of keeping the sea clean and reduce marine littering at source, MD conducts publicity and education activities from time to time, such as distributing leaflets to vessels and stakeholders of marine operations. Before the Lunar New Year and fish moratorium, MD also organises typhoon shelter management meetings with the stakeholders to promote the message and distribute leaflets to remind members of the industry and vessels to keep the sea clean and place their domestic waste and items properly to prevent them from falling into the sea. With reference to the relevant marine refuse study, we agree that it is important to enhance promotional efforts, especially on curbing the disposal of cigarette butts in Hong Kong waters and shorelines. The message of no disposal of cigarette butts into sea is now incorporated into the leaflet "We are one in keeping our harbour clean". MD has been distributing these new leaflets to the public since 2021.

*Dissemination of information on website*

24. The “Clean Shorelines” website is managed by EPD. In general, MD follows EPD’s requirement to review and update information related to MD in the website quarterly. When there are material changes to the work that could lead to any change of the information on the website, MD will proactively review and update the content of the website as necessary, so that members of the public may get hold of the latest information.

*New initiatives in tackling marine refuse*

25. MD spares no effort in tackling marine refuse with the aid of innovation and technology. For example, MD has placed floating booms in Kwun Tong Typhoon Shelter to intercept floating refuse since March 2021 and enhanced the monitoring of sea surface cleanliness with the assistance of drones starting from April 2021.

26. MD will continue to explore the application of innovative technologies adopted by other regions in harbour cleansing and collection of refuse from ships and floating refuse. We will keep an open mind and proactively consider any possible options which may enhance its work in tackling marine refuse handling, are suitable for application in Hong Kong waters, and at the same time will not endanger navigation safety or pose a safety risk at sea.

27. MD will continue to explore with the contractor the wider application of information technology to enhance the daily management and monitoring of marine refuse collection and disposal services.

*Progress of implementing the recommendations of Audit and PAC*

28. The latest progress of implementing the recommendations of Audit and PAC is summarised in Enclosure 1.

Encl. 1

**Chapter 2 – Government's efforts in tackling shoreline refuse**

29. The Government accepts the views and recommendations made by Audit and PAC on the Government’s efforts in tackling shoreline refuse, and will follow up on their recommendations. The progress made in this respect in the past six months is reported below.



30. Being a coastal city facing the sea on three sides, Hong Kong has an ever challenging task in tackling marine refuse problems. Since the set up of the Inter-departmental Working Group on Clean Shorelines (later revamped as the Inter-departmental Working Group on Marine Environmental Management, “the Working Group”) led by ENB in 2012, a series of Government actions have been scaled up to prevent refuse from entering the marine environment and keep the shorelines clean. Visible improvements in shoreline cleanliness were seen and acknowledged in the recent years.

31. The Government noted PAC’s emphasis on the need for a specific and measurable performance target, as well as a shared vision and timetable among the member departments of the Working Group for improving the cleanliness of shorelines. EPD is exploring with other member departments on setting a specific and measurable performance target for monitoring the progress of their collaborative efforts in the coming years. Draft proposals will be put up for the Working Group’s consideration.

32. As regards the recommendation of assigning a department to take up the responsibility to ensure the cleanliness of the shoreline areas which do not fall within the purview of any bureau/department (such as the back-of-beach areas beyond the high water mark), its feasibility and cost-effectiveness has been reviewed by the Task Force on Marine Refuse (TFMR) under the Working Group in July 2021. It was agreed that where there are refuse accumulation problems at individual remote or back-of-beach areas which cannot be resolved in regular clean-up procedures, EPD will continue to coordinate targeted in-depth clean-up operations with joint departmental efforts to deal with them, which is considered a practical and effective approach.

33. At the TFMR meeting, the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD), the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) and the Food Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) have agreed to adopt EPD’s Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System in assessing the cleanliness conditions of their respective service locations.

34. With the established mechanism of the Working Group, member departments, including EPD, AFCD, LCSD and FEHD, are working together, with the help of MD and Mainland authorities, to implement the recommendations raised by Audit and PAC. The progress made on actions taken by the Government is set out in Enclosure 2.

### **Chapter 3 – Efforts of the Home Affairs Department in facilitating building management**

35. The Government accepts the findings and recommendations made by Audit and PAC on efforts of the Home Affairs Department (HAD) in facilitating building management.

36. HAD assists owners of private buildings to form owners' corporations (OCs) under the Building Management Ordinance (Cap. 344) (BMO) and provides various support services on building management. While other bureaux and departments regulate different building-related areas such as building safety and fire safety in accordance with relevant legislation, HAD has all along been working closely with them to provide assistance to owners/residents of private buildings and to promote the available financial subsidies and technical assistance relating to building maintenance and repair<sup>1</sup>.

37. HAD has taken proactive actions to follow up on the recommendations. The progress made is reported below.

#### ***Support services for the formation of OCs***

##### ***Building Management Professional Advisory Service Scheme (BMPASS)***

38. Audit and PAC have made a number of recommendations on the implementation of BMPASS<sup>2</sup>. Among others, PAC suggested that community organisations should be engaged under BMPASS to reach out to the owners of “three-nil” buildings<sup>3</sup>.

39. In this regard, HAD has conducted a review taking into account the experience of the past three phases of BMPASS, as well as Audit's and PAC's recommendations. HAD will take on board PAC's recommendation and plans to implement a pilot scheme (hereinafter referred as “the Pilot Scheme”) to engage community organisations/non-governmental organisations with experience in

---

<sup>1</sup> For example, HAD has been hosting the Central Platform on Building Management regularly since 2018, where representatives of relevant departments and organisations are invited to introduce their support services. More recently, HAD is assisting the Security Bureau and the Fire Services Department in the procurement of portable firefighting equipment (i.e. fire extinguishers and fire blankets), which will be distributed to owners/residents of “three-nil” buildings in three pilot districts (i.e. Tsim Sha Tsui, Kowloon City and Yau Tsim Mong) through the relevant District Fire Safety Committees.

<sup>2</sup> Phase 3 of the pilot BMPASS was completed in December 2020. HAD will regularise the scheme and continue to provide assistance to “three-nil” buildings.

<sup>3</sup> “Three-nil” buildings refer to buildings which do not have OCs or any form of residents' organisations, or do not engage property management companies.

building management or related fields to provide BMPASS services to owners of “three-nil” buildings. As recommended by PAC, the Pilot Scheme seeks to leverage on the extensive network of community organisations in reaching out to owners of “three-nil” buildings, and in doing so, encourage the formation of OCs and improve the success rate of OC formation under BMPASS.

40. While details of the Pilot Scheme are being developed, we intend to launch the scheme on a district basis, according priority to those districts with more “three-nil” buildings, and cover all eligible “three-nil” buildings in the districts concerned. Appropriate performance indicators (e.g. the number of OCs to be formed) would be set to assess the performance of the community organisations engaged. Moreover, we are exploring measures to gauge users’ feedback in a more effective manner, such as engaging professional polling firms, designing different sets of questionnaire for different target groups and adopting other means of collecting feedback.

41. In response to Audit’s and PAC’s recommendation to ascertain the number of buildings eligible for BMPASS and maintain relevant statistics, HAD has taken steps to gather updated information on buildings. Specifically, HAD has requested District Building Management Liaison Teams (DBMLTs) to review the information on the “three-nil” buildings in their districts and update their status for reporting to the headquarters (HQ) regularly. HAD issued guidelines in July 2021 to assist DBMLTs in identifying buildings with management committees (MCs) which are defunct or inactive and buildings which may not be able to form OCs in accordance with the BMO. DBMLTs are required to suitably record information about such MCs identified during their daily liaison and report the information to HQ regularly. We believe the above measures would facilitate the planning and assessment of buildings’ eligibility for HAD’s support services (including BMPASS).

#### *Resident Liaison Ambassadors (RLA) Scheme*

42. As regards the implementation of the RLA Scheme, HAD plans to set a higher RLA recruitment target for community organisations in the Pilot Scheme, with a view to having at least two RLAs for each “three-nil” building. HAD has also stepped up the promotion of the RLA Scheme. A set of newly designed poster and application form was produced in January 2021, which have been distributed to owners/residents through our daily liaison and on other occasions.

### ***Support services on other building management matters***

#### ***Support Services provided by DBMLTs***

43. HAD maintains close liaison with owners/management bodies of private buildings. In recognition of technological advancement and to enable DBMLTs to maintain closer and more frequent liaison with OCs by electronic means, HAD has since 2017 adopted a new performance indicator “liaison with owners/management bodies of private buildings”. As a result, physical visits to each and every building was no longer regarded as the only means of performing the building management liaison.

44. In light of Audit’s recommendation, HAD has reviewed the requirement on the frequency of liaison with private buildings. Starting from 2021, DBMLTs are required to conduct liaison with building management bodies of private buildings (e.g. OCs and Owners’ Committees) and “three-nil” buildings for an average of four times every year. Specifically, DBMLTs must conduct at least one time of liaison with each management body and conduct at least one physical visit to each “three-nil” building. The new requirement allows flexibility for DBMLTs to conduct more frequent liaison with buildings in need, while ensuring that all management bodies/“three-nil” buildings will be contacted at least once every year.

45. In this respect, we have prepared and issued to DBMLTs a set of guidelines on the frequency of liaison. Having regard to Audit’s and PAC’s recommendations, the guidelines also touch on the issues of proper record keeping and procedures for conducting visit. In particular, it has been specified that DBMLTs should keep proper records of all liaison and complete a report for each visit conducted.

#### ***Training for Liaison Officers (LOs)***

46. To equip LOs with the necessary knowledge in discharging their building management duties, HAD has been providing them with training programmes and briefing sessions on a regular and need basis.

47. Having reviewed the training arrangements for LOs, consideration is being given to further enhancing the training for LOs who are newly-recruited or newly-posted to perform building management duties, whereas training programmes covering advanced topics will be available to more experienced staff members. Moreover, to encourage LOs to attend training, we will put in place a host of measures such as announcing the training schedule in advance, introducing a reminder system and issuing written appeal to the District Officers (DOs) regularly.

48. In addition, HAD updated the Operational Manual on Building Management for LOs in July 2021 to include, among others, the new requirements on the frequency of liaison and guidelines on record keeping and procedures for conducting visits as mentioned in paragraph 45 above. We will continue to provide LOs with adequate training and other reference materials to facilitate LOs to perform their building management duties.

#### *Educational and Publicity Programmes*

49. As regards Audit's recommendations in respect of the Central Platform on Building Management, HAD has expanded the geographical coverage of the briefing sessions, after taking into account the number of buildings issued with notices or repair orders in the districts concerned. On that basis, three districts (i.e. Sha Tin, Tuen Mun and Kwai Tsing) where no briefing was held in the past, will be covered in the programme in 2021. Moreover, HAD has adopted Audit's recommendation and made the briefing session available online regularly starting from 2021.

50. To equip MC members of OCs with the knowledge and skills to discharge their duties more effectively, HAD has since 2011 engaged tertiary institutions to provide structured training programmes, i.e. the LEAD Programme and Advanced LEAD Programme. While it may not be practicable to impose a mandatory requirement for MC members, who participate in the work of OCs and the programmes on a voluntary basis, to attend all the training sessions, HAD is exploring possible ways to encourage their participation as far as possible. For example, HAD is considering the possibility of organising make-up classes to better serve the needs of participants. On Audit's recommendation, HAD will also set the possession of a Statement of Attendance in the LEAD Programme as a prerequisite for nominating MC members to enrol in the Advanced LEAD Programme starting from the coming programme scheduled for the fourth quarter of 2021.

#### *Other administrative matters*

##### *Achievement of Performance Targets*

51. Taking into account Audit's recommendations, HAD has enhanced the monitoring mechanism to ensure that the target number of liaisons would be met. DBMLTs are required to report the progress of achieving the liaison target regularly. HQ will monitor the progress and issue reminders to the DBMLTs as appropriate. DOs have also been reminded to monitor the progress closely to ensure that the annual targets are met, and that they should provide an explanation for any failure to achieve the targets.

52. HAD has followed up the recommendations in respect of the reporting of educational and publicity programmes. As a general principle, the counting basis should take into account factors such as nature and content of the programme, the extent of outreach to target participants and the input of resources. To ensure a consistent approach will be adopted for each type of programme, HAD issued guidelines on the counting basis to DBMLTs in February 2021.

*Management of Database of Private Buildings*

53. Taking into account Audit's recommendations, HAD has taken steps to improve the accuracy of the database of private buildings. As mentioned in paragraph 45, LOs are required to complete a report upon completion of visit. The standard visit report requires LOs to indicate whether any updates to the database have been recorded, thereby reminding LOs to update the database.

*Progress made in implementing Audit's and PAC's recommendations*

Encl. 3      54. A summary of the progress made by HAD in implementing the recommendations of Audit and PAC is at Enclosure 3.

-----

**Collection and removal of marine refuse by the Marine Department  
Progress of Implementing Recommendations of the Audit and the PAC**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Administration of marine refuse cleansing and disposal contracts</b>		
<p>Paras. 2.7(a) and (b) of the Audit Report</p> <p>Page 30 of the PAC Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should investigate the significant discrepancies between the quantities of municipal solid waste disposed of by the contractor as per records of the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) and the quantities of marine refuse collected as reported in the Marine Department (MD)'s Controlling Officer's Reports (CORs) during the period from 2012 to 2019, and based on the investigation results, take measures to ensure the proper reporting of the quantity of marine refuse collected.</p> <p>PAC has recommended that MD should consider using the actual weight of marine refuse disposed of by MD's contractor as per EPD's records for reporting in MD's CORs, with a view to reporting the quantity of marine refuse collected in a more accurate and consistent manner.</p>	<p>MD has investigated the cause of the discrepancies. The discrepancies arose from the different measurement methods adopted by the two departments. EPD's records were based on the actual weight of the municipal solid waste disposed of by the contractor at landfills and refuse transfer stations while MD estimated the quantities of marine refuse collected by volume (in terms of number of bags) and converted the estimated volume into tonnes. With the consent of the Environment Bureau (ENB), MD has instructed the contractor to measure the quantity of refuse collected from the sea and vessels by volume in cubic metres starting from 1 January 2021, which follows the practice recommended in the "Consolidated Guidance for Port Reception Facility Providers and Users" promulgated by the International Maritime Organization. In the 2021-22 Estimates, MD has included remarks in its COR to clarify the reporting methodology used in the estimation of marine refuse collected and the adoption of new reporting methodology starting from 1 January 2021.</p> <p>To ensure the accuracy of the statistics provided by the contractor, MD officers have since 1 January 2021 conducted monthly surprise checks on the refuse handling procedures adopted by the contractor, including checking whether the contractor has used designated containers for carrying marine refuse and recorded the quantity of marine</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>refuse collected when handling marine refuse at the four marine refuse collection points (MRCPs).</p> <p>As investigation and follow-up actions have been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Page 30 of the PAC Report	MD should further review whether it is effective and meaningful to merely rely on the performance indicator “the quantity of marine refuse collected” for stakeholders to evaluate MD’s cost-effectiveness in deploying resources to collect and remove marine refuse, and should explore other quantitative performance indicators which are more effective in assessing the contractor’s performance.	MD is actively exploring the adoption of other performance indicators to demonstrate the effectiveness of the marine refuse cleansing work in the CORs. In addition, MD is examining ways to include other quantitative indicators to monitor the performance of the contractor more effectively, during its review of tender documents of the service contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters. The review of the tender documents is expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2022.
Para. 2.15(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should clearly specify the arrangement for charges incurred in refuse disposal at refuse transfer stations for tender exercises in future.	<p>When inviting tenders for the contract for Tai Po District in 2018, MD has already clearly stipulated in the relevant tender documents that all costs related to marine refuse disposal were to be borne by the contractor. In future tender documents of the contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters, MD will also specify clearly that refuse disposal costs shall be borne by the contractor.</p> <p>MD will state that refuse disposal costs shall be borne by the contractor during its review of tender documents for the service contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters. The review of the tender documents is expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2022.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Paras. 2.15(b) and (c) of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should –</p> <p>(b) remind the contractor to maintain proper records of the attendance and daily log books proving deployment of the vehicles and their work, and review such records periodically; and</p> <p>(c) take appropriate follow-up actions with the contractor so that Vehicle 1 will not be used for purposes other than transporting marine refuse.</p>	<p>MD requested the contractor to strictly comply with the requirement of maintaining records of vehicle attendance and daily log books from August 2020 onwards, and the contractor has provided and will continue to provide such records to MD each month for regular inspection.</p> <p>In February 2021, MD reached an agreement with the contractor that Vehicle 1 (i.e. main vehicle used for transporting marine refuse) should not be used for purposes other than transporting marine refuse.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis/has been completed, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Paras. 2.21(a) and (b) of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should strengthen the control on sub-contracting arrangement and ensure that all sub-contracting arrangements are properly approved in future.</p>	<p>At present, sub-contracting under the contracts for the whole of Hong Kong waters and Tai Po District is permitted only with MD's approval. MD has reminded the contractor to strictly follow the terms and conditions in the contracts in future, and has also required the contractor to provide documents of sub-contracting for approval before any sub-contracting commences in future. Should there be any breaches in the contractual requirements again, MD will promptly investigate and take necessary actions such as imposing penalties as per the terms of contracts and claiming against the contractor for administration costs arisen. The incident will also be properly recorded in writing.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<p>Para. 2.26 of the Audit Report</p> <p>Pages 32, 33, 35 and 39 of the PAC Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should explore measures to enhance the tender competition of the marine refuse cleansing and disposal services in future, taking into account the comments of the Central Tender Board.</p> <p>PAC urges that MD –</p> <p>(a) before the expiry of the two contracts for the whole of Hong Kong waters and Tai Po District in September 2022, should conduct cost analysis to compare the relative costs of adding special service requirements for Tai Po District in the contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters and issuing an additional contract for Tai Po District;</p> <p>(b) should conduct a comprehensive review on the content of the current contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters before it expires in September 2022 in order to identify ways to reduce the contract price; and</p> <p>(c) should review the effectiveness of its marine refuse cleansing and disposal services on a regular basis with a view to achieving value for money and ensuring quality service delivery.</p>	<p>MD is conducting a comprehensive review on the tender of the next marine refuse cleansing and disposal contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters. During the review, MD will make reference to the recommendations of the Central Tender Board to enhance tender competition, including allowing a longer tender period for the tenderers to prepare proposals, shortening the contract period to allow more flexibility and allowing a longer gearing up period for successful tenderers to mobilise the necessary resources. MD will also consider other way such as splitting contract service areas and removing unnecessary contract service requirement to reduce the contract price, with the aim to achieve the most cost-effective tender award. The review is expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2022.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>PAC recommends that MD should –</p> <p>(a) explore further measures to enhance the competition in tendering exercises; and</p> <p>(b) explore various channels to attract new blood, in particular young people, to the marine refuse cleansing industry, in order to have more options in terms of contractors which can provide the relevant services.</p> <p>PAC requests MD to revert to the Committee the outcomes of its review on the marine refuse cleansing and disposal services.</p>	<p>MD will enhance its efforts in promoting the marine refuse cleansing industry during various promotional activities of the maritime industry, so as to encourage more workers, in particular young people, to join the marine refuse cleansing industry.</p>
<b>Part 3: Monitoring of marine refuse cleansing and disposal services</b>		
<p>Paras. 3.19(a) and (b) of the Audit Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should –</p> <p>(a) take measures to ensure that the required frequency of daily cleanliness patrols for each patrol area is met; and</p> <p>(b) take into account the number of service requests received in selecting patrol areas for conducting daily cleanliness patrols.</p>	<p>MD has strengthened its monitoring work from November 2020 onwards by reviewing the frequency of patrols conducted for each area in the middle of each month. Whenever it is identified that an area has not been arranged with any patrol, officers will be deployed for conducting patrols in the area concerned at the earliest opportunity.</p> <p>MD has amended the relevant guidelines on selection of patrol areas for conducting daily cleanliness patrols. Reference will be made to the nature and numbers of service requests/complaints received by a particular area in arranging deployment.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>From November 2020 onwards, the frequency of daily cleanliness patrols for each area has met the required level.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<p>Paras. 3.19(c) and (d) of the Audit Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should –</p> <p>(c) step up the monitoring of the contractor's marine refuse cleansing work with a view to meeting the performance standards of the contracts; and</p> <p>(d) take measures to ensure that service requests made by the public are responded to in a timely manner and up to service requirements in accordance with the contract provisions.</p>	<p>Upon receipt of marine refuse reports, MD will instruct the contractor to clean up the water area concerned. Upon the contractor's completion of the cleansing work, where circumstances permit, MD officers will inspect the cleanliness condition of the water area concerned. In case the cleanliness condition is still unsatisfactory after the cleansing work, MD will instruct the contractor to allocate resources and manpower to strengthen the cleansing work until the cleanliness condition is up to the standard as stipulated in the contract.</p> <p>In addition, MD will conduct surprise checks on the priority areas including typhoon shelters during patrols to ensure the sea surface cleanliness condition is up to the standard as stipulated in the contract. MD will inform the contractor to clean up any water areas found to be of unsatisfactory cleanliness condition.</p> <p>Under certain circumstances, for instance, after typhoons and rainstorms, or when floating refuse is accumulated between mooring vessels where it is difficult or impossible to reach, the contractor may need a longer time than the time limit as specified in the contract to reinstate the sea surface cleanliness condition. MD has already reminded the contractor to keep the</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>department informed in case the cleansing work cannot be completed within the specified time limit due to such circumstances, and to continue the cleansing work until it is completed.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Page 33 of the PAC Report	<p>PAC urges MD to –</p> <p>(d) step up the monitoring of the performance of the contractor and exercise its right under the two contracts to impose penalties against the contractor as and when appropriate; and</p> <p>(e) require its staff to provide and document justifications properly for cases where imposing penalties for the breaches of conditions by the contractor is not recommended.</p>	<p>MD has reminded the contractor to strictly follow the terms and conditions in the contracts in future. Should there be any breaches in the contract requirements again, MD will promptly investigate and take necessary actions such as imposing penalties as per the terms of contracts and claiming against the contractor for administration costs arisen. The incident will also be recorded in writing.</p> <p>MD has also reminded its staff to provide and document justifications properly for cases where imposing penalties for the breaches of conditions by the contractor is not recommended.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 3.19(e) of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should take appropriate follow-up actions with the contractor on the issue of vessel licensing, and take measures to ensure that only vessels with appropriate licences are deployed for marine refuse cleansing work.</p>	<p>Upon receipt of the Audit Report, MD instructed the contractor to stop using non-compliant vessels in conducting marine refuse cleansing work immediately. After further investigation, MD issued to the contractor two Performance Default Notices under the contract for the whole of Hong Kong waters and one Performance Default Notice under the contract for Tai Po District in 2020.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>The contractor undertook not to use non-compliant vessels in conducting marine refuse cleansing work in future.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<p>Para. 3.28(a) of the Audit Report</p> <p>Page 38 of the PAC Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should take appropriate follow-up actions on the issues identified in paras. 3.24 and 3.25 with the contractor, and step up the monitoring of the management of the MRCPs with a view to ensuring that the performance of the contractor is up to the standards specified in the contracts.</p> <p>PAC urges MD to make more efforts to ensure strict compliance with the contractual requirements on the operation of MRCPs by the contractor, and conduct a review to assess the genuine need to retain MRCPs given their low utilisation.</p>	<p>From January 2021 onwards, MD has increased the frequency of conducting surprise checks to around eight to ten times at different MRCPs every month to ensure that the contractor has cleared the contents of temporary storage containers at the MRCPs every day as per the contractual requirements.</p> <p>MD has reminded the contractor to comply with the terms and conditions of the contracts. Should the contractor breach the relevant requirements again, MD will promptly investigate and take necessary actions such as imposing penalties as per the terms of contracts and claiming against the contractor for administration costs arisen. The incident will also be properly recorded in writing.</p> <p>Regarding the unsatisfactory hygiene conditions at Cha Kwo Ling MRCP, MD already instructed the contractor to improve its cleansing work. The contractor has arranged an on-site supervisor and taken immediate follow-up actions, including improving the hygiene conditions of the MRCPs, placing rodenticides and trapping devices at the MRCPs, emptying the temporary storage containers every day and regularly</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>submitting the loading and unloading records of refuse collection vehicles to MD for inspection.</p> <p>Ap Lei Chau MRCP is mainly used for handling marine refuse collected from the southern waters of Hong Kong. About 30% to 40% of marine refuse collected in Hong Kong was transported from Ap Lei Chau MRCP to disposal sites for disposal every year. This MRCP also provides essential support to the cleansing work of the southern waters of Hong Kong and the Aberdeen Typhoon Shelters by saving the travelling time taken by work boats to the other MRCPs in Hong Kong, especially during the typhoon season when more frequent cleansing work is required. Hence, there is a genuine need to retain this MRCP.</p> <p>Cha Kwo Ling MRCP is mainly used for handling marine refuse collected from the eastern waters of Hong Kong and has been in use since 1995. It has to be retained at this stage as about 20% to 30% of marine refuse collected in Hong Kong was transported from Cha Kwo Ling MRCP to disposal sites for disposal every year.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 3.28(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should review the need for the lifting appliances in the MRCPs in Cha Kwo Ling and Ap Lei Chau, and expedite the repair/replacement as appropriate.	Regarding the replacement of the lifting appliance in Ap Lei Chau MRCP, MD has co-ordinated with the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department (EMSD) and the replacement is expected to complete by November 2021. Before completion of the replacement,

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>the contractor will arrange refuse collection vessels equipped with lifting appliance to unload refuse into temporary storage containers.</p> <p>Cha Kwo Ling MRCP may have to be relocated in tandem with the development plan of the district. It will not be cost-effective to repair lifting appliance and then to demolish it shortly afterward. As the contractor has arranged refuse collection vessels equipped with lifting appliance for unloading refuse to the temporary storage containers, MD will not repair the lifting appliance in Cha Kwo Ling MRCP for the time being.</p>
<b>Part 4: Other related issues</b>		
<p>Paras. 4.9(a) to (c) of the Audit Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should –</p> <p>(a) consider arranging more anti-marine littering operations by officers in plain clothes to take enforcement actions;</p> <p>(b) take into consideration the source activities of marine refuse in planning enforcement operations; and</p> <p>(c) step up publicity campaign to curb illegal littering of cigarette butts into waters and shorelines.</p>	<p>To improve the effectiveness of the enforcement actions, about 30% of the anti-marine littering operations have been conducted by MD officers in plain clothes since 2021. During the operations, enforcement officers in plain clothes will patrol along coastal area and in locations of source activities of marine refuse, and take enforcement actions against marine littering.</p> <p>To raise public awareness of keeping the sea clean and reduce marine littering at source, the message of no disposal of cigarette butts into sea is now incorporated into the leaflet “We are one in keeping our harbour clean”. MD has been distributing these new leaflets to the public since 2021.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>



<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
Para. 4.14 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should regularly review the information provided on the "Clean Shorelines" website with a view to ensuring that the information relating to MD's marine refuse cleansing work provided on the website is accurate and up-to-date.	<p>The "Clean Shorelines" website is managed by EPD. MD follows EPD's requirement to review and update information related to MD in the website quarterly. When there are material changes to MD's work that could lead to any change of the information on the website, MD will proactively review and update the content of the website as necessary, so that members of the public may get hold of the latest information.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 4.21(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should expedite completion of the trial run of floating booms to tackle marine refuse as soon as practicable.	<p>MD placed floating booms in the Western District Public Cargo Working Area and the Kwun Tong Typhoon Shelter in October and November 2020 respectively to test the effectiveness of intercepting marine refuse in different waters. The test result showed that floating booms can effectively intercept floating refuse in calm and sheltered waters. In light of the positive outcome, MD has placed floating booms in Kwun Tong Typhoon Shelter to intercept floating refuse since March 2021.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
Para. 4.21(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Marine should keep in view the development of innovation and technology in tackling marine refuse.	MD has also enhanced the monitoring of sea surface cleanliness with the assistance of drones starting from April 2021.
Page 33 of the PAC Report	PAC urges MD to explore the wider use of information technology to facilitate its work in tackling marine refuse, particularly in respect of the submission of marine refuse collection records by the contractor, referral of service requests/complaints to the contractor for follow-up and the monitoring of daily cleanliness patrols conducted by patrol officers of MD.	<p>MD will continue to explore with the contractor the wider application of information technology and will proactively consider any possible options which may enhance its work in tackling marine refuse.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions are being implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

-----

**Government's efforts in tackling shoreline refuse  
Progress of Implementing PAC and Audit's Recommendations**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Monitoring of shoreline cleanliness by Environmental Protection Department</b>		
Para. 2.19 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Environmental Protection (DEP) should –</p> <p>(a) draw on the experience of the in-house inspections in monitoring contractors' inspections of coastal sites and reporting of inspection results;</p>	<p>The service contractors are required to submit an inspection report with photos taken upon completion of each coastal inspection within the specified time. EPD staff will draw on their experience to review the cleanliness grading, inspection coverage and other information in the report. In case of discrepancy between the contractor's report and EPD staff's finding, the contractor has to re-conduct inspections at each location in accordance with the contractual requirements. EPD will also conduct on-site surprise checks from time to time to ensure that the contractors have carried out coastal inspections as required under the service contracts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) consider disseminating of updated information on cleanliness conditions of coastal sites through the dedicated Clean Shorelines website; and</p>	<p>EPD has uploaded the average cleanliness grading of the marine refuse priority sites (priority sites) onto the Clean Shorelines website, and will update the information on a quarterly basis.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) continue to keep in view the need for updating the coastal sites in the shoreline cleanliness monitoring programme and make use of Unmanned Aircraft System (UAS) inspections (currently under trial) to supplement on-site inspections when reviewing the site monitoring contract requirements in future.	<p>EPD has completed a review of the priority sites and updated the list of the sites in April 2021, covering seven newly added sites and 26 existing ones. In future, EPD will continue to keep in view the need for updating the list of sites in the shoreline cleanliness monitoring programme.</p> <p>Given that the trial has confirmed the advantages of utilising UAS for shoreline inspection, EPD will continue to deploy UAS to supplement on-site inspections as appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 2.26 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DEP should draw on the experience in the pork hock incident to update the Protocol for Handling Surge of Marine Refuse (the Protocol), where appropriate.	<p>Upon agreement reached in the Inter-departmental Working Group on Marine Environmental Management (the Working Group), EPD updated the Protocol in February 2021, which enables EPD to activate the Protocol when “an abnormal amount of a substance” (in addition to the original five specific scenarios) is spotted in the sea or at coastal areas of Hong Kong to facilitate more structured responses by relevant departments.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 6: Other related issues</b>		
Para. 6.11 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DEP should –</p> <p>(a) continue to encourage the use of marine refuse data cards during clean-up events;</p>	<p>EPD has enhanced communications with the public and community groups to encourage them to make use of marine refuse data cards for all voluntary clean-up events since January 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) remind the contractor of social media pages to report accurate figures in the monthly analytical reports; and</p>	<p>EPD has reminded the contractor to ensure the reported figures are accurate.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(c) arrange for the Working Group to consider appropriate ways to gauge public views on shoreline cleanliness at a future opportune time.</p>	<p>In the prevailing state of the Coronavirus Disease 2019 pandemic and social distancing practice, EPD has been utilising the interactive functions of social media pages to actively communicate with the public on matters related to marine refuse. Appropriate means of gauging public views on shoreline cleanliness will be launched at a post-pandemic opportunity.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 63 (Page 68) of the PAC Report	<p>PAC urges that the ENB should –</p> <p>(a) set specific measurable performance target and timetable for improving shoreline cleanliness, for example, set a target and timetable for achieving “Grade 1 - Clean” of the Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System devised by EPD in more coastal sites;</p>	<p>EPD has been exploring options of setting specific measurable and representative performance targets to reflect improvements in shoreline cleanliness. EPD will put up proposals for discussion at the Working Group.</p>
	<p>(b) assign a department to take up the responsibility to ensure the cleanliness of the shoreline areas which do not fall within the purview of any bureau/department (B/D); and</p>	<p>The feasibility and cost-effectiveness of assigning a department to take up the responsibility to ensure the cleanliness of the shoreline areas which do not fall within the purview of any B/D was discussed at the Task Force on Marine Refuse (TFMR) under the Working Group meeting in July 2021. In general, the Food Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD), the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) and Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) are responsible for cleaning different sections of shorelines within their purview. Where there are refuse accumulation problems at individual back-of-beach areas (i.e. the adjacent land beyond high water mark) which cannot be resolved in regular clean-up procedure, EPD will continue with its role to coordinate targeted in-depth clean-up operations with joint departmental efforts, which is considered a practical and effective approach.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) explore the wider use of information technology to facilitate member departments' work in tackling shoreline refuse.	<p>EPD and the member departments of the Working Group have adopted various types of technologies, e.g. UAS and 360-degree cameras, to monitor shoreline cleanliness condition. They will keep exploring the potential application of new technologies to tackle marine refuse problems.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 63 (Page 69) of the PAC Report	PAC urges that ENB should require AFCD, LCSD and FEHD to adopt the same standard in the Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System in assessing the cleanliness conditions of their respective service locations.	<p>At the TFMR meeting, AFCD, LCSD and FEHD have agreed to adopt EPD's Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System in assessing the cleanliness conditions of their respective service locations.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 63 (Pages 69 to 70) of the PAC Report	<p>PAC urges that EPD should –</p> <p>(a) be alert to significant environmental incidents in neighbouring regions and implement the Protocol with flexibility and in a more vigilant and sensible manner; and</p>	<p>EPD has been using the “alert function” of internet search engines (Google and Baidu) to keep track of and gather media reports on marine environmental incidents occurring in Guangdong.</p> <p>EPD has been implementing the Protocol in a vigilant and sensible manner. The updated Protocol (regarding response to para. 2.26 of the Audit Report) allows EPD to activate it when “an abnormal amount of a certain substance” (in addition to the original five specific scenarios) is spotted in the sea or at coastal areas of Hong Kong. This facilitates a more structured response by relevant departments.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.
	(b) improve collaboration with the Mainland authority under the existing regional notification and alert mechanism for better handling of similar incidents in future.	<p>Apart from the Hong Kong-Guangdong Notification Mechanism on Marine Refuse, EPD and the Mainland authorities have established channels to communicate on matters related to marine refuse incidents and abnormal amount of certain substance in the sea or at coastal areas of Hong Kong.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 64 (Page 73) of the PAC Report	<p>PAC recommends EPD to –</p> <p>(a) make effective use of UAS inspection and helicopter aerial surveillance to supplement on-site inspection so as to better monitor the cleanliness conditions of shorelines; and</p>	<p>EPD has been deploying UAS to supplement on-site inspections in a trial project since May 2020 and using helicopters to conduct wide-area inspection since March 2017. Given the trial has confirmed advantages of utilizing UAS for shoreline inspection, EPD will continue to deploy both helicopters and UAS flexibly to supplement on-site inspections.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(b) upload the updated photos of the 119 coastal sites onto the Clean Shorelines website for public inspection more frequently.	<p>EPD uploaded photos showing the cleanliness condition of the updated priority sites onto the Clean Shorelines website in July 2021. EPD will continue to upload the updated photos on a quarterly basis.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 64 (Page 78) of the PAC Report	PAC urges EPD to enhance its educational and promotion work to increase the public awareness of reducing marine refuse.	<p>EPD has been promoting the message of keeping the shorelines clean through the "Clean Shorelines" thematic website, social media pages and other publicity and educational activities including coastal cleanup activities. EPD will continue to enhance these efforts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Clean-up operations by Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department</b>		
Para. 3.8 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC) should –</p> <p>(a) improve the inspection reporting requirements of cleansing services;</p>	<p>AFCD has implemented the new Guidelines for Monitoring Cleansing Services for Marine Parks and Marine Reserve (the Guidelines) since January 2021, with improvement in reporting of cleansing service inspections. Appropriate guidance and training have been provided to relevant frontline and supervisory staff.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) take effective follow-up actions on cases of suspected absence from duty of contractors' staff and specify a minimum inspection frequency for AFCD staff;</p>	<p>The Guidelines require B/Ds to record follow-up actions on abnormalities in the Inspection Form. It has also set a minimum inspection frequency.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(c) consider the merit of requiring AFCD staff to verify the quantity of marine refuse reported by the contractors, such as test counting the refuse; and</p>	<p>AFCD has strengthened the arrangement by conducting regular test-counting spot-checks to verify the quantity of marine refuse in accordance with the requirements stated in the Guidelines.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(d) take measures to enhance monitoring of contractors' work, including –</p> <p>(i) issuing guidelines on the assessment of the quality of services of the contractors;</p>	<p>The Guidelines have specified that the Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System used by EPD would be adopted for assessment of the quality of contractors' services.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(ii) requiring contractors to provide additional evidence on the work performed by the contractors' staff, e.g. digital images and video clips before and after completion of the cleansing service; and	<p>AFCD has added requirements in new cleansing contracts that the contractor has to provide photos or video clips before and after the completion of services for checking by AFCD.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(iii) requiring contractors to report the arrival and departure times of their staff for each cleansing operation in future contracts.	<p>AFCD has added requirements in new cleansing contracts that the contractor has to report the arrival and departure times of their staff for checking by AFCD.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 3.22 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) in consultation with MD, consider improving the salvage operation of large floating objects found in the Marine Parks and Marine Reserve;</p>	<p>The matter was discussed at the meeting of the Working Group in January 2021, and MD agreed to render support and assistance as appropriate when AFCD encounters difficulties in removing large floating objects found in the Marine Parks and Marine Reserve.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(b) strengthen the monitoring of contractor's work in cleaning up back-of-beach area of Lung Kwu Chau and improve contract provisions on the frequency of shoreline refuse collection and documentation of evidence (e.g. taking photographs and/or video clips) after completion of each clean-up work in similar cleansing contractors in future;	<p>AFCD has strengthened the monitoring of contractor's work in cleaning up the back-of-beach area of Lung Kwu Chau. The Guidelines have introduced requirements of including frequency of shoreline refuse collection and documentation of evidence in the back-of-beach cleansing contracts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) review the effectiveness of the ad hoc cleansing services at back-of-beach area of Lung Kwu Chau and report to the Working Group;	<p>It was agreed at the Working Group meeting in January 2021 that AFCD would conduct a clean-up operation on areas of concern in back-of-beach once a year. In view of the level of refuse accumulation onsite in recent years and scarce visitors there, such an arrangement is considered appropriate. AFCD will monitor the situation and report to the Working Group.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) explore effective measures in removing refuse located at the back-of-beach area of Lung Kwu Chau not covered by the existing contract and seek the steer of the Working Group where appropriate; and	<p>It was agreed at the Working Group meeting in January 2021 that AFCD would hire a contractor to conduct a one-off special clean-up operation at the subject site with the assistance of EPD. The specialist contractor hired by AFCD completed the clean-up work in March 2021.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.
	(e) take prompt actions to improve the cleanliness of the Brothers Marine Park and consider the need for increasing the cleansing frequency.	<p>AFCD has increased the cleansing frequency since November 2020 to improve the cleanliness of the Brothers Marine Park. AFCD will monitor the situation and consider further increasing the cleansing frequency if necessary.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 63 (Page 70) of the PAC Report	PAC urges that AFCD should develop a mechanism for better handling of large floating objects found in Marine Parks/Marine Reserve in future.	Please see the above response to para. 3.22(a) of the Audit Report.
Para. 64 (Page 75) of the PAC Report	<p>PAC recommends that AFCD should –</p> <p>(a) consider introducing penalty clauses in future cleansing contracts to deter contractors from breaching the terms of the contracts;</p>	<p>AFCD will add a clause in all future relevant contracts to specify that willful provision of false attendance record may be regarded as a breach of the contract and subject to termination of the contract.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(b) ensure that its staff will closely monitor the performance of cleansing contractors and take effective follow-up actions against non-compliance with contract requirements by contractors; and	<p>AFCD has implemented the Guidelines since January 2021 which include a standardised Inspection Form for better documentation of inspection records as well as the findings of abnormalities and the relevant follow-up actions by AFCD staff. Appropriate guidance and training have been provided to relevant staff. The monitoring team, including frontline and supervisory staff, conducts regular meetings to review the performance of cleansing contractors and ensure effective follow-up actions have been taken.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) consider further increasing the cleaning frequency of Marine Parks and Marine Reserve if necessary to ensure cleanliness of such areas.	<p>AFCD has increased the cleansing frequency in the Brothers Marine Park since November 2020 to improve its cleanliness. AFCD will monitor the situation in other Marine Parks and Marine Reserve and consider further increasing the cleansing frequency as appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 4: Clean-up Operations by Leisure and Cultural Services Department</b>		
Para. 4.16 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (DLCS) should –</p> <p>(a) consider incorporating into the cleansing contracts performance standards on cleanliness condition of beaches;</p>	<p>LCSD will make reference to the existing Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System of EPD and incorporate the performance standards on cleanliness conditions of beaches into the tenders for new cleansing service contracts. It is expected the performance standards will be incorporated into the new cleansing service contracts of beaches to be commenced in 2022 and 2023.</p> <p>As an interim measure before the commencement of new cleansing service contracts, LCSD disseminated the information of the existing Shoreline Cleanliness Grading System of EPD to all beaches in January 2021 to provide reference for the management staff of beaches in monitoring the cleanliness of beaches.</p>
	<p>(b) ensure that the results of special cleansing operations are reported to the Working Group and TFMR;</p>	<p>In addition to the regular monthly reports on the statistical data on shoreline refuse (including the refuse weight, complaint data, photos showing the cleanliness of priority sites, etc.), LCSD took the initiative to report to the Working Group and TFMR on special cleansing operations starting from January 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) improve the accuracy of management information on special cleansing operation statistics for reporting to the Working Group and TFMR;	<p>LCSD has reviewed the method adopted for counting the number of special cleansing operations and in January 2021 disseminated the information about statistical methods to all beaches for reference to ensure the provision of a more accurate number of operations.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) tighten controls on the provision of additional workers for cleansing work of beaches; and	<p>LCSD's current Contract Management Manual has already listed out the matters requiring attention when requiring contractors to provide additional services under the contracts, including the justifications for such requirements and relevant records of certification. LCSD issued an email to all beaches in January 2021 reminding the management staff to manage requests of providing additional cleansing services by contractors in accordance with the established contract management mechanism.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(e) improve the accuracy of shoreline refuse data, including –</p> <p>(i) formulation of guidelines on how to classify, count and weigh refuse collected; and</p>	<p>LCSD has reviewed and aligned the classification method of shoreline refuse at beaches, and drew reference from EPD's definition specifying that refuse collected from water area up to</p>



Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>the high tide mark of the sand area would be classified as shoreline refuse. Information on aligning the definition of shoreline refuse was issued to all beaches in January 2021. Regarding the estimation of the weight of refuse, LCSD has made reference to the actual weight of each bag of refuse as the basis and standardised the estimated weight of every bag of shoreline refuse as ten kilograms since February 2021. The estimated weight will be reviewed every year. Moreover, LCSD has been reporting to the Working Group on the data on the refuse on shark prevention nets since October 2020 to attain more accurate statistics on the shoreline refuse collected.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(ii) monitor and investigate the abnormal fluctuations in shoreline refuse data collected.	<p>LCSD has strengthened monitoring the accuracy of shoreline refuse data at both the district and headquarters levels. An email was sent in January 2021 reminding the management staff of all beaches to monitor and examine the abnormal data on shoreline refuse.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 63 (page 71) of the PAC Report	PAC urges LCSD to strengthen the controls on the provision of additional workers and ensure that the requests for additional cleansing workers are fully justified, with justifications being properly documented and authorized.	Please see the above response to para. 4.16(d) of the Audit Report.
<b>Part 5: Clean-up Operations by Food and Environmental Hygiene Department</b>		
Para. 5.10(a) of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene (DFEH) should –</p> <p>(a) update the guidelines for assessing the cleanliness level achieved by the contractor;</p>	<p>FEHD has put in place guidelines for monitoring the performance of contractors. After review, the guidelines have been revised to set a benchmark on the level of cleanliness. The level of cleanliness that the contractor should achieve has been illustrated by photos and descriptions and laid down in the contract with effect from in June 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) remind FEHD's supervisory staff to comply with the monitoring requirements of FEHD's Operational Manual (OM); and</p>	<p>FEHD reminds its supervisory staff from time to time to comply with the monitoring requirements of its OM, and has already consolidated the relevant guidelines in a new separate chapter in the OM promulgated in March 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
	(c) lay down procedures for estimating the quantity of shoreline refuse collected.	<p>FEHD has laid down procedures for the contractor to provide a more accurate assessment of the quantity of shoreline refuse collected (i.e. using scale or weighting devices).</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para 5.14 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DFEH should step up efforts in monitoring the cleanliness of priority sites and strengthen the supervision on the contractor's work.	<p>FEHD will continue to install 360-degree cameras at remote areas including the priority sites under its purview to closely monitor the accumulation of shorelines refuse and mount clean-up operations according to the actual ground situation.</p> <p>After review, FEHD has revised the guidelines and set a benchmark on the level of cleanliness. The level of cleanliness that the contractor should achieve has been illustrated by photos and descriptions and laid down in the contract.</p> <p>FEHD is revamping the Contract Management System to help supervisory staff comply with the monitoring requirements as stated in the OM.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para 5.24 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DFEH should –</p> <p>(a) in consultation with the Department of Justice (DoJ) as appropriate, consider splitting the territory-wide clean-up service contract into different Districts Groups and imposing a restriction to the effect that the contracts cannot be awarded to a single contractor in future, taking due consideration of the prevailing market condition; and</p>	<p>In consultation with DoJ, FEHD has imposed a restriction in the new contract with effect from June 2021 to avoid having the same contractor provide cleansing services for more than one district group.</p> <p>Cleansing contracts across the territory are currently split into two district groups. FEHD will keep this under review and adjust district grouping where necessary based on experience and operational needs as far as practicable.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) make realistic estimation of clean-up services hours for inclusion in future contracts as far as practicable.</p>	<p>FEHD has collected and made use of information on the actual hours spent by the contractor for completing the clean-up service, in order to come up with a more realistic estimate of the clean-up service hours for inclusion in the contract with effect from June 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 63 (Page 71) of the PAC Report	<p>PAC urges that although awarding more than one contract to a single contractor is undesirable from the perspectives of risk management and promotion of competition, FEHD should also take due consideration of the prevailing market conditions and strike a balance between competition</p>	<p>When contracts are put to tender in future, FEHD would consider whether to impose similar restrictions as appropriate, so as to avoid having the same contractor provide cleansing services for more than one district group. FEHD shall strike a balance between competition and efficiency,</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	and efficiency when deciding whether to impose the above restriction in future.	<p>and will take into account relevant factors including the prevailing market conditions, risk management to avoid over-reliance on a single contractor for centralised service delivery, the issue of perceived fairness, etc.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 64 (Page 78) of the PAC Report	PAC urges FEHD to consult DoJ for better handling of cases similar to Case 1 in future.	<p>FEHD shall consult the DoJ on handling similar cases as and when necessary.</p> <p>As the recommendation will be implemented on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 6: Other related issues</b>		
Para 6.18(a) of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DFEH should –</p> <p>(a) keep proper records on causes of malfunctioning of the camera system and follow-up actions taken; and</p>	<p>FEHD has reminded its staff to keep proper records of the causes of malfunctioning of the 360-degree camera systems and the follow-up actions taken. FEHD will continue to follow the established procedures in monitoring the operation of the camera systems on a daily basis.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) ascertain whether the contractor has achieved the service contract requirements and consider taking follow-up actions in case of non-compliance.	FEHD has reminded its supervisory staff from time to time to carefully monitor whether the contractor has achieved the service contract requirements and properly recorded the information in the daily and weekly

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 64 (Page 79) of the PAC Report	PAC urges FEHD to step up the monitoring of the performance of the contractor and impose penalties against the contractor as and when appropriate, with a view to deterring non-compliance with the terms of the contract.	<p>returns. Apart from an deduction of service charge, FEHD has incorporated default notice clauses in the contract with effect from May 2021. In case the contractor's performance is substandard (e.g. failing to provide images), FEHD may deduct service charge in the form of liquidated damages.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
	PAC recommends FEHD to seek advice from DoJ or the Office of the Privacy Commissioner for Personal Data on using the 360-degree camera system to facilitate the enforcement actions against shoreline littering.	As the priority sites installed with 360-degree cameras are remote and many are hard-to-reach, with low patronage and relatively fewer cases of littering offences, FEHD is studying whether the information collected by the 360-degree camera systems can facilitate enforcement actions against shoreline littering, and is seeking advice from DoJ on this.
<b>Part 5: Clean-up Operations by Food and Environmental Hygiene Department</b>		
Para. 5.25 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Immigration should continue to strengthen the checking procedures on conviction records against the Immigration Ordinance and remind the checking staff of the requirements of the relevant Financial Circular (e.g. FC No. 3/2019) that conviction under appeal should still be counted until it is quashed by the Court.	<p>The Immigration Department has conducted a comprehensive review on the relevant arrangement and strengthened the internal checking procedures. At the same time, a new instruction was issued to all staff concerned to ensure thorough understanding of the requirements in the relevant Financial Circular.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 6: Other related issues</b>		
Para. 6.23 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DAFC and DLCS should step up enforcement actions against marine littering.	<p>LCSD deploys additional manpower to carry out inspection at beaches during major festive celebrations, such as the Mid-Autumn Festival and Dragon Boat Races to closely monitor and improve the cleanliness of beaches. In normal circumstances, staff at beaches will first give verbal advice to offenders, who are in general cooperative. Staff at all beaches were reminded in January 2021 to step up enforcement actions against marine littering. Apart from verbal advice, enforcement actions will be taken when necessary for deterrent effect.</p> <p>AFCD conducts frequent and regular patrols to the Marine Parks/Marine Reserve for monitoring and enforcement (including littering). AFCD also promotes marine conservation and code of conduct to visitors who generally follow the rules (including no-littering). AFCD will continue to strengthen the relevant monitoring and enforcement effort as well as marine conservation education activities.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 6.32 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DLCS should –</p> <p>(a) in collaboration with the Director of Architectural Services and the Director of Electrical and Mechanical Services, expedite the installation of water dispensers in gazetted beaches; and</p>	<p>Most of LCSD's beaches are already provided with water dispensers or are under planning for provision of water dispensers. As at August 2021, 30 beaches of LCSD are provided with water dispensers. Among the 12 beaches not yet provided with</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>a water dispenser, installation works at two beaches, i.e. Ting Kau Beach and Hoi Mei Wan Beach will be completed within 2021; the installation works at other six beaches, including Gemini Beaches, Kwun Yam Beach, Cheung Chau Tung Wan Beach, Silver Mine Bay Beach, Anglers' Beach and Trio Beach are expected to be completed in 2022 and 2023. Due to the lack of infrastructure such as water supply or sewage disposal system, water dispensers cannot be provided at three beaches including Casam Beach, Kiu Tsui Beach and Hap Mun Bay Beach. As regards Rocky Bay Beach which is not provided with a beach building, associated ancillary facilities and lifesaving service, LCSD is assessing whether there is a need to provide water dispenser facilities there.</p>
	<p>(b) in planning the installation of new or replacement of existing water dispensers in gazetted beaches and other venues, consider adopting water filling stations or non-fountain type (i.e. bottle filling type) water dispensers.</p>	<p>LCSD updated the guidelines on the installation of water dispensers in February 2020, advising venues to first consider installing bottle filling type water dispensers or the type equipped with parts for filling of water in bottles in providing or replacing water dispensers.</p> <p>For the four beaches where the installation of water dispensers was completed by March 2021, bottle filling type water dispensers (including one water filling station and one fountain type water outlet) were installed in accordance with the guidelines. For the other eight beaches where the installation of water dispensers is expected to be completed from 2021 to 2023, bottle filling type water dispensers will be installed.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend this part be deleted from the next progress report.
Para. 64 (page 80) of the PAC Report	PAC urges LCSD to conduct a cost and benefit analysis for the installation of water dispensers at gazetted beaches and explore more effective measures to expedite the installation progress and lower the cost of installation.	<p>Provision of water dispensers at gazetted beaches, water sports centres and other leisure venues of LCSD is meant to provide better facilities to allow members of the public to drink water after exercising, rather than solely as a measure to promote environmental protection and prevent waste from entering the marine environment. From daily observations, quite a number of members of the public use water dispensers after swimming or exercising. Hence, there is a practical need for such provision. LCSD will render full support to the measures put forward by EPD in assessing the effectiveness of reducing shoreline refuse and explore with relevant departments the feasibility of cutting the lead time and costs of the works.</p> <p>LCSD will enhance liaison with the Architectural Services Department and EMSD to speed up the installation of water dispensers at gazetted beaches as far as practicable, and explore the feasibility of applying innovative technology in future. Besides, progress of installation works of new water dispensers at LCSD's leisure venues will be reported periodically to district management for the purposes of monitoring, so that issues cutting across departments may be discussed at the management level as necessary.</p>

-----

**Efforts of the Home Affairs Department in facilitating building management  
Progress in Implementing Audit's and PAC's Recommendations**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Support services for the formation of Owners' Corporations</b>		
<i><b>Implementation of Building Management Professional Advisory Service Scheme</b></i>		
Para. 2.27(a) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that the Director of Home Affairs (DHA) should ascertain the number of buildings eligible for Building Management Professional Advisory Service Scheme (BMPASS).	In view of the recommendations of the Audit and PAC, and to facilitate planning for support services (including BMPASS), the Headquarters (HQ) of HAD wrote to District Building Management Liaison Teams (DBMLTs) in December 2020 and May 2021 requesting them to review the number of "three-nil" buildings (i.e. buildings which do not have Owners' Corporations (OCs) or any form of residents' organisations, or do not engage property management companies) and provide an updated list of "three-nil" buildings in their districts. DBMLTs will update the list regularly.
Para. (d) in page 106 of the PAC Report	PAC has urged Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) and Home Affairs Department (HAD) to step up their efforts in taking forward BMPASS by maintaining a proper database on the number of buildings that should be covered under BMPASS and other related statistics for effective implementation of the scheme.	Separately, HAD HQ issued guidelines in July 2021 to help DBMLTs identify buildings with defunct or inactive management committees (MCs) (e.g. where no meetings have been held for a prolonged period of time, or no response has been provided to HAD's enquiries or phone calls, etc.), and buildings which may not be able to form OCs in accordance with the Building Management Ordinance (Cap 344) (BMO). DBMLTs will report the information to HQ regularly.

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<p>Para. 2.27(b) to (d) and (f) of the Audit Report</p>	<p>Audit has recommended that DHA should –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(b) review the basis of planning the geographical allocation of target buildings under BMPASS;</li> <li>(c) formulate measures to improve the success rate of forming/reactivating OCs under BMPASS, taking into account the difficulties encountered by the BMPASS Contractors;</li> <li>(d) review the level of performance targets for BMPASS Contractors with a view to enhancing the service level; and</li> <li>(f) perform a comprehensive review for mapping out the way forward for BMPASS, drawing lessons from the experiences gained in the three phases, and take into account the recommendations in this Audit Report in implementing BMPASS in future.</li> </ul>	<p>HAD has reviewed BMPASS, taking into account the experience of the past three phases of BMPASS, as well as Audit's and PAC's recommendations. HAD plans to implement a pilot scheme (hereinafter referred as "the Pilot Scheme") under the regularised BMPASS to engage community organisations/non-governmental organisations with experience in building management or related fields to provide BMPASS services to owners of "three-nil" buildings.</p> <p>The engagement of community organisations/non-governmental organisations would allow us to tap into their district network in reaching out to owners of "three-nil" buildings, thereby encouraging the formation of OCs and improving the success rate of OC formation under BMPASS.</p> <p>We intend to launch the Pilot Scheme on a district basis, with priority accorded to those districts with more "three-nil" buildings, and will cover all eligible "three-nil" buildings in the districts concerned. HAD is working on the details of the Pilot Scheme, including performance indicators for the community organisations/non-governmental organisations engaged.</p>
<p>Para. (a) to (c) and (f) in page 106 of the PAC Report</p>	<p>PAC has urged HAB and HAD to step up their efforts in taking forward BMPASS by –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) engaging community organisations, which have established an extensive network with local residents, in reaching out to the owners/residents of "three-nil" buildings;</li> </ul>	<p>on the details of the Pilot Scheme, including performance indicators for the community organisations/non-governmental organisations engaged.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(b) exploring various means, including mandatory and non-mandatory means, to drive and encourage the formation of OCs by owners of “three-nil” buildings;</p> <p>(c) setting attainable but reasonably challenging output targets for the regularised BMPASS with a view to improving the performance of the BMPASS contractors; and</p> <p>(f) conducting a comprehensive review for mapping out the way forward of BMPASS by drawing lessons from the experience gained from the three phases of the scheme as recommended in para. 2.27 of the Audit Report.</p>	
Para. 2.27(e) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should, in collaboration with the BMPASS Contractors, explore ways to encourage more users to give feedback via the users’ advisory meetings and the users’ satisfaction surveys.	To enhance service evaluation, HAD is exploring measures to gauge users’ feedback more effectively when introducing the Pilot Scheme. Some of the measures being considered include engaging professional polling firms to conduct opinion surveys, designing different sets of questionnaire for different target groups (e.g. service users, Resident Liaison Ambassadors (RLAs), residents not interested in using the service) and adopting other means of collecting feedback (e.g. conducting telephone interviews), etc.
Para. (e) in page 106 of the PAC Report	PAC has urged HAB and HAD to step up their efforts in taking forward BMPASS by further exploring more effective ways to gauge users’ views on BMPASS, particularly in respect of the questionnaire distribution method of the users’ satisfaction survey on the scheme.	

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b><i>Implementation of the Resident Liaison Ambassador Scheme</i></b>		
Para. 2.34 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DHA should –</p> <p>(a) step up efforts in recruiting RLAs, focusing on “three-nil” buildings with no incumbent RLAs; and</p>	<p>HAD plans to set a higher RLA recruitment target for community organisations/non-governmental organisations in the Pilot Scheme, such that there will be at least two RLAs for each “three-nil” building covered under the Pilot Scheme.</p>
	<p>(b) take measures to enhance publicity of the RLA Scheme with a view to encouraging more owners/residents to become RLAs.</p>	<p>To promote the recruitment of RLAs, a set of newly designed poster and application form was produced in January 2021. In addition to distributing the new forms to owners/residents through our daily liaison, the forms have also been made available on other occasions, e.g. when one-off cleaning service is provided to “three-nil” buildings to demonstrate good building management. HAD will continue to publicise the RLA Scheme.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Support services on other building management matters</b>		
<b><i>Support services provided by the District Building Management Liaison Teams</i></b>		
Para. 3.28(a) of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DHA should issue more guidelines to ensure that proper records are kept for the Pre-meeting Advisory Service for OCs provided by DBMLTs;</p>	<p>Taking into account Audit's recommendation, HAD issued in February 2021 new guidelines on record keeping for liaison conducted, including that under the Pre-meeting Advisory Service for OCs. Members of DBMLTs are required to record the service provided in the respective building files in the prescribed format. Moreover, District Officers (DOs) are required to assign an officer not lower</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>than the rank of Senior Liaison Officer to conduct regular random inspection to ensure the keeping of proper records.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 3.28(b) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should review the frequency of visits to private buildings by DBMLTs and revise the frequency requirement in the OM on Building Management for Liaison Officers (LOs) where appropriate, and set up a monitoring mechanism to ensure that the frequency requirement is met.	HAD has reviewed the requirements on the frequency of liaison. Starting from 2021, DBMLTs are required to conduct liaison with building management bodies of private buildings (e.g. OCs and Owners' Committees) and "three-nil" buildings for an average of four times every year. Specifically, DBMLTs must conduct at least one time of liaison with each management body and conduct at least one physical visit to each "three-nil" building every year.
Para. (a) in page 111 of the PAC Report	PAC has recommended that HAD should put in place a stringent mechanism to monitor the work performance of DBMLTs, and provide timely and appropriate advice to those persistently under-performing DBMLTs.	<p>The new requirement allows flexibility for DBMLTs to conduct more frequent liaison with buildings in need, while ensuring that all management bodies/"three-nil" buildings will be contacted at least once every year.</p> <p>To monitor progress, DBMLTs are required to regularly report the number of management bodies with liaison conducted, and the number of "three-nil" buildings with visit conducted. HAD HQ will monitor the number of liaison conducted by districts on a quarterly basis and issue reminders to the DBMLTs as appropriate to ensure accomplishment of the targets. DBMLTs will be requested to provide an explanation for any failure to achieve the targets.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>HAD prepared and issued to DBMLTs a set of guidelines in February 2021 on the relevant requirements.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 3.28(c) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should issue more guidelines to DBMLTs on the procedures of conducting visits (e.g. contacting the OC before conducting visits).	<p>Taking into account Audit's recommendations, HAD issued new guidelines in February 2021 to DBMLTs on the procedures for conducting visits, which include contacting the OCs concerned before conducting visits. LOs of DBMLTs are required to complete a report in a prescribed format for each visit conducted and submit it for endorsement by their supervisors.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
Para. 3.28(d) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should encourage LOs in DBMLTs to attend relevant training courses, and consider setting a training requirement for them.	With reference to Audit's and PAC's recommendations, HAD is reviewing the training arrangements for LOs. Consideration is being given to further enhancing the training for LOs who are newly-recruited or newly-posted to perform building management duties, whereas training programmes covering advanced topics will be available to more experienced staff members.
Para. (c) in page 111 of the PAC Report	PAC has recommended that HAD should consider setting out training requirements for LOs to ensure that they are equipped with sufficient and latest knowledge and skills required for performing their duties.	<p>To encourage LOs to attend training, HAD plans to put in place a host of measures such as announcing the training schedule in advance, introducing a reminder system and issuing written appeal to DOs regularly.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
Para. 3.28(e) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should continue to provide adequate training to LOs in DBMLTs on new services launched and new/revised guidelines published.	HAD will continue to provide LOs with training on new services launched and new/revised guidelines issued. For example, we organised a briefing session in April 2021 on record keeping and procedures for conducting visits.
Para. (d) in page 111 of the PAC Report	PAC has recommended that HAD should enhance the provision of dedicated training to LOs on the new services launched, in particular the mediation service for building management, which can better equip LOs with the necessary skills for quality service delivery.	As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Para. 3.28(f) of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should update the OM on Building Management for LOs more frequently.	HAD updated the OM on Building Management for LOs in July 2021 to include, among others, new requirements on the frequency of visits/liaison and guidelines on record keeping and procedures for conducting visits. HAD will continue to timely update the OM.
Para. (b) in page 111 of the PAC Report	PAC has recommended that HAD should ensure timely update of the OM, which serves as a guidebook for LOs to perform their duties correctly and properly, to reflect any changes in work procedures and requirements.	As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
Para. (e) in page 111 of the PAC Report	PAC has recommended that if resources are available, HAD should consider uploading the training materials on building management, particularly in relation to legal aspect, such as provisions of the BMO, and study of court cases, to its website to facilitate better understanding of the relevant issues by stakeholders.	<p>The training programmes for LOs are specifically designed having regard to the job nature and operational needs of LOs, so as to equip them with the necessary knowledge in discharging their building management duties. Given the target audience and the relatively technical nature of the training materials, the general public may find them difficult to understand.</p> <p>On the other hand, to provide general reference for different stakeholders (such as owners and OCs) and the general public, HAD published</p>



Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>two publications, namely "A Guide on Building Management Ordinance" and "Frequently Asked Questions on Building Management Ordinance". The former explains in layman's terms the major provisions of the BMO, whereas the latter answers some of the common questions encountered in daily building management, with relevant court cases provided for reference where appropriate. Besides, HAD organises building management seminars regularly for owners and OCs to provide updated information on BMO and other aspects of building management. Both the publications and seminars are available on the dedicated website on building management (<a href="http://www.buildingmgt.gov.hk">www.buildingmgt.gov.hk</a>).</p> <p>As follow-up action will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b><i>Educational and publicity programmes</i></b>		
Para. 3.43 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DHA should –</p> <p>(a) for the Central Platform on Building Management –</p> <p>(i) keep in view the need to organise briefing sessions in all the 18 districts, having regard to the intended objective of the briefings and cost-effectiveness considerations; and</p>	<p>In respect of the Central Platform on Building Management, HAD has expanded the geographical coverage of the briefing sessions, after taking into account the number of buildings issued with notices or repair orders in the districts concerned. On that basis, three districts (i.e. Sha Tin, Tuen Mun and Kwai Tsing) where no briefing was held in the past will be covered in the programme in 2021.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(ii) consider stepping up the use of electronic means in conducting the briefings;	<p>With reference to Audit's recommendation, live broadcast was arranged for the briefing session in Yuen Long in December 2020 as a trial. Starting from January 2021, one physical briefing session will be held in one of the 18 districts every month while live broadcasts are available in alternate months.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) examine the reasons for the large variance in the number of educational and publicity programmes organised across the 18 districts, and consider setting a target number for each district;	<p>Educational and publicity programmes at the district level are planned and organised by District Offices or working group under the respective District Council, having regard to the specific need of owners or OCs in the districts.</p> <p>Taking into account the building profile of individual districts (e.g. number of old buildings and buildings with management issues), a target number of educational and publicity programmes has been set for each district from 2021 onwards.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) take measures to encourage participants in the LEAD/Advanced LEAD Programmes to attend all the training sessions; and	<p>HAD is exploring measures to further enhance the attendance rate for LEAD/Advanced LEAD Programmes. For example, consideration is being given to organising make-up classes for participants who cannot attend the scheduled training sessions.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(d) consider setting possession of a Statement of Attendance in the LEAD Programme as a prerequisite for nominating MC members to enrol in the Advanced LEAD Programme.	HAD will adopt Audit's recommendation and set the possession of a Statement of Attendance in the LEAD Programme as a prerequisite for nominating MC members to enrol in the Advanced LEAD Programme starting from the coming programme scheduled for the fourth quarter of 2021.
<b>Part 4: Other administrative matters</b>		
<b><i>Achievement of performance targets by District Offices and the Headquarters</i></b> <b><i>Performance measurement</i></b>		
Para. 4.9 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should take improvement measures to ensure that the performance targets on liaison with owners and management bodies of private buildings are met by all District Offices and the HQ.	As mentioned above, DBMLTs are required to conduct liaison with building management bodies of private buildings (e.g. OCs and Owners' Committees) and "three-nil" buildings for an average of four times every year. This formed the basis of estimates on the performance indicators reported in COR and was conveyed to DOs in writing in February 2021. DBMLTs are now required to regularly report the number of liaison conducted. HAD HQ will monitor the number of liaison conducted by districts, as well as its own target on a quarterly basis and issue reminders to the DBMLTs or relevant parties as appropriate to ensure accomplishment of the targets. HAD HQ has also reminded DOs in writing that they should monitor the progress closely to ensure that the annual targets are met, and should provide an explanation for any failure to achieve the targets.
Para. 4.17 of the Audit Report	<p>Audit has recommended that DHA should –</p> <p>(a) document the bases of estimates on the performance indicators disclosed in the COR and ensure that supporting information on performance indicators is properly maintained; and</p> <p>(b) on the reporting of educational and publicity programmes –</p> <p>(i) examine the suitability of the counting basis adopted for the programmes, taking into account their nature and content; and</p> <p>(ii) issue clear guidelines on the counting basis and avoid double counting of the same programmes.</p>	

Para. No.	Audit's/PAC's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>such as nature and content of the programme, the extent of outreach to target participants as well as the input of resources. As an illustration, a certificate course targeting at the same group of participants should be counted as one regardless of the number of classes involved.</p> <p>HAD HQ will consolidate returns of educational and publicity programmes on a district basis and ensure there is no double counting of the same programmes.</p> <p>As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b><i>Management of database of private buildings</i></b>		
Para. 4.24 of the Audit Report	Audit has recommended that DHA should continue to take measures (e.g. ensuring inputting data of visit reports and updating data, and specifying this requirement in the OM for LOs) to improve the accuracy of the database of private buildings.	<p>Taking into account Audit's recommendation, HAD introduced a new requirement in February 2021 for LOs to complete a standard report after conducting a visit. They need to indicate in the visit report whether updates (if any) to the database have been recorded.</p> <p>The standard report has been attached to the new guidelines on procedures for conducting visits, and LOs are reminded to update the database of buildings timely. The new guidelines have been incorporated into the OM on Building Management for LOs.</p>

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's/PAC's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
		As follow-up action of the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.

-----