

**THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE**

**in response to the**

**REPORT OF  
THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE  
No. 76**

**of July 2021**

**29 September 2021**



# **THE GOVERNMENT MINUTE IN RESPONSE TO THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE REPORT NO. 76 DATED JULY 2021**

## **REPORT ON THE RESULTS OF VALUE FOR MONEY AUDITS (Report No. 76)**

### **Chapter 1 – Management of birth, death and marriage registrations**

The Government accepts the recommendations made by the Audit Commission (Audit) on the management of birth, death and marriage registrations. The Immigration Department (ImmD) has taken the following actions to follow-up on the recommendations.

#### ***Registration of births and deaths***

##### ***Registration of births***

2. With respect to the management of births registries, ImmD will continue to review the overall manpower and services at its births registries. After reviewing the manpower of the Kowloon Birth Registry (KBR), ImmD has enhanced the services by accepting applications for Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) passports at KBR. Members of the public may apply for birth registration, HKSAR passports and HKSAR Re-entry Permits at KBR in one go. ImmD will introduce new functions under the Next Generation Application and Investigation Easy Systems (APPLIES-2) to monitor the processing time for birth registration at the birth registries. The new functions are expected to roll out in the first quarter of 2022.

3. ImmD have strengthened the handling of unregistered birth cases, such as elaborating the internal guidelines on the handling procedures of unregistered birth cases by citing common scenarios warranting flexible handling as examples and issuing new guidelines to enhance the monitoring of investigation progress. ImmD will continue to formulate more effective strategy to identify the whereabouts of the parents concerned.

##### ***Registration of deaths***

4. With regard to the management of death registries, ImmD has critically reviewed the issue of registration of deaths from natural causes beyond the statutory time limit specified in the Births and Deaths Registration Ordinance (Cap. 174) and put in place following measures –

- (a) requesting hospitals to help distribute a guidance note to relatives of the deceased which reminds them of the statutory time limit for registering deaths from natural causes (i.e. within 24 hours from the death);
- (b) putting up notices on ImmD's website and updating the guidance note to remind the public of the said statutory time limit for registering deaths; and
- (c) enhancing the monitoring of late registration cases and taking follow-up actions on those without reasonable grounds provided.

5. Moreover, the Security Bureau and ImmD are conducting a review on the statutory time limit for registration of deaths. Subject to the outcome of the review, necessary legislative amendments will be taken forward as early as practicable.

6. ImmD will introduce new functions under APPLIES-2 to monitor the processing time for death registration. The new functions are expected to roll out in the first quarter of 2022. ImmD will also introduce the electronic ticketing system at the Hong Kong Island Deaths Registry in the fourth quarter of 2021, which will provide queuing tickets with estimated waiting time printed to members of the public.

7. With respect to performance reporting at the registries, ImmD will include the issue of "certified copies of birth/death certificates" involving search of records as one of the key performance measures in ImmD's Controlling Officer's Report from 2022-23 onwards.

### ***Registration of marriages***

8. ImmD will continue to closely monitor service demands at its marriage registries. A half-yearly review will be conducted to identify the popular dates in the coming year such that additional quotas for marriage ceremonies will be provided accordingly. In this connection, a pilot scheme will be implemented to increase marriage ceremony quotas at the Tsim Sha Tsui Marriage Registry and Sha Tin Marriage Registry on popular days in 2021, namely the "Singles' Day" (i.e. 11 November) and Christmas Eve (i.e. 24 December).

### ***Civil Celebrants of Marriages (CCMs)***

9. ImmD has taken proactive measures to ensure that the appointed CCMs meet the eligibility criteria laid down in the Marriage Ordinance (Cap. 181). To this end, ImmD has reminded the appointed CCMs to notify the Registrar of Marriage in writing within 14 days if they cease to meet any of the prescribed

criteria in the Marriage Ordinance. ImmD has put up the relevant information on its website, the pamphlet of “How to Apply – Becoming a Civil Celebrant of Marriages” (CCM pamphlet), the training materials for CCMs, etc. ImmD will continue to liaise with the Law Society of Hong Kong (LSHK) and the Hong Kong Society of Notaries (HKSJ) on matters in relation to qualification of solicitors and notaries public respectively. ImmD will also verify the eligibility of appointed CCMs by checking against the information on the websites of LSHK and HKSJ on a daily basis. Should any irregularity be identified, ImmD will take follow-up actions as appropriate. Regarding the training for CCMs, ImmD has specified the training requirements in the CCM pamphlet and on its website in June 2021. For CCMs who have not provided any marriage solemnisation service in his/her last term of appointment, upon receiving application for appointment renewal, ImmD will require the CCMs to attend a refresher course and provide them with a set of the “Guidance Notes for Civil Celebrants of Marriages” for reference.

#### *Suspected bogus marriages*

10. ImmD will continue to strengthen its handling of suspected bogus marriage cases. ImmD has improved the current investigation and administrative processes, including flexibly deploying manpower to expedite the handling of outstanding cases; issuing new guidelines to relevant staff; enhancing the relevant computer systems for better monitoring of the investigation progress; and stepping up measures to identify the whereabouts of suspects.

11. With respect to the performance reporting, in June 2021, ImmD made a performance pledge that the standard processing time for search of absence of marriage record is seven working days. ImmD’s Performance Pledge Booklet and website have been updated accordingly.

#### ***APPLIES-2***

12. ImmD will continue to closely monitor the development progress and spending position of the APPLIES-2 project through multi-tier project governance. ImmD will also ensure that APPLIES-2 will bring better services and greater convenience to users. In particular, the electronic services of APPLIES-2 will support the Government’s “iAM Smart” Platform in December 2021.

13. APPLIES-2 will be implemented in two phases. Upon the completion of Phase 1 by December 2021 as scheduled, APPLIES-2 will provide all existing functions of APPLIES (e.g. birth, death and marriage registrations). Upon the completion of Phase 2 in October 2022, APPLIES-2 will provide new functions (e.g. generation of management reports and workload statistics). The development of APPLIES-2 has been on schedule. No major risk or issue concerning the project has been identified by ImmD so far.

14. With regard to the spending position of APPLIES-2, ImmD will continue to closely monitor and manage the expenditure of the project. ImmD has been strictly complying with the relevant regulations and notification mechanism to make timely report to the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau as appropriate. In addition to the main contracts which have been awarded, ImmD is arranging to procure other required hardware, software and services. According to the pre-tender estimate, the estimated cost for the upcoming procurements is around \$80 million (inclusive of a contingency provision). Subject to the actual out turn of the contracts, ImmD does not anticipate the project to have a significant underspent balance.

***Progress made in implementing Audit's recommendations***

Encl. 1      15. The progress of follow-up actions taken by the Government to implement the recommendations of Audit is at Enclosure 1.

**Chapter 2 – Education support measures for non-Chinese speaking students**

16. The Education Bureau (EDB) accepts the views and recommendations put forward by Audit and PAC on education support measures for non-Chinese speaking (NCS) students. The following actions are being taken to follow up on the recommendations.

***Funding support to schools***

17. The additional funding support for NCS students (NCS Grant) provided by EDB is intended to provide additional resources to supplement the rich array of resources already available to schools. EDB will continue to closely monitor the use of the NCS Grant by schools to ensure that they deploy the resources in a prudent, cost-effective and timely manner, and that the expenditures incurred are reasonable and necessary for education purposes. To ensure that schools are adequately utilising the NCS Grant to meet the policy objective of enhancing the support for NCS students' learning of Chinese language and creating an inclusive learning environment in schools, EDB has required schools to provide justifications and submit improvement plans if their accumulated surplus has reached 70% or more of the provision of the NCS Grant in a school year. EDB will monitor the implementation of schools' improvement measures. Besides, EDB will step up efforts to remind schools to closely observe timeliness in submitting school plans and school reports, and follow up with schools in a more timely manner on any late submissions.

18. With the accumulation of experience by special schools receiving the NCS Grant in the implementation of the Chinese Language Curriculum Second Language Adapted Learning Framework (for NCS students with intellectual disability) (Adapted Learning Framework), EDB started arranging school visits in the 2020/21 school year to gather how those special schools had utilised the NCS Grant to cater for the students' needs under the Adapted Learning Framework. We plan to complete all the visits to the special schools by the end of the 2021/22 school year.

19. EDB will continue to collect feedback from major stakeholders on the support measures for NCS students through different channels, and to better understand the implementation of relevant measures in schools. Starting from the 2021/22 school year, the target groups of the stakeholder survey will cover kindergartens (KGs) and special schools.

### ***Capacity building for teachers***

20. To enhance the professional capability of Chinese Language teachers in teaching NCS students, EDB has been providing diversified professional development opportunities for teachers. Other than the professional development programmes offered by EDB, teachers can participate in professional learning communities and school-based support services (SBSS) arranged by EDB or other organisations, training programmes offered by tertiary institutions, and experience sharing among teachers of the same or different schools according to their personal and school-based professional development needs. With regard to the recommendation that EDB should consider the need to set appropriate training requirements for primary, secondary and special schools with NCS students, we will examine different school-based circumstances and teachers' professional development needs, and deliberate on the recommendation through existing consultation channels. As for the Professional Enhancement Grant Scheme for Chinese Language Teachers (Teaching Chinese as a Second Language), EDB is currently conducting a review of the Scheme and collecting views from stakeholders. EDB plans to report the relevant review results and recommendations to the Standing Committee on Language Education and Research before the end of 2021.

21. EDB provides multifarious types of support to schools admitting NCS students (including the provision of NCS Grant, teacher training, student support, etc.). Schools may choose the appropriate support services in accordance with their school-based needs, priorities and circumstances. SBSS are a relatively intensive type of professional development that requires the full cooperation of schools and teachers. Schools' participation is entirely voluntary. Moreover, given that the proportion of NCS students in the school population varies among schools, and schools have different support needs in different subjects and aspects, they may choose the types of support services that best suit their changing needs and circumstances and in accordance with their priorities. Therefore, it has never been

the policy intent for SBSS to cover all schools in Hong Kong, and we should not expect a huge number of schools to apply for SBSS every year. Having said that, EDB will, in accordance with the established mechanism, take the initiative to identify and follow up with schools in need of support and accord priority in processing their applications. We will also step up efforts in promoting SBSS to the sector and encouraging schools to make good use of the wide range of support services provided by EDB according to their needs, including SBSS.

### ***Other support measures***

22. For the Student Support Programme, starting from the 2021/22 school year, EDB and the service provider will conduct a briefing session in September annually to share with schools more detailed information as well as the key features of the Programme with a view to giving schools a better understanding of the Programme and encouraging more schools to join the Programme. To facilitate students' participation in the Programme, the service provider will maintain communication with participating schools to draw up programme timetables compatible with other extra-curricular activities arranged by the schools. The service provider will also conduct assessment of students' Chinese language proficiency before commencement of the Programme and arrange students to study in different learning groups according to their performance at the assessment, with a view to catering for learner diversity, enhancing learning effectiveness and improving student enrolment/attendance. Starting from April 2021, EDB has arranged more lesson observations to monitor more closely the teaching performance of the course instructors, and provided feedback and appropriate assistance where feasible to enhance their teaching quality. In addition, to promote the Summer Bridging Programme 2021, EDB stepped up publicity and promotion through different media channels in May and June 2021. This measure will continue for the school years to come.

23. EDB has contacted the service providers concerned to learn about the reasons for their lukewarm response to the past invitations for provision of life planning education services to NCS students. For the life planning education services for the 2021/22 and 2022/23 school years, EDB has invited bids for the contract through open tendering, in which all eligible service providers, including those not on the invitation list, could submit bids. EDB will continue to explore whether there are more suitable service providers and encourage them to bid for the provision of services beyond the 2022/23 school year. Besides, to cope with the increased need for on-site support service on life planning education, EDB has liaised with the service provider which has agreed to increase the quota of participating schools receiving the on-site support service in the 2021/22 school year by 12.5%. EDB will continue to review the needs of NCS students for life planning education services having regard to the applications received and explore room for increasing the quota of school-based life planning education on-site support services to cope with the demand.



24. As regards the admission procedures of KGs, EDB has reminded KGs that when interviewing NCS children, they should arrange interpretation or translation services for NCS children where necessary. KGs may also allow parents to be accompanied by a Chinese-speaking relative/friend during interviews to facilitate communication. KGs have notified parents of such arrangement through different channels, e.g. announcing such arrangements on their school webpages, verbal communication, etc. To enhance transparency, EDB has requested KGs, through a circular memorandum issued in June 2021, to indicate such arrangements on their school webpages when they start the process of student admission in 2021 for intake of students for the 2022/23 school year. Regarding the Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA), under the prevailing arrangement, EDB has all along required schools to make public their admission criteria and weighting of each criterion in advance. Starting from the SSPA 2022, EDB will urge participating secondary schools to announce their admission criteria and weighting of each criterion in both Chinese and English on their webpages in addition to publicising the aforesaid information in the Secondary School Profiles. In tandem, EDB will conduct regular checking of schools' webpages and follow up with schools as appropriate.

### ***Progress on Recommendations of Audit***

Encl. 2      25. A summary setting out the progress of implementing the respective recommendations made by Audit is at Enclosure 2.

## **Chapter 3 – Control of trade in endangered species by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department**

### ***Control of trade in endangered species***

26. The Government accepts the recommendations made by Audit on control of trade in endangered species by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD). AFCD has taken the following actions to follow up on the recommendations.

### ***Licensing and Inspections***

27. Regarding the work on consignment inspections, AFCD has arranged for an enhancement of the Endangered Species Licensing and Enforcement System (ESLES) to set the inspection ratio as a mandatory field to be filled for the inspection report. AFCD has reviewed the guidelines on consignment inspections and implemented the updated guidelines since December 2020.

28. Regarding the follow-up procedures on expired import licences, export licences and re-export licences, AFCD has reviewed and updated the relevant internal guidelines. AFCD has reminded all relevant staff of the procedures

for processing possession licence applications and strengthened the supervision on frontline staff. The department has also reviewed the overall approach adopted for shop inspections and amended the related guidelines, and set individual annual targets for routine shop inspections and inspection-cum-education visits, which will be reviewed annually.

29. In addition, AFCD will continue to explore the application of facial recognition technique on the control of trade in humphead wrasse and keep abreast of other technological developments and applications.

### ***Investigation and Prosecution***

30. Regarding the investigation and prosecution work, AFCD has reviewed all cases remarked as under investigation and prosecution in ESLES and is expediting the relevant follow-up actions. The department has adopted a new procedure to ensure that the movement of case files is properly recorded.

31. To ensure that the uncompleted cases are handled in a timely manner, AFCD is adding a new alert function in ESLES for subject officers and their supervisors, and enhancing some computer systems to facilitate tracking of progress of cases. AFCD has reviewed all cases marked as pending application for court order with appropriate follow-up actions being undertaken and has formulated work targets for relevant procedures.

32. AFCD will also keep in view the development of relevant forensic technologies applied in the identification of scheduled species, and has been conducting a comprehensive review on the effectiveness of the reward scheme and its operation.

### ***Other Related Issues***

33. AFCD has reviewed the record keeping procedures for specimens held and ready for disposal and their stocktaking arrangements, and has updated and implemented the relevant internal guidelines to ensure that the procedures meet the actual operational needs. AFCD consulted the Endangered Species Advisory Committee at its meeting in June 2021 on the disposal of forfeited timber, including the identification of other suitable ways of disposal in compliance with the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora.

34. AFCD has set a training target for frontline officers and will provide at least one enforcement training session for frontline enforcement officers on an annual basis. In addition, to continue its public education during the pandemic, AFCD has organised online education seminars for multiple organisations, and will continue to conduct publicity and education activities through the Internet or by electronic means.

Encl. 3      35. Detailed progress of AFCD's implementation of the recommendations of Audit is provided at Enclosure 3.

#### **Chapter 4 – Innovation and Technology Commission: Efforts in promoting internationally accepted standards and conformity assessment services**

36. The Government accepts the recommendations in Report No. 76 of the Director of Audit on Innovation and Technology Commission (ITC)'s efforts in promoting internationally accepted standards and conformity assessment services. Actions have been taken to follow-up on the recommendations as follows.

##### ***Promotion of Accreditation Services***

37. Hong Kong Accreditation Service (HKAS) of ITC will continue to conduct thorough market surveys and consult key stakeholders to ascertain market demand when developing new accreditation programmes. HKAS will also enhance the promotion of its accreditation services and the services of HKAS accredited organisations to public and private sectors as well as government bureaux/departments (B/Ds) via different means, and encourage them to use the testing and certification (T&C) services offered by accredited organisations. Besides, since January 2021, HKAS has been conducting remote assessments (i.e. assessments conducted via video conferencing) for assessing organisations that require reassessments, thereby minimising the impact of the pandemic and its associated travel restrictions on the participation of local, Mainland or overseas assessors in the reassessment work.

##### ***Product Standards Information Bureau***

38. ITC has completed the review and, having considered the current demand of services, concluded that it is no longer necessary to maintain a dedicated Product Standards Information Bureau (PSIB) and a physical Product Standards Resource Centre (PSRC) to provide the services. As such, ITC is working on abolishing the PSIB and the physical PSRC, redeploying the staff of the PSIB to other sections of ITC Quality Services Division for handling other duties, and arranging the Quality Services Division to take up the existing work of PSRC so that public money will be used more efficiently and cost-effectively. The relevant reorganisation will be completed in September 2021.

##### ***Calibration Services of Standards and Calibration Laboratory (SCL)***

39. ITC completed the inventory check on inventory items in SCL in accordance with the requirements of Stores and Procurement Regulations (SPR) in June 2021 to ensure the correctness of inventory records. ITC also completed the

review of calibration requirements on equipment labels in June 2021 to ensure appropriate calibration status had been assigned to the equipment. SCL will strengthen the management of equipment calibration to ensure that equipment is calibrated before the due date and the progress will be reviewed regularly to avoid overdue. ITC is now reviewing the queuing time for the calibration services of SCL and will set up different queuing time for high-grade and low-grade equipment items. The review is expected to be completed in September 2021.

***Support for Hong Kong Council for Testing and Certification (HKCTC)***

40. ITC will provide facilitation for members of HKCTC to attend council meetings (e.g. to join the meeting through video-conferencing) and will remind members more frequently that they should declare any potential conflicts of interest at the council meetings. ITC will also continue to promote the teaching kit on chemical testing developed by HKCTC to secondary schools through various means, and encourage and facilitate the participation of T&C practitioners and bodies in activities organised by HKCTC such as seminars and exhibition programmes on promoting Hong Kong's T&C services.

41. ITC will strengthen cooperation with HKCTC and the stakeholders in the sector to facilitate the development of the T&C industry in Hong Kong. ITC will also continue to liaise with the Mainland authorities to explore suitable measures in assisting the T&C industry to grasp the business opportunities in the Greater Bay Area.

***Overall progress***

42. The Government has taken measures in response to the recommendations of Audit and details of the follow-up actions are set out at

Encl. 4

Enclosure 4.

**Chapter 5 – Management of government vehicle fleet by the Government Logistics Department**

43. The Government agrees with the recommendations made by Audit regarding the management of the government vehicle fleet. The Government Logistics Department (GLD) has taken a series of measures to follow up on the recommendations.

***Monitoring of Government Vehicle Fleet***

44. To expedite the process in conducting departmental transport reviews (DTRs), GLD has flexibly deployed existing manpower and arranged staff to work full time on a particular review until its completion since June 2021. GLD has also

set targets for completion of DTRs for B/Ds with reference to their vehicle fleet size. For the benefits of other B/Ds, GLD has posted the lessons drawn from past DTRs onto Central Cyber Government Office Intranet Portal since April 2021 and will continue to update the information in a timely manner.

### ***Procurement of Vehicles***

45. To facilitate timely delivery of new vehicles, GLD has advanced the processes for inviting and examining the requests from B/Ds for replacement vehicles and the procurement exercise in the light of the time required by potential suppliers for vehicle delivery starting from the vehicle vetting exercise in 2021.

46. Since March 2021, GLD has started to provide updates to B/Ds on the progress of vehicle procurement when the tenders concerned are issued and on the vehicle delivery schedule when orders are placed for their additional or replacement vehicles with a view to facilitating B/Ds in resource planning for meeting their transport needs.

47. With a view to fully meeting the operational needs of B/Ds as far as practicable, GLD will continue to collect users' feedback on the vehicles procured, and consult B/Ds concerned on the technical specifications before including them in the quotation or tender documents.

### ***Other Related Issues***

48. GLD has all along been closely liaising with and keeping the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) informed of the latest development in the procurement and use of electric vehicles (EVs) in the government vehicle fleet so as to facilitate EPD in devising its strategy to promote the wider use of EVs. GLD will keep on collecting information from B/Ds on their various operational needs, examine the availability of suitable EVs in the market that can fully meet B/Ds' operational requirements and pass the information to B/Ds for their consideration.

### ***Progress of Implementing Audit's Recommendations***

49. A summary of the progress made in implementing Audit's recommendations is at Enclosure 5.

## **Chapter 6 – Site formation and associated infrastructure works for development near Choi Wan Road and Jordan Valley**

50. The Government accepts the recommendations made in the Director of Audit's Report No. 76 regarding the site formation and associated infrastructure works for development near Choi Wan Road and Jordan Valley. The Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) has taken appropriate follow-up actions and the progress made is generally reported below, with details set out at Enclosure 6.

Encl. 6

### ***Contractual disputes under Contract A***

51. CEDD has implemented appropriate measures in enhancing the monitoring and control of the generation and demand of fill materials from public works projects, and vetting of contract documents.

### ***Other issues under Contract A***

52. CEDD has implemented appropriate measures in providing detailed guidance to project offices for conducting pre-tender site investigations, monitor blasting activities, and keep on exploring and applying new technologies and digital tools to complete the site investigation works effectively.

### ***Administration of Contracts B and C***

53. CEDD has implemented appropriate measures in enhancing the accuracy of cost estimation for variation order, dealing with actual cost of variation order exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval, and checking the completeness and accuracy of contract documents.

54. CEDD is liaising with relevant B/Ds for incorporating CEDD's guidelines for dealing with actual cost of variation order exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval into Project Administration Handbook for Civil Engineering Works. The review is anticipated to be completed by end of 2021.

## **Chapter 7 – Upgrading and operation of Pillar Point Sewage Treatment Works**

55. The Government agrees with the recommendations made by Audit and PAC on upgrading and operation of Pillar Point Sewage Treatment Works (PPSTW). The Drainage Services Department (DSD) has taken a series of measures to follow up on the recommendations.

### ***Upgrading works of the PPSTW***

56. DSD has been actively monitoring and following up on the performance of the concrete protective coatings in PPSTW, and the performance of the new types of protective coatings for repairing the peeled-off concrete coating has been satisfactory so far. DSD appointed a local university in November 2020 to carry out investigation on the failure of concrete protective coatings to identify the root cause of the matter. The university team has carried out on-site sampling, and performed testing and analysis. The team anticipated that the investigation will be completed in November 2021. DSD will carry out the necessary follow-up actions based on the investigation results.

57. After the incident of using substandard chain material in the fine screen, DSD has conducted reviews and taken additional measures in subsequent DSD's sewage treatment works projects by requiring the contractors to provide a full list of compliance check on materials for equipment/facilities, demonstrating compliance with the contract requirements as well as the relevant requirements specified in the General Specification for Electrical and Mechanical Sewerage Facility Installations. Such measures are to ascertain the contractors' compliance with the relevant contractual requirements relating to materials for equipment or facilities.

58. Regarding the difficulties encountered in executing defects correction works while a sewage treatment works is in operation, DSD has drawn on the experience gained and will take appropriate measures in future sewage treatment works projects to enhance the coordination and liaison among the construction and operation teams, so as to ensure that the defects correction works can be completed within the period stipulated under the contract.

59. "Upgrading and Operation of PPSTW" is DSD's first sewage treatment works project adopting the design-build-operate (DBO) contract arrangement. The contract details and finalisation of accounts are relatively more complex than other contract types. Having consolidated the experience gained and taken into account Audit's recommendation, DSD has taken additional measures to address and early resolve those unforeseen contractual and technical issues, as well as to urge the project team to coordinate the construction and operation parties effectively to complete all the outstanding issues and ensure timely finalisation of accounts of the design and build portions of the contract.

### ***Monitoring of operation of upgraded PPSTW***

60. Regarding the operation of PPSTW, DSD has been closely monitoring the performance of the contractor including assessment of its compliance with Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) on a monthly basis. Moreover, the contractor's performance (including its KPIs' compliance level) will be duly recorded and reflected in the quarterly performance report.

61. To effectively monitor the performance of the contractor, DSD has conducted additional checking of effluent quality. Having consolidated the experience gained and taken into account Audit's recommendations, DSD has issued relevant guidelines on conducting surprise checking on 16 August 2021, requiring that all the investigation and reporting on high *Escherichia coli* results should be completed as soon as possible.

62. Subsequent to the fatal accident occurred in October 2014, DSD had engaged an independent safety consultant in 2015 to conduct a comprehensive review and had taken immediate measures to improve the safety system of the sewage treatment works, such as strengthening the staff training, installing safety devices, avoiding staff having to work alone and installing closed-circuit television for safety monitoring. DSD had also issued a circular in July 2020 to remind project teams to maintain close liaison with the Labour Department, to timely obtain information of the relevant occupational and safety incidents, and to take follow-up actions as soon as possible and reflect the safety performance in the corresponding quarterly performance report of contractors. Moreover, DSD would monitor the safety performance of contractors through regular and surprise site safety checks and meetings, and would also manage the safety performance of contractors by giving advice, warning and conducting performance appraisal.

63. As regards the loss of data in Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition System, DSD has conducted a review and resolved the problem to avoid the loss of data. Moreover, all operation data had been cloned in the backup hard disks to ensure that all data in the terminals would be properly kept.

64. To ensure timely completion of corrective and preventive maintenance works, the Computerised Maintenance Management (CMM) System was upgraded in June 2021 by adding preventive maintenance functions, alert system and tracking of maintenance record, etc., to tie in with the latest maintenance strategy. Moreover, DSD has requested the contractor to regularly compile and submit the summaries of CMM System maintenance records since July 2021 to facilitate management and monitoring.

65. With the experience gained in operating a sewage treatment works under DBO contract arrangement, when managing future defects correction works, DSD will request contractors to submit reports at monthly operation meetings. A list of all the defect correction items with agreed completion date would be provided by contractors for review and the works progress would be properly recorded to ensure timely completion of the defects correction works.



***Administration of DBO contract arrangement***

66. Since the PPSTW is the first adoption of DBO contract form in sewage treatment works project, it was DSD's original intention to conduct the post-completion review at the end of the entire DBO contract period. Having regard to Audit's recommendation, DSD would conduct the post-completion review in two phases. The first part on reviewing the design and construction portions of the contract was completed in August 2021. The second part on reviewing the operation portion will be conducted at the end of the contract period.

67. Being the first DBO contract, DSD cherishes the experience gained through delivering the contract of upgrading sewage treatment works. DSD has uploaded and shared more information of PPSTW on the Knowledge Management Portal. DSD will continue to make use of the Knowledge Management Portal to share the experience and knowledge gained throughout the PPSTW DBO contract.

***Progress made in implementing Audit's recommendations***

68. The progress of follow-up actions taken by the Government to implement the recommendations of Audit is set out at Enclosure 7.

Encl. 7

-----

**Management of birth, death and marriage registrations  
Progress in implementing Audit's Recommendations**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Registration of births and deaths</b>		
<i>Management of births registries</i>		
2.13	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Immigration (D of Imm) should –</p> <p>(a) keep under review the manpower deployed on birth registration work in the Immigration Department (ImmD)'s births registries, and make adjustments where appropriate;</p>	<p>ImmD will continue to review the overall manpower and services of its births registries from time to time. After reviewing the manpower of the Kowloon Birth Registry (KBR), ImmD has enhanced the services at KBR by accepting applications for Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) passports at KBR. Members of the public may apply for birth registration, HKSAR passports and HKSAR Re-entry Permits at KBR in one go.</p>
	<p>(b) keep records on the processing time for birth registrations; and</p>	<p>ImmD will introduce new functions under the Next Generation Application and Investigation Easy Systems (APPLIES-2) to monitor the processing time for birth registration, which will be rolled out in full in the first quarter of 2022.</p>
	<p>(c) explore measures to strengthen the follow-up actions on unregistered birth cases, including –</p> <p>(i) incorporating details on handling cases warranting flexible handling in the guidelines on handling unregistered birth cases;</p>	<p>In May 2021, ImmD elaborated its internal guidelines by citing common scenarios warranting flexible handling as examples for officers' reference.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
	(ii) drawing up more effective strategies in locating parents for conducting interviews;	<p>ImmD shall endeavour to formulate a investigation strategy to handle unregistered birth cases as early as possible, having regard to the uniqueness and complexity of individual cases.</p> <p>ImmD has issued new guidelines requiring case officers to –</p> <p>(i) report progress of outstanding cases to the respective Senior Immigration Officer (SIO) two months after the commencement of investigation; and</p> <p>(ii) report to the Section Head (at the Chief Immigration Officer (CIO) rank) every two months thereafter for seeking directives. If case circumstances warranted or if the concerned parents were involved in other offences (such as perjury or overstaying in Hong Kong, or they had tried to deliberately evade the investigation and consequently obstruct ImmD officers from exercising their duties, etc.), case officers would consider enlisting assistance from the Police to put the parents concerned as wanted persons for interception.</p>
	(iii) keeping records on reporting the progress of outstanding cases in individual case files; and	<p>ImmD has issued new guidelines to enhance the procedures for handling unregistered birth cases. Case officers are required to –</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>(i) report progress of outstanding cases to the respective SIO two months after the commencement of investigation; and</p> <p>(ii) report to the Section Head (at the CIO rank) every two months thereafter (or two months before reaching the prosecution time limit, whichever is earlier).</p> <p>To enhance case monitoring, reports made by case officers and directives given by the respective supervising officers should be recorded in case files.</p>
	(iv) considering setting a time target for commencement of investigation of unregistered birth cases.	<p>ImmD has issued new guidelines requiring case officers to commence investigation for unregistered birth cases and open a case file within five days upon receipt of a referral from the Birth, Death and Marriage Section.</p> <p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
<b>Management of deaths registries</b>		
2.21	<p>Audit has recommended that D of Imm should –</p> <p>(a) keep records on the processing time for death registrations;</p>	<p>ImmD will introduce new functions under APPLIES-2 to monitor the processing time for death registrations. The new functions are expected to roll out in the first quarter of 2022.</p>
	(b) consider the merits of installing an electronic ticketing system at the Hong Kong Island Deaths Registry; and	<p>In tandem with the implementation of APPLIES-2, an electronic ticketing system will be rolled out in the fourth quarter of 2021 (including the Hong Kong Island Deaths Registry). By then, computer generated tickets</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>with a queuing number and estimated waiting time printed will be issued to persons waiting at the registries. Also, monitors showing the service progress will be displayed at the waiting area.</p>
	<p>(c) critically explore measures that can be taken to address the issue of non-compliance with the Births and Deaths Registration Ordinance requirement of registering deaths from natural causes within 24 hours.</p>	<p>ImmD has put up a notice on the its website and updated its guidance note to remind members of the public of the legal requirement of registering deaths from natural causes within 24 hours.</p> <p>ImmD has requested 44 hospitals to help distribute the guidance note to relatives of the deceased so as to remind them of the said legal requirement.</p> <p>ImmD has enhanced the monitoring of late death registration cases. For cases with late death registration made over 24 hours from the death but within seven days, the informant is required to provide explanation(s) by filling in a supplementary information sheet. For cases with late death registration made over seven days from the death, the informant will be inquired and required to provide detailed explanation with supporting documents (if any).</p> <p>Upon completing the registration of deaths, ImmD will examine the circumstances of each case and take follow-up actions on individual cases with no reasonable explanation provided.</p> <p>The Security Bureau (SB) and ImmD are conducting a review on the statutory time limit for registration of deaths (i.e. within 24 hours from the death). Subject to the outcome of the review, necessary legislative amendments will be taken forward as early as practicable.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b><i>Performance reporting</i></b>		
2.24	<p>Audit has recommended that D of Imm should –</p> <p>(a) consider including the issue of a certified copy of a birth/death certificate involving search of records as one of the key performance measures in the Controlling Officer's Reports (CORs); and</p>	<p>The issue of certified copies of birth/death certificates involving search of records will be included as one of the key performance measures in CORs from 2022-23 onwards.</p>
	<p>(b) take measures to monitor the waiting time for death registrations.</p>	<p>Since May 2021, subject to the number of informants waiting for services and the manpower available, ImmD staff at the Hong Kong Island Deaths Registry and Kowloon Deaths Registry has provided an information card, together with the queuing tags, to informants advising them the estimated waiting time. The informants may return to the Registry with reference to the estimated waiting time. This would shorten the waiting time of the informants at the Registry and facilitate their personal arrangement.</p> <p>In tandem with the implementation of APPLIES-2, an electronic ticketing system is expected to roll out in the fourth quarter of 2021. Informants will obtain a computer-generated tickets showing their queuing number as well as the estimated waiting time from the electronic ticketing system. Monitors will be placed in the waiting area showing the service progress so that the informants could have a better idea on their queuing position.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 3: Registration of marriages</b>		
<b><i>Management of marriage registries</i></b>		
3.6	<p>Audit has recommended that D of Imm should consider –</p> <p>(a) exploring the feasibility of increasing the marriage ceremony quotas for Cotton Tree Drive Marriage Registry, Tsim Sha Tsui Marriage Registry, Sha Tin Marriage Registry and Tuen Mun Marriage Registry on Saturdays during festive seasons and on auspicious dates; and</p>	<p>ImmD will conduct a half-yearly review to identify the popular dates in the coming year for which additional quotas for marriage ceremony will be provided.</p> <p>A pilot scheme will be implemented to increase marriage ceremony quotas at the Tsim Sha Tsui Marriage Registry and Sha Tin Marriage Registry on popular days in 2021, namely the “Singles’ Day” (i.e. 11 November) and Christmas Eve (i.e. 24 December).</p>
	<p>(b) setting up a performance pledge for the search of absence of marriage record.</p>	<p>ImmD made a performance pledge in June 2021 that the standard processing time for the search of absence of marriage record should be within seven working days. ImmD’s Performance Pledge Booklet and website have been updated accordingly.</p> <p>Since the measure in response to Audit’s recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
<b><i>Civil Celebrants of Marriages Scheme</i></b>		
3.14	<p>Audit has recommended that D of Imm should –</p> <p>(a) take measures to ensure that persons included in ImmD’s list of Civil Celebrants of Marriages (CCMs) meet the eligibility criteria mentioned in the Marriage Ordinance (Cap. 181);</p>	<p>ImmD has reminded the CCMs of the legal requirement of notifying the Registrar of Marriage in writing within 14 days if they cease to meet any of the prescribed criteria specified in Schedule 4 to the Marriage Ordinance. The reminder has been included in</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>ImmD's website, the pamphlet of "How to Apply-Becoming a Civil Celebrant of Marriages" (CCM pamphlet), and the training materials for CCMs, etc.</p> <p>ImmD will continue to liaise with the Law Society of Hong Kong (LSHK) and the Hong Kong Society of Notaries (HKSJ) on matters in relation to qualification of solicitors and notaries public respectively. ImmD will also verify the eligibility of appointed CCMs by checking against the information on the websites of LSHK and HKSJ on a daily basis. Should any irregularity be identified, ImmD will take follow-up actions as appropriate.</p> <p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
	(b) specify the training requirements of CCMs in the Code of Practice or ImmD's information pamphlet "How to apply – Civil Celebrants of Marriages"; and	<p>The training requirements of CCMs were specified in the CCM pamphlet and ImmD's website in June 2021.</p> <p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
	(c) consider requiring dormant CCMs to attend refresher training course upon receiving their CCM renewal applications.	<p>For "dormant" CCMs who have not provided any marriage solemnisation service in last term of appointment, upon receiving an application for appointment renewal, ImmD will require the CCMs to attend a refresher course and provide them with a set of the "Guidance Notes for Civil Celebrants of Marriages" for reference. The first refresher course has been conducted in August 2021.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
<b><i>Bogus marriages</i></b>		
3.32	<p>Audit has recommended that D of Imm should –</p> <p>(a) expedite actions to clear the backlog of suspected bogus marriage cases, focusing on cases which have remained outstanding for a long time;</p>	<p>To expedite the processing of outstanding cases, in July 2021, ImmD has flexibly redeployed manpower resources to form two special teams to identify outstanding cases which need expeditious investigation.</p> <p>ImmD has strategically deployed resources to clear backlogs. As at 31 July 2021, the 2 237 backlog cases mentioned in para. 3.19 of the Audit Report was reduced to 1 476, representing a decrease of around 34%.</p>
	<p>(b) step up checking of suspected bogus marriage cases;</p>	<p>ImmD has completed a system enhancement by introducing a new result code to distinguish curtailed cases from no-further-action (NFA) cases. With the enhanced measures, ICAS will be able to identify NFA cases for spot checks as appropriate. ImmD has issued new guidelines and re-circulated the relevant instructions to remind officers the importance of sending the completed case files to ICAS for updating and filing in a timely manner.</p>
	<p>(c) require case officers to send the case files to the Investigation Central Administration Section (ICAS) for updating the Application and Investigation Easy Systems' records after obtaining endorsement of Section Head to curtail the investigation for the time being;</p>	<p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(d) consider setting a time target for opening of case files for normal cases of suspected bogus marriages, similar to that for priority cases;	<p>ImmD has issued new guidelines to set out a time target for commencement of investigation of normal cases. Case officers are required to open a case file and commence investigation within ten working days after the assignment of cases.</p> <p>Since the measure in response to Audit's recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from next progress report.</p>
	(e) ensure that supervisory checks of field operation are conducted as frequently as possible in accordance with ImmD's guidelines; and	ImmD has re-circulated relevant guidelines to remind all Heads of Special Task Force Sub-sections to conduct supervisory checks on their investigation teams and properly record the details of such checks.
	(f) review the case (Case 1) examined by Audit and draw lessons to step up efforts in locating suspects of bogus marriage cases in future.	<p>ImmD has been adopting all practicable means to investigate suspected bogus marriage cases and effect arrest in a timely manner. Drawing the experience of Case 1, ImmD has adopted various measures and strategies to handle sophisticated cases to improve the investigation of suspected bogus marriage cases. These include –</p> <p>(a) requesting up-to-date contact or residence information from other government bureaux/departments (B/Ds) or organisations;</p> <p>(b) requesting information from the private sector so as to identify the whereabouts of the suspects; and</p> <p>(c) requesting the police to include the suspects as wanted persons as appropriate.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 4: Implementation of Next Generation Application and Investigation Easy Systems</b>		
<i>System implementation</i>		
4.6	Audit has recommended that D of Imm should closely monitor the progress of APPLIES-2 implementation to ensure that the whole APPLIES-2 is rolled out as scheduled (in particular Phase 1 of APPLIES-2 (covering the existing functions of the First Generation of Application and Easy Systems) is rolled out by the target completion date of December 2021).	<p>ImmD will continue to adopt a multi-tier project governance, including Working Group (WG), Project Steering Committee (PSC) and Immigration Department Information Systems Co-ordination Committee to closely monitor the progress of APPLIES-2's implementation.</p> <p>Having regard to the development progress thus far, Phase 1 of APPLIES-2 (covering existing functions of the APPLIES) is expected to roll out by December 2021 on schedule.</p>
<i>Project monitoring and cashflow reporting</i>		
4.14	<p>Audit has recommended that D of Imm should –</p> <p>(a) strengthen ImmD's project monitoring of APPLIES-2 by holding regular PSC and WG meetings in future;</p>	<p>Having regard to development of the pandemic situation, with appropriate anti-pandemic measures in place, ImmD conducted on-site WG and PSC meetings on 4 June 2021 and 29 June 2021 respectively. The next WG and PSC meetings are scheduled for February 2022.</p>
	(b) critically review the cashflow requirement of APPLIES-2 when submitting the cashflow update to SB and the Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (FSTB) in future; and	<p>APPLIES-2 is still under active development. For full commissioning of the system, in addition to the main contracts awarded, ImmD is arranging to procure other required items including hardware, software and services according to the procurement timetable.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>As of March 2021, excluding the approved contract value and known expenditure, the project vote has a remaining balance of around \$80 million (including a contingency provision). As of July 2021, the costs of all the upcoming procurements, including the hardware, software and services for the New 1868 System for the Assistance to Hong Kong Residents Unit, computer peripherals, anti-virus and application software, etc. are estimated to be around \$80 million in total (including the contingency provision) according to the pre-tender estimate. Subject to the actual amount of the approved contracts, ImmD does not anticipate the project to have a significant unspent balance.</p> <p>ImmD will continue to critically review the cash flow requirement of APPLIES-2 and report to SB and FSTB regularly.</p>
	(c) closely monitor the project expenditure under APPLIES-2 and immediately report to FSTB if there is surplus fund in excess of project requirement.	<p>ImmD has been strictly complying with the relevant regulations and notification mechanism, and closely monitoring and managing the project expenditure. ImmD will continue to review the cash flow requirement of APPLIES-2 in the submission to SB and FSTB in future and make timely report to FSTB if there is any surplus fund in excess of project requirement. No surplus fund is identified thus far.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<i>Use of innovative technologies</i>		
4.17	Audit has recommended that D of Imm should closely monitor the progress of adopting "iAM Smart" Platform in APPLIES-2 electronic services.	<p>APPLIES-2 will provide new and enhanced electronic services. It will support the Government's "iAM Smart" Platform by end-December 2021, thereby providing better user experience and bringing greater convenience to users.</p> <p>ImmD will continue to monitor the trend of electronic services and expand the scope of electronic services.</p>

-----

**Education support measures for non-Chinese speaking students  
Progress in implementing Audit's Recommendations**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Funding support to schools</b>		
2.12(a)	<p>Audit has recommended that the Secretary for Education (SED) should take further measures to ensure that schools submit their school plans and school reports on the deployment of the enhanced additional funding support for non-Chinese speaking students (NCS Grant) and the support measures in a more timely manner.</p>	<p>The Education Bureau (EDB) will step up efforts to remind schools to closely observe timeliness in submitting school plans and school reports.</p> <p>Starting from the 2021/22 school year, we will further highlight the importance of timely submission of school plans and school reports in the annual letters of funding disbursement issued to primary, secondary and special schools and kindergartens (KGs) concerned. For late submissions of school reports and/or school plans for over 14 calendar days or more, EDB will require schools to submit in writing the reasons for the late submissions. For schools submitting the reports late without justifiable reasons or with repeated late submissions, we may issue advisory letters to the Incorporated Management Committees/School Management Committees of the schools concerned as appropriate.</p> <p>EDB issued the annual letters of funding disbursement to schools in July and August 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
2.12(b)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should step up monitoring of the utilisation of NCS Grant by schools and encourage schools with unjustified underspending to make good use of the Grant to support non-Chinese speaking students (NCS students) as far as possible.</p>	<p>Starting from the 2019/20 school year, EDB has required primary, secondary and special schools that receive the NCS Grant ranging from \$0.65 million to \$1.5 million to provide justifications and submit improvement plans if their accumulated surplus has reached 70% or more of the provision of the NCS Grant in the school year. EDB consider the measure effective in encouraging schools to make the best use of NCS Grant to support NCS students and will continue to monitor its effectiveness.</p> <p>From the 2021/22 school year onwards, EDB will extend the above measure to cover schools admitting a relatively small number of NCS students (i.e. one to nine students for ordinary schools and one to five students for special schools) and KGs, with a view to further encouraging schools to make best use of the NCS Grant.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
2.19	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should take measures to arrange supervisory visits to schools receiving NCS Grant in a more timely manner taking into account the operational and development needs of individual schools.</p>	<p>EDB will adopt a multi-pronged approach to conduct supervisory checks on the schools in a more timely manner including video conferencing and online meetings in addition to on-site visits, having regard to the circumstances and development needs of individual schools. In particular, EDB has accorded priority to visiting ordinary schools and KGs newly eligible for the NCS Grant, in particular those admitting more than five NCS students as well as those requiring additional support regarding the use of the NCS Grant.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>As for special schools in receipt of the NCS Grant ranging from \$0.65 million to \$1.5 million, EDB started arranging school visits in the 2020/21 school year to gather how those special schools had utilised the NCS Grant to cater for the students' needs under the Adapted Learning Framework, with a view to strengthening the support for NCS students in learning Chinese and creating an inclusive learning environment in schools. EDB plans to complete all the visits to the special schools by the end of the 2021/22 school year.</p> <p>We will report the progress in the next progress report.</p>
2.24	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should strengthen measures to ensure that feedback from major stakeholders of KGs and special schools is collected and taken into consideration in formulating support measures for NCS students in such schools.</p>	<p>EDB will continue to collect feedback through various channels (including school plans, school reports and face-to-face discussion with principals, teachers and students during school visits). Starting from the 2021/22 school year, the target groups of the stakeholder survey will cover KGs and special schools.</p> <p>We will report the progress in the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Capacity building for teachers</b>		
3.7	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should consider the need to set appropriate training requirements for primary, secondary and special school Chinese Language teachers on teaching NCS students Chinese as a second language, taking into account the growing number of Chinese Language teachers teaching NCS students and the diversified</p>	<p>On the recommendation to set appropriate training requirements, EDB has been deliberating with the school sector and stakeholders since May 2021 on various occasions, e.g. meetings of the Curriculum Development Council Committee on Chinese Language Education, school visits, interviews with language experts and teachers, and will further engage school head representatives in the discussion to</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	backgrounds and training needs of teachers and varied school contexts.	<p>gauge their views from school management and professional perspectives.</p> <p>We will report the progress in the next progress report.</p>
3.13	Audit has recommended that SED should review the way forward for the Professional Enhancement Grant Scheme for Chinese Language Teachers (Teaching Chinese as a Second Language) (PEG Scheme) taking into account the lukewarm response from teachers to the Scheme.	<p>Since the launch of the PEG Scheme in the 2014/15 school year, 97% of the grant applications lodged by teachers have been approved. EDB is currently conducting an overall review of and collecting views from stakeholders on the PEG Scheme, and plan to report the relevant review results and recommendations to the Standing Committee on Language Education and Research before the end of 2021.</p> <p>We will report the progress in the next progress report.</p>
3.23(a)	Audit has recommended that SED should step up efforts in assisting schools in their review on the needs for capacity building for their teachers and encouraging schools to make good use of school-based support services (SBSS) where necessary with a view to maximising the effectiveness of learning and teaching of NCS students.	<p>Given that the proportion of NCS students in the school population varies among schools, and schools have different support needs in different subjects and aspects based on their unique school contexts, it has never been the policy intent for SBSS to cover all schools in Hong Kong and participation is entirely voluntary.</p> <p>Under the principle of school-based management, schools need to review their school-based circumstances and analyse schools' and teachers' development needs. Schools will then prioritise various development needs and devise appropriate teacher professional development plans accordingly, which may include the application for SBSS to enhance the effectiveness of learning and teaching.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>EDB will, in accordance with the established mechanism, take the initiative to identify and follow up with schools in need of support and accord priority in processing their applications. We will also step up efforts in promoting SBSS to the sector and encouraging schools to, having regard to their needs, make good use of the wide range of support services provided by EDB, including SBSS.</p> <p>EDB will also continue to give concrete and professional advice to schools, with a view to strengthening their self-reflection culture and promoting sustainable development under the spirit of the school development and accountability.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for the recommendation will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
3.23(b)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should issue clear guidelines on the on-site evaluation of projects commissioned to tertiary institutions under SBSS, specifying the coverage in selecting schools to visit and the factors that should be considered in school selection.</p>	<p>EDB has devised clear guidelines on on-site evaluation which will be put in place with effect from the 2021/22 school year, and will endeavour to strike a balance between the operational needs and manpower available in EDB for monitoring visits without compromising the quality of the SBSS. The guidelines include service specifications for the service providers, frequency of EDB officers' monitoring visits, coverage and sampling methods for schools being visited and other monitoring measures that are in place.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 4: Other support measures</b>		
4.14(a)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should take measures to promote the Student Support Programme to NCS students and schools with a view to encouraging schools to nominate NCS students to enrol in the Programme.</p>	<p>Starting from the 2021/22 school year, EDB and the service provider will conduct a briefing session on the Student Support Programme in September annually to share with schools more detailed information as well as the key features of the Programme with a view to giving schools a better understanding of the Programme and encouraging more schools to join.</p> <p>To facilitate students' participation in the Programme, starting from the 2021/22 school year, the service provider will maintain communication with participating schools to draw up programme timetables compatible with other extra-curricular activities arranged by the schools.</p> <p>The service provider will also follow up on feedback from schools and students concerning convenient venues, preferable time slots, etc. to facilitate them to join. In the next tendering exercise of the Programme for 2022-2024, the service provider will be required to devise more measures to promote the Programme.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.14(b)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should take measures to encourage and facilitate students to attend lessons, and improve the drop-out rate and the attendance rate of the Student Support Programme.</p>	<p>Starting from April 2021, EDB has strengthened liaison with the service provider to monitor students' attendance and render appropriate assistance where feasible, e.g. changing class or venue for students in need, etc. Schools welcome this arrangement which has facilitated their students in attending the classes and EDB will enhance this arrangement in the coming school years.</p> <p>To facilitate students' participation in the Programme, starting from the 2021/22 school year, the service provider will maintain communication with participating schools to draw up programme timetables compatible with other extra-curricular activities arranged by the schools.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.14(c)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should take measures to ensure that students enrolled in the Student Support Programme are arranged into study groups of appropriate levels to cater for their individual learning needs, instead of arranging them according to their school levels.</p>	<p>Starting from the 2021/22 school year, the service provider of the Student Support Programme will conduct assessment of students' Chinese language proficiency before commencement of the Programme and arrange students to study in different learning groups according to their performance, with a view to catering for learner diversity, enhancing learning effectiveness and improving student enrolment/attendance.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.14(d)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should take measures to improve the course instructors' performance and students' performance to enhance the effectiveness of the Student Support Programme.</p>	<p>Starting from April 2021, EDB has arranged more lesson observations to monitor more closely the teaching performance of the course instructors, and provided feedback and appropriate assistance where feasible to enhance their teaching quality which will in turn benefit students and improve the effectiveness of the Programme.</p> <p>Besides, starting from the 2021/22 school year, students will be arranged into study groups of appropriate levels upon assessment of their Chinese language proficiency before commencement of the Programme, which will better cater for students' learning needs and enhance the effectiveness of the Programme.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.23(a)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should step up efforts in encouraging schools to nominate NCS students to enrol in the Summer Bridging Programme.</p>	<p>To promote the Summer Bridging Programme 2021, EDB has produced more information leaflets and placed advertisements through different media channels including the radio, newspapers, websites, etc. in May and June 2021. EDB has reminded participating schools to avoid arranging the Programme in peak periods when NCS students usually return to their home countries. EDB has also contacted participating schools which have nominated students in the past to encourage them to join again in 2021. These measures will continue in the school years to come.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.23(b)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should step up measures to ensure that the participating schools of the Summer Bridging Programme include in their annual school reports all the required information of the Programme with a view to enhancing accountability and the transparency of the schools' operation of the Programme.</p>	<p>For the Summer Bridging Programme 2021, EDB has reminded schools through the circular memorandum on invitation (including Administrative Guide) issued in May 2021 to upload their annual school reports onto the school webpages by end November 2021. EDB also sent letters to participating schools in August 2021 to remind them of the above requirement.</p> <p>EDB will check the reports of all participating schools by end November 2021 and take follow-up actions as appropriate. If schools are not able to upload the school reports on their school websites or some of the required information is omitted, EDB will contact the schools to offer advice and assistance in a timely manner. These measures will continue for the school years to come.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.29(a)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should ascertain the reasons for the lukewarm response from the service providers for the life planning education services and explore whether there are other suitable service providers who may be interested in providing the services.</p>	<p>EDB has contacted the service providers invited previously to understand the main reasons for not submitting bids. It is found that the lukewarm response is mainly due to their internal limitations, e.g. insufficient manpower to start new service.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>For the life planning education services for the 2021/22 and 2022/23 school years, EDB has invited bids for the contract through open tendering, in which all eligible service providers, including those not on the invitation list, could submit bids. Two tenders have been received in this exercise. EDB will continue to explore whether there are more suitable service providers and liaise with schools and related organisations/associations to encourage suitable potential service providers to bid for the service contract beyond the 2022/23 school year.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.29(b)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should endeavour to increase the capacity in the provision of on-site support services on life planning education with a view to meeting the needs of schools and NCS students for the services.</p>	<p>EDB has liaised with the commissioned service provider for life planning education services which has agreed to increase the quota of participating schools for on-site support services by 12.5% for the 2021/22 school year. EDB will continue to liaise with the commissioned service provider to increase the quota of participating schools for the 2022/23 school year. For the service contract beyond the 2022/23 school year, EDB will review the service need having regard to the applications received and explore room for increasing the quota for on-site support service.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.38(a)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should closely monitor the websites of KGs joining KG Scheme to ensure their compliance with EDB's guidelines on admission arrangements.</p>	<p>Since the implementation of the KG Scheme in the 2017/18 school year, EDB has been conducting a compliance survey on the admission arrangements for Nursery (K1) classes of all Scheme-KGs, including inspection of KGs' webpages to ensure their compliance with the relevant guidelines and directives on admission procedures. EDB will continue to closely monitor the websites of KGs joining the KG Scheme to ensure their compliance.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for the recommendation will be carried out on an ongoing basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.38(b)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should encourage KGs to indicate on their webpages that interpretation and/or translation services may be arranged, and non-Chinese speaking children and their parents are allowed to be accompanied by a Chinese speaking relative/friend during the interview.</p>	<p>EDB has reminded KGs vide the EDB Circular Memorandum No. 75/2021 "Admission Arrangements for Nursery Classes in Kindergartens for the 2022/23 School Year" issued on 23 June 2021 to state explicitly the relevant interview arrangements on their respective school webpages to inform parents of NCS children that relevant assistance could be offered when they start the process of admission in 2021 for intake of students for the 2022/23 school year. EDB will check the websites of all Scheme-KGs under an annual survey on admission arrangements for Nursery (K1) classes in KGs conducted by EDB as mentioned above.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an ongoing basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.38(c)	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should encourage secondary schools to make public the admission criteria and weighting of each criterion for the Discretionary Places stage of the Secondary School Places Allocation (SSPA) System in both Chinese and English, in order to help parents of NCS students understand such information to facilitate school choices.</p>	<p>EDB will issue the “Notes for Secondary Schools on Handling Applications for Secondary One Discretionary Places for SSPA 2022” to participating secondary schools in mid-September 2021 to urge participating secondary schools to make known their admission criteria and weighting of each criterion in both Chinese and English on their webpages in addition to publicising the aforesaid information in the Secondary School Profiles. In tandem, EDB conducts regular checking of webpages of all participating secondary schools before the commencement of the Discretionary Places stage in January every year, and follows up with schools as appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.44	<p>Audit has recommended that SED should take on board the observations and recommendations of this Audit Report, and continue to monitor the implementation of the support measures for NCS students and make refinements as necessary.</p>	<p>EDB accepts Audit's observations and recommendations on education support measures for NCS students, and is implementing follow-up actions as appropriate (as listed in this progress summary). Besides, we will continue to closely monitor the implementation of the support measures for NCS students and make refinements as necessary.</p> <p>As the follow-up actions for the recommendation will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

-----

**Control of trade in endangered species  
by the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department  
Progress of implementing Audit's Recommendations**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 2: Licensing and Inspections</b>		
2.10	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation (DAFC) should –</p> <p>(a) regarding the conduct of consignment inspections –</p> <p>(i) take measures to ensure that inspection ratios for all consignment inspections are recorded in the Endangered Species Licensing and Enforcement System (ESLES);</p> <p>(ii) lay down detailed guidelines on inspection sampling in the Endangered Species Protection Division (ESPD) operation manual;</p> <p>(iii) review and update as appropriate the time target in ESPD operation manual for submission of inspection reports and take measures to ensure compliance; and</p> <p>(iv) take measures to ensure that adequate supervisory inspections are conducted in accordance with ESPD operation manual; and</p>	<p>(a) The Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) has arranged for an enhancement of ESLES to set the inspection ratio as a mandatory field to be filled for the inspection report to ensure that the inspection ratio will be recorded in the system. Supervisors have also reminded frontline officers to record the inspection ratio of all consignment inspections in ESLES and have stepped up their supervision, such as increasing the frequency of random checking of inspection reports, as well as reminding staff concerned to conduct adequate supervisory inspections.</p> <p>AFCD has reviewed and updated the guidelines on consignment inspections to strengthen supervision on frontline officers, such as specifying the timeframe for submission of inspection reports and implementing the target supervisory inspection ratio as stipulated in the operation manual. The updated guidelines have been implemented since December 2020.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(b) review the objectives and effectiveness of the follow-up actions on expired import licences, export licences and re-export licences, including the procedures for dealing with licensees not responding to AFCD's reminder letters on expired licences.	<p>(b) AFCD has reviewed the follow-up procedures on expired import licences, export licences and re-export licences, as well as updated and implemented the relevant internal guidelines. According to the updated guidelines, AFCD will issue reminder letters with a specified deadline of reply to licensees of expired import and export licences. Licensees are required to report on the use of the expired licences or return expired licences that have not been used by the deadline to facilitate the department to update the record. The reply will be used for reference in vetting the licensee's subsequent application. If a licensee fails to respond to the reminder letters or return expired licences that have not been used, AFCD will not issue any license for the same consignment again for its import and export.</p> <p>As recommendation (b) has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
2.22	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) take measures to ensure that the laid-down procedures in ESPD operation manual are followed in processing possession licences (PL) applications;</p> <p>(b) review whether the current procedures for inspecting commercial premises with expired and un-renewed PLs effectively meet AFCD's</p>	<p>(a) and (b)</p> <p>AFCD has reminded all relevant staff regarding the procedures laid down in the ESPD operation manual and has strengthened the supervision on frontline staff, including increasing the frequency of random checking. The department has reviewed the procedures for inspecting commercial premises with expired and un-renewed PL, as well as updated and</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>licensing control objectives, and update ESPD operation manual if necessary;</p> <p>(c) continue the efforts to pursue the facial-recognition programme for humphead wrasse in collaboration with the local university; and</p> <p>(d) explore the need and feasibility of labelling or marking individual specimens of other commonly possessed scheduled species in Hong Kong.</p>	<p>implemented relevant guidelines, taking into account the actual market situation. AFCD adopts a risk-based approach in formulating the annual shop inspection plan and arranging routine shop inspections. Relevant considerations include any recent reports of irregularities or complaints against the shops, any rising trend of illegal trade in the species sold in the relevant shops, etc. A shop might be selected for routine shop inspections irrespective of whether it holds a current PL, or whether the PL is expired.</p> <p>(c) and (d) AFCD has been in close contact with the relevant parties (including the tertiary institutions) and continues to explore the application of facial recognition technique on the control of trade in humphead wrasse. AFCD also closely keep in view on whether there are other technological development and applications which can be used for labelling or marking individual specimens.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
2.33	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) keep under review the target number of routine shop inspections and inspection-cum-education visits laid down in ESPD operation manual, and consider setting separate targets for the two types of inspections;</p>	<p>(a) to (c) AFCD has reviewed the overall approach adopted for shop inspections and amended the relevant guidelines. AFCD has also set individual annual targets for routine shop inspections and inspection-cum-education visits respectively, which will be reviewed annually. AFCD has accepted Audit's</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(b) take measures to ensure that the shop list for shop inspection is up-to-date;</p> <p>(c) continue to conduct inspections to the shops on the watch list of shops with irregularities in accordance with ESPD operation manual;</p> <p>(d) lay down guidelines on the follow-up actions that should be taken when a shop is found closed at the time of inspection;</p> <p>(e) remind the inspection officers to –</p> <p>(i) accurately record irregularities identified during shop inspections in inspection reports; and</p> <p>(ii) timely submit inspection reports in accordance with ESPD operation manual; and</p> <p>(f) take measures to ensure that supervisory re-inspections are conducted in accordance with ESPD operation manual.</p>	<p>recommendation and will adjust annually the target number of inspections to be conducted at retail outlets of different nature on the basis of the actual market situation and strategies for regulating trade in endangered species.</p> <p>Under the updated guidelines, supervisors are responsible for vetting the information in ESLES and conducting supervisory site inspections to ensure the accuracy of the information in ESLES. AFCD will continue to update the watch list in accordance with the operation manual and will continue to conduct inspections on shops on the watch list.</p> <p>(d) and (e) AFCD has included in the guidelines the relevant follow-up actions to be taken on shops which are closed at the time of inspection so as to ensure that follow-up inspection will be conducted during the confirmed opening days/hours. The guidelines have already been implemented. AFCD has also reviewed the relevant guidelines and reminded inspection officers to make accurate records of irregularities identified during shop inspections in the inspection reports in accordance with the guidelines and submit inspection reports in a timely manner.</p> <p>(f) AFCD will strengthen supervision of frontline staff in accordance with the relevant guidelines stipulated in the ESPD operation manual, including arranging supervisors to conduct supervisory inspections on the shops concerned. To ensure that supervisory inspections meet</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>the ratios as set out in the guidelines, AFCD has arranged to enhance ESLES by adding a function to automatically count the number of supervisory inspections conducted by each supervisor. This will facilitate management staff of professional grades to analyse the progress of supervisory inspections and remind staff concerned to conduct adequate supervisory inspections.</p> <p>As recommendations have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Investigation and Prosecution</b>		
3.9	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) review the status of all cases remarked as under investigation and prosecution in ESLES, and –</p> <p>(i) where appropriate instigate prompt prosecution before the cases are time-barred; and</p> <p>(ii) take prompt follow-up actions (e.g. applying for court orders for forfeiture of specimens and issuing warning letters) on cases with no prosecution instigated;</p>	<p>(a) AFCD has reviewed all cases remarked as “under investigation and prosecution” in ESLES. Investigations of the 327 cases mentioned in the Audit Report were completed and no prosecution was instigated due to insufficient evidence. They were remarked as “under investigation and prosecution” in ESLES since follow-up actions by AFCD are still underway, such as issuing warning letters to persons concerned and disposal of seized specimens in accordance with the established procedures, etc., are still underway. AFCD is expediting the follow-up actions of these cases, of which 155 have been completed.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(b) take measures to ensure that all case files for cases under investigation and prosecution are kept properly;</p> <p>(c) consider enhancing ESLES to record cases under investigation and those under prosecution separately for better case monitoring;</p> <p>(d) review all cases remarked as pending application for court orders in ESLES to ascertain whether a court order is required for the disposal of the seized specimens in each case and take prompt actions to apply for the orders as appropriate;</p> <p>(e) consider setting a timeframe for applying for court orders for forfeiture of seized specimens to the Government in future; and</p> <p>(f) take measures to ensure that case records in ESLES are properly updated to facilitate monitoring of outstanding cases and taking follow-up actions (e.g. prosecution and court order application) promptly.</p>	<p>(b) AFCD has adopted a new procedure to ensure that the movement of case files is properly recorded. All enforcement officers keep a personal log book to record the movement of case files.</p> <p>(c) and (f) To better monitor the progress of outstanding cases, AFCD is adding a new alert function in ESLES for subject officers and their supervisors to ensure that the relevant cases are handled in a timely manner. In addition, another computer system enhancement project is underway to allow data exchange between the Prosecution Management System of the Prosecutions Unit of AFCD and ESLES of ESPD, and enable tracking of progress of cases under prosecution and applications for a court forfeiture order. The system enhancement is expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2022.</p> <p>(d) and (e) AFCD has reviewed all cases pending application for court orders and has been taking appropriate follow-up actions to handle the cases. AFCD has formulated work targets and deployed manpower suitably for the relevant procedures. In general, the processing of cases that do not involve prosecution but require a court order to dispose of the seized specimens is expected to be completed within six months.</p> <p>As recommendations (b), (d) and (e) have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
3.16	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) continue the efforts in exploring technology for quick identification of scheduled species that cannot be readily identified by morphology; and</p> <p>(b) keep in view the development of new technologies in identification of scheduled species with a view to further enhancing AFCD's enforcement work.</p>	<p>(a) and (b)</p> <p>AFCD has been in close contact with the forensics experts and will continue to keep in view the development and application of relevant forensic technologies for identification of scheduled species.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
3.24	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) keep under review the number of intelligence reports received and explore measures to encourage more intelligence reports; and</p> <p>(b) consider conducting a review on the reward scheme to evaluate its effectiveness and identify measures to improve the operation and attractiveness of the scheme.</p>	<p>(a) and (b)</p> <p>AFCD has been conducting a comprehensive review on the effectiveness of the reward scheme and its operation. AFCD commenced a survey on the market prices of endangered species in 2019 with a view to reviewing the reward levels and the attractiveness of the reward scheme. However, the progress of the survey was hindered by the pandemic. AFCD expects the comprehensive review would be completed within this year. AFCD will continue to promote the reward scheme through different channels, raise public awareness of trade in endangered species and relevant regulations through publicity and public education, and encourage the public to report illegal activities involving trade in endangered species.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 4: Other Related Issues</b>		
4.15	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) review AFCD's record keeping requirements for specimens held and ready for disposal to assess whether the current practice effectively meets the requirements and update ESPD operation manual if necessary;</li> <li>(b) maintain proper records on inspections to care centres;</li> <li>(c) review whether AFCD's current stocktaking arrangements effectively meet the objective of ensuring proper custody of specimens and update as appropriate the relevant requirements in ESPD operation manual;</li> <li>(d) in consultation with the Endangered Species Advisory Committee (ESAC), continue to explore ways to dispose of the forfeited timber; and</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) AFCD has reviewed the record-keeping procedures for specimens held and ready for disposal, as well as updated and implemented the relevant internal guidelines to ensure that the procedures can meet the actual operational needs.</li> <li>(b) AFCD is maintaining proper records on the recent inspections to the relevant organisations.</li> <li>(c) AFCD has reviewed the relevant operational arrangements for stocktaking, as well as updated and implemented the internal guidelines. Regular bring-up mechanism is adopted by AFCD to remind the staff concerned to conduct the annual stocktaking. The latest stocktaking was smoothly completed in April this year. The confiscated specimens were confirmed to be properly stored and in good condition.</li> <li>(d) AFCD consulted ESAC in the meeting held in June 2021 on the disposal of forfeited timber, including identifying other suitable ways of disposal in compliance with the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora, and will continue to consult ESAC on this issue in the future.</li> </ul>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(e) for the placement scheme of pet animals of scheduled species –</p> <p>(i) consider conducting regular visits to the non-governmental organisations (NGOs) under the scheme;</p> <p>(ii) regularly report more information about the scheme to ESAC; and</p> <p>(iii) consider conducting an overall evaluation on the effectiveness and operation of the scheme.</p>	<p>(e) AFCD has comprehensively evaluated the effectiveness and operation of the placement scheme of pet animals of scheduled species, and considered that the scheme had brought about certain benefits to the handling of seized live animals. AFCD reported the review of the scheme to ESAC at the meeting held in June this year. ESAC noted AFCD's views on the issue. AFCD will continue to arrange regular visits to the relevant NGOs that have joined the scheme and report to ESAC with regard to the placement scheme on a regular basis.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.19	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should consider conducting a review on the effectiveness of ESLES, in particular the report generating functions, with a view to enhancing its effectiveness in supporting AFCD's work relating to control of trade in scheduled species.</p>	<p>In accordance with Audit's recommendation, AFCD has reviewed the existing functions of ESLES and commenced enhancement work on various areas, including data entry, progress management and preparation of reports, etc., so as to upgrade the functions of ESLES and facilitate the relevant regulatory work.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.23	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should –</p> <p>(a) consider setting appropriate training targets for frontline enforcement officers; and</p> <p>(b) take measures to ensure that adequate training is provided to frontline enforcement officers to enhance and refresh their knowledge in relation to the Protection of Endangered Species of Animals and Plants Ordinance.</p>	<p>(a) and (b)</p> <p>AFCD has set a training target for frontline officers and will provide at least one enforcement training session for frontline enforcement officers on an annual basis. AFCD will also remind supervisors to arrange for all relevant staff, including experienced staff, to join the training as far as practicable. In April 2021, three sessions of internal training were provided to relevant AFCD staff and officers from the Customs and Excise Department. AFCD will keep in view the need of other species identification or forensic training courses, and arrange additional training where appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.28	<p>Audit has recommended that DAFC should continue to explore the use of electronic means in delivering the publicity and education programmes on scheduled species protection.</p>	<p>To continue its public education during the pandemic, AFCD has organised online education seminars for multiple organisations. AFCD will continue to provide online education seminars for organisations on request and conduct publicity and education activities through the Internet or by electronic means.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

-----

**Innovation and Technology Commission: Efforts in promoting  
internationally accepted standards and conformity assessment services  
Progress in implementing Audit's Recommendations**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 2: Hong Kong Accreditation Service</b>		
2.15	<p>Audit has recommended that the Commissioner for Innovation and Technology (CIT) should –</p> <p>(a) before launching new accreditation programmes, conduct thorough assessments on the market demand for the programmes;</p>	<p>As recommended by Audit, Hong Kong Accreditation Service (HKAS) will continue to conduct thorough market surveys and consult key stakeholders to assess market demand when developing new accreditation programmes. HKAS will consider launching a new service only when sufficient number of organisations have indicated clear intention of applying for accreditation.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) step up efforts in promoting the three accreditation schemes of HKAS and in particular, those accreditation programmes of the schemes with only a small number of accredited organisations;	<p>HKAS continues to promote the services of HKAS and HKAS accredited organisations to public and private sectors as well as government B/Ds via different means, including the website of the Innovation and Technology Commission (ITC) and other online platforms, seminars, newsletters, internal circulars and direct communication, to encourage them to use accreditation and accredited services. In the past few months, HKAS has introduced its accreditation programmes (such as veterinary testing and forensic testing) to government B/Ds, public and private organisations, who may be interested in</p>
	(c) step up efforts in promoting to B/Ds the services of HKAS and services of organisations accredited by HKAS, and encourage B/Ds to use such services; and	

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>applying for accreditation, through emails or meetings. ITC has also organised seminars to promote accreditation and certification services for food safety management system and information security management system.</p> <p>HKAS is also preparing new publicity brochures to promote HKAS's latest services to trade associations and conformity assessment bodies.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting these parts from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) promulgate guidelines on the procedures for ascertaining the reasons for the voluntary terminations of accreditations and whether any follow-up actions are warranted.	<p>HKAS has revised the form used by accredited organisations to file for voluntary termination of accreditation status in July 2021 so as to understand their reason for termination. If the reason given is related to the quality of HKAS services, HKAS will follow up accordingly. HKAS has also revised the internal quality procedures to include relevant guidelines on follow-up actions.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
2.27	<p>Audit has recommended that CIT should –</p> <p>(a) take measures to ensure that the reassessments for accredited organisations are conducted in a timely manner, and arrange remote reassessments where appropriate; and</p>	<p>To ensure that accredited organisations are continuously complying with the accreditation criteria, HKAS conducts regular reassessments for accredited organisations located in Hong Kong and the Mainland. Reassessments are</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>typically conducted by an HKAS officer together with a team of independent expert assessors in the form of on-site assessments. These expert assessors include testing and certification (T&amp;C) professionals, university professors or researchers from Hong Kong, the Mainland or overseas.</p> <p>Since January 2021, HKAS has been conducting remote assessments (i.e. assessments conducted via video conferencing) for organisations of which reassessments were due but could not be conducted on-site, with a view to minimising the impact of the pandemic and its associated travel restrictions on reassessment work. Besides, HKAS will continue to start the preparatory work for reassessments of accredited organisations three and a half months before the reassessment due date. The management of HKAS will also review the reassessment schedule and arrangements every two weeks to ensure that reassessments are conducted in a timely manner.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) strengthen the measures to ensure proper use of HKAS symbols and proper claims of accreditation status.	<p>HKAS took follow-up actions in January 2021 on the four cases mentioned in para. 2.25 of the Audit Report. The organisations concerned have already rectified the accreditation claims.</p> <p>HKAS has strengthened the mechanism on examining the websites of organisations of which accreditation is</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>terminated. Their websites will be checked immediately after the termination is effective, and again in two months' time and on a regular basis afterwards to ensure that the HKAS accreditation symbols and claims of accreditation status are not misused.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
2.31	<p>Audit has recommended that CIT should consider the merits of disclosing the information on the number of newly accredited bodies and the number of accredited bodies which ceased their accreditations in each year.</p>	<p>ITC has already included the performance indicator on the number of newly accredited organisations in the 2021-22 COR and will provide information about the number of accredited bodies which ceased their accreditations in the 2022-23 COR.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Product Standards Information Bureau and Standards and Calibration Laboratory</b>		
3.15	<p>Audit has recommended that CIT should –</p> <p>(a) review the need for maintaining the Product Standards Resource Centre (PSRC) and whether the services of PSRC can be more effectively provided by other means;</p>	<p>ITC has completed the review and, having considered the current demand of services, concluded that it is no longer necessary to maintain a dedicated Product Standards Information Bureau (PSIB) and a physical PSRC to provide the services. As such, ITC is working on abolishing PSIB and the physical PSRC, redeploying the staff of PSIB to other sections of ITC Quality Services Division for handling other duties, and arranging the Quality Services Division</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>to take up the existing work of PSRC so that public money will be used more efficiently and cost-effectively. The relevant reorganisation will be completed in September 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) maintain proper inventory records for all inventory items kept in PSRC and conduct inventory checks according to the requirements of Stores and Procurement Regulations (SPRs);	<p>ITC established an inventory management and review mechanism for PSRC in March 2021, and has started to conduct inventory checks in PSRC and maintain proper records according to the requirements of SPRs. The inventory check will be completed in September 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) devise an effective mechanism on disposal of outdated standards and publications in PSRC which have no reference value;	<p>ITC has adhered to the mechanism established in March 2021 to only maintain the latest versions of standards and publications, and to dispose of outdated documents that are no longer relevant.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) maintain proper performance records on PSIB's sales of standards and take measures to ensure that performance reported in COR is substantiated by proper performance records; and	<p>ITC completed the review of the mechanism to maintain proper performance records on PSIB sales of standards in January 2021 and has developed a new electronic form for inputting and maintaining sales records by responsible personnel. HKAS management will step up the checking</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>of performance records when drafting the COR, so as to ensure that the information reported is substantiated by proper performance records.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(e) take measures to ensure that the information on performance of PSIB reported in COR for sales of standards is accurate.</p>	<p>When preparing the COR, ITC will step up the checking of information with regard to performance of standards sales so as to ensure that the information reported is accurate.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
3.28	<p>Audit has recommended that CIT should –</p> <p>(a) complete the implementation of the recommendation of Government Logistics Department (GLD) on inventory management as soon as practicable, and consult GLD if ITC encounters difficulties in implementing GLD's recommendation;</p>	<p>ITC has expedited the inventory check for all inventory items kept in the Quality Services Division and completed the implementation of the recommendation made by GLD on inventory management in June 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) conduct inventory checks on inventory items according to the requirements stipulated in SPRs and take measures to ensure the accuracy of inventory records;</p>	<p>ITC completed the inventory check on inventory items in Standards and Calibration Laboratory (SCL) in accordance with the requirements of SPR in June 2021. As Taking Over Officers, engineers in SCL are responsible for confirming the accuracy of the relevant inventory records. As Verifying Officers, technical officers in</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>SCL are responsible for performing annual inventory checks in accordance with the inventory records to ensure accuracy.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) properly assign calibration requirement to SCL's equipment and take measures to ensure that the equipment is calibrated in a timely manner according to the planned schedule; and	<p>SCL has put in place procedures to ensure equipment used in calibration jobs have valid calibrations. To ensure the validity and quality of SCL's calibration services, equipment overdue for calibration will not be used for measurements.</p> <p>SCL completed the review of calibration requirements on equipment labels in June 2021. Appropriate calibration status had been assigned to equipment in SCL. SCL will strengthen the management of equipment calibration to ensure that equipment will be calibrated before the due date and the progress will be reviewed regularly to avoid overdue.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) closely monitor the queueing time for SCL's calibration service and take necessary actions to address the issue of long queueing time.	<p>ITC is now reviewing the existing arrangements and will take appropriate measures, including considering setting up different queueing time for high-grade and low-grade equipment, and inform stakeholders accordingly. The review will be completed in September 2021.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 4: Support for Hong Kong Council For Testing and Certification</b>		
4.16	<p>Audit has recommended that CIT should –</p> <p>(a) step up efforts to encourage and facilitate non-official members' attendance at council meetings;</p>	<p>To encourage and facilitate non-official members' attendance at council meetings, the Hong Kong Council for Testing and Certification (HKCTC) Secretariat under ITC will provide facilitation and issue meeting reminders to members more frequently.</p> <p>HKCTC has started using a hybrid mode (i.e. physical and online) to hold meetings since May 2021 so that members who are unable to attend in person may choose to join the meeting through video-conferencing. From the council meeting in August 2021 onwards, HKCTC Secretariat would also check the schedule of members before fixing the date of a council meeting so that more members would be available to attend.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) strengthen measures to ensure that potential conflict of interests of members are declared in council meetings; and</p>	<p>HKCTC Secretariat, starting from the council meeting in May 2021, has adopted the practice of reminding members, at the beginning of each council meeting, the need to make declaration of interest for relevant discussion items (i.e. such practice is not confined to the first meeting of each term of HKCTC members). Whenever there are specific issues which may involve potential conflict of interest to be discussed at a council meeting (e.g. the eligibility criteria for</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>participating in the Local Exhibition Programme and the Mainland and Overseas Exhibition Programme), HKCTC Secretariat will also take the initiative to remind members to declare their interests as appropriate.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) take measures to ensure that the draft minutes of council meetings are issued to members for comments as soon as possible.	<p>HKCTC Secretariat will shorten the time for preparing the draft minutes for council meetings and aim at issuing the draft minutes within one month after a meeting. This arrangement has been adopted since the council meeting of May 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.30	<p>Audit has recommended that CIT should –</p> <p>(a) step up efforts, seeking assistance from EDB if necessary, to promote the teaching kit on chemical testing to secondary schools with a view to arousing students' interest in testing and attracting new blood to T&amp;C industry;</p>	<p>ITC will continue to pursue various means to promote the teaching kit on chemical testing for the new senior secondary curriculum, which was developed by the Hong Kong Baptist University as commissioned by HKCTC. These include organising demonstration sessions and laboratory workshops for teachers and students respectively.</p> <p>Moreover, ITC, with the assistance of EDB, has promoted the teaching kit by making use of EDB's Circular Memorandum on "Distribution of</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>Learning and Teaching Materials by Curriculum Development Institute” issued to schools in July 2021 and the webpage of EDB’s Science Education Section on Chemistry.</p> <p>HKCTC has also planned to develop and launch another set of teaching materials for junior secondary students by end 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) explore measures to encourage the enrolled participants to attend the seminars and workshops organised for T&C practitioners and reduce the no-show rate as far as possible; and	<p>ITC will remind registered participants to attend the HKCTC’s seminars or workshops by issuing reminders to them more frequently.</p> <p>Moreover, ITC will, having regard to the topics and target audience, arrange the seminars/workshops to be held outside office hours (e.g. late afternoon of weekdays) to facilitate the attendance by participants.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) step up efforts to enhance T&C bodies’ interest in the exhibition programmes launched to promote Hong Kong’s T&C services and boost their participation.	<p>ITC will make further promotion at HKCTC seminars and other appropriate activities with a view to encouraging T&amp;C bodies to participate at the exhibition programmes on promoting Hong Kong’s T&amp;C services and will provide facilitation for interested T&amp;C bodies to take part in the exhibition programmes.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
<b>Part 5: Way Forward</b>		
5.8	Audit has recommended that CIT should step up efforts to promote HKAS accreditation services for the testing of medical face masks and Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19).	<p>HKAS contacted laboratories that are currently offering, or preparing to offer, testing services for medical face masks and COVID-19 in the market in June 2021 to encourage them to seek HKAS accreditation if they have not yet been accredited. The July issue of the HKCTC Newsletter also published the promotion message for these services.</p> <p>As at August 2021, 17 testing organisations were granted accreditation for their COVID-19 nucleic acid tests, while applications from 13 organisations were being processed. Besides, one laboratory has been accredited by HKAS for the testing of medical face masks.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
5.13	Audit has recommended that CIT should, in collaboration with the Innovation and Technology Bureau (ITB) and taking on board the observations and recommendations in this Audit Report, continue to engage HKCTC and other stakeholders in the T&C industry with a view to devising appropriate measures to facilitate the industry in grasping new opportunities for development.	<p>ITC, which is under ITB, will continue to strengthen cooperation with HKCTC and other stakeholders to facilitate the development of the T&amp;C industry.</p> <p>In consultation with T&amp;C bodies, ITC has stepped up the promotion efforts in the Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Greater Bay Area. For example, in the first half of 2021, a digital promotion programme of Hong Kong's T&amp;C services was rolled out on a number of popular digital platforms in the Mainland.</p>

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
		<p>ITC will also continue to liaise with the Mainland authorities to explore suitable measures in assisting the T&amp;C industry to grasp the business opportunities in the Greater Bay Area.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

-----

**Management of government vehicle fleet  
by the Government Logistics Department  
Progress in implementing Audit's Recommendations**

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
<b>Part 2: Monitoring of Government Vehicle Fleet</b>		
2.7	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Government Logistics (DGL) should –</p> <p>(a) consider setting time targets for completing departmental transport reviews (DTRs);</p> <p>(b) explore measures to expedite the DTR process in future; and</p> <p>(c) consider disseminating lessons drawn from DTR for the benefits of other B/Ds, where appropriate.</p>	<p>(a) and (b) To expedite the DTR process, GLD has flexibly deployed existing manpower and arranged staff to work full time on a particular review until its completion since June 2021.</p> <p>GLD has set targets for completion of DTRs with reference to the vehicle fleet size of individual B/Ds.</p> <p>(c) GLD has posted the lessons drawn from past DTRs onto Central Cyber Government Office Intranet Portal for reference by B/Ds since April 2021. GLD will continue to update the information in a timely manner.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
2.17	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) remind B/Ds to submit monthly returns on vehicle utilisation within the required timeframe and step up follow-up actions on long-outstanding returns;</p>	<p>(a) Since April 2021, GLD's Transport Management Information System (TMIS) has automatically issued reminders to B/Ds that have yet to submit returns beyond deadlines. For long-outstanding returns, GLD has been following up with B/Ds concerned.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(b) investigate and rectify any discrepancies identified in B/Ds' monthly returns on vehicle utilisation, including those mentioned in para. 2.12;</p> <p>(c) issue the extracts of exception reports on vehicle utilisation for B/Ds' follow-up actions in a timely manner; and</p> <p>(d) consider the merits of conducting in-depth DTRs for B/Ds with vehicles repeatedly captured in the exception reports.</p>	<p>(b) Having checked the discrepancies with B/Ds concerned, GLD found that in most cases, B/Ds omitted to submit or submitted incorrect entries such as kilometre run and fuel/electric consumption through TMIS, and hence the relevant data have been understated. To minimise input errors by B/Ds, GLD has enhanced the verification functions of TMIS. GLD will continue to review the data, conduct spot checks and verify with B/Ds concerned if a discrepancy is identified.</p> <p>(c) To facilitate B/Ds' follow-up actions in a timely manner, GLD will issue exception reports on vehicle utilisation within one month after receiving and verifying the returns from B/Ds for the reporting period.</p> <p>(d) GLD updated the selection guidelines for conducting DTRs for B/Ds in March 2021. In addition to factors such as vehicle fleet size, vehicle utilisation, traffic accident, vehicle hiring expenditure and demand for supernumerary vehicles, whether vehicles have been repeatedly captured in the vehicle utilisation exception reports will also be taken into account in selecting B/Ds for conducting in-depth DTRs.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
2.25	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) consider reporting the calculation basis of the performance targets on transport pool resources utilisation in the COR; and</p> <p>(b) work out a more accurate estimate of annual revenue of the transport pool, taking into account the factors mentioned in para. 2.24.</p>	<p>(a) GLD will report the calculation basis of the performance targets on transport pool resources utilisation starting from the COR for 2022-23.</p> <p>(b) GLD will take into account the factors mentioned, including the hiring pattern of vehicle users, unpredictable prolonged sick leave taken by drivers and factors affecting the filling of driver posts, when working out the estimated annual revenue of the transport pool in December 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendations will be implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
2.32	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) remind B/Ds to submit monthly returns on drawdown positions in a timely manner;</p> <p>(b) remind B/Ds with no departmental quota or with departmental quotas fully utilised to seek prior approvals from GLD before drawing services against GLD term contracts, where appropriate; and</p>	<p>(a) and (b)</p> <p>Since March 2021, GLD has increased the frequency of re-circulating the relevant GLD circular to B/Ds from a half-yearly to quarterly basis with a special emphasis on the need to submit monthly returns on drawdown positions in a timely manner and seek prior approval from GLD before drawing additional services against GLD term contracts.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(c) take measures to ensure compliance with the guidelines on conducting surprise inspections (i.e. at least one surprise inspection for each contract is conducted every three months with priority of inspection accorded to major contracts).</p>	<p>For long-outstanding returns on the drawdown positions, in addition to automatic reminder notifications sent by TMIS, GLD has been following up with B/Ds concerned separately.</p> <p>(c) The inspection schedule had been reviewed and updated in March 2021. GLD will conduct a regular review on the inspection schedule with a view to ensuring its compliance with the inspection frequency stipulated in the guidelines for conducting surprise inspections.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Procurement of Vehicles</b>		
3.13	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) take measures to limit the retained use of supernumerary vehicles to within one year under normal circumstances;</p>	<p>(a) GLD updated the guidelines for processing supernumerary vehicle applications in May 2021 to the effect that GLD would approve the use of a supernumerary vehicle for over one year only under very exceptional circumstances. The relevant factors that will be taken into consideration, such as overall utilisation of departmental fleets and availability of alternative transport means, have been clearly stated in the updated guidelines.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(b) remind GLD staff to keep proper documentation of their consideration of the overall utilisation of departmental fleets before approving requests for supernumerary vehicles; and</p> <p>(c) gather more operational data of electric vehicles (EVs) and consider conducting a study with a view to enhancing the Economic Life Model (ELM) for replacement of EVs.</p>	<p>(b) GLD reminded staff in March 2021 to keep proper documentation of the consideration, including the overall utilisation of departmental fleets, before approving requests for supernumerary vehicles.</p> <p>(c) GLD has started to collect operational data such as the state of health of batteries used in EVs. Subject to the availability of more data for EVs, GLD will consider conducting a study with a view to enhancing ELM for assessing the replacement need of individual EVs.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
3.24	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) explore measures to shorten the time taken for procurement of vehicles and deliver them in a timely manner for use by B/Ds as far as practicable;</p> <p>(b) provide an update on the progress of the procurement of vehicles to B/Ds concerned periodically with a view to facilitating their resource planning for meeting transport needs; and</p>	<p>(a) To facilitate timely delivery of new vehicles, GLD has advanced the processes of inviting and examining the requests from B/Ds for replacement vehicles and the procurement exercise taking into account the time required by potential tenderers for vehicle delivery since the vehicle vetting exercise in 2021.</p> <p>(b) Since March 2021, GLD has started to provide updates to B/Ds on the progress of vehicle procurement when the tenders concerned are issued and on the vehicle delivery schedule when orders are placed for their additional or replacement vehicles with a view to facilitating B/Ds in resource planning for meeting their transport needs.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) continue to take measures to improve the drawing up of user requirements with a view to fully meeting the operational needs of B/Ds as far as practicable.	<p>(c) To fully meet the operational needs of B/Ds as far as practicable, GLD will continue to collect users' feedback on the vehicles procured, and consult B/Ds concerned on the technical specifications before including them in the quotation/tender documents.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 4: Other Related Issues</b>		
4.7	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) keep in view the use of EVs as additional/replacement vehicles by B/Ds under the new requirement for procurement of government vehicles as mentioned in para. 4.5; and</p> <p>(b) continue to examine the availability of suitable EVs in the market that can fully meet B/Ds' operational requirements.</p>	<p>(a) and (b)</p> <p>GLD has all along been closely liaising with and keeping the Environmental Protection Department (EPD) informed of the latest development in the procurement and use of EVs in the Government fleet so as to facilitate EPD in devising its strategy for promoting the wider use of EVs.</p> <p>GLD will keep on collecting information from B/Ds on their various operational needs, examine the availability of suitable EVs in the market that can fully meet B/Ds' operational requirements and pass the information to B/Ds for their consideration.</p> <p>As the above work will be carried out on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
4.15	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should –</p> <p>(a) consider conducting online training courses on a trial basis for targeted government drivers; and</p> <p>(b) take measures to enhance the provision of the Induction Course, Safe Driving Course and Remedial Course to targeted government drivers.</p>	<p>(a) GLD arranged an online training course for government drivers on a trial basis in July 2021 and will continue to identify suitable courses that may be conducted online.</p> <p>(b) GLD has also reviewed and redesigned the Remedial Course and Safe Driving Course so as to increase the number of trainees for each course. GLD is exploring the possibility of arranging online Induction Course for new drivers.</p> <p>As the recommendations have been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>
4.21	<p>Audit has recommended that DGL should regularly remind B/Ds to take appropriate measures to ensure that GLD's requirements on working hours of government drivers are complied with.</p>	<p>GLD reminded B/Ds to take appropriate actions to comply with the requirements on working hours of government drivers in June 2021. Reminders will be sent to B/Ds on a half-yearly basis.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been implemented and the measures will continue on an on-going basis, we recommend that this part be deleted from the next progress report.</p>

-----

**Site formation and associated infrastructure works  
for development near Choi Wan Road and Jordan Valley  
Progress in implementing Audit's Recommendations**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Contractual Disputes under Contract A</b>		
2.20	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Civil Engineering and Development should –</p> <p>(a) in implementing a works contract involving excavation and handling of disposal materials in future, closely monitor the effectiveness of the enhanced control measures for the management of disposal materials having regard to the lessons drawn from the claim for stockpiling and handling of disposal materials under Contract A; and</p>	<p>In August 2011, the Development Bureau (DEVB) promulgated Technical Circular (Works) No. 9/2011 “Enhanced Control Measures for Management of Public Fill” to enhance the accuracy of the estimation and management of generation and demand of construction and demolition (C&amp;D) materials of public works projects. It lays down a mechanism on continuous review, update and monitoring of the estimated quantity of C&amp;D materials generated/demanded at multiple management levels to enable better forward planning on designation of reception sites in a timely manner. Since then, for projects dealing with significant amount of C&amp;D materials, the forecast estimate on generation or demand of C&amp;D materials is required to be reviewed and reported on quarterly basis.</p> <p>The Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to continue closely monitor the effectiveness of the enhanced control measures for the management of disposal materials in their works contracts.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(b) in preparing documents for a works contract in future, take measures to critically vet contract documents (e.g. Bill of Quantities (BQ) items under a composite heading) in accordance with the related guidelines with a view to minimising the risk of contractual disputes on valuation of works arising from different interpretations of contract documents.</p>	<p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>In 2014, CEDD incorporated further guidelines on checking the completeness and accuracy of BQ and related documents into the Project Administration Handbook for Civil Engineering Works (PAH), with an aim to enhancing the vetting of contract documents.</p> <p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to critically vet contract documents in accordance with the related guidelines.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
2.28	<p>Audit has recommended that, in implementing a works contract involving excavation and delivery of excavated materials in future, the Director of Civil Engineering and Development should –</p> <p>(a) remind CEDD staff and consultants to conduct thorough ground investigation at the detailed design stage in accordance with the related guidelines with a view to enhancing the accuracy of the estimation of the quantity of excavated materials generated from the works contract; and</p>	<p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to conduct thorough site investigation at the detailed design stage in accordance with the related guidelines.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(b) closely monitor the quantity and quality of excavated materials delivered to specified disposal sites to ensure compliance with the related contract requirements.	<p>CEDD reminded resident site staff on 14 May 2021 to closely monitor the quantity and quality of excavated materials delivered to specified disposal sites to ensure compliance with the related contract requirements.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Other Issues under Contract A</b>		
3.10	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Civil Engineering and Development should –</p> <p>(a) in implementing a works project involving a large-scale site in future –</p> <p>(i) take measures to ensure that CEDD staff and consultants conduct thorough pre-tender site investigations in accordance with the related guidelines; and</p>	<p>The Geotechnical Engineering Office (GEO) of CEDD published “GEO Publication No. 1/2007 – Engineering Geological Practice in Hong Kong” and updated the “Geoguide 2: Guide to Site Investigation” in 2007 and 2017 respectively, providing guidance on good site investigation practice for works departments to plan and carry out site investigation.</p> <p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to conduct thorough pre-tender site investigation at the detailed design stage in accordance with the related guidelines.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(ii) continue to explore new technologies and digital tools for conducting pre-tender site investigations with a view to providing better information on site conditions for design and tender purposes; and	<p>To enhance the site investigation works for engineering design and tendering, CEDD has embraced latest technological advancements at various fronts. New technologies such as geophysical survey and directional coring are increasingly adopted for more efficient and reliable geological information. Also, digital and information technology are employed in topographical survey for design purpose, including using remote sensing technologies for three-dimensional spatial data acquisition in a safer and quicker manner.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) in implementing a works project involving blasting activities (particularly at works sites in densely populated area) in future, make continued efforts to ensure that CEDD consultants and contractors comply with the control requirements on blasting activities.	<p>CEDD amended the PAH in 2007 and relevant Mines Division Guidance Notes, mandating the deployment of suitably qualified Blasting Competent Supervisor(s) and Resident Explosives Supervisor(s) under the consultants' site supervision team for works projects that involve blasting activities to ensure proper implementation of the specified protective measures. In addition, Mines Division of CEDD also carries out regular inspections to construction sites involving blasting activities to audit the performance of blasting works carried out by the contractor.</p> <p>CEDD reminded its staff, consultants and contractors on 14 May 2021 to make continued efforts to comply with the control requirements on blasting activities.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.
3.15	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Civil Engineering and Development should –</p> <p>(a) complete the post-completion review for Contract A as soon as practicable, and</p>	<p>CEDD conducted the post-completion review for Contract A on 12 March 2021.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) remind CEDD staff and consultants to conduct post-completion reviews on major works contracts in a timely manner.</p>	<p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to conduct post-completion reviews on major works contracts in a timely manner.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 4: Administration of Contracts B and C</b>		
4.10	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Civil Engineering and Development should –</p> <p>(a) in implementing a works contract involving footbridge works in future, take measures to ensure that CEDD staff and consultants conduct pre-tender site investigations (particularly for works at critical locations) in accordance with the related guidelines; and</p>	<p>GEO of CEDD published “GEO Publication No. 1/2007 – Engineering Geological Practice in Hong Kong” and updated the “Geoguide 2: Guide to Site Investigation” in 2007 and 2017 respectively, providing guidance on good site investigation practice for works departments to plan and carry out site investigation.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
		<p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to conduct pre-tender site investigations in accordance with the related guidelines in their works contracts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) in implementing a works project involving slope works in future, remind CEDD staff and consultants to fully assess the conditions of slope works as early as practicable and take prompt follow-up actions as needed.</p>	<p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to fully assess the conditions of slope works as early as practicable and take prompt follow-up actions as needed in their works projects.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
4.21	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Civil Engineering and Development should –</p> <p>(a) in administration of a works contract in future –</p> <p>(i) take measures to enhance the accuracy of cost estimate for works variations as far as practicable; and</p>	<p>The Government introduced an enhanced cost management measures in 2017, under which any variations with estimated value exceeding \$1.4 million should be submitted to the Project Strategy and Governance Office of DEVB for independent views, in particular on cost-effectiveness, before issuance. Also in May 2019, CEDD promulgated new guidelines for dealing with actual cost of variation order exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(ii) remind CEDD staff and consultants to follow CEDD guidelines for dealing with a variation with value exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval;	<p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to follow the latest guidelines to enhance the accuracy of cost estimate for works variations as far as practicable in their works contracts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p> <p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to follow CEDD guidelines for dealing with actual cost of variation order exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval in their works contracts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) consider incorporating into PAH CEDD guidelines for dealing with a variation with value exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval; and	PAH is being reviewed for incorporating guidelines for dealing with actual cost of variation order exceeding its estimate made at the time of approval. The review is anticipated to be completed in end of 2021.
	(c) in preparing documents for a works contract in future, remind CEDD staff and consultants to follow the related guidelines on checking the completeness and accuracy of BQ and related documents.	<p>CEDD reminded its staff and consultants on 14 May 2021 to follow the latest guidelines on checking the completeness and accuracy of BQ and related documents in their works contracts.</p> <p>As the recommendation has been properly implemented, we recommend deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

**Upgrading and operation of Pillar Point Sewage Treatment Works  
Progress in implementing Audit's Recommendations**

<b>Para. No.</b>	<b>Audit's Recommendations</b>	<b>Progress to Date</b>
<b>Part 2: Upgrading Works of Pillar Point Sewage Treatment Works</b>		
2.21	<p>Audit has recommended that the Director of Drainage Services (D of DS) should –</p> <p>(a) regarding the concrete protective coating at Pillar Point Sewage Treatment Works (PPSTW) –</p> <p>(i) continue to monitor the performance of the new types of protective coatings for repairing the peeled-off concrete coating; and</p> <p>(ii) complete the investigation on the failure of the concrete protective coating as early as practicable with a view to identifying the root cause of the matter and taking necessary follow-up actions;</p>	<p>The Drainage Services Department (DSD) will continue to monitor and follow up on the performance of the concrete protective coatings in PPSTW. The performance of the new types of protective coatings for repairing the peeled-off concrete coating has been satisfactory so far, and its performance is under close monitoring.</p> <p>DSD appointed a local university in November 2020 to carry out investigation on the failure of concrete protective coatings to identify the root cause of the matter. The university team has carried out on-site sampling, and performed testing and analysis. The team anticipated that the investigation on the concrete protective coatings deterioration will be completed in November 2021. DSD will carry out the necessary follow-up actions based on the investigation results.</p>
	(b) regarding the automatic cleaning system of ultraviolet (UV) disinfection facilities –	

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	<p>(i) keep under review the operation of the system at PPSTW and explore further measures for enhancing its effectiveness; and</p> <p>(ii) continue to monitor the performance of the system at other sewage treatment works; and</p>	<p>DSD has reviewed the performance of the concerned system. The contractor has combined automatic cleaning system with manual cleaning for the UV sleeves, which is a more effective means to maintain the performance of the UV disinfection system. DSD will continue to explore further with the operator other measures to enhance the operation of the UV disinfection system.</p> <p>DSD will continue to monitor the performance of the system at other sewage treatment works.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(c) keep under review the effectiveness of the additional measures implemented at other sewage treatment works for ensuring the contractor's compliance with contract requirements relating to materials for equipment/facilities.</p>	<p>DSD has implemented additional measures in future sewage treatment works contracts by requiring the contractors to provide a full list of compliance check on materials for equipment/facilities, demonstrating compliance with the contract requirements as well as the relevant requirements specified in the General Specification for Electrical and Mechanical Sewerage Facility Installations. DSD is keeping under constant review the effectiveness of the additional measures.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
2.35	<p>Audit has recommended that D of DS should –</p> <p>(a) in administering an upgrading works project in future, consider incorporating more reference information (e.g. underwater inspection results) as proposed by the consultant into the condition survey report;</p>	<p>DSD will incorporate all the necessary reference information as proposed by the consultant into the condition survey report of future upgrading works projects.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) take measures to enhance the record keeping of relevant test results (e.g. underwater inspection) relating to the conditions of facilities of sewage treatment works;</p>	<p>It has been DSD's standard practice to regularly conduct dye test yearly and underwater inspection once every four years for submarine outfalls. The relevant test results relating to the conditions of facilities of sewage treatment works are kept for 12 years.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(c) in implementing a works project in future, take measures to ensure the timely completion of defects correction by the contractor (e.g. closely monitoring of resources deployed by the contractor to the defects correction programme); and</p>	<p>DSD has drawn on the experience gained, and will closely monitor the contractor's resources planning and take other measures (such as arranging weekly progress meetings by the project team to monitor the defect correction works, and conducting ad-hoc meetings with the senior management on issues that would affect the progress of works) in future sewage treatment works construction to ensure the timely completion of defects correction by the contractors.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>



Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(d) take measures to ensure the timely finalisation of accounts of the design and build portions of a design-build-operate (DBO) contract in future.	<p>DSD has consolidated the experience gained and taken measures to ensure timely finalisation of accounts of the design and build portions of DBO contracts in future, including closely monitoring and taking action as early as possible to resolve those unforeseen technical or contractual problems, and urging the project team to coordinate the construction and operation parties effectively to expedite the completion of all remaining works.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 3: Monitoring of operation of upgraded Pillar Point Sewage Treatment Works</b>		
3.27	<p>Audit has recommended that D of DS should –</p> <p>(a) continue to closely monitor the performance of the contractor in operating PPSTW including compliances with Key Performance Indicators (KPIs);</p>	<p>DSD has been closely examining and making use of the KPIs' compliance level to continuously monitor the performance of the contractor.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(b) review the demerit point mechanism (including the maximum payment deduction level for non-compliances with KPIs and the assignment of demerit points for unauthorised emergency bypass and incident reporting) of the PPSTW contract as scheduled and complete it timely;	As planned, DSD will start reviewing the five-year extension option of the contract in 2022, and the demerit system will also be assessed at the same time.

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) take timely actions to investigate the reasons for high Escherichia coli (E.coli) concentration in effluent found by DSD's surprise checks at PPSTW and address the issues identified (e.g. equipment failure or poor disinfection efficiency of UV disinfection facilities and possible sample contamination);	<p>DSD has reviewed the current arrangement and issued relevant guidelines on 16 August 2021. Regarding the issue of high E.coli concentration found during surprise checks, DSD has taken immediate actions, identified the cause and urged the contractor to rectify the situation. All investigations and relevant reports should be completed as soon as possible according to the new guidelines.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) formalise the existing practice and promulgate guidelines on DSD's surprise checks conducted on effluent quality of PPSTW (covering frequency and timing of surprise checks, and follow-up actions needed);	<p>DSD has reviewed the current surprise check arrangement and issued relevant guidelines on 16 August 2021.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(e) regularly compile management information (e.g. highlights or summaries) on test results of DSD's surprise checks at PPSTW for monitoring by DSD's senior management;	<p>In the guidelines issued on 16 August 2021, DSD has stipulated the requirement to compile management information of the surprise check results, which should cover the details of sampling, investigations to be taken and major findings, for regular reporting to the senior management to facilitate monitoring.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(f) take adequate and timely follow-up actions on incidents relating to occupational safety at PPSTW; and	<p>DSD issued a circular on 27 July 2020 to remind project teams to maintain close liaison with the Labour Department, to timely obtain information of the relevant occupational and safety incidents, to take follow-up actions as soon as possible and to reflect the safety performance in the corresponding quarterly performance report of contractors.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(g) make continued efforts to enhance the occupational safety at PPSTW, including –</p> <p>(i) keeping under review and improving the safety of facilities as needed;</p> <p>(ii) closely monitoring the contractor's measures in safeguarding occupational safety and promoting safety awareness; and</p> <p>(iii) stepping up actions to ensure that the irregularities identified in site safety inspections are timely rectified.</p>	<p>DSD will continue to review and improve the operation safety of the sewage treatment works when needed.</p> <p>DSD has been monitoring the performance of the contractor in occupational safety through monthly site safety inspections and meetings, and will continue to manage the contractor's performance by giving advice, warning and conducting performance appraisal.</p> <p>DSD has closely monitored the progress of rectification of irregularities. Unsatisfactory progress will be immediately followed up and the contractor's performance will be duly reflected in the quarterly performance report.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
3.45	<p>Audit has recommended that D of DS should –</p> <p>(a) continue to monitor Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition (SCADA) System and take timely follow-up actions in addressing the problems identified (e.g. data loss problem in the terminals of the two DSD's offices);</p>	<p>DSD has resolved the problems of SCADA System to avoid the loss of data, and will continue to monitor the operation of the system and take timely follow-up actions in addressing any problems identified. Moreover, all data in the console terminal had been cloned into hard disk to ensure all data are properly recorded.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	<p>(b) enhance the monitoring of the contractor's preventive maintenance of equipment and facilities at PPSTW, including –</p> <p>(i) enhancing the documentation of the revisions made to the preventive maintenance schedules in the PPSTW contract;</p> <p>(ii) taking measures to ensure that preventive maintenance is carried out according to the required frequency; and</p> <p>(iii) exploring the feasibility of using CMM System to capture all maintenance records;</p>	<p>The Computerised Maintenance Management (CMM) System was upgraded in June 2021 to enhance supervision of the contractor's preventive maintenance works. Any changes in maintenance schedules will be well documented.</p> <p>DSD has strengthened the monitoring of preventive maintenance. Systematic ways are being developed to enhance the documentation and monitoring of the preventive maintenance works of the contractor.</p> <p>DSD will continue to review and upgrade the existing CMM System.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(c) strengthen measures to ensure that the maintenance for equipment and facilities at PPSTW is timely completed;	<p>Upon the request by DSD, the contractor has enhanced and upgraded CMM System in June 2021 by adding new functions to ensure timely completion of the maintenance works of the PPSTW's equipment and facilities.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(d) take measures to ensure that maintenance information for equipment and facilities at PPSTW is timely recorded in CMM System;	<p>DSD has requested the contractor to timely record the maintenance information for equipment and facilities at PPSTW in CMM System, and since July 2021, the contractor has been regularly compiling and submitting summaries of CMM System records to DSD. Such arrangement has facilitated timely completion of the maintenance for equipment and facilities.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(e) regularly compile management information (e.g. highlights or summaries) on maintenance carried out at PPSTW for monitoring purpose;	<p>DSD has requested the contractor to enhance the management of records. The contractor has compiled regular management summaries on maintenance for submission to DSD since July 2021 to facilitate progress monitoring and timely completion of the maintenance for equipment and facilities.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(f) strengthen actions to ensure that defects identified in a structural condition survey of PPSTW are timely rectified; and	<p>DSD has strengthened actions by conducting monthly inspection and arranging defects rectification within the respective time limits. Meanwhile, the defects identified in the structural condition survey of PPSTW have been rectified.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(g) regarding items/defects identified in a plant performance audit and a structural condition survey of PPSTW, keep track of the progress of rectification works against the time limits for different items/defects.	<p>DSD will keep track of the progress of defects rectification against the time limits for different items/defects in the next plant performance audit and structural condition survey.</p> <p>Since the follow-up work on this recommendation will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
<b>Part 4: Administration of Design-Build-Operate Contract Arrangement</b>		
4.16	<p>Audit has recommended that the DDS should –</p> <p>(a) keep under review the savings achieved in operating the upgraded PPSTW under the DBO contract arrangement;</p>	<p>DSD has been exercising tight control on the operating cost of the upgraded plant. As of June 2021, while the upgraded PPSTW had been operated for around seven years, the actual operation expenditure in general reflected that the estimated annual saving of \$30 million had been achieved. DSD will keep under review the operation cost savings achieved under the DBO contract arrangement.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

Para. No.	Audit's Recommendations	Progress to Date
	(b) conduct a post-completion review for the design and construction portions of Contract A to facilitate drawing on the experience gained in future DBO contracts; and	<p>DSD conducted the post-completion review for the design and construction portions of the contract, which was completed in August 2021.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>
	(c) make better use of the Knowledge Management Portal in sharing experience gained from DBO contract arrangement (e.g. regular updating of experience gained in implementing DBO contracts).	<p>DSD cherishes the experience gained through the project implementation of the first DBO project on upgrading of sewage treatment works. DSD has uploaded the post-completion review report on the design and construction phases of the contract on the Knowledge Management Portal on 16 August 2021. DSD will continue to make use of the Knowledge Management Portal to share the experience and knowledge gained throughout the PPSTW DBO contract.</p> <p>Since the recommendation has been implemented and will be carried out on an on-going basis, we suggest deleting this part from the next progress report.</p>

-----