

**Laying of the Report** Report No. 72 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits was laid in the Legislative Council ("LegCo") on 17 April 2019. The Public Accounts Committee ("the Committee")'s supplemental report (Report No. 72A) on Chapter 1 of the Director of Audit's Report ("Audit Report") was tabled on 4 December 2019.

2. **The Government Minute** The Government Minute in response to the Committee's Report No. 72A was laid in LegCo on 22 April 2020. A progress report on matters outstanding in the Government Minute was issued on 5 November 2020. The latest position and the Committee's further comments on these matters are set out in paragraphs 3 to 5 below.

**Planning, provision and management of public parking spaces**  
*(Part 4 of P.A.C. Report No. 72A)*

3. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Hong Kong Housing Authority.

4. The Committee was informed that:

Planning and provision of public parking spaces

*Demand and supply of parking spaces*

- the Transport Department ("TD") was actively pursuing various short and medium to long-term measures to increase parking provision, which included providing public parking spaces in suitable "Government, Institution or Community" facilities and public open space projects in line with the "single site, multiple uses" principle;

*Planning and provision of long-term public parking spaces*

- TD had substantially completed the review of the standards for parking facilities specified in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines. TD was consulting relevant stakeholders on the proposed revisions to the parking standards with the objective of promulgating the revised parking standards as soon as possible. The revised parking standards would increase the number of private car parking spaces in private and subsidized housing developments and the number

of commercial vehicle parking spaces in subsidized housing in future. Prior to the promulgation of the revised parking standards, TD would require developers to provide parking spaces at the higher end of the current parking standards for new developments;

- TD was drawing up internal guidelines to set out the principles and requirements for the planning and provision of public parking spaces in new development and redevelopment proposals;
- in approving future submissions of general building plans of car parks which provided parking spaces for both private cars and goods vehicles simultaneously, TD would, through relevant departments, remind the relevant landlords and associated car park operators to provide clear directional signs and road markings at car parks with a view to facilitating drivers to park their vehicles at the right parking spaces;
- for land sale sites and projects under lease modifications, TD would propose incorporation of suitable requirements in the relevant leases for provision of public parking spaces where possible, taking into account the technical feasibility and without compromising the development potential of the sites;
- the Transport and Housing Bureau and TD were liaising with relevant government bureaux/departments to promulgate a circular with a view to setting out the requirement for government bureaux/departments to incorporate public parking spaces in government projects;
- TD had been monitoring the utilization of light goods vehicle ("LGV") parking spaces of the subject car park in Case 2<sup>1</sup> in the Audit Report by site surveys conducted in August 2017, April 2019 and January 2020. In addition, through surveys of illegal parking situation in the vicinity of the subject car park, TD was keeping track of the local parking demand of LGV to ascertain that the provision of LGV parking spaces was generally in line with the demand;

---

<sup>1</sup> In December 1999, a public lorry park with 155 LGV parking spaces was approved for inclusion as a special condition in the land lease of Development A. The Lands Department ("LandsD") conducted seven inspections to check the owner's compliance with the land lease condition and found no lorry was parked in the lorry park from October 2016 to August 2018. However, TD's survey on illegal parking in the area suggested that there was a demand for LGV parking spaces.

- the car park operator of Case 3<sup>2</sup> in the Audit Report had, based on TD's recommendation, put up clear directional signs and road markings at the subject car park in order to facilitate drivers to park their vehicles at the right parking spaces. Furthermore, actions such as impounding or removal of any vehicles which were parked in the area in contravention of any signs or road markings pursuant to the Road Traffic (Parking on Private Roads) Regulations (Cap. 374O) might be considered by the car park operator for proper management of parking spaces in car parks;
- in relation to the actions taken regarding Case 3 in the Audit Report, District Lands Office/Kowloon West had issued an advisory letter to the lot owner, who replied on 28 June 2019 that management measures would be put in place against the improper parking situation. District Lands Office/Kowloon West's subsequent site inspections carried out on 16 August, 11 October and 20 November 2019 as well as 13 July 2020 found no irregularities. TD and the Lands Department ("LandsD") would continue to co-operate to monitor the situation and LandsD would take necessary lease enforcement actions if TD had identified any breach of the relevant clauses in the lease;

### Management of government multi-storey car parks

#### *Review of parking fees and sale of parking tickets*

- having considered the impact on Hong Kong's economy and the utilization of the car parks brought by the Coronavirus Disease 2019 pandemic, TD had decided to maintain the parking fees for car parks under TD's purview at their existing levels for a year with effect from 1 June 2020;
- in March and July 2020, TD conducted questionnaire surveys in seven government multi-storey car parks under its purview where monthly parking tickets were sold on a first-come-first-served basis to

---

<sup>2</sup> In February 1999, LandsD included the provision of public parking spaces as a special condition in the land lease of Development B. LandsD's inspections in August and October 2018 found that some LGV parking spaces were occupied by private cars and letters were issued to the owner requiring rectification. In response, the car park operator informed LandsD that since cordoning-off of LGV parking spaces was not permitted, all LGV parking spaces were open to use by private cars which made it difficult to manage. Audit's site visit in January 2019 revealed that some LGV parking spaces were still occupied by private cars and the non-compliance with land lease condition remained unrectified.

gauge car park users' opinions on the special sale arrangements of parking tickets. The results of the surveys showed that the majority of users of the car parks still supported the use of first-come-first-served arrangement for the sale of parking tickets;

- in respect of the remaining four government multi-storey car parks under TD's purview where parking tickets were sold by balloting, car park contractors were now developing an online platform to allow car park users to submit applications for parking tickets through electronic means;

#### *"Bay Guidance System"*

- TD had embarked on a project for installing the "Bay Guidance System" at the multi-storey car parks under its purview to better monitor the availability and occupancy rates of parking spaces. The Electrical and Mechanical Services Department ("EMSD") was taking forward the installation project and it was expected that the construction works would be completed in the third quarter of 2021;

#### *Non-availability of parking spaces for public use*

- TD completed a review on the use of the rooftop of Kwai Fong Car Park in December 2019. While keeping 21 parking spaces for the Temporary Vehicle Detention Centre, the remaining 54 private car/van parking spaces had been made available for public use since 1 January 2020. Kwai Fong Car Park was now providing a total of 531 and 93 parking spaces for private cars/vans and motorcycles respectively;

#### *Facilities management*

- in collaboration with EMSD and the Hong Kong Police Force, TD had completed a review on the provision of closed-circuit television security systems in government car parks under TD's purview with a view to enhancing security. In this connection, EMSD was conducting a tender exercise for the installation of additional closed-circuit televisions in the car parks concerned. It was anticipated that the installation works would be completed in the third quarter of 2021;

Management of on-street parking spaces

*Management of on-street metered parking spaces*

- TD had completed a review on on-street parking meters charging the rate of \$2 per 30 minutes. It was recommended that the charging rate of about 1 600 metered parking spaces should be adjusted from the rate of \$2 per 30 minutes to \$2 per 15 minutes in order to encourage turnover in view of their high utilization rates beyond 85%. TD had substantially completed the consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the metered parking spaces concerned were located, and would take forward the adjustment progressively after duly evaluating the views gauged;
- TD had completed a review on "longest parking period" for each transaction of existing parking meters. The "longest parking period" for each transaction of about 290 metered parking spaces was proposed to be adjusted downwards to 30 minutes in order to encourage turnover. TD had also substantially completed the consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the metered parking spaces concerned were located, and would take forward the adjustment progressively after duly considering the views gauged;
- TD had conducted a desktop study on adjusting the operating period of parking meters. Having considered the utilization of the parking spaces, TD had preliminarily identified about 220 metered parking spaces concerned, the operating period of which might need to be extended. In this connection, TD had substantially completed the consultation with local stakeholders and members of the relevant District Councils where the metered parking spaces concerned were located, and would take forward the proposed extension progressively after duly considering the views gauged;
- starting from December 2020, TD had installed in Central, Tuen Mun and Clear Water Bay a total of 44 new parking meters with three major functions and features, including supporting payment of parking fees through Octopus or contactless credit cards, supporting remote payment through mobile application, and being equipped with sensors to detect whether individual on-street metered parking spaces were occupied for the provision of real-time vacancy information. About 12 000 new parking meters would also be installed by phases and it

was anticipated that replacement of all existing parking meters would be completed by the first half of 2022;

- the Administration had proactively re-visited the proposed increase in maximum fee chargeable for parking at metered parking spaces. In the light of the latest social and economic conditions and community sentiment, the Administration had decided to withhold the proposed increase in maximum fee to avoid increasing the financial burden of motorists and the transport trades;
- the contracts for "Procurement cum Management, Operation and Maintenance of New Generation of Parking Meter System" had already included provisions requiring the contractors to complete a review on vehicle-sensing technologies and electronic payment means by the end of the sixth contract year (i.e. in early 2025). TD would examine the review reports with a view to considering the way forward of the future management of the roadside metered parking spaces;

#### *Management of on-street non-metered parking spaces*

- TD had arranged to conduct regular surveys on a half-yearly basis to assess the need to install meters and the utilization of on-street non-metered parking spaces. The most recent survey was completed in the first half of 2020;

#### Implementation of parking-related technology initiatives

##### *Dissemination of parking information*

- TD had conducted follow-up meetings with the departments concerned (i.e. the Government Property Agency, the Housing Department and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department) in early 2019, and shared a new standard tenancy clause concerning the provision of parking information for short-term tenancy car parks for their reference. The relevant departments had agreed to incorporate the new clause into their car park contracts upon expiry of the existing ones, such that the parking information could be disseminated to the public via "HKeMobility" mobile application and the Public Sector Information Portal (i.e. data.gov.hk);

- in May 2020, TD held a briefing for the relevant departments and car park operators to facilitate their understanding of ways to disseminate parking vacancy information, including TD's new interactive voice response system, which would enable the dissemination of parking vacancy information of car parks without the provision of exit-entrance monitoring system;
- with the gradual renewal of the relevant car park management contracts, it was expected that the parking vacancy information of government public car parks could be fully disseminated in two to three years;
- for non-government car parks, operators could, at their discretion, disseminate other supplementary car park information, including hyperlinks to the car park operators' specific websites, on the car park information pages. As some information (such as parking fee and promotion) was subject to frequent changes to suit car park operators' own business needs, it was more desirable for the operators to directly disseminate such information to the public via their websites;
- TD had been monitoring the usage of "Hong Kong eRouting" website since its launch. With a view to maintaining the driving route search service for the public, and at the same time better utilizing resources, TD integrated the "Hong Kong eRouting" website into the "Hong Kong eTransport" website in July 2020;

*Provision and management of electric vehicle ("EV") charging facilities at government car parks*

- the Administration had allocated \$120 million to install additional medium EV chargers at government car parks open to the public, including Aberdeen Car Park, Kennedy Town Car Park and Kwai Fong Car Park under TD's purview. Subject to technical feasibility, over 1 000 additional public EV chargers were expected to be in place by 2022, bringing the total number of government public EV chargers to about 1 800. The installation schedule for the additional EV chargers, including those in Aberdeen Car Park, Kennedy Town Car Park and Kwai Fong Car Park, was as follows:

| <b>Fiscal Year</b> | <b>Actual/Estimated No. of<br/>Additional Public EV Medium Chargers</b>   |
|--------------------|---|
| 2019-2020          | about 170 (actual)  |
| 2020-2021          | about 570 (estimated)<br>(including those in Aberdeen Car Park,<br>Kennedy Town Car Park and<br>Kwai Fong Car Park) |
| 2021-2022          | about 460 (estimated)   |

- the Environmental Protection Department would work closely with TD on the provision of real-time availability information of EV chargers in the car parks under TD's purview in order to facilitate EV drivers to identify vacant parking spaces equipped with EV chargers. In order to assist drivers in identifying EV parking spaces, electronic display panels would be installed at the entrances of government car parks to display the real-time availability of parking spaces with EV chargers;
- in view of the latest utilization rates of car parks under its purview, TD had implemented since 1 August 2020 a trial scheme in four car parks (i.e. Rumsey Street, Star Ferry, City Hall and Tin Hau Car Parks), designating some parking spaces with EV chargers for exclusive use by EVs. The trial would last for six months. TD would review the effectiveness of the scheme after the trial;
- the Administration had allocated funding for the installation of over 1 000 additional medium EV chargers at government car parks by 2022. These additional EV chargers would be installed at locations that were less popular as far as possible;

*Implementation of automated parking systems*

- TD was taking forward six automated parking system pilot projects, and had already identified four pilot sites for adopting automated parking systems (i.e. Tsuen Wan, Sham Shui Po, Sheung Wan and Chai Wan); and
- for the short-term tenancy site in Tsuen Wan, TD had awarded the tender to a contractor to provide not less than 75 automated parking spaces with a view to commissioning automated parking systems in the second half of 2021. As regards the pilot project in Sham Shui Po, TD was currently assessing the technical feasibility after securing



support from the relevant District Council. For the proposed pilot projects in Sheung Wan and Chai Wan, TD would consult the relevant District Councils in due course.

5. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.