Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Laying of the Report The Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year end 31 March 2019 and his Report No. 73 on the results of value for money audits were laid in the Legislative Council ("LegCo") on 27 November 2019. The Public Accounts Committee ("the Committee")'s Report (Report No. 73) was subsequently tabled on 26 February 2020 which met the requirement of Rule 72 of the Rules of Procedure of LegCo that the Report be made within three months of the Director of Audit's Report ("Audit Report") being laid.

2. **The Government Minute** The Government Minute in response to the Committee's Report No. 73 was laid in LegCo on 27 May 2020. A progress report on matters outstanding in the Government Minute was issued on 5 November 2020. The latest position and the Committee's further comments on these matters are set out in paragraphs 3 to 76 below.

Consumer protection against unfair trade practices, unsafe goods, and short weights and measures

(Paragraphs 3 and 4 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 3. The Committee was informed that the Consumer Council aimed to commence the enhancement of its Complaints Case Management System to improve its analytical and reporting capabilities for better case management in 2021-2022.
- 4. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Government's efforts in managing excavation works on public roads (Paragraphs 5 and 6 of Part 3 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 5. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2020 that:
 - the Highways Department had been closely monitoring the progress of the consultancy study on the review of the implementation of Common Utility Enclosures ("CUE"). The consultant had completed all the tasks specified in the consultancy study and was preparing the final

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

report. The Highways Department would take timely follow-up actions on the findings and recommendations of the consultancy study;

- the experience in conducting/planning the trial CUE schemes had been taken into account in the above-mentioned consultancy study. A framework for implementing CUEs in new development areas had been recommended. This included procedures to identify suitable locations to install CUEs through consultation with the relevant utility undertakings at an early stage of implementation of a new development area project with due regard to its construction programme and the results of the detailed cost and benefit analysis conducted; and
- the implementation results of the two trial CUEs constructed in 2006 had been reviewed in the consultancy study and recorded in the deliverables of the consultancy study.
- 6. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Monitoring of charitable fund-raising activities

(Paragraphs 3 to 5 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a director of the Absolutely Fabulous Theatre Connection and the Heifer International Hong Kong Limited respectively, an Executive Committee Member of the Hong Kong Sheng Kung Hui Welfare Council Limited, a founder member of the Construction Industry Charity Fund and a member of the School Council of St. Stephen's Girls' College, all of which might have conducted fund-raising activities. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun participated charitable that he had in fund-raising declared Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that he was a member of the Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong, which might have conducted fund-raising activities. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Assessment Committee of the Liberal Party Caring Foundation, which might have conducted fund-raising activities, and unremunerated honorary adviser or honorary member to some non-governmental organizations ("NGOs").
- 8. The Committee was informed that the Home Affairs Bureau ("HAB") had been assigned to co-ordinate inputs from relevant government bureaux/departments

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

("B/Ds") in formulating a response to the Law Reform Commission of Hong Kong's recommendations on the monitoring of the operation of charities for the Administration's overall consideration.

9. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of squatter and licensed structures

(Paragraphs 6 to 8 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 10. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Hong Kong Housing Authority ("HKHA").
- 11. The Committee was informed that:

Monitoring of squatter and licensed structures

taking into account the overall enforcement priorities under the squatter control policy, any genuine difficulties encountered by the occupants and local sentiments, as well as any special policy considerations relevant to businesses operating in that particular area, the Lands Department ("LandsD"), in consultation with the Development Bureau, was drawing up a proposal on a pilot scheme for regularization of warranted cases by way of short-term tenancies and/or short-term waivers for consultation with relevant B/Ds; and

Rates, government rent and licence fees on squatter and licensed structures

- LandsD was conducting an overall review of the licence fee charging mechanism for Government Land Licences. After digitizing the Government Land Licence records in end 2019, LandsD was consulting relevant B/Ds with a view to identifying the most appropriate way forward for the review of the Government Land Licence fee levels.
- 12. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Kai Tak Cruise Terminal

(Paragraphs 9 and 10 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 13. The Committee was informed that the Tourism Commission had implemented the recommendations made by the Audit regarding Kai Tak Cruise Terminal and the overall cruise tourism development in Hong Kong. The Tourism Commission would continue to closely monitor the industry performance through keeping track of the key parameters of the economic benefits brought by the industry.
- 14. As the cruise tourism industry was hit hard by the Coronavirus Disease 2019 epidemic, the Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of projects financed by the Lotteries Fund

(Paragraphs 11 and 12 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 15. The Committee was informed that regarding the assignment of the social centre for the elderly to the Administration (Case 7 in the Audit Report), the Government Property Agency ("GPA") completed in April 2019 the vetting of the revised assignment plan submitted by the developer. The assignment procedure would be duly completed pending the developer's confirmation of the conditions of assignment and payment arrangements. GPA had already requested the developer and the grantee to provide the revised draft assignment. Between April and July 2020, GPA issued a total of four reminders urging the developer and the grantee to take prompt action to complete the assignment of the social centre for the elderly.
- 16. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

A Lotteries Fund grant of \$1.46 million was approved in February 1993 for the construction and fitting-out works of a social centre for the elderly. However, the project account has not yet been finalized since the substantial completion of the works in December 1997 because the assignment of the title of the social centre to the Administration has not been completed.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Government's support and monitoring of charities

(Paragraphs 13 to 15 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

17. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him declared that he was a director of the Absolutely Fabulous Theatre Connection and the Heifer International Hong Kong Limited respectively, a founder member of the Construction Industry Charity Fund and a board member of the Construction Industry Skills Training Centre Limited. He was also a member of the School Council of St. Stephen's Girls' College. In addition, he was involved in the construction of the new headquarters of Scout Association of Hong Kong. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was a member of the Scout Association of Hong Kong and was involved in the work of a number of charities. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of the Assessment Committee of the Liberal Party Caring Foundation.

18. The Committee was informed that:

Administration of tax exemption of charities and tax-deductible donations

- HAB had been tasked to co-ordinate inputs from relevant B/Ds for formulating a response to the Law Reform Commission of Hong Kong's Report on Charities. HAB had been actively following up the co-ordination. Recommendations in the Audit Report and the Committee's Reports would be taken into account in this process;

Administration of land granted to charities for operating welfare/social services

among the eight cases named in the Audit Report in which the leases specifically permitted the running of hostels/dormitories, relevant B/Ds had confirmed earlier that they were satisfied with the current use or operation of hostels/dormitories under seven of the cases, i.e. Leases F, G, H, I, J, M and N. As regards Lease L, the grantee recently had submitted a certificate from an independent auditor demonstrating that the use of surplus income generated from the hostel from 2017-2018 to 2019-2020 was to the satisfaction of LandsD. LandsD would continue to monitor the case to ensure that the use of surplus income generated from the hostel under Lease L was satisfactory; and

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Regulation of Chinese temples

- in respect of the renewal of the expired delegation agreement of the remaining one delegated temple, the Chinese Temples Committee Secretariat had discussed with the new Chairman of the delegated organization on re-entering into a new delegation agreement. The new Chairman was consulting other stakeholders of the organization and had agreed to revert as soon as possible.
- 19. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Fresh food wholesale markets

(Paragraphs 19 to 21 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 20. Hon YUNG Hoi-yan declared that she was a member of the Fish Marketing Advisory Board.
- 21. The Committee was informed that:

Reprovisioning of private and public fresh food wholesale markets

regarding the relocation of the Cheung Sha Wan Temporary Poultry Market, the Administration had been exploring Fu Tei Au and other possible sites for relocation together with some other wholesale markets under the study commissioned by the Civil Engineering and Development Department. Depending on the study results and other considerations, the Food and Health Bureau and the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department ("AFCD") would consult the relevant stakeholders and consider the way forward; and

Way forward

- a holistic review on the roles and functions of the Fish Marketing Organization and the Vegetable Marketing Organization, including their strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats, was being conducted. The Food and Health Bureau and AFCD would fully take

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

into account Audit's recommendations when mapping out the way forward.

- 22. From the List of outstanding items for discussion of the LegCo Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene, the Committee notes that the Administration would report to the LegCo Panel on Food Safety and Environmental Hygiene (or the LegCo Panel on Development) on the progress of the wholesale market consultancy study (including the timetable, proposed sites and detailed plan for relocating the Cheung Sha Wan Temporary Poultry Market) in due course.
- 23. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts

(Paragraphs 22 and 23 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

24. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of academic programmes

Admission of non-local students

having taken into account various considerations including the recent economic situation and the outbreak of Coronavirus Disease 2019, the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts ("HKAPA") had decided to maintain the tuition fee for non-local students at the same level as in 2019-2020. The tuition fee applicable to local and non-local students in 2020-2021 were \$42,100 and \$52,000 for degree programmes, and \$31,575 and \$39,000 for sub-degree programmes respectively. As the tuition fee for non-local students should be set at a level sufficient to recover all additional direct costs, the tuition fee would be reviewed with a view to recovering all additional direct costs when the economic situation was improved. HAB would continue to monitor HKAPA's setting of the tuition fee level, and follow up with HKAPA on its policy on admission of non-local students, taking into account a series of factors including the need to maintain a satisfactory mix of international and local students;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Student unit cost

as the enrollment figures would have a direct impact on student unit cost, HKAPA had implemented different measures with a view to increasing the number of full-time students, which included the implementation of the online application system by phases. Phase 1 came into operation in September 2019 and Phase 2 had been implemented since September 2020. The system was applicable to both post-secondary and undergraduate programmes. provided an online platform to collect and update student application data/status to facilitate online checking of applicants' eligibility for initial screening. It also enabled HKAPA to make timely decision on student recruitment with reference to the management information reports generated from the system. Phase 2 enabled HKAPA to conduct online audition/interview and to make admission offers to applicants. More advanced management information reports could be generated which was useful in decision making in respect of student The student unit cost would continue to be monitored: admission.

Governance and government monitoring

- HAB had requested HKAPA to further improve the content of the audited financial report to fully fulfil Audit's recommendations in respect of the compliance with subvention requirements. On updating of the Memorandum of Administrative Arrangements, HAB would continue to liaise with HKAPA to consider the incorporation of suitable clauses, including clauses on Government Reserve and submission of audited account, that were mutually agreed by HAB and HKAPA and in line with the prevailing subvention guidelines; and

Campus improvement and expansion

- HKAPA was preparing the documents on the final account of the on-campus expansion project for submission to the Architectural Services Department ("ArchSD"). HAB would continue to monitor HKAPA's progress in finalizing the project account on the on-campus expansion project.
- 25. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Planning, construction and redevelopment of public rental housing flats (Paragraphs 26 to 28 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 26. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was a member of HKHA and engaged in the trading business of construction materials.
- 27. The Committee was informed that according to HKHA's Public Housing Construction Programme as at September 2020, the estimated total public housing production of HKHA and the Hong Kong Housing Society in the five-year period from 2020-2021 to 2024-2025 would be 101 300 units. As announced in the Chief Executive's 2020 Policy Address, based on the Long Term Housing Strategy Annual Progress Report 2020 published by the Transport and Housing Bureau, the Administration had identified all the land required for providing 316 000 public housing units to meet the demand for about 301 000 public housing units in the coming 10 years (i.e. 2021-2022 to 2030-2031). The Committee noted that the Administration had submitted the Long Term Housing Strategy Annual Progress Report 2020 and Public Housing Construction Programme 2020-2021 to 2024-2025 to the LegCo Panel on Housing at its meeting held on 14 January 2021.
- 28. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Recoverability of the outstanding advances to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

(Paragraphs 29 and 30 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 29. The Committee was informed that the Security Bureau reiterated again by letter to the Hong Kong Sub-office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees in September 2020 the Administration's stance and registered the Hong Kong community's expectation of an early recovery of the outstanding advances. The Administration was now considering the Committee's suggestion to the LegCo Panel on Security in March 2020 that the Administration should re-consider writing off the outstanding payment.
- 30. The Committee recommends that the issue be continued to be followed up by the LegCo Panel on Security and wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject matter.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Small house grants in the New Territories

(Paragraphs 31 to 34 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

31. Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun declared that he was an indigenous villager of the New Territories and had exercised his small house concessionary right to build New Territories small houses.

32. The Committee was informed that:

- the Court of First Instance of the High Court ("CFI") handed down a judgment and subsequent orders² on a judicial review of the small house policy on 8 and 30 April 2019 respectively; and
- since the CFI judgment took effect, the Administration had suspended the processing of the applications already received for building small house on government land by way of the Private Treaty Grant and Land Exchange arrangements. The receipt of new applications for these two types of grants had also been suspended since 8 April 2019. Pending the results of the appeal, the aforesaid arrangements would be maintained.
- 33. The Committee noted that although "Small House Policy and rural planning strategy" had been put on the List of outstanding items for discussion of the LegCo Panel on Development, the Administration considered that it would not be in a position to discuss the small house policy review at this juncture as all parties to the judicial review had lodged appeal against the judgment of CFI, and the Court of Appeal handed down the judgment on 13 January 2021 which allowed the Government's appeal. The developments of the judicial review case might have implications on the policy.
- 34. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

² CFI ruled that the Free Building Licence and Land Exchange arrangements for building small houses on private land under the small house policy, being a lawful traditional right and interest of the indigenous inhabitants of the "New Territories" within the meaning of Article 40 of the Basic Law, were lawful and constitutional, while the Private Treaty Grant and Land Exchange arrangements for building small houses on government land under the policy were not. CFI also stated that the judgment would take effect on 8 October 2019.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Management of roadside skips

(Paragraphs 39 and 40 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 35. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2020 that:
 - Tseung Kwan O Area 137 Fill Bank and one at Siu Lang Shui in Tuen Mun, through short-term tenancies, for use by the skip trade to store idling skips. It had also continued to engage a dedicated term service contractor to assist enforcement departments in speeding up the removal of skips found to be posing serious obstruction to traffic and/or imminent danger to the public, thereby enhancing enforcement efficiency and the deterrent effect;
 - from 2017 to 2019, the Joint Working Group on Management of Roadside Skips ("JWG") had conducted a total of 65 joint enforcement operations to tackle the malpractice of indiscriminate placement of idling skips at a number of black spots, including Tseung Kwan O, Sai Kung, Kowloon Bay, Kai Tak and Chai Wan areas. JWG would continue to duly organize joint enforcement operations as necessary at black spots in various districts. It was also preparing for a trial to install surveillance camera systems at the black spots along Shing Tai Road, Chai Wan and Muk On Street, Kai Tak, aiming for stepping up enforcement and deterrence against the malpractice of indiscriminate placement of skips at roadside;
 - JWG had engaged a consultant to work with skip operator trade and other stakeholders (such as construction trade associations, property management companies and insurance trade associations) to explore the setting up of a voluntary skips management system and draw up the proposals concerned. The consultant of JWG, after consulting skip operator trade and other stakeholders, had suggested that the "Certification Scheme for Skips" ("Certification Scheme"), "Registration Scheme for Skip Operators" and "Charter for Skip Users" should be implemented under the voluntary management system to address public and trade concerns;
 - JWG engaged a consultant in late 2019 to assist skip operator trade in commencing the preparatory work for the voluntary skips management system. It was expected that the first phase of the Certification

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Scheme would be launched in the second half of 2020, while the "Registration Scheme for Skip Operators" and "Charter for Skip Users" would be rolled out progressively in line with the amount of certified skips in the market;

- to assist skip operator trade in expediting the implementation of the Certification Scheme so as to increase the amount of certified skips in the market, JWG was conducting a trial for the trade to retrofit about 30 in-use skips with fixtures to meet the warning and appearance requirements for road safety as set by the Transport Department ("TD") and to prevent environmental nuisance. Such fixtures could help avoid the skips from posing safety threats to other road users or causing nuisance to the public. The trial was expected to be completed in the second quarter of 2020. The findings and experience gained would provide important information including the design and materials of the road safety fixtures, operation guidelines, the retrofitting cost and time required to facilitate the carrying out of suitable retrofitting works for all in-use skips across the territory by the trade; and
- JWG would continue to explore options for enhancing the standards of skip operations. Taking into account the progress of and the experience gained in implementing the voluntary management system, JWG would consider whether there was a need to introduce a new regulatory system in the long run.
- 36. The Committee wrote to Secretary for Environment on 6 January 2021 to seek information about the latest position of the measures implemented by the Administration to enhance the management and control of roadside skips. The replies from **Director of Environmental Protection** are in *Appendix 4*.
- 37. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of long-term care services for the elderly

(Paragraphs 41 and 42 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

38. The Committee was informed in the Government Minute which was laid before LegCo in May 2020 that:

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- on supporting ageing in place of frail elderly persons, the Administration would provide an additional 3 000 service quota under the Integrated Home Care Services (Frail Cases) in total in 2020 and 2021, which represented an increase of around 29% as compared with 10 365 home care places in May 2020. The Administration would also provide 1 000 additional Community Care Service Vouchers in 2020-2021, bringing the total to 8 000, to provide services for more elderly persons in need;
- on residential care services, the Administration had been implementing 51 development projects since 2019-2020 to gradually provide, inter alia, about 7 100 subsidized and non-subsidized residential care places. The Administration would also continue to purchase additional EA1 places (i.e. places with higher standard of staffing and space provision) from eligible residential care homes for the elderly under the Enhanced Bought Place Scheme to provide an additional 5 000 subsidized residential care places in phases from year 2019-2020 onwards; and
- the Administration would implement the above initiatives for the provision of elderly services on an on-going basis.
- 39. The Committee noted that the Administration had updated the LegCo Panel on Welfare Services at its meeting on 11 January 2021 on measures to enhance community and residential care services for the elderly.
- 40. The Committee recommends that the issue be continued to be followed up by the LegCo Panel on Welfare Services and wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Administration of the air traffic control and related services (Paragraphs 43 to 45 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

41. Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that he was a non-executive director of the Airport Authority Hong Kong.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

42. The Committee was informed that:

- the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China announced in October 2020 the imposition of sanctions on three companies from the United States, including Raytheon, which was the supplier of the new Air Traffic Management System; and
- in November 2020, the Administration informed LegCo that the Transport and Housing Bureau and the Civil Aviation Department had been, and would continue to be, in close communication with the supplier of the Air Traffic Management System to ensure that the necessary civil aviation equipment and services were provided in accordance with the contract requirements. The Administration would spare no effort in safeguarding aviation safety and ensuring that the maintenance work for the Air Traffic Management System would not be affected.
- 43. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Regulation of non-franchised bus and school private light bus services (Paragraphs 53 and 54 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

44. The Committee was informed that:

Administration of licensing requirements

- TD had merged the Passenger Service Licence Certificates for scheduled services and non-scheduled services of public non-franchised buses since 13 July 2020;
- TD was considering the implementation of the proposal of aligning the validity periods of the Passenger Service Licence Certificates and related Passenger Service Licences, and the related legislative timetable; and

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Regulatory controls over unauthorized operations

- TD had completed the review and was conducting the preparatory work to put in place measures, through legislative amendment, to prevent Passenger Service Licence holders from avoiding sanctions by transfer of ownership of vehicles. TD aimed to introduce such amendments into LegCo for scrutiny in 2021.
- 45. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Operation of the Land Registry

(Paragraphs 55 and 56 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

46. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of services

the Land Registry and the Home Affairs Department secured funding in June 2020 for the implementation of the computerization of owners' corporation records which was targeted for completion in end 2021;

Implementation of the Land Title Registration System

- due to the Coronavirus Disease 2019 pandemic, the Land Registry had been following up with key stakeholders as well as the Land Titles Ordinance Review Committee and the Land Titles Ordinance Steering Committee on the main issues for implementing the "new land first" proposal, including indemnity arrangements, verification of applications for registration, title certificates and caution mechanism, through circulation of discussion papers in 2020; and
- the Administration planned to consult the Land Titles Ordinance Steering Committee on the proposed major amendments to the Land Titles Ordinance (Cap. 585) after reaching consensus with the stakeholders on the main issues concerning the "new land first" proposal. The Land Registry would then refine the Land Titles (Amendment) Bill according to the comments of the Land Titles

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Ordinance Steering Committee and work out a more concrete implementation timetable.

47. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of government office accommodation and utilisation of government sites

(Paragraphs 57 and 58 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

48. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of government-owned office accommodation

- GPA would continue to consider "Government, Institution and Community" sites recommended by the Planning Department in its site search for planning new joint-user general office buildings, with a view to meeting additional office accommodation needs on a long-term basis;
- relevant B/Ds were actively taking forward the implementation of the nine replacement building projects under the Wan Chai Government Offices Compound relocation exercise;
- the construction works of the West Kowloon Government Offices and the move in of user B/Ds to the West Kowloon Government Offices had been completed. Construction works for the Government Information Technology Building, the Inland Revenue Tower, the Treasury Building and the Immigration Headquarters had commenced. The Government Information Technology Building, the Inland Revenue Tower and the Treasury Building were scheduled to be completed in 2022, while the Immigration Headquarters was expected to be completed in 2023. The Tseung Kwan O Joint-user Building (to be named as Tseung Kwan O Government Offices) project obtained funding approval from the LegCo Finance Committee on 14 July 2020. The construction works had commenced in September 2020 and were expected to be completed in the first quarter of 2025;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- the preparation of the remaining three building projects was in progress. In December 2020, the LegCo Finance Committee approved the funding applications of the remaining three building projects (namely the Drainage Services Department Office Building, the Water Supplies Department Headquarters with Hong Kong and Islands Regional Office and the Correctional Services Department Headquarters Building);
- it was the Administration's target to complete the construction of all the replacement building projects under the Wan Chai Government Offices Compound relocation exercise by 2026;

<u>Utilization of government sites</u>

- GPA was keeping site particulars in the Government Property Information System up to date with reference to the relevant information from ArchSD's completed projects under the established This updating mechanism was running smoothly and mechanism. subject to periodic reviews. All system enhancements to the Government Property Information System to perform more automatic cross-checking of processes various to prevent omissions/discrepancies had been put in place and further system enhancements would be examined when necessary;
- in view of the proposed public housing development at Shek Pai Street in Kwai Chung, TD had requested the Civil Engineering and Development Department to conduct a traffic impact assessment under the feasibility study for the "Site Formation and Infrastructure Works for the Development at Shek Pai Street, Kwai Chung" to review the traffic impact on the adjoining road network and propose traffic improvement measures, if necessary. The concerned traffic impact assessment had been largely completed. TD, together with the Civil Engineering and Development Department, was studying the aforementioned traffic impact assessment and relevant supplementary information to review the need for implementing the Kwai Chung Circumferential Road project; and
- meanwhile, the government land at No. 5-7 Yip Shing Street, Kwai Chung (currently reserved for implementing the Kwai Chung Circumferential Road project) would be let to an NGO by way of direct grant under short-term tenancy for the purpose of transitional housing

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

for a proposed term of four years and nine months certain and thereafter quarterly.

49. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Administration of lump sum grants by the Social Welfare Department (Paragraphs 59 to 61 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

50. Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun and Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that they were directors and/or advisers to a number of NGOs which might have received lump sum grants or other subventions from the Social Welfare Department ("SWD"). Hon Steven HO Chun-yin declared that one of his family members worked in SWD.

51. The Committee was informed that:

Financial monitoring

- SWD had on-going discussion with three NGOs (i.e. NGOs I, J and K) on the details of appropriate cost apportionment basis for head office overheads between Funding and Service Agreement ("FSA") services and non-FSA services. These NGOs had provided more concrete and reasonable apportionment plans for SWD's assessment. Discussion on the calculation details was in progress;
- SWD had given advice to another NGO (i.e. NGO G) to facilitate it in working out a clear and consistent cost apportionment basis. The NGO had proposed to SWD a revised cost apportionment plan. SWD held a meeting with the NGO on 19 June 2020 in which the NGO had agreed to submit concrete calculation basis for cost apportionment together with supporting documents on the remaining expenses;

Monitoring of service delivery by SWD

SWD had collaborated with the Agreement Service Unit J, which was a children and youth centre for people aged from 6 to 24, to rectify the relevant statistics regarding the cross generation project involving

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

retired men, which in fact was an FSA-related activity. As regards the activities provided by the Service Unit for children under six, SWD would hold a meeting with the Service Unit to map out an agreed cost apportionment method as such activities were not regarded as FSA-related activities; and

Review of lump sum grant subvention system

- as of November 2020, the review of lump sum grant subvention system was still in progress.
- 52. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Centre for Food Safety: Management of food safety

(Paragraphs 62 and 63 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 53. Hon YUNG Hoi-yan declared that she was a member of the Fish Marketing Advisory Board.
- 54. The Committee was informed that the Centre of Food Safety was working closely with the contractor on data analysis and preparation of the report on the second population-based food consumption survey, with a view to completing the whole survey by mid-2021.
- 55. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Management of signboards by the Buildings Department

(Paragraphs 64 and 65 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

56. The Committee was informed that the Buildings Department had engaged a consultant in September 2020 to test the feasibility of applying artificial intelligence in lieu of manual extraction in identifying and extracting relevant information of existing legal or validated signboards from approved plans with a view to expediting the progress.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

57. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Radio Television Hong Kong: Provision of programmes

(Paragraphs 66 and 67 of Part 5 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

58. The Committee was informed that:

Production of programmes

Radio Television Hong Kong ("RTHK") conducted in January 2020 the first focus group study on the commissioning of television ("TV") programmes to collect views from participants, listeners and audiences on how to enhance awareness of the relevant programmes as well as promotion, etc. RTHK had reported the results of the study and the latest information on the commissioning of TV programmes to the RTHK Board of Advisors. RTHK would conduct focus group studies on an annual basis in the future;

Broadcasting of programmes and new media services

- for content licensing, RTHK had stepped up promotional strategies by exploring more diversified markets, such as promotion to airline companies, and participating in more international TV programme showcases to promote RTHK's programmes;

Evaluation of programmes and other administrative issues

- regarding the procurement procedures for the Radio Audience Surveys and TV Appreciation Index Surveys, RTHK had completed the review and removed the mandatory requirements imposed on the service providers and enhanced the marking schemes to ensure that the procurement procedures were in compliance with the Government's procurement regulations (including the pro-innovation government procurement policy);
- RTHK had adopted the revised procurement procedures and marking scheme, and commissioned a survey institution in April 2020 to conduct the reviewed and revised Radio Audience Survey. The survey report was completed in September 2020;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- RTHK had also reviewed and revised the frequency and scope of the "TV Programme Appreciation Index and Audience Survey", and commenced the procurement process in August 2020. The survey commenced in November 2020 and the report would be available in early 2021;
- to ascertain the reasons for low TV ratings, RTHK commissioned a survey organization in November 2019 to conduct the "RTHK TV Channel Penetration Survey" to collect information and data on the penetration/take-up patterns of the digital terrestrial TV channels, viewing habits and preferences of the audience. The survey was still in progress;
- in early 2020, RTHK had made use of a social media analytical tool to collect cross-media data (including webpages and mobile devices) for live webcast and re-run programmes, with a view to obtaining information on the number of viewers of RTHK's programmes in a more comprehensive manner;
- RTHK would further collect detailed figures to better understand the reasons for low TV ratings and formulate improvement measures to increase the popularity of its TV programmes. Targets/benchmarks in terms of both programme quality and awareness level would be set for different categories of RTHK's programmes; and

Evaluation of school education television programmes

- School education television service would be repositioned. The Education Bureau ("EDB") would produce more diverse multi-media resources in support of learning and teaching through engagement of service providers in the market. RTHK could be one of the service providers which EDB would engage on a need basis. In this connection, with effect from 2020-2021, EDB had ceased to provide annual funding to RTHK for the production of a certain number of education TV programmes.
- 59. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Planning, provision and management of public toilets by the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

(Chapter 1 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

60. The Committee was informed that:

Planning and provision of public toilets

- based on the headcount data on the number of users of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department ("FEHD")'s public toilets collected in the exercise from February 2019 to February 2020 by using the infra-red sensor counting technology, FEHD had completed the assessment on the demand for and usage pattern of public toilets. FEHD was reviewing the existing male-to-female compartment ratio;
- FEHD regularly reviewed its guidelines and criteria for the construction and reprovisioning of public toilets with a view to meeting the ever-changing needs of the public. In reviewing the adequacy of public toilets at tourist spots, FEHD continued to communicate with the Tourism Commission to meet the needs of tourists:
- FEHD had refined the procedures for the public consultation and the workflow of implementing public toilet projects with a view to expediting the refurbishment works of public toilets;
- it was announced in the 2019-2020 Budget that the Administration would make an additional allocation of over \$600 million to implement the Enhanced Public Toilet Refurbishment Programme ("PTRP") under which FEHD would roll out the refurbishment or facelifting works³ for about 240 public toilets under its management by phases in five years as from 2019-2020. Among the 42 public toilets included in the first-year of the Enhanced PTRP, 14 facelifting projects were completed while the remaining were in progress. The Administration had included 49 public toilets in the Enhanced PTRP in 2020-2021 and planned to include another 50 public toilets in 2021-2022;
- for the 418 public toilets without accessible unisex toilets mentioned in paragraph 2.49(b) of the Audit Report, ArchSD had conducted the

Facelifting works mainly include the replacement of aged facilities and installation of new features, with the prevailing layout and exterior wall remaining unchanged.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

feasibility study and found 412 public toilets infeasible to provide such type of toilet due to various reasons including site constraints, local objections and complicated land issues. As for the remaining six public toilets, three public toilets had been included in PTRP or Enhanced PTRP, while the remaining three public toilets were still being planned;

- ArchSD was exploring the use of the innovative "Design for Manufacture and Assembly" method for PTRP projects with off-site fabrication of some toilet components such as pre-fabricated wall panels with urinals, so as to minimize the on-site assembly works and shorten the closure period of the toilets during the implementation of works;

Management of public toilet works projects

- ArchSD had stepped up measures to closely monitor the progress of future public toilet works projects and ensure that adequate resources were provided by term contractors, including reminding ArchSD staff and consultants to pay particular attention to whether sufficient resources were deployed by a contractor;
- FEHD had, in collaboration with ArchSD, taken measures to shorten the time required for the completion of the refurbishment projects upon review on the workflow of the projects in 2016, including earlier application for land allocation, rationalizing the pubic consultation procedures, expediting design vetting and tightened the monitoring of the performance of consultants and contractors;
- of the 84 public toilets included in PTRP between 2011-2012 and 2018-2019 as mentioned in paragraph 3.9(b) of the Audit Report, the projects for 27 public toilets were completed and those for two public toilets were withdrawn from PTRP;
- ArchSD had stepped up the measures to handle future aqua privy conversion projects and public toilet projects so as to complete the works as scheduled. Experience sharing sessions were held in April and June 2020 to remind ArchSD staff responsible for handling similar projects to implement these measures;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- FEHD had further divided the improvement works of the public toilets into two sub-types of works. The first type was the refurbishment works with change in the prevailing layout under the Enhanced PTRP which required about two to three years to complete, and the other was the simpler facelifting works which required about 1 to 1.5 years to complete. Such arrangement could allow early completion of some simpler projects;
- to avoid delays in public toilet works projects as a result of water main connection works, and to ensure the compliance with the requirements of the Waterworks Ordinance (Cap. 102), ArchSD gathered records of water mains in the vicinity of the sites and carefully reviewed the site constraints affecting the proposed water main connection routing. ArchSD also liaised with the Water Supplies Department and other relevant departments for planning water main connection at early inception stage of the toilet project in case difficulty was envisaged;

Management of public toilets

- FEHD was reviewing the guidelines on the inspection frequency of public toilets, and would provide some form of guidelines for the District Environmental Hygiene Offices to exercise discretion to determine the inspection frequency of public toilet facilities in remote areas;
- since November 2019, the revamped electronic Contract Management System had been fully implemented to ensure the input of correct information on inspection of public toilets by inspection officers. A new function had also been added to the above System to provide the management with summary reports on outsourced services in respect of cleanliness as well as repair and maintenance of minor facilities of public toilets;
- FEHD was exploring the use of information technology ("IT") for keeping inspection records of cleansing services provided by in-house cleansing workmen properly and electronically. The study was tentatively scheduled to be completed in the first quarter of 2021;
- FEHD, ArchSD and the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department had jointly developed a mobile application "minor works order record system" since the second quarter of 2019 to connect the

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

computerized public toilet repair systems of the three departments for data sharing. FEHD had launched the trial scheme in three districts with ArchSD and the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department since November 2019 and January 2020 respectively. The use of the mobile application was extended to the remaining districts since March 2020;

- in the light of the findings of an analysis conducted by ArchSD in 2020 on the number, trade and distribution of minor repair works at public toilets from 2017 to 2019, FEHD and ArchSD would consider suitable measures to address the issues relating to the repair and maintenance of public toilets;
- ArchSD would require contractors to set up a dedicated team to manage and monitor the repair and maintenance works to public toilets and aqua privies. The first batch of the new maintenance term contracts commenced in April 2020, while the tender documents of the remaining new maintenance term contracts were under preparation and anticipated to be awarded in April 2021;
- FEHD set up in March 2019 dedicated deep cleansing teams for public toilets with very high usage rate, and had extended the deep cleansing services to all street cleansing services contracts to cover all public toilets;
- FEHD was developing a Smart Toilet System prototype to include the revamped visitor feedback system for trial at two public toilets to collect users' views on public toilet services and to evaluate the effectiveness;
- FEHD and ArchSD had provided attendant rooms and related facilities for existing public toilets as far as practicable. FEHD was considering a review on the basis for the provision of toilet attendants to public toilets with high usage rate. ArchSD would provide technical advice to FEHD on the provision of attendant rooms when suitable sites for the construction of public toilet were identified in the future;
- following the completion of the feasibility study on the enhancements to the Complaints Management Information System in analyzing complaints about public toilets, FEHD had finalized the prototype of

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

the enhanced features for testing in March 2020. As the outcome of the trial run was successful, the enhanced features were rolled out on 19 June 2020;

- FEHD had displayed posters and stickers of "Keep Clean Ambassador Ah Tak" at suitable locations of public toilets, broadcast health messages, made use of the social media as well as other publicity materials to disseminate messages on proper use and care of public toilets and related facilities; and
- FEHD had enhanced the provision of information about public toilets, such as toilet types, toilets closed or underdoing refurbishment, on its website, and had also liaised with the relevant departments to provide appropriate directional signs for public toilets.
- 61. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Provision of consultancy, research and development and training services by the Hong Kong Productivity Council

(Chapter 2 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 62. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was engaged in the trading business of construction materials, and unremunerated honorary adviser or honorary member to some NGOs or trade associations.
- 63. The Committee was informed that:

Provision of consultancy and manufacturing support services

- for the incident where the Hong Kong Productivity Council ("HKPC") had revised the definition of the Key Performance Indicator ("KPI") of "Number of Consultancy Projects Accepted" without informing its Council and the Innovation and Technology Commission ("ITC"), HKPC had made a report on the issue to its Council in January 2020;
- HKPC and ITC had completed the review of the "Memorandum of Administrative Arrangements on the Administration of the Subvention

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

for the Hong Kong Productivity Council" ("MAA"). The revised MAA stipulated that prior agreement of the Council of HKPC and Commissioner for Innovation and Technology ("CIT") had to be obtained by HKPC for any proposed change of a KPI, including its definition and target. Subsequent to the Council's endorsement of the revised MAA, ITC and HKPC signed the new version in May 2020;

- ITC and HKPC had completed a comprehensive review on HKPC's KPIs, and formulated 19 KPIs to measure and monitor HKPC's performance more effectively. The new KPIs and the corresponding targets had been implemented from 2020-2021 onwards with the approval obtained from the Council of HKPC and CIT;
- to address the failure of some consultancy projects to achieve full-cost recovery, HKPC would adjust the "contingency budget" as appropriate to cater for unforeseen additional costs, such as those arising from technical difficulties, and record justifications for accepting projects that were expected to fall short of full-cost recovery;
- taking into account HKPC's public mission, ITC considered that Government consultancy projects accepted by HKPC could deviate from the principle of full-cost recovery provided that specified conditions were met. HKPC had set out in its Standard Practice the relevant guiding principles for compliance by staff;
- HKPC completed the review on the manufacturing support projects in March 2020 and had not identified any services which had been rendered but not billed;
- the Independent Commission Against Corruption had agreed to provide trainings in 2020-2021 to HKPC staff, covering clauses in the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap. 201) applicable to public bodies, misconduct in public office, roles of staff in corruption prevention and corruption reporting channels. HKPC had also invited the Independent Commission Against Corruption to conduct a review in early 2021 on HKPC's corporate governance;

Research and development services

- HKPC had formulated new KPIs for patents/licences/royalties and HKPC's commercialization work, removed the KPI of "Number of

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

on-going research and development projects", and set realistic and challenging targets for KPIs to better reflect and improve HKPC's performance in relevant areas. The new KPIs and the corresponding targets for 2020-2021 had been implemented with the approval obtained from the Council of HKPC and CIT; and

Way forward of HKPC

- HKPC would review and consult the industry its mode of operation, future business direction and subvention mode. The Innovation and Technology Bureau and ITC would also participate in the review and provide views. HKPC had already engaged a consultant to conduct a study on the socio-economic impact of HKPC's services and would collect information such as the market's latest developments as the basis of the review and discussion. HKPC planned to consult its Council the review result in the first quarter of 2021 in order to draw up the long-term development strategy.
- 64. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Governance and administrative issues of the Hong Kong Productivity Council (Chapter 3 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 65. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was engaged in the trading business of construction materials, and unremunerated honorary adviser or honorary member to some NGOs or trade associations.
- 66. The Committee was informed that:

Corporate governance and performance reporting

- HKPC and ITC had completed the review of HKPC's service focus in MAA, and the updated service focus had been included in the new MAA signed in May 2020 to better align with the latest strategic plan of HKPC;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- HKPC and ITC had set up a formal mechanism for HKPC to report its performance of KPIs each year. From 2020 onwards, HKPC had submitted to ITC in June every year a formal written report, in which HKPC set out in detail its performance with respect to each KPI in the preceding financial year, and provided explanations and planned follow-up actions in respect of those KPIs not meeting the targets. CIT would review and respond to the report in writing. The above arrangement had been included in the revised MAA;
- CIT had approved HKPC's new KPI framework, which had been implemented from 2020-2021. Under the new KPI framework, the KPIs were no longer categorized into "core" and "non-core" categories;
- HKPC had conducted a comprehensive review on the disclosure of KPIs in its Annual Report by making reference to the relevant practice of other similar public bodies. In addition to the performance of the original nine KPIs, HKPC disclosed an additional KPI on "Training participants satisfaction index" and provided the targets of the above ten KPIs in its 2019-2020 Annual Report, which was released in September 2020;

Human resources management

- to improve staff turnover and to address the significant staff shortfall in some staff grades, HKPC had expanded recruitment channels, offered market-competitive remuneration packages and enhanced staff communication with senior management. HKPC had also invited the Independent Commission Against Corruption to conduct a review on HKPC's recruitment procedures tentatively in early 2021; and

Procurement and other administrative issues

- HKPC had strengthened the management of procurement and other administrative issues by increasing the number and types of fixed asset items selected for quarterly surprise stocktaking since October 2019, providing reports on inactive suppliers by the computer system from March 2020, stepping up the promotion of its testing laboratory services to boost equipment utilization, updating the Standard Practice on claiming entertainment expenses to require staff to provide full justifications and seek approval from the designated authorities if the number of staff exceeded the number of guests, and reminding staff to

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

obtain prior approval for official travels outside Hong Kong before departure.

67. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Control of wild and stray animal nuisances

(Chapter 4 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

68. The Committee was informed that:

Control of wild animal nuisances

- AFCD had reviewed and updated the operation manual for complaints about wild animal nuisances and briefed staff on the amendments and updates;
- AFCD had reminded staff to document the reasons for not conducting on-site visits upon receiving complaints about wild animal nuisances and to record sufficient information in the register of wild animal nuisances. AFCD staff had also been reminded to respond to complaints in a timely manner. Supervisors would regularly check the register to ensure proper handling of cases;
- since 1 June 2020, AFCD had launched a new sterilization programme for monkeys captured outside the scheduled trapping programme of the original contraception period between September and March. The first sterilization operation was conducted in July 2020 for five nuisance monkeys captured from Tsz Wan Shan in June 2020;
- AFCD was planning to conduct population viability analyses to devise suitable performance indicators for the contraceptive programme for better assessment of the contractor's performance;
- cage traps had been deployed in monkey nuisance blackspots. The strategy was proven effective in minimizing the nuisance of monkeys. Since the extension of the scope of the contraceptive programme in 2018, a total of 105 monkeys had been captured from the nuisance blackspots near the urban fringe;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- AFCD had laid down the criteria for selecting sites for the operations under the Capture and Contraception/Relocation Programme for wild pigs in the Operation Manual to ensure that the operations would be arranged for all blackspots as far as practicable. AFCD would increase the frequency of the Programme with a view to collecting adequate samples for evaluating the effectiveness of immuno-contraceptive vaccine on wild pigs;
- AFCD had completed a pilot study on surveying the wild pig populations, and would extend the field surveys to cover additional sites and seasons for better estimation of wild pig populations in Hong Kong;
- AFCD established an advisory group comprising experts from various fields in October 2019 to advise on the management of wild pigs, and would take the experts' views into account in assessing the feasibility of extending the feeding ban areas;

Control of stray animal nuisances

- AFCD had reminded staff to input necessary data (including the dates of replies issued) into the complaint recording system for stray animal nuisances at all times and comply with the guidelines on handling of stray animals;
- AFCD had introduced regular visit arrangement to rehoming partners. As at August 2020, 7 out of 11 rehoming partners with rehoming facilities had been visited. AFCD had also reminded rehoming partners to submit their rehoming and sterilization records periodically. AFCD would continue to visit "Trap-Neuter-Return" sites periodically and review the monthly reports submitted by the programme coordinators;
- AFCD had implemented the stray cattle management plan supported by the Animal Welfare Advisory Group Management of Animal Population Subgroup, which consisted of representatives of the relevant animal welfare organizations and veterinarians. AFCD had also engaged a consultant to continue to periodically review the measures to control the movement of cattle:

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- the territory-wide pigeon population survey was completed in May 2020. Information collected in the survey such as feeding activities could facilitate the follow-up actions to be taken by the relevant departments to mitigate feral pigeon nuisances;

Publicity, prosecution and other administrative issues

- AFCD produced new leaflets and posters on "Be Neighbour with Wild Birds" in January 2020. AFCD had also shared the lists of pigeon congregation spots as well as monkey and wild pig feeding blackspots with FEHD and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department to facilitate their monitoring and prosecution of environmental hygiene offences arising from feeding activities;
- AFCD had reminded staff to take timely actions to instigate prosecution of offences relating to wild animals and to record the reasons for any prolonged actions in taking forward prosecution cases for supervisory review. AFCD launched in May 2019 a new enforcement case record system under the Wild Animals Protection Ordinance (Cap. 170) to facilitate record keeping and progress monitoring; and
- AFCD had completed the pilot scheme for enhancing African Swine Fever surveillance on wild pigs. Routine African Swine Fever surveillance on wild pigs was currently in place, covering the entire New Territories (except islands), Kowloon and cases with a large number of deaths.
- 69. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Special education

(Chapter 5 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

70. The Committee was informed that:

Provision and management of school places and boarding places

- EDB had explored with schools for social development ("SSDs") the feasibility of their conversion to schools for children with intellectual disability ("ID"). In view of the significant differences between the two types of schools in various aspects, such as school operation, curriculum, expertise of teachers, service targets and facilities, the sector considered such conversion scarcely feasible;
- EDB had since the 2019-2020 school year launched a two-year pilot scheme under which special units in SSDs provided support to ordinary school students with autism spectrum disorders who displayed very severe adjustment problems. EDB would evaluate the effectiveness of the pilot scheme and collect the views of major stakeholders in considering the appropriateness of expanding the scale of the above service in the 2021-2022 school year;
- EDB considered that instead of the student enrolment at different cut-off dates within a school year, the total number of students served by SSDs within different periods of a school year should be used to reflect more fully and accurately the utilization rate of SSDs;
- EDB had reviewed the statistics on the time required for SSD students to complete short-term and non-short-term adjustment programmes in the last three school years for discussion with SSDs on whether it was necessary to adjust the current deadlines for discharge of students and alter the calculation method for cases of prolonged stay in SSDs;
- in view of the keen demand for seven-day boarding places, EDB had been communicating with the schools for children with ID that had a boarding section, in particular those offering solely five-day boarding service, to identify plausible ways to increase the provision of boarding places. EDB would discuss further with the sector the feasibility of temporarily accommodating students with severe ID who were awaiting seven-day boarding service with vacant five-day boarding places upon parental consent;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- all special schools had been well informed of the requirement for their boarding section to review the boarding needs and status of their boarders. EDB would issue guidelines to enable special schools to adopt consistent practices in reviewing the boarding needs of their boarders;
- with the measures taken to make good use of the vacant boarding places, the utilization of boarding places for girls increased from 43% in the 2018-2019 school year to 61% in the fourth quarter of 2019. The corresponding figure on the overall boarding places for boys and girls increased from 68% in the 2018-2019 school year to 75% in the fourth quarter of 2019;

Staffing arrangements and grants provided for special schools

- starting from the 2020-2021 school year, EDB further enhanced the staff establishment and resources of the boarding sections in aided special schools. The additional annual expenditure incurred was about \$66.8 million. Measures included:
 - (a) upgrading the ranks of warden and assistant warden on the establishment of boarding sections with a capacity of 40 or above, and increasing the number of assistant warden and houseparent-in-charge on the establishment correspondingly to provide more appropriate life skills training and counselling for boarders through the enhanced collaboration between the management teams of boarding sections and school sections in special schools;
 - (b) further improving Saturday and Sunday manning ratios for boarding sections so that special schools offering seven-day boarding service would have extra manpower to take care of their boarders; and
 - (c) providing an additional grant for the boarding sections of schools for children with physical disability, moderate ID, severe ID and visual impairment cum ID to employ personal care workers or hire related services, so that the workload of houseparents and programme workers could be relieved and more focused efforts could be dedicated to the provision of training and counselling for boarders;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

Other support for special education

- EDB would commission teacher education universities to organize the Leadership Development Programme for Middle Leaders of Special Schools for vice principals or senior teachers of special schools to enhance their leadership capacity for effective management. EDB would also regularly require special schools to arrange teachers to attend structured training courses, so that they could meet the pre-set training targets by the 2022-2023 school year;
- EDB had collected the views of special schools to identify more suitable themes for future sharing sessions under Cross-Sector Communication and learning circle activities;⁴ and
- SWD would further increase the number of day training and vocational rehabilitation places for persons with disabilities (including special school leavers) to meet the post-school service needs.
- 71. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Judiciary Administration's work in implementing projects under Information Technology Strategy Plan

(Chapter 6 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

72. The Committee was informed that:

Progress in project implementation and problems encountered

- the Judiciary Administration ("JA") had consolidated and refined the governance structure for the implementation of Information Technology Strategy Plan ("ITSP") projects in order to meet the challenges ahead and to better monitor the implementation of ITSP. Where possible and subject to the general public health situation, JA

⁴ Under the Tripartite Model of Support, sharing sessions under Cross-Sector Communication and learning circles are given specific themes to deepen special schools' understanding of the development and trends of special education, or to help these schools further develop their learning and teaching strategies.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

had been expediting actions to complete the outstanding projects as early as practicable;

- with a view to strengthening IT support required for the implementation of ITSP and the effective and efficient operation of the new IT systems introduced by the Judiciary, JA had been exploring various options under the established mechanism for resource acquisition as appropriate to supplement the required resources and expertise;
- actions taken included creating new permanent posts and converting time limited posts into permanent ones to provide continuous and long-term professional IT support at various levels for implementation of the IT projects under planning or development, and creating short-term posts to cope with the increased demands for the conduct of remote hearings triggered by the general public health situation;
- JA promulgated in April 2020 the guidelines advising end users to make clearer, detailed and comprehensive user requirements during the preparation of user requirements document. End users were required to provide full justifications and seek senior management's endorsement if they raised key requirement changes during user acceptance tests;
- JA had been keeping proper and complete meeting records as far as practicable, and also organized briefings in January 2020 for about 40 prosecuting departments and agencies on the design and usage of web portal;

Project governance

- JA had taken steps to streamline the governance structure for the implementation of the integrated court case management system, and to refine that for the introduction of the Judiciary's Electronic Information Management System under ITSP. JA would also take forward the remaining parts of the ITSP project and improve the e-services of the Judiciary as appropriate;
- the ITSP Steering Committee held meetings in November 2019 and January 2020 to discuss strategic issues, including the initial timeline of the key milestones of the overall implementation of ITSP Stage 2;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- JA had arranged circulation of papers as necessary and appropriate to seek views from members of the ITSP Steering Committee on other issues relating to the implementation of ITSP. JA had also documented more explicitly the ITSP Steering Committee's approval of revisions of the target completion dates of project activities;

Other related issues

- JA had placed the Daily Cause Lists and the e-hearing date enquiry services under the same header on the Judiciary's website since January 2020;
- JA drew up in March 2020 the necessary requirements to enhance the online Legal Reference System by making reference to similar websites in Hong Kong and other jurisdictions;
- JA refined the internal guidelines in January 2020 to remind staff to ensure the accuracy and consistency of the information uploaded onto the Judiciary's website. A regular exercise to review the contents of the Judiciary's website started in January 2020;
- JA was reviewing together with the relevant Judges and Judicial Officers the use of online evaluation questionnaires on voluntary mediation. JA would implement the proposed changes put forth in the review;
- the enhancements to the e-services (e.g. evaluation questionnaires for voluntary mediation, appointment service of the Probate Registry and apostille verification service) by adopting a "mobile-friendly design" to facilitate public access through mobile devices had been completed;
- arrangements for upgrading the facilities of audio-visual presentation systems in the District Court by phases were in progress. The first phase of the upgrade exercise at five courtrooms was completed in April 2020. Planning of the second phase at another five courtrooms was in progress. The whole upgrade exercise was targeted to be completed in 2021;
- JA had redesigned the mechanism to record the usage of the e-presentation systems. A function collecting the utilization records of the e-presentation systems had been built in the court case

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

management systems used by the High Court and implemented since June 2020. Similar system functions had also been developed and been in use by other court levels since October 2020;

- JA had finalized the plan to accumulate necessary experience in the wider use of electronic bundles in portable document format ("EBPDF") in hearings. While EBPDF would continue to be used at the High Court, the Judges and Judicial Officers would consider if more suitable hearings at the District Court could also make use of EBPDF. JA would collect feedback from all the parties concerned, including case parties, after the hearings; and
- JA planned to consult the relevant external stakeholders (including the legal professional bodies) after accumulating about one year's experience of conducting more hearings using EBPDF.
- 73. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.

Child Development Fund

(Chapter 9 of Part 9 of P.A.C. Report No. 73)

- 74. Hon SHIU Ka-fai declared that he was unremunerated honorary adviser or honorary member to some NGOs or trade associations.
- 75. The Committee was informed that:

Planning the launch of projects and commissioning project operators

the Labour and Welfare Bureau ("LWB") and SWD would sustain their efforts in attaining the annual average target of rolling out 20 new projects under the Child Development Fund ("CDF") for 2 000 to 2 300 new participants. The rolling out of the eighth batch of CDF projects run by NGOs and the seventh batch of school-based projects in September and December 2020 respectively was expected to benefit more than 3 200 new participants;

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

in consultation with the Vetting Committee, SWD had set a passing mark for the quality assessment starting from the seventh batch of school-based projects. Starting from the next round of proposal invitation for NGO-run projects in 2021, SWD would take into account the statistics provided by the Census and Statistics Department relating to children aged 10 to 16 with low income background (i.e. the number of families with monthly household income of less than 75% of relevant Median Monthly Domestic Household Incomes) in setting the district quota for inviting proposals on NGO-run projects;

<u>Implementation of projects</u>

- to facilitate identification of and timely follow-up on any irregularities or non-compliant cases during project delivery, SWD had increased the frequency of site inspections from at least one time to at least two times during the three-year project period;
- SWD had issued guidelines, which set out the general principles on the effective use of training provisions, to the existing project operators on 12 February 2020;
- SWD had issued on 31 December 2019 a "Guidebook on Good Practice for Implementing the Child Development Fund projects", which included the monitoring of the use of targeted savings, to existing project operators;
- SWD had refined three existing guidelines, namely "Guidelines on the Handling of Unspent Targeted Savings", "General Guides on Drawing Up Personal Development Plan and Use of Targeted Savings in relation to the Personal Development Plan" and "General Guides on Monitoring the Targeted Savings" to clearly set out operators' responsibilities in relation to the spending of targeted savings beyond the project period. The revised guidelines were issued to the existing operators on 12 February 2020;
- SWD had introduced a monitoring mechanism to keep track of the status of the overdue audited financial reports. SWD would impose more stringent follow-up measures on those operators with persistent delays in submitting audited financial reports (e.g. deducting those operators' scores when vetting their future applications for CDF projects);

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

- SWD had tightened the monitoring of the submission of audited financial reports to ensure timely clawing back of surplus funds from project operators. To further expedite and streamline the clawing back of surplus funds, SWD would forward the audited financial reports to its Finance Branch for review once ready instead of by batch;
- for project operators with persistent under-performance in service, SWD would proactively initiate contacts and/or conduct visits to look into the situation, and ask the operators to take adequate remedial actions as and when necessary;

Governance and other administrative matters

- LWB completed in April 2020 the review on the system for making declarations of interests for the Steering Committee on CDF in accordance with the memorandum issued by Secretary for Home Affairs in 2005. LWB had also put in place a mechanism to regularly remind the Secretary of the Steering Committee to ensure that members' declarations made at meetings should be duly recorded in the relevant minutes of meetings;
- it had been the established practice for LWB and SWD to organize collaboration meetings regularly to provide opportunities for schools and NGOs interested in running CDF projects to explore any future collaboration. In consultation with EDB, LWB and SWD would make use collaboration meetings to step up the promotion of CDF among NGOs and schools; and
- LWB and SWD had implemented in 2020 the following recommendations made by the consultant upon completion of "Further Study on the Long Term Development of the Child Development Fund Project Participants":
 - (a) encouraging project operators to formulate tailor-made programmes for younger and elder participants, and promote the interactions among CDF project participants in different batches; and
 - (b) organizing some mentorship workshops for project operators to share their good practices in organizing mentorship programmes.

Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2019 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 73) [P.A.C. Report No. 73]

76. The Committee wishes to be kept informed of further development on the subject.