

(Extracts)
立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CP 1435/98-99
(These minutes have been
cleared with the Convenor)

Ref: CP/G 05/4I

**Minutes of LegCo Members' Meeting
with Tai Po Provisional District Board Members
on Thursday, 22 April 1999 at 10:45 am
in Conference Room B of the Legislative Council Building**

- Present** : Hon LEE Kai-ming, JP (Convenor)
Hon HO Sai-chu, JP
Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon Andrew WONG Wang-fat, JP
Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong
Hon WONG Yung-kan
Hon LAU Kong-wah
Hon Ambrose LAU Hon-chuen, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
- By Invitation** : **Tai Po Provisional District Board**

Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming, JP (Chairman)
Mr CHAN Mei-tak
Mr CHENG Chee-kwok
Mr CHEUNG Wing-fai
Mr HO Tai-wai
Miss LAM Wai-ling
Mr WU Kam-fai
- In Attendance** : Mr LAW Kam-sang, JP
Deputy Secretary General

Ms YUE Tin-po
Senior Assistant Secretary (C)3

Action

* * * * *

IV. Reclamation at Pak Shek Kok

11. Mr CHAN Mei-tai and Mr HO Tai-wai said that reclamation at Pak Shek Kok had destroyed the fish breeding ground along Tolo Harbour. An ad-hoc working group with TPPDB representatives had been formed to review and monitor regularly the changes in environmental conditions in the surrounding areas. They told Members that the working group had recently constructed a dam to avoid further deterioration in the water quality of Tolo Harbour.

12. Mr WONG Yung-kan, the representative of the working group together with Mr CHAN and Mr HO reiterated that although 89 hectares of land had been reclaimed, the whole fish breeding ground in Tolo Harbour had been destroyed. Therefore, the payment of \$3 million Ex-Gratia Allowance (EGA) calculated on the basis of the existing formula was unreasonable because the existing formula was in respect of evacuation work in fishing ground whereas the project at Tolo Harbour was reclamation. Reclamation was different from evacuation since the seabed of the reclaimed land would never be recovered and would be lost forever to the fishermen. The number of fishing boats currently operating in the affected area had been reduced by one-third and some of the affected fishermen had become jobless after the reclamation. In addition, they were dissatisfied that the Administration had used the sales record of wholesale fish markets to estimate the fish catch of the fishermen when calculating EGA. Such figures could not apply to the affected fishermen in Tolo Harbour as their catch varied with seasons. No record could be traced and the total fish catch had been underestimated. They therefore asked for a review of the existing formula for calculating EGA for fishermen affected by reclamation. The EGA should also be retitled as compensation and the amount should be increased significantly to reflect their real loss.

13. In response to Miss Emily LAU Wai-hing regarding the public consultation conducted by the Administration on the consultancy study on fisheries resources and fishing operations in Hong Kong waters, TPPDB members generally agreed with the consultant's view that the decline in fish catch was due to overfishing and habitat destruction. They supported that demersal trawl should be prohibited for protection of seabeds. They also agreed that the Administration should formulate a fisheries policy to plan the conservation, development and sustainable use of fishing resources. However, they did not accept some of the consultant's findings on the study. After discussion, Mr Andrew CHENG Kar-foo invited TPPDB members to send in their views on the findings and recommendations of the consultancy study in writing for Members' reference and follow-up. Miss Emily LAU Wai-hing suggested that TPPDB members' views on this issue be also referred

TPPDB

SAS(C)3

Action

to the Administration for consideration.

14. The Convenor remarked that the Economic Services Bureau (ESB) was now formulating a management strategy for fisheries resources and fishing operations in Hong Kong waters in the light of the outcome of the consultation exercise. Meanwhile, the Planning, Environment and Lands Bureau (PELB) was reviewing the formula for calculating EGA payable to the fishermen affected by reclamation or development projects, having regard to the recommendations in the above consultancy study. ESB and PELB would report back to the LegCo Panel on Economic Services in mid 1999.

* * * * *

Legislative Council Secretariat

27 May 1999