



政府土地工程測量員協會
Association of Government Land & Engineering Surveying Officers

Correspondence Address:
P. O. Box 71564, Kowloon Central Post Office
Email Address : agleso@hotmail.com

通訊地址：
九龍中央郵局郵箱71564

c/o 8/F, Yuen Long Government Offices,
2 Kiu Lok Square, Yuen Long, N.T.
Tel : 24431583 Fax : 24736996

檔號：CB1/PS/PS
香港中區花園道3號
萬國寶通銀行大廈3樓
立法會秘書處
事務委員會秘書
〈經辦人：盧思源先生〉

盧先生：

立法會公務員及資助機構員工事務委員會
二零零零年二月二十一日舉行的會議

就上述會議，本會提交三份文件：

- (一) 本會就地政總署測繪處公司化『顧問報告』的意見書。
- (二) 一位本會會員就地政總署測繪處公司化『顧問報告』的意見書。
- (三) 一位無名氏會員交給工會就地政總署測繪處公司化『顧向報告』的英文文件。

主席

二零零零年二月十二日

地政總署測繪處公司化之意見

政府土地工程測量員協會

21. 01. 2000

立法會秘書處
事務委員會秘書
(經辦人：盧思源先生)

定義 ----- [公司化] 沒有既定的定義

[公司化] 的最終目的是在不增加資源下提供更高的效率和成本效益 (見 1 月 17 日立法會公務員及資助機構員工事務委員會會訊)。

反對測繪處公司化的理據

1. 根據顧問報告所示，測繪處公司化可為政府未來十年製造總盈餘 5.83 億元(見 1 月 17 日立法會公務員及資助機構員工事務委員會會訊 13 段 C) 這只是一場美麗的誤會和數字遊戲也。實則測繪處公司化後，各政府部門便要按成本多付百分之二十的附加費，以利公司化後的“SMC”製造虛假盈利。按目前測繪處的成本計算，未來十年，各政府部門便要多付約十億元來製造“SMC”的 5.83 億元盈餘。
2. 測繪處公司化只是一場會計數字的轉化，不能產生附加值和增加成本效益。只會削減低下層的職位以利增加效率 3.3 億元(見 1 月 17 日立法會公務員及資助機構員工事務委員會會訊 15 段)。
3. 公司化後的“SMC”卻要即時開設薪酬很可觀的 D1 職位，其十年支出約 3.3 億元(見顧問報告第 29 及 46 頁)。即公司化後的測繪處只利少數高官(D1 職位，CLS grade 以上)因此，整個 SMC 並沒有增加成本效益。
4. 公司化後的“SMC”對公眾沒有好處
 - 公司化後的“SMC”將會調高收費(見 1 月 17 日立法會公務員及資助機構員工事務委員會會訊第 27 段)。
 - 對員工士氣帶來沉重的打擊。
 - 損耗社會資源，如：立法，諮詢員工，官員出席立法會及顧問費等。

結論：測繪處公司化從社會資源的分配及財務角度看都是不能達致增加成本效益和為政府節省十億元。相反，政府卻要多支出十億元。社會大眾同時卻要面對測繪產品和服務的加價來維持 SMC 的盈利。

參考資料：

1. P. E Handley. Walker (HK) Ltd 就地政總署測繪處公司化的顧問研究報告
2. 2000 年 1 月 17 日立法會公務員及資助機構員工事務委員會會訊

一位政府土地工程測量員協會會員就地政總署測繪處公司化『顧問報告』的意見書

BSPU 委出的顧問公司所作的報告說，SMO 的產品與服務具有很多商業機會。故此，應該把它公司化，即是把 SMO(Survey & Mapping Office)變成 SMC(Survey & Mapping Corporation)。然而，我們則不以為然。因為，只是稍為細讀報告，內行人都會發現，所謂商機，只是一些一廂情願的想法，和近似天馬行空式的空想。犯駁的地方，真是不勝枚舉，姑且不在數字上爭論，在情理上與可行性上已使人覺得，把 SMO 公司化只是一套大膽和近似不負責任的假設與推斷而已。

1. SMC 的產品如何與私人公司(現市場)競爭？
2. 那些公司會購買 SMC 的產品與服務？
3. SMC 如何肯定政府部門出錢僱用“外調人員”而不選擇把他們的工程外判呢？
4. SMO 現時已把很多工作，例如 Geodetic Survey、Small House Survey、Mapping Survey 等外判給私人公司做。故此，SMC 又如何從這方面取得盈利呢？
5. SMC 如何有把握能說服立法會的議員們去相信現存的測量和製圖在物業交易中有不妥當的地方而需另行立法呢？而且這個另外立法會加重物業交易的成本與加長交易的時間，對發展商、業主們和社會大眾是否有利呢？
6. “Systematic Land Boundary Survey of all DD lots in NT” 更加可笑。現時 SMO 視 1898 年做的 DD sheets 為唯一的 records。這個觀念亦為新界居民普遍接受，若 SMC 進行重新 Survey，勢必引起各方面的土地紛爭，官司訴訟。遇有與 1898 的 Records 有衝突的地方時，更引起 HK 特區政府尷尬。況且該 survey 如何有法律認受基礎與廣泛受新界人任同意接受，仍是疑問，更惶論有人會願每年給予 6 億，去做這件愚蠢的工作？
7. 現時私人測量公司向 SMO 購買 survey information 和 survey data，目的多是為重整地界與分割土地測量之用，若 all NT 地界已做了 Systematic Survey，則什麼人會像現時一般購買 survey information 與 survey data 呢？政府又如何有進賬呢？
8. 正如報告所說，現今的經濟環境，SMC 如何去定出其產品與服務的價錢呢？若果維持現有的 pricing，則 SMC 又如何盈利呢？
9. “other business opportunities” 更覺可笑，因為：
 - (1) HK 有那些公司需要 GIS 服務？
 - (2) 是否只有 SMC 識做 GPS 測量？SMC 是否有專利權？這方面的收入如何保證？
 - (3) HK 的市區環境可以做或需要 Car Navigation Systems 嗎？既然如此，又怎會有商機？
10. “HK Flying Services” 又屬天方夜譚，以 HK 的生活指數，又怎可以去服務鄰近地區與國家呢？“Business partnership with government flying services” 又如何有收入呢？
11. 大約 2 年前，SMO 聘請顧問做了一個報告，當時不贊同 SMO 獨立，但為何今天又說成如此有商機呢？
12. 根據英國 OS 的 1999 年 accounts，它至今仍是在虧損中，仍要政府注資。SMC 又怎可以如此有信心於顧問的“推斷”呢？

Corporatisation

The consultants define “Corporatisation” as organisations which had changed in structure and purpose from a government department to *something else*, usually with greater degrees of freedom and often called agency or *trading fund*.

Is Corporatisation a synonym of trading fund?

Public Interests

If the SMC is established according to the Laws of the HKSAR, she may not have the statutory power to dissolve land boundary disputes raised from “**Systematic Survey**” proposed. Can statutory powers be delegated to a corporation? The consultancy report assumes that revenue can be generated under the Land Survey Ordinance.

Pocket-to-Pocket Strategy

The majority of revenue of the company is mainly relied on the “**Service Level Agreements (SLAs)**” with government departments. Those unprofitable existing products and services, which may be non-core activities, can be funded by the “**National Interest Mapping Services Agreement (NIMSA)**” in order to cater public interest.

Market Conditions

The consultancy report does not cover research on the marketing environment for the SMC. It does not indicate **favourable** market conditions for the SMC under a **healthy** market.

Substantiality of Business

From the consultancy report, it suggests a number of new opportunities for the SMC to exploit. However, the consultants have not considered the marketing environments in the industry which are severely influenced by the infrastructure undertaking in the recent years. Besides, the some of the figures estimated cannot truly reflect to the real life situation in the projected year. In addition, some of the services and products are depended on enactment of legislation for the SMC to generate profits. Take the Systematic Survey as an example, the revenue from selling plans for the DD Lots surveyed may not be sustainable at HK\$24 million when land development dropped. Comments of the Marketing Strategies proposed will be discussed in the part of **Business Opportunities**.

Consultants views on Corporatisation

The consultants have not positioned the pros and cons of SMO corporatisation. They only mention the views from key customers and suppliers. There is no indications on the other stakeholders. These parties do not have a clear understandings of the operations and environments faced by the SMO. By all means, the consultants should provide their views on these matters in a responsible manner.

Business Opportunities

The consultancy report has stipulated (page 4) that “..... *brainstorming to determine future product and service developments*”. The consultants have not undertaken any basic **SWOT analysis** and **Environmental Analysis** (both internal and external) for the SMC. The report does not contain a complete picture to the management. In some cases, assumptions are not realistic. They also have not considered the available potential markets and the penetrated markets for the SMC.

In financial aspect, it has not performed ratio analysis or Information Economic Analysis for this high-risk industry. The consultants have also focused on the **key customers** in the study that put aside public interests.

Hand-held and Mobile Technologies

The projection on the **Potential Growth** is incorrect. From the Transport Bureau (<http://www.ingo.gov.hk/tb/press/keystat/26-28.htm>), the number of registered cars (including motor cycles) is steadily at a level of about 500,000 between 1997 and 1999(July). Logically, it is impossible to imagine how to achieve a subscription of 2 millions subscribers to the Car Navigation Systems in the Year 10. It is a question how the SMC and the VARs partners to achieve this target for every 4.5 persons will have a this subscription (population projected at 2009 with a growth rate of 2.8% as at 1998 is about 9 millions – calculations based on figures from the Census and Statistics Department).

Centralized Spatial Data Agency for the Management of Metadata and Sharing of Spatial Data in HKSAR

In a free market, government cannot enforce companies to adopt a certain GIS for their operations. Thus, the current problems generate from propriety driven data formats. As a result, spatial data is required conversion before use. Metadata is for customers to justify on the fitness of use, therefore, it may not be possible to exploit revenue to the SMC. In the issue of data dissemination, it is still not justified that other data collectioners will launch their products through the subscriptions. Meanwhile, enactment may be required to provide the future SMC to have such statutory authority to as a monopoly in data disseminator.

Electronic Commerce System

The idea for establishing an Electronic Commerce System is doubtlessly improved the existing distribution channels (two sales counters and 11 DSOs). Unlike with other foreign countries, customers are only required to have spent a short travelling time to obtain what they from the existing distribution channels where personnel selling is available. Customers cannot retrieve free substitute products of our existing products through the World Wide Web (WWW). For example, a site map can be obtained from our business partners (Centraline Property Ltd and Telecom Directory Ltd). Therefore, the consultants highlighted that “**VARs may be more defensive as they perceive conflicts of interest ...**”

Systematic Land Boundary Survey of all DD Lots

There is a politic issue for the Legislative Council to enact an ordinance to have compulsory rectification on DD Lots in the New Territories. Such enactment will have immediate impacts to the society. Disputes on Lands Boundary are raised immediately after legislation passed and so are court cases. Customer behaviour in the DD plan market is on a special demand purpose and once-off situation. Therefore, it is a question of sustainability to have HK\$24 million revenue. Besides, the SMC must be a sole agent to sales such information that no other organisations can deliver similar services after they brought the CLIS data from the SMC.

Marketing

Pricing – The consultants have not suggested a solid pricing strategy to the SMO. In 1997 consultation, they suggested a price cut on digital products. In this corporatisation consultancy report, it suggests “ *a close monitor ... to ensure that adequate increased levels of take-off are achieved as a result of the dramatic decrease in Digital Product prices and to assess whether increased volumes can compensate in revenue terms*”. These imply that they do not take into account of the penetrated market share to the potential market.

In the pricing of the Countryside maps, they suggested a price increase. This is a demarketing strategy to reduce price sensitive customers (eg students, children, and hikers).

The price increase in Lot Index Plan may lead to a monopoly situation