

For Information on
17 April 2000

Legislative Council Panel on Education

**Administration of University Grants Committee-funded Institutions -
Grievance and Appeal Procedures and
Attendance Records of Members of Governing Bodies**

Introduction

At the Panel meeting of 27 September 1999, the Legislative Council Panel on Education (the Panel) discussed the grievance and appeal procedures in the UGC-funded institutions. The Administration undertook to –

- (a) relay to the institutions Members' concerns over the fairness and transparency of their grievance and appeal procedures, and report back to the Panel the institutions' response; and
- (b) report back to the Panel the respective decisions of the Baptist University of Hong Kong (HKBU) and the Chinese University of Hong Kong (CUHK) regarding the release of attendance records of members of their governing bodies.

This paper provides updated information on the above two items.

Grievance and Appeal Procedures

2. Based on Members' comments expressed at previous meetings and the relevant guidelines published by the Ombudsman and similar bodies, the Administration has drawn up a list of issues for consideration. (A copy was sent to the Clerk to Panel on 16 February 2000.) The list is intended to facilitate institutions, as autonomous statutory bodies empowered to manage their internal affairs, in re-examining their existing grievance and appeal procedures. The list of issues for consideration and the institutions' responses are at **Annex A**. Whilst the information provided reflects the current position regarding grievance and appeal procedures, it is open to all members of individual institutions to suggest ways to improve the existing procedures.

Attendance Records

3. As mentioned in our preliminary report to the Clerk to Panel on 16 February 2000, both the HKBU and CUHK Councils have agreed

that the attendance records of **future** Council meetings will be disclosed to the public upon request. However, the HKBU Council considers the disclosure of past records to the public inappropriate because Council members were not informed of such disclosure at the time they accepted their appointments. Individual members of the CUHK Council have been consulted on the disclosure of their past attendance records, but there was no unanimous agreement. The CUHK Council is prepared to provide the past attendance records of those members who have given their consent if the Panel so requested.

4. Since September 1999, all new appointees or re-appointees (whose appointments/re-appointments were made by the Chief Executive) to the governing bodies of the UGC-funded institutions have been advised, prior to their acceptance of appointment, that their attendance records would be disclosed to the public upon request.

Education and Manpower Bureau
April 2000

GRIEVANCE AND APPEAL PROCEDURES IN THE UGC-FUNDED INSTITUTIONS

A. Structure

1. *Is the mechanism comprehensive enough to cover various types of complaints/appeals regarding, for example, promotion, termination of employment, non-renewal of contract and disciplinary action?*

Institution	Response
City University of Hong Kong (CityU)	There are prescribed procedures for dealing with appeals against personnel decisions, including promotion, termination of employment, as a result of decisions made by the respective approving committee. Where the decision is to dismiss the staff concerned, a report will be made to the Council.
Hong Kong Baptist University (HKBU)	Appeal procedures are in place for a variety of complaints/appeals, including promotion, bar crossing, review of appointment, removal of appointment, etc. Such procedures are incorporated in the relevant policy papers.
Lingnan University (LU)	Three standing committees are established under the Council and the University management to hear and determine on appeals regarding a wide range of issues, including termination of employment, non-renewal of contracts, misconduct and unethical behaviour.
Chinese University of Hong Kong (CUHK)	The University has established procedures for dealing with termination of employment including appeals thereof, which covers all levels of staff, including academic, administrative, general grades as well as junior staff.
Hong Kong Institute of Education (HKIED)	The Institute has established a comprehensive mechanism to take care of various types of complaints/appeals. Depending on the nature of the complaints/appeals, they will be referred to the appropriate committees, e.g. Staff Selection and Review Sub-Committee of the Staffing Committee, Disciplinary Committee, Grievance Committee, Equal Opportunities Committee, etc., for consideration and review according to the established policies.
Hong Kong Polytechnic University (PolyU)	The University has established a set of procedures for staff appeals and grievance (the Policy) which covers various types of complaints/appeals.

Institution	Response
Hong Kong University of Science and Technology (HKUST)	The University has in place procedures covering appeals for various types of personnel decisions including contract non-renewal, non-substantiation of appointment, etc. There are also separate procedures covering complaints in specific areas such as breaches of academic integrity and sexual harassment. Should there be other complaints which fall outside the scope of specific procedures of the kind illustrated above, the established procedure is for these to be considered by the appropriate tier of management – the complainant having the right of appeal to the next tier in each case, and ultimately to the University Council.
University of Hong Kong (HKU)	Yes. The University has well-defined and established mechanisms governing grievance and appeals. The mechanisms are built into the procedures governing various staff-related matters, including termination of employment, redundancies, retirement, etc.

2. *Are there clearly defined stages with clearly defined procedures and responsibilities at all levels?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes
HKBU	Yes
LU	Yes
CUHK	Yes
HKIEd	Yes
PolyU	Yes
HKUST	Yes. The various established procedures have defined and laid down processes and responsibilities at different management/committee levels to handle complaints formally lodged.
HKU	Yes

3. *Are all levels of the channels open and easily accessible to all ranks and types of staff, including lower ranking staff and contract staff?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes
HKBU	Yes

Institution	Response
LU	In the notice of termination or contract non-renewal, the staff member concerned is also informed of the right to appeal against termination or non-renewal, together with the procedures for lodging an appeal.
CUHK	Yes
HKIEd	Yes
PolyU	Yes. The appeal and grievance channels are open and easily accessible to all staff, irrespective of their ranks or terms of service.
HKUST	Yes. All ranks of staff have full rights to lodge their complaints and grievances. Staff members in need of guidance of any kind can always approach the Personnel Office which will advise them on the options and channels open.
HKU	Yes. It is stipulated in the relevant guidelines that the appointee adversely affected by a decision should be advised of his right of appeal to the University.

4. *To what extent does the complainant/appeal mechanism involve people who are members independent of the institution's management? For instance, is the final decision/judgement made by a person independent of the University's management or a panel who primarily consists of member(s) independent of the institution's management?*

Institution	Response
CityU	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Disciplinary Committee dealing with an alleged breach by a staff of any grade will comprise one elected staff representative nominated by the Staff consultative Committee. • For disciplinary proceedings against a member of the Academic and Equivalent Administrative Grade staff, the Disciplinary Committee may also comprise one or more lay members of the Council.
HKBU	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Committee of Appeal, set up under the Council to handle appeals against decisions of removal from appointment, is chaired by a Council member who is not a staff member of the University, and also comprises another lay Council member. • All members of the Committee of Appeal should not be involved in the original decision-making process on removal from appointment. • Recommendation of the Committee of Appeal will be forwarded to the Chairman of Council for approval, whose decision shall be final.

Institution	Response
LU	Of the three appeals committees, two of them are established by the Council with majority of membership being non-LU-staff Council members. For the other one which is established by the University management and consists of LU staff, external co-opted members may be appointed to the committee. In addition, the committee member cannot deliberate on a staff member who belongs to their individual unit to ensure fairness.
CUHK	Recommendations/decisions on termination of appointment and on the appeals/grievances thereof will be considered by the Council (with external Chairman and members) or a body with delegated authority from the Council, and the Council's decision will be final.
HKIEd	Most of the Committees consist of elected staff representative(s) from the Council who is/are independent of the Institute's management. In the case of the Staff Selection and Review Sub-Committee, external members are involved apart from the elected staff representative(s).
PolyU	In accordance with the established policy guidelines, an Appeals and Grievance Committee (the Committee) must be formed on an annual basis to investigate appeal and grievance cases either referred to it by the President or submitted to it direct from staff members. Composition of the Committee include those members elected from among the staff members of the University and from representatives of the Hong Kong Polytechnic University Staff Association as well as co-opted member from outside the University.
HKUST	For reviews for contract renewal and substantiation of appointment, independent views and opinions would be solicited from outside experts as provided for in individual procedures. The ultimate appeal authority lies in the University Council, which comprises mostly lay members independent of the University's management.
HKU	The Chairman of the Staff Grievances Panel shall not be an employee of the University or a member of the Council, and there will be one lay member of the Council on the Panel. With regard to termination and redundancy procedures, the employee can be accompanied by a second person of the University or a legal representative in the case of termination of a teacher for "Good Cause".

5. *Is there a regular/standing office within the institutions to serve as the first point of contact to receive complaints/appeals and to ensure that they be handled according to proper procedures?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes, the Human Resources Office.

Institution	Response
HKBU	Yes, the first point of contact for different types of complaints/appeals is stipulated in the relevant policy guidelines.
LU	Yes, the respective secretaries of the appeal committees.
CUHK	Yes, the point of contact for complaints/appeals from different types of staff is stipulated in the relevant procedure. Promulgated to the staff.
HKIEd	Yes, the Human Resources Department (HRD) for staff on employment related issues, the Student Affairs Office (SAO) for equal opportunity cases.
PolyU	Yes, Secretary to the Appeals and Grievance Committee, who is appointed by the Director of Personnel.
HKUST	Yes. The respective subject officers/committees/senior University administrators as provided for under various procedures. Staff members with complaints may also always approach the Personnel Office as the first contact point.
HKU	Yes. The first point of contact of appeals can be found in the relevant guidelines.

B. Operation

6. *Is the mechanism simple to invoke and operate? For example, do complainants need to deal with tedious paper work to lodge a complaint?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. No tedious paper work is required of the staff concerned. The complainants simply lodge a written complaint with the Human Resources Office.
HKBU	Yes. The mechanism will be invoked once the complainant writes to the first point of contact. No tedious paper work is needed.
LU	Yes. Once the staff member concerned notify in writing the secretary of the standing committee concerned of his/her intention to appeal, the appeal process is triggered.
CUHK	Yes, the staff member concerned may simply lodge a written complaint, given the details of the complaint/grievance.
HKIEd	Yes. Staff members may simply lodge a written complaint, either in English or Chinese, giving details of his/her complaint. No tedious paper work is needed.

Institution	Response
PolyU	According to the procedures for staff appeals and grievance (the Policy), "any staff member who wishes to lodge an appeal or to pursue a grievance should set out his case in writing". Staff who wish to lodge their complaints would not be deterred from doing so, because there is no restriction as to the language used (i.e. English or Chinese) and to the context of their complaints.
HKUST	Yes. Any complainant may simply lodge a written appeal/complaint, stating its basis. Certain procedures also provide for assistance by the subject officer in drafting the written complaint. There would not be the question of staff members being deterred from lodging their complaints by tedious paper work.
HKU	Yes. If an appointee wishes to exercise his right of appeal, he can give notice of his decision of appeal together with the grounds thereof in writing. No tedious paper work is required to lodge a complaint.

7. *Are there clearly defined rules to prevent the management's undue influence on and interference with the mechanism?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. All procedures have to be strictly adhered to. Any changes or deviation from the established procedures must be approved by the relevant committees.
HKBU	Yes. Appeals against decision of removal from appointment of substantiated staff are handled by the Council. The Committee of Appeal set up under the Council to handle such appeals shall be chaired by a Council member who is not a staff member of the University, and shall comprise another lay Council member. All members of the Committee of Appeal should not be involved in the original decision-making process on removal from appointment.
LU	Yes. As the mechanisms handling complaints/appeals are managed by standing committees under the Council (except for the internal Appeals Committee for supporting and technical staff), it is quite clear that the management cannot exert undue influence and interfere with the process.
CUHK	Yes. Recommendations and decisions for termination of staff will be processed centrally by the Personnel Office to ensure that due process has been observed and that such actions are in full compliance with the relevant provisions of the relevant Terms of Service of the University, the University Ordinance and Statutes, the Employment Ordinance and other relevant ordinances. The University will also ensure that such recommendations are made with substantiated reasons and evidences.

Institution	Response
HKIEd	Yes. The following mechanisms are in place to prevent undue influence of the management: (a) The terms and reference of various Committees are clearly laid down to eliminate the possibility of manipulation; and (b) the compositions of the Committees usually consist of elected staff representative(s) and/or external members outside the Institute who are independent of the Institute's management.
PolyU	Yes. As the Appeals and Grievance Committee is an independent unit with representatives from different levels, it is considered that Management's undue influence on and interference with the mechanism does not exist.
HKUST	Yes. The defined procedures and the availability of the appeal channel all the way up to the University Council would effectively preempt any undue influence by the University management.
HKU	Yes. For example, it is required that two of three members of the Grievances Panel, which is set up by the Council to handle complaints, are not employees of the University.

8. *Are there clearly stated rules to prevent the person(s) against whom a complaint is made or who has/have direct interest in the complaint from being involved in handling that complaint at any stages?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. The person against whom a complaint is made and those who have direct interest in the complaint will not be involved in handling the complaint. They will of course be asked to provide information and data to assist investigation of the allegation.
HKBU	Yes. For removal from Appointment of Substantiated Academic and equivalent Administrative Staff on Terms of Service A, although the Head of the Relevant Department will be present in the Committee of Enquiry to give evidences, he/she should not be involved in the final decision.
LU	Yes. Besides the clearly defined procedures, the members of the appeals committees are also requested to observe the rule of conflict of interests. The procedure of the Discipline and Ethics Committee also prevents any person(s) against whom a complaint is lodged from being involved in handling the complaint at any stage.
CUHK	Yes, the party against whom the complaint is made will not be involved in handling the complaint. He/She will be required to provide information/explanation as required by the University.

Institution	Response
HKIEd	Yes. The membership of the Committee handling the complaint/appeal normally excludes anyone who has direct interest in the complaint and anyone who will be involved in the proceedings or has taken part in any attempt at conciliation of the complaint. In this regard, members will normally be required to declare interest to the Committee beforehand.
PolyU	Yes. Although the Policy has no clearly stated rules to prevent the person(s) against whom a complaint is made from being involved in handling that complaint, the Policy does provide clear guidelines for any appeal or grievance case to be handled by the Committee independently and objectively.
HKUST	Yes. Person(s) against whom a complaint is made or who has/have direct interest in the complaints would in no circumstances be involved in handling the complaint. They would be requested to provide information if needed to assist in the investigation. Provision is also made to the effect that at each stage of a complaint procedure, the complaint would be handled only by parties not involved in the previous decision for thorough and unbiased re-consideration of the complaint.
HKU	Yes. If the complainant is against a Head of Department, the Dean of the Faculty will be involved in handling the complaint initially. If the Vice-Chancellor is himself the appointee against whom the complaint is made, he shall be replaced in the Grievance Procedures by the Chairman of the Council.

9. *Is there sufficient confidentiality to protect the complainant's privacy?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. All information will be handled in a strictly confidential basis.
HKBU	Yes. All appeals/complaint cases will be handled in strictest confidence. Privacy of the complainant and parties concerned will be protected in accordance with the requirements of the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance.
LU	Yes. The procedures of the mechanisms require that the whole process be conducted in strict confidence, and that involving parties' privacy be protected as required by the laws.
CUHK	Yes, all information related to the case will be handled in strict confidence.

Institution	Response
HKIEd	Yes. All complaints are to be dealt with in strictly confidential manner. The Institute is committed to maintain the principle of confidentiality and will act strictly according to the Personal (Data) Privacy Ordinance to protect the interest and privacy of the complainant.
PolyU	Yes. It is stipulated in the Policy that "confidentiality" must be maintained at all time, and that privacy of the complainant will therefore be protected.
HKUST	Yes. All complaints are handled on a strictly confidential basis. Violation of confidentiality by persons involved in the review process would be regarded as a serious breach of professional ethics and be subject to appropriate sanctions.
HKU	Yes. All proceedings will be handled in a confidential manner. All parties involved in the hearings and investigations are reminded of the confidential nature of the proceedings, and of the obligation to maintain that confidentiality. Unauthorised disclosure of any information, details or documents relating to the report may result in appropriate action by the Council.

10. *Are parties involved in a case given adequate opportunities to present information and evidence in support of their positions?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. In the case of the personnel decisions, the staff concerned is the one who decides what evidence to supply to the approving committee in support of the promotion, renewal of contract, etc. In the case of disciplinary proceedings, the respondent shall be entitled to submit a written representation to the Disciplinary Committee, to call witnesses, and to attend hearing of the Committee.
HKBU	Yes. In considering contract renewal/bar-crossing/promotion, the staff member concerned will be invited to supply evidences in support of their cases. In considering removal from appointment, the staff member involved will have the right to appear before the relevant Committee to present information or evidences in defense of his/her case, to call witnesses and be accompanied by a staff colleague if he/she so wishes.
LU	Yes. According to the procedures, involving parties of a complaint/appeal are given full opportunities to present information and documents in support of their positions during the whole process.
CUHK	Yes. In the review process, due consultation will be made. The appointee concerned will be given the opportunity to provide input and any information that he/she feels may help the University to review the case.

Institution	Response
HKIEd	Yes. All parties involved in an appeal/complaint case will be given the rights to appear before the Committee, to present evidence to the Committee and to call witness(es) to the event on their behalf during the investigation process.
PolyU	Yes. Throughout the investigation process, the Policy provides that both the staff member making the appeal or pursuing a grievance and the other party concerned will be interviewed and be given the right to comment on the information gathered during the interviews of other persons and to provide further information as appropriate. Furthermore, it is stated that relevant documentation setting out the appeal or grievance shall be made available to the person against whom the appeal or grievance is directed. Similarly, any written response to the appeal or grievance shall be made available to the member of staff making an appeal or pursuing a grievance.
HKUST	Yes. Parties involved would be given full opportunities to present any information/evidence they consider relevant to their case.
HKU	Yes. The appointee is allowed to submit full justifications for appeal, can appear in person before the appeal-handling bodies to present his case.

11. *Are there promulgated performance pledges in handling complaints/appeals? For example, are there pre-determined time limits within which response should be given or hearing should be conducted?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. For disciplinary proceedings, there are prescribed time limits within which hearing should be conducted, response given and decision made.
HKBU	Yes. Specific time limits are laid down in the policy. For handling appeals against decision of removal from appointment of substantiated staff, specific time limits are laid down for the formation of the relevant Appeal Committee, meeting of the Appeal Committee, submission of the report on the Committee's decision, and notification to the staff member concerned of the decision with regard to his/her appeal.
LU	Yes. The procedures set out the timeframes for action after receipt of complaint/appeal and for completion of the process. Non-compliance with the set timeframes will require explanations to the Council or the President.
CUHK	Complaints/appeals are always dealt with the as soon as possible, and time limits are specifically indicated in some guidelines.

Institution	Response
HKIEd	Yes. Specific time limits have been promulgated in respective policy papers in handling complaints/appeals at all stages.
PolyU	Yes. The Policy sets out a deadline for submission of a report to the President within two months. Otherwise, the Appeals and Grievance Committee is required to explain the reason(s) in writing to the President.
HKUST	Yes. Specific time frames for handling appeals are provided for in the established procedures. For complaints falling outside the prescribed procedures, there is a mandate within the University for any such complaints received to be dealt with as expeditiously as possible.
HKU	Yes. In redundancy cases, for example, the appeal has to be referred to the Council as soon as reasonably practicable and before the expiry of the appointee's notice period as set out in the letter advising him of the redundancy decision.

12. *Are the reasons for the final decision, action or non-action fully explained to the complainant?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. A copy of the written report from the Disciplinary Committee will be given to the Respondent. The reasons for the Disciplinary Committee's recommendation will be captured in the Report. For personnel decisions, the reasons are communicated to the staff concerned via the Head of Department.
HKBU	Yes. The staff member concerned will be informed in writing of the decision of the relevant Committee.
LU	Yes. Upon request from the staff member concerned, the reasons for the final decisions will be fully explained to the appellant. In case of complaint of a disciplinary nature, the complainant will also be fully informed of reasons for action and non-action.
CUHK	Yes, all decisions on the appeal/complaint are communicated formally to the staff concerned.
HKIEd	Yes. A written reply conveying the Committee's final decision with detailed explanation will be sent to the complainant after the case is closed.
PolyU	Yes. All decisions of the Appeals and Grievance Committee shall be communicated to both parties in writing.
HKUST	Yes. The appellant/complainant would as a rule be informed of the final decision and the reasons thereof, via his/her Head of Department in case of decisions regarding contractual employment matters.
HKU	Yes. It is stipulated that the complainant will be informed of the final decision.

13. *Are there mechanisms for granting redress or directing remedial measures? Are there requirements for doing so in an expeditious way?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. Where redress or remedial measures are considered appropriate, the parties concerned will be notified and required to take appropriate action.
HKBU	Yes, in case redress or remedial measures are considered necessary, the decision will be followed up expeditiously by parties concerned.
LU	Yes. There will be remedial measures if redress is granted for a disciplinary case.
CUHK	Yes, in compliance with the provisions of the University's Terms of Service, the University's Ordinance and Statutes, the Employment Ordinance and the other relevant ordinances.
HKIEd	Yes. After investigation, the respective Committees may recommend, if necessary and as appropriate, granting redress or direct remedial measures. The decisions will be followed up expeditiously.
PolyU	Although redress or remedial actions are not topics covered in the Policy, the President would immediately take remedial action if the results of the appeal case revealed that such action is called for.
HKUST	Yes. The committee/authority handling a complaint may direct that redress be granted or remedial action be taken, in which case appropriate action would be taken expeditiously.
HKU	Yes. Remedial measures will be taken expeditiously if redress is granted.

C. Transparency and Monitoring

14. *Are staff at all ranks consulted when devising or changing the mechanism?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. When the Regulation Governing Staff Discipline were devised, views were sought from the Staff Consultative Committee which has elected staff representatives on it.
HKBU	Yes. Changes in major personnel policies will need to be thoroughly discussed in relevant Committees comprising academic and non-teaching staff as members before being considered by the Council where elected staff representatives are present.
LU	Yes. It is a normal practice that staff members are consulted for important personnel policies as well as subsequent major changes made to it. Staff members have the opportunities to comment on the draft policy in hard copy form and/or voice their views at a forum for all staff members.

Institution	Response
CUHK	Yes, the two staff associations were consulted on the appeal procedure for termination and non-substantiation of appointment.
HKIED	Yes. When devising or proposing changes to the complaint/appeal mechanism, staff are consulted, e.g. at open forums and/or through the Association of Lecturers. The proposals will be thoroughly discussed and endorsed by Staffing Committee or the Council in which elected staff representatives and external members are present.
PolyU	Yes. The procedures for staff appeals and grievance was formulated some years ago by a group, comprising staff representatives as well as lay Council members appointed independently by the Government at that time. The then Polytechnic Staff Association was consulted and comments received from it were incorporated before it was formally approved by the University Council.
HKUST	Yes. The University's procedures have been established after wide consultation among staff concerned. For instance, procedures for the teaching staff were widely discussed at the departmental level at Departmental Committees and at the school level at School Committees. They were then finally debated and approved at the University level at the University Senate.
HKU	Yes. Changes in termination/redundancy/grievances regulations have to be considered by a Conditions of Service Committee before going to the Council. The Conditions of Service Committee consists of a member each from the Academic Staff Association and Non-Academic Staff Association. This reflects that the University has included staff representatives on Committees which deal with regulations on termination and grievances.

15. *Are the complaints/appeal channels sufficiently publicised?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. The appeal channels and procedures are easily accessible via the Human Resources Office Home Page available in the University's Intranet.
HKBU	Yes. The appeal/grievances procedures are set out in the Staff Handbook and Terms of Service booklets.
LU	Yes. The functions and procedures of the appeals committees are widely publicised in the University electronically through the campus computer network. A Staff Handbook including the relevant procedures is kept in every unit of the University for easy reference of the staff members.

Institution	Response
CUHK	Yes, the appeal procedure for non-substantiation of appointment is publicized in the Staff Handbook. When the appeal procedure for substantiation and dismissal of staff was devised, they were also communicated to the Teacher's Association and Staff Association respectively.
HKIEd	Yes. The complaints/appeals channels have been widely publicised by various means, e.g. email communications, internal circulars, Intranet and Staff Handbook.
PolyU	Yes. The Policy, which defines clearly the appeal mechanisms as well as the responsibilities of different parties at different levels, has been widely publicized and is currently available on the Staff Handbook accessible through the Staff Intranet in the University homepage. Besides, the procedures for appeals and grievance on cases of dismissals are set out in individual staff members' conditions of service documents, which provides another avenue for them to appeal to the University Council for final decision. These procedures have been publicized in both English and Chinese and are also obtainable from the Personnel Office.
HKUST	Yes. The procedures are publicized in the relevant staff handbook and are also available on the University's staff intranet.
HKU	Yes. The procedures and policies handling staff complaints on contractual employment matters are published in the staff handbooks, which are available on the Internet.

16. *Are there suitable measures to facilitate the staff's monitoring of the mechanism?*

Institution	Response
CityU	Yes. There are two elected staff members on the Council, who will consider and approve the policies.
HKBU	Yes. Appeal procedures are promulgated via circulars and staff handbooks etc. Staff members are always welcome to forward their views and feedback to the Personnel Office. Besides, major changes in personnel policies will need to be thoroughly discussed in relevant Committees and the Council where staff members or elected staff representatives are present.

Institution	Response
LU	Yes. In the Council where all the policies are considered and decisions made, some of its members are elected from among the staff members and some elected among the academic staff in the Senate. As standing committees are required to report to the Council their activities at the next Council meeting, the aforesaid categories of Council members can comment on the mechanisms, and propose changes if situation requires.
CUHK	Yes, staff members are always welcome to make suggestions either individually, or through their staff associations. The University has a regular forum to discuss matters including those relating to personnel matters and policies with the staff associations at the Joint Consultative Committee.
HKIEd	Yes. Staff members are always welcome to provide feedback and suggestions to the Human Resources Department to improve the existing mechanism at any time. All comments/suggestions will be dealt with seriously. Elected staff representatives are also present in various Committees to help monitor the mechanism.
PolyU	Yes. As mentioned above, the Polytechnic Staff Association was consulted before the procedures for staff appeals and grievance was approved by Council and it has been sufficiently publicized afterwards. As such, it is considered that the procedures for staff appeals and grievance is both fair and transparent, and that suitable measures have been established to facilitate staff members to monitor the mechanism.
HKUST	Yes. As there is staff representation on the major policy approving authorities such as the University Senate and the University Council, staff members would be in a position to continuously to monitor the established procedures.
HKU	Yes. As explained at 14 above.