

**Legislative Council Public Service Panel  
Meeting on 15 November 1999**

**Starting Salaries Review**

**PURPOSE**

This paper informs Members of the latest position on the Starting Salaries Review.

**BACKGROUND**

2. On 20 July 1999, we issued the Standing Commission on Civil Service Salaries and Conditions of Services (Standing Commission)'s Starting Salaries Review (Review) to the Staff Councils and department/grade management. A Legislative Council Brief was issued on the same day and a briefing for the Public Services Panel was held on 22 July.

3. As the Standing Commission's recommendations are confined to the civilian grades, the report was passed to the Standing Committee on Disciplined Services Salaries and Conditions of Service's (SCDS) to consider whether, and if so how, the results of the Starting Salaries Review should be applied to the disciplined services. SCDS's recommendations were issued to the Staff Sides and department/grade management on 7 October. An information paper on SCDS's recommendations was issued to Members on the same day. The report was also passed to the Judiciary Administrator to consider inviting the Standing Committee on Judicial Salaries and Conditions of Services to advise on the appropriateness of adjusting the salaries of Judges and Judicial Officers in line with civil service starting salaries. We are awaiting recommendations on this from the Judiciary Administrator.

4. We have conducted two rounds of meetings with the Central Consultative Staff Councils and the three service-wide staff associations. We have also met all department/grade management (including the disciplined services) to clarify issues and listen to their views on the recommendations arising from the Review. The Departmental

Consultative Committees of individual departments/grades also discussed the Review and passed us their comments. The deadline for submission of comments on the civilian sides was end October and we have asked for comments on the disciplined sides to reach us by mid-November.

## **PROPOSED BENCHMARKS AND STARTING SALARIES AND PAY MODEL FOR RECRUITS**

5. The recommendations from the Standing Commission and SCDS and the main features of the new pay model for Members' reference are set out below.

### **Standing Commission's Recommendations**

6. The Standing Commission has carried out a pay comparison survey to find out how the starting pay for jobs in the private sector at the entry level relates to the starting salaries for various entry ranks in the civil service on the basis of similar entry qualification. The Standing Commission's recommendations on the new benchmarks for the 13 Qualification Groups (QGs)<sup>1</sup> are set out in **Annex A**. In summary, except for QG 8 (*Technical, Supervisory and Related Grades Group I*), the benchmark for all the other QGs will be lowered from one to at most six points.

7. The starting salaries of majority of the civil service grades are pitched variously at one to six points above their respective benchmarks. The additional pay points were awarded in recognition of special job factors pertaining to some grades. Under this exercise, these factors are taken as given assumptions.

8. To ensure the continuing broad comparability between civil service pay and pay in the private sector for similar qualifications, the Standing Commission has also recommended the delinking of the benchmark/entry pay from the annual pay trend survey. To ensure the benchmark is in line with the private sector pay in future, a full benchmark review would be conducted every three to four years with annual updating carried out in the interim.

---

<sup>1</sup> No benchmark are set for QG 3 (School Certificate Group II), QG 15 (Education Grades) and QG 16 (Other Grades). The starting salaries for grades under these QGs are set having regard to (a) internal relativity with other QGs or (b) education requirements of the grades.

## **SCDS's Recommendations**

9. SCDS has made the following recommendations –
  - a) some adjustment to the starting salaries of recruits entering the disciplined services would be justified in order to maintain broad comparability with the rest of the civil service; and
  - b) the pay advantage which the disciplined services now enjoy in recognition of "special factors" and "job factors" should not be reduced.
  
10. In arriving at the new starting salaries, SCDS -
  - a) confined adjustment to that element of disciplined services pay based on academic qualification benchmarks;
  - b) concentrated on the two usual reference pay points, i.e. Matriculation for officers and School Certificate for the rank and file, and adjusted other entry points for recruits in step;
  - c) used the Inspector of Police and Police Constable as the reference point for the officers and rank and file respectively in adjusting the entry pay of the other six disciplined services; and
  - d) brought the salary adjustments as closely in line with existing relativities between the seven disciplined services as possible.

The proposed starting salaries of the disciplined services are set out at **Annex B**.

11. SCDS has also supported in principle the proposal to delink the benchmark from the annual pay trend adjustment and the proposed benchmark review mechanism.

## **New Pay Model**

12. Having regard to the new starting salaries, we have proposed a new pay package for recruits with the following main new features -

- a) the benchmark/entry pay will be delinked from the annual pay trend survey; and

- b) increment dates will be standardized for recruits and staff on transfer to 1 April of each year.

13. We propose to apply the new starting salaries and pay model to recruits and serving staff on transfer.

## **FEEDBACK FROM STAFF COUNCILS AND DEPARTMENT/ GRADE MANAGEMENT**

14. Both staff and management have remarked on the fact that the Review was conducted at a time when Hong Kong's economy was at its worst. The broadbanding Education Qualification Method adopted by the Standing Commission which disregard job factors has also been criticised by the staff in that the job factors unique to the civil service and individual grades have been ignored. They are very concerned that different starting salaries would result in a split in the civil service. There are also concerns from department/grade management that some grades may face recruitment difficulties with the entry pay lowered. They argue that this will particularly be the case for grades which, under the old scale, will receive housing benefits within a few years or immediately on appointment. Other issues that have attracted considerable discussion among staff are the arrangements for assistant/student/training rank, the disruption of pay relativity, in particular between some supervisory and subordinate grades, the delinking of entry pay from the annual pay trend survey, the benchmark review mechanism, the salary on transfer formula and the proposal to standardise incremental date. Some grade-specific issues were also raised during our consultation (e.g. whether a particular academic qualification should continue to be the qualification requirement for a particular grade).

## **CONCLUSION**

15. The results of the consultation on the Starting Salaries Review are now being analysed. We are still awaiting further comments from staff and management on the revised starting salaries and pay package for recruits to the disciplined services and recommendations from the Judiciary Administrator. In the weeks ahead, we will analyse carefully the feedback we have received before we finalise the new benchmarks

and starting salaries. We aim to implement the revised starting salaries when the current freeze in civil service recruitment is lifted. As for issues relating to the future adjustment mechanism and the delinking arrangement, we will continue the dialogue with the Staff Sides as we develop these issues.

Civil Service Bureau  
November 1999

### Proposed Benchmarks for Civilian Grades

| QG | Qualification Groups                                  | Examples of Grades  | Existing Benchmark   | Proposed Benchmark   | Reduction             |
|----|---|---|----------------------|--|-----------------------|
| 1  | Grades not requiring a full School Certificate        | Bailiff's Assistant, Clerical Assistant, Data Processor, Postman, Telephone Operator, Typist, Water Sampler               | MPS 1<br>(\$8,625)   | MPS 0<br>(\$8,125)   | -1 point<br>(-5.8%)   |
| 2  | School Certificate Grades<br>Group I                  | Calligraphist, Clerical Officer, Land Inspector, Personal Secretary, Supplies Supervisor, Welfare Worker                  | MPS 3<br>(\$9,785)   | MPS 2<br>(\$9,180)   | -1 point<br>(-6.2%)   |
| 3  | Group II  | Confidential Assistant, Labour Inspector, Tax Inspector, Trade Controls Officer   | N/A                  | Starting salaries to be determined having regard to internal relativity with QG2 |                       |
| 4  | Higher Diploma, Diploma and Related Grades<br>Group I | Dental Therapist, Health Inspector, Occupational Therapist, Radiographer, Registered Nurse                                | MPS 13<br>(\$18,140) | MPS 11<br>(\$16,095)   | -2 points<br>(-11.3%) |
| 5  | Group II  | Aeronautical Communications Officer, Audiology Technician, Dispenser, Explosives Officer, Laboratory Technician, Printing | MPS 10<br>(\$15,160) | MPS 6<br>(\$11,820)  | -4 points<br>(-22.0%) |

|    |   |  |                      |                      |                       |
|----|---|--|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|
|    |   | Officer, Social Work Assistant, Statistical Officer  |                      |                      |                       |
| 6  | Group III   | Computer Operator, Dental Hygienist, Enrolled Nurse, Midwife   | MPS 7<br>(\$12,595)  | MPS 3<br>(\$9,785)   | -4 points<br>(-22.3%) |
| 7  | Technical Inspectorate and Related Grades             | Air-Conditioning Inspector, Building Supervisor, Clerk of Works, Electronics Inspector, Force Armourer, Marine Controller, Motor Vehicle Examiner                  | MPS 13<br>(\$18,140) | MPS 11<br>(\$16,095) | -2 points<br>(-11.3%) |
| 8  | Technician, Supervisory and Related Grades<br>Group I | Amenities Assistant, Armourer, Butcher, Foreman, Launch Master, Mortuary Technician, Printing Technician, Sailor   | MPS 6<br>(\$11,820)  | MPS 6<br>(\$11,820)  | -<br>-                |
| 9  | Group II  | Artisan, Cook, Darkroom Technician, Domestic Servant, Leading Sewerman, Motor Driver   | MPS 6<br>(\$11,820)  | MPS 5<br>(\$11,115)  | -1 point<br>(-6.0%)   |
| 10 | Matriculation Grades                                  | Amenities Officer, Assistant Registrar, Court Prosecutor, Housing Manager, Judicial Clerk, Land Executive, Liaison Officer, Social Security Officer                | MPS 10<br>(\$15,160) | MPS 4<br>(\$10,420)  | -6 points<br>(-31.3%) |
| 11 | Professional and Related Grades<br>Group I            | Architect, Assessor, Auditor, Building Surveyor, Government Counsel, Dental Officer, Electrical Engineer, Insurance Officer, Medical and Health Officer, Solicitor | MPS 27<br>(\$35,285) | MPS 22<br>(\$28,075) | -5 points<br>(-20.4%) |
| 12 | Group II  | Administrative Officer, Agricultural Officer, Cartographer, Chemist, Economist, Forestry Officer, Pharmacist, Physicist  | MPS 27<br>(\$35,285) | MPS 22<br>(\$28,075) | -5 points<br>(-20.4%) |
| 13 | Degree and  | Accounting Officer, Chinese Language Officer, Executive  | MPS 16               | MPS 11               | -5 points<br>(-23.4%) |

|    |                      |   |                   |  |                      |
|----|----------------------|---|-------------------|--|----------------------|
|    | Related Grades       | Officer, Hospital Administrator, Labour Officer, Librarian, Social Work Officer, Trade Officer  | (\$21,010)        | (\$16,095)   |                      |
| 14 | Model Scale 1 Grades | Workman II, Car Park Attendant II, Ganger, Lift Operator, Ward Attendant  | MOD1<br>(\$9,785) | MOD0<br>(\$8,615)  | -1 point<br>(-12.0%) |
| 15 | Education Grades     | Certificated Master/Mistress, Education Officer, Inspector (Graduate), Primary School Master/Mistress   | N/A               | Starting salaries to be determined having regard to established relativity with QG 4 and QG 13   | N/A                  |
| 16 | Other Grades         | Air Traffic Control Officer, Chauffeur, Chef, Driving Examiner, Domestic Staff, Legal Aid Assistant, Photographer, Proof Reader, Protocol Officer, Traffic Warden | N/A               | Starting salaries to be determined by reference to (a) traditional relativities with other QGs and (b) where such relativities are not available, the relevant educational attainment stipulated in the appointment requirements | N/A                  |



## Proposed Starting Salaries for Disciplined Services

### I. Officer Grades

| Dept               | Basic Rank  | Entry Qualification                                     | Existing Starting Salary |        | Recommended Starting Salary |        | Actual Decrease |       |
|--------------------|---|---|--------------------------|--------|-----------------------------|--------|-----------------|-------|
|                    |   |   | Pay Point                | \$     | Pay Point                   | \$     | \$              | %     |
| CSD<br>C&ED<br>FSD | Officer<br>Inspector of Customs & Excise<br>Station Officer (Operational) | Degree  | GDS(O)10                 | 30,585 | GDS(O)7                     | 26,075 | 4,510           | 14.75 |
|                    |   | Higher Diploma  | GDS(O)9                  | 29,080 | GDS(O)6                     | 24,605 | 4,475           | 15.39 |
|                    |   | 2A 3O/Diploma   | GDS(O)8                  | 27,570 | GDS(O)5                     | 23,095 | 4,475           | 16.23 |
|                    |   | 5Es in HKCEE/ Higher Certificate/<br>Technical Diploma  | GDS(O)6                  | 24,605 | GDS(O)3                     | 20,765 | 3,840           | 15.61 |
| CSD                | Industrial Officer (Correctional<br>Services)                             | Degree  | GDS(O)10                 | 30,585 | GDS(O)7                     | 26,075 | 4,510           | 14.75 |
|                    |   | Higher Diploma  | GDS(O)9                  | 29,080 | GDS(O)6                     | 24,605 | 4,475           | 15.39 |
|                    |   | 2A 3O   | GDS(O)8                  | 27,570 | GDS(O)5                     | 23,095 | 4,475           | 16.23 |
|                    |   | 1A 3O   | GDS(O)6                  | 24,605 | GDS(O)3                     | 20,765 | 3,840           | 15.61 |
|                    | Technical Instructor (Correctional<br>Services)                           | Apprenticeship + Experience (not<br>less than 10 years) | GDS(O)5                  | 23,095 | GDS(O)2                     | 19,730 | 3,365           | 14.57 |
| FSD<br>ImmD        | Station Officer(Control)<br>Ambulance Officer<br>Immigration Officer      | Degree  | GDS(O)8                  | 27,570 | GDS(O)5                     | 23,095 | 4,475           | 16.23 |
|                    |   | Higher Diploma  | GDS(O)7                  | 26,075 | GDS(O)4                     | 21,795 | 4,280           | 16.41 |
|                    |   | 2A 3O   | GDS(O)6                  | 24,605 | GDS(O)3                     | 20,765 | 3,840           | 15.61 |
|                    |   | 5Es in HKCEE  | GDS(O)4                  | 21,795 | GDS(O)1                     | 18,885 | 2,910           | 13.35 |
| GFS                | Air Crewman   | 2A 3O   | GDS(O)1                  | 18,885 | GDS(O)1d                    | 15,850 | 3,035           | 16.07 |
|                    |   | 5Es in HKCEE  | GDS(R)9                  | 16,725 | GDS(R)4                     | 14,100 | 2,625           | 15.70 |
|                    |   | Aircraft Engineer                                       | GDS(O)22                 | 50,980 | GDS(O)17                    | 42,895 | 8,085           | 15.86 |

|      |   |                  |         |        |          |        |       |       |
|------|---|------------------|---------|--------|----------|--------|-------|-------|
|      | Aircraft Technician                           | Apprenticeship   | GDS(R)5 | 14,500 | GDS(R)3  | 13,710 | 790   | 5.45  |
|      | Cadet Pilot                                   | 2A 3O            | GDS(O)1 | 18,885 | GDS(O)1d | 15,850 | 3,035 | 16.07 |
| HKPF | Inspector of Police                           | Degree           | PPS27   | 32,380 | PPS21    | 26,955 | 5,425 | 16.75 |
|      |   | Higher Diploma   | PPS26   | 30,975 | PPS20    | 26,245 | 4,730 | 15.27 |
|      |   | 2A 3O            | PPS25   | 30,050 | PPS19    | 25,580 | 4,470 | 14.88 |
|      |   | 5Es in HKCEE     | PPS23   | 28,295 | PPS17    | 24,175 | 4,120 | 14.56 |
| ICAC | Commission Against Corruption Officer (Lower) | Degree           | ICAC15  | 31,195 | ICAC11   | 25,895 | 5,300 | 16.99 |
|      |   | Higher Diploma   | ICAC14  | 29,870 | ICAC11a  | 25,220 | 4,650 | 15.57 |
|      |   | 2A 3O            | ICAC13  | 28,555 | ICAC10   | 24,540 | 4,015 | 14.06 |
|      |   | Lower than 2A 3O | ICAC11  | 25,895 | ICAC8    | 21,915 | 3,980 | 15.37 |
| ICAC | Commission Against Corruption Controller      | Degree           |         |        | ICAC11   | 25,895 | -     | -     |
|      |   | Higher Diploma   | ICAC11  | 25,895 | ICAC11a  | 25,220 | -     | -     |
|      |   | 2A 3O            |         |        | ICAC10   | 24,540 | -     | -     |
|      |   | Lower than 2A 3O |         |        | ICAC8    | 21,915 | -     | -     |

II. Rank and File Grades

| Dept               | Basic Rank   | Entry Qualification  | Existing Starting Salary |        | Recommended Starting Salary |        | Actual Decrease |      |
|--------------------|--|--|--------------------------|--------|-----------------------------|--------|-----------------|------|
|                    |  |  | Pay Point                | \$     | Pay Point                   | \$     | \$              | %    |
| CSD<br>C&ED<br>FSD | Assistant Officer II<br>Customs Officer<br>Ambulanceman<br>Fireman | 5Es in HKCEE including English                               | GDS(R)4                  | 14,100 | GDS(R)3                     | 13,710 | 390             | 2.77 |
|                    |  | 3Es in HKCEE   | GDS(R)3                  | 13,710 | GDS(R)2                     | 13,305 | 405             | 2.95 |
|                    |  | Up to completion of F.5                                      | GDS(R)2                  | 13,305 | GDS(R)1                     | 12,940 | 365             | 2.74 |
| CSD                | Instructor (Correctional Services)                                 | 5 years of experience or<br>Apprenticeship in various trades | GDS(R)3                  | 13,710 | GDS(R)2                     | 13,305 | 405             | 2.95 |
| FSD                | Senior Fireman (Control)<br>Senior Fireman (Canteen<br>Supervisor) | 5 Es in HKCEE including English                              | GDS(R)14                 | 19,535 | GDS(R)13                    | 18,965 | 570             | 2.92 |
| ImmD               | Immigration Assistant  | 5 Es in HKCEE including English                              | GDS(R)3                  | 13,710 | GDS(R)2                     | 13,305 | 405             | 2.95 |
|                    |  | 3Es in HKCEE   | GDS(R)2                  | 13,305 | GDS(R)1                     | 12,940 | 365             | 2.74 |
|                    |  | Up to completion of F.5                                      | GDS(R)1                  | 12,940 | GDS(R)1a                    | 12,585 | 355             | 2.74 |
| HKPF               | Police Constable   | 5Es in HKCEE including English                               | PPS3                     | 15,995 | PPS2                        | 15,520 | 475             | 2.97 |
|                    |  | 3Es in HKCEE   | PPS2                     | 15,520 | PPS1                        | 15,065 | 455             | 2.93 |
|                    |  | Up to completion of F.5                                      | PPS1                     | 15,065 | PPS1a                       | 14,625 | 440             | 2.92 |
| ICAC               | Assistant Commission Against<br>Corruption Officer                 | 5Es in HKCEE   | ICAC2                    | 14,500 | ICAC2a                      | 13,970 | 530             | 3.66 |
|                    |  | Lower than 5Es in HKCEE                                      | ICAC1                    | 13,440 | ICAC1a                      | 12,950 | 490             | 3.65 |
|                    |  | Commission Against Corruption<br>Investigator (Main Stream)  | 5Es in HKCEE             | ICAC2  | 14,500                      | ICAC2a | 13,970          | 530  |
|                    |  | Lower than 5Es in HKCEE                                      | ICAC1                    | 13,440 | ICAC1a                      | 12,950 | 490             | 3.65 |
|                    | Commission Against Corruption<br>Investigator (Attendant Stream)   | 5Es in HKCEE   | ICAC2                    | 14,500 | ICAC2a                      | 13,970 | 530             | 3.66 |
|                    |  | Lower than 5Es in HKCEE                                      | ICAC1                    | 13,440 | ICAC1a                      | 12,950 | 490             | 3.65 |