

Mock Motion Debate
Strengthening control on light pollution

In recent years, there has been growing public concern about light nuisance and light pollution problems caused by external lighting installations such as advertising signboards, decorative lightings, and spot lights on the external walls of buildings. Furthermore, light pollution implies energy wastage. In this connection, this Council urges the Administration to expeditiously introduce legislation on external lighting installations to minimize the adverse impact of light pollution.

Mock Motion Debate

Strengthening control on light pollution

Role	Script
PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	: Members' motion: Strengthening control on light pollution. <u>Hon _____</u> (Name of the student acting as Legislative Council Member A who moves the motion)
MEMBER A (ELECTION COMMITTEE)	: (<i>Stands up</i>) President, I move that the motion be passed to urge the Government to expeditiously introduce legislation for the control of external lighting to alleviate the problem of light pollution. While there are existing laws relevant to the issue of external lighting, they do not deal specifically with light pollution. The Government has issued guidelines on practices for external lighting to encourage the public to take early action to minimize light nuisance and energy wastage. However, these guidelines are not only vague and incomprehensive, but also toothless and non-enforceable ... (<i>Student may express more views freely</i>) Therefore, the Government should demonstrate its commitment and introduce legislation to minimize the adverse impact of light pollution. Thank you, President. (<i>Sits down</i>)
PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	: I now propose the question to you and that is: That the motion moved by <u>Member A</u> be passed. Does any Member wish to speak? (<i>The student acting as Legislative Council Member B (Medical and Health Services Functional Constituency) raises his/her hand</i>)
PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	: <u>Hon _____</u> (Name of the student acting as Legislative Council Member B (Medical and Health Services Functional Constituency))

Role	Script
MEMBER B (MEDICAL AND HEALTH SERVICES FUNCTIONAL CONSTITUENCY)	<p>: <i>(Stands up)</i></p> <p>President, I support <u>Member A</u>'s motion. While research studies conducted in different countries so far have not come to any conclusive view on any direct relationship between exposure to strong light and health problems, there are possible health effects of light pollution. These include glare, vision impairment and discomfort caused by exposure to excessive strong light, possible disturbance of rest and sleep, and feeling of irritation and annoyance. Therefore, I support the early introduction of legislation to strengthen control on light pollution to provide against possible troubles and ensure visual comfort of people ... <i>(Student may express more views freely)</i></p> <p>President, I so submit and support <u>Member A</u>'s motion. Thank you.</p> <p><i>(Sits down)</i></p> <p><i>(The student acting as Legislative Council Member C (Tourism Functional Constituency) raises his/her hand)</i></p>
PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	<p>: <u>Hon _____</u> (Name of the student acting as Legislative Council Member C (Tourism Functional Constituency))</p>
MEMBER C (TOURISM FUNCTIONAL CONSTITUENCY)	<p>: <i>(Stands up)</i></p> <p>President, I oppose <u>Member A</u>'s motion. Hong Kong has earned the reputation of the "Pearl of Orient" with its glittering cityscape at night and beautiful vistas across Victoria Harbour. External lighting, being part and parcel of the captivating night scene of Hong Kong, helps beautify the environment, complement the operational needs of the business sector and promote tourism. The interactive light show "A Symphony of Lights" has even become an iconic tourist attraction. The night scenery of Hong Kong will inevitably lose much of its lustre and become less attractive to tourists if the Government introduces legislation to control external lighting ... <i>(Student may express more views freely)</i></p> <p>President, I so submit and oppose <u>Member A</u>'s motion. Thank you.</p> <p><i>(Sits down)</i></p>

Role**Script**

(The student acting as Legislative Council Member D (Geographical Constituency) raises his/her hand)

**PRESIDENT OF
THE LEGISLATIVE
COUNCIL**

: Hon _____ (Name of the student acting as Legislative Council Member D (Geographical Constituency))

**MEMBER D
(GEOGRAPHICAL
CONSTITUENCY)**

: *(Stands up)*

Thank you, President. I support Member A's motion. Electricity generation is one of the major sources of air pollutant emission in Hong Kong, where the provision of lighting is usually powered by electricity. The arbitrary use of excessive lighting installations by the public will aggravate air pollution. Therefore, if the Government can effectively step up the regulation of external lighting installations, this may not only save energy, but also reduce the pollutants generated from such installations in the process of power generation, thereby improving air quality by tackling the emissions at source, as well as creating a clean air environment to safeguard public health ... *(Student may express more views freely)* President, I so submit and support Member A's motion. Thank you.

(Sits down)

(The student acting as Legislative Council Member E (Election Committee) raises his/her hand)

**PRESIDENT OF
THE LEGISLATIVE
COUNCIL**

: Hon _____ (Name of the student acting as Legislative Council Member E (Election Committee))

**MEMBER E
(ELECTION
COMMITTEE)**

: *(Stands up)*

President, I oppose Member A's motion. For normal business operations, the higher the illumination level of advertising signboards, the more likely that such signboards may attract the attention of pedestrians, thus leading to better promotional effect for the shops concerned. If the Government strengthens the control of light pollution, this may lessen the promotional effect of such advertising signboards. In the absence of any conclusive findings

Role	Script
	<p>pointing to the impact of exposure to strong light on human health, hastily introducing legislation on the external lighting installations of shops will be tantamount to jeopardizing the interests of shop operators without a solid and objective basis. It is unfair to the sector ... <i>(Student may express more views freely)</i> President, I so submit and oppose <u>Member A</u>'s motion. Thank you.</p> <p><i>(Sits down)</i></p>
PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	<p>: Does any other Member wish to speak?</p> <p><i>(The rest of the students acting as Legislative Council Members may raise their hands to indicate their wish to speak. Students should wait until the President calls his/her name to stand up and speak)</i></p> <p>Hon _____ (Name of the student acting as Legislative Council Member)</p> <p><i>(One by one, the President calls upon the students who have raised their hands to indicate their wish to speak to stand up and speak)</i></p>
HON (LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL MEMBER)	<p>: <i>(Stands up)</i></p> <p>(Student to express his/her views)</p> <p><i>(Sits down)</i></p>
PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	<p>: <i>(All students who have raised their hands to indicate their wish to speak have finished delivering their speeches)</i></p> <p>Does any other Member wish to speak? (If no Member indicates a wish to speak)</p> <p>Secretary for Environment and Ecology.</p>
SECRETARY FOR ENVIRONMENT AND ECOLOGY	<p>: <i>(Stands up)</i></p> <p>President, I am delighted that quite a number of Members have spoken enthusiastically on the motion, reflecting that various sectors of the community are very much concerned about the regulation of light pollution. Since 2016, the</p>

Role	Script
	<p>Government has been implementing a voluntary charter scheme to encourage responsible persons for external lighting installations to switch off lights at a certain time at night. To review the effectiveness of the charter scheme, we have commissioned consultancies to conduct an opinion survey, measured the changes of illumination level in different districts, and studied applicable overseas experience. We will consider the next step, including whether legislation should be introduced to control the nuisance caused by external lighting, in the light of the assessment results ... <i>(Student may come up with more points of his/her own)</i> Thank you, President. <i>(Sits down)</i></p>
<p>PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL</p>	<p>: <u>Member A</u>, you may now reply. This debate will come to a close after <u>Member A</u> has replied. <u>Member A</u>.</p>
<p>MEMBER A (ELECTION COMMITTEE)</p>	<p>: <i>(Stands up)</i> Thank you, President. Given that Hong Kong is small and densely populated and many shopping malls are built near residential buildings, light pollution has a serious impact on people's daily lives. Therefore, the Government should act decisively without delay to introduce legislation to implement the switch-off requirement and strengthen control on light pollution, with a view to enhancing people's quality of life and reducing energy consumption, thereby steering the territory towards the Government's goal of carbon neutrality by 2050 ... <i>(Student may express more views freely)</i> I call upon Members to support my motion. Thank you. <i>(Sits down)</i></p>
<p>PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL</p>	<p>: I now put the question to you and that is: That the motion moved by <u>Member A</u> be passed.</p>

Role	Script
-------------	---------------

PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	: Will those in favour please raise their hands? ¹ <i>(The Clerk counts the votes)</i>
---	--

Those against please raise their hands.
(The Clerk counts the votes)

(If over half of the Members present
vote in favour of the motion)

(If half or less than half of the Members
present vote
in favour of the motion)

PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	: I think the question is agreed by a majority of the Members present. I declare the motion passed.
---	--

PRESIDENT OF THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL	: I think the question is not agreed by a majority of the Members present. I declare the motion negatived.
---	---

- End -

¹ To simplify the proceedings of the role-play, the passage of motions shall require a majority vote of the Members present. The voting procedure for real Council meetings is as follows:

- (a) the passage of motions or amendments introduced by the Government requires a majority vote of the Members present;
- (b) the passage of motions or amendments introduced by individual Members requires a majority vote of each of the two groups of Members present:
 - Members returned by the Election Committee; and
 - Members returned by functional constituencies and by geographical constituencies through direct elections.