



National Education and National Security Education in Singapore and the United States

FS07/2022

1. Introduction

1.1 The implementation of National Education and National Security Education has been widely discussed in the local community, especially over the past few years. A Subcommittee to Study the Promotion of National and National Security Education (“the Subcommittee”) has been established by the Legislative Council’s Panel on Education, with a view to studying and following up the implementation of National Education and National Security Education in local schools as well as other relevant policy issues, and making recommendations where necessary.

1.2 At the request of the Subcommittee, the Research Office has prepared this *Fact Sheet* on National Education and National Security Education in Singapore and the United States. Main findings are illustrated below and the mode of delivery of National Education and National Security Education in these two places together with those in Hong Kong are summarized in **Appendix**.

2. Definitions of National Education and National Security Education

2.1 Both Hong Kong and Singapore have official documents defining “**National Education**” and their respective approaches in education regarding the subject. However, the nomenclature does not appear to be commonly adopted in education-related policy documents in other places. Notwithstanding, it is noted that content conventionally associated with “National Education”, such as the development of national identity, civic or citizenship education, educational activities serving political development and stability of a nation, and equipping young people with awareness, attitudes and skills for national defence,¹ could also be found in educational curriculum in many places under different labels, and is often subsumed under elements including **teaching and learning of history and culture, national values and morals, and other knowledge and attitudes shared among citizens**.

¹ See Cheng, Y.C. & Yuen, T. (2017).

2.2 Meanwhile, there is even less consensus around what constitute “**National Security Education**”. First of all, places have varied definition for elements of “**national security**”: while one of the most common definitions of national security would be military and homeland security concerning issues related to national defence, it can also refer to responding to the repercussions of natural disasters (in the case of Japan) or be presented as **a multi-dimensional concept covering a wide variety of areas** (such as economic security, ecological security, etc.) that are subject to threats. The Mainland², Hong Kong and Singapore appear to have adopted the multi-dimensional approaches on national security or defence against related threats. Subject to a particular place’s adopted definition of national security, it will then be translated into educational programmes aiming at teaching students relevant knowledge on the perceived major potential threats.

2.3 Amid the diversity set out above, it should not be surprising for individual places to implement “National Education” and “National Security Education”, or comparable programmes, with their own **approaches and sets of contents** which are **very much dependent on the history, culture, geography as well as social development** specific to the places concerned. The ensuing paragraphs will briefly discuss “National Education” and “National Security Education” in Hong Kong, and then set out, in more depth, observations on “National Education” and “National Security Education”, or comparable programmes, in Singapore and the United States.

3. Hong Kong

3.1 In Hong Kong, National Education is an important component of values education in schools, **with an objective to nurture young people into quality citizens who have a sense of belonging to our country, a sense of national identity and social responsibility, and affection for Hong Kong and the Chinese people.**

² In the Mainland, the five essential elements of the holistic view of national security are: (a) regarding the people’s security as the ultimate goal, (b) achieving political security as the fundamental task, (c) taking economic security as the foundation, (d) leveraging military, cultural and public security as means of guarantee, and (e) promoting international security so as to establish a national security system with Chinese characteristics. Specifically, the holistic view of national security encompasses various fields, including politics, military, homeland, economy, finance, culture, society, science and technology, cybersphere, food, ecology, resources, nuclear materials and technologies, overseas interests, outer space, deep sea, polar regions, biology and artificial intelligence. See 求是網(2022).

Primary and secondary education – formal curriculum

3.2 National Education covers various interlocking areas, including **Chinese history and our nation’s development, Chinese culture, geography, Constitution and Basic Law education, as well as National Security Education**. Learning elements of National Education are infused in various subjects, such as **General Studies for primary schools, Chinese History** as well as **Citizenship and Social Development for secondary schools**.³

3.3 As an integral part of National Education, **National Security Education straddles different domains of national security**, ranging from political and military security to cyber security and cultural security, etc.⁴ **A Curriculum Framework of National Security Education in Hong Kong⁵ and curriculum frameworks on National Security Education for 15 individual subjects⁶** have been developed by the Education Bureau (“EDB”), illustrating topics relating to national security in these subjects. **A supplement on national security has also been incorporated into the existing standalone module on the “Constitution and the Basic Law” designed for the junior secondary students** in support of the implementation of National Security Education.⁷

Primary and secondary education – experiential activities

3.4 National Education and National Security Education are also delivered through experiential activities. **All primary and secondary schools have to display the national flag on each school day and conduct a national flag raising ceremony weekly with the playing and singing of the national anthem**, so as to strengthen students’ sense of belonging to our country and affection for the Chinese people, and their sense of national identity. Schools are advised to plan appropriate school-based national education activities on

³ See Education Bureau (2022a).

⁴ The domains of national security include: political security, homeland security, military security, economic security, cultural security, social security, technological security, cyber security, ecological security, resource security, nuclear security, overseas interests security and new security domain.

⁵ See Education Bureau (2021a).

⁶ The 15 curriculum frameworks include: Biology; Business, Accounting and Financial Studies; Chemistry; Chinese History; Chinese Language Education Key Learning Area; Economics; General Studies; Geography; Health Management and Social Care; History; Information and Communication Technology; Life and Society; Physics; Science; and Technology Education Key Learning Area. See Education Bureau (2021c).

⁷ See 教育局 (2022c).

selected key dates such as Victory Day of Chinese People’s War of Resistance against Japanese Aggression⁸, Constitution Day⁹, National Security Education Day¹⁰, etc. in accordance with the “National Education – Event Planning Calendar”, so as to deepen students’ understanding of the major historical events and knowledge of the relevant topics of our country.¹¹

3.5 To further enrich students’ learning experience, EDB has been organizing **Mainland exchange programmes** or subsidizing those organized by schools to provide first-hand experience for students which help cultivate students’ affection for our nation. It also **organizes different competitions** (e.g. territory-wide inter-school competitions on Chinese History and Culture, and on Basic Law, as well as National Constitution Day and National Day Online Quiz Competitions) and **holds the “Basic Law Student Ambassadors Training Scheme”** to deepen students’ understanding of the history, culture and conditions of our country, the Constitution, the Basic Law and national security.¹²

Post-secondary education

3.6 With regard to the higher education level, **all eight University Grant Committee-funded universities in Hong Kong have launched National Education courses** to educate undergraduate students on the Basic Law, the National Security Law, and other elements including the city’s legal systems and development of the Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Greater Bay Area. **Completing such National Education course has been made a requirement for graduation.**¹³

⁸ **Victory Day of Chinese People’s War of Resistance against Japanese Aggression** is designated on 3 September each year in remembrance of the resistance of Chinese people against Japanese aggression in the past and to pay tribute to those who lost their lives in the conflict.

⁹ **Constitution Day** is designated on 4 December each year to conduct promotion and education activities of the Constitution through multiple channels, in order to enhance public awareness of the Constitution, promote its spirit, strengthen its implementation and advance the overall law-based governance of the country.

¹⁰ **National Security Education Day** on 15 April each year aims at raising public awareness of national security, creating a positive atmosphere of safeguarding national security, enhancing the capacity to fend off national security risks, deepening public understanding of the Constitution, the Basic Law and national security, and fostering a sense of national identity.

¹¹ See Education Bureau (2022b).

¹² See Education Bureau (2022a).

¹³ See 明報 (2022) and China Daily (2022).

4. Singapore

4.1 According to Singapore’s Ministry of Education, **National Education is essential for cultivating a sense of belonging and emotional rootedness to Singapore as well as developing national cohesion**, considering Singapore’s characteristics as a multi-racial and multi-religious society. **National Education also helps cultivate the instinct for survival as a nation and boost students’ confidence in the nation’s future.**¹⁴ The objectives of National Education can also be captured in six messages regarding the nation: (a) “Singapore is our homeland; this is where we belong”; (b) “We must preserve racial and religious harmony”; (c) “We must uphold meritocracy and incorruptibility”; (d) “No one owes Singapore a living”; (e) “We must ourselves defend Singapore”; and (f) “We have confidence in our future”.¹⁵

Primary and secondary education – formal curriculum

4.2 **National Education-related topics spread across multiple subject areas in the formal curriculum, including Social Studies as well as Character and Citizenship Education**¹⁶ which are compulsory subjects at both the primary and secondary levels. Specifically, **Social Studies**¹⁷ seeks to inculcate in students a deeper understanding of the values that define the Singapore society, nurture dispositions that will inspire them to show concern for the society and the world in which they live and demonstrate empathy in their relationships with others, **with the objective of making students become informed, concerned and participatory citizens.**¹⁸ Meanwhile, **Character and Citizenship Education** focuses on “values” and “character” which aims to develop in students good character, resilience and social-emotional well-being, future readiness and active citizenship.¹⁹

Primary and secondary education – experiential activities

4.3 In addition to classroom instruction, National Education is put into action through other channels. Every year, **schools hold different kinds of activities to commemorate four core national events**, namely Total Defence Day (see more details on Total Defence in paragraphs 4.8 to 4.12 below),

¹⁴ See Ministry of Education (2013).

¹⁵ See Ministry of Education (2018).

¹⁶ Ibid.

¹⁷ Social Studies integrate the disciplines of history and geography with some basic economics and sociology about Singapore.

¹⁸ See Ministry of Education (2022b).

¹⁹ See Ministry of Education (2020a).

International Friendship Day, Racial Harmony Day and National Day.²⁰ Students learn important lessons from these defining moments in Singapore’s history, and reflect on how they can apply their learning to contribute as active citizens.²¹

4.4 To inculcate students’ national consciousness and patriotism, schools are encouraged to promote **daily routines for students such as hoisting the national flag, singing the national anthem, and taking the National Pledge**²² to reinforce the values they stand for as a nation.

4.5 Besides, **students are required to participate in Values in Action** which is a key student development experience with the objectives of building social responsibility in students and encouraging them to make contribution to the community. Under Values in Action, students learn about community issues and the needs of others, and come up with proposals on how they can contribute to improvements in school, at home or in the community.²³

4.6 Meanwhile, students have the opportunities to embark on **Learning Journeys such as experiential learning trips to historical sites and national institutions** to appreciate the nation’s heritage and vulnerabilities, and at the same time develop a sense of pride and confidence about how Singapore had overcome its developmental constraints.²⁴

4.7 There are also **designated cohort experiences**, such as National Education Show for Primary 5 pupils to let students gain a deeper understanding of what it means to be “Singaporeans”,²⁵ and Secondary 3 MOE-OBS Challenge Programme to allow students to develop confidence and resilience, build cohesion as well as learn to be a concerned citizen.²⁶

²⁰ **Total Defence Day** is held on 15 February each year to commemorate the fall of Singapore to the Japanese in 1942, and serves to remind students of their roles in defending Singapore. **International Friendship Day** is celebrated in schools on the third Friday of Term Two, which is a day dedicated to the understanding of Singapore’s relations with its neighbours and aims to nurture in students the spirit of friendship and collaboration among different people. **Racial Harmony Day** is commemorated on 21 July each year to remind students the nation’s success as a harmonious society built on cultural diversity. **National Day** on 9 August each year celebrates Singapore’s independence from Malaysia and its emergence as a sovereign nation. See Government of Singapore (1997).

²¹ See Convent of the Holy Infant Jesus (Kellock) (2021).

²² See Ministry of Education (2020b).

²³ See The Straits Times (2018).

²⁴ See Government of Singapore (1998).

²⁵ See The Straits Times (2022).

²⁶ See Outward Bound Singapore (2021).

4.8 **Teaching of concepts with regard to Singapore’s national security is arguably an important element in its National Education**, despite that such education appears not being named as National Security Education in the official documents. Instead, **Total Defence introduced in 1984 is considered Singapore’s whole-of-society national defence concept which involves every Singaporean playing a part, individually and collectively to build a strong, secure and cohesive nation**. Initially, Total Defence consisted of five pillars, namely **Military Defence, Civil Defence, Economic Defence, Social Defence and Psychological Defence**. **Digital Defence** was added as the sixth pillar in 2019, highlighting the increasing threats from the cybersphere and the digital domain.²⁷

4.9 Students will learn about the Total Defence concept and the corresponding actions they can take to help the nation deal with the spectrum of **military and non-military threats**. Some examples of the activities on the Total Defence Day include **emergency preparedness drills, as well as food and electricity rationing conducted by schools** to allow students having a brief experience of the situation in times of emergency, and **excursion to the Singapore Discovery Centre** for students to learn how Singapore transformed from a developing nation to a world-class city-state, as well as to understand the constraints and threats facing the country.²⁸

4.10 Learning on Total Defence is made more interactive through **the Total Defence strategy card game – “Guardians of the City II (GOTC II)”**, which was designed to help youths develop a deeper understanding of Singapore’s threats and the part they can play in keeping Singapore safe and secure. **Such card game is provided to each Secondary 2 student every year** to enhance learning and facilitate discussions on National Education and Total Defence.²⁹

4.11 Furthermore, the **annual inter-school animation and storyboard competition “N.E.mation!” centred on Total Defence** has been organized to

²⁷ The descriptions of the six pillars of Total Defence are as follows: (a) **Military Defence** – “A strong and formidable defence force made up of Regulars and National Servicemen, and supported by the entire nation”; (b) **Civil Defence** – “The ability to spot signs of threats, respond effectively and recover quickly from crises”; (c) **Economic Defence** – “A strong and resilient economy that is globally competitive and able to bounce back from any crises”; (d) **Social Defence** – “The bonds that unite us, built on trust and understanding among people of different races and religions, living in harmony and looking out for one another”; (e) **Digital Defence** – “Being secure, alert and responsible online”; and (f) **Psychological Defence** – “The will and resolve to defend our way of life and interests, and the fighting spirit to overcome challenges together”. See MINDEF Singapore (2021b).

²⁸ See TheSmartLocal (2020).

²⁹ See MINDEF Singapore (undated).

encourage students and youths to express their thoughts on Total Defence by creating digital animation clips.³⁰

4.12 There are also **different levels of Total Defence Badge Programmes for Uniformed Groups (i.e. Gold, Silver and Bronze) in place to raise the awareness of students on issues related to the defence and security of Singapore.** These programmes aim to create opportunities for secondary school Uniformed Group cadets to participate in and lead Total Defence-related activities within their Uniformed Groups, schools and/or communities. For instance, to achieve the Gold badge, cadets have to either design and conduct a Total Defence lesson for junior cadets, or initiate, plan and execute a Total Defence-related Values in Action project that benefits the community at large.³¹

Post-secondary education³²

4.13 **National Education is also carried out at the higher education level.** For instance, most students are required to read one General Education module under the Singapore Studies pillar in the National University of Singapore for graduation.³³ Meanwhile, the course “Singapore: Imagining the Next 50 Years” being offered in all public universities of Singapore teaches students about the country’s socio-economic issues and challenges, covering major themes such as Aspiration and Identity, Security and Threats, etc.³⁴ Singapore University of Social Sciences also offers the course “Theory and Practice in Security Studies” focusing on topics related to national security.³⁵

5. The United States

5.1 In the United States, **the federal role in education is rather limited and education is indeed primarily a state and local responsibility.** It is the states and communities, as well as public and private organizations of all kinds, that establish schools and colleges, develop curricula, and determine

³⁰ See MINDEF Singapore (2021a).

³¹ See MINDEF Singapore (2022).

³² It is noted that “Full-time National Service” (“NS”) in Singapore Armed Forces, Singapore Civil Defence Force or Singapore Police Force is a “mandatory conscription and duty that every male citizen and Permanent Resident must undertake upon attaining the age of 18” in Singapore. NS is considered outside the formal education streams and is administrated outside the Ministry of Education. See Central Manpower Base (undated).

³³ See National University of Singapore (undated).

³⁴ See Bahrawi, N. (2017).

³⁵ See Singapore University of Social Sciences (2022).

requirements for enrolment and graduation.³⁶ As such, there is no education curriculum that is fully imposed nationwide and **curriculum standards could vary from state to state.**

Primary and secondary education – formal curriculum

5.2 As regards National Education, such terminology is not commonly observed in educational curricula in the United States. Rather, elements are encompassed in **“Civic Education” curricula across the states** covering citizenship, government, law, current events and related topics that contains overlapping concepts with the National Education curriculum in Hong Kong and Singapore. In fact, civic education is generally considered as having a positive impact on strengthening common national identity,³⁷ which can largely be considered coherent with the purpose set for conducting National Education in Hong Kong and Singapore.

5.3 Currently, **most states have established civic education standards**³⁸ and a majority of them require at least one Social Studies course for high school graduation.³⁹ **The subject matter required by states varies, with the United States History, Civics and American Government being the most commonly required courses.** Meanwhile, it is generally considered **civic education as providing a basic and realistic understanding of civic life, politics and government. It also familiarizes students with the constitutions of the United States and the state in which they live, emphasizes the rights and responsibilities of citizens, and aims to develop civic skills and foster those dispositions or traits of private and public character essential for citizens in a constitutional democracy.**⁴⁰

5.4 Though the federal government by-and-large had limited roles in education policy and curricula, the study of the United States Constitution is a distinct exception. **Federal law requires that all schools receiving federal funds to hold an educational programme on the United States Constitution for their students on 17 September each year, which is a day recognized as the Constitution Day and Citizenship Day** to commemorate the creation and signing of the supreme law of the land and to honour and celebrate the **privileges and responsibilities of United States citizenship for both native-born and naturalized citizens.**⁴¹ **In addition to classroom instruction on the Constitution, some states provide opportunities**

³⁶ See U.S. Department of Education (2021).

³⁷ See CivXNow (2021).

³⁸ See Education Commission of the States (2016a).

³⁹ See Godsay, S. et al. (2012).

⁴⁰ See Center for Civic Education (1998).

⁴¹ See Center for Civic Education (undated).

for students to assist at naturalization ceremonies on the day to give them a better understanding of the process of becoming a citizen, such as reciting letters and poems to newly naturalized citizens, performing the national anthem, or leading the Pledge of Allegiance.⁴²

Primary and secondary education – experiential activities

5.5 To promote patriotism and loyalty to the nation, **recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance is very common in schools** across the United States⁴³ with most states making time for the pledge for their students.⁴⁴ **The national flag is displayed properly during school days in or near every schoolhouse, and the national anthem is played before many school events**, especially inter-high school athletic competitions.⁴⁵ These ceremonies help further enhance students' sense of national identity. In addition, **a considerable number of schools will arrange activities to commemorate important federal observances** such as Memorial Day⁴⁶, Veterans Day⁴⁷, etc., as well as **organize field trips for students to visit museums, memorial parks and historical monuments** so as to strengthen their understanding of the country's history and inspire their patriotic enthusiasm.⁴⁸

5.6 Apart from textbook learning and discussion of current events, **some states have incorporated participatory elements of learning or community engagement into their civic standards and curriculum frameworks**. For example, **service-learning is an instructional strategy that combines meaningful service to the community with curriculum-based learning** that students can improve their academic and civic skills by applying what they learn in school to the real world. At the same time, it provides students with a strong sense of accomplishment and the development of civic dispositions that lead them to stay involved. Almost half of the states offer **some types of academic credit for community service**.⁴⁹

⁴² See U.S. Courts (2017).

⁴³ See The Hill (2022).

⁴⁴ It is worth noting that students who want to opt out of saying the pledge are generally allowed to do so.

⁴⁵ See Gray, G.D. (2010).

⁴⁶ **Memorial Day** is observed on the last Monday of May each year to honour the men and women who died while serving in the United States military.

⁴⁷ **Veterans Day** is observed on 11 November each year to honour all veterans of the uniformed services who served or are still serving during times of peace as well as war.

⁴⁸ See 黃寧寧 (2019).

⁴⁹ See Center for American Progress (2018).

It is further noted that certain places (e.g. Maryland and District of Columbia) went one step further to set community service requirement for high school graduation.

5.7 Meanwhile, over half of the states offer **simulations of democratic processes or procedures**⁵⁰ such as **mock elections, moot courts, mock trials**, etc. for students to facilitate their understanding of the institutions, processes, and principles that undergird the country’s constitutional democracy and allow them to practise their civic skills.

5.8 Separately, a **voluntary programme called “The Junior Reserve Officers’ Training Corps (JROTC)”** administrated by the Department of Defense is available **to prepare high school students for leadership roles while making them aware of their rights, responsibilities and privileges as United States citizens.**⁵¹ It is a programme to instil in students the values of citizenship, service to the United States, and personal responsibility and a sense of accomplishment.⁵² Besides, **having the objectives of character development, leadership development and citizenship training, among others, the Scouting programmes offered by the Boy Scouts of America similarly help prepare youth to become responsible, participatory citizens and leaders,**⁵³ **inspiring them to take a prominent role in civic engagement over their lifetimes.** These can also be considered as a type of civic education in the country.

Post-secondary education

5.9 Meanwhile, for the higher education level, a survey conducted by the American Council of Trustees and Alumni indicated that it is **not really common for colleges and universities to require students to take any American History or Government courses before they graduate,**⁵⁴ possibly suggesting that civic education is not necessarily taught at tertiary institutions in the United States.

5.10 On the other hand, National Security Education at post-secondary level in the United States is highlighted by the **“National Security Education Program”, which is often cited and studied by commentators.** Created

⁵⁰ See Hansen, M. et al. (2018).

⁵¹ See U.S. Department of Defense (2021).

⁵² JROTC courses are taught over a three- or four-year period with academic coursework on topics such as leadership and ethics, civics, history, and health and wellness. It also includes service-specific courses such as Aerospace Science or Seamanship and Navigation, and extra-curricular activities such as colour guard/drill team, marksmanship, and field trips to military installations. See Congressional Research Service (2022).

⁵³ See Boy Scouts of America (2022).

⁵⁴ The survey covered over 1 100 liberal arts colleges and universities and found that only 18% require students to take at least one survey course in American History or Government before they graduate. See American Council of Trustees and Alumni (2016).

under the mandate of the David L. Boren National Security Education Act of 1991, the “National Security Education Program” is a programme to award scholarships to the United States undergraduate students; fellowships to the United States graduate students; and grants to the United States institutions of higher education for study or programme development in languages and regions critical to the national security of the United States.⁵⁵

5.11 The programme’s primary mission is to develop a **pipeline of foreign language and culture expertise for the United States federal government workforce (serving in national security/defence positions), rather than targeting the wider post-secondary education cohort.** Award recipients of the “National Security Education Program”, more specifically, agree to work in qualifying national security positions for a minimum of one year in exchange for funding support.

5.12 There are also **different kinds of homeland security and emergency management programmes offered by some colleges and universities in the United States.**⁵⁶ The field is broad and varied, which could contain topics ranging from terrorism, intelligence, biological threats to critical thinking, emergency preparedness and disaster management, etc. Again, different from the National Security Education concept in Hong Kong, these courses are more inclined to prepare a legion of selected students for national security-related jobs of the country.

6. Observations

6.1 **Hong Kong and Singapore appear to have visible similarities in the implementation of National Education, with both having an official framework for and descriptive content coverage of elements of National Education in the school curriculum.** On the other hand, contents comparable to National Education appear to be covered by **Civic Education in the United States**, and could have distinctive characteristics across different states in the country. Regardless, a strong resemblance in these three places is that **experiential activities are emphasized in promoting national/civic education.** For instance, **they all have patriotic exercises** regarding national flag and anthem in strengthening students’ sense of national identity. **Some days are also selected for commemoration** to deepen students’ understanding of the major historical events. Moreover, **various knowledge-enrichment and participatory activities are available for students** to complement classroom

⁵⁵ See Defense Language and National Security Education Office (undated).

⁵⁶ See Kilroy, Jr., R.J. (2018).

instruction. The respective focuses for National Security Education or comparable programmes in the three places appear to reflect the perceived threats facing these places. The United States stands out in setting aside resources for training (generally at post-secondary level) a group of national security/defence experts. Moreover, the **areas covered by National Education/National Security Education or comparable programmes could evolve over time and subject to updates** in response to major geopolitical and social developments/events. Singapore's addition of Digital Defence to its Total Defence campaign can be considered a case in point.

6.2 All in all, the unique approaches and emphases of different places in implementing their National Education and National Security Education, or comparable programmes, could be attributable to the history, cultural norms, and socioeconomic and geopolitical development of the places concerned.

Research Office
Research and Information Division
Legislative Council Secretariat
18 October 2022
Tel: 3919 3181

Fact Sheets are compiled for Members and Committees of the Legislative Council. They are not legal or other professional advice and shall not be relied on as such. Fact Sheets are subject to copyright owned by The Legislative Council Commission (The Commission). The Commission permits accurate reproduction of Fact Sheets for non-commercial use in a manner not adversely affecting the Legislative Council. Please refer to the Disclaimer and Copyright Notice on the Legislative Council website at www.legco.gov.hk for details. The paper number of this issue of Fact Sheet is FS07/2022.

National Education and National Security Education in Hong Kong, Singapore and the United States

	Hong Kong	Singapore	The United States ⁽¹⁾
A. Formal definition of “National Education” and/or “National Security Education” in academic curricula/programmes			
National Education	✓	✓	× (Similar content is found under “Civic Education” in the curriculum)
National Security Education	✓	× (Similar content is delivered under “Total Defence” thematic extra-curricular programmes)	✓
B. Objective of National/Civic Education			
Objective	<u>Objective of National Education</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nurture young people into quality citizens with a sense of belonging to our country, a sense of national identity and social responsibility, and affection for Hong Kong and the Chinese people 	<u>Objective of National Education</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nurture a sense of belonging and emotional rootedness to Singapore for the students, develop national cohesion, cultivate the instinct for survival as a nation, and boost students’ confidence in the nation’s future 	<u>Objective of Civic Education</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide a basic and realistic understanding of civic life, politics and government, familiarize students with the constitutions of the United States and the state in which they live, emphasize the rights and responsibilities of citizens, and develop civic skills and foster private and public character essential for citizens in a constitutional democracy
C. Primary & Secondary Levels			
Formal subjects/ courses with content related to National Education and/or National Security Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Education is infused in various subjects, such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ General Studies (primary schools) ➤ Chinese History & Citizenship and Social Development (secondary schools) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> National Education is infused in various subjects, such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Social Studies ➤ Character and Citizenship Education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Elements of National Education are observed in Civic Education, with most commonly required subjects being: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The United States History ➤ Civics ➤ American Government

⁽¹⁾ Education curricula in the United States vary across states. Materials in this table only refer to more commonly observed examples, but not necessarily apply to all states.

National Education and National Security Education in Hong Kong, Singapore and the United States

	Hong Kong	Singapore	The United States ⁽²⁾
C. Primary & Secondary Levels (cont'd)			
Formal subjects/ courses with content related to National Education and/or National Security Education (cont'd)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Constitution and Basic Law Module with supplement on national security • Curriculum Frameworks on National Security Education for 15 individual subjects have been developed to illustrate topics relating to national security 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Constitution education <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Constitution Day and Citizenship Day programmes and activities on 17 September each year
Experiential Learning Activities			
Patriotic activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flag-raising • National anthem singing • Commemoration of national events 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flag-raising • National anthem singing • National Pledge taking • Commemoration of national events 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flag-displaying • National anthem singing • Pledge of Allegiance recitation • Commemoration of national events
Knowledge enrichment/ participatory activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inter-school competitions (Chinese History and Culture & Basic Law) and National Constitution Day and National Day Online Quiz Competitions • Basic Law Student Ambassadors Training Scheme • Mainland exchange programmes • National Security Education Day programmes and activities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Values in Action • Learning Journeys • Designated cohort experiences, such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ National Education Show for Primary 5 students to deepen their understanding of the meaning of being “Singaporeans” ➤ MOE-OBS Challenge Programme for Secondary 3 students to develop their confidence and resilience, and help them to become concerned citizens 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service-learning/Community service • Field trips • Simulations of democratic processes and procedures (e.g. mock elections, moot courts and mock trials) • The Junior Reserve Officers’ Training Corps • Scouting programmes

⁽²⁾ Education curricula in the United States vary across states. Materials in this table only refer to more commonly observed examples, but not necessarily apply to all states.

National Education and National Security Education in Hong Kong, Singapore and the United States

	Hong Kong	Singapore	The United States ⁽³⁾
C. Primary & Secondary Levels (cont'd)			
Experiential Learning Activities (cont'd)			
Knowledge enrichment/participatory activities (cont'd)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Total Defence-related activities such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ emergency preparedness drills ➤ “Guardians of the City II” strategy card game ➤ Total Defence Badge Programmes for Uniformed Groups ➤ “N.E.mation!” inter-school animation and storyboard competition 	
D. Post-secondary Level			
Formal courses/programmes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Courses: Completion of the specified National Education courses has been made a graduation requirement in the University Grant Committee-funded universities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Courses: Courses including topics related to National Education are offered by tertiary institutions, such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ General Education module under the Singapore Studies pillar offered by National University of Singapore ➤ “Singapore: Imagining the Next 50 Years” offered by all public universities in Singapore ➤ “Theory and Practice in Security Studies” offered by Singapore University of Social Sciences 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Degree/professional qualification programmes: Homeland security and emergency management programmes are offered by colleges and universities • Courses: Civic education courses such as American History and Government are offered by colleges and universities

⁽³⁾ Education curricula in the United States vary across states. Materials in this table only refer to more commonly observed examples, but not necessarily apply to all states.

References^

Global

1. Cheng, Y.C. & Yuen, T. (2017) *Broad-based National Education in Globalisation: Conceptualisation, Multiple Functions and Management*. Available from: <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/IJE-M-05-2016-0127/full/html>
2. Chong, K.M. (2019) *From Citizenship Education to National Education – Perceptions of National Identity and National Education of Hong Kong's Secondary School Teachers*, Routledge, January. Available from: <https://www.routledge.com/From-Citizenship-Education-to-National-Education-Perceptions-of-National/Chong/p/book/9780367141790>
3. Davies, I. et al. (2021) *Conceptualizing National Education and Methods of Teaching National Education in Hong Kong*. Available from: <https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/162422/>
4. Shek, D. et al. (2022) *Satisfaction with HyFlex Teaching and Law-abiding Leadership Education in Hong Kong University Students under COVID-19*. Available from: <https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007/s11482-022-10040-4.pdf>
5. 大公報(2021)：《多國重視學生憲法教育》，12月5日，網址：<http://www.takungpao.com.hk/news/232111/2021/1205/662444.html>
6. 中華人民共和國國防部網(2018)：《一圖帶你看懂國外如何開展國家安全教育》，網址：http://www.mod.gov.cn/big5/photos/2018-04/13/content_4809384.htm
7. 文匯報(2021)：《公民教育屬國際慣例 美學校重點教愛國》，4月2日，網址：<https://www.wenweipo.com/s/202104/02/AP6066812fe4b04e1918cea8e8.html>
8. 求是網(2022)：《這四個重點，幫你全面準確把握總體國家安全觀的科學體系》，4月15日，網址：http://www.qstheory.cn/laigao/ycjx/2022-04/15/c_1128564888.htm

Hong Kong

9. GovHK. (2021) *LCQ15: Promotion of National Education*. Available from: <https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/202107/21/P2021072100378.htm?fontSize=2>
10. GovHK. (2022) *LCQ17: Values Education on National Identity*. Available from: <https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/202204/06/P2022040600236.htm?fontSize=2>
11. Commission on Strategic Development, Task Group on National Education. (2008) *Promotion of National Education in Hong Kong – Current Situation, Challenges and Way Forward*. Available from: https://www.pico.gov.hk/en/CSD_2007-2009/csd_2_2008.pdf
12. Education Bureau. (2021a) *Curriculum Framework of National Security Education in Hong Kong*. Available from: https://www.edb.gov.hk/attachment/en/curriculum-development/kla/pshe/national-security-education/nse_framework_en.pdf
13. Education Bureau. (2021b) *Debunking Myths about Implementing National Security Education in Hong Kong Schools*. Available from: <https://www.edb.gov.hk/en/about-edb/press/cleartheair/20210222.html>
14. Education Bureau. (2021c) *National Security Education in School Curriculum – Additional Curriculum Documents and Learning and Teaching Resources*. Available from: <https://applications.edb.gov.hk/circular/upload/EDBC/EDBC21006E.pdf>
15. Education Bureau. (2022a) *Implementation of National Education and National Security Education in Kindergartens, Primary and Secondary Schools*, LC Paper No. CB(4)672/2022(01). Available from: https://www.lego.gov.hk/yr2022/english/panels/ed/ed_nse/papers/ed_nse20220725cb4-672-1-e.pdf
16. Education Bureau. (2022b) *National Education – Event Planning Calendar*. Available from: <https://applications.edb.gov.hk/circular/upload/EDBCM/EDBCM22120E.pdf>
17. 教育局 (2022c) : 《 憲法與〈基本法〉 》 , 網址 : <https://www.edb.gov.hk/tc/curriculum-development/kla/pshe/basic-law-education/constitution-basicclaw/index.html>

18. China Daily. (2022) *National Education Mandatory in HK*, 6 August. Available from: <https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/202208/06/WS62edc1f6a310fd2b29e70a25.html>
19. 明報(2022)：《八大7校國安教育納課程 港大未覆 中大科大下學年推國安課 同列必修》，7月25日，網址：<https://news.mingpao.com/pns/教育/article/20220725/s00011/1658685805667/八大7校國安教育納課程-港大未覆-中大科大下學年推國安課-同列必修>

Singapore

20. Legislative Council Secretariat. (2020) *Information Note on National Education in Singapore and Japan*, LC Paper No. IN07/19-20. Available from: <https://www.legco.gov.hk/research-publications/english/1920in07-national-education-in-singapore-and-japan-20200324-e.pdf>
21. Bahrawi, N. (2017) *New Course to Speculate Singapore's Future*, FUSION – Singapore University of Technology and Design, issue 8, p. 3. Available from: https://www.sutd.edu.sg/SUTD/media/SUTD/FUSION8_final.pdf
22. Boot Camp & Military Fitness Institute. (2022) *What is Total Defence (Singapore)?* Available from: <https://bootcampmilitaryfitnessinstitute.com/2022/02/06/what-is-total-defence-singapore/>
23. Central Manpower Base. (undated) *Discover NS*. Available from: <https://www.cmpb.gov.sg/web/portal/cmpb/home/about-us/discover-ns>
24. Convent of the Holy Infant Jesus (Kellock). (2021) *NE Commemorative Events*. Available from: <https://chijkellock.moe.edu.sg/the-k-experience/character-and-citizenship-education/citizenship-programmes/ne-commemorative-events>
25. Georgia State University. (2018) *Perspectives on the 21st Century Urban University from Singapore – A Viewpoint Forum*. Available from: https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1023&context=urban_studies_institute
26. Government of Singapore. (1997) *Launch of National Education*. Available from: <https://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/history/events/44fa0306-ddfe-41bc-8bde-8778ff198640>

27. Government of Singapore. (1998) *Launch of Learning Journeys*. Available from: <https://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/history/events/f3a07da7-06b5-4720-9ac1-dafffbfcc469>
28. Koga, K. (2020) *Singapore's Distinctive "Quasi-bases"*, In: Kawana, S. and Takahashi, M. (eds.) *Exploring Base Politics*, pp. 133-151, London, Routledge. Available from: <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/chapters/edit/10.4324/9780429356315-9/singapore-distinctive-quasi-bases-kei-koga>
29. Lee, M.H. (2021) *Upper Secondary Social Studies Curriculum in Singapore and National Identity*, In: Zajda, J. and Majhanovich, S. (eds.) *Globalisation, Cultural Identity and Nation-Building*, pp. 51-67, Dordrecht, Springer. Available from: https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007/978-94-024-2014-2_4.pdf
30. MINDEF Singapore. (2019) *Total Defence Strengthened with Addition of Digital Defence as the Sixth Pillar*. Available from: https://www.mindef.gov.sg/web/portal/mindef/news-and-events/latest-releases/article-detail/2019/February/15feb19_nr
31. MINDEF Singapore. (2021a) *About N.E.mation! 2021*. Available from: https://www.mindef.gov.sg/web/portal/mindef/news-and-events/latest-releases/article-detail/2021/February/21feb21_fs
32. MINDEF Singapore. (2021b) *Total Defence*. Available from: <https://www.mindef.gov.sg/web/portal/mindef/defence-matters/defence-topic/defence-topic-detail/total-defence>
33. MINDEF Singapore. (2022) *Total Defence Programme for Uniformed Groups*. Available from: https://www.mindef.gov.sg/oms/imindef/mindef_websites/topics/totaldefence/resources-total-defence-programme-for-UGs.html
34. MINDEF Singapore. (undated) *Guardians of the City II – The Total Defence Strategy Card Game*. Available from: https://www.mindef.gov.sg/oms/imindef/mindef_websites/topics/totaldefence/resources-guardians-of-the-city.html
35. Ministry of Education. (2012) *Character & Citizenship Education Syllabus – Primary*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/-/media/files/primary/characterandcitizenshipeducationprimarysyllabusenglish.pdf?la=en&hash=07C4DBF66BCF5182FF4AEA4436679A96466DDE24>

36. Ministry of Education. (2013) *National Education*. Available from: <https://eresources.nlb.gov.sg/webarchives/details/www.ne.edu.sg.html>
37. Ministry of Education. (2016) *Social Studies Syllabus – Upper Secondary – Express Course – Normal (Academic) Course*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/%2D/media/files/secondary/syllabuses/humanities/2016socialstudiesuppersecondaryexpressnormalacademicsyllabus.ashx?la=en&hash=DA8E79D9F02721DAE69B78EB879F4E2F907C76A9>
38. Ministry of Education. (2018) *National Education Review 2016-2017*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/-/media/files/programmes/ne-review-collateral.ashx?la=en&hash=E41B0A9C3045DDD6542D60E6A2E63D50F1B64D05>
39. Ministry of Education. (2020a) *Character & Citizenship Education Syllabus – Secondary*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/-/media/files/secondary/syllabuses/cce/2021-character-and-citizenship-education%2Dsyllabus%2Dsecondary.pdf?la=en&hash=D41C87D627D3AA6CF52C14538121EA5E1B9E0B44>
40. Ministry of Education. (2020b) *Teaching of National Symbols as Part of National Education*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/news/parliamentary-replies/20201005-teaching-of-national-symbols-as-part-of-national-education>
41. Ministry of Education. (2022a) *National Education*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/education-in-sg/our-programmes/national-education>
42. Ministry of Education. (2022b) *Social Studies Teaching and Learning Syllabus – Primary*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/-/media/files/primary/2020%2Dsocial%2Dstudies%2Dprimary.ashx?la=en&hash=1C4D8BA74B72E3ABFB91D409460572A4067C2DEF>
43. Ministry of Education. (2022c) *Values in Action*. Available from: <https://www.moe.gov.sg/education-in-sg/our-programmes/values-in-action>
44. National University of Singapore. (undated) *General Education for Students Admitted from AY2021-22*. Available from: <https://www.nus.edu.sg/registrars/academic-information-policies/undergraduate-students/general-education/for-students-admitted-from-AY2021-22>

45. Outward Bound Singapore. (2021) *MOE-OBS Challenge Programme*. Available from: <https://www.nyc.gov.sg/en/obs/programmes/moe-obs-challenge-programme>
46. Sim, J.BY. (2013) *National Education: Framing the Citizenship Curriculum for Singapore Schools*, In: Deng, Z., Gopinathan, S., Lee, CE. (eds.) *Globalization and the Singapore Curriculum*, Education Innovation Series, Springer, Singapore, pp. 67-83, Singapore, Springer. Available from: https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007/978-981-4451-57-4_5.pdf
47. Singapore University of Social Sciences. (2022) *Theory and Practice in Security Studies (SEC331)*. Available from: <https://www.suss.edu.sg/course/s/detail/sec331>
48. Study International. (2018) *Singapore's Major Universities Want Students to Prepare for Country's Future*. Available from: <https://www.studyinternational.com/news/singapore-university-50-years/>
49. The Straits Times. (2018) *Values in Action Programme Making Lasting Impact on Students: Ministry of Education*, 18 September. Available from: <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/education/values-in-action-programme-making-lasting-impact-on-students-ministry-of>
50. The Straits Times. (2022) *NDP National Education Show for Primary 5 Pupils Returns after 2 Years*, 2 July. Available from: <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/ndp-national-education-show-for-primary-5-pupils-returns-for-the-first-time-in-3-years>
51. TheSmartLocal. (2020) *7 Total Defence Day Activities That Every Singaporean Kid from the 90s Used to Do*. Available from: <https://thesmartlocal.com/read/total-defence-day-singapore/>
52. 信報(2021)：《借鑑新加坡全面防衛 思考國安教育實施》，2月19日，網址：<https://www1.hkej.com/features/article?q=%23港版國安法政經專欄%23&suid=103586728>
53. 新華社(2017)：《綜述：新加坡五方面強化國家安全教育》，4月15日，網址：http://xinhuanet.com/world/2017-04/15/c_1120815711.htm

The United States

54. Almanac. (2022) *U.S. Flag Code: Etiquette, Rules, and Guidelines*. Available from: <https://www.almanac.com/us-flag-etiquette-rules-and-guidelines>
55. American Council of Trustees and Alumni. (2016) *A Crisis in Civic Education*. Available from: https://www.goacta.org/wp-content/uploads/ee/download/A_Crisis_in_Civic_Education.pdf
56. American Federation of Teachers. (2018) *A Look at Civics Education in the United States*. Available from: https://www.aft.org/ae/summer2018/shapiro_brown
57. Boy Scouts of America. (2022) *The Boy Scouts of America's Mission, Vision, Aims, and Methods*. Available from: <https://troopleader.scouting.org/scoutings-aims-and-methods/>
58. Center for American Progress. (2018) *The State of Civics Education*. Available from: https://www.americanprogress.org/wp%2Dcontent/uploads/2019/12/020618_CivicsEducation-UPDATED.pdf
59. Center for American Progress. (2019) *Strengthening Democracy with a Modern Civics Education*. Available from: <https://www.americanprogress.org/wp%2Dcontent/uploads/2019/12/CivicsEducation-report-UPDATE.pdf>
60. Center for Civic Education. (1998) *The Role of Civic Education*. Available from: https://www.civiced.org/papers/articles_role.html
61. Center for Civic Education. (1999) *The Civic Education of American Youth: From State Policies to School District Practices*. Available from: https://www.civiced.org/papers/ceay_campaign_tolo.html
62. Center for Civic Education. (undated) *Constitution Day! September 17th*. Available from: <https://www.civiced.org/lesson-plans/constitution-day-and-citizenship-day>
63. CivXNow. (2021) *Civic Education has Massive Cross-Partisan Appeal as a Solution to What Ails Our Democracy*. Available from: <https://civxnow.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CivXNow-infographic-Luntz-polling-FINAL.pdf>

64. CivXNow. (2022) *Current State Policies*. Available from: <https://civxnow.org/our-work/state-policy/>
65. Congressional Research Service. (2022) *Defense Primer: Junior Reserve Officers' Training Corps (JROTC)*. Available from: <https://sgp.fas.org/crs/natsec/IF11313.pdf>
66. Defense Language and National Security Education Office. (undated) *National Security Education Program*. Available from: <https://dlnseo.org/NSEP>
67. Education Commission of the States. (2016a) *50-State Comparison: Civic Education*. Available from: https://www.ecs.org/wp%2Dcontent/uploads/Companion_Report_-_50-State_Comparison_-_Civic_Education.pdf
68. Education Commission of the States. (2016b) *Civic Education Policies: State Statutes (Laws) that Address Civics, Citizenship Education or Social Studies*. Available from: <https://ecs.secure.force.com/mbdata/MBQuest2RTANW?Rep=CIP1606S>
69. FindLaw. (2018) *The Roles of Federal and State Governments in Education*. Available from: <https://www.findlaw.com/education/curriculum-standards-school-funding/the-roles-of-federal-and-state-governments-in-education.html>
70. Godsay, S. et al. (2012) *CIRCLE Fact Sheet on State Civic Education Requirements*. Available from: https://www.academia.edu/33969790/State_Civic_Education_Requirements._CIRCLE_Fact_Sheet
71. Gray, G.D. (2010) *Teaching Patriotism in America's Public Schools; Policy, Practices, and Debates*, Matsuyama University, Studies in Language and Literature, vol. 29, no. 2, March. Available from: <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/230512049.pdf>
72. Hansen, M. et al. (2018) *The 2018 Brown Center Report on American Education: How Well are American Students Learning?* Available from: https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/2018-Brown-Center-Report-on-American-Education_Final.pdf
73. Kilroy, Jr., R.J. (2018) *Threats to Homeland Security: Reassessing the All-Hazards Perspective*, 2nd ed Wiley.

74. Levinson, M. and Solomon, M.Z. (2021) *Can Our Schools Help Us Preserve Democracy? Special Challenges at a Time of Shifting Norms*. Available from: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.1002/hast.1224>
75. Merrimack College. (2021) *Examining Civic Education Policy in the United States*. Available from: https://scholarworks.merrimack.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1068&context=soe_student_ce
76. NJCSS Journal. (2021) *The Return of Civics*. Available from: <https://teachingsocialstudies.org/2021/07/09/the-return-of-civics/>
77. PA TIMES. (2021) *Civic Education: A Positive National Conversation*, 2 May. Available from: <https://patimes.org/civic-education-a-positive-national-conversation/>
78. Population Education. (2021) *Six States with Exemplary Civics Education Programs*. Available from: <https://populationeducation.org/six-states-with-exemplary-civics-education-programs/>
79. Stewart, K.B. and Vocino, J. (2013) *Homeland Security in Higher Education: The State of Affairs*, *Journal of Public Affairs Education*, vol. 19, no. 1, pp. 13-29. Available from: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23608932>
80. The Council of State Governments. (2017) *State Civic Education Toolkit*. Available from: https://issuu.com/csg.publications/docs/civics_toolkit_2017_web
81. The Hill. (2022) *Here is a Breakdown of Laws in 47 States that Require Reciting the Pledge of Allegiance*. Available from: <https://thehill.com/homenews/3256719-47-states-require-the-pledge-of-allegiance-be-recited-in-schools-here-is-a-breakdown-of-each-states-laws/>
82. The StateUniversity.com Education Encyclopedia. (undated) *Civics and Citizenship Education – A National Education Goal, Formal Instruction, the Informal Curriculum, Concerns and Issues, Improving Civic Education*. Available from: <https://education.stateuniversity.com/pages/1831/Civics-Citizenship-Education.html>
83. U.S. Courts. (2017) *Students Assist at Naturalization Ceremonies on Constitution Day/Citizenship Day*. Available from: <https://www.uscourts.gov/news/2017/09/29/students-assist-naturalization-ceremonies-constitution-daycitizenship-day>

84. U.S. Courts. (2019) *Constitution Day and Citizenship Day*. Available from: <https://www.uscourts.gov/about%2Dfederal%2Dcourts/educational%2Dresources/annual-observances/constitution-day-and-citizenship-day>
85. U.S. Department of Defense. (2021) *Junior Reserve Officers' Training Corps*. Available from: <https://www.defense.gov/Help%2DCenter/Article/Article/2742332/junior-reserve-officers-training-corps/>
86. U.S. Department of Education. (2021) *The Federal Role in Education*. Available from: <https://www2.ed.gov/about/overview/fed/role.html>
87. U.S. Department of Education. (2022) *Commemorating Constitution Day and Citizenship Day*. Available from: <https://www2.ed.gov/policy/fund/guid/constitutionday.html>
88. U.S. Department of Education. (undated) *Laws & Guidance*. Available from: <https://www2.ed.gov/policy/landing.jhtml>
89. 大公報(2020)：《美國憲法教育 從娃娃抓起》，12月5日，網址：<http://www.takungpao.com.hk/news/232111/2020/1205/528529.html>
90. 大公報(2021)：《潛移默化 / 培養愛國公民 多國憲法教育進校園》，12月5日，網址：<http://www.takungpao.com.hk/news/232111/2021/1205/662442.html>
91. 新華網(2017)：《理直氣壯的美式愛國主義教育 不允許出現雜音》，網址：http://us.xinhuanet.com/2017-07/06/c_129648802.htm
92. 黃寧寧(2019)：《美國中小學愛國主義教育的途徑和啓示》，教育視界，2019年9期，第76-79頁。

Note: ^ Internet resources listed in this section were accessed in October 2022.