立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1224/02-03 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/BC/3/01/2

Bills Committee on Chemical Weapons (Convention) Bill

Minutes of tenth meeting held on Monday, 3 March 2003 at 4:30 pm in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

Members present: Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan (Chairman)

Hon HUI Cheung-ching, JP

Hon LAU Kong-wah

Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

Member absent: Hon James TO Kun-sun

Public officers attending

: Ms Ellen CHOY

Principal Assistant Secretary for Commerce,

Industry and Technology (Commerce and Industry)

Miss Amy CHAN

Assistant Secretary for Commerce,

Industry and Technology (Commerce and Industry)

Ms Vivian SUM

Assistant Director-General Trade and Industry Department

Ms Doris CHAN

Principal Trade Officer

Trade and Industry Department

Mr Andrew WONG Head of Trade Controls Customs and Excise Department

Mr Paul SIT Principal Trade Controls Officer Customs and Excise Department

Mr Geoffrey FOX Senior Assistant Law Draftsman Department of Justice

Ms Marie SIU Senior Government Counsel Department of Justice

Clerk in attendance: Miss Salumi CHAN

Chief Assistant Secretary (1)5

Staff in attendance: Miss Anita HO

Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Ms Cindy CHENG

Senior Assistant Secretary (1) 4

Action

I. Meeting with the Administration

(Part A: Matters arising from the eighth and ninth meetings

LC Paper No. CB(1)908/02-03(01) — "Follow-up to the eighth meeting on 21 January 2003" prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(01) — "Follow-up to the ninth meeting on 17 February 2003" prepared by the Legislative Council Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(02) — Administration's response to the issues of concern raised by members on clauses 5 and 29

LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(03) — Administration's response to members'

concern on whether the implementation of the Convention in Hong Kong falls under the ambit of "foreign affairs" or "defence" referred to in Articles 13 and 14 of the Basic Law

Part B: Clause-by-clause examination of the Bill

LC Paper No. CB(3)10/01-02 The Bill Ref: CIB CR14/46/6/1 The Legislative Council Brief issued by the Commerce and Industry Bureau LC Paper No. CB(1)1510/01-02 — Marked-up copy of the proposed consequential amendments to Organized and Serious Crimes Ordinance (Cap. 455) and the Weapons of Mass Destruction (Control of Provision of Services) Ordinance (Cap. 526) LC Paper No. LS9/02-03 List of drafting issues raised by the Legal Service Division of the Legislative Council Secretariat LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(04) — Draft proposed Committee Stage Amendments provided by the Administration (6th draft))

The Bills Committee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Appendix**).

Discussion on whether the implementation of the Convention in Hong Kong fell under the ambit of "foreign affairs" or "defence" referred to in Articles 13 and 14 of the Basic Law

2. Responding to the Chairman's enquiries on the Administration's written response (LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(03)), the Administration advised that the Convention required each State Party to the Convention to adopt the necessary measures to implement its obligations under the Convention. The People's Republic of China, as a State Party to the Convention, was therefore obliged to implement its obligations under the Convention. As the application of the Convention was extended to the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) under Article 153 of the Basic Law, the Central People's Government requested the HKSAR Government to implement the Convention in HKSAR. Such implementation would be done through the enactment of legislation in HKSAR, i.e. through the enactment of the Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance. In the Administration's view, the implementation of the Convention in HKSAR (at the level or in

the sense of international treaty obligations) fell within the ambit of "foreign affairs" under Article 13 of the Basic Law and related to "defence" under Article 14 of the Basic Law. As regards the concrete measures taken by the HKSAR Government to implement the Convention, such as the implementation of a permit system to control chemical weapons, they did not fall within the ambit of "foreign affairs" under Article 13 of the Basic Law and of "defence" under Article 14 of the Basic Law.

3. The Chairman noted that under Article 19 of the Basic Law, "[t]he courts of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region shall have no jurisdiction over acts of state such as defence and foreign affairs. The courts of the Region shall obtain a certificate from the Chief Executive on questions of fact concerning acts of state such as defence and foreign affairs whenever such questions arise in adjudication of cases. This certificate shall be binding on the courts. Before issuing such a certificate, the Chief Executive shall obtain a certifying document from the Central People's Government". Chairman requested the Administration to confirm whether the courts of HKSAR would have jurisdiction over cases involving offences under the Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance (if enacted), and whether the mechanism provided in Article 19 of the Basic Law needed to be triggered off for the courts of HKSAR to adjudicate such cases. Administration advised that the Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance, if enacted, would be a piece of local legislation and that the courts of HKSAR would have jurisdiction over cases involving offences under the Ordinance. The Administration also considered that the concrete measures to implement the Convention in HKSAR contained in the Ordinance were not "acts of state" referred to in Article 19 of the Basic Law.

Date of next meeting

4. <u>The Chairman</u> reminded members that the eleventh and twelfth meetings would be held on Monday, 31 March 2003 at 8:30 am and Monday, 14 April 2003 at 2:30 pm respectively.

II. Any other business

5. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:50 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
27 March 2003

Proceedings of the tenth meeting of the Bills Committee on Chemical Weapons (Convention) Bill on Monday, 3 March 2003 at 4:30 pm in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
000000-001212	Chairman Mr LAU Kong-wah Mr HUI Cheung-ching	Internal Discussion	•
001213-001537	Administration	Briefing by the Administration on its response to the issues of concern raised by members on whether the implementation of the Convention in Hong Kong fell under the ambit of "foreign affairs" or "defence" referred to in Articles 13 and 14 of the Basic Law (LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(03))	
001538-003250	Chairman Administration ALA 2	(a) Whether the concrete measures taken by the HKSAR Government to implement the Convention fell within the ambit of "foreign affairs" under Article 13 of the Basic Law and of "defence" under Article 14 of the Basic Law	
		(b) Whether the courts of HKSAR would have jurisdiction over cases involving offences under the Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance (if enacted), and whether the mechanism provided in Article 19 of the Basic Law needed to	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		be triggered off for the courts of HKSAR to adjudicate such cases (c) Whether the concrete measures to implement the Convention in HKSAR contained in the Ordinance were "acts of state" referred to in Article 19 of the Basic Law (LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-	Kequireu
		03(03)) (Clause 27) (Articles 13, 14 and 19 of the Basic Law)	
003251-004512	Administration	Briefing by the Administration on its response to issues of concerns raised by members on clauses 5 and 29 (LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(02)) (Clauses 5 and 29)	
004513-010651	Ms Audrey EU ALA 2 Chairman Mr HUI Cheung-ching Administration	 (a) Whether clause 5 was an exact copy of paragraph 1(d) Article I of the Convention (b) Whether it was appropriate to use the words "assist", "encourage" and "induce" in clause 5(f) (c) Reference to the approach adopted by other common law jurisdictions, including the 	
		United Kingdom, Canada, Singapore and New Zealand (d) Whether clause 5(f) should be deleted	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		(e) Whether it was necessary for the Administration to review the provisions of clause 5 a certain period after the enactment of the Chemical Weapons (Convention) Ordinance (LC Paper No. CB(1)1011/02-03(02)) (Clauses 5 and 29)	
010652-010942	Chairman	Date of eleventh and twelfth meetings	

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
27 March 2003